NEW FRONTIERS OF FEMINIST EDUCATION: CHALLENGING THE
PRESUMPTIONS OF EPISTEMOLOGICAL AND RATIONALIST
PATRIARCHY IN THE CONTEXT OF
EMANCIPATORY PEDAGOGY

By
Rachel Anne Buchanan
BSocSc (Hons), BA

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

School of Education
Faculty of Education and Arts
University of Newcastle

December 2010
DECLARATION

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library**, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

**Unless an Embargo has been approved for a determined period.

Signed:____________________________    Date:________________
Firstly I’d like to acknowledge my supervisor, Prof Ron Laura, who not only gave me this opportunity to research a topic that I am passionate about, but also has provided much support and encouragement along the way. Thank you, for being more than a supervisor. Through out this philosophical adventure, you have been a teacher, a mentor and a friend. Thank you for not only the intellectually inspiring thesis supervision, but the establishment of a creative and academically nurturing space that you have generated with the establishment of the Thursday afternoon group.

Mary Buchanan – Mum – thank you for the editing, proof-reading, child minding, and subtle demands for progress reports. You have invested a lot of your own blood, sweat, tears and energy into this thesis and I want you to know that I appreciate your support and faith in me.

Thank you to Helen Scobie, Melissa Bull, Amy Chapman, Milka and Alex Roach who between them have provided the extra emotional and material help that was required for me to complete this intellectual adventure and scholarly undertaking. Thanks for the listening ears, encouraging words, scholarly partnership, and child minding that I required along with your friendship during this time.

Also I would like to acknowledge the continued support, and encouragement I have received from the Thursday afternoon study group. This was truly a community of inquiry, a place where I could develop my scholarly proclivities in a nurturing, caring yet stimulating and challenging group of fellow scholars. Thank you for helping me to develop my ‘voice’. I have enjoyed not only sharing my work with you, but learning about your own work – it’s been a process of mutual stimulating intellectual development over the last few years and I thank you all.

Lastly, but absolutely not least, to my family - Steven, Miriam, and Isaac – there are no words, other than I love you, and I know you have all been very patient with me as I have been otherwise occupied. Thank you for being your good selves, that’s the way I like it. Steve thanks for the continued love, support, (almost) infinite patience and all the coffee that you have supplied along the way.
DEDICATION

In loving memory of my grandmother
Joyce Rachel Buchanan
(1917-2005)

For you were always the (reluctant) political feminist and you would have passionately argued with me about all of this.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Declarations</th>
<th>i</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter One: The Worth of a Woman: Challenging the role played by Epistemological Patriarchy in the continuing subjugation of women ........... 4

Chapter Two: Woman as “Other”: Examining Institutions of Patriarchal Control ......................................................... 6

Chapter Three: Global Patterns of Inequality and Further Challenges for Feminism .......................................................... 8

Chapter Four: An Exploration of the Nexus between Knowledge and Reason as Patriarchal Constructs ......................................................... 9

Chapter Five: Patriarchal Corporeality and Epistemological Patriarchy ............. 13

Chapter Six: Challenging the Presumptions of Epistemological and Rationalist Patriarchy in the context of Emancipatory Pedagogy ............. 16

## CHAPTER ONE: THE WORTH OF A WOMAN: CHALLENGING THE ROLE PLAYED BY EPSITEMOLOGICAL PATRIARCHY IN THE CONTINUING SUBJUGATION OF WOMEN .............................................................. 19

*Epistemological Patriarchy* .......................................................................................................................... 20

Patriarchy .................................................................................................................................................. 21

Feminist Foundations of Epistemological Patriarchy .................................................................................. 23

*The Historical Development of Western Feminism* ....................................................................................... 28

Status of Women, circa. 1750 ...................................................................................................................... 29

Feminism Emerging: ‘Articulation’ .................................................................................................................. 31

Further development of Feminism: ‘Formalisation’ ..................................................................................... 33

Organised Women’s Movement Feminism’s ‘Participation’ Stage .................................................................. 35

Demands of the First Wave Feminists ........................................................................................................ 38

The Second Wave: Women’s Liberation ........................................................................................................ 39

Early Feminist success and the establishment of mass education ................................................................ 41

*Querying the Achievements of Feminism* .................................................................................................. 47

Continued Economic Disparity .................................................................................................................. 49
The Burden of the Second Shift .............................................................. 52
Conclusion ................................................................................................. 52

CHAPTER TWO: WOMAN AS ‘OTHER’: EXAMINING INSTITUTIONS OF
Patriarchal Control...................................................................................... 54

Marriage: Historical Perspectives and modern research ......................... 54
The Christian Church and Marriage .......................................................... 57
Changing attitudes towards marriage ....................................................... 57
Marriage as a Patriarchal institution and Feminist Reform ...................... 59
Further changes to Marriage .................................................................. 61
Modern Research into Marriage ............................................................... 62

Theological Perspectives on Women ......................................................... 66
The Biblical view of nature ...................................................................... 67
Women’s Place in the Hierarchy ............................................................... 71
Woman as Economic Property ................................................................. 72
The Redemption offered by Jesus ............................................................ 75
The Pauline Tradition and the Position of Women .................................... 77
Bad Women: Eve, Mother of All, and Witches, Accomplices of Satan ...... 79
Good Women: Mary, the Mother of God and Nuns, Brides of Christ ...... 85
Modern Women and the Modern Church ................................................. 89

Science and the Feminine ....................................................................... 93
Rachel Carson and masculine science .................................................... 96
Feminist critiques of masculine science ............................................... 97
Reproductive Science and the Control of Women .................................. 101
Mental Health and Masculine Science ................................................... 103

Conclusion ............................................................................................... 105

CHAPTER THREE: GLOBAL PATTERNS OF INEQUALITY AND FURTHER
CHALLENGES FOR FEMINISM ................................................................. 108

Global Economic systems and the Impact upon Women ....................... 109
Women’s Work ....................................................................................... 110
Women workers in the Neo-liberal Global Economy ................................ 111
Third world working conditions in first world countries ...................... 118

Population Movement ........................................................................... 120
Trafficking of People ............................................................................. 121
The extent of the problem ................................................................. 122
The International Response ................................................................. 124
Refugees .............................................................................................................................. 128

Women’s bodies as Commodities .................................................................................... 131

Sex Trafficking and Prostitution ....................................................................................... 132

Sex Tourism ........................................................................................................................ 135

Mail-order Brides ................................................................................................................ 136

The HIV/AIDS Pandemic .................................................................................................... 137

HIV/AIDS: The Global Picture ............................................................................................ 138

AIDS and globalisation ......................................................................................................... 142

AIDS and Women .................................................................................................................. 143

Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 146

CHAPTER FOUR: AN EXPLORATION OF THE NEXUS BETWEEN
KNOWLEDGE AND REASON AS PATRIARCHAL CONSTRUCTS ...................................... 149

A Brief History of Reason .................................................................................................... 150

Ancient Greek Philosophy and Reason .............................................................................. 151

Christian theology and the incorporation of Reason ........................................................... 159

Reason and the emergence of the scientific worldview......................................................... 163

The Enlightenment: The ‘Age of Reason’ ......................................................................... 165

Women and Reason .............................................................................................................. 171

The Ecofeminist Insight ....................................................................................................... 173

The ‘Woman/Nature’ Question ............................................................................................ 177

Reason and the Epistemology of Power .............................................................................. 178

Epistemology of Power ......................................................................................................... 180

Transformative Subjugation ................................................................................................. 184

Educational Implications ..................................................................................................... 188

Epistemology of Power and Patriarchal Rationalism ............................................................ 191

The search for Emancipatory Pedagogy ............................................................................. 194

Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 195

CHAPTER FIVE: PATRIARCHAL CORPOREALITY AND
EPistemological patrIARCHy ............................................................................................... 197

The Mind/Body Split: Epistemological Patriarchy and Patriarchal Corporeality ................ 198

Patriarchal Corporeality: The Sex/Gender/Heteronormality Order ..................................... 204

The Gender Agenda: Masculinity, femininity and patriarchal corporeality.............................. 205

Compulsory heterosexuality: Judith Butler’s Heterosexual matrix ..................................... 208

Gender in Education and Gender Education ..................................................................... 209

The “Boy Turn”: The Gender debate in Education ............................................................. 210

Teachers and expectations of Gender ................................................................................. 212
Students and the enactment of masculinity, femininity and heterosexuality ........................................................................................................................................... 214

**Masculinity** ..................................................................................................................................................................................................................... 219
Masculinity in crisis ........................................................................................................................................................................................................... 219
Hegemonic masculinity ...................................................................................................................................................................................................... 221
Masculinity Studies: Real men and the repudiation of the feminine .......................................................................................................................... 224
Consumption and masculinity .......................................................................................................................................................................................... 227
Masculinity and the potential for positive change ................................................................................................................................................... 229

**Sexuality** .............................................................................................................................................................................................................. 231
Sexuality and the Technology of Sex ......................................................................................................................................................................... 232
Pornography and Rape: Dominance in Sexuality ...................................................................................................................................................... 234
Uncertainty and sexual scripts ..................................................................................................................................................................................... 236
Sex and Language: The priority of the Male experience ........................................................................................................................................ 236

*Conclusion: Can a world cleaved in two be put back together?* ......................................................................................................................................................... 239

**CHAPTER SIX: CHALLENGING THE PRESUMPTIONS OF EPISTEMOLOGICAL AND RATIONALIST PATRIARCHY IN THE CONTEXT OF EMANCIPATORY PEDAGOGY** ........................................................................................................................................................................................................... 242

**Structural Inequality and Epistemological Patriarchy** ............................................................................................................................................................................. 244
Economic opportunities .............................................................................................................................................................................................. 244
The Institute of Marriage: From Patriarchal to Companionship ....................................................................................................................................... 248
The Church and Women ......................................................................................................................................................................................... 250
Science and Women .............................................................................................................................................................................................. 251
Global Economics ........................................................................................................................................................................................................... 252
Education ......................................................................................................................................................................................................................... 254

**Patriarchal Corporeality** .................................................................................................................................................................................................... 256
Sex: A false dichotomy .................................................................................................................................................................................................... 257
Gender ......................................................................................................................................................................................................................... 258

**Education and Epistemological Patriarchy** .................................................................................................................................................................................. 260
Patriarchal Rationalism ................................................................................................................................................................................................. 261
Educational mediation of Epistemological Patriarchy ................................................................................................................................................... 264
Empathetic Education .............................................................................................................................................................................................. 266
Beyond conformity: the search for connectivity .................................................................................................................................................... 267

*Conclusion: The New Frontiers of Feminist Education* ................................................................................................................................................................. 269

REFERENCES ................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 273
This study builds on and contributes to work in the area of educational epistemology and feminist theory. The aim of this thesis is to provide a deeper perception of the potential role which feminist thought can continue to play within the educational context. To advance this critical exploration, I endeavour to provide a tolerably coherent account of the dominant epistemological framework within which many feminist presumptions have emerged. Given that it is popularly believed that the goals of feminism have been met and thus that feminism, especially in the educational context, is no longer such a pressing issue, I seek to demonstrate why such considerations are still applicable in the so-called ‘post-feminist’ era. One of my central objectives in this thesis will be to urge strongly that this is a temptation to be resisted, and I try to show why we should do so. Although the feminist movement has done a great deal to advance the cause of the emancipation of women, a close examination reveals that the lives of women (and, indeed, men) remain textured by oppressive structures and practices which limit the expression of their full personhood. Within the framework of these structural impediments, I endeavour to establish, by appeal to a variety of philosophical case studies, that women continue to suffer considerable disadvantage compared to their male counterparts. Although various scholars have suggested that the current educational context is presupposed by the epistemic values of power and control (Laura & Cotton, 1999; Laura & Marchant, 2002; Marchant, 2006; Laura, Marchant & Smith, 2008) there has not been an investigation into the implications of Laura’s Epistemology of Power theory for feminist education. I argue that unless knowledge is reconceptualised the goals of feminist education are unlikely to be well served within the current educational paradigm.