THE PROCESS OF RESPONSE OF MENTAL HEALTH NURSES WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED ASSAULTS BY THEIR PATIENTS: A GROUNDED THEORY STUDY CONDUCTED IN MENTAL HEALTH INPATIENT SETTINGS.

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Nursing at the University of Newcastle

Charles Harmon, RN, BHSc (Nursing), M.N.

December 2009.
I hereby certify that this thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library*, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

*Unless an Embargo has been approved for a determined period.

Charles Harmon . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . .
Acknowledgements

The work described in this thesis has been supported by a number of people who have provided me with information, advice and encouragement.

Professor Michael Hazelton provided valuable counsel as the principal supervisor for this study. Professor Hazelton demonstrated a generosity of spirit in affording me his time and expertise in discussing the planning and conduct of the study as well as the development of the thesis. His questioning and constructive criticism has enhanced my learning experiences during my doctoral studies.

Dr. Ashley Kable graciously accepted the role of co-supervisor at a time when the thesis was taking shape and was adept at providing a balance of insightful comments and steadfast encouragement. Dr. Kable encouraged me to re-examine what I had achieved in the study and her fresh sense of perspective is greatly valued.

Thanks must go the many nurses and patients who permitted me to observe them during the observational phase of the study. In particular, I would like to take this opportunity to acknowledge the sixteen nurses who became participants during the interview phase of the study and subsequently gave me their time and generously shared their experiences with me.

Finally special thanks are due to my wife, Karen, and my children Alexandra, Timothy and Nicholas for their steadfast support and understanding of my ambition to complete this thesis. Their love and energy has sustained me.

Charles Harmon

Newcastle, AUSTRALIA

September 2010.
Contents

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................................... iii
List of figures and tables ................................................................................................................... xi
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... xii
Key to abbreviations and conventions employed in the data transcriptions ...............xiv

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW OF THE THESIS ........ 1

1. BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY ............................................................................................... 1

1.1 Violence in health care settings .............................................................................................. 1

2. PURPOSE OF THE STUDY ....................................................................................................... 2

3. JUSTIFICATION FOR THE STUDY .......................................................................................... 2

4. RESEARCH QUESTIONS .......................................................................................................... 4

5. RESEARCH APPROACH .......................................................................................................... 5

5.1 Analysis of the data ............................................................................................................... 6

5.2 Personal beliefs underlying the study .................................................................................... 7

5.3 Definitions of terms .............................................................................................................. 8

6. OVERVIEW OF THE CHAPTERS ........................................................................................... 9

CHAPTER TWO: PRELIMINARY REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE ........... 12

1. INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................................... 12

2. ASSAULTS UPON MENTAL HEALTH NURSES IN PSYCHIATRIC HOSPITALS ......................... 12

2.1 Historical perspective: The study of violence in psychiatric care facilities prior to 1980 ........................................................................................................................................ 13

2.2 The study of patient assaults in the 1980s .............................................................................. 14

2.3 Underreporting of patient assaults in US psychiatric hospitals ........................................... 16
2.4 Increases in reported assaults against nurses in psychiatric hospitals.............. 18
2.5 Interpreting data from studies on violence in health care facilities................. 19

3. FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH AGGRESSIVE INCIDENTS IN PSYCHIATRIC HOSPITALS .............................................................................................................. 20

4. ASSAULTS UPON STAFF AS AN OCCUPATIONAL HEALTH AND SAFETY ISSUE..................................................................................................................... 24
   4.1 Aggression in mental health settings in the Australian context .................... 26
   4.2 Trends in violent crime statistics, including assaults, in Australian society..... 29

5. ESTIMATING THE FINANCIAL COST OF WORKPLACE VIOLENCE .................... 31

6. NURSES’ ATTITUDES TO PATIENT VIOLENCE ............................................ 33
   6.1 Nurses’ attitudes towards assaulted colleagues ........................................... 34

7. CONCLUSION....................................................................................................... 35

CHAPTER THREE: METHOD OF ENQUIRY .................................................................. 36

1. INTRODUCTION.................................................................................................. 36

2. RATIONALE FOR USING MIXED METHODS OF ENQUIRY IN THIS STUDY ......................................................................................................................... 36

3. RATIONALE FOR USING GROUNDED THEORY METHOD IN THE PRESENT STUDY ................................................................................................................. 37

4. RESEARCH METHODS USED TO STUDY SOCIAL PHENOMENA ............... 38
   4.1 The emergence of qualitative research methods ............................................ 39
   4.2 Symbolic interactionism as a basis for grounded theory............................... 41

5. GROUNDED THEORY ......................................................................................... 42
   5.1 Overview of the method.................................................................................. 42
   5.2 Types of theory produced by grounded theory research .............................. 43
5.3 Further explanation of concepts related to grounded theory .................. 44
5.4 Literature as a source of data ....................................................... 48
5.5 Glaserian and Straussian versions of grounded theory method .......... 49
5.6 Circumstances leading to the use of the Glaserian approach in this study ......51
5.7 Ensuring rigour in grounded theory research .................................. 52
5.8 Methodological limitations to grounded theory .................................. 53

6. CONCLUSION .................................................................................. 54

CHAPTER FOUR: METHOD OF ENQUIRY: PROCEDURES .................. 55
1. INTRODUCTION .............................................................................. 55
2. THE STUDY SETTINGS ................................................................. 55
3. GAINING ENTRY AND RECRUITING STUDY PARTICIPANTS ........... 62
   3.1 Ethics committee approval ....................................................... 62
   3.2 Conduct of the non-participant observation phase ...................... 62
   3.3 Gaining access to the study environment and participants during Phase Two of the study ................................................................. 67
   3.4 Journals, field notes and memos ............................................... 75
   3.5 Protecting the confidentiality of participants ............................. 75
4. CONCLUSION .................................................................................. 76

CHAPTER FIVE: DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS .......................... 77
1. INTRODUCTION .............................................................................. 77
2. PHASE ONE .................................................................................... 77
   2.1 Management of the data: ............................................................ 77
   2.2 Coding processes used to analyse data ...................................... 79
5. HOW COULD THINGS BE DIFFERENT? SUGGESTIONS FOR PRACTICE .......................................................... 177

5.1 Recommendations about the education of inpatient mental health nurses regarding the potential effects of patient assaults .......................... 178

5.2 Recommendations about the provision of support groups and clinical supervision for assaulted mental health nurses ................................. 180

6. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH .................................. 181

7. CONCLUDING COMMENTS ................................................................. 182

References .............................................................................................. 184

Appendix A: Demographic data form .......................................................... 216
Appendix B: Patient assault response questionnaire .................................... 219
Appendix C: Perceived stress scale .............................................................. 223
Appendix D: Information sheet (Phase One) ............................................... 225
Appendix E: CONSENT FORM- Observation of nurses in a mental health unit (Phase One) .......................................................... 227
Appendix F: Advertisement (Phase One) ...................................................... 228
Appendix G: Example of sociogram ............................................................ 229
Appendix H: Advertisement (Phase Two) ..................................................... 230
Appendix I: Information sheet: participant’s copy (Phase Two) .................. 231
Appendix J: CONSENT FORM- Interviews with assaulted nurses (Phase Two) ...... 233
Appendix K: Example of a ‘formulation’ prepared prior to the second interview (Phase Two) .......................................................... 234
Appendix L: Example of a ‘formulation’ prepared prior to the third interview (Phase Two) .......................................................... 235
Appendix M: Example of field notes from Phase One of the study .............. 236
Appendix N: Examples of initial codes, selective codes and related theoretical codes with examples of occurrence in the data set: Phase One of the study .......................... 240
Appendix O: Examples of initial codes, selective codes and related theoretical codes with examples of occurrence in the data set: Phase Two, interview two of the study .......................... 243
Appendix P: Examples of initial codes, selective codes and related theoretical codes with examples of occurrence in the data set: Phase Two, interview three of the study 244

APPENDIX Q: Table 10: Summary of participants’ responses to the assault response questionnaire (n=16) ............................................................................................................................................245

List of figures and tables

Figure: 1: Depiction of nursing levels of process in relation to the Phase One core category: Responding to others in an ad hoc manner ................................................................. 86

Figure 2: Reported period of time taken to recover from assault at interview two: Phase Two participants (n=16) ........................................................................................................... 97

Figure 3: Depiction of churning anxiety phase of recovery: Phase Two participants. .... 102

Figure 4: Comparison of period of time reported for recovery from major effects of assault at interview two and interview three: Phase Two of the study (n=16) ............... 104

Figure 5: Depiction of reintegration phase of recovery: Phase Two participants. ....... 108

Figure 6: Depiction of the recovery trajectory for Phase Two participants ............... 111

Table 1: Age distribution of Phase Two participants in years (n=16) ......................... 88

Table 2: Total years of nursing experience of Phase Two participants (n=16) ........... 88

Table 3: Total years of mental health nursing experience of Phase Two participants (n=16) .............................................................................................................................. 89

Table 4: Summary of educational qualifications attained by Phase Two participants (n=16) .............................................................................................................................. 89

Table 5: Number of previous patient assaults experienced by Phase Two participants (n=16) ............................................................................................................................ 90

Table 6: Type of assault experienced by Phase Two participants (n=16) .................... 92

Table 7: Type of injury experienced by Phase Two participants (n=16) ...................... 92

Table 8: Level of threat perceived by Phase Two participants during their assault (n=16) .............................................................................................................................. 93

Table 9: Responses to assault reported on the ARQ by Phase Two participants during their first interview (n=16) ................................................................................................. 95

Table 10: (Appendix Q) Summary of participants’ responses to the assault response questionnaire (n=16) ............................................................................................................... 245

Table 11: Comparison of reported time taken to recover from the major effects of assault at interview two and interview three by four participants: Phase Two of the study .......................................................................................................................... 103
Abstract

This study examines the experience of inpatient mental health nurses who have been assaulted by their patients. The study was conducted in two phases in the inpatient units of a mental health service in regional New South Wales, Australia. Grounded theory method was used to analyse the data collected during Phase One in which the researcher conducted non-participant observation of three units. This enabled the researcher to explore the nurses’ working environment and develop a theory which explained the way in which inpatient mental health nurses interacted with their patients in the provision of care. Phase One findings provided contextual information which facilitated the understanding of subsequent data collected during Phase Two. Mixed methods were used during Phase Two of the study in which sixteen recently assaulted nurse were interviewed within three weeks of their assault and then on two subsequent occasions at three months and six months post-assault. None of the nurses experienced lasting physical trauma as a result of their assault however nine reported psychological effects lasting from several weeks to several months. Data were analysed using descriptive statistics and grounded theory method. The main purpose of this study was to develop a substantive theory which explained the process of response and, by extension, recovery of the mental health nurses to the experience of assault by a patient.

Data analysis during Phase One of the study revealed that the mental health nurses were constantly dealing with the problem of a chaotic work environment and a preoccupation with ensuring the smooth operation of the unit which was done in preference to the provision of therapeutic nursing care. The emergent core category of nurses responding to others in an ad hoc manner explained the tendency of the nurses to constantly deal with the needs of others rather than actively plan patient care. Data analysis during Phase Two of the study revealed that participants tended to use passive coping strategies in the aftermath of their assault by a patient. Whilst some participants were able to forget about their assault and get on with their lives, however, others who were more severely affected by their assault developed a coping pattern characterised by churning anxiety which featured assault reminders, passive coping strategies, assault response mediators (which referred to the availability of support from peers and nursing
administrators) and a sense of futility related to the belief about the inevitability of workplace assault. The *churning anxiety* phase of recovery was followed by a later *reintegration* phase in which the participants adopted a more active coping style accompanied by a sense of residual vulnerability and ongoing futility. An important finding was that the participants reported that they were compromised in their ability to effectively engage with patients as they recovered from their assault. The basic social process emerging from the data for the severely affected assaulted nurses was labelled moving from passive to active coping strategies in the context of the nurses overcoming futility focused about the assault.

The significance of this study is that the nurses who experienced more severe post-assault responses had a recovery that was completed in stages as they passed from the churning anxiety phase to the reintegration phase and this finding adds to the understanding of the complex phenomenon of recovery after assault. The finding also has occupational health and safety implications for employers as they assist mental health nurses to recover from the effects of patient assault. It is concluded that, with further research, interventions might be tailored to assist nurses in the recovery process depending upon their phase of recovery. This may enable assaulted nurses to decrease their distress and enable them to more effectively fulfil their professional role by engaging with their patients.
Key to abbreviations and conventions employed in the data transcriptions

In the presentation of transcript material in this thesis the following abbreviations and conventions have been used.

**Names:** all names used in reference to study participants (e.g. Bruce, Nigel, Krystal, etc.) are pseudonyms or initials (e.g. ‘A’ for Anne). Other patients and staff referred to in the thesis have been labelled Patient or Staff and numbered (e.g. Patient #3).

*The initial ‘C’:* refers to the researcher (as occurs in Chapter 7, p. 166).

*The initial ‘p’:* refers to pages.

*[Bold letters in brackets]:* represent the researcher’s coding of the data.

*…:* signifies a pause in the original interview.