‘LANDSCAPE OF FULFILMENT’: A MODEL FOR UNDERSTANDING RURAL MEDICAL RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION

Helen Mary Tolhurst MB, BS (Hons)

Submitted for Doctorate of Philosophy (General Practice) in March 2008
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and to the best of my knowledge and belief contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my Thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP/ COLLABORATION

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this Thesis, is the result of original research, the greater part of which was completed subsequent to admission for candidature for the degree.

The data for the two Female Rural General Practice Studies were collected as part of collaborative projects and I undertook a descriptive analysis of this data in collaboration with other academics while I was employed at the University of Newcastle, prior to admission for candidature. However all of the analysis of the Female Rural GP data reported in this Thesis was undertaken subsequent to admission for candidature of the degree.

During the initial stages of the Student project I worked collaboratively with Dr Mark Stewart, a general practice academic registrar under my supervision. I was responsible for the conceptualisation of the project, the project development, most of the data collection, and most of the data analysis. Dr Stewart worked under my supervision on analysing data thematically in relation to issues not reported in this Thesis.

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this Thesis contains published papers of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of the Thesis a written statement from each co-author attesting to my contribution to joint publications.

Signature

Date
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS TO

Katie and Jennie McGill and Jenny Stewart-Williams for their wonderful and caring support

Associate Professor Jon Adams my principal supervisor for introducing me to many of the joys of qualitative research and co-supervisor Professor John Fraser who provided wise insights and advice and the academic support I needed to complete this Thesis

Jane McDonald and Lee-Anne Wilson-Smith for their patience in providing technical support

The medical students and rural GP participants who generously gave their time and candidly told of their experiences and without whom this Thesis would not have been possible
CONTENTS

Statement of originality .............................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgement of authorship/collaboration ........................................................................ ii
Abstract .................................................................................................................................... 1
Executive summary ................................................................................................................... 3
  Background .............................................................................................................................. 3
  Aims of thesis .......................................................................................................................... 4
  Research questions .................................................................................................................. 4
  Brief outline of the thesis ......................................................................................................... 5
Chapter 1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 13
  1.1 Background ....................................................................................................................... 13
  1.2 Aims of thesis ..................................................................................................................... 14
  1.3 Research questions ............................................................................................................. 15
  1.4 How this thesis will bring a new approach to rural medical workforce research ............ 15
Chapter 2 Literature review And Development of Thesis Aims .................................................. 17
  2.1 Rural Medical Workforce Shortages ................................................................................... 17
  2.2 Defining rurality, recruitment and retention ..................................................................... 21
  2.3 Rural general practitioners in Australia ............................................................................ 25
  2.4 Quantitative research on the recruitment of rural doctors .................................................. 27
  2.5 Quantitative research on the retention of rural doctors ....................................................... 37
  2.6 Female rural doctors ......................................................................................................... 43
  2.7 Women in medicine .......................................................................................................... 58
  2.8 Relationship between research literature on rural doctors, female rural doctors and women in medicine .................................................................................................................. 69
  2.9 Models and decision making frameworks for understanding rural recruitment and retention ................................................................................................................................................. 71
  2.10 Qualitative research on rural recruitment and retention ................................................... 77
  2.11 What gaps are there in the literature? Where to from here? ............................................. 90
Chapter 3 Methods ................................................................................................................... 93
  3.1 Why a qualitative methodology ......................................................................................... 94
  3.2 Theoretical approach ........................................................................................................ 95
  3.3 Case series design and overall methodological approach of the three studies presented and analysed in this thesis ................................................................................................................. 96
  3.4 Detailed description of methods used in student study ...................................................... 104
  3.5 Detailed description of methods used in initial female rural GP study ............................. 113
  3.6 Detailed description of methods used in second female rural GP study ......................... 119
  3.7 Summary of methods ........................................................................................................ 125
Chapter 4 Rural Recruitment: Attitudes and Intentions of Medical Students to Rural Practice ............................................................................................................................... 127
  Background ............................................................................................................................ 127
  Research Questions ............................................................................................................... 127
  Results ...................................................................................................................................... 128
  4.1 Descriptive analysis .......................................................................................................... 128
  4.2 Thematic analysis .............................................................................................................. 131
  4.3 Summary of results .......................................................................................................... 188
Chapter 5 Variations in model for particular groups of students ............................................. 193
  5.1 Analysis relating to groups of students: Rationale and methods ...................................... 193
  5.2 Female students .............................................................................................................. 194
  5.3 Male students .................................................................................................................. 199
  5.4 Rural background students ............................................................................................. 202
  5.5 Urban background students ............................................................................................ 206
  5.6 Young students .............................................................................................................. 210
  5.7 Mature-aged students .................................................................................................... 213
  5.8 Summary ......................................................................................................................... 216
Chapter 6 Women in Rural General Practice ............................................................................ 217
  Background ............................................................................................................................ 217
# TABLE OF FIGURES

Table 4-1: Domains with factors grouped into domains identified from student focus group data .................................................. 132
Table 4-2: Interrelationships between domains identified from student focus group data ......................................................... 133
Table 4-3: Aspects of place and relationship between self and place ...................................................................................... 134
Table 4-4: Aspects of work and relationship between self and work ...................................................................................... 146
Table 4-5: Aspects of significant others and relationships between self and significant others ...................................................... 157
Table 4-6: Revised model showing relationships between domains of Self, Place, Work, Significant others, and Significant others’ work .................................................................................. 162
Table 4-7: Overlap between the domains of Self, Place, Work, Significant others and Significant others’ work .......................... 163
Table 4-8: Aspects of recreation and relationship between self and recreation ........................................................................ 167
Table 4-9: Revised model including all the domains identified, and relationships between the domains .................................... 169
Table 4-10: Revised model with all domains and strength of interrelationships between the domains .................................... 175
Table 4-11: ‘Landscape of fulfilment’ Model for understanding recruitment of rural doctors ...................................................... 189
Table 4-12: Landscape of fulfilment model, showing overlap and interactions between domains .................................................. 191
Table 5-1: Landscape of fulfilment for female family-oriented primary family carer ............................................................. 194
Table 5-2: Landscape of fulfilment for family oriented primary family carer ................................................................. 195
Table 5-3: Landscape of fulfilment for female care delegators .......................................................................................... 195
Table 5-4: Male family oriented students- family providers ................................................................................................ 200
Table 5-5: Landscape of fulfilment for rural oriented rural background students ............................................................. 203
Table 5-6: Landscape of fulfilment for urban-oriented rural background students ............................................................. 203
Table 5-7: Landscape of fulfilment for rural oriented urban background students ............................................................ 207
Table 5-8: Landscape of fulfilment for urban-oriented urban background students ............................................................ 207
Table 5-9: Landscape of fulfilment for younger students ................................................................................................. 211
Table 5-10: Landscape of fulfilment for mature aged students ...................................................................................... 214
Table 6-1: Aspects of place and relationship between self and place ...................................................................................... 221
Table 6-2: Aspects of the community with whom female rural doctors had relationships ...................................................... 222
Table 6-3: Aspects of work and relationship between self and work ...................................................................................... 231
Table 6-4: Interrelationships between aspects of the domain of work for female rural GPs ...................................................... 240
Table 6-5: Aspects of significant others and relationships between self and significant others ...................................................... 259
Table 6-6: Aspects of recreation and relationship between self and recreation ............................................................. 271
Table 6-7: Aspects of identity for female rural GPs ..................................................................................................... 278
Table 6-8: The ‘Landscape of fulfilment’ model for female rural doctors ...................................................................................... 284
TABLE OF TABLES

Table 2:1 Factors identified as important in attracting subgroups of doctors and medical students to rural areas ...............................................................29
Table 2:2 Results of literature review: Summary of positive and negative aspects of rural life and practice identified by rural doctors ........................................38
Table 2:3 Difference in demographic characteristics of female and male rural GPs ........45
Table 2:4 Summary of literature review: Personal and professional issues identified by female rural doctors ........................................................................51
Table 2:5 Demographic and professional differences between male and female doctors identified in the literature review .......................................................59
Table 2:6 Comparison of issues identified as problems by female doctors, all rural doctors and female rural doctors ........................................................................70
Table 3:1 Numbers of participants in focus groups and interviews ................................106
Table 3:2 Focus group composition: one focus group was held in each category shown ..........107
Table 3:3 Number of focus group participants in female rural doctor study .......................116
Table 4:1 Summary of factors influencing medical student location choice .......................129
Table 6:1 Issues identified by focus group and interview participants ............................219
Table 8:1 Current and new recruitment strategies in relationship to the 'Landscape of fulfilment' model ........................................................................309
Table 8:2 Current and new retention strategies in relation to the 'Landscape of fulfilment' model ................................................................................311
Table 8:3 Recruitment strategies suitable for subgroups of doctors .................................314
ABSTRACT

Background

Due to an ongoing shortage of rural medical professionals both in Australia and internationally, the recruitment and retention of rural doctors has been extensively researched. Mostly the research used quantitative methods to focus on factors associated with rural medical workforce recruitment and retention issues, and until now, limited work has investigated inter-relationships between these factors. Although a few qualitative studies have used thematic analysis to develop models to better understand these issues, none have specifically considered the attitudes of medical students, and female rural doctors. This Thesis responds to this need by using qualitative research methods to develop a model that incorporates feminisation of the medical workforce and generational change in the 21st century. Data were collected from Australian medical students and female rural general practitioners (GPs) as study participants.

Aims

The broad aims were to develop a model for understanding recruitment and retention of rural doctors in Australia, incorporating concepts of place, gender, and professional identity.

Research Questions

How are Australian medical students’ and female general practitioners’ perceptions of entering and remaining in a rural health career influenced by the constructs of place, gender and professional identity?

Does this perception change as doctors’ progress through their careers from students to practising general practitioners?

Methods

A case series of three qualitative studies were used to develop a model for understanding rural GP recruitment and retention. Data, collected using focus groups and interviews, were analysed thematically by domains describing
participants’ lives, and the interaction between the domains was explored to better understand influences on location choice.

Results

The ‘Landscape of fulfilment’ model which is integral to this research, incorporates the domains of self, place, work, significant others, recreation, and significant others’ work as the domains of life which influence location choice. Most participants sought balance within their lives, and maximum fulfilment in all domains, but at times they faced conflict between domains. Individuals’ gender, professional, and place identities were related to how they viewed the domains and how the domains interacted.

Conclusion

This model provides a way of understanding the complex interaction between aspects of life that affect a doctor’s location choice. There is important potential to use the model to inform the development of rural medical recruitment and retention strategies, and as a basis for further rural health workforce research. The model has already been used by General Practice Education and Training (GPET) in developing post graduate general practice training research, and also by the Sustainable Practice Working Group of the Rural Faculty of the Royal Australian College of General Practitioners (RACGP) in developing strategies for sustainable rural general practice.