Exploring social supports/support services and decisions to leave or change with women who have experienced domestic partner violence

Lyn Marie Francis
BN, MHM, LLB, LLM, Grad.Cert.TT

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Submitted October 15th 2014
Statement of Originality

The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library**, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968. **Unless an Embargo has been approved for a determined period.
Acknowledgements

Most importantly I acknowledge and thank the 12 women who courageously offered to tell me their stories of experiencing and ending domestic violence. I also wish to acknowledge and offer my gratitude to the 25 professionals who participated and shared their knowledge and experience during three focus groups.

I wish to acknowledge and thank my two supervisors Associate Professor Deborah Loxton and Doctor Colin James. Your patience, perseverance, guidance and wisdom were immeasurable. I also wish to acknowledge my many colleagues at the University of Newcastle, and elsewhere, who provided support and advice.

I acknowledge Jane Todd for professional copy editing and proofreading advice as covered in the Australian Standards for Editing Practice, Standards D and E, and Lana Prendergast for the final formatting.

Undertaking a PhD is not an easy passage either professionally or personally. I thank all my family and friends who shared this journey with me. In particular I thank my husband Jim Francis who has been right beside me during all the ups and downs. I also acknowledge my three sons Russel, Logan and Shane and their partners and children. My grandchildren helped to keep me grounded during this pilgrimage! To my dear mum and son Russel who passed away during this journey I love you and I thank you.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Originality</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1: Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Significance of the study</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 Definitions of domestic violence</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 Prevalence of domestic violence</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3 Definitions and models of social support</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.4 Social support and domestic violence</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.5 Summary</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Organisation of the thesis</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2: Literature Review</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Search strategy</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Women leaving or ending domestic violence</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Disclosure of domestic violence</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Barriers to disclosure</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Screening for domestic violence in the health sector</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 Mandatory reporting of DV when children are involved</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Facilitators for ending or leaving domestic violence</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Readiness to change</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Turning points</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 Other facilitators</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Barriers to leaving or ending domestic violence</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Loss of personal identity</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 Financial barriers</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.5.3 Other barriers........................................................................................................ 44
2.6 Social support; referrals and helpfulness................................................................. 45
2.7 Social support that may help .................................................................................... 47
2.8 Barriers to social support.......................................................................................... 49
2.9 Social support and leave or stay decision making ............................................... 52
2.10 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 53

Chapter 3: Mode of Inquiry .......................................................................................... 55
3.1 Why a qualitative approach? ...................................................................................... 57
3.2 Narrative inquiry ....................................................................................................... 59
3.3 Collecting narratives ................................................................................................. 62
3.4 Analysis ..................................................................................................................... 64
3.5 Focus groups ............................................................................................................. 65
3.6 Interpretation of narratives ...................................................................................... 67
3.7 Validity ...................................................................................................................... 70
3.7.1 Sensitivity to context............................................................................................. 71
3.7.2 Commitment and rigour ....................................................................................... 71
3.73 Transparency and cohesiveness ............................................................................. 72
3.7.4 Impact and importance ......................................................................................... 73
3.8 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 73

Chapter 4: Method ....................................................................................................... 75
4.1 Sampling and participant selection........................................................................... 77
4.1.2 Researching sensitive topics ................................................................................ 78
4.2 Attention to ethical details ....................................................................................... 80
4.2.1 Documentation to participants ........................................................................... 81
4.2.2 Information and consent procedures .................................................................. 82
4.2.3 Confidentiality and privacy ................................................................................ 84
4.2.4 Storage of data for all interviews ....................................................................... 84
4.2.5 Discussion of anonymity of participant and data .............................................. 85
5.1.1 Internal factors ................................................................. 106
5.1.2 External factors ................................................................. 112
5.1.3 Culture of pretence ............................................................. 117
5.1.4 Attachment ................................................................. 120
5.2 The process of leaving ......................................................... 123
5.2.1 The build up to leaving: realisation .................................... 125
5.2.2 Reality check…this is domestic violence ............................... 127
5.2.3 Facing reality…regaining strength ...................................... 130
5.2.4 Leave or die............................................................................ 131
5.2.5 Overcoming impediments to action ..................................... 132
5.3 After the leaving…not the end of the violence? ....................... 137
5.4 Conclusion ............................................................................ 138

Chapter 6: Phase 1 Findings B: Help Seeking ............................... 142
6.1 Informal support ................................................................. 144
6.1.1 Reluctance, help seeking and conditional support ................. 145
6.1.2 Feeling empowered and emotionally supported .................. 147
6.1.3 Opportunistic leaving, fear and safety .................................. 148
6.1.4 Pets, neighbours, acts of kindness and information ............. 151
6.1.5 Summary of informal support ............................................ 153
6.2 Formal support ................................................................. 154
6.2.1 Legal services ....................................................................... 155
6.2.2 Health services ................................................................. 160
6.2.3 Social services: government and non-government organisations .... 163
6.2.4 Formal support: on the right path? ...................................... 169
6.2.4.1 Support that helped ......................................................... 169
6.2.4.2 Support that may harm ...................................................... 170
6.3 Conclusion ............................................................................ 171

Chapter 7: Phase 2 Findings: Focus Groups ................................. 175
7.1 Roles of professionals/service providers ........................................... 176
7.2 Validation and acknowledgement of barriers ...................................... 177
7.3 Barriers to leaving – culture of pretence ........................................... 179
7.4 Helping women to see reality .......................................................... 181
7.5 Helping women to develop goals ...................................................... 184
7.6 Helping women use anger and energy .............................................. 186
7.7 Not ‘cutting the cord’ if women return or stay in domestic violence ...... 187
7.8 Overcoming or working around the barriers ...................................... 188
7.9 Barriers to service provision ........................................................... 194
7.10 Helping women navigate the legal system ....................................... 199
7.11 Collaborating with other services ................................................... 201
7.12 Tailored support ............................................................................ 204
7.13 Conclusion ..................................................................................... 207

Chapter 8: Discussion: Traversing the Convoluted Façade to Get Help 209
8.1 Summary of findings ........................................................................ 210
8.2 Being non-judgemental .................................................................... 211
8.3 Complexity of barriers .................................................................... 212
8.4 Flexibility of service provision ........................................................ 215
8.5 Culture of pretence .......................................................................... 216
8.6 Empowerment versus disempowerment .......................................... 219
8.7 Navigating the systems .................................................................... 220
8.8 Multipronged approach .................................................................... 221
8.9 Strengths of this research .................................................................. 224
8.10 Limitations ....................................................................................... 226
8.11 Future research ................................................................................ 227
8.12 Recommendations for Policy Makers and Service Providers ......... 228
8.13 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 229

Appendices: 1-14 ................................................................................... 231
Appendix 1 Demographic survey for focus group participants .......... 231
Appendix 2 HREC approval May 2007 ........................................... 232
Appendix 3 HREC approval for variations 2008 - 2010 ....................... 233
Appendix 4 Poster for recruiting participants Phase 1 ......................... 236
Appendix 5 HREC approved advertisement .................................... 237
Appendix 6 Information Statement Phase 1 participants .................... 238
Appendix 7 Consent form Phase 1 participants .................................. 241
Appendix 8 Information Statement Focus group participants ............... 243
Appendix 9 Consent form Focus group participants ............................ 246
Appendix 10 Confidentiality agreement for transcriptionist ................ 248
Appendix 11 Preliminary findings Phase 1 ....................................... 249
Appendix 12 Phase 1 interviews – demographics and guiding questions ........ 252
Appendix 13 Focus group interview schedule ..................................... 256
Appendix 14 Summary of findings Phase 2 Focus groups .................... 257

Bibliography .................................................................................. 262
Abstract

This research examined how women perceive their experience of ending or leaving domestic violence and help seeking during that process. Additionally this research investigated how service providers identified their professional role in assisting women to end abusive relationships.

Domestic violence continues to occur worldwide with the long term consequences to health for woman experiencing such abuse being well known. Many women do not recognise their situation as violence and they may choose not to disclose violent behaviour or seek help. Social support provided by informal sources or professional support providers has been associated with a decrease in health effects for women experiencing abuse, particularly where the support provided is matched to the woman’s perceived needs.

The research process was undertaken using a narrative inquiry framework with thematic analysis utilised to identify themes. I conducted twelve interviews with women who had experienced and ended violent relationships (Phase 1). Additionally I conducted three focus groups with professionals whose work includes assisting women experiencing domestic violence (Phase 2).

This project identifies and describes the difficulties for women experiencing domestic violence in identifying or acknowledging the abuse in their relationship. Self-blame and other barriers were identified as preventing disclosure but also led women to normalise the violence to enable women to feel ‘safe’. This ‘culture of pretence’ inhibited disclosure and help seeking. This research explores how women overcame the culture of pretence and other barriers in order to leave or end domestic violence. The professional’s identified role in this process is reported and analysed.

This project articulated what women said they needed in order to support them in making stay/leave decisions regarding the violent relationships. The provision of tailored support and the difficulties inherent in providing support specifically tailored to women’s needs were correspondingly explored. The strength of this narrative research approach included the identification of issues by women and service providers that are pertinent to providing tailored support, including a multipronged approach which incorporates a variety of services that vary depending on her individual requirements at that point in time.
Glossary

**AVO/ADVO** – Apprehended Violence Order. In NSW AVOs protect people by ordering the defendants not to do specific acts which are set out in a list. Women experiencing abuse from an intimate partner relationship would be seeking a specific type of order called an Apprehended Domestic Violence Order (ADVO) although the participants in this research referred to these orders as ‘AVOs’ hence the use of this term in this research. In other states different terminology may be used including ‘restraint order’ which is also referred to in this research.

**CALD** – culturally and linguistically diverse

**CAS** – Composite Abuse Scale

**Children and Young Persons (Care and Protection) Act NSW (1998)** – shortened to ‘Care Act’ 1998

**CLE** – community legal education which may be provided by the NGO sector to others in the NGO sector, the public and/or women experiencing domestic violence.

**DOCS** – Department of Community Services; this NSW government department changed its name to Family and Community Services (FACs) however participants in this research still referred to them as DOCS.

**DOH** – Department of Health NSW (name changed to Ministry of Health NSW in 2012 following change of government)

**DV** – domestic violence

**DVLO** – domestic violence liaison officer. Police officer with additional training or qualifications in order to deal with domestic violence matters.

**HREC** – Human Research Ethics Committee (University of Newcastle)

**IVAWS** – International Violence Against Women Survey

**NGO** – non government organisation. They are smaller organisations who are not part of the government sector although rely on the government for funding in addition to raising funds from donations or the private sector. Called the ‘third sector’ in some countries (first sector government, second sector private).

**PSS** – Personal Safety Survey (Australia 2005 and 2012)

**SOC** – Stages of Change model
**TTM** – The Trantheoretical Model also called the Stages of Change (SOC) model

**US** – United States of America

**WAST** – Woman Abuse Screening Tool

**WHO** – World Health Organization