EMOTIONAL ORIENTALISMS:
A POSTCOLONIAL STUDY OF EMOTIONS IN HIV AND AIDS DEVELOPMENT WORK IN PNG

Jack Aisbett BSc (Hons Class 1)
Candidate for Doctor of Philosophy in Geography
September 2014
The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or
diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and
belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where
due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being
made available worldwide when deposited in the University’s Digital Repository**, subject to
the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

**Unless an Embargo has been approved for a determined period

Signed: Jack Aisbett
Acknowledgements

This thesis would not be possible without the great support and countless input of many wonderful people. First off, I would like to thank my research participants that gave up their time so that I could interview them. More so I would like to thank them for their openness and honesty. I asked them to open up about their emotions and they responded both generously and reflexively. Without such honesty this thesis would be much the poorer.

Next, I wish to thank the supervisors who saw me through the PhD process. First off I must thank my principal supervisor Sarah Wright who has been with me the whole way on this journey. Her help and advice has helped me through many of the rough patches throughout the thesis experience. Her advice was often thought provoking and enlightened my thinking immensely. Without her help this PhD would not have been written. I would also like to thank my co-supervisor Jenny Cameron. Her knowledge too was invaluable for shaping my understanding and approach to this thesis topic. The writing classes she taught were also very valuable to improving my writing style. I would also like to thank Kathy Mee for help with some of the shaky first attempts in writing my PhD chapters. I would also like to thank her for checking in on me while I was in PNG.

I would also like to thank the geography department at the University of Newcastle. All members of the staff and many of the students helped to produce a very friendly and collegial atmosphere.

I am also greatly indebted to my family for their love, help and support over the time of my thesis. I would especially like to thank Janet Aisbett and Greg Gibbon for their boundless generosity in providing me with a place to stay and study over my many numerous trips to Newcastle. I would like to especially thank Janet Aisbett for her tireless efforts proof reading all my drafts and chapters from the beginning of the process. I have learnt a lot from her help. I would also like to thank my parents, Chris and Kate Aisbett, for their kindness and love throughout this whole process. I would also like to thank my parents for providing me with a place to live and employment over some of the most crucial years of my thesis. Kate also provided some editorial help to a number of my thesis chapters that I found extremely valuable. I also give my thanks to my sister for cheering me up and talking me through some of the low moments in the PhD writing process.

Finally a big thanks goes out to my partner Paula Brown, who has been with me for most of this journey. Over that time she has been a constant source of love and support. Her direct, but always kind, advice has helped foster much of the emotional growth required to complete a PhD.
Table of Contents

List of Tables and Figures ........................................................................................................ VII

Abstract ..................................................................................................................................... VIII

Chapter 1: Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1
  1.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Aims ............................................................................................................................... 7
  1.3 Structure ....................................................................................................................... 8
  1.4 Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 10

Chapter 2: The Theoretical Context of the Research ............................................................... 11
  2.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 11
  2.2 The Theory of Orientalism and the Field of Postcolonial Studies ......................... 12
  2.3 Social Science Research into Emotions ..................................................................... 31
  2.3 Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 45

Chapter 3: Contextualising HIV and AIDS Development in PNG ..................................... 47
  3.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 47
  3.2 Papua New Guinea Country Description .................................................................... 48
  3.3 A Colonial History of PNG .......................................................................................... 54
  3.4 Development Agencies in PNG and their Response to HIV and AIDS ................. 60
6.5 Sympathy and Connection .............................................................................................. 157

6.6 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 162

Chapter 7: Belonging and the Reaffirmation of a Sense of Self in the Resort, Home and Village.
.................................................................................................................................................. 165

7.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 165

7.2 The Emotional Responses to the Work Place ................................................................. 166

7.3 Home ............................................................................................................................... 180

7.4 The Role of the Resort and Western Leisure Life ............................................................ 190

7.5 Heading for the Hills........................................................................................................ 199

7.6 Discussion ........................................................................................................................ 203

7.7 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 222

Chapter 8: The Emotional Interaction between Policy and Development Workers ............ 226

8.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 226

8.2 Policy and its Effects on Development Workers’ Emotions.......................................... 227

8.3 How Development Agencies Might be Influenced by the Emotions Felt by Development Workers........................................................................................................................................ 234

8.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 239

Chapter 9: Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 241

9.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 241

9.2 Thesis Contributions ....................................................................................................... 242

9.3 Limitations and Future Research .................................................................................... 260
9.4 Conclusion ................................................................................................................................. 262

Appendix 1 ....................................................................................................................................... 264

References ......................................................................................................................................... 269

List of Tables and Figures

Figure 1 Map of Papua New Guinea .......................................................... 48

Table 1: How my suite of research methods is applied in this thesis .......... 78

Figure 2: Image of PNG People Treating Someone with HIV and AIDS in a Positive Manner .... 144
Abstract

This thesis is a call for greater reflexivity on the role of emotions in development. It argues that emotions are integral in both reproductions of Orientalisms and in producing resistances to Orientalisms. The framework for this research is a combination of Postcolonial Studies and Emotional Geographies, and a case study of HIV and AIDS development work in Papua New Guinea (PNG). The methods used are several forms of critical discourse analysis applied to: mainstream development research; development policy (at several levels); in-country experience; and the middle ground between policy and policy enactment. The data sources were: 30 mainstream HIV and AIDS development research articles; 4 policy documents; 20 in depth interviews; and a free writing journal documenting 3 months of participant observations in a PNG HIV and AIDS development organisation. Results reveal evidence of emotions, of attempts to avoid unpleasant emotions, and of attempts to elicit emotions in others in all aspects of the development process. In the case of PNG HIV and AIDS Development work, it seems that emotions, or the attempts to influence emotions, have the potential to promote or resist Orientalisms. Of particular note are feelings of uncertainty, confusion and disorientation. If one is reflexive, these emotions may be powerful in generating resistance to Orientalisms, but without reflexivity they can reproduce them in powerful ways. I conclude this thesis by claiming that a reflexive understanding of the roles of emotions can uncover covert and persistent forms of Orientalisms in development work. Emotional reflexivity can also help find new ways of thinking and being that can move the ‘West’ beyond Orientalisms. In particular, I call for more reflexive ways of embracing and accepting the uncertainty that is inherent in the development process.
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Introduction

What do Westerners feel when they hear of the suffering and illness caused by disease in the Third World? Concern, pity and sympathy for people they imagine as worse off than themselves are amongst the emotions that may be invoked (Vaux, 2001). Others may feel a sense of guilt or horror at the situation, yet very few turn these emotive responses into practical action.

There are, however, people who are moved to act in ways that can be both profound and life changing for those involved. Such people include development workers. Because of this, development workers and the work that they do, are often represented as being empathetic, altruistic and humane (Vaux, 2001). This image of the ‘altruistic development worker’ is pervasive, a message propagated by countless media reports, plus a great cast of actors and actresses who work as ambassadors for development agencies.

For those who have worked in the field of development, altruism is also something often witnessed, or to which they have been a party. For example, while conducting field research in Papua New Guinea (PNG), I met a development worker who endured rough and stressful conditions in which she had previously been physically attacked, and for her efforts received less pay than she would have back in her home country. Altruism was a strong motivator for her accepting these personal costs. I also saw one of her clients moved to tears by the assistance that she and her organisation had given him. This scene, in turn, moved me.

---

1 In this thesis I will refer to ‘Third World countries’ over other terminology like the ‘Global South’ and ‘developing countries’. All this terminology is problematic because the countries represented by these terms have tended to be viewed as inferior to the countries represented by the terms ‘First World’, ‘developed countries’, and ‘Global North’. I chose to use the term “Third World” because the original term had nothing to do with ranking these areas as ‘third class’ as it is colloquially known and more to do with describing countries that were recently decolonised and for the first time aiming to develop on their own terms.
This anecdote highlights the highly emotional nature of development work. It seems that emotions move people to work in development, and then, once they are in position in a Third World country, they are buffeted by an array of complex and varying emotional experiences. And it would seem that an important part of the reason they stay is a passion to do something beneficial for the Third World communities in which they are placed.

Yet any critical look into the histories of Western aid and development work in the Third World reveals a far more complicated and problematic picture. Development work was never purely altruistic, but always marked by self-interest, alternative agendas and conflicts between the individuals, states and organisations involved in these projects (Gillespie, 1991, Birn and Solorzano, 1997, Mosse, 1999, 2004, 2005). It is not surprising, therefore, that researchers have widely criticised development projects for being dominated by the ideas and priorities of (post) colonial Western donors (Turnbull, 1989, Denoon, 1991, Gillespie, 1991, Trudgen, 2000, Vaux, 2001, Stillwaggon, 2003, Andreasson, 2005). For example some of the first health development workers were 19th century French and English missionaries. These Christian missionaries openly admitted that medicine was an invaluable tool for introducing the ‘heathens’ to Christianity and then, to trade from the ‘West’ (Cunningham and Andrews, 1997, McKenzie, 1997). This suggests that health development can be a tool for accessing and then, ultimately, exploiting the Third World ‘Other’.

An analysis of the first global single-issue disease campaign -- to eradicate the hookworm -- revealed a campaign marked by arrogance and the ruthless pursuit of commercial and cultural dominance (Gillespie, 1991, Birn and Solorzano, 1997). More than trying to eradicate hookworm, the program tried to establish a US-style health bureaucracy system all over the world. This bureaucracy changed who was considered an authority on health issues. These new authority figures could choose what procedures and theories of health and illness were considered therapeutically beneficial (Gillespie, 1991, Birn and Solorzano, 1997). Such actions were an attempt to bring about hegemonic change to cultural understandings of (attitudes to).

---

2 The Third World ‘Other’, sometimes referred to as the Third World subaltern. It’s a term used to describe people that some groups subordinated and marginalised based on ‘class, caste, age, gender and office or in any other way’ (Kapoor, 2004 pg 644).
health and illness. As such, they damaged traditional cultures through attacking and silencing traditional knowledge holders and their understandings of health and illness (Cunningham and Andrews, 1997, Trudgen, 2000).

It should be noted that these attempts to silence traditional knowledge holders were never completely successful, and were not passively accepted without resistance from local knowledge holders or their communities (Porter, Allen and Thompson, 1991, Said, 1993 a). Even so, critics of development have pointed to the attempted silencing of traditional knowledge as an important contributing factor in the way some development projects can increase poverty, decrease access to health care, and increase the burden of disease in Third World countries (Porter, Allen and Thompson, 1991, Farmer, 2006, Benatar, 2002, Benatar, 2004, Paluzzi and Farmer, 2005, Radcliffe and Laurie, 2006, Faria, 2008). Many of these criticisms concern the way that failures to achieve development goals were attributed to the Third World and the “predictable litany of barriers and deficiencies that exist within any profoundly poor country” (Said, 1993 a, Paluzzi and Farmer, 2005 pg 12). Meanwhile, potentially destructive and obstructive international development policies, and their implementation, often went unchallenged (Benatar, 2004, Paluzzi and Farmer, 2005, Faria, 2008). Development policy that shows the Third World as the only cause for the failure of (good/unproblematic) First World development policy suggests that mainstream development practise are affected by binary thinking.

The critical works described above implicate First World development practices with attempts at cultural hegemony, binary thinking, and the desire to access and then exploit a Third World ‘Other’. As such, these works point to the presence of Orientalisms\(^3\) as an ever-present factor in development work (Said, 1978, Mosse, 1999). Orientalisms are hegemonic discourses that hold at their core an assumption that there is a fundamental ontological distinction between ‘East’ (which often represents anywhere in the Third World) and ‘West’ (often the instigators of development projects). An integral part of all Orientalisms is the concept of knowledge.

---

\(^3\) I use the plural term ‘Orientalisms’ here instead of ‘Orientalism’ because I refer to a group of very similar, but different discourses, whereas Orientalism is a discourse that is generally only applied to the Middle East.
Orientalisms are essentially discourses about ‘knowledge’ of the ‘East’ (or the Third World) that is used to wield power over the ‘East’. It is a discourse about who can ‘know’ and what they ‘know’ about the East. Said (2003) claimed that the East, seen through the lens of Orientalism, works as the shadow self of the West. The ‘West’4 can then imagine itself as strong, knowing and ‘civilised’ in the light of a weak, ignorant, uncivilised/childlike ‘East’. Such a discourse justifies and enables the ‘West’ to intervene, exploit and govern Third World ‘Others’, because it portrays them as incapable of governing themselves (Said, 2003).

The current HIV and AIDS crisis affecting the Third World provides further examples of how health aid and development work in Third World countries is affected by this form of racist and imperialist thinking. For example, Stillwaggon (2003) shows that key African HIV/AIDS social science and policy documents portrayed African sexuality through the metaphor of Homo Ancestralis, to suggest that African sexuality was like that of the Wests’ pre-civilised past. This metaphor links understandings of the problem of African HIV and AIDS back to debunked colonial racial science. This, and other metaphors within key documents, constructed an image of a hypersexualised pan-African culture. These documents then attributed this hypersexualised culture as the main reason for the high prevalence of HIV in sub-Saharan Africa. Africans were portrayed as the social ‘Other’ in these texts, which were marked by sweeping generalisations and innuendo. The metaphors associated with these documents lead to data being differentially emphasised, suppressed and organised to conform to the metaphors. The end result, according to Stillwagon, was that behavioural approaches dominated Third World AIDS prevention strategies, rather than basic epidemiological approaches and holistic development practices. Similarly, evidence of racism and imperialism was found in Ingram’s (2005) and Ebb’s (2005) investigations of efforts to frame the global AIDS pandemic as an international security issue. These authors argue, at a bio-political level, that politicising HIV and AIDS in security terms can put into play a range of potentially racist and normalising social practices.

4 Throughout this thesis I will occasionally use the term ‘West’ to essentially denote the First World; and the term ‘East’ to denote the Third World. I do this only in circumstances in which I will attempt to link findings or research specifically to Said’s (2003) theory of Orientalism which uses an ‘East/West’ divide instead of a First World and Third World division.
Set against claims that self-interest, imperialism and racism have been embedded into health development work (Ahmed, 2004) are the well-documented endeavours of development workers and development agencies to make their work culturally appropriate and equitable (Vaux, 2001, Mosse, 2005, UNESCO, 2007, USAID, 2007, World Health Organisation, 2011). As Mosse (2005 pg 1) states: “Western [development] agencies... and their policy advisers direct huge energy to re-framing development, discarding the signs of a colonial past or present-day commercial self-interest (i.e. tied aid), finding new focus and political legitimacy in the international goal of reducing global poverty, in the language of partnership and participation, citizens’ rights and democracy.”

Mosse (2005) criticises the “critical view” of development policy which claims that real, undisclosed and/or unintended effects of development enhance bureaucratic power and Western dominance while silencing local knowledge. This thesis accepts Mosse’s (2005) assessment about development practice, viz., that self-interest, racism, and imperialism are not part of the conscious intentions of the vast majority of contemporary development workers and agencies. Nevertheless, as discussed above, even in the contemporary period there is evidence of cultural imperialism and racism in development projects (Porter, Allen and Thompson, 1991, Trudgen, 2000, Vaux, 2001, Butt and Eves, 2008, Faria, 2008). This raises the question: why do racism and imperialism continue to exist in international development work?

In recent years, some research has suggested emotions could be a probable and under-researched cause for the persistence of racism and imperialism in development work (Wright, 2012). Such research comes from the newly established and currently growing field of Emotional Geography. Emotional geographers explore the role that emotions play in the production and dissemination of knowledge. They explore how emotions affect the way one senses the bodies and the substances of the past, present and future (Anderson and Smith, 2000).

---

5 Mosse (2005 pg 2-5) also criticises the alternate “instrumental view” of development policy, in which policy is seen as a form of “rational problem solving,” as being naive and optimistic.

6 This study, although old, provides a useful description of a project which has very good (conscious) intentions to help its Third World clients yet ultimately disadvantages many of them, and is seen in the eyes of its clients to be a continuation of imperialism and racism of the colonial era.
Therefore the works of emotional geographers have opened new ways of understanding ‘Self-Other’ relations that are integral for understanding the contemporary forms of racism and imperialism (Nast, 2006, Askins, 2008, Srivastava, 2005, Morrison, Johnston and Longhurst, 2013). For example, if someone came into contact with a person that they felt fear towards, they would read their actions (Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005) as fearsome, while witnessing their own bodily actions as fearful (Ahmed, 2004 a). When the events of the present are assessed, by someone, as fearsome, this fear may make them reassess past events or bring up past events to confirm one’s fears of this person. In addition, their future interactions with this (‘fearsome’) person will be affected – and most likely limited–due to their fear response. This means that one’s emotive response to a place, subject, body or time will affect how they think about it and thus affect the knowledge that they produce about the person, place, time or thing (Anderson and Smith, 2001, Ahmed, 2004 a, Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005).

Given that emotions can affect the type of knowledge that people produce, there is clearly potential for emotions to impact on the development process. It is likely that Orientalist knowing, too, must be affected and shaped by emotions. This means that both emotions and the persistence of Orientalisms in development are linked. It follows that links between emotions and Orientalisms should be investigated further in order to overcome development’s persistent link to racism and cultural imperialism. This thesis will investigate the interplay between emotions and Orientalisms in order to reveal some of the reasons why racism and cultural imperialism (Ahmed, 2004 b) still exist in contemporary health development work.

It is important to note that Said (1993 a, 1993 b, 2003) and many others in the field of Postcolonial Studies (Spivak, 1988, Kapoor, 2004, Ahmed, 2006, Chakraborty, 2010) see new knowledge as a means by which people and societies can resist, and move beyond, Orientalisms. It stands to reason that emotions would also be integral to these new forms of knowledge. Greater understanding of the interaction between resistances to Orientalisms and emotion could therefore help reveal new ways of understanding that will also help those in development to move beyond instances of racism and imperialism. Therefore this thesis also investigates the links between emotions and resistances to Orientalisms.
1.2 Aims

Using HIV and AIDS development work in PNG as a case study, this thesis will explore the development process and investigate the interactions between emotions and Orientalisms, and resistances to Orientalisms. Specifically it aims to explore several core aspects of development. These core aspects are: the knowledge claims of development researchers and policy experts; the textual world of policy documents; the on-the-ground experience of development workers; and the process and interactions involved in policy implementation. I chose to investigate several core aspects of development to enable a more holistic view of the roles that Orientalisms (and their resistances) play in development projects. Focusing of several aspects of development also enables greater understanding of the multiple mechanisms by which Orientalisms may continue to exist in development process.

Through exploring these aspects of development, this thesis will argue the following points:

1. All aspects of development are emotional.
2. The emotionality of development work can cause the reproduction of Orientalisms in development policy practice and research.
3. Emotions are not wholly negative forces in development, as they are also important in creating resistances to Orientalisms.

To argue these three points I will rely largely on the theoretical perspectives of Postcolonial Studies and Emotional Geographies. I have chosen to focus on these fields because Postcolonial Studies, and Orientalisms in particular, have produced a well-established lens through which to view and expose racism and imperialism in development practice, while at the same time leaving the door open for the possibility that emotions may play a role in this process. Meanwhile, the less established field of Emotional Geographies can provide links between the knowledge claims and the emotional reactions one feels to the objects of one’s knowledge. Combining these two fields will have the added benefit of showing how an individual’s emotional reactions, and the knowledge claims that result, can strengthen the universalised hegemonies of Orientalisms. In the next section I will discuss how I have structured this thesis in order to make my arguments.
1.3 Structure

This thesis consists of nine chapters. Each chapter will build on the three points of argument outlined above. This thesis aims to first give the theoretical basis for my three points of argument. It does so in Chapter Two.

Chapter Two introduces the topic by giving the background to the theoretical cornerstones of this thesis. I start by describing the theory of Orientalism (the origin of the theories of Orientalisms) and the ways that Postcolonial Studies utilised theories of Orientalisms and applied them to the development context. In doing so, I argue that Orientalisms have always been, and continue to be, present in the workings of international development as applied to the peoples of PNG. From there, I discuss the field of Emotional Geographies and the similarities and connections that I see between Orientalisms and the findings of Emotional Geographers. I argue that some of the ways in which emotions lead to knowledge claims about “those in need of development” have important resonances with Orientalisms. As such, I argue, emotions can lead to Orientalisms, or to their resistances.

In Chapter Three I discuss the case study of HIV and AIDS in PNG. This chapter starts with a country description of Papua New Guinea. This description gives a brief explanation of both the urban and rural conditions in PNG, and the situation of HIV and AIDS. It also gives a brief description of the colonial relationship between Australia and PNG (with a focus on colonial health development) and the ways international development organisations are tackling PNG’s HIV and AIDS situations. In doing so, this chapter will pass a critical eye over the way PNG development has been handled, both in the past and in more contemporary HIV and AIDS campaigns, and set the context for the current emotional and cognitive understandings of PNG and its peoples in the field of development.

Chapter Four describes and justifies methods employed in this research. It starts with a brief description of the previous methods used in Emotional Geography that have influenced the processes of data collection and analysis employed in this thesis. It then details the methods used to both collect and analyse data. It describes the methods in terms of the three data sources that were used. These were PNG HIV and AIDS research documents; policy documents used in HIV and AIDS development in PNG; and interviews and a free writing journal about the experiences of doing HIV and AIDS development in PNG. In doing so, this chapter describes several innovative ways to apply critical discourse analysis (and to a lesser extent, content
analysis) to texts and interviews in order to draw forth the emotionality within such data, and
to pair it with the knowledge constructions that may reinforce or resist Orientalisms. Next, my
thesis presents and discusses the findings of these methods in relation to several different
aspects of the development process. These aspects are development research/knowledge
claims, development policy, development workers’ experience, and the interaction between
policy and policy implementation.

Chapter Five shows and discusses the results of the analysis of research documents and
knowledge claims about HIV and AIDS in PNG. The chapter first provides evidence that the
assumptions made in mainstream research documents that inform PNG HIV and AIDS policy
are Orientalised. It also shows how emotionality is often implicated in these acts of
Orientalisms. This, I argue, is because these Orientalisms had the ability to give academic
writers pleasant/beneficial emotions about their research. Orientalisms also had the ability to
manipulate the emotions of readers, which might lead to emotional as well as tangible
benefits to the writer. This chapter goes on to argue that the use of Orientalisms in such ways
is often relayed to other development researchers through conferences, key-note papers and
the acknowledgement of expertise. It is in this transmission that I was also able to see some
attempts to subvert and resist the pull of Orientalisms.

Chapter Six presents and discusses findings from policy documents on HIV and AIDS in PNG
that were produced by both secular development agencies and religious organisations. This
chapter contends that (although often subtle in secular aid documents) emotions were present
in all policy documents despite attempts (in secular documents) to remove them. In secular
documents, emotions were often connected to claims about knowing the correct action to
deal with HIV and AIDS in PNG and the obstacles to the implementation of HIV and AIDS
development policy. These knowledge claims work subtly with emotions to try to make the
reader feel that the Western policy knows how to deal with PNG, people, place, HIV and AIDS,
etc, more so than the people of PNG and their Government. In doing so, they perpetuated
Orientalisms. Yet this chapter also claims that, although problematic for their own reasons,
religious documents that embraced the emotionality of the situation in PNG had the potential
to resist Orientalisms.

Chapter Seven shifts the focus of the thesis from research and policy texts to the lived
experiences of Western development workers in PNG. This chapter describes how
development work is a highly emotional experience for those on the ground. It shows that how
development workers emotionally react is dependent on place and on the types of identities that they are trying to associate or disassociate with at the time. These emotional reactions will have significant effects on when and how development workers propagate Orientalisms and when and how development workers resist Orientalisms.

Chapter Eight concerns the experience of development workers and looks at how this relates to the demands and pressures of policy implementation. In doing so, this chapter shows that policy can affect the emotionality of development workers and, in turn, their propensity to reproduce or resist Orientalisms. This chapter also assesses how policy can limit the influence of development workers on the ground and thereby limit their ability to propagate or resist Orientalism. Yet this chapter also shows that, to a limited extent, development workers have the ability to subtly affect future policy documents. Therefore this chapter also explores the ways that development workers can affect the emotionality and structure of (future) policy documents.

Chapter Nine concludes the thesis by synthesising the findings in relation to the three points of argument (outlined in Section 1.2) and by presenting ways forward for both development and development research. It begins to ask questions about the façade of certainty in which development policy and action is supposed to be undertaken. It then considers a possible future in which the uncertainty of the development process is embraced as a way to move beyond Orientalism.

1.4 Conclusion

In this chapter I have introduced the argument that I wish to present in this thesis. I have introduced a theoretical argument that postcolonial theory should be combined with Emotional Geographies in order to expose Orientalisms in development and to produce new knowledge that can resist Orientalisms in development. Such an approach is important because the effects of emotions are under-explored in contemporary development studies and practices. Over the coming chapters I wish to show just some of the ways that a combination of Postcolonial Studies and Emotional Geographies can produce new methods and new ways of understanding the postcolonial development context, particularly in PNG. In the next chapter I will discuss the theoretical framework for this argument.
Chapter 2: The Theoretical Context of the Research

2.1 Introduction

In this chapter I wish to discuss the links between racialised knowledge (Orientalisms in particular) in development policy and practice, and the emotionality of the development work experience. To do so, I rely heavily on two fields of study. These are the established fields of Postcolonial Studies, the theory of Orientalism in particular, and the emerging field of Emotional Geographies.

Postcolonial Studies has produced a number of works that indicate that the way Westerners know the foreign ‘Other’ is through a series of tropes that confirm ‘Western’ superiority over its former colonies justifying its continued access and dominance in those regions (Baker, Hulme and Iversen, 1994 Heron, 2007). And a number of postcolonial researchers have implicated development work in this process (Kothari, 2002, Bazz, 2005, Radcliffe and Laurie, 2006). Although some of these theorists have acknowledged that there is an emotional component to the racialised knowledge that is being produced (Said, 2003, Haldrup, Koefoed and Simonsen, 2006) very few have investigated just how emotions are implicated in the production of racialised knowledge.

I use the emerging field of Emotional Geographies to explore this link. Emotional geographies can assess the links between what and how one comes to know a person or a culture, and one’s emotional reaction to what they are claiming knowledge of. This opens up the potential to study racialised knowledge about developing countries discussed in Postcolonial Studies, through a lens of emotionality. In addition, recent works on Emotional Geographies have placed emotions as an important and under-researched aspect of development studies (Wright, 2012). These new insights open up new ways of studying emotions in development work.

In this chapter I will discuss the fields of Postcolonial Studies and Emotional Geographies in detail, as well as the benefits of combining the research achievements from both these fields. I will firstly describe the field of Postcolonial Studies (with emphasis on Orientalisms). In doing so, I will also describe the ways that Postcolonial Studies can provide a more detailed understanding of development practice. I will then discuss the role that emotions can play in Postcolonial Studies. After that, I introduce the field of Emotional Geographies, and explain the
links between emotions and knowledge, and the implication this has for a postcolonial understanding of development. Finally, I conclude this chapter with a discussion of some of the benefits that combining traditional Postcolonial Studies with the field of Emotional Geographies can have on understanding Orientalised knowledge in development work.

2.2 The Theory of Orientalism and the Field of Postcolonial Studies

Introduction: Orientalism

Said’s 1978 book “Orientalism” is arguably one of the most extensively published and influential works of Social Science (Gates, 1991, Huggan, 2005). It transformed the humanities, according to Rizvi and Lingard (2009), because it provided a new way of understanding colonialism, imperialism and the historical construction of the knowledge of ‘Orient’. Of all Said’s many contributions to Postcolonial Studies, it was the book “Orientalism” that lent most to the political and intellectual corpus of the field (Huggan, 2005, Rizvi and Lingard, 2009).

In his books, Said (1978, 2003) argued (vis-a-vis the Middle East) that when the ‘West’, or the Occident, was discovering and learning about the territories and countries to the east of them (which the ‘West’ called the ‘Orient’) they were also working to dominate, control and exploit the resources there. As a consequence, Western knowledge and representations of the Orient are constructed and highly influenced by Western desires for control and dominance. ‘Fictitious facts’ are developed that allow for illegitimate authority over the Orient.

According to Said, there are three types of interconnected Orientalism. Firstly there is the academic study of the Orient, consisting of all manner of people who teach, write or research about the Orient. Their thinking is highly integrated and interchangeable with the second form of Orientalism, which is based on an ontological and epistemological distinction between the Orient and the ‘West’. This more-or-less imaginative standpoint has influenced the works of a very large mass of writers, including poets, novelists, economists, journalists and political theorists (Said, 1978, 2003). Over time these ontological and epistemological differences become viewed as ‘natural’ and are taken for granted, producing the third, and overarching, form of Orientalism. This form of Orientalism is a hegemonic discourse and corporate institution for dealing with the Orient. This form concerns the various individuals and institutions that have both invested in, and legitimised, Orientalism by making statements about it, authorising views of it, describing it, teaching it, settling it and ruling over it. In short,
Western discourses and studies of the Orient are now a mechanism by which to ‘control’ the Orient. More than that, as the Orientalist discourse defines the flexible (according to what suits the circumstance) bounds between ‘East’ and ‘West’, this cultural phenomenon actually produced the ‘Orient’ itself that the ‘West’ now studies, writes about and ‘controls’. In other words, the Orient and Orientalism are creations of Western thought that set boundaries about what can be known about the Orient. They can also shape who can know the Orient and how they can know it.

This creation of the Orient was originally a European cultural phenomenon and as such it is affected by ‘Eurocentrism’ (Said, 2003, Rizvi and Lingard, 2009). Said (1978) used the term ‘Eurocentrism’ to describe the belief that a European or Western identity is superior when compared to all other cultures. Eurocentrism colours the history and tradition of thought that the ‘West’ used to create the Orient. Thus the Orient can only be known as inferior to the ‘West’; only ‘Westerners’ can truly ‘know’ the Orient; and the ways of knowing the Orient can only be ‘Western’ ways of knowing, that often consume or exploit some aspect of the ‘East’.

The consequence of this is that Orientalism has become a series of flexible tropes that are employed to position the Westerner as the superior party in any possible relationship between the Westerner and the ‘Orient/Oriental’. Thus anyone who is an interlocutor of the ‘Orient’ must rely on a construction of the Orient. This construction of the Orient shows it to be fundamentally different from – and inferior to – ‘the West’ (Daitch, 2010). Thus Orientalism can be seen as a form of cultural hegemony.

Said (2003) showed how this hegemony could bring material benefits to those in the ‘West’ (particularly France, England and the US) as Orientalism justified and allowed the exploitation of natural resources and the people found in the ‘East’ (Said, 1993 a, 2003). For example, a common Orientalist trope was to describe the Arab as ‘uncivilised’ or ‘childlike’ and incapable of self rule. As such the ‘West’ was given a moral imperative to intervene and govern (i.e. invade) the Orient and ‘civilise’ its people. Civilising, as mentioned in Chapter 1, meant gaining access to the Orient’s territories and incorporating its people into the West’s hegemony so that they could be amenable to Western trade (Said, 1993 a, 2003, McKenzie, 1997).
Importantly, Orientalism also brings emotional benefit (Said, 1978). Said argues that perhaps the greatest gift the Orient ‘gives’ to the ‘West’ is a sense of strength (confidence) and identity. A sense of confidence and identity is likely to give large emotional benefits to the ‘West’. Orientalism does this by constructing the Orient as a surrogate or underground self, which Westerners can use to hide their baser and less pleasant emotions. By being the ‘West’s Other’ (or surrogate self), the Orient allows the ‘West’ to define itself by what it is not. For example, the ‘West’ can identify itself as strong only because its surrogate self is weak (Said, 1978). The Orient therefore gives meaning to terms such as “the West” or “Western”, allowing certain people and territories to identify/be identified as Western. This means that both ‘East’ and ‘West’ are imaginative geographies, where the ‘West’ gains its own history, traditions of thought, imagery, vocabulary and presence through the contrasting image of the Orient. This setting of the West/self apart from the Orient/others essentially creates the geographies of the world in Western eyes. This is because all smaller divisions of space conventionally used to break down the world into its parts (e.g. nations) will follow from this primary division of West and East (Said, 1978, 2003). In the dichotomy of the ‘West’ and the rest, the rest (Orient) which might otherwise be too wild, too patently foreign and sinister etc, is rendered more familiar, because Westerners are familiar with the shadow self that is produced through Orientalism. Without Orientalism giving the ‘East’ a familiar voice, that which is beyond familiar boundaries is silent and unknown and (potentially) dangerous. Therefore feelings of comfort and familiarity, as well as the absolution of fear, seem to be an integral part of a Westerner’s need for Orientalism.

Said (1978, 2003) claims that an interrogation of Orientalism (and its binary thinking) reveals that the ‘West’ is essentially having a conversation with itself through Orientalism. This is because Orientalism, which is a Western construction/imaginative geography, speaks for the ‘Orient’, which apparently can’t speak for itself. Therefore, this binary mode of thinking when interrogating, actually reveals more about the Occidental/Western Self than it does of the Oriental Other (Said, 2003, Isstaf, 2009). Thus, interrogating Orientalism reveals how the ‘West’ understands and tries to control its (past) colonies. In other words discourses which

7 Confidence is a form of emotion and one’s identity is highly contingent on how they feel towards the objects of their experience (Ahmed, 2004)
show binary and hegemonic tendencies between the Western Self and the non-Western Other serve as an institution for the (re)production and control of the area deemed the ‘Orient’ (Said, 1978, Gregory, 2009). Other writers in this field (e.g. Kothari, 2002, Ahmed, 2006, Isstaif, 2009) argue that this binary thinking must not only be exposed but also interrogated for a greater understanding of the Self and the Other.

Orientalism was also the body of thought that sparked the field of Postcolonial Studies, and many academics have added important elements to this theory since its inception (Said, 1993a, Said, 1993b, Spivak, 1988, Yegenoglu, 1998). The next section will describe Postcolonial Studies and some of the principles it has developed and appropriated from Orientalism, and how these developments leave room for the investigation of emotionality within Orientalisms.

**Postcolonial Studies**

Postcolonial Studies is an inter-disciplinary research field that is concerned with the persistence of racism and cultural imperialisms in the modern world (Baker, Hulme and Iversen, 1994, Said, 2003, Clayton, 2004, Clayton and Gavin, 2006). Researchers in Postcolonial Studies claim that the cultures of contemporary and previously colonised and colonising people are the results of the colonising process. Thus the impacts of colonialism dominate the lives and mindsets of both the inhabitants of the former colonies and the people who colonised them. The work of postcolonial theorists has produced a large body of evidence that imperialism and colonialism, either directly or in their aftermath, are still shaping the world socially, politically, economically and militarily (Baker, Hulme and Iversen, 1994). In this way, the colonial origins of contemporary cultures lead to on-going colonial hegemony and imperialism (Baker, Hulme and Iversen, 1994, Said, 2003, Clayton, 2004, Clayton and Gavin, 2006). As such, the field has the potential to give insights into how the mindsets and cultural assumptions of those in development projects might, contribute to the persistence of racism and cultural imperialism evident in development work.

In this section I wish to discuss some of the aims and theoretical approaches of Postcolonial Studies. Many of these aims were also evident in Said’s book “Orientalism” (1978, 2003) yet Postcolonial Studies has articulated them more thoroughly and applied them beyond the Arab experience that was central to Said’s work on Orientalism. This has produced a more general set of aims and methods that can be applied to a broader range of situations (such as HIV and
AIDS development work in PNG) and they also enable a wider investigation of Orientalisms in relation to emotionality.

The ultimate aim of Postcolonial Studies is to relieve and heal the impacts of racism and cultural imperialism on all peoples and places (Clayton, 2004, Clayton and Gavin, 2006). To achieve such an aim, postcolonial theorists often take one or both of the following approaches. Firstly, they interrogate Western thought and expose the explicit racism of imperial/colonial projects embedded within this thought. Secondly, postcolonial theorists try to extend and promote the history of activism, resistance and anti-colonial thought.

These approaches involve the acceptance of several core principles that leave Postcolonial Studies receptive to the investigation of the role that emotions play in contemporary forms of racism and imperialism. Firstly, these approaches involve understanding (and being open and honest to this fact) that you are engaged in a form of academic and political activism (Young, 2004). Indeed, postcolonial theorists believe that no one could write theory and not be politically active (Said, 1993 a, Said, 2003, Rizvi and Lingard, 2009). Hence works that claim to be apolitical or neutral in their treatment or ‘understanding’ of a (previously) colonised subject are often seen as particularly problematic and worthy of interrogation (Young, 2003, Said, 1993 a, Said, 1993 b, Said, 2003). These same ‘neutral’ stances are invariably linked to problematic claims of being dispassionate or emotionless on the subject (Young, 2003, Davidson, Bondi and Smith, 2007).

Postcolonial theorising also often uses a form of reflexivity known as “secular criticism”. Secular criticism involves being unsettled and unsettling others, by being reflexive of what is taken for granted and those aspects of thought that you and others use to form identity (Said, 1993 b, Rizvi and Lingard, 2009). This means that the secular critic counterpoises one idea or experience with another so that both will be seen in a new (and better) light. For example, the intellectual will balance Islamic fundamentalism against Jewish and/or Christian fundamentalism, so that the intellectual is not just passing judgments against a preordained ‘enemy’. From the position of a secular critic, all forms of fundamentalism will be seen as equally problematic. By counterpoising ideas and experiences, Postcolonial Studies is receptive

8 Such reflexivity would be emotional in nature, just as much as it is intellectual (Ahmed, 2004).
to the counterpoising of emotions. For example Postcolonial Studies should be receptive to contrasting the apparently ‘problematic’ emotions of one group with the apparently ‘unproblematic’ emotions of the ‘home’ group.

The secular critic will never see things in isolation, but always in terms of both what is left behind and what is in the here-and-now (Said, 1993 b pg 121). Thus the secular critic/postcolonial theorist has the advantage of seeing things not simply as they are, but with attention to how things have come to be the way they are. They will see contemporary situations as the results of historical processes and not as natural or ‘God-given’. So the postcolonial theorist aims to reveal that what seems unchangeable, irreversible and inescapable can be changed, reversed or avoided (Said, 1993, pg 122). As such it seems that Postcolonial Studies could be receptive to the idea that emotions towards ourselves and others are never static but are in a constant flux albeit in ways that are heavily informed by historical features and relations of power (Davidson, Bondi and Smith, 2007).

Much of postcolonial theory is centred on the belief that history cannot be taken for granted as a fact about the past. On this basis, postcolonial theorists argue that history of the same event can be vastly different, depending on three factors: the form in which the history has been told, the way it has been argued, and the perspective from which it has been seen (Young, 2004). Therefore implicit in a Postcolonial Studies approach is a review of the past, particularly colonial history of people, place and objects (Said, 1993 a, Baker, Hulme and Iversen, 1994, Young, 2004). By studying the form, argument, and perspectives of a particular history, imperial and colonial history can be re-examined in light of current realities. Thus, Postcolonial Studies gives an understanding of the life in the (ex) colonies, and a more differentiated and contested picture of modernity and the ‘West’. This contested picture can put in question the West’s view of its self as rational and superior to all that is ‘non-West’. If Ahmed’s (2004 a) claims that everybody’s emotional reactions are linked to their past (real or imagined) histories with ‘others’ is correct (see Chapter 1) then this too opens up the possibility of a Postcolonial Studies of emotionality.

According to Said (1993), Siddiqi (2005) and Rizvi and Lingard (2009), by taking these approaches the intellectual is connected to the patterns of thinking of the marginal, alienated, and anti-systemic forces, and so can work with, and connect to, the political realities of the society in which their work occurs. Yet the intellectual also needs to be constantly self-
reflexive, so as to uncritically accept the state of unsettlement that is produced. Challenging oneself in this way will invariably be an emotional as well as an intellectual task.

**Approaches to Orientalisms that Resonate with the Study of Emotionality in Development Work**

Since 1978 there have been a number of changes to the study of how and why Orientalism appears in contemporary ‘Western’ descriptions of the (post) colonial Other. One of the greatest changes that occurred was to situate the theory away from the Middle East and look at the ways in which it could be applied to experiences in other regions that were colonised by European powers. Said (1993 a), in his work “Culture and Imperialism”⁹ went some way towards this goal, emphasising a relationship between what he had described in “Orientalism” and a more general experience of imperialism (Said, 2004). He showed that many of the tropes used to produce and sustain hegemony in the Middle East were also applied to areas such as Africa, India and Australia (Said, 1993 a). Yet in doing so Said (and other postcolonial researchers) have found discourses that although very similar to the original discourse of Orientalism, are technically different discourses. As such I refer to these more generalised experiences of Orientalism as ‘Orientalisms’.

An example of the broader application of Orientalisms that makes it relevant to the study of emotions in development work is that of Brooten (2005) concerning portrayals of Aung San Suu Kyi by the American media. Brooten describes how the American media used an Orientalist framework to personify Third World democracy in Aung San Suu Kyi. This framework was Orientalist because it constructed Third World democracy as something feminine, weak and under threat. In juxtaposition, these articles represented US democracy as a more mature, masculine and strong form of democracy. American democracy presented through these Orientalist frameworks, is seen as the protector of democracy (particularly Third World democracy) that is under threat. These sorts of media portrayals help to represent US foreign policy actions (including the invasion of countries like Iraq) as altruistic acts of protection that are justifiable. As such, Brooten’s (2005) work shows how contemporary foreign policies in areas beyond the Arab world are still supported through, and contribute to, 

⁹ “Culture and Imperialism” in many respects is the sequel to “Orientalism” (Said, 2004).
Orientalisms. If there are Orientalisms in contemporary foreign policy, there are likely to be effects on many development campaigns. This is because many development campaigns are influenced by national and international foreign policy (Vaux, 2001, Mosse, 2004).

Some writers have investigated Papua New Guinea in the context of Orientalisms (Buck, 1988, Silver, 1993, Wardlow, 2002, Wardlow, 2006). One example of this is Silver’s (1993) research into how travel agents market ethnicity in Third World countries. She showed that tourism brochures for PNG often do not show a typical or contemporary image of PNG culture. Instead they show Orientalist images of PNG people that conform to what Western tourists ‘want’ to see in PNG. That is, an image of what such tourists think of as a ‘genuine’ PNG person— one who has static, primitive and unchanging traditions that have not been influenced by colonialism, nationalism, tourism, etc. Such images obscure the realities of the lives of most native PNG people. It particularly obscures issues such as abject poverty, and pressures from resource companies and governments that wish to exploit their lands. These brochures present PNG nationals as commodities that are to be consumed by Western tourists. This Orientalism may have an impact on the mindset of Western development workers, as research has shown part of the appeal of international development work is the ability to travel to, and access, foreign cultures (Heron, 2007).

Other writers have shown Social Science research in PNG to be implicated in Orientalisms (Buck, 1988, Waiko, 1994). Waiko’s work (1994) shows how the research process in PNG can lead to an exploitation of PNG people and resources through the historical and cultural processes that position researchers and their research process. Waiko describes the two cultural identities, or positionalities, that he holds (one as a Binandere person and the other as someone trained in the Western education system) and reflects on the insights that this gives him into the exploitive colonial legacy of research in PNG. Waiko claims that the process took from PNG people both knowledge and artefacts (some of which are now lost to the people from which they were taken) and exploited these so what is described by ‘Western’ (colonial) research is not the history of PNG but the West’s history of what it has exploited and consumed.

For example, Buck (1988 pg 2) demonstrated how the study of ‘cargo cults’ in PNG can work as a form of Orientalism. Buck argued cargo cult studies formed a discourse that filtered a wide variety of phenomena and presented them in identical light. Eurocentric blinkers made Europeans see cargo cult elements that were not there, and exaggerated them when they did
exist. This meant that all PNG activity was viewed in terms of cargo and created the ‘cargo cult’ as an object/subject to debate and analyse. This sort of thinking obscured the behaviours of both the colonised and colonisers. It particularly obscured the symbolic validity behind ‘cargo thinking’ observed in many PNG people, which was that Europeans held, and refused to share, the ‘key’ that gave them access to the kinds of goods that were being offloaded from aeroplanes and boats. In particular, Buck saw the study of cargo cults as at least partially, obscuring academia’s ability to acknowledge and support Papua New Guinean resistances to (neo) colonial hegemony.

Other writers have argued that the term “cargo cult” is not inherently obstructive but can be subverted from its original\(^{10}\) (and derogatory) intent and be used as a “vantage point for a culture-critical approach to Western Society” (Otto, 2009 pg 1). Otto believes that if academics use the term as a comparative analytical term (instead of a descriptive analytical term) it can allow a number of movements, including Western movements, to be looked at in the same light. This ‘de-exotification’ can allow academics to gain insights into Western religious, cultural and political movements that have a hitherto overlooked form of materialism (cargoism).

Some writers of PNG history did emphasise the ways in which the colonizing process was resisted and/or how PNG peoples attempted to move beyond the colonial legacy. For example, Nuemann (1992) documents the attempts of the Tami and the Tolai to revive, retrieve, reinvent and foster features of their culture that are said to be of their pre-colonial past. Works such as Nuemann’s extend and promote the history of activism and anti-colonial thought, and show how resistances to colonialism became embedded in aspects and acts of culture. They also demonstrate how understandings of pre-colonial practices are varied, and are subject to the interests of different sections of a society and, likewise, affect different sections of a society.

\(^{10}\) Originally the term was used in a derogatory manner by “Western” PNG landowners and businessmen, and represented PNG people as stupid. The academic use of the term, however, has been quite varied in the aims of the usage. (Otto, 2009)
Although Orientalisms were not the main impetus of Wardlow’s (2002, 2006) work, her studies are relevant here as they concern the cultural aspects of HIV and AIDS in Papua New Guinea. Wardlow mentions how the term “cultural differences” can be used to essentialise and etiolise the differences of PNG people (and other communities) from Westerners as a cause for disease. In doing so, the term “cultural differences” can hide racism and poverty in analyses of the AIDS pandemic. Wardlow’s research suggests the possibility that Orientalist thinking might still be applicable in contemporary Social Science research into HIV and AIDS in PNG. If this is the case, there are implications for HIV and AIDS development work in PNG which is usually informed through such academic research. This is a concern I take up in Chapter Five.

‘Melanesianism’ is of course an important form of Orientalism in relation to this thesis. Banivanua-Mar (2007) describes Melanesianism as the South Pacific’s version of Orientalism, in which administrative documents and academic studies of the South Pacific (of which PNG is part) ‘created’ Melanesian people out of an ethnically and culturally diverse area, labelling these cultures and peoples as essentially the same. Melanesianism relied heavily on the tropes that Melanesian people were primitive, tribal and violent. These tropes silenced much of the colonial realities occurring in Australia and Melanesia, including the practice of ‘blackbirding’ that was taking place in Queensland. Melanesianism meant that the sugar cane growers of northern Queensland could talk for the ‘indentured labour’ because Melanesians, in their view, were too primitive to communicate beyond the simple speech required for them to undertake tasks. Banivanua-Mar (2007) indicates the need to interrogate PNG HIV and AIDS development texts’ notions that construct PNG people as primitive, tribal and violent.

The tropes of Melanesianism that label PNG people as primitive have meant that the interrelated discourse of Primitivism is also applied to PNG and its peoples (Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, 1998, Lindenbaum, 2004). Primitivism is a discourse that emerged from colonial Europe’s fascination with the art of the non-Western Other, and out of two contradictory propositions held by some Europeans at the time. These contradictory positions were the unofficial, and poetic, claim that Western culture is deficient and moribund, and the official

---

11 ‘Blackbirding’ was often referred to as a form of slave trading in which people were kidnapped or tricked into working on plantations, as labourers (Margolies, 2008, Quanchi, 2010).
claim which affirms it as the perfect and ultimate state of humanity (Janis, 2006). This
discourse works through similar mechanisms to Orientalism, but here the people within this
arbitrarily defined boundary were often seen as the past/primitive Western Self, a different
form of Other to the foreign Other of the Orient. Such discourse often conveyed a Western
trope of imagined idealised communities, infused with Western desires to return to a simpler
life. This form of primitivism has been said to exotify, commodify and eroticise Third World
‘Others’ for the benefits of the West (Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, 1998, Lindenbaum, 2004,
Janis, 2006).

It is interesting to note that many of the tropes used in Melanesianism and Primitivism have
strong resonances with those employed in Africanist discourse (Apter, 1999, Dunn, 2004). This
may stem from the fact that Africa and PNG may play similar roles in the minds of (post)
colonial Europeans (Heron, 2007). More so than Arabs (particularly since the World Trade
Center attack in 2001), PNG and Africa are stereotyped as ‘outcasts’, to be ignored or given
paternalistic charity, not as competition or threats to the West (Heron, 2007).

Another relevant example of the broader application of Orientalism is Radcliffe and Laurie's
(2006) work on a form of colonial ‘Othering’ that she calls ‘Andeanism’. Andeanism has
similarities to Orientalism, in that the Andean Indians are portrayed as ignorant compared with
the Western, or Mesto, ways of thinking. Andeanism differs from Orientalism in that the Andes
were imagined as isolated from the West/Mesto world/markets, while the Orient was
imagined as in contact and conflict with the West (Said, 1973). Radcliffe and Laurie (2006)
showed that Andeanism had significant material effect on development work in Bolivia and
Ecuador well into the 20th century. By being imagined as isolated and ignorant by development
planners, the state and popular culture could justify the lack of development in these regions
and place the blame for this underdevelopment squarely on the shoulders of the Andean
Indians. These ideas of isolation may have an important impact on how PNG people are
imagined, as they too have highland communities that have been described as difficult to
access and ‘isolated’ from much of the world (McKinnon et al, 2008). For instance, PNG’s
“isolating” topography and the fact that over 85 per cent of PNG’s population lives in these
rural and remote areas have been cited as reasons why many communities have difficulty
accessing quality health care, education and adequate transport (AusAID, 2012 b).

Radcliffe (2005) shows that Orientalist (or in her case Andeanist) discourses are evident in the
international development arena. Radcliffe (2005) notes that, from the mid 1990s,
development geography has been engaging with postcolonialism. This engagement has contributed to what is known as a crisis in development thinking and practice (Watts, 1995, McEwan, 2001). The crisis in development has brought into question many actions undertaken by development projects that had previously been assumed to be altruistic and guaranteed to work. This crisis has also seen the growth in new agendas and ways forward for the field (Sylvester, 1999, Radcliffe, 2005). As a result some development researchers have begun to see the Orientalisms present in development policy and practice. For example, Crush (1995) claims that if you substitute ‘the Third World’ for ‘the Orient’ then Said’s (1978) definition of Orientalism provides a useful starting point to explore the power and purpose of development. Thus development discourse and texts have the ability to produce ‘the developing world’ politically, sociologically, militarily, ideologically, scientifically and imaginatively\(^{12}\).

Andreasson (2005) found evidence that techniques used in the Orientalist discourse had been imported into African development studies. Andreasson makes specific mention of the reductive repetition technique, described by Said as a technique whereby the Orientalist, who, on the surface may acknowledge the diversity in the Orient, nevertheless constantly and repeatedly reduces the Orient’s multiple manifestations of civilisation (its histories, traditions, ideologies, practices, arts and so forth) down to a singular 'theory' of the Orient. As discussed in the subsection 2.2, such a ‘theory’ juxtaposes the Orient with the ‘West’, and it portrays the Orient as inherently inferior to the ‘West’. Andreasson claims that the importation of reductive repetition to African development studies has meant that the diversity of Africans’ historical, social, cultural and economic circumstances has been reduced to a set of core deficiencies of Africans and Africa. It is due to these perceived core deficiencies that external (Western/modernist) 'solutions' to development must be applied. These solutions, Andreasson argues, put African communities under a Western modernist/capitalist hegemony and silences

\(^{12}\) Crush (1995) goes on to critique the simplicity of the above definition, arguing that power does not emanate from one space, to be directed exclusively at another space. Power can often be defuse, fragmented, reciprocal and resisted. These are important criticisms and will be dealt with later in this section.
the voices, and freezes the benefits, of grassroots development (or post development) projects

Heron (2007) looked at the motivations and desires of middle-class Canadian women to volunteer for HIV and AIDS development work in Africa. She notes that Orientalisms (along with a variety of other gendered and classist discourses) helps to legitimise the volunteers' intervention in African nations. The binary opposites of Orientalisms allow development workers to feel that they, as Westerners, can go to Africa and ‘help’ and, moreover, that this ‘help’ will be successful, because it allows them to imagine that their lives as white/Western middle class has given them skills and knowledge that the ‘native’ population lack, and which will enable them to improve the situation. This altruistic desire to help also seems to legitimise actions of a more selfish nature. For example, development workers received the perquisites of travel (which was imbued with its own Orientalist traits) and of accessing foreign cultures that would have otherwise been inaccessible. In addition, development workers noted the benefits of having a better-looking CV and greater self-knowledge that derived from the experience. These benefits received from ‘accessing’ Africa were seen as exchange for being altruistic and helping. Yet there is room to speculate about how much help development workers provide in this exchange.

Another interesting study is Mosse’s (1999) investigation of the ideologies of community management of ‘traditional’ irrigation systems, held by NGOs in southern India. He demonstrates that originally colonial governments employed certain discourses around the use of ‘traditional’ irrigation systems (and village traditions) to construct concordance between empirical evidence and social theory. These discourses were Orientalist, and thus weaved Orientalisms as a body of knowledge into the fabric of administration and law. Mosse (1999) then demonstrated how similar Orientalist tropes were used to weave empirical evidence from the ground with the theory and policy of “community management” employed by NGO’s on water management projects. These projects present the cultures of southern India as

---

13 Such solutions give Andreasson’s work an anti-Orientalist flavour, of which, arguably, Said would not approve. Said kept to a humanist perspective, which meant that, although he might view a development project as highly flawed, it would not be something that should be dismantled completely (Rizvi and Lingard, 2009, Radcliffe, 2005, 2006).
homogenous, and take aspects of southern India’s irrigation systems out of the context of the whole network of social and cultural factors that support traditional irrigation. Many of these supporting factors are in fact in decline, and as such many of the traditional irrigations systems are also in decline. Yet it is useful for development organisations to employ Orientalisms to link theory and policy to evidence, because it enables them to overcome major organisational, as well as intra-organisational, issues that would arise from considering specific local, cultural, gender and caste aspects of each site. Mosse’s work tells the reader that they should interrogate development theory for Orientalisms and look at the ways that theory and empirics of development work might be linked.

It is evident from a comparative reading that Mosse’s (1999) findings went on to influence his later (2004) work. Although his later work does not specifically mention Orientalisms, it has relevance to this thesis as it investigates the question of whether development policy is implementable. Mosse argues that development practice is not driven by policy, but by a multi-layered complex of the relationships and the cultures of organisations and people working together under the same policy framework. Policy, however, is important because development workers and organisations come together and shore-up funding through policy. Policy, Mosse says, legitimises and mobilises political support. He also notes that development organisations act as a cohort and represent what they do as a series of actions that are in line with the policy because it is in their interest to do so (Mosse, 2004). These acts of cohesion and representation are where Orientalisms weave empirics with policy (Mosse, 1999, Mosse 2004). In doing so they obscure understandings of what actions are actually happening on the ground, and how development is actually being implemented. This is similar to Orientalism in that the voices and resistances from the ground are silenced, replaced with an imagined image of the Other. Acts of Orientalisms playing out on the ground may also be obscured. Mosse (2004) observes that what would determine a good or successful development project was not how much it ‘helped’ or ‘developed’ its intended clients, but how well it was able to fit (show coherent representations of policy) and move with any changes in the overarching policy structures in which it was located. Therefore if an overarching policy framework is highly Orientalised then possibly ‘good’ projects that resist Orientalisms might find it difficult to ‘fit’ the policy framework and run the risk of being deemed failures. I will explore this issue more in Chapter 8.

In “Orientalism”, Said described how many academics claimed to ‘know’ the Orient through their extensive study of Western academic texts. Indeed the question of academic knowledge
work is central to Said’s ideas. One process that Said (2003, pg 275) describes as important in helping academics to claim knowledge of the Orient is the process of “academic-research consensus or paradigm”. In describing this process Said claims to be borrowing in a “rather gross fashion from Thomas Kuhn” (Said, 2003 pg 275, Bhatnagar, 1986). How Kuhn’s (1970) work on exemplar paradigms can help explain how the Orient becomes broadly accepted among academic workers bears further elaboration. The role that exemplar paradigms play in the creation and dissemination of Orientalisms, has the potential to build an understanding of the ways Orientalist ideas are shared and propagated. It is thus an area that I wish to address in this thesis. The theory of exemplar paradigms states that, science is socially contingent on negotiations with scientists on what is considered evidence, what is considered valid method, etc. Scientists learn to do science, or discuss how they should proceed with their work through these negotiations. If one scientist or one group of scientists come up with a solution to a problem that has been vexing the scientific community, their theory as to how to solve a problem may become a scientific paradigm if they discuss their solution with other scientists elsewhere, and these other scientists choose to take up their ideas. All the scientists who take up this original example as the way to comprehend and solve a problem, end up working under the one exemplar paradigm (Kuhn, 1970). The implication of this is that an investigation of the ways that researchers teach other researchers how to research, might reveal one way in which the Orientalisms are internalised.

Another area that Postcolonial Studies has particularly developed from Said’s theory is that of resistance to Orientalisms. In fact, many writers have critiqued Said (1978) on his lack of discussion of resistance which, they claim, causes a series of paradoxes whereby his book reinforces the structure in which the master Orientalist speaks for the Orient. For instance, Gregory (2009) and Young (2004) argue that the theory maintains the dualistic structure of Orientalism by not breaking away from the same binary distinctions that it critiques. In the case of development, Crush (1995 pg 7) argues that “Said draws the Orientalist web from the

14 That is not to say that other postcolonial researchers have not used exemplar paradigms to explain (post) colonial realities. Stillwagon refers to the theory of exemplar paradigms to explain how this small number of papers could have such a significant effect and the spread of racial metaphors in HIV and AIDS development work. Few works, however, have used it in conjunction with Orientalisms.
diffuse representational practices of the West. The result is an image of a homogenising disciplinary power that is too tidy, too seamless, and too unitary. In the case of development, it would be a mistake to view power as emanating from one space and being directed exclusively at another... Development, for all its power to speak and control the terms of speaking, has never been impervious to change and resistance...”

Some of these criticisms stem from superficial readings of Said’s (1978, 2003) “Orientalism”, as well as from the way things get lost in the summation of Said’s work (Said, 2004, Huggan, 2005). When Said describes a text which “produces” Orientalism, he gives a good description of the historical circumstances, influences and pressures that affect that particular writer of that text. He also goes to lengths to try to explain what he can glean of that writer’s personality and how that influenced their readiness to (re)produce Orientalism15. Therefore from the detailed reading of “Orientalism”, the reader can get a more detailed understanding of how the power to represent is in fact diffuse rather than unitary and homogenising. In addition, the reader can get some sense of how each individual writer/text can resist in some instances Orientalism, yet at the same time be complicit in it.

That being said, there is still validity to these criticisms, because Said did not highlight resistance issues as much as he did in later works, including “Culture and Imperialism” (Said, 1993 a) and “Orientalism Reconsidered” (Said, 2003). In “Culture and Imperialism” Said (1993 a) deals with the idea of external resistances to Orientalisms, explaining that the power to speak back and resist can change the structure of imperialism, and imperial discourse. For example, he shows how, to the French colonialists, ‘conquest’ and killing in Algeria became seen as a sacred and spiritual duty, due to the resistance from the Algerian Arabs. As such, Said shows the hybridity of both cultures and texts. Said (1993 a) mentions that, as the colonial era ‘matured’, the general European populations started to have greater access to the colonised Others. This also resulted in greater ability to hear the voices of dissent or resistance to the imperial process. It started to become clear to European populations that the imperial process was not turning out as had been envisioned, and that resistance to colonialism was not going away. In this later period of the colonial era, the texts of the imperialist began to wear markers

15 More so, he showed how a writer’s historical circumstance and personality would mean that they prefer one type of Orientalist trope over another.
of these resistances. Uncertainty began to appear. There were mixtures of pride and concern about the various colonial projects. This suggests that moments of uncertainty and worry could be marks of resistance to Orientalisms.

Ahmed (2006) deals with aspects of this uncertainty in her book “Queer Phenomenology” on the topic of ‘orientation’, which examines what it means to be orientated towards someone or something or away from someone or something. A significant proportion of the book investigates Orientalisms and how they orientate people. Ahmed (2006) claims that even the very word ‘orientation’ shows Western desires for the ‘East’. Ahmed (2006) claims that people turn towards what they desire, what they want to reach. To orient one’s self literally means to turn so you face the East. She then goes on to explain how what is ‘East’ and what is ‘West’ depends on one’s perspectives and location, but the colonial map-making process has helped to produced hegemony so that what is east of Greenwich (England, a colonial superpower) becomes the ‘East’.

From here, Ahmed goes on to explain how Orientalisms turn people towards the ‘East’, making them desire and access the ‘East’ and try to bring aspects back into the ‘West’. This process makes Western/white bodies the norm or home from which “abnormal” Eastern/black bodies can be accessed and consumed. This process of orienting and accessing the ‘East’ produces trajectories towards certain objects and produces access to these objects only at certain angles. Following these trajectories causes what Ahmed (2006) calls "lines of whiteness". These lines can gain significant power through the vast numbers of people who are orientated by Orientalisms. Such lines can block ‘black’ bodies from achieving their desired trajectories (if their desired trajectory interacts with a line of whiteness), subsequently disorientating and shaping ‘black’ bodies. The same is true if ‘white’ bodies diverge from lines of whiteness.

Ahmed (2006 pg 160) describes these situations as a “disorientation”, or the “losing of one’s place in the world”. Disorientation involves a failed orientation, in that the body’s inhabited space does not extend the shape of the body, and the objects (people, tools, etc) do not extend its reach. Thus moments of failure occur when what is ‘here’ becomes strange, and

16 What this means is that we can only see/access certain aspects of the ‘Eastern’ object or person because Orientalism obscures many aspects of ‘Eastern’ people, places and objects from view.
objects do not point towards or around a desired trajectory and reach. Thus, disorientation can be seen as a form of resistance when ‘black’ bodies press up against the trajectories of Orientalisms, or when ‘white’ bodies diverge from Orientalist trajectories and become ‘less white’. As Orientalisms have made the Western/white body the norm, divergences and blockages from lines of whiteness would make one feel abnormal. Therefore disorientation is often felt as a confronting and discomforting experience.

Another interesting work that applies the theories of phenomenology to Orientalisms is that of Haldrup, Koefoed and Simonsen (2006). These writers look at what they call “banal bodily and sensuous practices” to better understand how Orientalisms are (re)produced and negotiated. Banal bodily and sensuous practices are things like what someone chooses to wear, how they speak, what they eat and what they think smells good. Haldrop and colleagues elaborate on Said’s idea that Orientalism is a practice, which through constant repetitions in numerous cultural representations of the Other, designates, in one’s mind, a familiar space which is ours and a familiar space which is theirs. They claim that Orientalisms are not just a set of practices established and reproduced by institutions but, in addition, there are a number of everyday acts of people that reproduce this self/other divide. These everyday acts are so ordinary and happen so often (i.e. are so banal) that they often escape attention all together. This practice can come in the form of speech acts like “us”, “them”, “we”, “they”, or in everyday media announcements, like those on the evening news. In other words, banal practices around all sorts of things form habits and reproduce Orientalised knowledge, as part of everyday life. This suggests that the institutionalised processes of Orientalisms are part of ordinary life, including the search for social meaning. Thus, for this thesis, the ordinary and banal actions of development workers—such as the products they use in their homes, acts of recreation and so on—should be interrogated for Orientalisms.

While Said (2003) mentions the benefits of reflexivity in resisting Orientalisms, other Postcolonial Studies academics have more fully explored the way reflexivity can encourage resistance to Orientalisms. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak is one writer who has done much to promote a heightened sense of self-reflexivity (Sharpe and Spivak, 2003, Kapoor, 2004, Chakraborty, 2010). Spivak asks the reader to think of their positionality in all aspects of life. She asks them to be reflexive of all the socio-economic, gendered, cultural, geographic, historical and institutional positions that they inhabit in a situation, as these affect how, who and why they represent others (Spivak, 1988, Kapoor, 2004, Maggio, 2007). This kind of approach helps in addressing the feminist critiques of “Orientalism” which argue that it is
impossible to separate the gendered aspects of Orientalisms from its cultural aspects, and that Orientalist discourses must be read with the gendered aspects of Orientalisms in mind (Yegenoglu, 1998, Gregory, 2000, Huggan, 2005).

Kapoor (2004) has analysed some of Spivak’s vast body of work and argued that it can be applied to development studies. He notes that what Spivak has to say about “who represents” is important to development studies, because development workers and development academics have a great deal of power to represent the subaltern. This is not only due to their position as Western or native informer but also because of the institutional powers behind them. Working in development can afford certain incomes and ways of life that put the worker in a higher class than their clients/research subjects. As such, there is not a level playing field between the Third World subaltern and the development worker/academic. Kapoor (2004) says that development workers must be hyperreflexive of how they represent the subaltern in development, since the common answer to this question in the field of development is usually an ‘altruistic’ one about how people in development represent the Third World so they can ‘help’ the ‘less fortunate’ in it. He is critical of such answers as this, claiming:

“Such noble and altruistic claims are never just that: knowledge is always imbricated with power, so that getting to know (or ‘discursively framing’) the Third World is also about getting to discipline and monitor it, to have a more manageable Other; and helping the subaltern is often a reaffirmation of the social Darwinism implicit in ‘development’, in which ‘help’ is framed as ‘the burden of the fittest’” (Kapoor, 2004 pg 632).

This indicates the importance of integrating the study of altruism into that of Orientalisms in development. Heron (2007) and McKinnon (2008, 2006) are two postcolonial researchers who investigate the role of altruism (among other things) in contemporary development campaigns. Heron sees altruism as a complex motivation for action that is often tied-up with colonial and post-colonial ideas and assumptions about what it means to be a ‘good’ middle class Westerner. Some of these assumptions function as Orientalisms, as they can be

17 “Subaltern” is a term used by Spivak (1988). It functions in some respects like Said’s (1978) “Oriental”. The subaltern is a silent Other for whom those in positions of power speak.
predicated on construction of the Third World ‘Other’ as weak and incapable of getting out of their situation themselves. McKinnon (2006, 2008) is more open to the possibility that altruism can resist hegemony such as Orientalisms. Using the example of development workers in northern Thailand, McKinnon argues that such workers often wish to articulate a caring, ethical and professional identity for themselves. This means that they can often resist and subvert hegemony in development policy. This altruistic identity can compel them to work, listen and negotiate more with the local communities affected by development policy, to ensure the outcome is acceptable or helpful to the community.

As altruism can be considered an emotional response, the results of feelings of empathy, it is clear that such interrogations are beginning to investigate the role of emotions in representations of the Other (Eisenberg, 2002, Batson, Ahmad and Lishner, 2011). As such, some postcolonial researchers are beginning to investigate the role of emotions in development work (Ahmed, 2004 a, Ahmed, 2004 b, Ahmed, 2006, Askins, 2008, Davies, 2010). These works and others will be discussed in the next section.

2.3 Social Science Research into Emotions

Introduction

In recent years there has been an increased understanding of the role of emotions in constructing knowledge. Contemporary research into emotion, particularly in geography, has tended to fall into two categories: those works that study the trans-human or affective aspects of emotion (and indeed the non-representational broadly defined), and those that study the interpersonal or relational aspects of emotions as a central question (Thien, 2005, Anderson and Harrison, 2006). In geography, the former is known as Affective Geographies while the latter is Emotional Geographies. Both these fields can shed new light on how development workers come to understand and construct knowledge about HIV and AIDS. In recent years attempts have been made to bridge the mythological and epistemological gaps between these two fields (see Anderson and Harrison, 2006, for example). In this thesis I have chosen to focus on studies that have emotion (as opposed to affect) as their core basis for understanding. This decision was largely based on my desire to combine the fields of Postcolonial studies with emotional research. Emotional research, due to its emphasis on the interrelation of individuals and their emotions, produces research and theory that is more in keeping with the humanist aims of post-colonial studies. For example, by empathising with the individuals over the trans-
human emotional research, emotional geographies can give voice to the emotional experiences of marginalized or colonised people and thus aid in the recovery from colonialism (Thein, 2005).

This section will therefore look at some of the current socio-cultural research into emotions. Its focus is on the works of Emotional Geographers, particularly those who have investigated the emotions present in self/other interactions. In doing so, I will put forward an argument that emotions are integral to the construction of knowledge and that it is impossible to separate the emotion from the rationality of an argument. Therefore both development studies, and to a lesser extent Postcolonial Studies, should begin to interrogate the emotional aspects of undertaking development projects more thoroughly than they currently are. In this section I will discuss how emotions create subjects and define subjectivities, and what this means for the way rationalist/modernist thought is defined. I will also discuss the implications this has on Orientalisms and development policy and practice. I will then finish this section with research specific to the development worker experience, namely development policy, practice and travel.

**New Forms of Emotional Research and their Role in Exposing and Resisting Orientalisms**

Until recently the study of emotions has been dominated by modernist thinking that has often viewed emotions as stable objects of study that could define people and cultures (Smith, Davidson et al, 2009, Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005). In contrast to modernist thought, Emotional Geographies take a non objectifying view of emotions, and suggest that emotions should be viewed as relational flows, fluxes or currents between people and places (Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005 pg 3). It is through these relational flows and currents that impressions are formed or left by the others with whom one comes into contact (Ahmed 2004 a, 2004 b). In other words, this new way of doing research comes from understanding emotions in terms of the socio- spatial articulations of the emotion, rather than as a completely internalised state of the mind (Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005).

These works show the reader that emotions become embodied in certain places and subjects in ways that are socially constructed, and that attempts to understand emotion and space are circular in nature (Davidson and Milligan, 2004). Emotions only become understandable or ‘rational’ in a particular place. Likewise, it is only through feelings that a place makes sense. So
in terms of Orientalisms, someone must feel that the ‘East’ is chaotic and wild, for them to understand it as such, and at the same time they can only understand why they feel these feelings through encountering the ‘East’s’ places and subjects. These encounters with place may be either real or imagined. Many encounters the ‘West’ has with the ‘East’ come through the books and texts and other forms of media that are designed for Western consumption (Said, 2003). Such works are heavily embedded in Orientalisms and thus have the potential to make a ‘Westerner’s’ encounter with the ‘East’, wild and chaotic. In this section I will indicate some of the work in Emotional Geographies that are particularly relevant for understanding Orientalisms and the nature of development projects.

In the 1980s and early 1990s health geographers began to tentatively explore the relationships between emotions and postcolonial realities (Davidson, Bondi and Smith, 2007). One work of note from this time was Farmer’s (2006) book “AIDS and Accusation: Haiti and the Geography of Blame”. Farmer shows how emotions have political, economic, and health impacts on developing countries and on the nature of development work. He argues that the spread of HIV and AIDS in Haiti is inseparable from the socio-economic relationships (both historical and contemporary) between the US and Haiti. Farmer notes that racism and imperialism, particularly on the part of the US, meant that the people in Haiti were susceptible to the conditions and circumstances that could help the spread of AIDS. This meant that, very early on in the AIDS epidemic, Haiti had a very high HIV and AIDS rate. Because of this and its close proximity to the US, Haiti often received the blame for spreading HIV and AIDS to the US. Farmer argues that blaming had significant effects on how HIV and AIDS development projects and polices were applied in Haiti as well as in the US. Such acts of development policy essentially blamed the victims for their own circumstance (although, as Farmer notes, US tourists are a more likely source of HIV infections into Haiti) and labels Haitians as a disease-ridden ‘risk group’. These policies of blame had flow-on affects that went beyond US and Haitian HIV and AIDS development policy, and exacerbated and complicated HIV and AIDS issues in Haiti. For example, blaming lead to the decision that Haitians could not donate blood in the US (for several years), which had flow-on affects in the US society as Haitian businesses in the US were discriminated against and fewer tourists went to Haiti. This in turn created

---


It was however, in the mid 1990s with David Sibley’s (1995) seminal work “Geographies of Exclusion” that the field of Emotional Geographies arguably came into existence (Davidson, Bondi and Smith, 2007). David Sibley (1995) was one of the first geographers to investigate socio-spatial articulation of emotion (and the subjectivities that this produces). Sibley used social anthropology and psychoanalytics to show how boundaries are formed, both socially and spatially, that create geographies of exclusions. His work doesn’t focus on the categories by which one is excluded, but rather the process by which people get excluded, noting that there are different scales to exclusion and dominance. Sibley argues that many of the patterns of exclusion that occur in a society, play out on the individual level, with people’s feelings towards others being the cause of boundary formation and distinction.

By way of example, Sibley (1995) mentions how the feeling of fear one gets in an area that has been labelled ‘dangerous’ or ‘rough’ makes this area distinct from other areas. For Sibley, areas labelled as ‘dangerous’ due to a large array of social processes become felt as ‘impure’ by a person. People feel the need to expel what is impure from the self and ingest that which seems pure. Thus to cross such an area is to transgress a boundary between what is Self and what is Other, and touch something that is ‘impure.’ This is what gives the ‘dangerous’ area its distinct feel. Sibley showed how, historically, Western society associated black skin with dirt and grime and therefore impurity. Such feelings helped justify why black-skinned people should be excluded from the wealth, power and privileges that white-skinned people held. He observes that at even the most intimate individual level, dead skin and excrement build up in an individual and must be expelled, and therefore what is being expelled is a part of that individual. And so excluded Others, like diseased Others or black-skinned people can become a dumping ground for ‘impure’ desires, excrement, etc, that one wished to expel. Therefore Sibley (1995) explains a way of understanding not only how emotions help to produce subjectivities, but also a way of understanding the shadow self. The shadow self is an important aspect of Orientalisms (see 2.2).

More contemporary work by Ahmed (2004 b, 2004 a, 2006, 2010) has provided fascinating insights into how emotions define subjectivities. According to Ahmed, emotions shape everyone and help to form the collectives that people cling to. She argues that emotions don’t come from within or without, but instead, flow to create the bodily boundaries of collectives
and individuals. For example, she seems to suggest that emotions are crucial for creating social bonds and creating imagined communities, like nations. Ahmed sees emotions as forming communities through two processes. One way this process occurs is by people forming sentimental attachments to the ideas of an imagined community. This subsequently maintains the idea of a community. According to Ahmed, however, it is not just how one feel for a community that matters, but also how they feel about ‘others’. This is the second and most important aspect of how a community is formed. The impression that others make on someone will align them towards one community or another. This process, Ahmed claims, is what forms the imagined community in the first place. The impression left by others can generate common or collective feelings that will align someone towards a particular collective of bodies. These impressions can be made by real or imagined encounters with others.

To give an example of how this works, I must first describe the importance that Ahmed places on texts for allowing collective feelings to be given form and expression. Ahmed sees text as vital to this process of forming community. As Ahmed states (2004 b pg 13):

“Naming emotions often involves differentiating between the subject and object of feeling. When we name an emotion we are not simply naming something that exists ‘in here’. So a text may claim a nation mourns… [this forms a claim that] the nation has a feeling... but also... generates the nation as the object of ‘our feeling’. The feeling simply exists before the utterance, but becomes ‘real’ as an effect [of the utterance] shaping different kinds of actions and orientations... The nation becomes a shared object of feeling through the orientation that is taken towards it.”

For Ahmed (2004 b) this process will form the narrative of a text, through replacing one word for an emotion with another. What and how these words get stuck together is dependent on past (and often concealed) histories of association. This leads Ahmed to believe that text and social theory are never emotionless; they are always trying to persuade readers to feel certain emotions towards some objects and other emotions towards other objects. Therefore through analysing the emotionality of texts, one can begin to understand how emotions maintain and construct psycho-social boundaries. If it is through emotions that nations come into being, then it stands to reason that it is through emotions that the divisions of Orientalisms come into being.

This notion is further explored by Ahmed (2004 a) when she discusses how the real or imagined impressions left by others can bring the past histories of racism and colonialism into
the here-and-now through the emotional reactions between a ‘Self’ and an ‘Other’. Fear was one example of an emotion that circulated in such a way as to keep past histories of colonialism in the here-and-now. Ahmed uses the example of a white child’s reaction to a Negro to show how fear travelling through a white body can establish a relationship with the black body that keeps the two bodies segregated. Ahmed discussed how the fear (which contracts the boundaries of the ‘Self’) can flow from white body and connect/stick to a black body (restricting the boundaries of the black body and freeing up the movements of the white body). For fear to escape like this it must be fear which the ego cannot handle. What the ego can’t take is that which threatens what the ego defines as the Self, e.g. the Self as a white body. Ahmed goes on to say that two bodies connected through the flow of fear from one body to another will shape both these bodies, but in different ways. The body that could not contain the fear anxiously rushes to protect, and be protected by, objects that the ego loves. And the ego loves those objects that give it a defined sense of self. This strengthens and defines the border of the Self, and it excludes the object of fear from these areas, thus defining the boundaries of the other. For the case of a white body, fear can open up past histories that allow it to reconstruct the white body as apart from the black body. Yet the fear can be just as much a ‘product’ of these past histories that have ‘told’ it to be fearful of black bodies.

In “The Promise of Happiness,” Ahmed (2010) notes how happiness is promised through acts of altruism and can motivate people to undertake tasks like development work. Thus development workers are at least partly motivated to act by promises from Western society about what will make them happy (Ahmed, 2010, Heron, 2007). Yet Clark’s (1997) work shows that although society might promise happiness through acts of altruism and sympathy, society also creates limitations on how much sympathy one should receive. Clark calls these "sympathy margins". Sympathy margins are created so that those on the margins do not get as much sympathy as their situation would warrant, for fear that it would exhaust the sympathiser physically, emotionally and financially. It is likely that Orientalisms produce margins that work to maintain unequal power relations. Thus there can also be socio-spatial articulations to stop the accumulation of emotions in certain spaces.

19 Ahmed was referring to an older text when she used this word.
Investigating the emotions that are articulated (or are silent) at a particular location can often reveal complex and overlapping layers of emotional entanglements associated with a place (Molz, 2005, Morris and Thomas, 2005, Walsh, 2006 a). An example of this can be found in Molz’s (2005) investigation of First World travellers’ experiences of McDonald’s, while overseas. Molz notes that McDonald’s restaurants were an escape or a comfort zone where travellers could indulge in comfort food to ease the disorientation and stresses of foreign cultures. McDonald’s provided a comfort zone because of the sense of home and familiarity that it produced in the minds of Westerners. And yet it was this sense of home and familiarity that engendered a sense of ambivalence about McDonald’s when overseas. This is because home is seen as the place that is so familiar it must be overcome through travelling and experiencing what is beyond the borders of the familiar. So for Western travellers, notions of home as familiar meant that visiting McDonald’s gave people emotions such as comfort and security, while simultaneously giving them feelings of guilt, frustration and contempt. Moltz (2005 pg 72) explained this by saying that by ‘indulging’ in McDonald’s people felt “robbed of the transforming experience” presented by encounters with others. These mixed emotions, according to Molz, show both the confusion that one feels as globalisation blurs the boundary between leisure or domestic places, and the boundary between home and away. Equally important, says Molz, are the individual emotional stances of the traveller, such as how geographically and emotionally far from home they feel and whether the traveller’s trajectory is taking them further or closer to the familiar.

Molz’s (2005) study shows how, by investigating the locations that signify a sense of home or the familiar, one can see how desires for the familiar are interwoven with debates about globalisation and a more general ambivalence towards the homogenisation (or hydbridisation) of cultures that globalisation brings. Molz’s work has relevance to the experience of Western development workers, as they often identify themselves as ‘travellers’ as well as development workers (Simpson, 2004, Heron, 2007). It is also relevant to how Orientalisms are perpetuated in contemporary society, as the justifications for being in McDonald’s, as well as the feelings towards McDonald’s, were entangled with desires about accessing and experiencing the foreign (or ‘East’) and learning more about the one’s self from the experience.

Another researcher who investigated the Emotional Geographies of Western travellers is Katie Walsh (2006 b, 2006 a, 2007). Walsh’s studies primarily revolved around examining the objects and places in Dubai that promoted a sense of belonging in young British expats. Walsh (2006 b pg 1) found that domesticity, intimacy and foreignness are important factors in determining
belonging. For her, domesticity, intimacy and foreignness are not mutually exclusive ways of understanding belonging, rather they are interrelated and part of the multiplicity of ways in which belonging is experienced by British expats. A strong theme that comes through Walsh’s work is that belonging produces a sense of self (Walsh, 2006 b, 2006 a, 2007). Because a sense of self as a Westerner is central to Orientalisms it is likely that belonging plays an important role in producing and/or resisting Orientalisms. Walsh observed that it was often through performing certain mundane acts, like going to bars, that British expats began to feel they belonged (or didn’t belong) to certain expat identities. In addition, she found that certain acts of belonging often revolved around everyday objects of the British expats lives, like DVDs and plastic bowls. Walsh’s work indicates that study of the emotional reactions to mundane and everyday spaces and objects of (Western) development workers’ lives, is a rich vein for understanding their sense of self. It is therefore a useful approach to understanding the processes by which development workers produce a sense of self that promotes or resists Orientalisms.

One aspect that Emotional Geographies have found particularly interesting is the study of the treatment of emotions in modernist thought (Connolly, 1999, Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005, Smith, Davidson, Cameron et al, 2009, Wright, 2012). This is particularly interesting for this thesis as development processes are largely a product of modernist thinking (Wright, 2012) stemming as they do from enlightenment era projects of colonial powers. For example Smith, Davidson, Cameron and Bondi (2009) believe that emotions played an important role from the start in resisting the hegemony of modernist thought. They argue that the philosophy of Descartes marked the beginning of the modernist thinking that has come to dominate much of Western thought. Descartes philosophy (and therefore modernist thinking) is marked by Cartesian dualism. This is the belief that there is a separate and distinct divide between mind and body. This imagines a superior, rational, controlling and ephemeral mind on one side, and a visceral, physical body on the other, for the mind to control. Like Orientalisms, the binary system of this philosophy entails a separate superior Self (which was the mind) and an inferior Other (which was the body). Thus all forms of feeling were relegated to the body and were considered inferior to the whims of the rational (controlling) mind. Yet Smith, Davidson, Cameron and Bondi (2009) argue that emotions have always been more than just feelings. Emotions also involve thoughts and perceptions which are the ‘realm’ of the mind. As such, emotions could never fit neatly into Descartes’ mind/body boxes. So Descartes, in his final book, “Passions of the Soul”, had to admit that even his rationalist philosophy of science can
never be fully emotionless. In this book, Descartes states that his philosophy was spurred-on by his desire to know, which he sees as an emotion sparked into being by another emotion, wonderment (Smith, Davidson Cameron et al, 2009 pg 9). Descartes argues that because emotions cannot be fully removed from the ‘rational’ mind’s field of view, some form of suppression and control must be placed on them. Thus the rational superior self was taught to suppress and control its emotionality.

Moreover, Descartes’ suppression of emotion can be seen as an important foundation stone in the creation of Orientalisms. Descartes claims that although some wonderment (i.e. emotion) is needed in order for people to study and understand a subject, too much wonderment is a bad thing. The cure for wonderment is gaining a sufficient amount of ‘rational’ knowledge on a subject (Descartes, 1989, Smith, Davidson, Cameron et al, 2009). The ‘West’, according to Said (1978) has always had a great fascination (i.e. wonderment) with the ‘East’. Thus controlling and suppressing that wonderment through ‘rational’ knowledge goes hand-in-hand with controlling and suppressing that which causes wonderment (i.e. the ‘East’), through ‘rational’ knowledge.

One of the best ways to suppress emotionality is to ignore or deny its existence in ‘rational’ thought (Wright, 2012, Barbalet, 2002, Davidson, Bondi and Smith, 2007). Barbalet (2002) claims that instead of being emotionless, rational thought is in fact a system of preferring some emotions over others. He claims that to be ‘rational’, which has been defined as a superior state, means to be calm, confident and secure. Thus emotions like calmness and confidence are seen as superior to other emotions like anger, insecurity and grief. If a more rational subject is one goal of mainstream development, then it stands to reason that the goal is not to reduce emotionality but more as a goal to get the ‘underdeveloped’ person to accept a hierarchy of emotions (Barbalet, 2002, Wright, 2012), which can serve as a useful tool for ‘confirming’ the superiority of the imperialist.

Probably one of the most useful outcomes of new research into Emotional Geographies has been the new understanding about how to be reflexive. Emotional Geographers are often interested in how emotions are represented in various spatial and temporal contexts (Bondi, 2001, Jones, 2007, Davidson and Smith, 2009, Hepworth, 2007, Thien, 2007). This has led to a number of works that study the importance of being reflexive about the emotional aspects to knowledge claims.
For example, Bondi (2001) investigates the role of empathy in producing reflexive engagement with the other. She notes that empathy can be an important and valuable emotion when thinking about fieldwork interactions. Bondi (2001 pg 1) argues that empathy can be thought of as entailing an oscillation between observation and participation which creates psychic space or room to manoeuvre, and that it provides a way of understanding other people’s experiences in the context of both similarities and differences between researchers and research subjects. Thus, it provides a useful resource for understanding the dynamics of the relationship between researcher and subject (or Self and Other). She is also wary of the way that empathy can slide into identification, the unconscious process of identifying the other as the self, and projecting one’s own experiences, feelings and reactions onto the research subject. When identification occurs, the researcher begins to speak for the subject (Bondi 2001). Therefore a constant mindfulness about how and when empathy might slip into identification should be fostered.

Studies like Bondi’s (2001) suggest that by being reflexive of emotions, one can produce interactions that can resist Orientalisms. Yet they also suggest a hyper vigilance is needed, as emotions can slip so easily into other forms of emotion that might promote, rather than resist, Orientalisms. In addition, works by Emotional Geographers suggest some limits to reflexivity. As Jones (2007 pg 205-206) notes, “Emotions systematically and constantly interact with our conscious and unconscious selves, memories and environment: they en-frame the rational and not vice versa... Emotions are intensely political, gendered and spatially articulated in both obvious and less obvious ways.” It is through these less obvious ways that emotions can resist even reflexive attempts at representation. This is because emotions in the present are invariably linked to the past, in ways that subjects cannot recollect in the present. Although Jones proposes limits to reflexivity, he argues that emotions still need to be taken account, and that one must be hyper-reflexive of forces and directions that emotions can take people.

In recent years academics have begun to study community and development organisations in relation to these new understandings of emotions. These academics have provided insights into how emotions, race and development culture interact to produce development outcomes. Some of these articles will be discussed in the following section.
**Emotional Geographies of Development**

Most researchers acknowledge that working for community and development organisations/groups can be a highly emotional experience (Vaux, 2001, Hardy, 2011, Smith and Jenkins, 2011, Wright, 2012). And so it is not surprising that research into the organisational theory of community organisations and social movements (as opposed to the study of development) was amongst the first to produce insights into the effects of emotion that were directly relevant to the study of development (Hardy, 2011).

Sarita Srivastava’s (2005) work, “You’re calling me a racist? The Moral and Emotional Regulation of Antiracism and Feminism”, is a good example. Srivastava argues that emotional reactions add an extra level of complexity to antiracism work in feminist organisations. Srivastava believes that a number of strong emotional responses to antiracism in feminist groups are due to a moral identity in the minds of the 'white' feminist. This ‘white’ feminist identity has historical underpinnings in colonial ideas of ‘white’ femininity and the historic and racialised influences of nation-building and colonisation during the first- wave feminist movement. A moral identity is an identity that people invest with moral significance: one’s belief in themselves as a ‘good person’ depends on whether they think their actions and reactions are consistent with that identity (Kleinman, 1996). Feminist moral identity is often linked to the liberal and 'egalitarian' non-racist discourse as opposed to the anti-racist. Antiracism confronts the moral identity of some 'white' feminists by challenging the belief that they are 'good' and creating egalitarian communities using a discourse of tolerance. As a result, emotional barriers can stop issues within feminist organisations being addressed. Srivastava (2005) gives examples such as angry denials, and outpourings of sympathy (and tears) that only focus on the self. These include outpourings of empathy that mean the pain that ‘white’ feminists feel about what happened to ‘non-white’ feminists drowns out the voices of non-white feminists. Another example Srivastava provides is that hearing about the sufferings of ‘black’ feminists can produce a sense of trauma in ‘white’ feminists that can bring about a desire to stay uninformed, in order to avoid more trauma. Also the notion of salvation that plays a strong part in feminism can lead to the construction of "a sacred image of moral superiority" as those struggling with new understanding of racism distance themselves from their own responsibility for ethical decisions and organisational action. Srivastava also notes; as these antiracism challenges (which cause such emotion) keep occurring, they shift the moral identity of the 'white' feminist. Yet, due to the structure of contemporary feminism and its historical influences (of which colonialism and Orientalisms are important), anti-racist
challenges seem mostly limited to bringing about personal change in the ‘white’ feminist; and seem to have little effect on organisational structures and aims. These findings are important to international development studies and people working in the field as there are sometimes resonances between the works of development workers and the works of feminist organisations. And in addition development work has a strong historical association with the forces that produced the first-wave ‘white’ feminists and the development of Western development practices (Srivastava, 2005, Heron, 2007).

Gould’s (2009) investigation into the rise and decline of the ACT UP movement in America showed that emotions are vital to social movements. She argues that emotions provide the force, motivation, and direction for the political action to force changes in attitudes, politics and laws around HIV and AIDS. The way emotions were handled by ACT UP was instrumental in its rise, success and eventual decline as an organisation. One interesting finding of Gould’s was the way a social change organisation like ACT UP would alter and channel emotional energy in ways that were deemed more useful in promoting social change. This channelling of emotions brought a number of successes but was also problematic. Thus, Gould (2009) describes with great empathy, but also concern, the ways that grief at the death of many in the gay and lesbian community was channelled by ACT UP members, into an anger and rage at the fact that nothing was being done about these deaths in the wider community. This anger produced some confrontational actions that brought the issues of HIV and AIDS into the wider community’s consciousness. Yet Gould (2009) ponders the extent to which grief can be transformed into righteous anger. She notes how years after the events that she were involved in with ACT UP, she is still brought to tears as she analyses her ‘data’ of old newspaper articles, speeches, etc, indicating the grief from this time has not gone away or changed.

Gould (2009) suggests that the decline in ACT UP is also located in the inability to completely channel emotions into “maintaining the rage”. She notes despite the success of groups like ACT UP, HIV/AIDS continued to spread into the 90s and began to go beyond the gay and lesbian community. This produced a sense of fear in society as a whole. This fear, along with other emotions like (suppressed) grief, helped to produce feelings of depression and betrayal among ACT UP members which were instrumental in the decline of ACT UP (Gould, 2009).
We can take from Gould’s work that, when a state of affect is generated, there is an attempt to make sense of it. To do this individuals and groups refer to their emotional habitus\(^{20}\), which provides the interpretive schema of naming the feeling, as well as paths for responsive action. These responses or actions, in collective form, may alter the emotional habitus (Gould, 2009, Kane, 2010). The actions of development organisations must be seen to be able to produce similar effects on the emotional habitus of place. Both the emotional habitus they impact on, and the changes that they impart on the emotional habitus of people, have the ability to resist or promote Orientalisms.

A strength of Gould’s (2009) work was the reflexive stance applied to understanding the rise and decline of ACT UP and the writer’s own involvement in it. Vaux (2001) too, undertook a reflexive stance to his involvement in Oxfam over a period of many years. His work gives insights into how emotions can shape international development organisations. He notes subtle forms of racism were often present in emotional dispositions made to influence decisions about where and how to deliver aid to those in need. Thus, Vaux observes that after the Kosovo conflict, Oxfam did not think it was problematic to use NATO resources and transport in order to deliver aid to people in Kosovo and Serbia. In most other conflicts, Oxfam would deny the support of one side to help deliver aid, as contrary to an apolitical stance in times of war. Vaux (2001) notes that the perceived practicalities and efficiency of delivering aid with NATO’s help combined with positive sentiments that came from the common Western-centric heritage of NATO and Oxfam, to override usual practice. The decision to use NATO affected what and where aid was delivered\(^{21}\). Such emotional decisions are in part influenced by Orientalisms.

In fact, an increasing number of writers in international development studies are beginning to be reflexive of their emotions and how these affect development outcomes (Davies, 2010, Christou, 2011, Hardy, 2011, Humble, 2011, Jones and Ficklin, 2011, Lund, 2011, Punch, 2011, Sanderson, 2011, Smith and Jenkins, 2011). Many have been reflexive of the academic

\(^{20}\) By “habitus” I mean their predispositions, schema, values, and lifestyles.

\(^{21}\) Vaux (2001) did not necessarily see this as a bad thing, as it is likely more aid was delivered by using NATO transports and so on, because Oxfam did not have to pay for, and co-ordinate, such deliveries.
experience of working in development studies, a process that often straddles the bounds of researcher and development worker. Thus a number of studies show (in the context of international development studies)

"Why we research; how and who we research; how the research process unfolds; how we approach the ethical dilemmas that inevitably present themselves during the research; and how we finally represent that research can all be shaped by an emotional commitment and a striving for greater social justice, underpinned by a complex and contestable sense of connection with the lives of distant, or not so distant, others" (Smith and Jenkins, 2011 pg 75).

As the boundary between development researcher and development worker is often very blurred in participatory research, these academics have uncovered a lot about how emotions affect development workers and organisations in general (Humble, 2011).

For example, Humble (2011) discusses how his emotions, while working in a development education organisation, were often mixed and very messy. Through interrogating his emotions, he could begin to see how he was motivated by the structure of research to negotiate and control these emotions into something that they were not. He notes that trying to clean up the emotional messiness of the situation through research methods meant that emotions and context were often not situated and much could be lost through this process. Humble argues that emotional tensions within and between development education organisations and workers at all levels, were an important influence on how and what work was implemented. Yet the common ways of reporting research, even qualitative research, tended to gloss over this emotional messiness and present the actions as being smoother and less contested than the actuality of the situation. Thus Humble’s (2011) research indicates that a researcher must look critically at how research represents the emotional realities that affect the development researcher and the development organisation that they are researching. His work also shows that emotions truly matter when trying to understand how development organisations run and the actions that they undertake.

Others, like Drew (2013), have investigated how emotions are triggered through the planning and implementation of development projects. Drew’s investigations concerned several dam development projects proposed for the Upper Ganges. Drew argues that expressions of love for, and grief about, what was happening to the Ganges River promoted as well as enacted community resistance to the projects. The strength of these resistances was instrumental in
halting the projects. In place of dam development, ecologically sensitive areas were set up to help ensure the protection of wildlife and the cleanliness of the Ganges River. This study indicates that emotions in opposition to the status quo in development can change how development is conceived\textsuperscript{22}. Research findings such as these open up the possibilities that similar resistances might be felt and enacted against development projects that exhibit Orientalisms.

Also of relevance to the present study is the work of Wright (2012 pg 1113) which draws “on empirical work with land reform participants in the Philippines to consider the ways emotions are central to participants’ experiences”. She discovered that “emotions inform how the land tillers act and react, and how they understand the past, present and future." Wright argues that, too often, research will focus on the suffering of development participants. Although this is an important and prevalent aspect of many development processes, this focus runs the risk of reproducing a dichotomy in which suffering is associated with the Third World, and pleasure with the First World. Wright (2012) advocates looking at the great and ever changing range of emotional experiences experienced by development participants. In addition, Wright argues that development researchers should view emotions as relational, entirely imbricated with development agendas, and the people and places of development. Being imbricated in development agendas means that emotions are also imbricated in the (post) colonial agendas that often lurk behind development agendas (Radcliffe, 2005).

Such works clearly indicate that emotions are a vital factor in how and why social movements and development projects do what they do. They show that what is considered right and sensible is often a result of emotions and the social forces that may manipulate them. As such, emotions should play a more crucial role in both postcolonial studies and development studies.

2.3 Conclusion

In this chapter I have discussed the theoretical framework of this thesis. I have outlined two fields that are important to my results. These fields are Postcolonial Studies and Emotional

\textsuperscript{22}In this case, from dam development to environmental protection development work.
Geographies. This chapter has indicated that there could be benefits from combining the understandings of Emotional Geographers with a more nuanced version of Orientalisms. This would seem like a useful pairing of disciplines because postcolonial research is very amenable to the idea that emotions might be the cause of containing racism and imperialism, but as yet very few postcolonial researchers have deeply, or even directly, studied this relationship.

It would seem, therefore, that the next logical step in the inquiry into the role of Orientalisms in society would be to investigate the role of emotions in the production of Orientalisms. Also, until very recently, development was yet to embrace the importance of emotions in the development process. Therefore this step is a particularly important step to make as it will also further much needed investigations into the role of emotions in development.

Another way that Postcolonial Studies can benefit from this pairing of fields is in the particularly under-researched area of how Orientalisms are taught to other researchers and development workers. By investigating this aspect of Orientalisms in light of the understandings that come from Emotional Geographies, there is the potential to gain a critical understanding of the roles that emotions play in the teaching and dissemination of racist and imperialist thought.

Emotional Geographies, too, will benefit from this pairing of fields. A number of Emotional Geographers are interested in the role of emotions in acts of racism. The theories of Orientalisms can provide Emotional Geographies with a strong and established theoretical basis by which Emotional Geographers can direct their inquirers into contemporary forms of racism and imperialism. In addition by investigating development this thesis can help strengthen the call for a greater understanding of the role of emotions in development.

The combining of Postcolonial Studies with Emotional Geographies also can lead to important breakthroughs in promoting resistances to Orientalisms. In particular, this chapter highlights how greater expressions of self reflexivity are a means to produce new forms of knowledge; new forms of knowledge that can move societies beyond Orientalisms. Emotional Geographies have the potential to expose certain aspects of the interactions between the ‘Self’ and the ‘Other’ that may have been previously overlooked or undervalued in traditional postcolonial understandings of reflexivity. In other words, combining these two fields can teach people to be more reflexive of their emotions and how this can impact of self/other relations, which are vital aspects of any Western development project.
Chapter 3: Contextualising HIV and AIDS Development in PNG

3.1 Introduction

In this chapter I contextualise the situation in which HIV and AIDS development work is performed in Papua New Guinea. It should be noted that, in order to do this, I must draw on the works of previous Western researchers and agencies. These institutions and people have been complicit in producing and reproducing Orientalisms (Said, 2003). Indeed, it is inevitable that there are politics associated with representing peoples and places. There is therefore something uncomfortable, even problematic, in the use of these sources, and in my portrayal of PNG as a place that can be ‘known’ through research. Nevertheless such sources were my (and many other Western academics’ and development workers’) means of contextualising HIV and AIDS in PNG. In addition, because I am particularly interested in the development context of HIV and AIDS in PNG, I have relied heavily on the works of development organisations and the ways that they contextualised PNG. Therefore it is important to read the chapter with a reflexive understanding of this inherent contradiction. Some footnotes in the first section are used to draw attention to just some of the ways readers might need to be reflexive of what they are reading.

In this chapter I will provide a brief country description of PNG before moving on to discuss its colonial history. I will then describe the role that international development agencies play in ‘independent’ PNG. I will particularly focus on the development industry’s interest and response to the HIV and AIDS ‘crises’ in PNG. This will, of course, involve a description of these ‘crises’ as seen by mainstream development agencies. Finally, I will critically describe AusAID’s National HIV and AIDS support project (NHASP). The NHASP was largely responsible for the funding of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG between 2000 and 2006. This campaign is

---

23 Although current circumstances in which Australia sends all asylum seekers who arrive by boat to PNG sheds some doubt on just how independent PNG is from Australia. Denoon (2012) refers to PNG’s independence more as a trial separation, one in which true independence is still being negotiated, or is a work in progress.

24 The NHASP concluded in 2006, and new HIV and AIDS development campaigns by AusAID are now in effect.
important to this thesis as NHASP shaped the experiences of the development workers I interviewed and shaped my own experiences in PNG.

### 3.2 Papua New Guinea Country Description

Papua New Guinea is located in the tropics, comprising the eastern half of the island called New Guinea and covering an area of 462,840 square kilometres (Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), 2013). It shares a land border with the Indonesian province of West Papua to its west\(^2\). Other neighbouring countries (in order of proximity to PNG) include; The Federated States of Micronesia, Solomon Islands, Palau, Australia and Nauru.

\(^2\) Terms such as these can be problematic due to a colonial past that orientates people around an ‘East’ which derives from being east of Greenwich, and thus may orientate people to see the ‘West’ as the norm (Ahmed, 2006).
The area is comprised of a variety of environments including mountain regions and tropical islands. There are also coastal, rainforest and mangrove regions (Connell, 1997 b, United Nations Development Program (UNDP), 1997, United Nations Environment Program (UNEP), 2000, McKinnon, Starnes and Carillet, 2008, CIA, 2012). The country has an abundance of natural resources, the extraction of which is central to the PNG economy (Connell, 1997 a, UNDP, 1997, WHO Pacific Regional Office, 2010, Encyclopaedia Britannica Inc., 2012). Mining and forestry provide a great deal of PNG’s international investment and engagement with the rest of the world. Yet these natural resource projects often fit uneasily and problematically with traditional land rights in PNG (UNDP, 1997, Duncan and Chand, 2002, Macintyre, 2007, McKinnon, Starnes and Carillet, 2008). Many of the origins of the civil war that occurred in the Bougainville province during the 1990s can be traced to tensions between the actions of international mining companies, the PNG Government and Bougainvillean’s ownership and entitlements under the traditional systems of land ownership. By the end of this nine-year civil war, between 8 and 20,000 lives had been lost (Salgo, 2000, Murray and Storey 2003, McLeod and Morgan, 2007, CIA, 2012). Such disputes, even if they don’t escalate into war, can cause economic destabilisation in communities, which may exacerbate the risks of HIV (Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997). Even if/when resource extraction does not cause tensions around traditional land entitlement, unsustainable patterns of resource extraction leading to environmental degradation have tended to exacerbate poverty in PNG. Poverty too is known to increase the risks of HIV and AIDS (UNDP, 1997).

Not only does PNG have a diverse natural environment, it is also one of the most culturally diverse areas in the world. According to the Central Intelligence Agency (2013) there are

---

26 Although the civil war officially occurred between 1989 and 1998, there were many incidents of conflict decades before and after this time.

27 It is important for Westerners, such as myself, to be reflexive of their own complicit role in this process, as many of the companies extracting these resources are Western enterprises and/or often extract resources to satisfy Western(ised) demands. In fact Western mining and political interest were implicated in events in the Bougainville crisis (Finin, 2000).
several thousand separate communities in PNG. Many of these communities have their own languages, customs and traditions (Connell, 1997 a, UNEP, 2000, Economic Insights Pty Ltd, 2003). There are often low-scale conflicts between some of these communities. Contemporary weaponry and migratory patterns are believed to have exacerbated some of these conflicts and their impacts (CIA, 2013).\footnote{Once again it is important to be reflexive and not Orientalise “tribal conflicts” as an aspect of PNG people. These conflicts are often about land and resource access/use. There is much evidence that the workings of Western/capitalist enterprise have played a role in a number of these conflicts, adding to the effects of the colonial demarcation of land (Baker, 1977).}

There are currently over 800 different indigenous languages spoken in the country (Dutton and Thomas, 1985, CIA, 2012, Foley, 1986). There are two main ‘trade’ languages and creoles used for communicating between language groups. These are Tok Pisin (New Guinea Pidgin English) and Police Motu (Hiri Motu). Tok Pisin is the most widely understood language in all areas of PNG, while Police Motu is currently spoken only by about 2 per cent of the population, predominantly in the southern areas around Port Moresby, and is declining in usage. English is also widely spoken in the large centres. However, as the majority of the population do not live in urban areas, fluent English speakers comprise about 1-2 per cent of the population (Dutton, 1985, CIA, 2012, Foley, 1986).

Academics, Western governments and development organisations have often described PNG societies as being primarily village-based and agricultural, comprised of political groupings of no more than a few thousand people (UNDP 1997, Hawksley, 2006, CIA, 2013). There are traditional clan territorial boundaries that, although sometimes fought over, are well understood. The people are also “linked through complex social and political relations concerning land inheritance, gift giving, marriage and kinship ties and defensive and offensive alliances” (Hawksley, 2006 pg 171). Such concepts by themselves run the risk of representing PNG peoples as cultures as essentially one unchanging culture. This however is not the case; modernism and development is changing PNG, producing more urbanised peoples as well as much more permanent migration of peoples onto the traditional lands of other clan groups, resulting in new negotiations of divisions and rights. (Curry, Koczberski and Connell, 2012). In other words “Indigenous social and cultural frameworks are constantly being reworked in the
interaction with macro-level processes to create a range of alternative modernities” (Curry, Koczberski and Connell, 2012 pg 122).

PNG is considered to have a dual economy, in which 15 per cent of the population lives in urban areas and 85 per cent derives a living directly from farming, mainly subsistence crops. The rural areas are considered to experience the worst poverty (Asian Development Bank, 2002 b, Asian Development Bank, 2002 a). One of the reasons for this is that most subsistence farmers live in rural and remote areas where the delivery of services and development aid is expensive and logistically challenging. This has meant that many communities have difficulty accessing quality health care, education and adequate transport (AusAID, 2012 a). As a consequence, PNG in general has very low levels of formal education and health services; in rural areas this has been exacerbated by sustained low levels of investment, particularly in agricultural productivity, education, and health (Asian Development Bank, 2002 a). Thus children may not attend schools, as the nearest school is too far to walk. The lack of central government services in rural communities contributes to migration to urban areas. This puts more stress on the resources and living space in the settlements and cities. Poverty is thus increasing in both rural and urban areas (Asian Development Bank 2002 b pg 6).

The urban 15 per cent are largely located in the centres of Port Moresby (the capital), Lae, Madang, Wewak, Goroka, Mt Hagen, and Rabaul (UNEP, 2000, Department of Foreign Affairs 29 It should be noted that, nowadays, even those who mainly subsist off the crops that they produce are often engaged in a diverse array of other forms of agrarian and non-agrarian activates to ensure their family’s economic security. Rural communities, particularly those on land settlement schemes, have subsistence plots where the majority of a family’s food needs and work takes place. Yet this subsistence living often incorporates cash cropping, such as oil palm, and off-farm activities, such as selling excess food stocks at markets (Koczberski and Curry, 2005).

30 Descriptions such as these that classify people as living in “remote areas” must be understood as being from a Western perspective. Perhaps it is best not to view the “remote” environment as something that challenges and blocks aid, but as an indicator that aid work has to be conceived in a way that is appropriate to the region. In addition, some Papua New Guineans feel that their village is central and easy to reach, and it is the urban centres like Port Moresby or Canberra that are seen as “remote” and difficult to access (Pers Coms).
and Trade, 2011). Although each area is unique, Port Moresby being the capital and largest of these urban areas (as well as being the place where many development organisations are based) will be described next.

**Description of Port Moresby**

The Port Moresby capital district is home to approximately 400,000 people (UN Habitat: Regional and Technical Cooperation Division, 2010). The city is surrounded by a large number of settlements or urban villages (shanties) (UN Habitat: Regional and Technical Cooperation Division, 2010). The capital is situated on the shorelines of the Gulf of Papua, in the south eastern part of the island of New Guinea (see Figure 1 above). The climate is dry, considering its tropical location, with less than 1,270 millimetres of rainfall every year.

The dry climate leads to occasional drought and drinking-water shortages (UNEP, 2000, http://travel.mapsofworld.com, 2012). These are particularly acute in the settlement districts which have no legal access to the town’s water supply, let alone sewage and sanitation and electricity (Asian Development Bank 2008, UN Habitat: Regional and Technical Cooperation Division, 2010). Other services and infrastructure are even more unreliable than the water supply. Problems in delivery of sanitation mean that large piles of garbage often build up in the streets (UN Habitat: Regional and Technical Cooperation Division, 2010). In addition, power outages are an increasingly common occurrence in PNG (Asian Development Bank, 2008). Most of the settlements have no power, maintained roads or sanitation.

The formal unemployment rate in Port Moresby and its surrounding settlements is considered to be very high\(^3\). As a result a large number of people, particularly from the settlements, are engaged in the informal sector. The high unemployment rates are an important contributor (along with the erosion of cultural values and widening income disparity) to a high, and increasing, crime rate in Port Moresby (UN Habitat: Regional and Technical Cooperation Division, 2010). According to UN Habitat (2010), common crimes are pick-pocketing, armed robbery, vehicle theft, carjackings, and aggravated assault. In addition, gang rapes and

\(^3\) There are unlikely to be accurate figures of the exact rate of unemployment, but it would be safe to say well over 50 per cent of Moresby’s population is not formally employed.
homicides are also increasing in number. The high level of crime has meant that the movement of residents is restricted after dark, and there are certain ‘no-go’ areas which can only be accessed under security protection (UN Habitat: Regional and Technical Cooperation Division, 2010 pg 38).

Much of the above paints a bleak picture of PNG and Port Moresby, which certainly wasn’t the summation of my experience of PNG and Port Moresby. The bleak picture drawn from reports from large scale development agencies including AusAID, the Asian Development Bank and the UN does not fully contextualise the situation in PNG. A considerable body of academic work attempts to normalise the actualities of PNG urban living by providing a more nuanced perspective (e.g. Connell and Lea, 1993, Barber 2003, Connell, 2003, Goddard, 2005). Although acknowledging many of the problems mentioned above, these writers have noted the role played by urban settlements, including those in Port Moresby, in offering a viable household economic and social survival strategy. The urban settlements enable reduction of the cost of living, for example through the pooling of incomes and garden produce. They also help in the continuation of kin and clan connections\(^{32}\) that are an integral social network in many PNG cultures, and provide (some) protection from social unrest (Barber, 2003, Goddard, 2005).

Some writers have also noted that the neo-liberal development agendas managed by the PNG government have often given weight to the stereotypical portrayals of urban settlements. The PNG government has then used these stereo-types to initiate (violent) actions that have exacerbated the problems found in urban settlements in an attempt to achieve its agendas (Connell, 2003, Goddard, 2005).

It is therefore important to nuance the bleak picture of urban life in PNG by highlighting the strong family and kinship ties which often provide a supportive framework for many in the

\(^{32}\) Some writers have noted a breakdown within urban communities of some of these ‘traditional’ connections with villages outside of the urban area. These breakdowns are partly caused by long term financial hardships, and affected communities seem to be in poorer socioeconomic circumstances because of this disconnection. It has been suggested that people in these communities are more likely to turn to crime as a survival strategy (Duncan and Chand, 2002, Barber, 2003).
community (Barber, 2003, McKinnon, Starnes and Carillet, 2008). In fact the term “weak state, strong society” has been applied to Melanesian societies like those found in PNG (Makim, 2002). Although disparaging of the state, the term does describe how many in PNG gain strength and support through the variety of church groups, NGOs, and traditional custom and kinship relationships that are vibrant and strong in PNG.

One must be reflexive, not only of the role that Westerners play in portraying PNG in a bleak light, but also of the fact that a number of contributing factors have their origin in the colonial experimentation of England, Germany and Australia. These three colonial powers, at one stage or another, controlled the area that now constitutes the independent state of Papua New Guinea. Yet all colonised PNG at a relatively late stage of “The Colonial Experiment”, and then often only partially or theoretically (Connell, 1997 a). One effect of this is that PNG has seen a period of rapid change to its societies that is still occurring today. The history and legacy of colonialism in PNG will be discussed in the next section.

3.3 A Colonial History of PNG

The period of formal colonialism in PNG started in 1884 and ended in 1975, when Australia, which was then the colonial power for the territory of Papua and New Guinea, ceded the country ‘back’ to the PNG people. Australia was not the first colonial power to govern PNG. After many years of relatively minor trade with European powers (and blackbirding by the Queensland colony 34), England made the south-eastern quarter of the island of New Guinea a protectorate of its empire (Denoon, 2012). This was a rather reluctant acquisition, made as a protective measure out of fear of a territorial invasion of its Australian colonies (Connell 1997a). Part of this reluctance came from beliefs propagated by a dominant public health paradigm at that time—tropical medicine. This paradigm saw geography (along with racialised

33 The colonial process was instrumental in the formation of the concept of ‘Papua New Guinea,’ and thence that of ‘Papua New Guinean people.’ Therefore there is something problematic in saying that the country was given ‘back’ to the PNG people.

34 Before the official colonial period, settlers from the colony of Queensland were often involved in ‘blackbirding’ the indigenous people of PNG (Denoon, 2012).
beliefs about the people from the tropics) as the cause of ill health in the tropics. It was believed that no profitable (white) colony could be formed in PNG (Denoon, 1991). These beliefs express a white/Western fear of the tropics that was common in that era. Thus it could be said the southern half of PNG was colonised out of, and in a state of, fear.

In response to England’s claim, Germany claimed the north-eastern side of the island of New Guinea. Unlike England, Germany saw the potential for a profitable colony, and administration of the colony was placed in the hands of the German New Guinea Trading Company. So where the English colony of English New Guinea was largely ignored and underdeveloped, German New Guinea had a more established economy and actively promoted trade and plantation development in the region. At this stage the German colony seemed more economically active and developed. Yet in both colonies colonial ‘control’ was largely restricted to the coast (Connell, 1997 a)35.

Much of this changed after World War I when Australia was awarded territorial control over both the colonies of Papua36 and New Guinea, which now form the nation of PNG (Connell, 1997 a, Foley, 1986). The two areas then became Australian territories and fell under the realm of the “White Australia Policy” which overtly privileged certain white migrants (Denoon, 2012). This racist policy had a big impact on how PNG developed. The Western (mainly Australian), urban, and white population of the settler class which had come to New Guinea were kept separate from the ‘Natives,’ who were seen as inferior beings (Denoon, 1989, Denoon, 1991, Denoon, 2012, Connell, 1997 a). The minority urban white population and the white plantation owners held much sway on how the country developed. Over much of this time the people of PNG were not consulted on how their country was to develop, with most

35 Thus one could argue resource extraction/exploitation and fear were the two fundamentals behind the establishment of the two colonies of Papua and New Guinea that nowadays form the country of PNG. At least in my view, many Australians still see their former colony of PNG in terms of resource exploitation and of fear.

12 In 1906 England ceded the colony of English New Guinea to Australia, when it became known as Papua.

For the public health works of the country, this meant that policies which aimed to provide facilities like hospitals (which essentially could be only accessed by the urban whites) and medicines for the indentured labour of the plantations often took precedence over policies that could have been beneficial to the majority of the people in Papua and New Guinea (Denoon, 1991). Thus infrastructure, including the provision of clean water and sanitation for the population as a whole, was often sidelined.

There was one public health measure in particular that is likely to have had a significant impact on the sexual cultures of PNG and the concomitant prospects of the spread of sexually transmitted diseases like HIV. That was the policy which led to men being paid a comparatively significant amount to father children (Denoon 1991). This policy stemmed from the notion of “racial degeneration” held by many Australian settlers at the time. Racial degeneration is the racist idea that once a race deemed inferior starts living side-by-side with the ‘superior’ white race it will eventually die out. But plantation owners feared this, because they needed indentured labour to work their plantations. So the plantation owners lobbied for health campaigns to increase the number of babies born in PNG. Their campaign, however, did not advocate increased child and maternal health care, and thus more disease and mortality arose from this campaign (Denoon, 1991).

Not surprisingly, with policies that neglected most of the country, the colony was running at a loss, and so was being ‘propped-up’ by Australia. The fledgling colonial apparatus only served the needs of a select white few. Christian missionaries, on the other hand, were gaining a great deal of power and control in PNG. The churches offered much of the schooling and most of the health services available to the PNG people, and this largely continues to this day (Spencer, 1999). As a result of this and other physical and spiritual help that the Church provided,

37 Once Canberra was established.

38 External social and economic factors such as the Great Depression also played a significant role in PNG’s economic prospects.
Christianity (and especially Catholicism) became central to the lives of most PNG people (Denoon, 2012).

Later on in this period of Australian colonialism (1930s), Westerners began to explore the interior of the country. This exploration was often spurred on by gold and other mineral speculation projects. These expeditions led to a number of ‘first contact moments’ between Westerners and PNG tribes (Denoon, 2012, Connell, 1997 a). It was at this time that PNG began to be seen in the eyes of Westerners as the ‘final frontier’, an adventurer’s playground. The type of images of PNG that this produced was something halfway between the ‘savageness’ of the deepest wilds of Africa, and the ‘softness’ of a Pacific paradise (Connell, 1997a, Denoon, 2012). This final frontier imagery continued into the later stages of Australian colonialism and beyond.

A change in policy focus came after World War II, when the Australian Government’s attitude towards PNG shifted. It was generally agreed that in order for Papua and New Guinea to develop, all their peoples needed to be given the resources to develop, rather than just a select ‘white’ group (Connell, 1997 a, Denoon, 1989). The policy changes were in part brought about by external (to PNG) forces, including changes in attitudes and paradigms of Australian Government officials/society, and the advent of new technologies including vaccines and antibiotics (Denoon, 2012, Denoon, 1991, Connell, 1997 a). They were also a result of internal forces/resistances. Many of the actions of Papua New Guineans that colonial academics labelled as ‘cargo cult’ behaviour could be considered a resistance to colonial control. Many of these supposed cargo cults tended to separate from both colonial administration and religion and undertake actions (which the colonialist labelled rituals) to secure access to more resources which they felt the colonialists were hoarding unfairly (Denoon, 2012).

Since the 1950s, high levels of Australian aid have enabled authorities in PNG to provide a wider range of social services than the colonial economy could sustain on its own (Denoon, 1989, Tulip, 2005). This period saw the establishment of schools, roads, hospitals, and judicial and political systems in PNG (Tulip, 2005). Although it was acknowledged that all must be involved in the development process, the wider PNG public generally was not consulted on the development paths that were to be undertaken. Canberra (and, in the case of public health,
doctors) would devise the strategic vision that the colonies would undertake and present it to the general population of PNG for endorsement rather than discussion39 (Denoon, 1989, Connell, 1997 a).

By the 1970s, both major parties in the Australian government were eager to end the colonial ‘experiment’ of PNG and see a new independent nation form (Connell, 1997 a, Denoon, 2012). By this time attitudes towards colonialism amongst the general Australian public had shifted significantly. The only thing of any real debate was when this change should happen (Denoon, 2012). Yet on the ground in PNG, many people were less confident in the idea of independence. Those opposed to decolonisation included Western settlers and some of the older (particularly male) Papua New Guineans. There was also some contention about decolonisation from some cultural groups that had only recently made contact with Australian colonial powers, and therefore had yet to fully assess the implications of colonisation (Denoon, 2012). In fact a number of ‘first contacts’ occurred after decolonisation, and many more tribes had only perfunctory versions of colonisation, in which the whole colonial experience boiled down to one or two visits by a few individuals on short term placements (Denoon, 2012). Yet there were many communities that had experienced colonialism for almost 100 years and desired to see its end. There was also a new wave of young indigenous university graduates/students, from the (relatively) recently established University of PNG, that provided a strong voice for decolonisation.

In 1972, with the election of Gough Whitlam who was morally opposed to the whole idea of colonialism, actions to decolonise PNG sped up considerably. Whitlam desired to see an independent PNG within two years of his election. On the ground in PNG he had the support of Michael Somare who, after the territorial elections, had built a majority coalition for early self-government and independence. These two parties worked to this extraordinarily short timeline to set up affairs for PNG to become an independent state. In 1975 independence was achieved, making it one of the few ‘peaceful’ decolonisation processes to have occurred. So, unlike many places in the world where the colonising party tried to keep hold of the colonial

39 Over this time PNG was given its own ‘elected Government’ but it was widely considered to be a rubber stamp to the policies developed back in Canberra (Denoon, 2012).
territory, in PNG it was the colonising party that was one of the strongest driving forces in this decolonisation (Denoon, 2012).

Yet this handover came with a number of immediate and long term economic costs to Papua New Guinea. With it came the severing of many social and economic services run by the Australian Government. Almost overnight, large institutions like the CSIRO packed up and left PNG, taking their resources and expertise with them. In addition, many Australian nationals went home, taking their own personal knowledge and skills (Tulip, 2005).

With the end of colonialism a new, post-colonial chapter started in PNG and Australian relations. Over this chapter, Australia has been the primary international aid donor to PNG, and remains so to this very day (Tulip, 2005, Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010). Yet for some time now, aid has been given officially in Australia’s interest (O’Connor, Chan and Goodman, 2006). There is ample evidence that Australia has used its aid-giving duties to promote its own neo-colonial agendas (Papoutsaki and Rooney, 2006, O’Connor, Chan and Goodman, 2006, Denoon, 2012). Australia’s aid has also been accused of pandering to the needs of a small, formal economy, rather than addressing the development needs of the country as a whole (Papoutsaki and Rooney, 2006).

Thus there are some resonances between colonial policies and those of today’s aid-giving policies. In addition, in 2004, Australia and Papua New Guinea negotiated an increased aid bill with ‘enhanced cooperation’. This bill has enabled Australians once again to work in Papua New Guinea’s government departments, the police and the army (Denoon, 2012 pg xi). Such bills put into contention just how independent PNG really is. This is particularly relevant in light of the Manus Island affair in which aid was given in exchange for PNG taking all of Australia’s asylum seekers who arrive by boat (Taylor, 2013).

In the next section I will discuss the development aid context in which this thesis is set. The focus will be on the development agencies’ responses to HIV and AIDS in PNG. It is important to note that the focus is on the context at the time my interviewees and I were working in PNG.
3.4 Development Agencies in PNG and their Response to HIV and AIDS

Description of the (HIV and AIDS) Development Agencies in PNG

Since independence, PNG has been a recipient of large tranches of international development aid, particularly from Australia. Australian Government’s rhetoric has tended to suggest that they are generous to the needs of PNG because of the special relationship that Australia has with PNG, as it is Australia’s closest neighbour and Australia is (PNG’s) largest trading partner. Australia also claims to help PNG due to the shared past as coloniser and colonised (Economic Insights Pty Ltd, 2003 pg 2, Denoon, 2012, Tulip, 2005). Counter to such statements of friendship and closeness are claims that Australian aid is given in Australia’s interest and continues the colonial practice of helping the formal economy (often located in the urban centres and commercial farms) at the expense of holistic development of the country (Papoutsaki and Rooney, 2006, O’Connor, Chan and Goodman, 2006, Denoon, 2012). So it is important to contextualise the situation in which development aid is delivered to PNG.

In 2005, aid to PNG provided about one fifth of the PNG Government’s budget (Tulip, 2005). Therefore aid plays a highly significant, but not primary, role in keeping the country afloat. At the same time, about four fifths of this aid budget comes from Australia (Tulip, 2005, Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010). Therefore Australia is by far the most important donor to PNG and has a lot of financial influence over how international development programs are run. Yet in real terms Australia has been reducing its aid budget to PNG for many years now, in an effort to ‘wean’ PNG off its financial aid (Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010, Tulip, 2005,AusAID, 2002). At least partly as a result of this, PNG, in more recent years, has begun to diversify its aid partners. So other significant donors include: China, the Asian Development Bank, the Global Fund (funding projects related to AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria) and the World Bank (Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010).

Such a term is highly Orientalising as it suggests that PNG is an infant and is completely dependent on a mature Australia. I have used this term to highlight the use of problematic terms by development organisations such as AusAID.
The recent decade has seen the health sector take up proportionally more of Australia’s aid budget than other vital sectors, like education and infrastructure (Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010). Changes to project funding have tended to suggest that, apart from governance issues, health development is the most important reform issue on Australia’s PNG aid agenda. And it would seem that HIV and AIDS is considered the most important health issue, as most of this increase in spending is the result of HIV and AIDS programs.

The significance of HIV/AIDS to the health budget can be seen in the comparison between the amount of money spent on general health development by AusAID and the amount of money spent on HIV and AIDS development work. Between 2000 and 2006 (the time when NHASP was active) AusAID spent only $7 million on improving the general health care of PNG, while $66.5 million was spent on the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (AusAID, 2006, 2006 b)

Although the primary funder of HIV and AIDS development works in PNG, Australia was not the only organisation to fund such work. Other organisations included the PNG Government and the World Health Organisation (AusAID, 2006 b, Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010). There are also a number of non-state organisations involved in HIV and AIDS development work. These groups receive significant monies from government donors but act as autonomous agencies. They include organisations like the Global Fund41 (which is fast becoming PNG’s biggest health development donor) and the Clinton Foundation that works in the Eastern Highlands of PNG to provide HIV and AIDS testing and treatments (Kwa, Howes and Lin, 2010). Groups such as these often form the backbone for the implementation of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG.

What is clear from this outline is that the Australian Government (as well as many other governments and organisations) sees HIV and AIDS as a significant development issue in PNG.

41 The Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria is a financing institute whose goals are to attract, manage and distribute resources to local experts and NGOs for the purpose of mitigating the effects of AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria in Third World countries. This means that it doesn’t implement anything on the ground itself. Instead it attracts funding from a variety of government and private sources and then makes these funds available to other institutions that will implement prevention strategies.
It is also evident that Australia still plays an important and continuing role in the PNG economy. This role gives it the ability to still influence the decision-making of the PNG Government. In the next section I describe the situation of HIV and AIDS to which these development agencies are responding.

**The Situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG**

The first reported case of HIV and AIDS in PNG was in 1987 (McBride, 2005, National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2005, Luker and Dinnen, 2010 a). This suggests PNG was one of the last countries in which HIV and AIDS was to spread. Yet after a slow start, by the mid-1990s it was clear that the HIV and AIDS infection rates were increasing in exponential proportions\(^{42}\) (McBride 2005).

HIV and AIDS infection rates were (and still are) highest in large urban centres. Port Moresby has by far the highest number of diagnosed HIV and AIDS cases, accounting for about 56 per cent of all those recorded\(^ {43}\). During the first decade of this century, Port Moresby, and Papua New Guinea in general, reported increasing rates of HIV and AIDS. In June 2005 there were 7023 reported cases of HIV and AIDS in the Port Moresby area and 12341 cases reported in Papua New Guinea as a whole (National Aids Council Secretariat and The Department of Health of PNG, 2005). This meant that PNG had the highest rate of HIV and AIDS in Melanesia, and that Port Moresby had the highest rate in PNG.

The majority of the cases are believed to have come from heterosexual sex, and PNG rates were considered to be at epidemic proportions (National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2005). For a disease to be officially classified as an epidemic it must be considered to infect more than 1 per cent of the general population, yet in PNG there was evidence that many sectors of the population experienced much higher levels. For example, data from STI clinics (treating general sexually transmitted infections) placed the rate of HIV as high as 19.9 per cent in Port Moresby

\(^{42}\) Note the use of an emotive term here. Exponential growth in a disease tends to evoke a fear of an uncontrollable rise in HIV and AIDS infections. Most infections disease rise exponentially at the start before the rate of infection tends to flatten out (Science & Health Education Partnership, 2013).

\(^{43}\) This statistic is in part a result of the larger number of reporting facilities in the Port Moresby area.
and 6.3 per cent in Mt Hagen (AusAID, 2006 b, McBride, 2005). In a country where data (albeit sketchy) suggest that the rate of STI infections could be around 50 per cent of the population, HIV and AIDS is considered to be a serious issue (Mgone, Passey, Anang et al, 2002 pg 265, Hammar, 2008).

The high STI rates are one reason for the increasingly high rates of HIV and AIDS in PNG. This is because STIs increase the likelihood of the transmission of HIV and AIDS due to sores etc (Mgone, Passey, Anang et al, 2002). In addition, condom use between casual partners is rare among PNG people, which is believed to be attributable to a number of social and economic factors (World Health Organisation and The National Aids Council-National Department of Health Papua New Guinea, 2000, Hammar, 2008). A number of studies conducted into the local cultural and socioeconomic reasons for PNG’s high rates of STIs and limited condom use (e.g. Hammar, 2004) have played a useful role in moving the approaches to, and understanding of, HIV and AIDS away from straight biomedical approaches to studies of HIV and AIDS in the context of PNG. In dealing with cultural and socioeconomic circumstances, these works have the potential to produce less racialized health research and approaches to HIV and AIDS in PNG. Yet we must be reflexive, as works such as these on the local cultural and socioeconomic circumstances have the potential Orientalise PNG people by presenting PNG cultures and social structures and circumstances as the cause for high rates of HIV, while not fully engaging with the potential for external (e.g. Western) powers to contribute to the situation.

Studies that have investigate the local/cultural reasons behind the spread of HIV and AIDS have suggested that a mismatch between Western approaches to HIV and AIDS prevention and PNG cultures might help to fuel the spread of HIV and AIDS. An example of the mismatch

44 A biomedical approach targets individuals for disease control either by reducing their exposure to agents of disease or by directly treating those adversely affected by their exposure. It therefore only investigates the exposure to known immediate causes and mechanisms of the illness (Ibrahim, Lorraine, Shy, & Farr, 1999). Many writers suggest that covertly racist practices are ingrained into the biomedical model as, by focusing on the individual, the importance of structural determinants like gender, poverty, and culture can be ignored (Nathan, 1980, Ibrahim et al, 1999, Humphery, Weeramanthri and Fitz, 2001). This flaw can be extremely detrimental in a place like PNG with hundreds of different cultures, gender issues, and high rates of poverty.
between Western biomedical approaches to HIV and AIDS prevention and local cultures, traditions and sexuality comes from the Tari community, which is a New Guinean ‘ethnic’ group located in the PNG highlands. Wardlow (2006) describes how women who members of the Tari community called “passenger women”45 have much more autonomy to say what they want and to go where they want than other women in the community. This independence, however, was often because other members of the community thought so disparagingly of the passenger women that they were not expected to follow Tari norms. The community and family were apparently a lot less likely to defend those who did not follow norms, and Wardlow (2006) notes that some in the community believed that the beatings and rapes (including pack rape) that could befall a passenger woman were justified forms of punishment.

Such ‘cultural’ practices (borne out of reinterpreted traditions, comprised of a mix of pre-colonial, colonial, Christian and postcolonial beliefs) add complexity when discussing and educating Tari people about HIV and AIDS. Thus the contention of a HIV and AIDS peer support educator who said HIV and AIDS was transmitted by girls writing love letters to boys in school46 was at least in part due to Tari morals, Wardlow (2006) argues, and reflects the tendency for Tari people to view HIV and AIDS through the lens of Tari morals and not through the (Western) lens of biomedical, microbial modes of transmission. Attempts to translate discussions of HIV and AIDS between Western biomedical approaches and Tari morals lends strength to the Tari belief that employing one’s reproductive energies or consuming another’s reproductive energy outside of Tari webs of generative relationality can result in corporal corruption and barrenness. The effects of this discussion may therefore be detrimental to Tari women’s agency and sexuality, particularly those in the community who have been classified as passenger women (Wardlow, 2002, 2006).

45 A term to describe women who exchange sex for money, goods or services (Wardlow, 2006).

46 Even though most would understand that this was a metaphor for sex, it does show a tendency to blame transmission on the women (Wardlow, 2006).
Lepani’s (2008, 2012) work in the Trobriand Islands\textsuperscript{47} depicts a vastly different form of culture, traditions, feminine agency and sexuality to that of the Tari as described by Wardlow (2006). As such, sociocultural relations to sex and HIV and AIDS are also very different. According to Lepani, all young Trobriand Islander men and women are encouraged to have a great deal of freedom and autonomy. The embodied identity construction of a young Trobriand person is largely patterned on mobility and exploration, on being attractive, pursuing desire, and testing out potential marriage partners for compatibility. Young women express confidence in their sexual autonomy and exercise the right to reject the advances of suitors they find undesirable (Lepani, 2008 pg 254). Yet these actions are undertaken within well-defined social and cultural boundaries. For example, sexual relations within one’s own clan are forbidden, partly because sex is seen as a mutual exchange between clans, and young people go to great lengths to hide their sexual relations from the public and from cross sex siblings.

According to Lepani (2008, 2012), Trobriand Islanders internalise the knowledge of the standardised HIV and AIDS awareness campaigns in a very different way to the Tari or to the Western biomedical approach that informs these campaigns. For example, there is a general acceptance and use of terms like “sex” in discussing HIV and AIDS, and reflection on what it means to them and their culture. However, many now are beginning to feel torn by the fact that the biomedical approach comes across as a morally inflected discourse that frames sexual practices in terms of risk, promiscuity and fear. In contrast, these sexual practices are culturally valued, experienced as life affirming, consensual and pleasurable acts that build and reinforce important social relations. As such, standardised HIV and AIDS awareness campaigns can either be detrimental to Trobriand Islander sense of self and identity or, conversely, be ignored and rejected for not being framed in terms of Trobriand Islander values or culture.

\textsuperscript{47} The Trobriand Islands has a long history of being Orientalised. Colonial administrators and Christian missionaries often talked in ‘disgusted’ terms about the sexual freedoms of the Trobriand Islanders and the propensity for this to spread disease. In the early 20\textsuperscript{th} century, with the work of Malinowski (1929), it became popular to view these islands through the lens of Primitivism in many Western societies. Popular retellings of Malinowski’s work (more than the work itself) meant that, in the eyes of many Westerners, the Trobriands was an idealised place of desire and love (Lepani, 2008).
Thus the works of both Lepani (2012, 2008) and Wardlow (2002, 2006) illustrate situations where HIV and AIDS may have been spread because awareness and methods of prevention are standardised to a Western biomedical perspective that does not fit with the vast array of PNG cultures.

Another reason for the increasingly high rates of HIV/AIDS in PNG is the country’s reliance on natural resource exploitation, which has encouraged workers into migratory work, especially in mining. Usually the spouses and the families of workers cannot travel with them to the work site. Separations from family increase the risk that one of the partners (the male partner is the dominant pattern) acquires the HIV virus while away and infects their spouse when they return home (Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997, Haour-Knipe, Leshabari and Wihula, 2002, National Catholic Family Life and the Melanesian Institute, 2007).

High crime rates, particularly sex crimes, have been associated with increased risk and transmission of HIV and AIDS (Benatar, 2004, Human Rights Watch, 2005). Thus, many academics experienced in PNG HIV and AIDS research consider crime to be a contributing factor to the increasing HIV and AIDS rate in PNG. They have noted that there seems to be a vicious cycles between the ‘law and order’ problem and HIV and AIDS. Several such works collected in the anthology “Civic Insecurity: Law, Order and HIV in Papua New Guinea” (Luker and Dinnen, 2010 b) point to structural links between crimes and the spread of HIV which involve a wide range of factors, including gender relations, masculinities, laws governing sexual relations and prostitution, and the strength (or lack thereof) of the state to enforce or regulate laws. Several chapters in this collection suggest high levels of rape and sexual abuse, domestic violence, and multiple sexual partners have contributed to HIV’s spread (Luker and Dinnen, 2010 a pg 17). Hammar (e.g. Hammar, 2008) has described how entrenched gender violence within marriage is an important contributor to the spread of HIV, and has criticised state-based approaches to HIV and AIDS prevention as being too reliant on women being able to choose to abstain from sex or to be with faithful partners. More broadly, Banks (2000) 48 claims that

48 This work comes from volume edited by Dinnen and Ley (2000) called “Reflections on Violence in Melanesia” in which a number of other articles explore or refer to the roles that violence plays in Melanesian societies including PNG.
reflecting on and dealing with socio-cultural roles of violence within PNG societies is an important and often ignored approach to many contemporary problems in PNG, including HIV and AIDS.

Not surprisingly, it has been projected that the future economic impact of the HIV/AIDS epidemic could be devastating for PNG households and the national economy.

These projected impacts of HIV and AIDS were a concern for AusAID, which responded with the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP) to help combat this disease. The project was multi-sectorial, providing support for policy implementation to a large range of government and non-state sectors. Considering the project’s size and the range of actions, its policies had a major effect on shaping the strategic direction of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG over its lifetime (AusAid, 2006 b). The next section will describe the NHASP.

**National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP)**

NHASP ran between 2000 and 2006, and was the primary source of funding for AIDS development research and development work in PNG during this time (AusAID, 2006, AusAID, 2006 b). Its budget of $66.5 million was around 86 per cent of all HIV and AIDS development funding to PNG over that period. This meant that AusAid had a lot of (financial) control over the types of HIV and AIDS projects undertaken in PNG. Other international donor organisations often took advice from AusAID on where to deploy resources (Personal communication with AusAID advisor 22 Feb 2010).

According to AusAID documents (AusAID, 2006 b, PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002)) the NHASP consisted of 6 components. These were:

Component 1 - Education, Information and Advocacy. The objective of this strategy was to promote behavioural change to reduce the impact of STIs and HIV and AIDS in PNG (National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2006, PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). This component received 39 per cent of the entire funding. It aimed to achieve its objective by

---

49 The other 14 per cent of funding came from the PNG Government (10 per cent) and other donors (4 per cent).
working with government agencies, NGOs, churches and the private sector at the national, provincial and local level, to develop and implement training programs in the delivery of HIV/AIDS awareness, education and advocacy programs. It provided a great deal of technical assistance and grants for prevention work, such as workplace HIV/AIDS and STI awareness and prevention programs, peer education programs and a condom social marketing campaign (PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). This component will be discussed more below.

Component 2 - Counselling, Community Care and Support. This component received 11 per cent of all project funding, and tried to create pre- and post-HIV test counselling as well as home-based care to respect kinship relations and reduce stress on hospitals (AusAID, 2002). It was argued that as awareness increased (due to Component 1) there would be a greater demand for voluntary counselling and HIV testing. This component of the program would thus help deal with the demand, as well as provide ‘trustworthy’ and confidential information sources about HIV and safe sex. This was important because HIV and safe sex were sometimes considered taboo subjects in PNG cultures (Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, 2005). The 2005 review of this component boasted some success with the training of a number of counsellors and the establishment of a National HIV counselling network. However, this component only provided benefits to core people in the network, and many counsellors were left under-supported. The home- and community based care strategy was also less successful, with very little done to relieve the stress on the hospital system (AusAID, 2005).

Component 3 - Policy, Legal and Ethical Issues. This component received 2.2 per cent of funding, and was to enable policy and legal change to create non-discriminatory environments for People Living with HIV/AIDS (PLHA) or people otherwise affected by HIV/AIDS. The work was to be done through provincial and local government structures (AusAID, 2002). The goal was revised to focus on strengthening the capacity of the National AIDS Council Secretariat (NACS) and other government and private sector agencies, to facilitate the development of relevant policies and enabling legislation regarding HIV/AIDS and STI prevention and care (AusAid, 2005). Some of the successes of this component were the facilitation of workshops to

50 Through PNG’s National AIDS Council Secretariat (NACS). NACS is the main Papua New Guinean government body that co-ordinates HIV and AIDS development work in PNG.
help the National AIDS Council\textsuperscript{51} (NAC) disseminate information to business and the media about the laws, and about ethics, stigma and discrimination in the workplace. The involvement of the media was claimed to have led to significant improvement in the promotion of human rights issues in the workplace, but paucity of information and material in the provincial areas was recognised (AusAID, 2005).

Component 4 - Monitoring, Surveillance and Evaluation. This part of the project aimed to get data on HIV/AIDS prevalence and trends, and received 7.8 per cent of the NHASP funding. The surveillance was on sexually transmitted infections (not specifically on HIV and AIDS) and involved the National Department of Health and the PNG National Reference Laboratory (AusAID, 2002). Surveillance was seen as providing essential data to understand the trends of infection and behavioural change, and a crucial basis for developing national (prevention) programs and policy responses (National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2006; PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). According to AusAID’s independent review (2006 a), some progress was made with surveillance methods over the course of the NHASP, but significant gaps in testing, data collection and collation and IT support meant that, overall, surveillance in PNG was weak.

Component 5 - Clinical Services and Laboratory Strengthening. The objective of this component was to improve the quality and delivery of STIs and HIV/AIDS services through enhanced diagnosis, clinical management, and community care (AusAID, 2005). The component was considered important because one of the main ways to reduce transmission of HIV was seen to be the prevention and early management of other STIs (PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). Various mechanisms were pursued, including working with the National Department of Health and the Central Public Health Laboratory to improve management of STI and HIV/AIDS health service policies, upgrading physical facilities for services and laboratories in the provinces, training health staff and ensuring regular supplies of drugs and condoms (PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). STI clinics were to provide clinical leadership in a wide range of activities such as counselling, prevention, testing, screening, HIV monitoring and professional development. They were to be a link between

\textsuperscript{51} Note this is slightly different to the NACS. The NACS is the Secretariat for NAC.
home-based care and hospital care that could save hospital resources (AusAID, 2005, PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). At the end of the project, clinical facilities had not been expanded and upgraded as proposed, but clinical training and treatment protocols were improved (AusAID, 2005).

Component 6 - Support to the National AIDS Council Secretariat. AusAID used 7.7 per cent of the project funding to help PNG’s National AIDS Council (NAC) implement their national program regarding HIV and AIDS, called the Medium Term Plan (MTP) (Government of Papua New Guinea and United Nations, 1998). This was seen to have helped with the MTP’s goals of creating more leadership on HIV and AIDS issues and increasing the profile for HIV in PNG. However, there was limited achievement in creating a multi-sector response, and tensions were caused by the NAC being vested with a political authority, while the NHASP had all the financial power (AusAID, 2005).

Component 1, it would seem from these documents, was the priority of the NHASP, as it received the most funding (39 per cent of total budget), and many of the other components, at least in part, served to strengthen, monitor and assist Component 1 (Australian Agency for International Development, 2006 b, National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2006, PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002). For instance the PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project (2002) states Component 2 (counselling and care) is useful because:

As the level of awareness of HIV/AIDS increases, there will be an increased demand for voluntary HIV testing and counselling services. Pre- and post-test counselling will be important for addressing issues associated with living with HIV/AIDS as well as providing a confidential information source on HIV/AIDS and safe sex (PNG National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002)

As another example, the 2006 Evaluation of the Project (AusAID, 2006) states that much of Component 4 (monitoring and surveillance) was to monitor behavioural changes (due to education, information and advocacy) in the community.

Thus Component 1 – education, information and advocacy – has flow-on effects to all other aspects of the project. Component 1 was also the area in which all development workers that I interviewed had experience. For these reasons, I will now concentrate on explaining this aspect of the response to HIV and AIDS in PNG.
The education, information and advocacy activities of NHASP depended on linkages with the NAC (National Aids Council), government agencies, NGOs, churches and the private sector at the national, provincial and local level (AusAID, 2002). These linked groups (which often received financial support from AusAID) would conduct the awareness-raising on the ground, and produce much of the supporting materials. The groups also played a vital role in distributing the materials through the NHASP resource centre (National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2006). One of the main producers of physical campaign materials (like teaching aids, billboards, advertisements in newspapers, etc) was the NACS. It is important to note, however, that AusAID did put checks in place to ensure that the material produced was deemed appropriate and correct (AusAID, 2007).

One contribution of the education and information component was the installation of 10,000 small, and 500 large, condom dispensers (AusAID, 2007). This component was also seen to make significant contribution by getting church leaders more involved, and there was evidence of generally raised HIV awareness in PNG covering the five-year period of NHASP (AusAID, 2005).

However, the paramount objective of the education, information and advocacy component of the NHASP was to initiate behavioural change (National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2006). In fact, documents suggest that AusAID saw positive behavioural change as a ‘premiere outcome’ for this or any HIV and AIDS campaign (AusAID, 2006 b). There was, however, very little evidence at the end of the project to suggest that any significant behavioural change had occurred even though awareness was raised (AusAID, 2006 b). This lack of response was a contributing factor in the recommendation by AusAID staff and advisors to put more emphasis on behavioural change in future HIV and AIDS development campaigns in PNG (AusAID, 2006 b, National HIV and AIDS Support Project, 2006). In the next section I will critically assess the behavioural response undertaken by AusAID.

**NHASP Behavioural Change Approach to HIV and AIDS**

The NHASP approach to education, information and advocacy tended to follow the commonly used ABC approach to HIV and AIDS prevention. This approach relies on a diverse array of strategies and programs to change a targeted group’s sexual behaviour. The name of the approach stems from its primary objective, which is to encourage abstinence from sex until marriage (A for ‘abstinence’), being faithful to one partner who is faithful to you (B for ‘be
faithful'), and correct and consistent condom use in the event that one is not abstaining or keeping the faith (C for ‘condom’). ABC is a standard approach to HIV and AIDS prevention in many developing countries (Avert, 2011, U.S. Presidents Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief, 2012) and is a generic name for a whole raft of different strategies whose ultimate goal is to get individuals to do one of A, B, or C to protect themselves against AIDS.

According to AusAID (2005), the NHASP Component 1 relied heavily on ABC prevention strategies, and across all components there was a reliance on prevention methods in general (but particularly the ABC prevention method). Prevention strategies in use in PNG at the time included: community education and awareness, mass media strategies, condom distribution, voluntary counselling and (HIV) testing and treatment of sexually transmitted infection52. Therefore most prevention strategies available had, at least in part, a section to teach an ABC approach53.

The ABC approach is the most globally common HIV and AIDS prevention approach in use, particularly at the time of the NHASP (Avert, 2011, U.S. Presidents Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief, 2012). So NHASP was consistent with global trends. NHASP use of the ABC approach was also consistent with approaches taken by the PNG Government and the NAC, who at the time were also committed to prevention campaigns (National HIV and AIDS Support Project 2006, Government of Papua New Guinea and United Nations, 1998).

There has been some evidence, not always consistent, of effective ABC prevention campaigns. Most notable of these were campaigns in Uganda (arguably where the ABC approach originated) and Thailand (Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997). Yet there is much theoretical and

52 This counts as a prevention method because removing STIs reduces the chances that HIV and AIDS will spread to another person. Also, when someone arrives for treatment an opportunity is provided to inform a ‘high risk’ individual about how to avoid catching/spreading HIV or other STIs through the ABC method.

53 There was the occasional prevention strategy like the prevention of mother-child transmission that did not follow the ABC approach. Later on in the NHASP there was also some dispensing of Anti-Retroviral drugs.
empirical evidence, coming from both within PNG and around the world, to cast doubt on the privileging of ABC prevention approaches.

In fact there is now a large body of empirical works that critique the ABC prevention approach (Butt and Eves, 2008, Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997, Faria, 2008). The main criticism to come out of these works is that the ABC behavioural approach overlooks ‘cross-cutting’ issues (Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997). These are the social, economic, gender and cultural issues that affect the ability of an individual to change their behaviour (UNAIDS, 2010). In general, an ABC approach like that used in PNG asks each individual to manage their own risks in contracting HIV and AIDS. These approaches put little or no focus on the social, cultural or economic realities in which individuals find themselves (Eves, 2006).

For example, Dworkin and Ehrhardt (1997) cite evidence that gender inequalities, economic realities and changes, and migration can erode the long-term benefits of an ABC approach. In one example they showed how, after initially working well in Thailand, the ABC approach became less effective because of an economic downturn. When the economy was stronger, many Thai prostitutes did not need to take the risks with a client who refused, or would pay more, to have sex without a condom. In the downturn, however, a number of these women faced economic pressures and couldn’t so easily refuse a client who would not wear a condom (Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997). As such Dworkin and Ehrhardt claim that approaches that emphasise the generation of alternative incomes could be more beneficial than ABC.

In her book, Elizabeth Pisani (2008) mentions a number of gender and sexuality issues that can impact on the effectiveness of the ABC method, even rendering it ineffective in certain situations. Pasani and others (UNAIDS, 2010) observe that societal constraints can reduce the choices and autonomy of women. One example given was that many women are physically unable to refuse a husband that they suspect has been unfaithful. Therefore campaigns that spent more time in trying to improve gender equality in countries may have had more beneficial effects (Dworkin and Ehrhardt, 1997).

Such deficiencies in ABC behavioural approaches have led some to claim that HIV and AIDS development strategies often ignore or reinforce social, economic, or gender inequalities in Third World countries (Benatar, 2002, Paluzzi and Farmer, 2005, Eves, 2006, Faria, 2008). Others have linked behavioural change strategies to the global process of Western racism and racialisation (Farmer, 2006, Stillwaggon, 2003, Jones, 2004, Briggs, 2005, Faria, 2008). For
example, Jones (2004) analysed the discourse of two major Western aid donors in Africa to assess how they justified a behavioural approach over providing Anti Retroviral Therapy (ART)\textsuperscript{54} to Africans living with HIV and AIDS. What emerged was that there seemed to be several racialised judgments used to justify these approaches. These were: that Africa was too poor, too unsophisticated, too corrupt, and too oversexed for ART to be effective.

There was some recognition by the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP) that the ABC approaches alone do not effectively deal with the cross-cutting issues. The NHASP tried to incorporate the three cross-cutting issues of (i) youth, (ii) gender and (iii) people living with HIV and AIDS (PLWHA) into its design. Yet NHASP review documents suggest that gender and PLWHA were not given priority through much of the campaign, and only began to be raised as important when weaknesses of the campaign became evident (National HIV and AIDS Support Project 2006). NHASP’s (2006) evaluation also seems to suggest that for several years the campaign tended to focus on the ‘softer’ issues of abstinence and fidelity over the ‘harder’ issues of condom use. NHASP (2006) claims this was in part because of critical feedback from members of the PNG public, and others, around condom use. This would essentially focus the program on abstinence-based approaches rather than condom-based approaches.

Another major criticism of privileging an ABC approach (particularly to the extent that the NHASP does) is the consequent under-utilisation of alternative approaches which could provide potential benefits. One approach that was significantly under-utilised was the funding and support of Anti Retroviral Therapy (ART) in PNG (Carman and O’Connor, 2004). Funding of ARTs can be very useful as a strategy in curbing the spread of the virus, not only because those infected can’t transmit the virus as easily, but also because they become an avenue by which their communities’ consciousness about HIV and AIDS is raised (Center for Advancing Health, 2011). Also, according to Farmer and Kim (2006, 2003), Jones (2004) and Faria (2008), providing ARTs can be an important development tool because they increase the amount of time that an infected person can be a productive member of the society and care for their

\textsuperscript{54} ART is the generic name for the drugs given to those infected with HIV. Although they cannot cure the virus the drugs reduce the amount of viruses in the blood stream. This significantly curbs the amount of damage that the virus does to the host body and greatly reduces the chance that the host will infect another person with the virus (Health, 2012). The under-utilisation of ART is discussed further, below.
families. In addition, some have reported that the flow on effect of these benefits is a reduction in the amount of stigma and fear that is directed at PLWHA from their community's members (Benatar, 2004). This is arguably, in the long term, more beneficial economically, socially and politically, than a heavy focus on prevention through behavioural change.

It should be noted that in 2004, toward the end of the NHASP, ART became available in PNG (TREAT Asia, 2012). Port Moresby General Hospital was one of the first places in PNG to provide this service. Even now, Port Moresby General Hospital is one of only a few facilities in the country equipped to treat HIV/AIDS (TREAT Asia, 2012). So, at the end of the project there were very few places that offered the therapy, and then only with first-wave drugs (NASHP, 2006, Hauquist, Usurup, Tinkena and Selve, 2007, TREAT Asia, 2012).

NHASP also under-utilised mainstream epidemiological/public health approaches. These approaches focus on the host factors such as poverty that are critical in preventing increased transmission of the disease (Page, Cole and Timmreck, 1995, Stillwaggon, 2003). People who live in poverty are much more likely to have compromised immune systems and, like other infectious viruses, HIV can spread more easily to them (Stillwaggon, 2003). Public health approaches therefore consider and ‘treat’ all the factors that might be causing the transmission of HIV and not just those related to sexual contacts and sexual behaviour. In other words, a more holistic approach can be taken to HIV and AIDS. Yet, as quoted earlier, between 2000 and 2006, AusAID spent only $7 million on improving the general healthcare in PNG while $66.5 million was spent on the National HIV and AIDS Support Project.

3.5 Conclusion

In this chapter I first described the context in which HIV and AIDS development work is undertaken in PNG. I started by giving a general country description of PNG. What this country description suggested was that PNG is highly ecologically and culturally diverse. The country

55 Host factors are intrinsic factors that influence a person's or a community's exposure, response, or susceptibility to infectious microorganisms. Behaviour is just one of many host factors that influence the exposure, response and susceptibility to a virus. Others include socio-economic status, poverty, age and climate (Page et al, 1995).
also has an abundance of natural resources that are of interest to a number of resource-extracting companies and are therefore very important to the country’s formal economy. From a mainstream development perspective, however, PNG is seen to be greatly affected by a number of social and economic problems, which adversely affects many of its peoples and environments. Problems listed included lack of sanitation, high crime rates, high (formal) unemployment, etc. Yet I also asked readers to be reflexive of the fact that ‘First World’ powers and Orientalisms have also played a role in representing PNG. Many of those who produced these representations play important roles in PNG’s development process, therefore one must be particularly reflexive of how the mainstream development process can represent PNG in such a bleak light. Thus is particularly so in the light of many PNG communities’ efforts to work to support one another, foster hope and undertake actions and negotiations in attempts to bring about a more self-determined future.

It would appear that some of these practices to represent PNG so bleakly have their origins in colonialism, where ideas about tropical medicine helped to produce a way of thinking among Australian colonists which represented the people of PNG as doomed. This meant that PNG people where often ignored and viewed as incapable of surviving, let alone determining their future, when faced with modernity. This time period also marks the start of a period in which the Australian Government began to see itself as being the power that would develop PNG and its peoples. Australia’s definition of development took precedence over all other definitions of development and Australia’s strategies for development were not discussed with the peoples of PNG, but presented to them for endorsement only.

These attempts to influence how PNG develops are likely to be present in Australia’s post colonial development practices. Through development aid, Australia has the ability to influence some of the choices that the PNG Government and its people have in how to develop their country. HIV and AIDS development is one area that Australia sees as vital in the development of PNG. It would seem that Australia’s interest in this disease is having a big influence on how the PNG health system is developed. HIV and AIDS appear to be taking precedence over all other diseases. Justification for such approaches comes from research that can represent PNG as being in the middle of an HIV and AIDS crisis, one which many in the mainstream development sector fear will bring about economic and social collapse.

Logically, if Australia (through AusAID) can influence health development to focus on HIV and AIDS it can have an even stronger influence on the types of HIV and AIDS development
undertaken. AusAID chose to focus on education and awareness through an ABC approach. This approach, although consistent with many mainstream policy ideas of effective projects, did little to address cross-cutting issues and neglected other approaches that might have been more effective. This weakness in the NHASP may in part be a result of racialised/Orientalised ideas about people from the ‘Third World.’ In the next chapter I will describe the methods used to investigate these issues.

Chapter 4: Method

4.1 Introduction

In Chapter 1 I set out the three points of argument that I wished to make in this thesis. The first point is that all aspects of development work are emotional. The second point was that the emotionality of development work can cause the reproduction of Orientalisms in development policy, practice and research. Thirdly, I said emotions are not wholly negative forces in development work, as they are also important in creating resistances to Orientalisms.

In this chapter I wish to discuss the methods used to argue these points. I will first give some background to my choice of methods by describing how others have looked at emotions in the past, and how that influenced my choice of methods. The main body of this chapter will then describe these methods, which generally fall under the banner of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA).

As stated in Chapter 1, I’m interested in investigating development research, development policy and development practices. Each of these three is an aspect of development (i.e. the same social practice) but they have their own ways of doing and representing development and development practice (Griffiths, Connor, Robertson and Phelan, 2013). The main body of this chapter is therefore divided into three sections corresponding to these three aspects of the development process. I have included a summary table at the end of this section, to help summarise these different approaches.

In the first of these sections I describe the methods used to investigate the emotionality (and its corresponding effects on Orientalisms and their resistances) of development research in PNG. I describe the data selection process and, briefly, the documents chosen for analysis. I then describe the analysis process. This analysis was a form of critical discourse analysis that
used linguistic pragmatics in order to uncover Orientalist assumptions embedded in research and link them to discourses of emotionality (Fairclough, 2003, Knoppers and Anthonissen, 2008).

In the second of these sections I describe the approach to CDA that was applied to policy documents. Again, I describe how and why the policy documents were selected. Next I describe the particular CDA approach used in this section, which was a linguistic analysis of the vocabulary and sentences used in the documents.

In the final section I describe the method applied to the policy implementation (or on-the-ground experience) side of the development process. I describe data collection from a free written journal of my time working in a PNG HIV and AIDS development program and from interviews with Western development workers who had worked in HIV/AIDS in PNG. In this section I apply a combination of qualitative content analysis and critical discourse analysis. This approach was taken, in part, to further explore the idea that new and powerful methods could be forged by combining content analysis with discourse analysis (Hardy, Harley and Phillips, 2004, Herrera and Braumoeller, 2004). I argue that the themes revealed in text through a qualitative content analysis function the same way that linguistic features function in texts. As such, themes revealed in a quantitative content analysis can also be subject to a critical discourse analysis. Therefore this section describes how I first applied a qualitative content analysis and then subjected the findings of this analysis to a critical discourse analysis.

I conclude this chapter by summarising the key points of each of the three methods sections, and why I felt it appropriate to use different approaches for the different types of data present in this thesis.

Table 1 summarises how the research suite is applied in the following chapters, in terms of the aspect of development investigated, the variant of CDA applied, and the data sources used. In the next chapter I will demonstrate the effectiveness of these methods in eliciting covert emotions and Orientalisms from research documents and knowledge claims.

Table 1: How my suite of research methods is applied in this thesis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Aspect of Development</th>
<th>CDA Method</th>
<th>Data source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Five</td>
<td>Development research</td>
<td>Linguistic pragmatics</td>
<td>Development research documents</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 Background to the Methods

Many Emotional Geographers use what I would call, in a broad sense, a critical discourse analysis approach (for example Pain, 2009, Wright, 2009, 2012). By this I mean these works start with a particular social issue or problem and then analyse texts and other social interactions from a (variety of) critical theoretical perspectives, in order to show the social meaning/signifiers (i.e. discourse) within these texts. These discourses can often be obscured without such critical perspectives. Upon revealing these discourses, CDA (in this broad sense) reveals the relationship between the discourse espoused in texts and interactions and other broader social process/problems, such as institutional forms of racism (Fairclough, 2001). Yet few have ever approached the topic with a specific look at the linguistic features of text, which my method entails. That is why this section, after explaining some of the works of Emotional Geographers that have influenced my methods, describes the theoretical background to the CDA approach used in this thesis and then explains why it is good for investigating the Emotional Geographies of development.

One of the first works of significant influence on my research was Ahmed’s (2004a) “The Cultural Politics of Emotion.” She described her approach as a close reading of texts, with a concern in particular with metonymy and metaphor, and examined how different figures of speech get stuck together to produce an emotionality of texts. There are strong resonances between this approach and CDA, as both use textual features as a way of analysing meaning from text. Unlike my work, Ahmed’s (2004a) argument, and ways of assessing what she found, drew much more on Marxism, psychoanalysis and to a lesser extent, phenomenology, than my critical discourse analysis does.
In fact, psychoanalysis and phenomenology were some of the most common ways in which Emotional Geographers assessed emotions. For example Sibley (1995) used psychoanalytical concepts, particularly around what is included or excluded from the self, to deconstruct some sources of cultural stereotyping found in Western countries. Data sources analysed by Sibley (1995) include photographs and advertising paraphernalia. Examples of phenomenological methods can be seen in the work of Haldrup, Koefoed, and Simonsen (2006) where in-depth interviews were used to assess the phenomena of sensory experience of Danish encounters with the Oriental. Using the self-reported sensory experiences of their interviewees with things such as smell of Middle Eastern food or the sight of the hijab, these researchers analysed how (some) Danes felt towards their immigrant neighbours. Through this method they show how interactions with the Other have emotions attached to them through banal practices of everyday life that help to reinforce Orientalisms.

While neither of these works—nor many others taking similar approaches—mention critical discourse analysis, their overall goal holds true to what CDA methods are trying to achieve. That common goal is to assess how language and/or semiosis interconnect with other elements of social life, and particularly how they interconnect in the production of, and resistances to, unequal power relations (Fairclough, 2001). Hence my CDA approach has the potential to produce beneficial methods for exploring issues that are important to Emotional Geographers. In addition, because of the dominance of psychoanalytical or phenomenological approaches to research in Emotional Geography, I believe such approaches have influenced some of the ways I describe assessments of emotions and Orientalisms in my results.

While CDA has begun to influence the methods used by Emotional Geographers in recent years, for the most part it has yet to be acknowledged as the primary research method. For example, there was evidence of the influence of CDA on Spencer and Walby’s (2013) method in which they undertook a qualitative content analysis of semi structured interviews with scientists. Spencer and Walby (2013 pg 57) transcribed these interviews according to a set of themes related to work, group conflict and emotions. Yet CDA perspectives and their data made them aware that statements do not necessarily fit into only one category and that there is blended meaning often inherent in a statement. To help overcome this, their method involved open coding of interview statements. DiEnno and Thompason (2013) also used a similar method where content analysis was influenced by critical discourse analysis to investigate how emotions motivate ecological restoration volunteerism. Such works lend strength to my idea that a greater amalgamation of CDA and content analysis is possible.
Another important influence from Emotional Geography research has been the use of autobiographical data to analyse emotional realities (Anderson and Smith, 2001, Jones, 2007). For example, Laurendeau (2013) uses autoethnographies to consider the emotionality of sustaining and exacerbating an athletic injury, and the way that such emotionality is connected to concepts of masculinities. Further, Janis (2006) analyses his memories to gain an assessment of the limitations on how much one can be truly self-reflexive.

The use and understanding of self-reflexive methods also plays an important role in this thesis. Through self-reflexive methods, I am less likely to produce a binary in which my research (and how I know the world) is represented as free of the process of power and resistance that shape the ways of knowing others (Finlay, 2002, Kapoor, 2004, English and Irving, 2008). It is important to note that part of the CDA method is for the writer to reflect on where they are coming from, and how they are socially positioned (Fairclough, 2003). But although this is mentioned as an aspect of CDA it is often underplayed. For this reason, this thesis will take a somewhat unusual reflexive approach to autobiographical data and experiences, using it to not only produce data but also to shape research methods. Adapting self-reflexive methods like this to my research is thus in keeping with a CDA approach but, in some respects, adding to the method in practice.

Autobiographical methods often go against traditional methods of social research, and have subsequently been criticised by some as being self-indulgent and/or not methodologically sound (Moore-Gilber 1997, Monaco, 2010). In response to such claims, there are now a number of researchers championing the use of autobiographical techniques, as they can produce reflexive methods and methodologies that can both reveal and resist hegemonies like Orientalisms (Monaco, 2010, Pillow, 2003, Kapoor, 2004). This is because the techniques allow for the observation of an Other with self-conscious awareness and self-scrutiny of one’s role in this process (Chiseri-Strater, 1996, Pillow, 2003). This is partly because self-reflexive approaches make explicit, rather than implicit, the ways in which locations of identity and emotional registers inform research choices (Monaco, 2010 pg 1).

I will now explain the theoretical background to my version of CDA in more detail.

**Background to the CDA Approach Used in this Thesis**

The two primary functions of the critical discourse analysis method are to expose the machinations of cultural hegemony (like Orientalisms), and to highlight the discourses that
resist hegemony (Fairclough, 2003, Griffiths, Connor, Robertson et al, 2013). In addition, CDA is interested in how social practices (such as development work), can articulate discourse together with other non-discourse social elements (Fairclough, 2003). Thus CDA is a useful tool for studying how emotions get articulated through the social practice of development.

The core of the approach to CDA that I use is the idea that cultural hegemony is enacted through the “orders of discourse” found within relatively stable social practices\(^56\) (Fairclough, 2003, Griffiths, Connor, Robertson et al, 2013)\(^57\). Orders of discourse are the discursive signifiers of how cultural hegemony can be sustained (or resisted) by a network of alliances between social forces and the internalisation of beliefs by social groups. It is through this network of alliances and internalised beliefs that a social practice is formed (Fairclough, 2003, Fairclough, 2001, Griffiths, Connor, Robertson et al, 2013). The discursive signifiers of these social practices are often referred to as genres (ways of acting), discourses\(^58\) (ways of representing) and styles (ways of being). The ways that genres, discourses and styles are networked, ordered and interlinked form an order of discourse. Therefore orders of discourses are the social structuring of semiotic difference—a social ordering of the way of making meaning (Fairclough, 2003, Fairclough, 2001, Griffiths, Connor, Robertson et al., 2013). It is therefore an objective of this thesis to look at the orders of discourse in the social practice of development and to discuss how this can reproduce forms of cultural hegemony.

Underlying the approach to critical discourse analysis used in this thesis is the belief that language is controlled through social practices, and thus social and political domination is reproduced and represented in the linguistic structures of text and talk (Fairclough, 2003).

\(^{56}\) Social practices are the articulation of different types of social elements which are associated with particular areas of social life. They articulate discourse (hence language) together with other social elements like emotions, attitudes and past histories (Fairclough, 2003 pg 25).

\(^{57}\) Social practices are the articulation of different types of social elements which are associated with particular areas of social life. They articulate discourse (hence language) together with other social elements like emotions, attitudes and past histories (Fairclough, 2003 pg 25).

\(^{58}\) Note: discourse is used here in a more limited way than it is used in the term “critical discourse analysis.”
Therefore critical discourse analysis can highlight how economic, gendered and racial power relations are reinforced and reproduced through language and across scale (Faria, 2008). Critical discourse analysis considers the larger discursive context or the meaning that lies beyond the lexical and grammatical structure of texts. These include consideration of the political, and even the economic, context of language usage and production (Faria, 2008, Fairclough, 2003, Griffiths, Connor, Robertson et al, 2013). As Orientalisms are a form of racial and political hegemony, then it stands to reason that CDA would be a valuable tool for exposing its presence within development text and talk.

CDA combines three separate forms of analysis onto one. These are the analysis of language texts, analysis of discourse practice (processes of text production, distribution and consumption) and analysis of discursive events as instances of socio-cultural practice (Fairclough, 2003, Faria, 2008, Van Dijk, 1997). Emotionality is often embedded in texts (Ahmed, 2004 b). Therefore an approach like CDA that deeply analyses the texts themselves, is particularly useful in analysing emotions in policy and research documents. It can show how emotions exist (and are directed towards certain objects) through grammatical and lexical structures rather than being reliant on looking for directly emotive words like happy, sad etc, which would not be used in most mainstream research and policy documents. Through analysing discourse in this way, a researcher can uncover the emotional response that policy and research documents may wish to elicit covertly, through grammatical functions. It also means that where emotions are less evident, attention to wider context can help guide interpretation.

Now I will describe the research methods that I used investigate four core areas of development. These were development research, development policy, the implementation of development work and the interaction between policy and implementation. I will first begin by describing the policy research methods.
4.3 Analysis of Development Research

This section describes the selection and analysis of development research documents. I chose to study a select group of important research documents because they had the potential to influence the contexts under which policy and practice occur (Said, 1993a, Davis and Howden-Chapman, 1996, Young, 2008, AusAID, 2012b, Said, 1985). For example, Said (Said, 1985, Said, 2003) claimed that it is the academic study conducted by specific researchers/experts that justified the creation of hegemonic policy direction (and therefore created policy documents) that aimed to strengthen US control over areas in the Middle East. Therefore, notions of expertise and academic research are an important aspect of the development process.

However, some academic writers and academic fields are listened to by mainstream development agencies and workers more than others (Broughton, 1999, Said, 2003). I have therefore chosen to focus my analysis on some of the research and researchers that mainstream development agencies have claimed (either directly or indirectly) to have a strong influence on policy direction.

The remainder of this section will discuss how I chose documents for analysis. It will discuss: the documents I selected; and the analysis techniques I used to elicit evidence of emotions and elicit evidence of Orientalisms within research documents, and their resistance. The analysis relied heavily on the use of pragmatics, which will also be discussed.

Document Selection

Selection of research documents for analysis started out as general reading for my thesis. To help contextualise and understand the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG, I read documents written by academics, development donors and NGOs about HIV and AIDS in PNG. Also as a way of contextualising my understanding of the case study, I had a number of conversations with academics who studied relevant issues. In several of these personal conversations it was recommended to me to read research on the website HIVpolicy.org.

There is some debate around the effectiveness of research to impact on development policy and practice.
HIVpolicy.org is a web database set up by a consortium (that includes several universities, research facilities and AusAID) for the easy access and storage of works that drive HIV and AIDS policy in the Pacific. As such, these articles could be seen as typical of the research that informs HIV and AIDS policy in PNG.

HIV policy.org became one of two main sources of documents that were selected for analysis. The other main source of documents came from the 2007 National Research Workshop, which was funded by the AusAID/National AIDS Council of PNG (NAC). Participants at this conference received a CD that contained many of the speakers’ talks, as well as exemplar papers and documents selected by the conference organisers. I deemed papers and talks from this conference important because its funders were the primary donors to PNG HIV and AIDS development work. In addition, the conference took place at the end of the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP: see Chapter 3) and it was positioned as an opportunity to sum-up and share what was learnt about PNG HIV and AIDS over the time of the NHASP. The talks on this CD formed the largest supply of conference talks that were analysed.

In general I chose to focus on articles written in the period prior to, and up to one year after, the NHASP because it would keep the knowledge claims contextualised to the experiences of the development workers that I interviewed, and to the timeframe in which the policies that I analysed were produced. In all, over 50 talks, articles and reports were chosen for analysis, primarily from these two sites. Most were only subject to a preliminary form of analysis. By this, I mean the document was analysed at a later stage, after an analysis of some research text revealed reductive repetition around the use of a particular metaphor that became the focus of the analysis of research documents: the metaphor that PNG was ‘like Africa’. Therefore for most of these articles I only wanted to see if any comparison was made between Africa and PNG, and if so, I made a brief note on how comparisons were being made (see analysis section below).

One document was subject to a more in-depth critical discourse analysis. This was Trevor Cullen’s (2006) “HIV/AIDS in Papua New Guinea: A reality check”. This article was chosen for two reasons. Firstly, the article itself is an analysis of political statements, government reports, scientific debate and the remarks of international health officials on the HIV/AIDS epidemic in Papua New Guinea (Cullen, 2006 pg 1). It thus gives a good overall summary of mainstream academic policy and science just before the end of the NHASP. But just as important as what is covered in this article is its seemingly prominent place in discourse around HIV and AIDS in
PNG. It is archived and referred to in several AusAID documents, media reports, and HIV and AIDS policy databases, including HIVpolicy.org. Indeed, placing the title of this paper (in quotes), as well as Cullen’s name, into Google returned 57200 results. This I believe is testament to the importance of this article in debates around HIV and AIDS in PNG.

All documents (including talks) were already in an electronic format, so no talk needed to be transcribed. These documents were then subject to a critical discourse analysis which I will now describe.

**Analysis**

What was of interest to me in analysis of research documents was the common themes or messages that these texts tried to teach their readers. Common themes throughout a number of papers could signify the use of reductive repetition (a function of Orientalisms, see Chapter 2) to teach people a homogenised view of PNG peoples and their cultures. The constant repetition of an assumption throughout a variety of texts is a strong sign of reductive repetition (Said, 2003). Therefore pragmatics was seen as an appropriate form of analysis to expose reductive repetition within the documents and speeches that informed mainstream development thinking and knowledge claims about HIV and AIDS in PNG. Pragmatics has a reputation of being a useful way to critically assess the roles of assumptions in texts (Fairclough, 1989, 2003). In particular, I have focused on a specific type of assumption in this analysis. That is the lexical metaphor. According to Fairclough (2003) metaphors function as assumptions, in texts. Assumptions are, according to Fairclough (2003 pg 55), a sign of fellowship and community that is formed on the common ground of shared knowledge that can be taken as given. Although there must be some form of common ground for social interaction and communication to occur, assumptions can reduce difference and leave little room for dialogue around the issue being assumed. At the same time, assumptions in text can be used to exercise social power, domination and hegemony and shape the common ground. Assumptions therefore can be associated with a particular form of value system (i.e. ideology). Ideologies and their associated assumptions can be regarded as belonging to a particular discourse. In other words, lexical metaphors and assumptions (if one was to look among a large range of texts) can show a researcher the common ground, or consensus, reached by experts in mainstream PNG HIV and AIDS development. There is the strong possibility that the consensus that is reached is Orientalist, i.e. consensus among experts, inherent in these assumptions, could be defining who can know PNG and how they can know PNG. So from the
perspective of Orientalisms, pragmatics can show how academics and institutions might be imagining PNG and its people. Therefore pragmatics offers a useful way of analysing and accessing the concepts that are central to this thesis.

Analysis started by selecting a research article that was keynote in representing mainstream development thinking around HIV and AIDS in PNG. This article was Cullen (2006) (see 4.3 above). Having selected and read this article, I highlighted in it where assumptions and non-modalised assertions appeared. Non-modalised assertions are very similar to assumptions, in that they make assertions about how reality is and what is known. Non-modalised assertions (unlike modalised assertions) don’t assert any possibility that there might be a different way of viewing reality, or a different take on what is known. Unlike assumptions, they can be attributed to the individual writer/speaker and not a reference to a whole “world of texts”.

After each of these assumptions or assertions, I would critically assess the knowledge claim that was being made through the assumption. I would also critically assess what sorts of arguments are being closed down by these assumptions and non-modalised assertions.

From the results of this analysis I chose one assumption (metaphor) evident in the text and began to investigate for its presence in other texts. In these I specifically focused on the metaphor/assumption that PNG was like Africa. This metaphor was chosen due to my physical and emotional engagement with the topic of HIV and AIDS in PNG. Very early on in my investigations, and throughout my volunteer work, I noted a specific thought process. In this process I ‘understood’ that the PNG HIV and AIDS crisis was like the African HIV and AIDS crisis. In personal conversations and interviews with PNG development workers, the African context was often brought to bear on the HIV/AIDS situation, without my prompting. Simultaneously I knew I had read that PNG was like Africa in a number of HIV and AIDS development articles. Because of my training in critical geographies, I felt that there was something problematic with such a metaphor. Exploring this problematic feeling seemed very important to my research.

60 It is important to note that this metaphor was rarely, if ever, uncritically brought to bear on the situation. Thus, although development workers used it, they often saw something problematic in the reference.
I then applied an analysis to other documents in my sample (as discussed above in this section) with a particular focus on the like Africa metaphor. My analysis of the like Africa assumption in these other texts followed the same principles that were applied to the Cullen article. I would therefore look at how these papers claimed PNG to be like Africa and what was not being explored through this claim. With the focus on the like Africa claim, I went a little further in my analysis and critically investigated how the like Africa assumption functioned to achieve its purpose. How an assumption would function was dependent on the type of assumption it was. There are three types: essential assumptions, propositional assumptions and value assumptions (Fairclough, 2003). Essential assumptions are assumptions about what exists. These assumptions aim to define/state what the receiver of the message takes for granted as factual. Propositional assumptions are assumptions about what is, can be, or will be, the case. Such assumptions are often used as bridging assumptions, creating a coherent link between two parts of text. Finally, value assumptions are assumptions about what is good and desirable. In analysing the type of assumption being used, I also analysed the emotionality expressed in each assumption.

In analysing the articles, I also noted what genre each document belonged to. Genres are ways of acting in order to propagate discourse (Fairclough, 2003). Genres have many different levels of abstractions, therefore one document can be of more than one genre (Fairclough, 2003). For example, a talk by a known (or agreed upon) expert is both the genre of a speech as well as that of expert testimony. As stated in Chapter 2 I was interested in exploring in more detail that aspect of the theories of Orientalisms that related to Kuhn’s (1970) exemplar paradigms and the teaching of Orientalisms to other researchers. Therefore by analysing what genre an article belonged to I could focus my attention on papers whose genres related to teaching other researchers how to research PNG HIV and AIDS.

At the end of this process I had placed all articles analysed into one of three broad genres. These were: conference papers and talks; reports and papers commissioned by donor organisations; and the words/testimonies of those that mainstream development agencies believed to be experts in the field. By analysing how the like Africa metaphor functioned under each genre, I was able to assess how this metaphor might be taught to other scientists so that they could imagine PNG in similar (possibly Orientalist) ways.
4.4 Analysis of Policy Documents.

This section describes the method by which I selected and analysed policy documents, in order to investigate the emotions embedded in key policy documents that create HIV and AIDS development discourse in PNG. The analysis involved a mixture of both discourse and directed content analysis that took in phenomenological considerations. I will also include a brief description of the four documents selected.

I chose to analyse policy documents for two main reasons. The first reason was to show that all texts are emotional, and that all texts propose an arguments about how people should feel towards other people, places, life forms or objects (Ahmed, 2004 a). As most mainstream policy documents aim to assert legitimacy by presenting a rational and emotionless front, I wished to bring out how even these documents guide their readers by subtle emotional means. Secondly, both critical and instrumental views of policy have tended to suggest that policy has an ability to shape what happens on the ground (Mosse, 2004). If this is so, then any Orientalisms embedded in development policy could have significant effects in shaping development workers’ actions, and possibly lead to the reproduction of Orientalisms.

It is important to note, however, I do not see policy as having a one-to-one relationship with the events that happen on the ground. Some development ethnographies have revealed that, although policy aims to direct the development worker towards certain actions, heterogeneous entities on the ground make such policy directions un-implementable (Li, 1999, Mosse, 2004). According to Mosse (2004), development policy gets “translated” by development workers. Mosse used the term to describe the many negotiations, compromises and agreements made by development workers with other stakeholders to achieve actions on the ground. The actions often have different outcomes and take different directions to those intended by policy. One might think therefore that if policy can’t be implemented it can have little bearing on the emotions of development workers on the ground. Yet Mosse (2004) argues that many development workers try to describe the actions they took on the ground as being in line with the policy framework that they were working under (even if they weren’t). Mosse calls these types of actions “the translation of implementation back into policy”. This “translating” process might mean that some of the actions undertaken by development workers to implement policy become obscured because they can’t be translated back into the policy context. In addition it could mean that the emotive experiences that development workers face might either be obscured, or affect what is being translated back into policy.
Document Selection

For continuity, I have chosen to study the policy documents that were in existence over the period in which the development workers that I interviewed were operating. This was generally over the time of AusAID’s NHASP (see Chapter 3).

My approach was to first read a variety of policy documents (around 20 in total) that I noted were in use in PNG\(^61\) and also documents that were online at HIV Policy.org (see 4.3). Documents were considered to be policy documents (instead of research documents) if they tended to recommend or set out a course of action, directly. After reading a significant number of policy documents, I chose four on which to do an in-depth analysis\(^62\). Two of these documents were selected because of their ability to affect, in some way, all the development workers that I worked with. These two keynote texts were Broughton’s (1999) “Guide to HIV/AIDS and Development” and the National HIV/AIDS Support Project’s (2002) Annual Plan January 2002 – June 2003.

Broughton’s (1999) work was commissioned by AusAID as a way to guide HIV and AIDS activities carried out through the Australian Government’s overseas programs, including those run in PNG\(^63\). Each of the many chapters relates to a “guiding” principle that HIV and AIDS organisations should try to follow when working with AusAID funding. As all bar one of the development workers I interviewed received funding from AusAID, the advice given in this Guide was therefore applicable to all development workers interviewed. I also noticed the policy being used during my participant observation in PNG. This, I deduced, made it applicable to the development workers interviewed.

\(^61\) These were mainly documents that were plainly obvious when I walked into an office, or which a development worker mentioned or showed me in personal conversations, while in PNG.

\(^62\) It is important to note that, although some of the documents mentioned above may seem quite old in terms of the life span of most policy documents, all were selected because they either came into being or were in use throughout the NHASP and my time in PNG.

\(^63\) Note: Only the sections of this guide that mentioned PNG were analysed.
The National HIV/AIDS Support Project’s (2002) Annual Plan January 2002 – June 2003, was chosen because it sets out a desired path (or line) by which endeavours undertaken by the NHASP and its partners were to progress. Development workers and development organisations would likely try to orientate themselves, or translate their actions, in ways that are in line with this plan, in order to receive more funding.

The other two documents chosen for analysis were “The Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea HIV and AIDS Policy” (2006) and the National AIDS Council Secretariat, PNG Ombudsman Commission, National HIV/AIDS Support Project, (2004) “HIV/AIDS Management and Prevention Act”. These two documents related to the on-the-ground experiences and actions of development workers. Also, many of the development workers that I interviewed had a copy of these documents in their work place and had reasons to adhere to these policies.

The Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea HIV and AIDS Policy was chosen particularly because it represents a different form of policy document to the mainstream development document. It is produced by a religious organisation and therefore does not necessarily adhere to the rules that make good policy, from a secular sense. Therefore, it makes an interesting point of departure from other policy documents in this study. From a phenomenological perspective it was likely to try to orientate development workers in different ways to other policy documents.

The National AIDS Council Secretariat et al’s (2004) document explained a group of laws that (in theory) all HIV and AIDS development workers had to adhere to, on a daily basis. This meant that it had the ability to shape and direct how development workers go about many of their interactions with people affected by HIV and AIDS in PNG.

64 This does not necessarily mean that they worked for either of these organisations. In fact, at the time of interview, none of the development workers interviewed had worked for either of these organisations.
Analysis

The analysis of policy documents required a second type of critical discourse analysis to be applied. This approach could be defined as a critical linguistic analysis of discourse. It was applied because pragmatics were deemed not a fine enough tool to pick up on the subtle emotions embedded in policy documents that had attempted to erase emotion. Also, policy documents were less likely to directly express knowledge claims, which ultimately have some underlying assumptions. Instead policy was more likely to put a logical and authoritative voice around a set of actions (Mosse, 2004, Wright, 2012, Askew, 2009).

In this approach I looked at how linguistic systems are employed to produce a subtle discourse of emotionality. What this means is, I looked at linguistic features within each sentence – grammar, vocabulary, etc – in light of their social meaning and as a form of social interaction. One such social meaning that can be attached to a linguistic feature is emotion (Van Dijk, 1997, Knoppers and Anthonissen, 2008). For example, certain words like death convey a social meaning of fear. Thus by analysing what linguistic features are used in each text, I was able to link passages of these texts to discourses of emotionality. Four discourses of emotionality were found in these texts, each focused around a central emotion. It was around these emotions that I decided to centre my analysis. The four emotions were:

1. Hope or positivity
2. Fear
3. Frustration and disappointment
4. Sympathy

Yet discourses of emotionality were not the only social meaning conveyed through policy documents. Indeed, some of the strongest discourse in policy documents tended to be managerial discourses and discourses of authority. Such discourses have been linked to (neo)colonial hegemony like Orientalisms (Ban and Dutta, 2012, Said, 2003). So it was important that I took note of how linguistic features also conveyed the social meanings of these discourses. By critically assessing how discourse of emotionality intersected with managerial discourses and discourses of authority, I was able to see how emotions could play a role in both the production of, as well as the resistance to, Orientalisms.
4.5 Analysis of Development Practice

The methods used to analyse development practice involved two methods of data collection, which this section will first describe. One used a free writing journal of my experience over the time working in a development organisation; the other used interviews with development workers. Both data collections underwent the same form of analysis.

Free writing of Observations and Experience Working for a Development Organisation

A journal of my observations and emotions was the first form of primary data collected in this study. The experiences and self-reflexivity represented in the journal affected much of my approach to, and analysis of, the other forms of data collected. In fact, my research questions and focus underwent a significant shift while writing the journal. The process of producing the journal also had several benefits in relation to the other forms of data that were subject to analysis. Advantages included positioning me as an insider to many of the Western development workers that I interviewed, and allowing me to observe which policy documents would be useful to analyse.

The Nature of the Journal and its Timespan

Between April and June 2008, I volunteered at an HIV and AIDS organisation in Port Moresby. This institution specialised in HIV and AIDS prevention largely through peer support projects as well as voluntary counselling and testing (VCT). During this time I was asked to undertake several activities for different sections of the organisation. Tasks included: utilising my research skills to find media about HIV and AIDS to use in presentations to the public; working

---

65 This was my second trip to PNG. I undertook a one-month preliminary trip to PNG the year before to help contextualise myself with PNG. On this preliminary trip I attended the National Research Workshop on HIV and AIDS (see 4.3) and received a copy of the “Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea’s HIV and AIDS Policy” (See 4.4).

66 See Chapter 3 for more information about Peer Support and VCT and their role in the PNG HIV prevention.
as a teacher’s aide helping the students who were undertaking peer support classes, VCT training, or literacy lessons; photographing students undertaking sewing and woodworking classes for a public presentation.

During this time I kept a free writing journal (see below) in which I noted down all my thoughts and feelings. I also kept a record of some of the actions and interactions with PNG people and place, over the time of the placement.

This journal served as both a recording tool and as an exercise in reflexivity (particularly once analysed). Originally I started it for therapeutic reasons. The therapeutic benefits of free writing journals have been discussed in a number of works including Goldberg (2005) and Clark (1997). At this stage the emotionality of development work was not the central focus of my thesis. It very soon became apparent to me that emotionality was the most significant part of the development story. It was through the very act of writing this journal that I came to this conclusion and decided to change my thesis topic to make emotions the central research focus. Therefore this journal was instrumental in informing my thesis topic and direction. It also became a valuable storehouse for my emotional reactions to PNG people and place.

In addition to this journal, I wrote a participant observation journal which, with the change in research focus, was not subject to an analysis. In this second journal I wrote down observations about the actions that I or other development workers undertook during the course of the work, and the types of tools used. Tools included things like the policy documents that I observed around offices where I worked or which I visited. This participant observation journal served as a useful starting point for collecting a reference list of written and visual texts, including newspaper articles, teaching aids, etc. Reading some of these articles (particularly newspaper articles) informed my contextual understanding of PNG. More importantly, this participant observation journal helped me choose which policy and research articles to analyse.

Free writing and transcription

The free writing practice is one that was originally used to overcome writer’s block (Belenoff, Elbow and Fontaine, 1991). The aim of free writing is to remove all constraints about writing, and to write constantly. There is no need to stay on topic, worry about spelling or grammar or indeed make sense. With these constraints gone, one must write constantly, usually for a set period of time (in some of my free writing sessions I even removed the constraint of a set
period of time). It is important for the writer not to stop or reread their work: instead they are encouraged to just keep writing (Clark, 1997). If the writer come to a point where they cannot think of anything to write, they are to write down that thought (i.e. ‘I can’t think of anything to write’) and all the variations of thoughts that their brain goes through (e.g. ‘maybe I should write about cars, no, bikes’) until they find a topic to write on.

According to Belanoff, Elbow and Fontaine (1991 pg XIV) there are several other types of free writing that are undertaken by adding additional constraints. Thus focused free writing asks the writer to stay on one topic, public free writing asks the writer to share their words with others, and focused public free writing adds both the previous constraints. By and large, the process that I undertook in my study was a focused free writing task. The topic I chose was to free write about my day, and, as I said, was originally chosen for my own therapeutic purposes. At this stage I did not wish to share this journal with the public or analyse it for emotional experience. I found, however, that my free writing would never stay true to one specific form. There were a number of times when my free writing would be constrained in one of the above three ways. For example, sometimes when a specific aspect of my day, or my life in PNG, truly captured my intellect, I would undertake a more focused free writing approach on that topic. Also, when I decided that I was going to analyse and present some of my free writing, the more public focus did, on some occasions, influence what I wrote. Yet as I was both author and analyser of this journal, this would not have that much of an effect. These changes in constraints came organically from my free writing experience and, as such, I feel are part of the process.

For the most part I chose to free write on a computer. This meant that most of the transcription was completed through the free writing process itself. But there were also several periods during my stint as a development worker when I went to more remote areas, where for several days I did not have access to a computer. For these occasions I used a handwritten journal. These journals were rewritten (but not in their entirety) on to a computer so that I would be able to analyse them using NVIVI software. I chose not to completely transcribe these journals for several reasons. The primary reason was the time it would take. The free writing process tends to produce messy handwriting that is difficult to read and therefore difficult and time consuming to transcribe. Also, the process of writing down whatever thoughts comes into one’s head can, even with a focused free write, go way off topic or result in nonsensical sentences. I saw no point in transcribing these phrases when they appeared. If I saw evidence of a strong emotion in an off topic or nonsensical section, I would
write a note of the emotion being expressed on the transcription. Therefore I tended to rewrite only those aspects of these journals that I, upon re-reading, felt did a good job at expressing my emotional involvement with PNG people and place.

It is important to note that my choice to mainly write with a computer may have had an effect on the amount and the type of emotionality expressed in my journals. According to Clark (1997) and Goldberg (2005), handwritten work contains more data on the emotionality of the subject. For example, Goldberg (2005) claimed to be more emotional when free writing by hand than when she was writing on a computer or typewriter, whereas her writings tended to follow a more narrative structure when done on a computer or typewriter. Also Clark (1997) claimed that one of the ways she could tell when her free-writing participants were getting more emotional was by the way that the handwriting changed. Reading over my journals I would concur with both these writers, but particularly Clark (1997). When I got more emotional, my handwriting often changed slant and became bigger and loopier.

The evidence that Clark (1997) and Goldberg (2005) give is subjective. Even so, I believe it is important for a researcher to consider effects such as these when deciding how they wish to employ free writing. My personal opinion is that my predominant use of a computer was the most appropriate form of free writing. The content which I produced on the computer was still highly emotional, while the more narrative structure which this form of writing produced made it easier to follow the flows of emotions between subjects and objects that comprised my experiences in PNG. Also the way that my handwriting would change when I became more emotional often made it more difficult to read, to the point that at times I was unable to transcribe what I had written.

The transcripts of the journals were uploaded into NVIVO for the analysis described below.

**Interviews**

Twenty interviews were conducted to assess the emotional stances of Western development workers working in PNG. These interviews also provided valuable qualitative data on how development workers felt and how they understood and constructed PNG and PNG cultures. In particular, they allowed me to assess what types of places in PNG were considered important to PNG people. Constructions of PNG people and place were also useful for revealing how and when development workers reproduced Orientalisms, and where they resisted them. Also of particular interest were the ways in which these interviews could help me describe the range
of significant emotions felt by development workers over their time in PNG, and the times and places in which they were felt.

Therefore information gained from these interviews provided a core understanding of how emotions affected interactions with PNG people and place, and the constructions of Orientalisms or resistances to Orientalisms that resulted. I will now describe how interview subjects were selected and how the interviews were conducted and transcribed.

Selection Process

The first step was to obtain ethics approval from the University of Newcastle (Australia). Ethics approval was received on the 12/7/2008 under the ethic application number, H-579-0907. Upon receiving permission, travel was arranged in order to participate in a volunteer placement in Port Moresby (see Section 4.3.4 below). This provided a number of connections with development workers that became the impetus for the selection of participants for this study.

Of the 20 interviews conducted, all but one participant was residing in Australia at the time of the interview. The gender breakdown of participants was 7 males and 13 females. Participants were from a variety of age groups (all above 25).

The selection process was a snowball interview process that developed through my connections to PNG HIV and AIDS development workers. Working as a development worker and being around the international development scene in general meant that I made a number of acquaintances who were potential candidates for my interviews. In unsolicited conversations with some of these friends/ acquaintances, I mentioned my research project and how I was looking for participants. Some of these acquaintances became interested and eager to participate. From there the number of participants spread through a word-of-mouth process. For example, after conducting an interview with one participant he subsequently recommended other development workers who might wish to participate, and emailed them a description of my work and my contact details. Three subsequently contacted me asking to participate in the study. Thus my sample can be described as a snowball sample.

The Interview Process
Upon receiving a verbal or written request from development workers to participate in my study, I sent them a participant information sheet. This gave general information about who I was and the university with which I was affiliated. It also outlined the aims of the study, the interview process and the risk factors involved. Upon receiving a signed consent form the interview process was able to begin.

The interview questions were divided into three sections. The first section consisted of questions about when and where the development worker was posted in PNG and the general structure of the organisation that they worked for. This section also contained questions about the tasks the development worker undertook while working in an HIV and AIDS development organisation. These questions were mainly to gain information on the context in which the interviewee worked. It was also to gain some insight into the types of places, equipment and people that the development worker interacted with in their day-to-day work. This part of the interview also served to make the development worker feel comfortable with the interview process. On some occasions this section elicited unsolicited emotional responses from development workers about their time in PNG, therefore providing additional emotional data for analysis.

The second section asked questions on issues to do with the effects of HIV and AIDS development work. This section was designed primarily to see how a development worker constructed PNG, PNG people and the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG. It was also to gauge the views and opinions that development workers had towards international HIV and AIDS development, and their role in the process. This section did not have any emphasis on emotions, rather it was used to see the emotions that spontaneously arose when development workers expressed their understanding (knowledge) of PNG, HIV and AIDS and International development. This section was also particularly useful in gaining an understanding of the interactions between development policy and on-the-ground practice (see Chapter 8).

The final section concerned how development workers felt, working and living in PNG. This section contained questions such as whether the development worker felt scared or isolated in their home and work lives while in PNG. Questions also asked whether (and when) the interviewee felt hopeful or happy in their working and living situation in PNG. The aim of this section was to more directly understand the emotions that development workers felt in PNG and the situations in which they felt them. In particular, the questions looked to investigate
whether certain emotional responses were associated with certain constructions of PNG people and place that were in line with Orientalisms, or resisted Orientalisms.

Upon completion of the third section, participants were given a chance to comment on how they felt going through the interview process and whether they wished to add anything else. This was to provide me with feedback about the interview process, its effects and possible ways to improve questions and questioning for future interviews and research.

These semistructured interviews ran between 1-2 hours. The interview schedule is attached as appendix 1. A semistructured interview process was chosen (over structured interviews) because I desired predominantly open-ended questions that allowed participants to give narrative style responses. These were considered to be the most useful form of response because narratives help people to both express and organise complex emotional experiences like those of international development workers (Pennebaker and Seagal, 1999). By allowing respondents to organise their experiences and their feelings, this process elicits a more genuine understanding of how development workers emotionally related to PNG objects (people, places and things).

Narrative responses may have also been elicited from unstructured interviews, which give the participant greater control over the types of narratives that they produce. This may have produced data that had more emphasis on the development workers’ personal perceptions and experiences (Dunn, 2000). Despite this benefit, I chose semistructured interviews because there was a worry, given free rein, development workers may have decided to avoid the emotional aspect of their experience and focused more on physicality. I was particularly concerned that they would not relate their negative experiences or their dislike of particular aspects of PNG people and place. Hence semistructured interviews were seen as the appropriate methodology, because they enabled me to elicit narrative-style responses that were focused towards key knowledge gaps in the emotionality of international development and PNG.

Transcription

Interviews were transcribed as close to the date of interview as possible using a naturalist form of transcription (Olivier, Serovich and Mason, 2005). This involves recording every utterance in as much detail as possible. I chose this method because it is generally believed that such transcriptions make it significantly more difficult to misrepresent what the interviewee is
saying (Olivier, Serovich and Mason, 2005). In addition, non linguistic cues like laughter, pauses and stutters can offer insights into the emotional state of the interviewee (Olivier, Serovich and Mason, 2005). Transcribing as close to the interview date as possible was important because I wanted to remember and capture the body movements, tone and general ‘vibe’ given off by the interviewee at the time, as these would reflect emotion. I would record these observations either at the start or the end of the sentence in which they occurred. I found that the greater the time period between when I conducted the interview and when I transcribed it, the less of this additional emotional data I could recall\(^67\).

All transcriptions were either first written in MS Word and then imported into NVIVO 8, or transcribed in NVIVO 8 using NVIVO's transcription functions.

There are a number of issues with presenting naturalised transcriptions in public documents, one being that it is difficult to keep the identity of interviewees confidential (Olivier, Serovich and Mason, 2005). This was definitely the case with my interviewees. The cohort of Western development workers in PNG is so small that any mention of the name of the location in which they worked, or organisation and place of residence, could likely compromise their anonymity. A number of my interviewees were highly cautious about their organisations being identified in the final thesis. As such the quotes that appear in the thesis have been somewhat denaturalised to help ensure anonymity of the interviewees. I have also denaturalised the quotes from my interviews to make them more readable. This means I often removed some of the pauses, half sentences and so forth that occurred throughout the interview process, at the stage of presentation.

**Analysis of Free Writing and of Interview Data**

Due to the nature of the free writing and interview data, and in particular to the questions that I asked in interview, emotional arguments were much more overt in these forms than in either the research or policy data. Also, where policy and research documents may try to convince the reader to feel or view PNG people, place, HIV and AIDS in a particular way, development

\(^{67}\)However, the tone an interviewee used, in some cases, could still be picked-up many days after the interview.
workers were trying to express how they felt. Therefore it was deemed that a different analysis approach was required for the journal and interview data.

One of the important aspects that I thought might be neglected in a straight discourse analysis was the fact that development workers were trying to describe the ‘realities’ of their emotional experiences in PNG. By applying a qualitative content analysis before applying a CDA I was able to highlight the seemingly fixed views of reality that development workers felt was important to convey before analysing the underlying forces that help to socially construct these views (Crawford, 2004).

A qualitative content analysis was considered a good middle ground for combining the apparent realist view expressed in my data and the constructivist ontology of a CDA approach (Hardy, Harley and Phillips, 2004). Qualitative content analysis investigates the characteristics of language with an attention to the content (e.g exact words) or contextual meaning of a text. Qualitative content analysis does not just count the words, it goes beyond this and provides a systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes from the subjective interpretation of content. Such an approach to text data is considered to be a naturalistic approach. This means that it assumes that there are multiple versions of reality, all of which are constructed in the mind in a holistic manner (Lawrence, 1994, Guba, 1979). Such an approach accepts a supposed reality but also understands that each reality is socially constructed. It also suggests that my inquiry is inherently value bound, and simultaneously shaped and linked to both my and my interviewees’ versions of reality.

Such approaches seemed warranted as emotions are not a tangible or measurable variable and are derived from subjective and socially constructed experiences (Lincoln, 2007, Davidson and Smith, 2009). In addition, it has been shown that Western expats tend to form groups, and the naturalistic paradigm has shown itself to be pertinent in capturing the experiences in living in a group setting (Lawrence, 1994, Walsh, 2006 b).

The analysis process undertaken in this thesis involved a conventional content analysis. Content analysis is a research method that involves the subjective interpretation of textual data through the systematic classification, processing and identifying of the themes presented in the text (Smith, Davidson, Cameron et al, 2009, Hsieh and Shannon, 2005). It codes data into categories that come out of reading and rereading the textual data itself. Conventional content analysis has at times been used in health and development research settings for describing
emotional reactions (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005, Li and Arber, 2006, Wang, Shi, Ng, Wang and Chan, 2011). Applying this method to the free writing journals and to the in-depth interviews described above was therefore appropriate because in this part of my study I primarily wanted to describe the emotional reactions of Western development workers to PNG (and why they claimed to feel these emotions).

The first step of the analysis required the transcription of the interviews. I have described the ways in which I tried to translate much of the emotional content into textural data. I felt, however, that some emotional content might still be getting lost. To make up for this, the next task\(^{68}\) was to re-listen to each interview in NVIVO 8, and, using its code audio function, roughly code my interview audio according to the criteria outlined below. I would essentially listen to large sections of my interview data (roughly 1 or 2 answers to questions on my interview schedule, see appendix 1) and code according to the general impression of the emotive themes expressed. This broke down into a list of emotions expressed and some general categories of the type of situations mentioned. As such, this coding for the audio files was generally a much more intuitive and less fine-grained process than my approach for analysing the textural transcripts of the interviews (out lined below).

Next, the textural transcripts, and later, the free writing journal were read and re-read several times to get a thorough understanding of the overall picture of the types of emotions expressed by the development workers (or me), and the types of situations in which these emotions were felt. First I read the interview transcripts as I would read a novel, then I read them word by word to derive the codes. In doing so I became immersed in the data and gained an overall sense of the whole (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005).

Data was coded to an emotion according to several factors. The most important factor was the type of words and phrases that the development worker used. If a development worker mentioned a word that described an emotion (e.g. sad) then all content in the statement that

\(^{68}\) I only learnt of this function after coding several interviews and this process was completed retrospectively on these first few interviews.
the emotive word related to would be coded as relating to that emotion. An example from my interviews is:

*The frustration of being treated differently, all the time, being treated like a weak fragile being made me very frustrated. It was like a real affront to my ego. Um, the sadness that I felt for, there was this one girl that I really liked and her parents were very conservative and religious. Sadness I felt, because somehow she seemed a bit trapped in this life, because she was quite a Western person and she was living in quite a culturally constrained family environment. I felt kind of sad about that.* Peter

(emphasis added)

In the quote I have underlined the words that describe an emotion. These words generally relate to two broad categories of emotions: sadness and frustration/anger. I then looked at the context in which these words are used. Any context that is related to words that describe sadness are coded to the node “development worker expressing sadness” (blue highlight) and any context that is related to words that denotes frustration/anger are coded to the node “development worker expressing frustration/anger” (yellow highlight).

Another way I coded for emotion was by the tone of voice. As noted above, when I wrote my transcripts I added notes on the tone of voice used. For example, I would write “(sad tone)” at the end of the sentence. This essentially would associate an emotive work with a certain phrase or sentence. I could then code sections in which the development worker did not actually use a word denoting an emotion, in similar fashion to the method described above. I also followed the same approach to body movements that expressed emotion. For example, if someone gave a groan and buried their face in their hands I might, depending on the context, code what they were talking about as indicating despair or frustration.

Particularly with my journal, but also occasionally with my interviews, my memory was used to help define which emotion some sections should be coded to. I was aware that using this technique on other people’s interview data ran the danger of overwriting their emotional experience with my own (Bondi, 2001). As such, I was very mindful when using this technique,

---

69 Note, this is a visual representation of the process that is undertaken by NVIVO 8. NVIVO codes data without highlighting the data. Therefore each word/phrase can be attributed to multiple codes.
and did not rely solely on memory when choosing an emotional node. However, I feel that the process of using my memory in this way gave me a greater empathetic understanding of my interviewees’ experiences. This understanding might have helped improve my ability to describe and relate to the emotional reactions and interactions of development workers (Bondi, 2001).

In addition, I made notes of the type of themes or issues that were related to these expressions of emotions. The general context of the whole interview and my own memories of an experience were also used to define how I should code a sentence. For continuity’s sake I will use the phrase from Peter, above, as an example of this coding technique in practice.

The frustration of being treated differently, all the time, being treated like a weak fragile being made me very frustrated. It was like a real affront to my ego. Um, the sadness that I felt for, there was this one girl that I really liked and her parents were very conservative and religious. Sadness I felt, because somehow she seemed a bit trapped in this life, because she was quite a western person and she was living in quite a culturally constrained family environment. I felt kind of sad about that. Peter

(emphasis added)

In the above quote I have underlined the words that describe the themes that relate to the expressions of emotion. I note three distinct themes at which Peter’s expressions of emotion were directed. These were: being treated differently by some undescribed other, the circumstances of a Papua New Guinean girl, and the mindset of the parents of a PNG girl. I therefore created a node for each of these objects and coded the phrases in this quote that I thought related to each of these nodes accordingly. It is important to note, however, that before coding the phrase highlighted as yellow, I derived who these ‘unknown persons’ were, who treated Peter differently. To do this, I used the general impression formed by immersing myself in the interview data, other similar mentions elsewhere, and my own memory. I was then able to classify this as an interaction with PNG people. Therefore in the end, this quote
was coded to the nodes “description of PNG people in general” (yellow), “description of PNG women” (Green and blue), and “description of Papua New Guinean parents” (blue).\(^{70}\)

After completing two interviews like this I had a large and unwieldy array of nodes for emotions and, more specifically, situations in PNG. This however is part of the process (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005). At this stage I grouped many of my emotional categories and situation categories into several broader categories. For example, I originally had three different nodes for expressions of anger, frustration, and annoyance. I collapsed these into one node called “frustration and anger”. My three object nodes in the above quote (“PNG girl” “PNG parents” and “PNG people”) that describe PNG peoples and places, I collapsed into “Descriptions of PNG peoples and places”. One of the main reasons I collapsed many categories into “PNG peoples and places” was that I found it a useful way of highlighting the moments when development workers and I might propagate Orientalisms.

After completing this step on two interviews I had a set of nodes to which I could code future interview data. However, the original set of broad nodes grew and sometimes gained subcategories, as I completed more interviews. For example, after several interviews, one interviewee expressed a great deal of surprise and shock at what they saw. The previous three interviews had not suggested surprise or shock. I then had to make a new coding node called “development worker experiencing surprise/shock”. After completing the coding of the fourth transcript, I then went back and scanned the previous three interviews for any mentions of surprise/shock.

Having coded all the data with the final set of nodes, I could then, through the use of NVIVO 8 query function, choose an emotion and assess themes related to the expression of such emotion. The patterns found in these emotions, and the objects to which they were related, are described in my results section.

The NVIVO 8 query function also made me a list of the emotional realities of individuals who participated in my study (including me). Yet from a CDA perspective I knew that these

\(^{70}\) Even though these were descriptions of a specific PNG woman and her specific parents, I coded these to more general terms of PNG women and parents because there would be too many nodes to create any form of analysis, if done otherwise.
emotional realities were socially constructed. In addition, I could see that at the time of the interview or the writing of my free writing journal, it could be argued that my participants were assuming these realities existed. As such, the emotional themes mentioned in these texts were an aspect of text not unlike linguistic pragmatics. Therefore the emotive themes of my content analysis were subject to a critical discourse analysis. The issue central to my CDA of these emotive themes was how such assumptions of reality recreate or resist Orientalisms.

4.6 Conclusion

In this chapter I have presented the methods of my research, which rely heavily on critical discourse analysis. The bulk of this chapter was dedicated to describing the three innovative methods that I used. These were: a critical analysis of the pragmatics used in HIV and AIDS research documents; an analysis of the words and grammar used in policy documents; and a critical analysis of the common themes relating to the common emotional experiences of PNG, as expressed in interview by development workers, and in my journal.

These research methods also described what other Emotional Geographers have used in the past and how their works help to confirm, complement and strengthen my idea to assess my data using a CDA approach. Their research suggests that such an approach would open up new methods in Emotional Geographies, as it will apply a new form of critical discourse analysis not normally associated with Emotional Geographies.

By combining the CDA techniques used by Fairclough (2003) with emotional data I have also produced new and innovative uses of CDA techniques. In doing so, I have devised new CDA techniques that are more a tuned to exposing discourses of emotionality. This is important because discourses of emotionality are ever present, but often over looked, in all forms of textual data (Ahmed, 2004 b). Another way in which I have made a more innovative CDA approach is through combining it with a qualitative content analysis. In doing so, I have helped strengthen calls for new methods of analysis that come through combining discourse analysis with content analysis (Hardy, Harley and Phillips, 2004). This has also worked to make a bridge between some of the more common ways of researching emotions in health (which have more often relied on qualitative content analysis) and typical CDA approaches.

Although the methods described were created to investigate the Emotional Geographies of HIV and AIDS in PNG, they can be applied to many inquiries. This is because what is critical to
each is not the topic, but the orders of discourse that are being employed to represent (genres in particular). This is important because it is in the orders of discourse that lie behind a contextualised social practice (like PHG HIV and AIDS development) that determine how cultural hegemony takes form. Also research documents, policy documents and the experiences of people in general are not limited to the social practice of development. More so, pragmatics and linguistic features are inherent in all texts. This suite of methods can therefore be applied in many situations in which texts or spoken words are recorded. As such, it will be an important addition to the ways in which Emotional Geographies can be assessed.
Chapter 5: Research and Expertise: The Role of Emotions, Metaphors and Knowledge Claims around HIV and AIDS in PNG

5.1 Introduction

This chapter investigates the assumptions and metaphors used in PNG HIV and AIDS research, primarily to show how Orientalisms can sustain, and be sustained, by development research. I show how research and expertise helps set up the context by which PNG is understood in relation to HIV and AIDS. Such representations can go on to influence both the policy direction and the ways in which Western development workers interact with PNG peoples and places. Just as important is the fact that academic work can teach other academics how to research HIV and AIDS in PNG (Kuhn, 1970). Therefore this chapter discusses the ways that the research community might teach other researchers Orientalist ways of doing HIV and AIDS research.

In this chapter, I first look at the variety of assumptions used in PNG HIV and AIDS development research. To achieve this goal I apply a Critical Discourse Analysis to an article that contains the opinions of a number of mainstream HIV and AIDS experts. This article is Trevor Cullen’s (2006) “HIV/AIDS in Papua New Guinea: A Reality Check”. I will argue that the assumptions and associated ideologies exposed in this text point to an Orientalist discourse present in academic works that inform policy on HIV and AIDS in PNG.

In this section I show the existence of a metaphor that PNG is ‘like Africa’. It is this metaphor that I select for in-depth analysis. Most of this chapter is centred on showing how the African metaphor is one of a number of Orientalisms still present in contemporary HIV and AIDS development in PNG. I also claim that, given the prevalence of this metaphor, it has become an exemplar paradigm for how to deal with HIV and AIDS development work in PNG (see Section 2.2). As such, Western development agencies and workers (over the time period of my study, at least) come to know PNG, at least partly, through this metaphor. It is important to note that, although it may have influenced our understanding, I and other development workers and academics (even ones who used this metaphor) were never fully accepting of the metaphor or unaware of its problematic nature. These forms of resistance to the metaphor will also be touched on in this chapter.

The next section contains the analysis of Cullen’s (2006) work. I describe how the metaphor that PNG is ‘like Africa’ functions as an Orientalism and how this Orientalist trope benefits and
sustains development researchers and their research. In 5.4 I show that, just as Orientalisms sustain development research, development research sustains Orientalisms, in return. Utilising Kuhn’s (1970) idea of an exemplar paradigm, I show how Orientalisms are taught to other researchers through a variety of different genres that are integral to how development researchers carry out research. Thus a cyclical process is formed, that can keep mainstream development research locked into Orientalisms. Throughout this chapter I describe how emotion plays an important role in the continuation of this cyclical process. I conclude this chapter by considering what this means for the emotional context in which development policy and action arise.

5.2 Assumptions and Metaphors in Text and the Production of Shared Knowledge about HIV and AIDS in PNG

As stated in Section 4.3, assumptions indicate a shared knowledge or common ground on a subject. At the same time, the repeated use of some assumptions in a discourse can be a sign of hegemony, like Orientalism. This is because assumptions can represent internalised knowledge claims that can be used to subjugate others. So I start by looking at the first page of Cullen’s (2006) article, where he states what he (and many others in development research) take to be the common knowledge by which to understand HIV and AIDS in PNG; it will also become clear from this that what is produced is a way of understanding PNG peoples and places, in general. The article’s first page is important as it sets the tone for the whole paper, while also claiming to describe the general tenor of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG. I have highlighted the key assumptions being made which define the shared knowledge about HIV and AIDS in PNG.

An analysis of political statements, government reports, scientific debate and the remarks of international health officials on the HIV/AIDS epidemic in Papua New Guinea. This commentary points to a grim future unless decisive strategies are implemented now and not later.

THE TIME for doubt is over. Several statements by various political figures and health officials in 2004 and 2005 have highlighted an ominous increase in HIV Infections throughout PNG. The country’s Health Minister, Melchior Pep, interviewed by the author in July 2004 at the 15th annual International AIDS conference in Bangkok, said his country anticipated a massive rise in the number of HIV infections: ‘We’re sitting under a devastating time bomb that is exploding as we speak’ (Pep 2004). A month
later, 16 political leaders representing the Pacific region gathered in Samoa for the annual Pacific Islands Forum. They expressed a similar concern about PNG and in the same month, Dr Yves Renault, the World Health Organisation (WHO) representative in PNG, estimated that HIV infections in PNG could reach one million by 2015.

WHO estimates that two per cent of PNG’s population is HIV positive...which means we have 100,000 people living with HIV. Our judgment is that, given the current level of infection and the rate of increase, it is possible that the number of infections could reach one million in 10-15 years unless decisive action is taken (Renault, 2004).

Dr Renault, who spent 16 years as an WHO representative in Sub-Saharan Africa, said that HIV infections among patients at Port Moresby General Hospital had reached nearly 20 percent and that the country was likely to experience an African–style epidemic. Renault’s remarks are supported by other prominent people. David Gordon-Macleod, the British High Commissioner in PNG, linked the HIV epidemic in PNG with the one in sub-Saharan Africa, where in some countries up to one-quarter of the population is living with the virus.

I have a sense that this country is more predisposed to what has already happened in southern Africa. The reasons include lack of development, tribalism and cultural diversity, the country’s difficult geography, the culture of violence towards women, the promiscuity, the lack of medical doctors and the dependency on AIDS funding from outside (Gordon-Macleod, 2004).

The High Commissioner added that the figures for HIV/AIDS in the country were misleading: ‘These are clearly minimal statistics and we’re probably talking about several times the actual truth in reality’ (Macleod 2004). Clement Malau, former director of the National AIDS Council Secretariat in Port Moresby, insists the massive epidemic of HIV/AIDS in many sub-Saharan African countries, such as Zambia, Malawi and Zimbabwe—where HIV infection rates are as high as 25 per cent in each country—could be repeated in PNG. ‘Given the current situation in PNG, we could go the same way as many sub-Saharan African countries. So there’s need for a more aggressive lead from government to fight this disease. Innovative long-term strategies must be found and implemented’ (Malau, 2005).

(Cullen, 2006 pg 1) (Emphasis added)
In the above section of the first page of Cullen’s (2006) paper I have highlighted the assumptions, metaphors and non-modalised assertions made or quoted by Cullen. The text continues in a similar vein. According to Fairclough (2003), such language features in text serve to reduce the dialogical nature of texts, reducing and suppressing voices and altering which voices are represented and responded to. Excessive use of such literary techniques can be seen as part of a hegemonic struggle of political forces to have their particular visions and representations of the world attain universal status.

A brief look at the above passage from Cullen (2006) reveals close to 50 per cent of the passage is taken up by assumptions and non-modalised assertions which essentially shut down arguments and discussions as to what are the issues and future for PNG in relation to HIV. This high percentage indicates an attempt to produce or reproduce hegemony (i.e. put forward one particular representation of PNG and HIV as a reality).

Reading these assumptions, two knowledge claims seem apparent. One of these knowledge claims is about who are the experts in understanding HIV and AIDS in PNG. The article suggests that part of what makes someone an expert on PNG HIV and AIDS is being in consensus with the views of the HIV and AIDS situation mentioned in this article. This is evident in the first three sentences where Cullen (2006) claims that “the time for doubt is over” and that only a “grim future” can be seen from analysing “political statements, government reports, scientific debate and the remarks of international health officials”. The experts who know the situation, therefore, are the governments, politicians, scientists and international health officials. And it is these experts who speak for PNG peoples and not the PNG peoples themselves. They also speak for PNG peoples as one coherent undifferentiated people, although at the same time the article mentions “cultural diversity” as one of the problems facing PNG. As such, the

---

71 Non-modalised assertions are very similar to assumptions in that they make assertions about how reality is and what is known. Non-modalised assertions (unlike modalised assertions) don’t assert any possibility that there might be a different way of viewing reality or a different take on what is known. Unlike assumptions they can be attributed to the individual writer/speaker and not a reference to a whole ‘world of texts’. “The time for doubt is over” is one example of a non-modalised assertion.

72 According to NVIVO, 48.83 per cent of the first page of Cullen’s (2006) article is a mixture of assumptions, metaphors and non-modalised assertions.
Orientalist tradition of claiming diversity in the Orient, while essentially reproducing the same image of the Orient/Oriental, seems to be present throughout these expert testimonies. In Chapter 3 I discussed that PNG is a highly diverse country, with over 372 spoken languages. I also explained how not engaging this diversity leads to problems in HIV and AIDS development work. Yet the experts to whom Cullen refers seem to reduce diversity down to a set of known core deficiencies in PNG and its peoples.

These core deficiencies are, by and large, related to the second knowledge claim expressed directly and indirectly in the assumptions, and in metaphors such as “a devastating time bomb”. This claim is that PNG peoples’ core deficiency is essentially the same as that of African people. Cullen’s quote from Macleod essentially sums up the core deficiencies of Africa, and subsequently Papua New Guinea, as “lack of development, tribalism and cultural diversity, the country’s difficult geography, the culture of violence towards women, the promiscuity, the lack of medical doctors and the dependency on AIDS funding from outside”. These deficiencies, for the most part, can be summarised by the metaphor ‘like Africa’. For example, all that Malau has to say is “Given the current situation … we could go the same way as many sub-Saharan African countries.” The current situation logically implies that Africa’s supposed deficiencies are present in PNG.

What is also clear is that what is being assumed is that, ‘like Africa’, left to its own devices Papua New Guinea will fall into disaster due to HIV. Terms like “time bomb exploding” as well as the psyche around “African HIV” produce a fear-filled image of PNG’s future. Thus Cullen’s paper is making a call for intervention and control of the situation. Implied is that it is the role of mainstream development to intervene.

These features, I argue, show the reproduction of Orientalisms. It defines certain people as experts, many of whom are Western, or indigenous informants to Western enterprise, as having the capacity to know PNG, people and place. What these experts ‘know’ is that PNG peoples are deficient in ways that present PNG as both scary and requiring mainstream development to intervene and control. This, Said (2003) claims, is a fundamental aspect of Orientalism: to produce knowledge of the Other that is fearful (or threatening), and which justifies a need to control the Other. Orientalisms also works through the reductive repetition technique, where the Orientalist, who, on the surface may acknowledge the diversity in the Orient, nevertheless constantly and repeatedly reduces the Orient’s multiple manifestations of
civilisation (its histories, traditions, ideologies, practices, arts etc) to a singular theory of the Orient.

I argue that the repeated use of such assumptions through the entire passage above from Cullen (2006), not to mention the whole article, shows that this aspect of Orientalisms is present in this text. Yet it is also clear from the passage that Cullen has incorporated a number of different texts from a variety of genres including reports, government papers and political speeches that also repeat this singular theory of PNG HIV and AIDS. As such, Cullen’s report provides evidence that mainstream PNG HIV and AIDS development work has incorporated reductive repetition from Orientalisms into its constructions of the PNG HIV and AIDS situation.

The metaphors that liken PNG to a time bomb, or Africa73, provide the strongest means by which the process of reductive repetition is carried out. Metaphors have more of an emotional/poetic quality to them. This enables metaphors, more so than other assumptions, to spread Orientalisms through what Said (2003) calls a poetic process, whereby the vacant or anonymous reaches of distance (i.e. unknown peoples and places) are converted into meaning for us, here. What matters more in the end is the spreading of metaphors and not the apparent facts on which they were based. In the next section I will explore this further, looking in detail how the ‘like Africa’ metaphor perpetuates Orientalisms and how it is strengthened through the emotional quality of the metaphor. To do this I will use techniques from Critical Discourse Analysis that enable three forms of assumption to be distinguished.

5.3 The African Metaphor and Orientalisms (The Role of Assumptions)

In this section I look at the works of several other ‘experts’ in the field of HIV and AIDS development, to investigate how research, with the proper linguistic trigger, has used the like Africa metaphor as either: an essential assumption about what exists; a propositional assumption about what is, can or will be; or a value assumption about what is desirable. It will

73 Speaking of ‘Africa’ in this way is also Orientalising in that it ignores the incredible diversity (of culture, income, political systems, religions, nation states, languages... etc) within Africa. This will be discussed later in this chapter.
also show how all three types of assumption play an important role in the (re)production of Orientalisms. For example, an essential assumption can state that the imaginative geographies and constructs of the Orientalist are actually real and accessible. Propositional assumptions enable knowledge of what the Orient is/how it will react, while value assumptions may enable knowledge that suggests it is good to intervene and deal with the Orient. Therefore what makes a metaphor such as ‘like Africa’ so powerful, is that it can function as all three types of assumption, with the proper linguistic trigger (Fairclough, 2003).

The ‘like Africa’ Essential Assumptions

The following quote illustrates how ‘like Africa’ works as an essential assumption.

> There is a real fear among authorities in the National Health Department and among practising physicians that PNG will follow the pattern of Africa and in the 1990s will suffer the enormous consequences of depopulation which is now beginning to become reality in parts of Africa. (Hughes, 1991 pg 137)

The above quote it is interesting in that all three forms of assumption are present in it. For example the word “fear” triggers a value assumption that one should feel the HIV and AIDS situation in PNG is ruinous to PNG. Also because the health department and physicians “fear”, it can be assumed that PNG will follow Africa. As such this quote assumes a common ground about what is good and what will happen in the future through a literal expression of fear.

What I particularly wish to analyse are the essential assumptions that are present in this quote. The first of these is triggered by the word “there” in the phrase “there is a real fear”. What is assumed by this quote is that health professionals in PNG are only feeling one emotion when it comes to HIV and AIDS in PNG, and that emotion is fear. This assumption, therefore, does not allow for dialogue around different emotions being felt by health professionals, and for the future of HIV and AIDS in PNG. Implicit in this assumption is that a solution and control of this situation can’t come from within the country alone because the health professionals within the country fear they can’t stop the ‘like Africa’ scenario. It also equates PNG, at least in relation to HIV, to being a fearful place, that one should approach the situation with a sense of fear and caution. This sense of fear and caution is directed at an imagined (i.e. Orientalised) Papua New Guinean people, which is one aspect of Orientalisms.
Secondly, there is an essential assumption triggered by the phrase “the pattern of Africa”, namely that there is a uniquely African (or sub-Saharan African) HIV and AIDS epidemic by which to compare the situation in Papua New Guinea. At this point it is important to consider the works of Stillwaggon (2003) and Farmer (1992, 2006) (see 2.3) whose research indicates that racism and cultural imperialism is deeply embedded in much of the knowledge that was taught to other scientists and development workers in order to produce this “pattern of Africa”. Farmer noted that racism, and (misplaced) blame for infecting Americans with HIV and AIDS, shaped how the United States devised HIV and AIDS policy in Haiti. He then noted that these ways of making and conceiving policy were transferred to Africa, influencing how HIV and AIDS development work was applied there.

Yet a more direct look at the impact of racism on African HIV and AIDS development work can be seen in Stillwaggon’s (2003) work on keynote African HIV and AIDS literature. Stillwaggon (2003) showed how those in HIV and AIDS development policy and research were quite willing to learn or accept certain forms of knowledge and solutions to HIV and AIDS due to racialised attitudes about Africans. She too was particularly interested in the power of metaphors, which she argued were being used to explain African sexuality, in the process racialising Africans. She focused on the metaphor Homo Ancestralis to explain sexual behaviour patterns as being particularly powerful in (poetically) endowing Africans with an essentialising quality that was distinctly Other. The reference and linking to the ancestral Africa has the ability to evoke the racialised science of the 19th and early 20th century. Because of the sexually transmitted nature of HIV, it is particularly strong in linking the sexual desires of the surrogate self, represented in 19th century racial science, to Africa. This essentialises Africa and Africans as a primitive, wild, and hyper-sexualised Other. Through researchers imagining this essential pan-African quality, Africans become a product to be known, and studied. According to Said (1985), this product, at its essence, is unchanging. This enables HIV policy ‘experts’ to know African behaviour/sexuality and devise plans to control it in order to stop the spread of HIV and AIDS. On the basis of this knowledge of Africa and Africans, behavioural approaches (like the ABC method74) would seem to be the only real solution to the African HIV and AIDS crisis. Stillwaggon also notes that who will be classified as an African HIV and AIDS expert is also

---

74 See Chapter 3 for more information on behavioral approaches and the ABC method.
affected by the ‘Homo Ancestralis’ metaphor. As more and more of those involved in the field of African HIV and AIDS development take up this metaphor, the more it is only people who believe in the Western, racialised image of Africa who are deemed as knowing the African HIV and AIDS situation. Hence Stillwaggon paints a picture in which African HIV and AIDS development has accepted Orientalisms as a way to define who and what can be known about HIV and AIDS.

Therefore when the metaphor ‘PNG is like Africa’ is evoked, this Orientalised African HIV AIDS situation is linked with the situation in PNG. This metaphor has been repeated in numerous other articles about PNG HIV and AIDS. Through this repetition75 Papua New Guineans become Orientalised as essentially ‘African’ with ‘African sexuality’. This ‘African sexuality’ constructs Papua New Guineans as wild and hyper-sexualised. Such constructions imply a people whose desires and emotions are raw. Having a behavioural approach (like the ABC prevention method) that is ‘proven’ in Africa, facilitates and justifies a behavioural approach in PNG. Thus this metaphor helps behavioural approaches to take precedence over other ways of dealing with HIV and AIDS. As much of mainstream HIV and AIDS development research has championed behavioural approaches, this metaphor helps to strengthen the validity for the continuance of such forms of research.

In the early period of the PNG HIV and AIDS epidemic, this linking to Africa through the metaphor would have had a particular emotional benefit because it would have enabled ‘experts’ to know what was an essentially unknown PNG epidemic and have given them a direction and authority by which to try and control this epidemic. As such, the metaphor had the ability to alleviate feelings of confusion, discomfort and disorientation that might have been felt by policy experts. Also, as so much more is written (and therefore known) about African HIV, the policy expert may have felt more confident in ‘dealing with’ or legislating, actions in PNG. These emotional benefits may help sustain some HIV and AIDS development researchers.

75 It is only through constant repetition that Orientalism gains its hegemony, according to Said (2003).
The ‘like Africa’ Propositional and Bridging Assumptions

The following quote gives an example of how the ‘like Africa’ metaphor can function as a propositional assumption.

AusAID (2006) financed a recent study that assessed the effect of HIV/AIDS on GDP using an HIV/AIDS prevalence and GDP impact function published by the International Labour Organization. The relationship, derived mainly from African countries, focused on the economic impact of the premature deaths of productive adults. This model estimated that 10% prevalence in PNG by 2025 would decrease GDP growth by 1.3%.

(Asian Development Bank, 2005)

This quote comes from a section of an Asian Development Bank report that uncritically summarises the results of three economic impact studies to assess how PNG will be affected by HIV. All three studies used information “derived” from African countries in order to predict the future of PNG. The word “derived” in the above sentences triggers a propositional assumption. It essentially tells the reader that because academics know what happened in Africa, they will know what will happen in PNG. Such a claim only makes sense with the proposition that PNG is like Africa. This assumption thus makes a bridge between, what is occurring in culturally and geographically separate and diverse locations in Africa, and the localities of PNG.

In making such a propositional assumption, Orientalised knowledge of Africa is uncritically transferred to PNG. One could argue that the same (imagined and homogenous) cultural characteristics of Africans are now attributed to all Papua New Guinean people. This, despite the fact that there are millions of people and hundreds of languages and cultures in this area (as indeed there are throughout Africa). This process may be part of a broader process in which all of Africa and all of the Pacific have been “Africanized” by many Western governments, media organisations, and researchers to be essentially the same homogenised group (Chappell, 2005). Africanizing both these areas ignores the great deal of diversity within the Pacific and African governments and communities.

These assumptions are particularly powerful and efficient in achieving one of the most important goals of Orientalisms, which is to make an area accessible to the ‘West’ (or the policy expert). At the start of NHASP, which signified the beginning of a concerted research effort to tackle HIV and AIDS in PNG, there was very limited research or knowledge about HIV
and AIDS in PNG (National AIDS Council of Papua New Guinea, 2008). At the same time Elizabeth Pisani (2008) mentions that there was, comparatively, a great deal of research, funding and interest in African HIV and AIDS research. So, from an HIV and AIDS development policy perspective, very little would be known about PNG if one did not rely on this propositional assumption. PNG, in relation to HIV, would remain essentially unknowable and therefore inaccessible. Because of this assumption, however, the policy ‘expert’ has the wealth of all the knowledge from Africa on which to base research and policies for PNG. Hence when the ‘like Africa’ metaphor works as a propositional assumption it can achieve one of the functions of Orientalisms, which is to make the unknown knowable (Said, 2003).

This assumption is beneficial from an emotional perspective also. One reason is it can alleviate the disorientation of not knowing the situation and not producing reports that will be ‘accepted’ by the mainstream development community/funders (who, by and large, have accepted the ‘like Africa’ assumption). Another emotional benefit comes from the fact that if one accepts this assumption, work in PNG becomes more globally relevant. That is because if PNG, Africa and the Caribbean are essentially the same, any knowledge claim made about PNG is relevant to at least Africa and the Caribbean also. Therefore accepting this Orientalist trope makes any work more significant in the eyes of other researchers and possible funders. This is beneficial both politically and emotionally; there is much academic ego around works being more globally relevant and applicable beyond the location in which a study took place.

The ‘like Africa’ Value Assumptions

There are value assumptions in many of the above quotes, as well as in the following:

We have known for almost as long as HIV/AIDS has been identified that Melanesia was in danger of a serious AIDS epidemic. One reason is that the mode of HIV transmission is (apart from ensuing vertical transmission from mother to child) almost entirely heterosexual. The other reason is that sexual intercourse outside marriage is treated fairly tolerantly in Melanesia, as it is in sub-Saharan Africa. (Caldwell, 2000 pg 2)

This quote illustrates a value assumption in the use of the word “danger” which makes African sexual practice seem undesirable. A value assumption is also made by linking Melanesia to sub-Saharan Africa through the phrase “in Melanesia, as it is in sub-Saharan Africa”. This is because, in the West, there has been much Orientalised research conducted that has reproduced a dichotomy in which the West is seen as good/desirable and sub-Saharan Africa
as undesirable, failing on many socio-economic issues like HIV and AIDS, economy and violence. In other words, there is an Orientalist value system that the writer can assume the reader shares. This assumption of shared value system is powerfully illustrated by the use of ‘We’ at the beginning of the quote “we have known...”. This assumption implies that if the Melanesians are doing anything like the sub-Saharan Africans, it must be undesirable. By using sentiments like these, African sexual behaviours are implied to be undesirable and the mainstream (Western) behavioural change programs are necessary/desirable.

Such value assumptions are inherently emotional. They prompt a feeling of negativity towards a Papua New Guinean form of sexuality and, through its rejection, a feeling of positive association with a non African/Papua New Guinean (i.e. conservative Western) form of sexuality. In particular, the assumption reinforces a positive association towards what are perceived as traditional Western understandings and behaviours around marriage. Thus it achieves another goal of Orientalisms, that is, to give the West a sense of an identity. Work based on such assumptions would be more likely to be positively received by the Western institutions that are the main funders of the HIV and AIDS research. Such research would therefore be more likely to receive funding in the future.

One important thing to consider about value assumptions, or all assumptions for that matter, is that they only exist/work when there is a shared belief (Fairclough, 2003). From reading Kuhn (1970) and Stillwaggon (2003) shared beliefs and assumptions can be viewed as possibly the markers of an exemplar paradigm based on Orientalisms. How this process occurs is investigated in the next section.

5.4 The teaching of African Comparisons in PNG HIV and AIDS and its Emotional Impacts

In the above section I demonstrated that African comparisons are a form of Orientalism. I also showed that it benefited development research and researchers both academically and emotionally to rely on this Orientalism. I also mentioned that metaphors and assumptions are

76 Though of course, this is just a constructed sexuality too, because sex outside marriage is also tolerated (even celebrated) in many Western countries.
a sign that fellowship and community (i.e. consensus) has been formed. In this section I look at how the practices of development research work to produce an exemplar paradigm by teaching other academics and development workers to accept and implement an Orientalist solution. As discussed in Chapter 2, an exemplar paradigm is created when researchers structure their way of thinking and enacting their research around an example of how to conduct research from elsewhere. As more researchers take up the example, the hegemonies of Orientalisms spread. Here, I investigate how the knowledge claim/Orientalist trope that, the HIV and AIDS epidemic in PNG is ‘like the African’ HIV and AIDS situation, is supported by the practices of development research more broadly. I particularly focus on research from the time of the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP). I specifically investigate three practices that are important to the dissemination/teaching of research to other researchers. These are: conferences; keynote talks and commissioned works of multinational (development) organisations; and the knowledge claims of people who are deemed experts in HIV and AIDS.

Conference Papers and Talks

Throughout my research I acquired conference papers and talks given on HIV and AIDS in PNG. Reading this material I noted that many conference papers made comparisons between Africa and PNG. One example was Hauquitz, Usurup, Tinkena and Selve's (2007) comparisons between antenatal clinics in rural South Africa and the antenatal clinic in Port Moresby General Hospital. Another example was Bakkali’s (2007) rundown of monitoring and evaluation of HIV and AIDS programs which, while it referred to many countries, was heavily skewed towards making a comparison with Africa, particularly with regard to sexual practices. Thus these papers reproduced the propositional assumption that PNG was ‘like Africa’ and conveyed it to the development researchers and policy experts who read them, or were present at associated talks.

Such banal practices as sharing knowledge at conferences is one example of how the exemplar that PNG is ‘like Africa’ can be shared and taken up by scientists. As this exemplar is also Orientalist, it is also a way to reinforces Orientalisms. A review of the publically available conference talks suggests that HIV/AIDS development researchers and policymakers shared
the idea that the HIV and AIDS epidemic in PNG is like that in Africa. For example at the “Gender, Sexuality and Culture” conference, Lukere (2001) stated:

From the start, HIV appeared predominantly heterosexual and PNG was seen as the Pacific nation most vulnerable to a severe, sub-Saharan-style HIV epidemic. (Lukere 2001 pg 5)

Another example is Mr. Robert G. Aisi’s (Ambassador/Permanent Representative of Papua New Guinea to the United Nations) statement at the Pacific Islands Forum:

Papua New Guinea is now in a generalised epidemic. Infection rates could follow a similar trajectory as those of sub-Saharan Africa if allowed to continue unchecked. (Aisi, 2006 pg 3)

In the above two quotes it seems that Africa is used as a warning of disaster to the people and governments of PNG if they do not change their ways. Warnings tend to make people feel their actions are wrong, and tend to direct people away from certain behaviours. The warnings are also functioning to produce value assumptions about Africa and an uncontrolled or “unchecked” PNG. A non-Papua New Guinean witnessing the warning given to PNG peoples could experience feelings of fear, as PNG peoples are portrayed as undertaking risky behaviour that can lead to a ‘like Africa’ disaster. Thereby the values of Orientalisms are shared and strengthened through conferences and talks.

At the same time, these talks give the reader a way of conceptualising the PNG HIV and AIDS problem, and that’s like the problem faced in Africa. So through expressing this belief at talks, HIV and AIDS experts are giving their listeners an example by which to conceptualise the PNG HIV and AIDS epidemic.

The 2007 AusAID/National AIDS Council of PNG (NAC) funded a conference called the ‘National Research Workshop’. This workshop was particularly important because its purpose was to collect and share what was known about HIV and AIDS in PNG. It was specifically designed that way because AusAID and the NAC felt there were large gaps in the collection and sharing of information. Thus, this conference can be seen as specifically designed to teach and discuss

---

77 This was particularly the case in the early 2000s.
potential solutions and understandings of PNG HIV and AIDS, in order to make a more coherent representation of the issue. At this conference a CD was handed-out to participants, which contained many of the speakers’ talks as well as exemplar papers and documents that conference organisers deemed important to share. More than 1 in 4 of these papers and talks made reference to Africa. Although not the majority of papers, this statistic still indicates a significant amount of discussing, sharing and ultimate reproduction of an Orientalist perspective. The papers also reproduced the idea that Africa can be seen as an example of how to do HIV and AIDS research in PNG.

I believe the number of mentions that linked PNG to Africa might have been down on previous conferences because this talk happened at the end of the NHASP. By this time two things are likely to have occurred. Firstly, the African metaphor may have been assumed knowledge among policy researchers, so did not need to be expressed as much; indeed there were several talks that I listened to at this conference that expressed a view that PNG was headed for a ‘like Africa’ disaster without mentioning Africa. However a reduction in the use of the ‘like Africa’ metaphor could also be a sign of resistance to the prevailing metaphor. Indeed some conference goers said to me “some people believe that HIV and AIDS is spreading for the same reasons it is spreading in Africa, but we don’t say that anymore because some PNG people found it offensive and got angry” (Researcher at NAC workshop Pers. Comm., 3/10/2007). Such communications suggest that sometimes emotional resistances to Orientalisms can reduce the spread and teaching of Orientalist solutions to social problems. In addition some papers also showed signs of resistance to the ‘like Africa’ solution to PNG HIV and AIDS. Oxfam’s (2007) paper, in particular, challenged the prevailing metaphor. The slides for this talk included a number of dot points focusing on why PNG was not like Africa and providing evidence as to how PNG was different from Africa, and how these claims of similarity could not, and should not, be made. Such works indicate that conferences can also function to seed new example solutions that can resist Orientalist discourse.

The information shared at conferences showed that the African analogy was often used for emotional/dramatic effect. For example, an editorial from the PNG Medical Journal on the conference CD stated that:

Alan Hauquitz’ sobering contribution, ‘Looking down the barrel of a cannon: the potential economic costs of HIV/AIDS in Papua New Guinea’ (27), uses macro-level
data-sets to present findings from literature reviews that bear witness to the struggles of sub-Saharan Africans. (Hammar, 2004 pg 5)

By using the phrase “looking down the barrel of a cannon”, a sense of danger and fear is evoked. One feels as if they are facing an almost inevitable death if they cannot quickly get out of the way. One gets the sense that PNG is in terrible danger. This effect is further heightened by the reference to the struggles of sub-Saharan Africa, an area that in many people’s psyches seems to have been ‘blasted’ by this metaphorical cannon. Thus, development researchers’ desire to elicit a strong emotional response from their audiences provides an avenue by which Orientalisms can be taught to others.

This effect can also be seen in the following talk notes from one of the presentations at the conference:

The PNG epidemic has many of the features of an African epidemic – [with] explosive, heterosexual transmission and isolated and rural communities. (PNGIMR, 2007)

In the above quote, emotive words tend to give PNG sexual activity a wild and violent quality through the word “explosive” as well as a sense of vulnerability through the word “isolated”. The use of this emotive imagery heightens the potential impact of these articles on the researchers and development workers listening. Said (2003) claims that Orientalisms have an emotive aspect to them. One can gather from the previous two quotes this emotive aspect of Orientalisms is shared by development researchers and policy experts in their talks and conferences. As such, ‘like Africa’ quotes may be a way of trying to give an exemplar about how one should feel about HIV and AIDS in PNG.

Yet this emotive aspect of Orientalisms is often invoked so researchers can advocate or justify their personal preference for how to (attempt to) control the PNG HIV and AIDS epidemic, and consequently the peoples of PNG. This is illustrated in the following quotes:

Even before Papua New Guinea’s first reported case of AIDS in 1987, observers recognized that conditions favoured the sexual spread of the virus. Rates of other sexually transmitted infections were already among the highest in the world (Papua New Guinea 1996, 51; Hammar 1998; Jenkins and Passey 1998)... While PNG’s epidemic is still classed as in the early stages, commentators seem to agree that it will follow the sub-Saharan course unless rapid gains are made in prevention. (Luker, 2003)
Once again, a sense of fear is being produced, this time by hearing sexually transmitted infections (STIs) were already among the highest in the world before the onset of AIDS. This produces a sense that HIV and AIDS have found their element in PNG, just as in Africa. The solution proposed, or that which will alleviate this fear, is expressed through the use of phrases like “rapid gains in prevention [programs]”. The prevention methods largely revolved around behavioural change. Behavioural change is the mainstream’s development example of how to deal with HIV and AIDS, and it largely originated from Africa (Stillwaggon, 2003). Hence the Orientalist tropes present in the ‘like Africa’ metaphor only gives a limited range of standardised solutions to the problem. One might be more inclined to accept these solutions due to fear prompting them to act quickly, and these solutions are already on hand/established.

What can be taken from the above quotes is that, although not wholly accepted at conference talks, there is an attempt to teach people how to apply the Orientalist trope that PNG and Africa (as in HIV and AIDS) are essentially the same. What is also clear is that although subconscious, this is just as much about teaching people how to feel, as it is to teach them what to think. This is also reflected in the following analysis of commissioned papers.

**Commissioned papers**

In a development setting, commissioned research about HIV and AIDS in PNG is particularly influential in teaching people how to envision PNG HIV and AIDS and define its solutions. This is because it is often large international development agencies that are commissioning these works, and thus the information created in these documents plays an important role in defining their actions. If international development agencies agree on some, or all, aspects of a commissioned work, they will try to both teach and apply the logic to all the locations in which they operate. In doing so they spread the reach of their exemplar paradigm. Therefore, if development agencies agree with the notion that PNG is like Africa, then the exemplar that PNG is like Africa can begin to be applied in all areas where the development agency works.

Commissioned works are probably the strongest link between development research and development policy and thus are likely to influence development policy and action.\(^78\)

---

\(^78\) This will be explored later in Chapter 8 and touched upon in Chapter 7.
Commissioned papers that rely on Orientalisms can therefore strengthen Orientalist practices far beyond the site for which the research was produced.

Commissioned research papers were analysed for their content on HIV and AIDS, as described in 4.3. It was found that commissioned research papers tended to use images and information from Africa which linked the African circumstance to the PNG HIV and AIDS circumstance. For example, in a discussion paper for the European Centre for Development Policy Management, Africa was used to frame the scale of the problem in PNG:

> A 2004 newspaper editorial suggested that ‘the spread of HIV/AIDS has gone past the stage of being an epidemic. No longer is it an epidemic spreading rapidly through a community but a pandemic spreading over the whole nation. International experts now say PNG faces the threat of an AIDS pandemic of sub-Saharan Africa proportions unless enormous efforts are taken to stem the virus spread’. (Bloger, Filer and Hauck, 2005 pg 5)

Once again there is the use of fear to portray the seriousness of the issue. Words such as “epidemic” and “pandemic” are imbued with a sense of fear and alarm. They are used to convey a sense of urgency of the problem, and attempt to stir international development agencies into action. Such techniques are common in a development research setting. Pisani (2008) mentions use of similar techniques to try to get aid organisations and national institutions to feel emotionally compelled to engage with the HIV and AIDS crisis in a number of areas of the globe. In other words, Africa is being conveyed as a threat to propel PNG development workers and organisations into action. Thus there is a strong sense that PNG is ‘like Africa’ and that, without direct action/development aid, its people will act just like Africans. Therefore the fear inherent in this quote does not just urge the reader of these papers into action; it inclines them towards certain actions that are consistent with the ‘like Africa’ paradigm. Quotes like these also have a tendency to limit the types of actions undertaken by development agencies, because it is implied that if the problems are ‘like African’ HIV and AIDS problems, ergo a development agency should act on the problems using the same methods as those used on African HIV and Aids problems. This once again means

---

79 African approaches were mainly through behavioural-change campaigns which particularly focused on ‘Abstain, Be faithful or use a Condom’. This was primarily the approach outlined for PNG (see Chapter 3).
the exemplar of Africa is imposed onto places in PNG. In doing so, a powerful Orientalism is reproduced.

Commissioned work for AusAID, the primary funder of all HIV and AIDS development work in the country, had numerous examples of the African situation being used as the framework for discussing HIV/AIDS in PNG. These papers were often more than just calls to action; they also proposed solutions to the issue to stop an African-like fate. The solutions proposed seemed to have, at their heart, the original warning and threat that PNG, left unchecked, would have an HIV and AIDS “disaster” “like Africa’s”. Over the course of the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP), knowledge from Africa was thus used to define development policy and action in PNG. An example can be seen in the following quote.

NHASP convened home care workshops in August 2003 and April 2004 and organised and funded a study tour to South Africa, Zambia, Kenya, Uganda and Senegal in November 2003 for 9 key stakeholders to examine home care experiences. (AusAID, 2006)

Home Care for People Living with HIV and AIDS (PLWHA) is practised in numerous countries and continents around the world. Yet, in the above quote, it seems for the nine key stakeholders, who would have a lot of influence over the direction of home care in PNG, only the African home care experience was deemed worth studying. Inherent in these choices is an assumption that PNG is more like Africa than Thailand or Australia. Thus, at least implicitly, AusAID is teaching these nine key stakeholders the exemplar of Africa, and they may then go on to teach others this exemplar. Such claims help to strengthen Orientalisms’ hold, as the key stakeholders are taught to do home-based care the way that Africans do home-based care.

The next quote shows how PNG’s future, in relation to HIV, is being mapped out and envisioned through the impacts of HIV and AIDS in African countries:

This study explores the potential economic impact of HIV/AIDS in PNG. It focuses on the macroeconomic and sectoral impacts for PNG if an epidemic should follow along the paths of selected countries in sub-Saharan Africa. The results demonstrate the potential for HIV/AIDS to exacerbate poverty in PNG, an issue of great concern to the PNG government and its development partners. (Centre for International Economics, 2002 pg 7)
In this quote, workers at the Centre for International Economics (2002) have implicitly agreed that a proportional change in a macro-economic data set of an African country will have a similarly proportional change in PNG’s macro-economic data sets because PNG is like Africa. The Centre for International Economics (2002) is therefore teaching people involved in PNG development that what is defined as the solutions to African HIV and AIDS problems are also the definitions of the solutions to the PNG HIV and AIDS problems. Interestingly, through this process it can also confirm or justify the emotion of fear or “great concern” that was often associated with the assumption that PNG’s HIV and AIDS epidemic was like that in Africa. This is because using evidence that is only valid through this assumption can confirm the sense of fear that one might have towards PNG’s HIV and AIDS situation. Perhaps without this confirmation the emotion would not make sense and therefore not stay associated with PNG (Davidson and Milligan, 2004). This indicates that exemplar paradigms might be one way in which certain people and places get imbued with certain emotional qualities. In the next quote, the writers make claims of PNG’s similarity to Uganda, Mozambique or Indonesia, in terms of health outcomes and Sector Wide Approaches (SWAps) for delivery of development assistance, without providing any justification for this claim.

As part of the design process for the new HIV and AIDS Program, AusAID commissioned a study about the role of government in HIV and AIDS responses. This study examined the current PNG government’s response to the epidemic, strategic opportunities for future support to the GoPNG, and responses made by decentralised governments in countries with some similarities of context (i.e. similar health outcomes and SWAps for the delivery of development assistance) – Uganda, Mozambique and Indonesia. (National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2006 pg 16)

These quotes also show that the comparisons between Africa and PNG were not always directly stated; rather they were implied through the HIV and AIDS research that would attribute the findings from Africa as an indicator for what is happening in Papua New Guinea. Policy recommendations were then made for PNG, based on the African findings. For example, Patrick (2005), in his review of AusAID’s multi-sectoral HIV initiatives in Papua New Guinea, claims that in order to understand what is a good practice for mainstreaming in PNG, one needs to “reflect on the wide body of [HIV&AIDS] literature, particularly drawing on responses to the epidemic in Africa” (Patrick, 2005 pg 18). What becomes clear from Patrick’s (2005) statement, and the two quotes above, is that the African exemplar teaches people in development to solve their problems by applying African data to their problems or issues.
In other words, African literature was often used to fill in gaps in understanding of PNG’s circumstance, thus linking the way people view the HIV epidemic in PNG, to Africa. By filling in the gaps with African literature, Africa more and more became the exemplar for PNG, and Orientalisms are reproduced. This is exemplified in the following quote.

Limited data [was] available... on the impact of HIV on [Papua New Guinean] families, but more extensive information of this kind is available for Thailand\(^80\) and several African countries, and was used in a qualitative way to indicate the **household impact**, as measured by the potential loss of income and expenditure of funds arising through HIV-related illness and death. (AusAID, 2006 pg 10)

This quote suggests that an image of PNG is being formed through the use of other data from, particularly African, countries. At the time of this paper the structures in place in PNG did not function well enough for the researchers to make the appropriate statistics in a manner fitting with the research constraints for commissioned papers, such as agreed definitions of appropriate statistics. By accepting the African exemplar they could use African data instead.

There is an important emotional component to such a decision. If development policy researchers did not make the assumption that PNG was like Africa, then there would be no example on how to act, what tools to use, or how to overcome deficits in knowledge. The academic could easily be at a loss as to what to do.

This is the sort of situation that Ahmed (2006) described as causing disorientation in an individual (see Chapter 2). Such disorientations have a highly emotive and often unpleasant quality to them. Such feelings of disorientation can be overcome by the assumption that PNG is like Africa. The researchers and the reader are given an orientation and direction for PNG through the information available in Africa. With direction, the emotive qualities of doubt and confusion that are so often associated with disorientation are also eased. This could mean that by teaching others that PNG is like Africa, researchers are teaching people how to overcome

\(^{80}\) Note, this is the only time Thailand is mentioned in the document. Africa is mentioned on several other occasions to indicate how PNG GDP will be affected and the potential problems that could face AIDS orphans in PNG.
some of their more unpleasant emotions. Yet at the same time development researchers are teaching other development researchers/workers how to reproduce Orientalisms.

Keynote research is, by definition, presented by people who are deemed experts in the field. Experts are particularly adept at teaching other researchers and policy makers exemplar problems and solutions. This is because there tends to be a social consensus that an expert’s claims are based on acceptable scientific or social scientific processes (Mitchell, 2002, Stich and Nisbett, 1984, Kuhn, 1970). Therefore someone who is deemed an expert in a field has more sway over negotiations, and people will often defer to them or incorporate their ideas into their ways of researching.

Experts responsible for driving PNG HIV and AIDS policy were often people who had a number of years’ experience researching African HIV and AIDS. The transfer of these social research experts from the African HIV and AIDS circumstance to the PNG circumstance is an important way in which the knowledge about African HIV and AIDS problems became the exemplar for how to know PNG’s HIV and AIDS problems.

For example, John C. Caldwell is an eminent HIV and AIDS policy expert responsible for some of the earlier keynote research that drove the direction of HIV and AIDS research in Africa (Stillwaggon, 2003). His contribution was critically discussed above (5.2 and in Chapter 2), as it was in one of his papers that the metaphor Homo Ancestralis was mentioned. At the time of the NHASP, his expertise was used to evaluate the HIV and AIDS situation in PNG. In his paper “AIDS in Melanesia” (2000) Caldwell makes a number of statements like the following:

The evidence seems to be that the societies of the Pacific and some of Southeast Asia resemble those of Africa in having a more relaxed attitude to sexual relations, and having experienced an increasing amount of premarital and extramarital sexual relations. (Caldwell, 2000 pg 8)

A comparison is possible between the social conditions set out earlier in the report for the East and Southern African AIDS epidemic and the conditions described in Papua

81 Paper prepared for Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID) Special Seminar, November 22, 2000,
New Guinea and Melanesia more generally. There are clearly close parallels, in sexual activity outside marriage, multiple and parallel sexual partners, a high level of STIs and a lack of male circumcision. (Caldwell, 2000 pg 12)

In the above quotes Caldwell is selecting data that he sees as confirming his findings in Africa. In his expert opinion (which is inseparable from how he did research in Africa), factors such as premarital and extramarital sexual relations, multiple partners and high levels of STIs were causing the rapid spread of HIV in Africa. Due to his status as an expert, Caldwell is able to teach a number of academics and development workers to make comparisons between Africa and PNG, to solve problems to do with HIV and AIDS in PNG. Caldwell’s solutions tend to suggest that development researchers should search and collect evidence that confirms the existence of the (Orientalised) African sexual practices in PNG. Searching on these lines therefore reproduces Caldwell’s African exemplar in PNG. Caldwell can also 'teach' other development academics to follow the African exemplar by working with them on collaborative works. An example of this is Caldwell and Toua’s (2002) work. In this study, Caldwell and Toua make a number of claims that strengthen and reflect Caldwell’s (2000) original claims. Hence, on some level, Toua, through this process has learnt ways of applying the African exemplar to PNG, through negotiations and collaborations with Caldwell (Kuhn, 1970, Turnbull, 1991). It is important to note that Caldwell’s African exemplar directed his research method to find evidence of (Orientalised) African sexual practices in PNG. In doing so he was able to link the PNG HIV and AIDS circumstance to that of Africa. He has also made the way he did research in Africa the exemplar for how to do research in PNG. Part of this linking process is also about linking the fear that one might feel about the African HIV and AIDS crisis, to PNG. This can be seen in the following quote.

The other reason for fearing an epidemic of AIDS is that sexual intercourse outside marriage is treated fairly tolerantly in Melanesia, as it is elsewhere in the Pacific, in sub-Saharan Africa... (Caldwell and Toua, 2002 pg 106)

82 This would be a reciprocal process. Caldwell would have also learnt from his experience with Toua, albeit one heavily endowed with power relations that would have positioned Caldwell as the premier expert.
Implied from this quote is that relaxed practices to sex outside of marriage gives the reader another reason to fear. Hence the African exemplar is also teaching readers to link fear to the way they study HIV and AIDS in PNG.

The above quotes are packed with emotive language that uses Western stereotypes for Africans. Phrases like “relaxed attitudes to sexual relations,” “multiple and parallel sexual partners” convey an image of wild and uninhibited people. This too has now been linked to PNG. It is perhaps because of the past stereotypes and their emotive effects that such portrayals tend to ‘stick’ in Westerners’ minds more than other portrayals and possibilities for PNG. Part of the reason why quotes like this stick is because of Orientalisms. As such these quotes are reproducing and reinforcing Orientalisms. It follows, therefore, that the way social scientific data is selected is affected by the ‘stickiness’ of such emotional portrayals, and is part of the process that reproduces Orientalisms.

Caldwell is not the only so-called expert who was transferred from Africa. Cullen (2006) listed a number of other experts from Africa who drew parallels between what they saw/theorised in Africa and what they saw/theorised in PNG (see Section 5.2).

Dr Renault, who spent 16 years as a WHO representative in sub-Saharan Africa, said that HIV infections among patients at Port Moresby General Hospital had reached nearly 20 percent and that the country was likely to experience an African–style epidemic (Cullen, 2006 pg1).

The above quote states that Dr Renault has witnessed, and theorised about, HIV and AIDS issues in sub-Saharan African countries. In these countries, hospitals have experienced 20 per cent of their clients infected with HIV and AIDS. The theories about what happened in those African countries have orientated how Renault views the future of PNG (in relation to HIV and AIDS). This quote also links a sense of fear and concern for PNG’s future, with the fear and concern that the expert has experienced during his 16 years in Africa.

Kuhn (1970) and StillWaggon (2003) have shown that scientific metaphors (such as the metaphor of ‘like Africa’ used in PNG HIV and AIDS discussions) will guide other researchers in what to observe, how to make these observations, and in structuring what observations are ‘results’ (Kuhn, 1970, Stillwaggon, 2003). Thus the experts from Africa are likely to structure their observations in such a way as to draw parallels between Africa and PNG. As most HIV and AIDS development experts seem to have gained their expert status from research in Africa,
there is likely to be a tendency for them to teach other development researchers to work in ways that will reinforce the ‘like Africa’ paradigm/Orientalism.

These quotes also indicate that experts begin to transfer their feelings about Africa and African people towards PNG and PNG peoples. What this indicates is that an exemplar may not just be teaching people how to carry out (social) scientific research; an exemplar may also be telling people how to feel about who and what is being researched. Thus an exemplar paradigm of social scientific research has the potential to also guide how the researcher feel about their research subjects, just as it guides observations and results.

That’s not to say that experts (like Jenkins), whose expertise is more situated in PNG, don’t also make these comparisons to Africa. Yet as the following quotes suggest, there was much less certainty in the validity of such claims.

On the other hand, this same expert predicts that Papua New Guinea (PNG) could reach HIV levels of 4-6% because its sexual behaviour patterns are more like those in Africa. (Jenkins, 2005)

This quote was made in the context of predicting where the HIV and AIDS infection rate would level-off in PNG. This quote has a certain indifferent feel to the comparison and seems to indicate that she does not fully subscribe to the ‘African’ future for PNG as much as other experts, but entertains that possibility. The uncertainty in this claim could be a sign of resistance to the ‘like Africa’ exemplar and Orientalisms (Ahmed, 2006). Later works by Jenkins (2006) more strongly stressed the fact that PNG was not ‘like Africa’, in contrast with some of the experts from Africa.

Despite claims that PNG is experiencing an epidemic similar to those in southern Africa, PNG is not an African look-alike. While certain aspects of social structure, kinship and ritual are more like those in parts of Africa than in most of Asia, the cultures that evolved in PNG are distinctly different and their diversity covers an enormous range of beliefs, practices and structural elements relating to sex, gender

83 Jenkins’ medical anthropological research was often focused on sites in PNG but she also conducted a number of HIV and AIDS research projects in Africa (e.g. Jenkins, 2003).
and fertility/reproduction and their intrinsic relationships to all aspects of life. 
(Jenkins, 2006) 84

The tone of this quote suggests a resistance to the idea that PNG is like Africa. The emphasis on the distinct differences between Africa and PNG suggest that she is concerned about the flow-on effects of the ‘like Africa’ comparison. Yet it is important to note that her emphasis is still on behaviour as the cause of the spread of HIV/AIDS, which was the exemplar approach first produced in Africa. Even so, her uncertainty around the African exemplar opens up a possibility for dialog around alternative strategies (Fairclough 2003).

5.5 Conclusion

In this chapter I have argued that the assumptions and metaphors in statements and texts by HIV and AIDS experts can be read as signs of social agreements, consensus and fraternity among experts. I stated that they also could be a sign of hegemony. I then went on to argue that many of the statements made by development academics and experts around HIV and AIDS in PNG showed evidence of Orientalisms. I particularly focused on the prevalent use of one metaphor: that PNG’s HIV and AIDS circumstance is like Africa’s HIV and AIDS circumstance. In making this point I noted that African HIV and AIDS research had a history of Orientalisms. By focusing on looking to African HIV and AIDS research to solve HIV and AIDS issues in PNG, research effectively transferred the Orientalisms of Africa to PNG. Researching in ways that reproduced Orientalisms such as the ‘like Africa’ metaphor was largely appealing because it allowed researchers to avoid some of the most unpleasant emotions associated with research. That is, feeling lost and confused (disorientated) about the topic of research.

One of the troubling aspects of this process was that when academics did this, they effectively taught other academics to Orientalise PNG peoples in the same way. A significant part of this teaching was teaching other researchers to avoid the discomforting feelings of disorientation and confusion by Orientalising PNG and its peoples. Also, because the works described here were often the basis for what policy and procedures were justified and decided on, the

84 Despite this quote, there were still instances in this paper where assumptions that PNG was like Africa meant that Jenkins used findings from African countries to paint a picture of what was happening in PNG.
assumptions and emotions embodied in these texts had important effects on policy formation, direction and enactment. It is the emotional context that these works produce that is of greatest interest for me. The significant use of fear and worry in these texts is likely to help embody a sense of fear and worry in policy formation and in development workers on the ground. Some of this may spill on to how both policy and development workers construct PNG peoples and places. In addition, through reproducing Orientalisms in their works, development academics and policy experts have now produced documents that enable development workers and other policymakers to get a sense of confidence (and a reduction in worry) about their own policies and actions.

Yet there were also a few signs of resistance and different ways of teaching development researchers to comprehend HIV and AIDS in PNG. Uncertainty and disorientation seemed to be a common emotion associated with these resistances. Ironically, overcoming the emotions of disorientation and uncertainty was one of reasons that researchers used the ‘like Africa’ Orientalism. It is therefore likely that it is in these uncertainties that academics will find new methods of doing and teaching research. These new methods could hold the potential to produce new exemplars that can move academic inquiry beyond Orientalisms towards more effective and culturally appropriate means of addressing HIV and ADIS.

I am aware that the emotional effects of these academic texts will be largely nuanced by a vast array of other factors in play at the time of policy creation and enactment. The next chapter will investigate this further, by describing the interactions between emotions and Orientalisms in policy documents.
Chapter 6: An Investigation into the Presence of Emotions and Orientalisms in HIV and AIDS Policy Documents

6.1 Introduction

Whereas Chapter 5 focused on the role of research and expertise in HIV and AIDS development, this chapter will focus on policy. Policy is important because it marks the point where the knowledge and expertise created through research begins to be transferred into action. This chapter investigates the subtle ways in which emotions are employed in (PNG) HIV and AIDS policy documents in order to justify courses of action. It is particularly interested in how a ‘knowing’ (Western) subject is produced in these documents. I will argue that this ‘knowing’ Western subject is integral in the (re) creation of Orientalisms in policy documents. In addition, I argue that although this ‘knowing’ subject often claims an emotionless stance, it is often a subtle expression and elicitation of emotions that give it its power to construct PNG people/society, and justify courses of action.

It was evident in Chapter 5 that development researchers and experts often expressed emotion overtly. This was usually not the case with policy documents. Most secular policy was written in a way that tries to erase emotion from the document (Askew, 2009). As such, a different form of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) needs to be applied. With Chapter 5’s research documents all that was needed was to locate the assumptions, and the emotion would be self evident. In this chapter CDA will play a role in locating the emotion in the first place. I will look for certain words, phrases and grammatical features that, given the social context, show (often subtle) expression of emotion. CDA’s attention to the context in which text operates is an important consideration in this chapter, in particular the context of who is the receiver/reader of these policy documents (Fairclough 2003). For it will often be the case that although a policy itself may not express an emotion, it may elicit an emotion from a reader, due to the reader’s social and cultural background (Fairclough, 2003).

As stated in Chapter 4, I selected four policy documents that were available from HIV policy.org or which I observed in development workers’ possession during my time in PNG. Three of the four chosen documents reflected what I noted in most HIV and AIDS policy documents that I read over the course of my study, namely, an attempt to erase the emotional context of development work. These documents try to present the actions that a development worker undertakes, as emotionally vacant and detached.
A very few policy documents did acknowledge the need to embrace, and work within, the emotional context of the development settings. These documents were often problematic to me, and to the development workers I interviewed, due to the religious\textsuperscript{85} connotations often associated with them. I have included one of these documents for analysis also.


In attempting to analyse the documents for emotions, this chapter is predicated on the fact that, although writers of policy documents may try to remove emotions, there is still evidence of them. Although subtle, these emotions are important because they can reflect, promote, or resist the emotional experience of development workers, both in the field and in the policy setting. This is because emotions have the ability to create and shape subjects and subjectivities (Bondi, Davidson and Smith, 2005, Ahmed, 2004 a). They therefore have the ability to shift the thinking of development workers in ways that may go unnoticed but still affect the materiality of the situation on the ground for both development workers and their clients.

I will investigate the four policy documents and discuss four discourses of emotionality found within these documents. These were; hope or positivity, fear, frustration and disappointment and sympathy. I will particularly discuss how these emotions can draw out certain subjects and

\textsuperscript{85} The only exception to this that I found, was the guide for teachers and lecturers produced by the Teacher Education and Staff Development Division of the National Department of Education in 2006, "HIV&AIDS and Reproductive Health: Student Teacher Course Book". These works were produced in conjunction with development agencies like VSO and AusAID. These recognised the importance of teachers and lecturers as emotional beings, whose reactions were affected by emotions. They were also largely secular. Although one informant held them as exemplars of good policy documents, they were not included in the study because (i) none of my informants were involved in their creation and (ii) these documents were designed to guide Papua New Guinean teachers and lecturers and not Western development workers.
help to define their subjectivity. In doing so I will create a picture of how Orientalisms are being recreated in contemporary policy documents.

6.2 A Sense of Hope and Happiness (Positivity and Confidence)

A sense of hope and happiness was evident in all policy documents. These emotions were usually not overtly stated, but were present as a subtle positivity in text that prompted the reader to feel a certain way towards certain things. This can be seen in the following quote:

The goal of the Project is to minimise the impact of HIV/AIDS in PNG. The purpose of the Project is to support the implementation of PNG’s multi-sectoral National HIV/AIDS Medium Term Plan (MTP). (National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002)

The language in the above quote shows an attempt to talk as naturally as possible about the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP). The reader will see no emotive adjectives to prompt them to feel that this project is good or desirable. One of the main ways the text achieves this emotionless stance is by creating, as the subject of the sentence, a non-human/living agent. The agent in this sentence is the NHASP, which is essentially a series of policies around HIV and AIDS in PNG. As the NHASP is a non-living entity it subsequently appears as an unemotional entity.

Even though the NHASP itself doesn’t feel, this document is written to elicit a positive feeling in readers, towards the NHASP, through the readers’ social and cultural contexts. This is done through the emotive connotations embedded in the action words like “support” and the juxtaposition of the word “minimise” with the negative notion of “impact of HIV/AIDS”. The past (real or imagined) histories of most people with the HIV and AIDS virus tends to evoke a sense of fear and caution along with other negative connotations that means they wish to exclude it from their field of existence. Thus “minimising the impact of HIV” and supporting other people’s attempts to eradicate the virus prompts one to feel positively towards the NHASP. It seems to provide protection from something that is feared. This may draw the reader closer to, and more in line with, the aims and agendas of the NHASP.

86 See Chapter 7 for more details on how a sense of hope and happiness was felt by development workers.
One is also made to feel hopeful that the NHASP will achieve its goal. This is because both sentences in the above quote work as non-modalised assertions (see Chapter 5). They assert that the NHASP has a clear goal and purpose, while avoiding nuancing words like “try” or “may” that open up the possibilities of other (less desirable) alternatives of the NHASP. This is useful in making one feel confident in the work of the NHASP and thus helps to produce a sense of hopefulness around the NHASP. As such, this quote lends weight to the idea that writing rationally is about promoting a hierarchy of emotions, where emotions like confidence are placed higher than almost all other emotions (Schilling, 2002). This encourages the reader to feel both positive and confident about what the NHASP knows.

The reader also ‘knows’ from the above quote that the PNG Government is in need of help. This is logically implied by the purpose of the project which is to “support” the PNG Government. Therefore a sense of hopefulness, and confidence in the NHASP’s ability to help, is felt. This may prompt feelings of sympathy towards PNG (and its Government in particular) because they are in need of support. This sympathy attracts the reader towards the PNG Government and what it is trying to achieve (in relation to HIV). Yet the relationship to PNG present in this quote is asymmetric, where the reader is the sympathiser and PNG Government the sympathised, a sense of superiority in the reader’s interaction with PNG (Government) may also be promoted. As such this quote serves to function as an Orientalist trope whereby Australia/PNG interactions are envisioned through a dialectical relation that places the Australia is in the position of power (Fairclough, 2003, Said, 2003).

Although such statements only produce a subtle feeling of positivity, they were prevalent throughout the secular documents of the annual plan and development workers’ guidelines. The following is another example:

The Principles guiding Australia’s AID programs in HIV/AIDS are: ...

(ix) Enabling environments

---

87 It is important to consider that feeling under confident and insecure in what one knows, can leave one open to new knowledge and understandings in the interactions between the ‘East’/’West’ or the developed/undeveloped world.
If high risk behaviours are to be reduced supportive environments need to be established. These might include an official acknowledgment that HIV/AIDS is present in a community, supportive legal and social policies, public discussion of HIV/AIDS, equity between men and women and the development of alternative livelihoods. Activities that remove impediments to the adoption of low risk behaviours should be supported. (Broughton, 1999)

The above statement is made emotive by the repeated use of the word “supportive”. AusAID and the NHASP claim to be guided by a desire to make supportive environments. People tend to have a positive association with the word support; this tends to flow on to the Australian Government because it is supportive. Such positive flow-on effects are also increased by the use of the words “equity” and “development” in the phrase “equity between men and women and the development of alternative livelihoods”.

It is worth noting that such phrases play an important role in producing a knowing Western subject. This occurs because the reader is told that Australia’s Aid programs have principles, one of which is to be supportive. Having principles is often positively associated with concepts of wise (knowing) management. This production of a knowing/Western subject enables an Orientalist dichotomy to be reproduced in subtle ways in the above quote. It enables the reader to feel hopeful or confident in Australian policy, as the policy ensures workers know how to react (that is, in a supportive manner that promotes equity and development) in the face of “high risk” (i.e. deviant) behaviour of Third World countries.

In this way these documents are constantly promoting positive feelings towards the NHASP or AUSAIDS HIV and AIDS development work in general. In fact, the vast majority of the positive feelings of hope and happiness (positivity) are directed towards the policy goals and the policy organisation which created them.

The HIV/AIDS Management and Prevention Act (the HAMP Act) was passed by the National Parliament in June 2003. Every Member of the National Parliament voted in favour of the Act.

These New Laws are designed to protect the health of everyone by supporting the work that is being done to manage existing cases of HIV/AIDS and prevent new ones. (National AIDS Council Secretariat et al, 2004)
A positive feeling towards this policy is engendered because the reader is told that every Member of Parliament voted for this Act. This logically implies that it must be good because no one in Parliament was in objection. The text thus promotes a sense of consensus and wellbeing around the policy. The reader is also told that the policy is designed to protect the health of everyone. This too generates a positive feeling. Positive associations of a policy that is designed to protect everyone, along with a sense of consensus, can promote both a sense of confidence as well as a sense of knowing that this policy will work.

Positivity and confidence in one’s actions undoubtedly does not reflect the actualities of policy implementation, in which there must be many moments of ‘not knowing’ and doubt (see Chapters 7 and 8 for examples). The way secular policy documents are written does little to address these issues on the ground. Broughton’s (1999) Guide is a rare example of a policy document that at least accepts that there are some ‘unknowns’ and mistakes. This acknowledgment is implied through the chapter sections that regularly appear called “lessons learnt”. An example of such a section is given below:

Lessons Learnt...

Sensitivity training for staff - Women tend to stay away from government STD clinics in PNG because of the verbal abuse they commonly meet with from nurses. Training is needed to ensure greater professionalism by health workers. Promotion of a client focus must be ongoing and subject to regular review. (Broughton, 1999)

The above quote illustrates self-reflexivity and criticism in policy documents. Specifically, it implies that Australian development agencies were not investing in sensitivity training of staff, and this led to many female clients not showing up at the clinics. Even so, the title “Lessons Learnt” produces a sense that such problems are a thing of the past and again prompts one to feel positive towards the Australian AID Agencies. It also produces a sense that the policy, as it stands now, ‘knows’ how to deal with the problems of PNG HIV and AIDS development. This means that, at the same time the policy promotes a sense of confidence in its actions, it is also recreating the Orientalist tradition of a Western subject who knows how to deal with, and control, the ‘problems’ of the Third World.

More important, however, is the way the above paragraph is worded so that criticism is forced more on the PNG Government and health workers, and how they run the STD (Sexually Transmitted Diseases) clinics. There is a sense of sympathy and positivity towards AusAID for
its ‘altruistic’ attempt at trying to provide the clinics in the first place. So one may be prompted to feel anger and frustration towards PNG health workers and government in the above statement, due to a sense that an altruistic (and thus positive) program of the Australian Government was let down. There is a possibility that this quote will reproduce an Orientalist representation in the mind of the reader. For example, the reader may feel repelled, and perhaps betrayed, by the violent behaviour of the PNG nurses and think once again AusAid must step in to help PNG people become rational.

The Anglican Church policy document also expresses feelings of hope and positivity, except this document is much more overt in its statements. It uses a great deal of emotive language to express its message.

The Anglican Church of PNG will embrace the challenge of HIV and AIDS with compassion and love. We will try to break the silence and overcome ignorance so that people may understand it, but not fear it, and so they may protect themselves.... We hope for a future where we can help reverse the spread of HIV and AIDS: where there is hope not despair; love not hate and healing not hurt; and where we can live out the call of Jesus to ‘love one another’ as he loves us. (Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea, 2006)

Although this policy document was used (or at least referred to) by secular Western development workers, it is clear it was written for a more religious audience. It tries to prompt one to feel positive towards the organisation, which from this statement is highly passionate about combating the issue of HIV and AIDS in PNG. Statements like “embrace the challenge” and “we will try to break the silence” tend, like the wording of the NHASP annual plan, to engender a sense of confidence that the policy can succeed in its goals (see above). Yet unlike the NHASP annual plan, these assertions are modalised. Use of words like “try” in the above quote does open up the possibility that goals will not be achieved and that the Church and its workers might not be all-knowing.

The above quote shows a high level of altruism in phrases such as “break the silence and overcome ignorance...”. Altruism may appeal to the Western development worker, as the emotion is often interlinked with their identity (see Chapter 7). Most development workers interviewed had, and accepted, a more nuanced version of altruism than the one espoused in this document (see Chapter 7) so such strong statements of altruism may sit a little uneasily
with them. Therefore, even though this statement tries to make the development worker feel positive about the Church, it might have the opposite effect.

What is also interesting about the above quote is its clear statement of the type of emotion that it wishes the reader to feel, in the circumstances in which development work is undertaken: you should feel positive emotions like love and compassion. It also states you should not feel emotions like despair and hate. Therefore this quote is, like the secular documents, blocking or resisting the more ‘negative’ emotional experiences of despair and great frustration that development workers may feel in the field. In addition, due to the role religion plays in PNG society, claims of Jesus’ love may be appealing and positive for a number of PNG people, including PNG development workers. But some Western development workers might find these statements disconcerting instead of positive. Some of this negativity comes from Western development workers’ belief that the Church has (and in some cases continues to) used hegemonic discourses like Orientalisms to gain more power and control over indigenous peoples (Cunningham and Andrews, 1997, Trudgen, 2000, Said, 2003).

The documents from AusAID referred to working with partner organisations. AusAID policy documents were written in ways that prompt readers to feel positive and hopeful toward these partner organisations. Yet the positive feeling that the reader should have towards partner groups, was often mixed. The reader is often told to feel positive about partner groups only when they were working in line with the desires of the policy. For example, because the National HIV and AIDS Support Project (NHASP) worked in partnership with the National AIDS Council (NAC) (i.e. PNG Government), the NAC was sometimes seen in a positive light.

The Project and NACS have worked to strengthen PLWHA groups, and has involved PLWHA and the carers in documentation of their experiences within the family and community, within the health system, and with different organisations. PLWHA have

---

88 One example of this that I discussed with other development workers was the Bush administration’s decision to remove condoms as part of their overall AIDS strategy and focus on abstention due to religious grounds. Another common approach that caused me and development workers some frustration was when religious organisations taught ‘subverted’ ABC (see Chapter 3) approaches to HIV and AIDS prevention where C did not stand for condom based approach, but Christianity.
been supported to strengthen their skills in the development of materials for awareness and training through workshop participation, including participation of two PLWHAs in the recent regional HIV/AIDS conference. (National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002)

In the above quote the reader may feel a sense of positivity and hopefulness towards the NAC because it is working (with the NHASP) to strengthen PLWA groups. This implies that it is helping to strengthen the position of people living with HIV and AIDS in PNG. These people are often in a very vulnerable and difficult situation. Therefore a sense of positivity is felt towards the NAC for ‘helping’ them. Note that a feeling that the NAC and NHASP are acting altruistically may also be felt at this stage; this too may make the development worker see the NAC in a positive light. It is also evident from the above quote that the reader should once again feel positive about AusAID and the NHASP in particular. There is a sense of positivity towards PLWHA as it implies that they deserve support. Yet the comment is somewhat patronising of PLWHA, portraying them as rather passive and weak and unskilled, without the help from NAC and NHASP. So through this quote NAC and the NHASP are constructed as the ones with the knowledge and skills while the PLWHA are the ‘Other’ who is weak (in need of strengthening) and in need of control (“training”).

This sense of positivity towards the PNG Government was not common. It was much more common for the PNG Government to be viewed in a negative light, as in the comment in Broughton’s (1999) Guide above (see 6.2).

Mixed emotions are also evident in the way the secular documents from AusAID talk about the Church.

Churches - In the Pacific, PNG and the Philippines the churches are a powerful force in society in terms of attitudes to sex, sexual roles and HIV/AIDS. HIV/AIDS is sometimes regarded as a punishment for sinful behaviour. This view impacts very negatively on PLWHA. The churches are one of the foundations of social organisation and youth and women’s groups are often church based. Consequently the churches offer an
alternative avenue for IEC\textsuperscript{89} where NGOs and CBOs are not well developed.

(Broughton, 1999)

The above quote suggests that when churches do not follow the main messages of AusAID, and instead claim that HIV/AIDS is a punishment, the reader should feel negatively toward the Churches as they are “negatively impacting” on PLWHA. Yet later in the same paragraph the reader is prompted to feel positive about the Churches because, if the Churches work with the types of programs set by AusAID, they are portrayed as doing ‘good’ for the community, providing alternative avenues to communities that apparently could not be reached before. The quote produces a sense that AusAID knows the motives of churches in PNG (and the Pacific and the Philippines). This produces once again the idea that AusAID policy is all-knowing of PNG’s religion/culture. The way the quote starts out with a negative statement and then moves to a positive statement tends to suggest that AusAID ‘knows’ about the negative side of churches but ultimately is positive about them. Such subtle but important emotional shifts may work to make the reader more accepting of the Churches’ failings. This may help the confidence of development workers who might have to participate in implementing policies that involve interaction with church groups.

The mixed messaging evident in this paragraph is also evident in the way a number of development workers talk about churches and religion in PNG (Personal Communications with development workers on 11/12/2008 and 13/6/2009). What is different, however, is that this policy document, while acknowledging the negative impacts that these churches can have on PLWHA, seems to focus more on the power that they have to ‘do good’. It encourages stronger ties. Few of the development workers I interviewed suggested making stronger ties and giving increased support to the Churches. Thus some development workers might react negatively to this statement and feel less in line (more disconnected) with AusAID goals and guidelines on this matter (Personal Communications).

It is important to note that, although there were a number of cases of sympathy (see Section 6.4) towards certain PNG peoples, in the documents from AusAID, there was very little sense

---

\textsuperscript{89} Information, Education and Communication
of positivity or hope expressed towards them. The only exception to that was when these documents talked about the cultural capital that PNG people possessed.

The most effective national strategies for HIV/AIDS are designed to meet the specific needs of countries, based on the particular situations that make their people vulnerable to HIV and its impact. Papua New Guinea has significant social and cultural resources that can be mobilised for expanding the national response to the HIV/AIDS epidemic.

These resources include value systems and traditions of kinship and reciprocal exchange that provide an important social safety net. There are also many organised traditional channels such as public meetings, exchange ceremonies, drama events and sing sings which can be used for social mobilisation. The vast network of women’s groups, youth groups, church groups and sports clubs throughout the country provide an important mechanism for sharing information, raising awareness, and promoting responsible behaviour. (National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002)

The above quote can engender a sense of positivity and hope towards PNG peoples because they have many “social and cultural resources”. This means they can spread the message and understandings about HIV and AIDS. Most of the “social and cultural resources” mentioned are things that are exotic and different to Westerners, like “exchange ceremonies” and “sing sings”. This highlights the ‘Otherness’ of PNG peoples. In addition it produces a sense of knowing and understanding of PNG traditional value systems and a sense that they can be controlled or “mobilised for expanding the national response to the HIV/AIDS epidemic”. Such wording therefore indicates the continued presence of Orientalisms in contemporary HIV and AIDS policies.

Yet a likely reason for the continued existence of statements like this is the subtle but important sense of confidence given the reader. The reader can feel assured that they will have a vast array of community support (or “resources”) to draw upon.

The National AIDS Council Secretariat et al’s (2004) HAMP Act and the Anglican Church Policy (2006) document did not specifically mention any qualities of PNG people but they did make mention of the types of behaviours to be encouraged in people. These statements were often followed-up with illustrated examples of ‘normal’ PNG people doing these sorts of positive acts. An example can be seen in the illustration on the next page, in which a man’s extended
family are shown as still loving, respecting and caring for him, despite the fact that he is HIV positive. This image shows PNG people in a positive light.
Such positive portrayals of ‘ordinary’ PNG people are often absent in policy documents, including Broughton’s Guide and the NHASP yearly plan. Most policy documents forget to mention, or show images of, the PNG general populace ‘doing good’, and tend to only talk about problems such as ‘stigmatisation’ that are apparently still prevalent in the PNG population. The fact that there are few examples of ordinary PNG people ‘doing good’ may affect the attitudes of development workers. Development workers could end up focusing on the negative and not mention that not all PNG people reject those with HIV (see Chapter 7 for examples of development workers focusing on the negative). Images such as the one above might remind the development worker that there are caring PNG people out there who will not stigmatise those who are HIV positive. These images may help development workers to be reflexive of the fact that PNG peoples differ from the Orientalist image that is commonly portrayed, and therefore these images may help to promote resistances to Orientalisms.

However, Western development workers are most likely not the prime audience for these images. These images are more likely there to encourage PNG people to behave ‘appropriately’ towards PLWHA. Policies like the HAMP Act and the Anglican Church policy are also more grounded in the actualities of PNG, compared to the other polices analysed. This I
believe is one of the prime reasons that ‘ordinary’ PNG people are directly represented in these documents and, on these occasions, represented in a positive light. It is also a reason why these documents are less likely to make broad statements about PNG social and cultural resources, unlike some the NHASP (2002) quotes mentioned above. Hence these sorts of documents (although still embedded in Orientalisms) are likely to show more signs of resistance to Orientalisms than those documents which are more detached from the actualities on the ground.

6.3 Fear

Fear was also employed in these documents. It should be noted in this section, due to the subtle nature of the fear expressed in these documents, I use the term ‘fear’ to encompass softer forms of fear such as worry and anxiety. Fear was often evoked to move people away from certain behaviours or values and towards others. This might help to produce a sense of disconnection or resistance to certain people and places that a development worker might encounter in the development field.

An example of the employment of fear can be seen in the following quote from “The Guide to HIV/AIDS and Development” (Broughton, 1999).

For a varying period of time the immune system keeps HIV infection in check and the person only gradually develops serious immune deficiency. She or he appears healthy with little sign of infection although the virus can be transmitted to others through semen, vaginal and cervical secretions and blood. During this period, provided the conditions are right, people living with HIV can have long and productive lives.

Gradually HIV overwhelms the immune system causing susceptibility to infections that healthy people successfully fight off. These opportunistic infections include certain kinds of pneumonia, tuberculosis, some fungal infections and many other diseases. This end stage of HIV disease is called AIDS. (Broughton, 1999)

The above section of the Guide attempts to explain some facts about how HIV and AIDS affect the host’s body. It tries to keep a neutral tone; however words like “overwhelms” still carry an emotional charge. As well, human beings’ past histories with infection and diseases can generate feelings of fear and elicit connotations of suffering. Further, in order to avoid emotional content, the article does not mention the true ‘end stage’ of the disease, which is
death. This however is logically implied by the effects of the virus, and primal fears about death may still be triggered in reading this section.

So by dealing with emotional content such as sickness, weakness and death, emotion cannot be removed from the text. The emotional reaction to such concepts is often to reject or exclude the disease, so efforts should be made to ensure that such impulses are acknowledged and catered for, in guiding the development worker. It is interesting to note, however, that although the statement may move the reader towards a state of fearing and being repulsed by (moving away from) the disease, in doing so it brings the reader more in line with the policy document whose goal is to combat this fear. An important aspect of ensuring that this occurs is in the way the text makes a knowing subject out of the description of the disease. The HIV and AIDS process is described in unemotional terms as a step-like progression, and this produces a sense that the policy knows how the disease functions and what will happen. And as the policy ‘knows’ its enemy, it is implied that it ‘knows’ how to fight HIV and AIDS. So by feeling fear towards the disease one may get a sense of protection, guidance and strength from the AusAID commitment to fight it, while the policy gains a sense of legitimacy and worthiness from this interaction. This legitimacy may make the reader less critical of statements that claim to know PNG people and place.

The above quote was taken from near the beginning of the policy document. Therefore it might seem that fear has been used to orientate the reader in line with the policy document’s aims, from the very beginning. This was a common practice in the policy documents that I read. In fact, apart from NHASP (2002), all the guides analysed tended to start with a fear-evoking message such as the following from the HAMP Act user guide:

There is no vaccine that can prevent HIV/AIDS and there is no medicine that can cure it.

That means the only way to stop HIV/AIDS from spreading is to change the human behaviours that help it to pass from one person to another....

Unprotected sex and other “risky” behaviours must be changed if we are to going to manage and prevent AIDS. (National AIDS Council Secretariat et al, 2004 pg 1)

Fear is evoked in the above passage in a similar way to the earlier quote, except this time the focus is on the inability to cure HIV/AIDS. This implies that HIV and AIDS is a death sentence.
The passage then offers one (and it implies only one) source of protection. That source of protection is to stop behaviours like unprotected sex. This solution is in line with the goals and values that this policy wants to promote. The use of fear in this quote may also produce a sense of urgency that something needs to be done to combat HIV.

The use of non-modalised statements about the disease and how to prevent its spread is vital in making the document seem both knowing and confident about what are the causes and ways of preventing HIV and AIDS spread. This has several interconnected effects. One is that the policy document becomes a confident knowing subject which silences any alternative version of what are HIV and AIDS and how to prevent their spread\textsuperscript{90}. In doing so, the quote presents the “risky” and dangerous behaviours of the PNG people as the (only) cause of the spread of HIV and AIDS. This may be viewed as a form of Orientalism in which the ‘West’ has been substituted by a knowing and confident policy document that also portrays its shadow self in representing PNG people as ignorant and engaged in risky behaviours.

Just as important is the effect that a document, written to be both knowing and confident, can have on the development worker. This quote suggests to development workers (as does the earlier quote) that they should act with a strong sense of confidence about what they know of HIV and AIDS. Such mindsets run the risk of being less open to new knowledge that might be learnt from their Papua New Guinean clients.

This idea, that one should gain an alleviation of fear through policy, was also evident in the NHASP yearly plan. It seemed that whenever the document tried to evoke fear it would then suggest ways that the NHASP plans to alleviate the issue. This can be seen in the following paragraph.

High prevalence rates of curable STDs amongst symptomatic and asymptomatic individuals is a major public health issue in PNG. As the predominant mode of transmission of HIV in PNG is heterosexual intercourse, there is a close linkage

\textsuperscript{90} Alternative solutions that are silenced by this form of language include general public health campaigns and Anti-Retro Viral drug treatments. Yet it also silences options that have a following in PNG, but are seen as highly problematic in development circles, like traditional medical cures and faith healings.
between STDs and increased risk of HIV transmission. The Project will strengthen the capacity of the health sector to diagnose, treat and prevent curable STDs, and provide adequate resources and skills for the clinical care of HIV/AIDS patients. (National HIV/AIDS Support Project, 2002)

In the above quote a sense of fear and concern is being produced by the suggestion of “high prevalence rates of curable STDs”. Often, the reader’s past histories with the concepts of STDs tend to engender a sense of moral, as well as physical, concern for our, or others’, wellbeing. This fear/concern is increased through phrases like “increased risk of HIV transmission”. Increased risk promotes a sense of increased danger. This can often slip into an anxiety which may cling to something for protection from the fear (Ahmed, 2004 a). This quote provides the reader with something to ‘cling’ to, in the form of the NHASP. In the above quote the reader is informed that the NHASP is strengthening the capacity of the health sector. In doing so it is providing some protection from social problems that might concern the reader. These words also portray the NHASP as sympathetic to the problem facing the PNG health service and as such this sympathy might also draw development workers to the NHASP (see Section 6.5 below). Thus the Orientalist dichotomy is being reproduced in this quote as it describes PNG in a way that involves fear and danger while the policy is portrayed as that which provides security.

The Anglican Church document also uses fear at its beginning. Unlike other policy documents, it does not try to alleviate fear through following a policy document. This can be seen in the quote below.

The Anglican Church believes that HIV and AIDS are more than just health issues, and that the damaging consequences and effects of HIV and AIDS on individuals, families, communities and PNG challenge us to make a response that meets the spiritual and pastoral needs of all people. (Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea, 2006)

This quote has the potential to generate fear or caution in a reader because it prompts the reader to see HIV and AIDS and as something that is damaging and bigger than “just a health issue...”. HIV is portrayed as damaging “individuals, families, communities and PNG” as a whole. In doing so this quote has both the ability to generate sympathy for PNG people but also fear about the effects of HIV and AIDS. To alleviate this fear the reader is told to contemplate and respond to the “spiritual and pastoral needs of all people”. So, unlike the other policy documents (which orientate the reader around a policy document), this document
orientates the reader around the PNG people. It also calls for a sense of self-reflexivity as it is “us” that are being challenged to act. Self-reflexivity is one important step towards overcoming Orientalisms. Although these could be seen as positive stances in a policy document, the forms of connection and self-reflexivity suggested are problematic. By focusing on connection and reflexivity through the “spiritual and pastoral” needs of PNG means, the connection is filtered through a lens of religion. Such a lens limits the form of connection to PNG people and may counteract some development workers’ desires to connect, due to their expressed ambivalence towards religion (see quotes in 7.2 and 8.2)

6.4 Frustration and Disconnection (Rejection)

It was evident that attempts had been made to remove from the policy documents any personal feelings of frustration and general negativity towards certain people and events. Despite these attempts, these emotions were still evident. As a consequence, at times these documents encouraged subtle feelings of negativity and anger towards certain individuals or groups of PNG society. An example can be seen in the following paragraphs from the NHASP (2003) Annual Plan.

Preparation of the 2002 Annual Plan for the National HIV/AIDS Support Project

(NHASP) began in August 2001. The planning process commenced with an initial NACS/NHASP workshop that aimed to ensure NACS’ ownership of identified issues. The workshop briefed participants on AusAID’s requirements for a ‘single Annual plan for the Health Sector projects’, and discussed and documented the issues that needed to be considered as part of the planning process. NACS and NHASP staff then separated into groups to discuss priorities and significant issues for inclusion in plan development.

NACS and NHASP staff met again in November 2001, prior to the departure of many NACS and NHASP staff to Melbourne, Australia, to attend the ICAAP Conference.

At this meeting, it became obvious that, despite the initial shared briefing; NACS and NHASP planning priorities had diverged. NACS staff had focused on refining a checklist for provincial activity development, and had drafted a schedule of planned activities for the remaining month of 2001. NHASP staff had focused on reviewing the previous year’s achievements, to assist with identifying and collating significant issues that needed to be addressed in the second year of the Project. With the departure of NACS
and NHASP staff to attend the ICAAP Conference, remaining NHASP staff continued preparation of the Annual Plan, in line with AusAID’s contractual requirements.


The above section denotes the events that were integral in the creation of the NHASP Annual Plan for 2002. It shows an attempt made by AusAID to get the PNG National Government (through NACS) to work together AusAID and come up with a single plan for 2002. In the course of events AusAID wanted NACS to take ownership (which some might read as responsibility/blame) of identified issues in PNG HIV and AIDS development work. In addition there was a divergence/confusion around what was meant to be achieved between the months of August and November. The events listed above would have been marked and shaped by a number of emotions. Confusion and frustration are two emotions which may have been felt strongly. While these emotions are not acknowledged, I believe they still come through in the emotional charge that this passage leaves behind. This article is written by the NHASP, and as such, this passage produces a feeling of negativity towards the NACS. This is largely done through the use of logical implication. For example, having a “workshop that aimed to ensure NACS’ ownership of identified issues” implies that NACS is not taking responsibility for its actions. In addition NHASP tells the reader the workshops were about a “single Annual plan” and “discussed and documented the issues needed to be considered as part of the planning process”. So when NACS (unlike NHASP) has only a one-month plan and no mentioned annual vision or review of the previous year’s issues, NACS seems in the wrong. Finally, with “the departure of NACS and NHASP staff to attend the ICAAP Conference” the reader is informed that only the “remaining NHASP staff” stayed behind to finish off and ‘fix’ the annual plan. Logically, this implies that the NACS staff left it unfinished, generating more feelings of negativity and rejection of NACS. As such, it is likely that the frustration that NHASP staff felt through this process influences some of the reader’s perceptions of the PNG National AIDS Council and its people. In this period of frustration the reader can see a familiar Orientalism being played out, where the PNG NAC is depicted as unable to manage its affairs properly and requires the help/control of the Australian NHASP to ‘fix’ its mistakes and give it the forward-looking agenda that it apparently ‘needs’.
In general, current or potential partner governments were often seen as a source of frustration in AusAID documents. Sometimes partner governments were given praise because their actions were ‘in line’ with AusAID polices (see Section 6.2.2). Often however they were portrayed as having their own ‘priorities’ and views of the issues. This tends to prompt the reader to feel frustration towards, or rejection of, the agendas of Third World governments. For example, in Broughton’s (1999) Guide for development workers there is a chapter called “Removing Obstacles to the Adoption of Lower Risk Behaviours”. This chapter lists five main obstacles to consider when working in the field, the first two of which relate to the actions of partner governments. This creates a sense that partner governments are an obstacle to a development organisation’s policies, programs and intentions. Portraying partner governments as ‘obstacles’ could create feelings of frustration towards government officials. These emotional stances can help justify a development worker’s continued faith in a policy document because it places the frustration of failure, not on the design or implementation of the policy, but on the indigenous governments of the Third World 'Other'. In doing so, Orientalisms are once again being played out through policy documents. This may lead to significant material effects in which the development worker is not as open to listening to members of the PNG Government, who they feel are a frustrating obstacle.

Frustration was also expressed towards the PNG people (in particular, men) as in the following example from Broughton (1999):

Fear of husbands - Many women may find it difficult or impossible to raise the subject of HIV infection with their husbands without external support. Women often have few alternatives to remaining in a marriage. Prejudices against women need to be overcome. As such changes occur over many years, donors should provide peer support, strengthen women’s organisations and help women support themselves and their children.

---

91 Frustration towards the government was not prevalent in the other two documents, as the topics that these documents were dealing with were more ‘on the ground’ and did not involve policy surrounding partner governments. In addition, the HAMP guide was very much the outcome of a partnership with the PNG Government and therefore the PNG Government is portrayed as positive, unanimously passing the bill, as seen in the quote in 6.2.1 above.
The above situation may very well affect a number of PNG women. As such this quote has the potential to create sympathy for PNG women (see 6.5). But what this quote also engenders is a sense of frustration towards PNG men. This is because PNG men (or Third World men in general) are making it “difficult or impossible” for (PNG/Third World) women to raise the subject of HIV infection. The reader may also get a sense of frustration at PNG/Third World cultures that are implied as being prejudiced against women. Feelings of frustration may generally prompt people to reject or ‘disconnect from’ PNG men as well as a PNG society that seems to prejudice women. Quotes like this may lead development workers to feel a sense of empathy and connection with women, to a greater extent than (or at the cost of) a connection with men.

The last part of this paragraph portrays AusAID as taking a stand against these prejudices, supporting and encouraging calls and activities that will strengthen women’s organisations and help women to support themselves and their children. Such calls have the potential to generative positive feelings towards the Broughton (1999) document and its aims. This, once again, has the potential to produce a sense of security and faith in AusAID. Yet at the same time the reader can see Orientalisms being played out as it is AusAID policy that speaks for Third World women, and it is AusAID policy that knows their suffering and can prevent it. As such, the positive feeling generated towards AusAID encourages the reader to join them and also feel good about themselves.

With a more detailed look at the amount, and prevalence, of the attempts in these documents to make the reader feel positive and in line with the policies and principles exposed therein, one might begin to feel that there is a sense of insecurity around the development process that the documents promote. This sense of insecurity would coincide with the types of insecurities felt by development workers in PNG (see Chapters 7 and 8). This is a further indication that the emotion subtly imbued in policy documents functions as an Orientalism, as it is fulfilling the role of giving Western subjects a sense of identity and security (Said 1985). Yet at the same time the fact that these documents must constantly ‘reassure’ Western subjects so often could also be a sign of significant external resistance that is causing and insecurity in the Orientalist belief, meaning that these documents bear the marks of one struggling with Orientalisms (Said, 1985).

Mosse (2004) mentions that development workers tend to translate what they learnt on the ground into policy documents. As such, these policy documents have the potential to bring up
a lot of issues and frustration that development workers feel towards PNG society. This can be seen in the following example:

It is against the law to stigmatise people affected or infected by HIV/AIDS

To stigmatise means to do or say something in public that causes or encourages people to hate or ridicule people affected or infected by HIV/AIDS.

Some examples include:

- Giving a speech or publishing a leaflet saying that the AIDS virus only attacks bad people or sinners.
- A police officer forcing a person in possession of a condom to eat, chew or blow up the condom;
- Writing in a newspaper column that all people with HIV/AIDS should be locked up;
- Putting up a notice that says a family should be thrown out of their house because one of their family members is sick with AIDS. (National AIDS Council Secretariat et al 2004)

It is important to note that, from my experiences in PNG, I heard a number of stories from development workers that painted Papua New Guinean people as the social Other. All of the above examples of stigma are ‘one sentence’ versions of some of those very stories that I heard while in PNG. These sentences, which generally depict some forms of disgusting and frustrating behaviours, could have a stronger effect because they come from ‘real life’ examples of stigma that development workers heard about. For me personally, these sentences have the ability to trigger memories of when I first heard these stories that work to erect a barrier between me and Papua New Guinean people. This split between me and PNG people at these moments is the very much lived experience of Orientalisms. At these moments I disconnect from some of the darker side of humanity (which is potentially in all of us), and subsequently imbue PNG people with these darker aspects of humanity. In addition, stating that such behaviour (and rightly so) is against the law brings connotations of law-breaking that may make some readers reject and strike out against such behaviours. In doing so, the reader is aligned with both the law and the policy document. Even for one who has not heard these stories, the document implies a rejection and loss of connection with the shadow-self behaviours, as there is no insight given as to the root cause of such behaviours.
There were no real expressions of frustration evident in the Anglican Church document (2006). Instead of rejecting ‘bad’ and discriminatory behaviours and the people who commit them, it tried to encourage people to change. This can be seen in the following quote.

> We are inspired and guided by the example of Jesus Christ who ministered to all without fear or discrimination. We believe that discrimination or stigmatisation is unacceptable. All in ministry and employees should be encouraged to treat people with HIV in a caring, non-discriminatory way. (Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea, 2006)

Once again the reader is first encouraged to orientate himself/herself around religion. This is achieved through the opening sentence that uses the example of Jesus Christ as the perfect way to behave. Such sentences can often make secular development workers ‘switch off’ and disengage from the messaging. By stating the words “without fear or discrimination”, this first sentence also shows some empathy and understanding about the cause of prejudices. It shows a level of acceptance and understanding as to why people might engage in these behaviours (i.e. because they are scared). By stating that stigma and discrimination are unacceptable, it raises a barrier to these sorts of behaviours. Yet unlike the other documents mentioned above, this text then proposes to connect to those that might be the cause of stigma and discrimination and encourage them “to treat people with HIV in a caring, non-discriminatory way”. As such this document does try to encourage empathy and connection between those that might be causing blockages and frustrations in the development process. There is also some self-reflexivity as the document asks “all in ministry and employees should be encouraged” to be caring to PLWHA. Implied is reflexivity on the fact that Anglican ministers and employees might also feel that fear and they should be encouraged to overcome it.

6.5 Sympathy and Connection

Policy documents also employ sympathy in order to justify their argument and approach. In Sections 6.2 to 6.4 I have already noted how sympathy is often felt alongside other emotions, like hope and frustration. This means that sympathy is often one of the most commonly expressed emotions in these policy documents. An example of sympathy is given below.

> Comprehensive care and support for people and families living with HIV/AIDS can be divided into four interrelated categories.
• medical needs, including access to medical care, home care and information;

• psychological needs, including counselling;

• socioeconomic needs relating to welfare and orphan support; and

• human rights and legal needs, including protection against violence and discrimination.

The Project will support the development of ‘a continuum of care’. Building on existing structures and programs, this will span home and community services through to institutional services, counselling services (including voluntary counselling and testing) and access to information on HIV/AIDS prevention, human rights, and support services. (National HIV/AIDS Support Project 2002)

In the above quote, phrases like “comprehensive care and support” and the listing of the different types of needs for people and families living with HIV/AIDS can generate feelings of sympathy. These feelings would be particularly directed towards “people and families living with HIV/AIDS”. This was the most common group of people about which HIV and AIDS policy employed subtly sympathetic language. Sympathy has the ability to generate feelings of closeness and connection towards people and families living with HIV/AIDS. Such statements may reinforce development workers’ desires to connect with those affected by HIV and AIDS92 (see Chapter 7). It also, once again, may generate positive feelings towards AusAID programs, as they are presenting themselves as sympathetic to the “needs” of the ‘needy’. The repetition of the word “needs” may also have the effect of portraying the families and people living with HIV and AIDS as being in need, and as victims of circumstances and violence from a PNG Other. It is on this line that connection to families and people living with HIV/AIDS is made. Such connections could therefore be problematic if these are the only (or an over-represented) way of connecting to PNG people. This is because such connections demand that PNG people be positioned as victims. For instance, Ahmed (2004 a) noted that a certain politics of pain can develop if one’s only voice is that of the suffering victim. If certain groups are positioned as

92 It is interesting to note that the HIV and AIDS development workers whom I interviewed generally expressed more of a desire to connect to PNG society(ies) as a whole and not specifically those living with HIV and AIDS.
society’s victims, a victim mentality can present itself. This can lead to a state in which development workers only relate to them as victims and, if used frequently enough, suffering may get ingrained as an integral part of Papua New Guinean PLWHA’s identity. This process can also be viewed as an act of Orientalisms, as it simultaneously speaks for PNG PLWHA, and leaves silent any attempts made by PLWHA at self-determination and resistance to discrimination and violence (Liddle and Shirin, 1998). Similar portrayals to these were also made frequently in the Broughton (1999) Guide to HIV and AIDS.

The HAMP Act Guide (National AIDS Council Secretariat et al, 2004) also included sympathetic portrayals of PLWHA. However, unlike Broughton’s (1999) Guide and the NHASP (2002) plan, where sympathy was used to make the reader connect with PLWHA along the Orientalist lines of a helping ‘us’ and suffering ‘them’, it used this sympathy to talk to PNG people as a whole and to advocate for changing behaviours that cause suffering to PLWHA.

Repression and abuse of people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA) makes people too afraid to talk about HIV/AIDS, too afraid to get tested and, worst of all, too afraid to find out what to do to protect themselves their families and loved ones from infection.

It will be impossible to stop HIV and AIDS from spreading if people are too afraid to talk about it, too afraid to get tested for it and too afraid to get treatment and care.

Everyone should be able to walk into a clinic for a HIV test and feel confident that, whatever the results, their rights (including their rights to privacy) will be respected and that they will get the things that they need to look after their health and prevent transmission of HIV infection. If that is not guaranteed then people will “go underground” to avoid being tested. (National AIDS Council Secretariat et al, 2004)

The above quote has the ability to prompt sympathy for PLWHA because of the reader’s likely associations with reactions like “repression and abuse” to which they are apparently subjected. This makes the reader sympathetic to the fear that they are stated as having. The inaction on behalf of the PLWHA that this fear prompts may increase the reader’s sympathy for PLWHA, and means that the blame for not getting tested doesn’t get placed on them. Unlike the NHASP (2002), which used this sympathy to connect to PLWHA as ‘rightfully’ needy, this quote goes on to describe the flow-on effects this has on PNG society, describing how it makes it “impossible to stop HIV and AIDS from spreading”. Then, with statements such as “everyone should ... walk into a clinic for a HIV test and feel confident” it then tries to prompt
empowerment and positive change from the PNG community. In doing so it encourages change from within PNG society instead of through an exterior (Western) force. A development worker reading this is more likely to see their role as supporting the change from within the society, instead of ‘controlling’ and managing the social change (which is implied in the wording of the NHASP document).

Papua New Guinean women are also dealt with in largely sympathetic ways in these texts. This was particularly strong in the Broughton (1999) Guide. Statements like the following were often observed:

> Change still seems to be limited with low condom use and although partner change is reduced people still have several partners. This is mainly attributed to cultural values and social practices. Linked to this is the relative powerlessness of women in relation to their sexual and economic lives. The NGOs concluded that behavioural change will only be achieved slowly and with extensive involvement by state institutions at all levels. (Broughton, 1999)

> Without independent means, for example, women may be unable to buy condoms, leave harmful relationships, or refuse cash for sex work. Additional activities such as improving women's access to credit, will always be needed to overcome such impediments. At a wider level interventions might include changes to legislation, policies, official and public attitudes.

> At the national and provincial levels interventions might involve strengthening institutions and community organisations. (Broughton, 1999)

It is important to note that both these quotes (but particularly the first) have a similar style to the quotes made by some of the experts critiqued in Chapter 5. Yet the passages also have the potential to generate sympathy for PNG women. These quotes do so by stating the ways in which PNG women are supposedly “powerless” to change their circumstances. Due to the past histories that people have with being powerless themselves, one might get the urge to feel sympathy for these women. It is likely to make a development worker want to connect and help these women. A sense of solidarity with the plight of these women may be felt. These paragraphs then suggest ways in which an NGO and/or development worker might help. These include trying to get women access to credit, and encouraging intervention from state government.
Portraying women as powerless, however, runs the risk of positioning PNG women into powerless and passive roles. It also silences the hard work done by PNG women to empower themselves and resist gender violence (Liddle and Shirin, 1998, Kapoor, 2004). As such, these quotes reproduce the common Orientalist trope which portrays an active and masculine ‘West’ that needs to speak for, and protect, a passive and feminine ‘East’. In the same way that sympathy for PNG women is generated, an implied negativity towards PNG men for apparently disempowering PNG women can also be seen. Such constructions may lead development workers to feel more sympathetic towards PNG women than men.

In addition, the first of the two above quotes concludes that “behavioural change will only be achieved slowly”. This elicits the feeling that the powerlessness of women is not going to change any time soon and that the reader (development worker) should try to accept this. In accepting this, the development worker is discouraged from undertaking ‘too many’ sympathetic acts because one has to accept that certain forces can’t change soon. This quote thus has the potential to place PNG women at what Clark (1997) calls ‘the sympathy margins’, where one does not feel or give someone the amount of sympathy (at least the physical signs of sympathy) that their circumstance might warrant (see Chapter 2).

This concept of sympathy margins is also evident in the one instance in the Broughton (1999) document where the reader was made to sympathise with development agencies and development workers. This was used to help development workers not over-extend their reach, and go beyond the limitations and bounds of their programs and policy.

*NGOs overwhelmed by poverty - Some NGOs working in community HIV/AIDS prevention and care may feel compelled to create income generation and credit schemes for poor families despite not wanting to become involved in such activities. In some circumstances, the basic needs of HIV positive people may overwhelm NGOs.*

(Broughton, 1999)

In the above quote the reader is told a cautionary tale of how, because NGOs/development workers care too much, they and their staff can be overwhelmed by the poverty of their clients, and as such can no longer perform their function as part of an HIV/AIDS prevention organisation. This quote places the development worker as a caring altruist who is empathic and compassionate towards the Third World ‘Other’. Yet it tries to make the worker temper that feeling, to not feel too much towards the Third World ‘Other’, to avoid getting overwhelmed/losing the self (see Chapter 7). In addition, to be labelled as ‘too caring’ comes
with a number of positive associations which may draw the reader to feel positive towards the actions of development agencies, or themselves as development workers (see 6.2 above). One could also read into this quote a sense that the development worker is being encouraged not to give the Third World person living with HIV/AIDS as much sympathy as the circumstance might warrant, for fear of being overwhelmed. This prompts the reader to place Third World PLWHA at the sympathy margin (Clark, 1997). This placement reproduces Orientalisms, for the implication in the above quote is that the Third World is a place of misery, a shadow self to Western sympathy. Therefore invoking a sympathy margin in this context has maintained a boundary between the Self and the Other.

In the Anglican Church policy the calls for sympathy are much more overt. This can be seen in the following quote:

In caring for those who suffer, we fulfil God’s purpose by resorting dignity and purpose to people’s lives. Christian care seeks the fullness of life, by the restoration of the body mind and spirit. (Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea, 2006)

The above quote calls for a greater sense of self-reflexivity than many of the above secular quotes. It prompts the reader to think about how they might be fulfilling God’s purpose, by caring for others. Yet once again this quote makes reference to God and asks that all emotions be felt and filtered using religious grounds. In doing so, this policy may put off a number of Western development workers and may stop the self-reflexive process that this quote aims to engender. Also, through the use of the word “care” there is an overt request that the reader care for those who are suffering, whereas the earlier quotes just mentioned that people were suffering. As such, this quote shows once again the religious document to be more willing to grapple and deal with emotions than the secular documents.

6.6 Conclusion

In this chapter I have discussed the ways Orientalisms are mobilised through HIV and AIDS development policy in PNG. I showed that this continued existence is intimately linked with the subtle (but important) ways in which these documents express emotion, or elicit emotion from the reader. As a point of comparison I analysed one religious policy document to discuss what the outcomes were when policy did engage overtly with emotions. Although this document revealed some benefits towards overcoming Orientalisms, particularly in the way it asked for an engagement in the highly emotional process of self-reflexivity, its references to God and
Jesus Christ may limit the engagement that secular development workers could have with the policy. These religious grounds could also provide problematic filters to how a development worker can be reflexive or engage with the community. I presented findings about the ways in which four policy documents (3 secular, 1 religious) express or elicit feelings of positivity, fear, frustration and sympathy.

A sense of positivity and hope was often encouraged in an attempt to bring the reader in line with desires and goals of the policy itself. This was largely done by presenting the policy as the ‘knowing’ Western subject who was ‘doing good’ in PNG. This could be read as an attempt to make the reader feel both positive and confident about the policy. The documents strengthened this by making the reader feel positive towards those people or groups working in line with the policy. In general, a sense of positivity toward PNG people was omitted. This was particularly the case with the AusAID documents, in which Orientalisms were reinforced by the sense that positive feelings were essentially due to belief in the ability to control elements of PNG or by fixing what was inherently ‘bad’ or ‘weak’ in PNG.

I also noted that fear was used as an orientating device that would try to make people disconnect or reject certain behaviours, and reinforce a sense of fear and caution around HIV and AIDS. This helped orientate readers around the policy documents because they were portrayed as providing protection from fear or worry. This once again had a tendency to lead to Orientalisms as the policy presented itself as a confident, ‘knowing’ subject that ‘knew’ what HIV and AIDS was and how to prevent it. This tended to generate a sense of certainty towards the actions that these policies took HIV and AIDS issues. This meant that alternative ways of knowing of HIV and AIDS as well of alternative ways of dealing with HIV and AIDS were silenced in favour of the Orientalist binary. This binary was evident in the way the policy documents portrayed themselves as ‘knowing and protective’, whereas the PNG people were ‘unknowing’ and engaging in danger.

I also noted that policy documents were constructed to present a knowing subject who knew what was causing problems in regard to HIV and AIDS. This ‘knowing’ could prompt the reader to reject those people, places and things that ‘blocked’ the policies’ desired development practices. This was generally achieved through textual techniques that prompted frustration towards these groups and people. In addition, documents were constructed to represent the policy contained within them as a positive force fighting these blockages to development goals. Such representations try to elicit a sense of positivity towards, and confidence in, the
development policy. By presenting elements of the PNG population as ‘bad’ while engendering positive feelings for policy documents, these documents reinforced Orientalist boundaries. They also showed a tendency to speak for members of the PNG population and in doing so silenced the good work and struggles of women’s groups and PLWHA in PNG.

In addition, I suggest that these documents made readers sympathetic towards certain groups that were described as in need. These forms of sympathy encouraged connection between certain PNG people and the development worker. Yet these connections were often unequal, with the development worker constantly in the position of sympathiser. This meant that only certain connections were encouraged between PNG people and development workers. If over-represented (as they were in most of these documents), these connections could produce identities of certain PNG people as victims, and passive. By setting the Western policy document as the sympathiser and groups in PNG as passive victims, a familiar Orientalist trope is being played out.

All the while the religious policy document was much more likely to deal openly with emotions than its secular counterparts. It also encouraged the development worker to be reflexive of their own positioning and what they wanted to achieve as a development worker. These could be seen as a positive step that resists Orientalisms. Yet these documents seem to constantly try to orientate the development worker around God. Such orientations can produce disconnection between development workers and the aims of these policy documents (including the non religious ones). But it is important to note that by dealing and accepting emotions more readily than the secular documents (particularly the unpleasant emotions like frustration) these documents were more willing to encourage connections with certain PNG people who could potentially be more marginalised in the secular documents. As such, these documents suggest that a more open acknowledgment and consideration of the emotions in HIV and AIDS has the potential to produce new forms of policy documents that are (more) resistant to Orientalisms.
Chapter 7: Belonging and the Reaffirmation of a Sense of Self in the Resort, Home and Village.

7.1 Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to describe the emotional experiences felt by development workers living and working in PNG. It aims to complement the textual works of experts and policy documents described in the previous two chapters. It will help problematise the belief of policy documents and expert testimonies written about HIV and AIDS in PNG that emotions do not matter. It will show that the on-the-ground experiences of development workers are, in fact, highly emotional. It does this by examining the, often mixed and varied, emotional reactions that development workers have to places in PNG.

In the previous two chapters I have focused on how Orientalisms play out in contemporary HIV and AIDS development campaigns and how emotions play an important role in the continued appearance of Orientalisms. At the start of this chapter I wish to step away from Orientalisms a little, to really explore the breadth of emotions experienced while implementing apparently ‘emotionless’ policy. That’s not to say that what is written here is not linked to Orientalisms. For instance, at the beginning of this chapter I show how emotions play an important role in the formation and reaffirmation of one’s identity. This has close links to Orientalisms, which is tied up in identity politics (Said, 2003). Indeed, I will show that there are certain places in PNG that will help to reaffirm a Western identity in the development worker. Yet I leave it to the end of this chapter to discuss the link between development workers’ emotions and their role in the recreation of Orientalisms.

In this chapter, I use two main data sources. These are 20 interviews with development workers, and a free writing journal of my time living and working in PNG. The questions aimed to elicit information about how development workers felt, living and working in PNG and the places that they went to, to relax and unwind. How the interviewees described their work, their feelings towards PNG and the places where they relaxed, were then subjected to a discourse analysis. This produced a list of places which development workers would commonly visit, and allowed me to investigate the emotions typically felt in those places.
This chapter will show that places can engender powerful and complex emotional reactions in development workers. In particular, it will show that development workers’ experience of place can be filled with contradictory emotions that are often overlapping in time and place. I do this by first investigating workers’ reactions to home and work in PNG. I show that there is no reprieve from emotionally intense experiences in either of these places. I then look at the places that development workers go to seek reprieve from these intense experiences. These places of reprieve were: the resort, the sports club, and a village setting. Yet I show that even in these places, emotions never let up, due to the permeable nature of these places and contradictory beliefs about how one should feel in them.

The next section, 7.2, explores the mixture of emotions present in the development workers’ work place. I then describe the emotional nature of the place that is considered ‘home’ while in PNG. Section 7.4 concerns the role that resorts and ‘plush’ clubs/restaurants play in the lives of development workers, and Section 7.5 is concerned with emotions felt at the rural/village retreat. Finally, in Section 7.6 I discuss these observations in the theoretical context provided by the work of Walsh (2006 b, 2006 a), Molz (2005), Ahmed (2004 a), McKinnon (2008, 2006) and Heron (2007), and relate these findings to Orientalisms.

7.2 The Emotional Responses to the Work Place

The work places of the development workers that I interviewed in PNG were very mixed and varied. Some worked in urban areas while others worked in (from a Western point of view) very remote villages. Also, as my interviewees were working in a variety of places all over PNG, many were working in very different cultural contexts to each other. So it is important to note in this section I take a more abstract view of a notion of a work space. In essence this section is more of a discussion of the emotions associated with work, than with a physical place.

Altruistic Identities and the Sense of Hope and Happiness from the Work Place

The work place for most of my interviewees was often where they got to interact with PNG people the most. For some of the development workers the work place in PNG was the only

93 There are occasions were the village setting is a place of work, instead of a place to go to relax and unwind.
place where they received any face-to-face time with PNG clients. Even more so, for some, this interaction with clients (as opposed to PNG development workers) was very limited because they were placed in technical roles that did not interact with the people who were receiving support from the NGO.

Even so, one thing that came through all my interviews with development workers was the desire to help or support their clients (PNG people) to live a ‘better,’ more improved sort of life. I call this a form of altruism⁹⁴ as the betterment of their clients’ lives technically does not benefit themselves. So it can be considered, on the surface, to be an altruistic or ‘selfless’ act. Therefore their work place in PNG became the place in which they performed these ‘selfless’ acts. This can be seen in the way development workers talked about their role, or their company’s role, in PNG.

I worked alongside a colleague [who was Papua New Guinean] with basically addressing issues in relation to women and youth and anybody who was considered disadvantaged, like people with disabilities, people who were marginalised, through any kind of civil unrest through clan situation, or whatever. Maryanne

In the above quote it is evident that the development worker is describing her role in ‘altruistic’ terms. In describing her role this way she is positioning herself as working with, and for PNG people, to address the problems of disadvantaged women and youth. One gets the sense that she is helping to empower women and youth through her work.

... [F]or us... we would see ourselves more as a support role so we will be supporting people that would be implementing on the ground. And we would support in a variety of ways, [the] most obvious way would be financially. So we support financially, but also if they need technical advice, we can provide technical advice. If they need equipment we can provide equipment. If they want to look at the work from a different angle. So for example work on masculinities and violence, we can assist with that as well. Lisa

---

⁹⁴ Altruism in general is never ‘pure.’ There are always some benefits to the self that can be gained through acts of altruism. I discuss this further in 7.6.
In the above quote it is evident that Lisa is positioned as altruistic by working for a company that she describes, on a number of occasions, as supporting or assisting other development agencies that may not be able to sustain themselves, whether it be financially, technically or intellectually. It leaves the impression that the development worker is helping to empower disadvantaged people and groups. It is evident from the above two quotes that the development workers see their goal as supporting and helping those who are seen as ‘disadvantaged,’ or requiring support. They do not see their role as one in which they ensure the proper implementation of a development policy. Seeing the personal and organisational goals as helping people, first, and the implementation of policy, as a distant and (often unmentioned) second, suggests that some of the hegemonic discourse present in the policy documents may be subverted on the ground level.

Almost all development workers made statements like the ones above and therefore positioned what they do in their work life in an altruistic light. McKinnon (2008) described similar emotions in development workers in northern Thailand. In her work she suggests that development workers’ identity as a development worker is closely linked to the articulation of ideals of empowerment and altruism. So for the development worker, the work place was the place that had the potential to enable or produce their altruistic and empowering identity.

When development work achieved this, workers felt a great sense of hope and happiness. This can be seen in the following quote.

We are seeing some positive changes in the community that suggests some of the stigma might be moving. We are seeing some cracks there, so I think [it’s] definitely [happening] by having some of the big men in business, you know, being leaders advocating. I really think that’s where the major changes are going to take place to be honest because... [These people have major influence in the community] and when we see people who are respected, speak openly and talk about... [HIV and AIDS] and talk about gender in the context of HIV it is positive. And I think that it’s happening. We are seeing it and that’s what we are encouraging with our business tokouts 95. We go into an area and we get a group of business leaders and we do a lot of work with them to make them aware that it is their responsibility to be change agents. To educate and

95 Pidgin for talk out, meaning discussion or debate.
Beverly worked on campaigns to get Papua New Guinean business leaders involved in raising awareness of HIV and promoting the anti-discrimination of HIV positive people. Beverly expressed a great deal of hope and happiness on witnessing some of the changes in PNG society that were in line with her campaign’s objectives. In this quote, Beverly is expressing some pride in the fact that her work seems to be empowering business leaders to speak up about HIV and AIDS, and gender issues in relation to HIV and AIDS. As such, the work place is giving her the opportunity to be an empowering force that she sees as bringing positive change in the community. Closely intertwined with this is the sense that she connects to PNG people through her development work, and this is a source of happiness. It is also evident that Beverly uses the fact that Papua New Guineans are responding positively to the program and “love” the opportunity to talk about HIV and AIDS, as a sign of hope and change in how the PNG HIV and AIDS issue is addressed. The use of the word “love” indicates that Beverly feels she has given PNG people something that they want and this too is a source of hope and happiness.

This quote also shows another aspect which development workers found hopeful or heartening, namely, she is heartened by the fact that once she (and her organisation) taught business leaders about HIV and gender, they began to teach the ‘rest’ of the PNG population. This quote shows that Beverly and her organisation are teaching example solution to HIV and AIDS issues to business leaders with the ultimate aim that business leaders teach them to other people. Therefore what Beverly describes here has resonances with exemplar paradigm theory (Kuhn, 1970); i.e. it is the spreading/making of an exemplar paradigm. In other words, bringing people (or institutions) together to share knowledge, with common beliefs and objectives around HIV and AIDS, was seen as a sign of hope and that the development worker was living up to their altruistic identity. This is evident in the following quote.

[One of the strengths of HIV and AIDS Development work], I think, [is] people being pushed to work together and to share information more... and I think that the Churches are coming on board. We have a program called “Channels of Hope”, which is a church-based workshop series that sort of is really targeting the leadership so that they’re much more aware ... I mean the Churches are kind of the key contact points right across the country in this. I mean, I think they are being used quite well
increasingly. Of course the Church is providing a lot of health services that the
government just can’t provide for various reasons. Richard

This quote from Richard shows that he is heartened by the fact that development projects
“pushed” people to work together and got people “on board”. In this case the church sector is
“coming on board,” suggesting similar beliefs and assumptions about HIV and AIDS are now
being shared. In the context of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG, there have been a
number of incidents where the Church and mainstream HIV and AIDS development work have
been in conflict. So one might understand why Richard might feel hope at the fact that the
work he is involved with is bringing churches “on board” and reducing conflict and tension.
Such work is a sign that Richard is articulating his altruistic identity. Yet one should not look on
this process as unproblematic, for as McKinnon (2008 pg 290) states:

Through the analytical lens of discourse theory, the work of professionals can be
understood as a way of bringing a certain kind of subject into being – in this case a
development professional who is ethical and an advocate for poor communities. As
that professional subject comes into being, so too do the universal values which it
reflects – those universalising values of development as social justice. In the coming-
into-being of the subject, the ideological foundations of a hegemonic project also
come into being.

In these above quotes, I see two main ways that development workers, as they succeed in
articulating their altruistic identity, might also be bringing “the ideological foundations” of
hegemony into being. Firstly, as discussed in Chapters 5 and 6, there are suggestions of
hegemony in the text that informs policy documents, and the policy itself. These problematic
aspects of policy and Western expertise, although undoubtedly changed through the process
of connecting to other knowledge sites, are thus gaining some power and acceptance with new
people, and at new sites. Secondly, in the above quotes from Richard and Beverly, both claim
to be empowering people and institutions (i.e. churches and “big men in business”) who
already had considerable social power and influence in the PNG community. The alternate
agendas of these groups that have just been “empowered” more, may have some adverse
effects on PNG communities. As noted in Chapter 1, churches have histories heavily embedded

What Richard goes on to say next raises some interesting questions about the work place and
the desire of development workers to foster a sense of hope, without any tangible outcome.
So, I think people are trying to learn and that’s, you know, I guess it’s recognition that it’s pretty complex, not easy, and that just simple messaging is not sufficient, there needs to be much, a much deeper level of engagement and understanding I think. And um, who knows what the tipping point might be in PNG, it might be something as simple as a cartoon character, that… like the TB dots, character Dotsy who… you know just... suddenly people get it, understand it. Richard

It is interesting to see here a development worker gain hope from the abstract search for a solution that will fix some (or all) of the hardships, in promoting change in individuals and communities. Richard gains hope from the ‘knowledge’ that (PNG) people are “trying to learn”. It also shows that he is gaining hope from the idea that development workers will one day find the “tipping point” or that missing link that leads to stronger connection and understanding between PNG people and the Western development worker. What this suggests is that by working in development, a development worker can keep hope alive (in themselves at least) that a better future is possible. So to the development worker, the existence of the work place is a sign of hope for a more socially just/healthier future. This quote also shows that it is a sense of hope from working in the work place that sustains the development process through moments when little, or no, ‘tangible’ hope can be present. (Gladwell, 2000)

The Work Place as a Place of Frustration and Failure: When Hope is Blocked and one does not Achieve one’s Altruistic Identity

The moments of hope which development workers felt, such as described above, were often fleeting in the scheme of things. Unfortunately, it was more common to feel emotions like frustration and failure than it was to feel a sense of hope. These were often experienced as discomforting sensations in the body and seemed connected to the development worker failing to achieve their desired goals and identities as helpful and altruistic. This can be seen in the following quote.

I would feel really… it was a bad feeling and I used to feel kind of, not embarrassed, not the right word, but I always come back to it. But I used to feel like I was a fraud, a bit (unsure in tone), like I used to have that feeling, you know really, what impact, is my information having, is this project working, is it not working, should we be doing HIV AIDS education while we are trying to do conservation? Are we not confusing people, is this ridiculous are we causing damage, is this going to damage people and relationships and how are things? There was a lot of those kinds of things that would run through my head. And, you know, and why would people be angry unless I was
In the above quote it is evident that Maryanne felt a level of confusion when she was conducting HIV and AIDS awareness rising work in PNG. She begins to feel this way because of an accumulation of worries and insecurities about the approaches taken to inform people about HIV and AIDS. As these questions accumulate, there is a sense that these could be overwhelming for Maryanne. She appears troubled by her lack of answers to her questions. As such, she doesn’t seem to know where to position herself in light of people’s reactions to her work (e.g. anger) and the cultural context of doing development work in PNG. What is occurring here is a situation in which Maryanne feels blocked from achieving her identity of being an empowering, helpful and altruistic development worker. Not achieving this identity is making her feel like a “fraud”. As she is not wishing to defraud people, this can be equated to a feeling of failure.

Ahmed (2006 pg 160) describes these situations as a disorientation or the “losing of one’s place in the world’. For Maryanne her ‘place in the world’ was to be the empowering, socially just development worker, and losing this place makes her disorientated. To be disorientated is to be disconnected or blocked from reaching the people, tools, knowledge, objects and locations that are required to reach one’s desired trajectory. In the above quote, there is a sense that, due to Maryanne’s feelings towards the angry reactions of PNG people, she feels disconnected from PNG clients. If Maryanne’s quote is taken in relation to Beverly’s (hopeful) quote it seems that a connection to PNG people is vital in the process of achieving the identity of a (altruistic) development worker. Thus for Maryanne, the work place can be a place of negative emotion and failure, because she can’t tell if the objects available at the work place (this includes herself, the information available, organisational structure, etc) help her reach her desired altruistic trajectory or allow her to establish a connection to PNG people.

What blocked the development worker from connecting to PNG people or achieving their desired goals (for PNG and for themselves) was often a raft of social, economic and/or cultural issues. This can cause the development worker to experience the confronting and discomforting feeling of despair.

Jack: What do you think can be done about PNG’s HIV and AIDS situation?
(Laughs) That's a really difficult one. I mean that's the problem that the whole country is facing, it's so hard! And I think personally you've got to get through to the young people. Sorry I forgot to mention the problems of alcohol cross cutting everything. You know I think a lot of promiscuity happens when people are getting drunk then you've got to ask; why are people getting drunk. And that's because; possibly they don't have jobs or they are not employed and they are going around town and that's the only fun they can have so, yeah, any way you've got to look at all of those issues. You've got to look at, you know, education, informal as well as formal education, you've got to look at what the Church is doing (disgust/disappointment in tone). So it's, I don't know, it's like fighting Goliath (despair in tone). It's just so overwhelming. You just got to get through, it's just a matter of hammering it through to the young people, about how dangerous, you know what the dangers are and then providing, you know, access to protection. And that's really tricky that's really tricky and I don't know how you do that because some populations like in Malian Bay the population is not on the mainland, you know that are on distant islands and stuff so... John

This quote shows how multiple issues of concern begin to build on John until he is overwhelmed. When this occurs, despair begins to enter his tone of voice. He refers to it as an impossible task “like fighting Goliath”. He then talks about how he feels that development-agencies need to get through to the young people. This indicates the trajectory that he wants development work in general to be moving towards, but he is despairing because it’s “really tricky” and he doesn't know “how you do that” because the objects that he needs to interact with, to extend this trajectory, are not within his reach. For example, John believes that development work needs to physically reach the communities and talk to these populations about HIV and AIDS issues, but can’t because the populations “are on distant islands”. John finishes answering this question by trailing off mid- sentence; this is something that I attribute to his sense of being overwhelmed/despairing.

In both Maryanne’s and John’s quotes it is evident that they had certain desired trajectories for their work and for PNG’s development, which are being blocked. Ahmed (2006) states that

---

96 John mentions, in another section of the interview, his dislike of the churches in PNG espousing that HIV and AIDS is a punishment from God, and that condoms don't work. This was an issue of concern for a number of development workers.
when a trajectory is stopped, it does not simply stop one from getting somewhere, but it also changes one’s relationship to what is ‘here’. Thus the development workers’ feelings of discomfort and being overwhelmed is this change in the relation to the ‘here’ that occurs from the blocking of their desired trajectory. It is also evident particularly in Maryanne’s quote, that once the nature of ‘here’ has been unsettled one begins to question, and become reflexive of, ‘here’ and what one knows. So changing the nature of ‘here’ may not always be a negative thing if it prompts development workers, as it did in the case of Maryanne, to ask important questions like “are we causing damage?”

This questioning of development practice due to experiences in the work place, was not uncommon. It could often lead to development workers reflecting on the broader process of development and its effectiveness, as can be seen in the following quote:

> I think that there is a real tension there because the experiences and circumstances in which I come from, or the exercise of my organisation, I don’t think necessarily translates into another context or another country, because there are a whole different set of social, economic and cultural factors. Similarly I think the aid programs, and I can only talk about what I know about the AusAID programs, seem to me to sit uneasily (laugh) in that other cultural context. David

David’s quote, and to some extent John’s, indicate a common concern of development workers, that programs were not helping because of the different cultural context between primarily Western- (or Australian) designed programs and the cultures of PNG. This indicates that development workers often reflect on their role in the development process. They can sometimes see that their position within Western development structures can limit their ability to help. Limits to helping due to cultural contexts, cause Western development workers considerable concern. David’s nervous laugh indicates some unease. It is evident in this quote that David’s unease first started with the experience of his own work place or organisation. The questioning of how his own organisation runs, leads him to question the programs of AusAID which is the keynote player in how HIV and AIDS development projects are run in PNG.

Blocking development workers from achieving their desired goals did not always lead to a reflexive stance about themselves and development work. It could just as easily lead to development workers ‘othering’ PNG people and place, for blocking them from achieving their goal. As such, the people and resources available at the work place were often viewed as a
cause of frustration. The following quote from Beverly shows frustration from a perceived lack of resources.

I guess day to day [what caused my frustration]; I suppose just the challenges of being in a developing country, like power, communications, internet access, postal stuff. Like we want to post something up and send it back we have to wait until someone is getting on a plane to Brisbane, and then they will send me stuff. Just that infrastructure that we take for granted is probably a bit of problem in PNG. Beverly

In the above quote it is evident that Beverly is frustrated by a number of resource and infrastructure problems that get in the way of her working goals. Her work place and also how she works are centred around Western business and communication practices. As such, they rely on certain objects that are regularly available in a Western context in order to extend their ‘reach and influence’. These, however, are not always available to the Western development worker/agency in PNG. In Chapter 2 I drew on Ahmed (2006) to describe how objects are integral in forming ‘lines’ which can give individuals orientations and trajectories so that they can form groups/organisation. So it would be evident that things like electric power, internet access and functional postal services are lines by which Western-centred development organisations gain their cohesion. What this quote indicates is that certain objects are also important for development workers, for them to feel as if they have achieved their identity as ‘altruistic development worker’. Without these objects, a development worker may, in some cases, feel like they are not helping. Yet it is the fact that their resources can be unreliable or ‘blocked’ that is seen as the cause of the frustration, not the reliance on these resources in the first place. There are implicit Orientalisms in these expressions of frustrations, as it is brought about by a (subconscious) belief that Western-centred resources and technologies are needed and superior to those that are available in PNG.

One interviewee felt that it wasn’t the infrastructure problems that blocked her from achieving her desired trajectory on the day-to-day level, but rather the corporate culture/structure of her organisation.

[A blackout]... doesn’t really bother me. It surprisingly doesn’t really bother me and doesn’t really affect your overall business because the things that affect your overall business are things like not having a structure is much more limiting than not having power. So not having tasks to do... it doesn’t matter if the power is on or not. If I don’t have a task to do it doesn’t matter if I can do it or not. There’s all these things you can
In the above quote it is evident that Paula is given an orientation and trajectory through a corporate structure which she perceives as absent in PNG. Not having this structure leaves her disorientated and discomforted (i.e. “bothered”). One could argue the point, however, that Western organisational and corporate structures are another factor, just like electric power, that are being blocked or resisted in PNG. One can also see that, implied in this quote is the ‘othering’ of the management of the organisation (who were Papua New Guinean nationals) who she feels should have been providing that structure. The ‘othering’ of PNG peoples in this way has some resonances with Orientalisms as it implies that Western organisational structures are required for PNG organisations to run correctly.

**Getting to ‘know’ Papua New Guinean People through the Work Place**

For many development workers interviewed, the work place provided one of the best ways to meet and connect to PNG people. Several mentioned that their closest relationships to individual PNG people came through work. Achieving this connection to PNG people was often described as one of the happiest and most rewarding experiences in PNG. This can be seen in the following quote from Peter, who describes meeting one of his work colleagues.

I formed in particular one particularly close friendship with a guy in PNG who I’m still in contact with and that friendship was probably like the cornerstone of my deeper enjoyment of the whole country. Peter

Peter’s statement indicates that feeling close and connected to PNG people gives a great deal of personal satisfaction to PNG development workers. The connection he made brings both ‘depth’ (and therefore perceived understanding) and enjoyment to the development worker. Peter’s use of the words “cornerstone” also indicates that these connections can be the most desired experience in PNG. The term “cornerstone” also indicates that these connections are vital for development workers’ experiences of PNG. If long-term development workers did not achieve closeness or connection to at least some degree, it would be unlikely that they could, or would, want to stay in PNG. Therefore this quote shows that the work place can be essential in making the connections that development workers require or desire, in order to do their in-country work.
When they made this connection with work colleagues, development workers would often view their colleagues as equals, and imbue them with the same altruistic identity as the one they themselves were attempting to gain through their work. In encounters with PNG work colleagues (where development workers felt a connection), Papua New Guineans were seen as empowered, inspirational change agents. This is illustrated in the next quote, in which Jill describes some of the factors that inspired HIV awareness-raising plays that she produced as part of her work.

…domestic violence [issues]… [had a] very strong influence [on the plays we produced]. My equal in the organisation was a very strong woman and another woman who was a local and was writing the scripts as well. And also we had some very strong female personalities in the drama group as well. So I think we were very sympathetic to female issues and domestic violence. Jill

Unlike some of the quotes in Section 7.2, this quote constructs Papua New Guineans as being supportive, instead of obstructive, to HIV development work. It is important to note that Jill uses (and emphasises) the word ‘equal’ to describe her partner in the organisation. Instead of there being an (implied) superior ‘us’ and an inferior ‘them’, both the Self and the Other are seen as equal. Jill talks about her work colleague and some of the other women in the drama group as being strong, which is a direct contradiction to the idea of a weak Other that is often the marker of the Orientalist paradigm. In the last sentence she talks about a shared sympathy to female issues and domestic violence. This suggests that empathy and connection with these women gave strength and direction to the kind of plays that Jill helped to produce.

This quote shows the potential of making strong connections with PNG development workers to produce situations that may resist Orientalisms. This quote also indicates that a sense of happiness and hope can come from the work place through connecting with PNG people. If these connections are felt by both parties (i.e the Western development worker and the Papua New Guinean development worker), these connections could lead to some genuine cross-cultural exchanges which could lead to the positive implementation of, and change to, the development process.

Yet at the same time it is evident that Jill, in this quote, has given the PNG development workers an identity similar to that which she herself is trying to achieve through development work. They are positioned as empowering or “strong” and determined to bring a more socially
just society, one with less domestic violence, into being. It is not possible to tell from this analysis whether this is an identity that these PNG development workers want to take up.

**Being 'Betrayed' by Papua New Guinean People in the Work Place**

Above, in 7.2., I mentioned the deep feelings of connections that development workers could show towards their PNG colleagues in the work place. These connections could be felt so strongly that they could lead to the Western development worker positioning the PNG development worker as having an identity similar to the one they (attempt to) create for themselves. That is, one of an empowering, socially just, and altruistic person. Yet this could have problematic consequences when Papua New Guinean development workers were perceived to fail to live up to this identity.

This can be seen in the following quote from Paula:

> I remember being really, really upset that one of the guys from work that I, like, rang up from jail because he had beaten up his wife. And I knew that his wife had a young baby and I knew that his wife was HIV positive. So here is someone who I think is a sweet --understanding, really positive, anti discrimination, you know all these --is tolerant, all these sort of ideals that I think he has got through all his education and all his insight into HIV, but still acting in this way that shows a complete lack of insight and complete lack of understanding. Because here he has just beaten his wife into hospital and been put into jail. So I find that very hard, and when you say people are resisting the message, I’m not really sure why people are resisting the message. There are just so many different reasons.

> There’s another one where the person I knew, he was a family man, and I thought he was very committed to his family and kids but also knew that he was sleeping with somebody that was also HIV positive. So he also had all this information and he was a trainer and he was someone who would go into communities and talk about how HIV was spread. So he knew the methods, the transmissions, he knew how to prevent it, and I’m pretty sure that most of the staff were unable --well not unable-- but were not using condoms on a regular basis. So this is this guy who I don’t think is using a condom on a regular basis and he is sleeping with someone who is HIV positive and he’s got a wife and kid. How does he resist that message, that is really confusing (sounding shocked and hurt). Paula
In this quote Paula is shocked and hurt by the types of behaviours of some of her PNG work colleagues; reactions I find quite understandable. What is important in Paula’s response is not the disconnect she feels from her PNG work colleagues, but what she describes as particularly shocking about these experiences. In both cases, she describes how these colleagues were trained and educated about HIV and AIDS, tolerance and anti-discrimination, and this leads her to identify with them, giving them qualities often given to the ideal image of the Self/Westerner in Orientalist discourse (i.e. sweet, tolerant, educated). When these work colleagues engaged in acts that are contradictory to this ideal image, the hurt and the divide are made all the wider (particularly evident in the tone of voice that accompanied this quote).

This quote also shows that these acts had broader implications, as they made Paula lose her sense of understanding as to why PNG people might be resistant to the messages of HIV and AIDS development agencies. Yet at the same time, these movements, distressing as they are, have opened up opportunities for her to question the development process. She is being made to reflect on the fact that there seem to be deep problems in the way HIV and AIDS development is being run if even the ‘teachers’ are not taking up the message. This has also disabled the belief that she ‘knew’ certain PNG people. Ideas that one should and could ‘know’ PNG people and place by living and working with the ‘PNG Other,’ which has links to Orientalisms, are now brought into question.

A number of workers have shown the strong link between empathy and altruism (Batson, Ahmad and Lishner, 2011, Eisenberg, 2002, Clark, 1997, Bondi, 2001). These works suggest that feeling empathy for the ‘Other’ would be tied up with an altruistic identity. So it is interesting to note that it is instances in which PNG development workers are perceived as not being empathetic that tend to cause the greatest levels of distress in Western development workers. At these moments, development workers will exhibit strong emotions that put up barriers between themselves and Papua New Guineans. From Paula’s quote, there is a sense that part of the issue is that she felt her PNG work colleagues were not being empathetic to their partners. This is also evident in the following quote from Maryanne:

**Jack:** Were there times when you just couldn’t empathise with your PNG work colleagues?

**Yeah!** There was always definitely times, you know, there were kind of times like where we were training women to do kind of stuff and I organised their per diem, well, some money to get boats back to their island. And somebody, I don’t know who,
organised for our guy who did all our logistics to send a boat to pick them all up and take them back to all their respective islands. So they kind of had the boat that we were paying for and they also then had the money I had given them to catch the boats back. So in a sense, then, I had to write off this double dipping thing, and again, I was really angry with my work colleagues that went “meh, that’s just the way”. You know, there was an opportunity there and they saw and took it. And I was like “ra ra ra” (shock and anger conveyed). Because we had, like, no budget. Again I was working to this kind of structure that wasn’t applicable, and then it looked like I was corrupt because I not only paid people to catch transport back, but then we had used our transport to take them back. There was times there, I sometimes felt like “BUT I’M GOING TO BE ACCOUNTABLE FOR THIS” (under her breath) fucked.... So there were little times like that. And it would always come back to that kind of stuff. Whereas in Australia you would have almost lost your job. And it was out of your control, so there was times like when I had no control, and I knew I was going to be answerable for that. [In those times] I would just be un-empathic to how they saw things. Maryanne

In this quote Maryanne feels a great deal of anger at the fact that her work colleagues put her in a situation where, from the outside, she might be seen as corrupt. She is particularly shocked and angered at their flippant attitude towards that situation. The description of this flippant attitude suggests that she felt that her work colleagues were not being empathic to her. As a result she cannot connect or empathise with her PNG work colleagues’ way of thinking. It is also evident from this quote that the source of the disconnection is her shock and anger at her work colleagues. Therefore a perceived ‘failure’ to reflect empathy by PNG development workers was a sign of not living up to the ideal of ‘development worker’, and in doing so, strong feelings often associated with betrayal, like anger and confusion, were often felt by development workers.

7.3 Home

Home Behind a Border

In this section I discuss the feelings that development workers had towards their place of residence while in PNG. The similarities between Western development workers’ places of residence were much stronger than their places of work. So this section is much more about how place affected development workers’ emotions than the previous section. I observed that development workers often found rest and relaxation in the physical home that they had in PNG. The home often symbolised a retreat into the self. Home (which was sometimes a hotel
room) was considered to be one of the most grounding places for development workers staying longer than a few weeks at a time.

Section 7.2 demonstrated that development workers were often ungrounded in many aspects of their work life in PNG. This, I argue, is because they often could not articulate altruistic identities. The home provided a place, a solid form of grounding for all kinds of stressors, not just work, as many development workers were destabilised by many aspects of life that were just outside the front door.

Staying in the house or going over to neighbours [within the same fenced compound] was so much more relaxing than going out to other places. Even though I really liked canoeing... I would always have to do it either in the early morning or late at night and just travelling at night, just travelling in the dark, was really stressful. Nearly every time I got into the car it was stressful, it was uncomfortable. Paula

From this quote it can be deduced that Paula feels a sense of vulnerability outside the fenced-in area of the compound. Even though she claims to like activities that occur outside the compound (like canoeing) she claims that there was an element of stress to these activities that made them less relaxing than being in the compound. Paula’s quote also shows what was common in many development workers and me. That is, there was a baseline level of stress and fear every time you left the house in PNG. In this quote I can see parallels with the findings of Walsh (2006 b) (see 7.6), in that ‘home’ for development workers (like expats in Dubai) was a place where they put up a border between themselves and the foreignness outside the door. Within the border of the home you can reconstitute the self and behave contrary to public performances. There is evidence of this in the above quote, as the compound/home (which was seen as relaxing) is working to put a border between Paula and the rest of PNG (which is viewed in this quote as stressful and uncomfortable). I would argue by being ‘relaxed’, the development worker has the ability to be ‘themselves’.

The home, like the resort (see Section 7.4), often segregated development workers from much of Papua New Guinean culture(s) and lifestyle(s). In 7.2 I showed that when places or events blocked development workers from feeling as if they achieved a connection to PNG communities, they tended to ‘other’ the situation, place or person that ‘blocked’ this connection. As the home can disconnect the development worker from PNG, one might expect development workers to ‘other’ the home. However, home was not ‘othered’ for
disconnecting people. In fact, the home’s ability to block out and segregate the development worker from PNG people and place could fulfil a deep desire.

So the segregation [of the home] was useful for having down time, reflecting on my experiences, having time to myself, to recover, recuperate, rest, cook, eat, watch TV and see what was going on in the world, read. If I had thrown myself out to living in the settlement, where I was working, then I don’t think I would have had enough segregation, for me. So in my personal experience there was a need to be separate, I need a wall and I need a door that closes, even though my political view and my idealistic view, was: no I’m here I should live amongst the people I’m working with, I should get closer to the ground, treat this more like anthropology. So there was a disjuncture between what I thought I should do, politically, philosophically and academically and I actually, wanted, or probably needed to do. As a person with limitations and, yeah, needs. Peter

This quote shows that Peter does not ‘other’ the home for segregating him but at first praises it for giving him what he needs. The home’s ability to block connections to PNG people and place is soon viewed in a more ambivalent light. This is evident from the fact that Peter retells some of the internal argument that he had with himself, in which he claims he wants to connect and live within a PNG settlement but this had to be negotiated around a “need” to be separate. Thus this quote illustrates a conflict that many development workers have around their identity, which is Western and separate from the PNG ‘Other’, and their identity as traveller and development worker, who has left the home and the ‘West’ behind, to be immersed in the PNG ‘Other’ (Ahmed, 2000, Molz, 2005, Walsh, 2006 a, McKinnon, 2008). It is evident from this quote that Peter, like a number of other development workers, was aware of this contradiction. Peter’s quote implies that home was considered the place to relax and unwind when things got ‘too hard’, when the development worker’s sense of self was feeling overwhelmed.

Jill expresses this more clearly when she describes what she liked to do to relax and unwind while in PNG.

97 Being overwhelmed was a common emotional stance for many development workers.
I reckon we would have tried to get out of town at least once every few weeks. And spend time with friends probably every weekend. Like, if we weren’t getting out of town we would probably be seeing a local and hang around with them. But like in town or something. Or have them come over with us. And sometimes of course we would just get a laptop and, like, watch movies because we couldn’t... you just had to (laugh). Jill

This quote shows that there are many things that Jill likes to do with her time. And a lot of them involved connecting and interacting with Papua New Guinean people. For example, most of the “out of town” trips mentioned by Jill were to a rural village of her local friends (see Section 7.5) where she could connect with local Papua New Guinean people in a novel environment. She also invites local Papua New Guineans around to her home on some occasions. However she also expresses a need to block out Papua New Guinean culture from her home and engage with Western-centred objects like laptops and DVDs (see Chapter 2.3)

These two quotes from Peter and Jill show that home is an important place in which to perform certain ‘homely’ and often solitary rituals, such as cooking, reading, or watching movies. The use of terms like “need” and “had to” shows the visceral nature of the desire to perform these rituals. What becomes clear with some further reading is that these rituals (even cooking) reaffirm a sense of Western/non-Papua New Guinean belonging.

We lived with other volunteers and there was a very clear focus, at least on my behalf, of cooking, um, good healthy enjoyable meals and trying to vary them from the local fare. You know in Papua New Guinea, I don’t think I’m saying anything that has not been said before, the food is sometimes less than inspiring. Bill

Bill describes the food that he cooks (with his knowledge of cooking developed in Australia) as good, healthy and enjoyable. Next, he ‘others’ Papua New Guinean cuisine, saying that what he cooks is different from the “less than inspiring” “local fare”. By inference, all Papua New Guinean cuisine is then seen as unhealthy and not enjoyable. In ‘othering’ Papua New Guinean food like this, the cooking that Bill performs is marked as distinctly different from the Papua New Guinean cooking, and as such helps to reaffirm a Western identity.

This is also evident in Ted’s quote:

Jack: How would you relax and unwind while in PNG?
I would listen to classical music [at home]. I had the best collection of classical music in PNG if not Oceania. And reading novels is required. I'm a huge fan of young Australian authors getting on their feet. You come back from holidays, we would go on holiday say every two years, and you would have a bag full of books, you are reading these and passing them around and sharing them around [emphasis added]. Ted

Although there is a self-reflective humour in the use of the word “required”, it still suggests the sense of need to indulge in familiar practices. It is also evident that these rituals reproduce a distinctly Western/Australian sense of self, through the type of novels that are read and the type of music that is listened to.

There are parallels between how the Western development worker uses the home and how Walsh (2006 a, 2006 b) describes the rituals and practices in the homes of expats in Dubai. The home is providing a grounding force for the uprooted development worker who feels uprooted every time they leave the house (see Paula's quote at the start of this section). Also the rituals performed in the home, code and demarcate cultural boundaries that tell development workers about themselves and their place in the world (Walsh, 2006 a pg 136). These home activities are therefore marking the development worker as separate from Papua New Guineans.

It is important now to consider what Ahmed (2004) describes as the cultural politics of fear (see Section 7.6). By applying Ahmed’s theory it can be inferred that fear, as in a loss of self98, drives the home actions of the development workers. Outside the home, the worker is uprooted, and trying to live up to an altruistic identity which involves being ‘selfless’ (see Sections 7.6 and 7.2). Such actions threaten the self, which retreats back to protect, and be protected by, what it sees as important i.e. its ‘traditional values’. Ahmed (2006) and Walsh (2006 a) pointed out that these traditional values can often be inherent in the objects, such as DVDs, books and the food a person cooks, for which the home has become a repository. In

98 I want to stress that this is not a fear for personal safety, although such fears are present.
other words, the home is a place for rituals (and the objects involved in these rituals\(^99\)) that re-orientates the Western development worker around a Western way of life or the Western collective. Re-orientating the development workers’ identities around Western ways of life has the potential to reproduce Orientalisms. This is discussed in 7.6.

**Letting off Steam**

The use of the home for orientating becomes particularly apparent when considering its role as a space in which to discuss with friends (typically other Western development workers) the stress of PNG. Many participants talked about meeting up with friends or having dinner parties where they would indulge a process that they called debriefing.

> Jack: What strategies did you have to deal with these discomforting emotions?

> Look I think one of the strategies was having people to talk to… But to have the debrief at the end of the day with your house mates and the volunteers who understood was a really good strategy because then you could just, if it was something you couldn’t deal… [with you could] get off your chest. Jill

From this quote from Jill, it is evident that discussing the stress of PNG with other (Western) volunteers was a good way of dealing with discomforting emotions. In Section 7.2 I describe how discomforting emotions were often the result of being overwhelmed, or having desired goals and trajectories, blocked. Therefore it would seem that talking to other Western development workers about these blockages was a good way to overcome the discomforting emotions that these caused. She describes her house mates and volunteers as people who understand, suggesting she connects with them. This would indicate that the development worker seeks connection in order to re-orientate themself, when connection to PNG people, place and culture is lost.

My personal experience of debriefing during my time in PNG was very similar to the one described by Jill. I had several dinner parties and discussions with development workers in

\(^99\) By objects I mean things such as Australian novels, laptops and DVDs, although the street-bought, pirated nature of some of these DVDs would suggest a form of hybridisation of these practices that gives them a certain Papua New Guinean flavour.
which I could, in her words, ‘get things off my chest’. At these sessions I would get some release and understanding about issues and aspects of culture that I found confusing and baffling in my day-to-day life. I found this process to be cathartic.

I went to a dinner once again with expats. It was a home cooked meal and it reminded me of a dinner party back at home. We talked disparagingly of local beliefs in faith-based healers and rumours that people behind the scenes peddling them might be, or are expats. Issues of gender were frequently talked about and how the Bible strengthened gender problems. We talked openly about problems of the Bible. A cornerstone of much of PNG culture (orientalising). ... Yet in hindsight I’m kind of ashamed at how good it felt to get drunk and vent some of the frustration and confusion I have over PNG. I don’t think we solved much. Jack Aisbett

In the above quote, I describe a dinner party that I went to. The quote suggests that I and the other guests spent a lot of time talking about problems and frustrations of doing HIV and AIDS development work in PNG. This quote shows that there are a lot of aspects that I don’t like. In fact, the next day, when I wrote this quote, I describe the whole experience as “orientalising.” I describe the dinner party as a process by which we have ‘othered’ and disparaged PNG people in order to feel better and more self-assured. Although in hindsight I am ashamed of my participation in such conversations, I still admit to a cathartic relief at being able to “vent” some of the frustrations and confusion that I had. At the end of the quote I say “I don’t think we solved much” indicating that, in my view, the only thing we gained from this process was a release of emotion (i.e. a catharsis). Cathartic experiences are well described by Peter who responded as follows to my question on his strategies for dealing with emotions:

Well, immediately, there were two other young white people in the town that I was in. Both were volunteers, international volunteers, and so we would meet regularly, like twice a week, either in pairs or in groups of three and we would talk about our experience in the highlands and in Papua New Guinea, like that. Letting-off steam was really useful. And because there was three of us and people would come to visit us, and then having those two other people would bring in a lot more visitors. Also going around PNG and speaking to people who lived in different cities about the nation as a whole, like going down to Madang, going down to Port Moresby, speaking to other volunteers. Putting your own experiences in perspective. Peter

Peter’s use of the term “letting-off steam” shows the cathartic nature of this debriefing process. This quote also suggests how it is a widespread process among development workers
in PNG. Peter meets development workers from all around the country and lets-off steam with them. It is also interesting to note that Peter ends his quote indicating this speaking with ‘white’ volunteers puts his experiences “in perspective”. Thus there is the impression that this cathartic ritual helps to re-orientate Western development workers. As each individual development worker is being re-orientated by other Westerners, the process is likely to help reinforce a Western mindset and identity, and, by inference, Orientalisms (see 7.6).

The importance of debriefing as a form of catharsis is echoed in Bill’s comment on how he felt on completing the semi-structured interview with me:

> Look as you can see it’s like a debrief, it’s probably a good cathartic confessional process, in my lapsed Catholic upbringing. No I think it’s good. Bill

In my own experience, and for most of my interviewees, debriefing often happened in the home. Home provided a space for a cathartic release, that is, a purging of emotional tension (Princeton University, 2011). There seems to be a missed opportunity, therefore, in these debriefs, as they seem to be more about letting-off steam (and potentially re-orienting around lines of whiteness) than about discussing reflexively with other development workers how the positionality of being a development worker might be implicit in some of the issues that are causing the stress in the first place. Also, in Section 7.2 I discuss how feeling overwhelmed was often the result of the disorientation caused by blocking some of the lines or trajectories by which development workers orientate themselves in the West. Stress accumulates at these points of social and physical pressure (Ahmed, 2006). It is likely, then, that being at home or in a similar safe haven enables catharsis, by purging these blockages. Home clears the blockages to the usual lines and trajectories that a Western development worker follows. This enables these lines and trajectories to be pursued again the next day. This process could lead to problematic outcomes, as a number of the usual lines and trajectories by which a Western development worker orientates his or her self are likely to be oriented around, or at least implicitly associated with, Orientalisms and other forms of hegemonic imperialism. This is likely to form a repetitive process in which lines and trajectories which have been blocked or

---

100 For those development workers who did not stay long enough in the country, debriefing was still considered an important part of the process of dealing with the emotions felt in PNG. However these debriefings occurred when they returned ‘home’ to Australia.
resisted by the PNG context can be renewed. This repetition is important because Said (1978, 1993a) and others (Ahmed, 2006, Sharp and Briggs, 2006) claim that it is through the repetition of Orientalisms that they gain their power and hegemony. Another important point about this catharsis is that it circumvents the feelings of disorientation and discomfort that seem associated with development workers acting reflexively.

Kapoor’s (2005) work suggests development workers could move beyond ‘empire building’ in their development work by publicising their desires and their complicity with hegemony. In doing so, the actions and procedures that a development worker performs would be open to public deliberation, particularly by the clients of development workers, who, as it stands, often have very little say about how they are to be ‘developed’. Yet such openness is difficult, as even when debriefing amongst themselves workers appear to prefer to seek the cathartic release of venting frustration. Even so, these debriefs do involve moments in which development workers are more open about their feelings and beliefs than usual. Therefore if development workers on debriefing can begin to note the disorientation and frustration that they wish to expel, and then act reflexively, they may be able to use the debriefing to express their feelings and desires about development outcomes (which may otherwise remain internalised), as well as to acknowledge their complicity with Orientalism. In doing so, these debriefs could play an important step in moving development beyond Orientalisms.

Breaching the Border

To imply that the borders of home were impenetrable to ‘Others’ would, however, be misleading. Home was a permeable barrier, allowing both controlled and uncontrolled entrances of PNG people, place and culture. Development workers (particularly later into their placements) would form connections with certain Papua New Guinean people. When friendships were made, home became one of the places to meet.

Jack: What would you do to relax and unwind while in PNG?

I would go bush walking. I did a couple of walks here and there. You would go to the hotel bars and that, if you wanted to have a drink on Friday night or Saturday. Or we would just invite friends over to the house and have some drinks and a BBQ. John

Jack: Were your friends more locals or expats?
I fell in with the locals much more than the expats, [so my friends tended to be more locals] John

In the first quote, John lists several activities that were common among development workers, particularly those staying for around a year or more. Going bushwalking indicates a common desire in development workers to get back to/have an adventure in nature (discussed in Section 7.5). John also lists going to hotel bars (discussed in Section 7.4) and ‘hanging out’ with mainly Papua New Guinean friends. Having Papua New Guinean friends was common among development workers but is was less common for development workers to say that they “fell in” with a local scene, instead of an expat or volunteer scene. When this did occur, it tended to be when development workers were positioned (like John was) in places with a small, or no, expat or volunteer community. This could possibly indicate that ease of access to Westerners can affect the nature and number of bonds that a development worker makes to Papua New Guinean people.

It is also evident from John’s quote that his house plays an integral role in fostering those connections. It was in his house that he opened up to these Papua New Guinean colleagues in his moments of free time. In my experience, and in the experience of most development workers I interviewed, it was often Papua New Guinean work colleagues, or Papua New Guinean people who lived on the compound, who would be invited to enter the development worker’s home. One could argue that this was the result of similar (more white/Western) discourses and orientations on the world. However it could also be the result of proximity of contact, as the development worker was more likely to make friends with colleagues or neighbours. Connection to Papua New Guinean people was one of the most rewarding and desired outcomes for development workers in PNG (see Chapter 7.2).

On the other hand, some of the most harrowing moments for development workers were when PNG people, place or culture entered the home uninvited.

101 Many volunteer development workers expressed to me that there were two types of Western communities in PNG, those they labelled as “the expats” and those like them who were volunteers from Western countries.

102 This should be investigated more fully in future research.
The first night I was in Hagen I was awoken to gunfire and hid under the bed. I just didn’t know how to deal with it. I never worked out how to deal with it. I never worked out how to deal with it. Well at least a guy like me doesn’t (laugh). If you are a soldier you would. Steve

Steve’s quote shows that when the sound of gunfire enters his home, there is an unwelcomed breach of the borders of the home. With this breach comes great fear. Ahmed (2004) argues that fear is the result of that which can cause a loss of self coming towards you, breaching the borders of the self. So it can be deduced from Steve’s quote that when gunfire sound enters the home it is causing a great breach of the self. As a result, Steve’s borders of himself are shrunk by that fear to the confines of the space under his bed.

Yeah, oh, I lived in a hotel room which was, like, they’d wash the bed sheets and do everything like that for me, so that was ok. Occasionally it would flood. It flooded once and wrecked all my books. And when you only have a few books and they are like your, the only thing that makes your room look different from everybody else’s room. That was pretty, yeah, (stuttering and upset) I actually got really upset. Peter

Peter’s quote also shows that when the outside world entered his hotel room uninvited it brought with it a loss of self which the development worker found traumatic. It is evident from Peter’s quote that a sense of individuality and self comes from the objects that occupy the home. When the flood waters enter the home and destroy those things, a loss of the self is felt. This loss is felt because his room becomes like “everybody else’s”. Even after the fact, these losses shape, or more precisely move him to, discomfiting emotions that can be felt when one’s orientation is lost.

### 7.4 The Role of the Resort and Western Leisure Life

#### Contradiction of Susan’s Work Life and Leisure Life

This section looks specifically at the role of Western leisure centres in the Western development worker’s life in PNG. The following story illustrates the work and leisure life that such a worker has.

Susan was a Western development worker who worked in Port Moresby (POM) on gender issues and prevention of violence against women. She worked with youth, mostly male, from
settlements in the POM area. She used tools like art/painting to raise awareness about gender violence and its relation to HIV risk.

She showed a desire to be good at her job by articulating the identity of passionate development worker connected to PNG people when she stated:

What people need and respect is straight info, clear info. Susan

To me it seemed she was passionately moved by the plight of Papua New Guinean people and wanted to give them clear information. Implied in this quote is that clear, straight information is information that PNG people connect with. Also evident is that she feels some form of connection to PNG people as she feels she knows what they need in relation to HIV and AIDS development. In other sections of her interview Susan also expressed a great deal of empathy for PNG peoples and the need for hope in the development challenges that they face.

When asked what she thought of PNG, Susan stated the following:

I loved the scenery, the landscape; the colours in Madang are amazing. It is such a beautiful place. The fear around security made me irritable, and the poor telecommunications and crappy bureaucracy made me very, very cranky. The absolute failure of GoPNG\(^{103}\) and the provincial governments, their abrogation of their responsibilities as leaders, makes me furious. The fact that the police are often nongs, ineffective and sometimes worse - perpetrators of crime- is kind of par for the course in many Third World locales. The worst, probably, is the fact that PNG is becoming too expensive for Papua New Guinean's to live in. POM has become a place of two solitudes, where the settlements' poverty subsidises the luxuries (maids, security guards, gardeners...) of the numerous advisors and technical experts (mining, LNG, AIDS industry...). So the social inequity bothered me. I loved going to small villages, whether by Cessna or boat, and I rarely felt worried about my personal safety. The bulk of my interactions with Papua New Guineans was positive. I was robbed 2 times (on the same day), ... [but] for the most part, Papua New Guineans were kind and generous and fun with me, and I felt that they were looking out FOR me. Susan

\(^{103}\) The Papua New Guinea Government.
Susan’s quote describes many elements of her experiences in PNG. It tells the reader that she loved many aspects of her life there. She loved the scenery, the landscape and found “for the most part, Papua New Guineans were kind and generous and fun...”. Susan’s quote also shows a deep concern for the welfare of Papua New Guinean people. She expresses this concern by stating that the social inequality bothers her. She explains how “the worst” problem where she lived in PNG is the fact that ordinary Papua New Guineans can no longer afford to live in POM. This concern for the ‘ordinary’ Papua New Guinean could be linked, to some degree, to her desire for an ethical development worker identity. It is interesting to note that she feels an ever-present fear particularly in her time in Moresby. This fear makes her slightly “irritable” the whole time she is in Port Moresby. Yet she finds escape from this fear by going to the “small villages”. Implicit in this quote is that the small villages also gave her a break from the sometimes overwhelming fears and frustrations of working in PNG (see Sections 7.2 and 7.3). This includes the problems of infrastructure issues, government failure and corruption.

Susan also liked to visit the resort complexes in PNG, particularly after busy, stressful periods at work. At these times she would go to a resort spa, to get “a massage or other ‘pampering’ treatments”. She also joined, or frequented, some of the more up-market clubs in PNG, as she describes:

I joined the Madang [Yacht] Club because it was a place to visit and because it had a very mixed (national ex-pat) membership. So it was a homey place to go to. I’m still a member. In POM, I used to go to the yachtie for the good wireless, but I didn’t join. Too pricey. I used my Madang club reciprocal membership. I joined the Aviat [another “up market” club] to use the pool, but never really got into the social aspects -- too many old fat Aussie blokes.

From this quote it is evident that Susan had mixed feelings about a number of these exclusive places. Her quote tells the reader that she frequented a number of them and got some enjoyment and benefit from them, even finding one as home-like. Yet she also felt the need to clarify why it was okay to like these places, saying that the clubs she joined had very mixed

---

104 This fear tended to plague most Western development workers and will be discussed in detail in 7.6.
membership, indicating a concern that these places could be seen as segregated\textsuperscript{105}. Susan later admits that these places are segregated, but she claims that the segregation is “about class, in the Weberian sense”. She is also keen to distance herself from many of the ‘social aspects’ of the clubs that she visits and in doing so indicates that these social aspects seem to be a particular form of Western culture she does not enjoy. She is disparaging of this culture because it incorporates, “too many old fat” Australian males.

This story represents a contradiction I found in interviews with most of the Western development workers, and in my own journal. The working-day life takes place in urban areas and requires connection to a predominately urban indigenous community. Yet the Western development worker chooses to relax and unwind in situations isolated from this urban indigenous life style (namely in remote villages and resorts). This section will investigate some of the emotions felt by development workers in these places and suggest reasons as to why they choose these places to relax and unwind.

**Ambivalent Feelings on Escaping to a Comfort Zone**

Just as Susan enjoyed being pampered at the resorts, my other interviewees and I often enjoyed these places. Echoing Molz’s (2005) findings about travellers and McDonald’s, the development workers found these places a good escape and a comfort zone (see Chapter 2).

\[\text{I do like the swimming pool at the Airways [Hotel] so that would be one place [to relax and unwind]. I would pretend that I’m a guest. In Port Moresby I guess I don’t think that there really is too many. Yeah, Madang is a nice place and I feel quite safe there so I go there. We’ve got a program in Bougainville that is really nice... Yeah there’s a lot to be said for those swimming pools. You can have a drink. No, hotels are good. And plus you don’t have to move around at night if you go during the day. Christine}\]

In the above quote you can see that Christine gains a sense of comfort from hotels. She finds them a great place to relax and unwind. This quote suggests that Christine feels somewhat naughty or ‘indulgent’ going to these hotels, describing how she pretends to be a guest so that

\textsuperscript{105} Other development workers commented that these places were quite cut off from most Papua New Guinean nationals, and gave resorts and clubs a segregated feeling. See later in the section.
she can ‘sneak in’. She also expresses some sense of comfort and enjoyment about going to some of the less-urbanised centres of PNG. Part of this comfort in these areas comes from her belief that they are safer than the more urbanised areas of PNG. She then reiterates that hotels “are good” largely because they offer facilities that the development worker feels they can’t access elsewhere in PNG, like a swimming pool, and where they feel that it’s okay to let their guard down (i.e. have a drink). Her statement that “you don’t have to move around at night” indicates that hotels feel as if they provide a bubble of safety. It seems, therefore, that one of the most comforting things about hotels, like all places that Christine finds relaxing, is the sense of safety that they offer. Evidenced in both Susan’s and Christine’s quotes is the fact that fears are often a constant, constraining and significant factor in a development worker’s experience in PNG. (See 7.5 and 7.6 for more examples.) Perhaps that is why development workers like them so much, for they provide a (short-term) release from the anxiety and fear that workers often felt elsewhere in PNG.

This sense, that resorts could offer shelter from the stressors outside their walls, is also evident in the following extract of a semi-structured interview with Tamara:

Jack: … when I went to the Holiday Inn I felt I could just let my guard down for a bit, you know, just ‘zone out’ for a bit and not have to worry.

Tamara: …I know what you mean [about going to the Holiday Inn and just letting your guard down and] having a nice coffee and just sitting down taking a breather and feeling like you are back in normality.

What is also evident in the above exchange is that resorts were giving Tamara and me a space where we could act differently to how we acted in other more ‘public’ spaces in PNG. Tamara talks about how they made us feel like we were “back in normality”. Normality for a Western development worker is often a Western/white lifestyle. This shows how resorts had an ability

106 Madang and Bougainville are provinces in PNG that have only a few very small urban centres. It is likely that something in the ‘village’ lifestyle of these places appealed to the development worker (see 7.5).

107 In my personal experience, going to resorts offered, not a full release from the baseline level of anxiety I felt, but they definitely turned the level of anxiety down substantially.
to orientate the Western development worker back along Western lines of thinking (see Section 7.3). This will be discussed in more detail in Section 7.6.

This sense that resorts could offer a release from the constant and baseline stressors of PNG was echoed in the following two quotes from Steve and Tina:

I couldn't really afford them. I went to them on occasions... I guess they were good, I guess they provided an escape. I guess they provided an escape for those who could afford them. To some level they were an oasis. Steve

You do feel kind of relaxed; you do feel that this is kind of a nice bubble in the middle of all this mayhem. But it's not real... Tina

In the quote from Steve it is evident that he refers to resorts as both an “escape” and an “oasis”. The image of an oasis engenders the idea that the environment outside is hostile and stressful. Yet this quote also shows that he is ambivalent about resorts. He suggests he couldn’t really afford them, indicating that a sense of exclusion on ‘class’ grounds can be felt by development workers at these places. Steve, who was on a ‘volunteer salary’, was likely to feel this income and class pressure more strongly than ‘professional’ development workers. This sense of exclusion is evident in Christine’s quote also, where she pretends to be a guest at the hotel in order to be let in.

In the quote from Tina there is once again the idea that resorts block out the perceived stressors of PNG for development workers. Her quote suggests that these places are ‘good’ or ‘relaxing’ because they provide shelter from the “mayhem” that is all the foreignness of Papua New Guinean cultures. And by inference, the culture within these places was not foreign but a familiar ‘white’/Western culture. Perhaps this is why Susan described the yacht club as “homey.”

Yet inherent in both these quotes is also the impression that Steve and Tina don’t feel quite right being in these places. As Tina says in the earlier quote, they are “not real”. And development workers saw them as such, as familiar ‘Western’ spaces that have followed us to the ‘foreign’ space that is PNG. This is illustrated by the following quotes:

...You can sit comfortably in air-conditioning, so I guess those things are good but... I guess that's where kind of a lot of the contradictions [between your life style and that of the Papua New Guineans] become obvious. David
This quote suggests that David likes the Western comforts available in resorts which are often not available elsewhere in PNG (i.e. air-conditioning). Next he says “so I guess those things are good”, indicating ambivalence towards these places. Finally he suggests that this ambivalence comes from the fact that resorts, for him, throw up the contradiction between his lifestyle and that of many PNG people. It makes him reflect on the fact that he is sitting in comfort and ‘they’ are not. There is thus an implied sense of guilt in this quote. I too felt this contradiction and the guilt about ‘indulging’ in these comforts when I was at these places. David’s quote is also suggesting that resorts segregate the development worker from PNG people. This was more strongly expressed in the following quote:

[So] yeah the resort culture is just strange with the rest what you see.... I mean you do see Papua New Guineans in there but, it’s very much 70% expat and maybe 30% Papua New Guinean. Tina

These quotes suggest that the development worker feels that resorts are quite segregated and disconnected from the rest of the Papua New Guinean experience. In Section 7.2 I discussed how connecting with PNG people and culture was important for forming development workers’ desired identity as professional, ethical and altruistic, so the segregated nature of the resort disturbs them (i.e. it makes them feel “strange”)\(^{108}\). For me, this feeling manifested itself in guilt at enjoying something that also seemed to reproduce a colonial lifestyle of ‘white’ privilege.

I ... went to the Holiday Inn to use the internet. There is a comfort you get from the place as a white Westerner. It allows escape into a hideaway of whiteness, of wealth and elegance; there are also plenty of white people; to me it inspires images of those ‘elegant’ places... where white people came to ‘hang out’ in our colonial past. Jack Aisbett 7/5/2008

In the above journal extract I indicate that there is very much a ‘white’/Western nature to these resorts, calling it “a hideaway of whiteness”. I got a strong impression that these places were orientated around ‘whiteness’ and alluded to a colonial past of Western elitism. Ahmed

\(^{108}\) This could indicate that resorts can disorientate the development worker by blocking their ability to connect with the Papua New Guinean ‘Other’.
(2006) claims the objects (e.g. people and places, etc) can be orientated around certain concepts like ‘white’ and ‘Western’. She claims that objects orientated around ‘whiteness’ can form “lines” that block non-Western trajectories. Perhaps, then, it is the ‘white’/’Western’ orientation of these resorts that is blocking development workers’ connections to Papua New Guinean people, which ironically gives them a reprieve. My use of the word ‘elegant’ was actually in reference to the classist nature of old colonial manor houses. Therefore resorts are also orientated around a class element that blocks connections to many PNG people.

Because development workers wanted to connect to the local Papua New Guinean people, they often expressed a desire to move beyond the isolating effects of the resorts/clubs, and connect with the greater community. Some Western development workers expressed this desire to move beyond and transform themselves as a frustration with, or dislike of, particular social aspects of these resort-like places. As quoted earlier, Susan referred disparagingly to the ‘many old fat Australian men’. For John, it was contempt for a drinking culture at these places that he was beginning to fall into.

[I] would go to the hotel bars ... and there was a period there where I drank a LOT but I stopped doing that. You know when I saw myself going down that route that a lot of expats...[in PNG do]. John

This quote suggests that John feels he made a choice to transcend the self as it stands and to articulate his ‘ethical’ development-worker identity (see 7.2 and 7.6). He is changing, from a big drinker who frequents hotel bars with white expats, to someone (as expressed later in the interview) who doesn’t drink as much and who mainly “fell in with the [PNG] locals”. In doing so, his choice of venue in which to socialise began to change to either his or a friend’s home (see Section 7.3).

---

109 Ahmed (2006) uses this term to describe Western identity politics and not just ‘white’ skin.

110 It is important to note that Susan (see Section 7.3.), who is a sociologist, at a later point claimed that race had very little to do with the nature of resorts and yacht clubs and that the nature of resorts had a lot to do with class.

111 Achieving closeness and connections were often seen a real ‘resource’ for achieving positive change in regards to HIV and AIDS in the community (see Section 7.2.).
It is also interesting to note the ‘othering’ of other white folk in the statements of Susan and John. This might be a way for a development worker to justify to themself what they are doing in these places that reinforce a colonial power relation. The participants seem to be saying that, while they might use the clubs, they are not really like the other people, those insensitive expats who frequent them. This form of ‘othering’ was strongly present in one of the interviewees I talked to, who expressed anger at what he perceived to go on in these clubs:

Yeah that’s right out to Lamana Gold\textsuperscript{112}, yeah, bad news mate, bad news that place.
Um, you know, young guys from fucking development organisations, dancing with 13 year old prostitutes! (yelling) Might be part of the problem, kids! Bill

Bill’s frustration with resorts and ‘other’ development workers who visit these clubs is clearly evident in this quote. He is implying that these clubs are a vector for the spread of HIV and AIDS, and one of the reasons why women are infected earlier than men. In doing so he is ‘othering’ the other development workers who frequent those clubs. The quote also labels the club element of resorts as a cause of social problems (i.e. under-aged prostitution). Later on in the interview Bill states the following:

[We would occasionally go to one of the] two, maybe three locations where we could have a drink in comfort when we wanted to. Bill

It was my experience that the only locations where one could “have a drink in comfort” was a bar/club attached to a resort complex or the bar attached to a building like a yacht club. Bill’s partner also mentioned that they played tennis on occasions\textsuperscript{113}. The courts were also located at resorts or at locations that engender similar contradictory experiences/emotions in the development workers. Bill’s experience typifies the fact that, even though there was a desire to be transformed in ways that facilitated connection to community, for the most part

\textsuperscript{112} This is a bar/night club attached to a resort in Port Moresby.

\textsuperscript{113} It is important to note that Bill and his partner also mentioned several other activities that were not related to resort culture before mentioning these ‘resort’- based activities. Therefore resort-based activities were not their preferred choice of leisure activities while in PNG. Some of these other activities will be discussed in 7.5.
development workers (and I) would still visit such resorts and clubs several times a week. In fact, half of the interviewees actually lived in a resort complex\textsuperscript{114}. Perhaps the reason for this lies in the fear that development workers feel while living and working in PNG (see 7.6).

### 7.5 Heading for the Hills

This section will investigate development workers’ choice of heading to remote villages to relax and unwind. It will investigate some of the emotions felt in these localities and the reasons why development workers feel that way. On the whole, going to a village was seen as a positive experience which development workers desired to have. As a whole, village life was enjoyed by development workers because it provided relief from security issues, facilitated connections with PNG people, and gave the development worker a chance to have an adventure and ‘get back to nature’. Yet development workers still, on occasions, felt discomforted by their experiences in a village. The main cause of their discomfort was when they felt that their position as Westerner reinforced colonial power structures between Westerners and Papua New Guineans.

### Escaping to the Safety of the Village

In my discussions with Susan (see Section 7.4) she said:

\begin{quote}
I loved going to small villages, whether by Cessna or boat, and I rarely felt worried about my personal safety. Susan
\end{quote}

In this quote Susan explains two things about the village that she enjoys. One is the ‘adventure’ of getting there by a small aircraft or by boat. The other point she makes is that at the village she is rarely worried about personal safety. As discussed in 7.3 and 7.4, fear plays an ever-present role in development workers’ experience of (particularly urban) PNG. I also mentioned that this fear was a constant baseline fear. So what Susan suggests is that village stays tend to turn down, or block, this anxiety. From my experience of how debilitating this fear can be, having a break from it is a welcomed experience. So, to the development worker,

\textsuperscript{114} This was not always by choice. It was often the choice of development agencies to house their operatives in hotels.
the village served as a place where one could take sanctuary from the fear and stressors of the city. Getting away and escaping the stressors was seen as a must for all development workers situated in an urban environment.

Well, Alatal was really busy it was the hub for the whole province, I mean it was small but it was super busy. The village was relaxing, and beautiful. Rowena

Rowena’s quote suggests how, to the development worker, the village often became the antithesis of the urban life. The city was stressful, busy and (to other development workers) scary. In contrast the village was both beautiful and relaxing. The juxtaposition of these two ways of seeing the urban and the rural is reminiscent of the call back to the ‘simple life’ that is an aspect of the primitivism movement. Inherent in such calls back to the ‘simple life’, is the Orientalist trope in which PNG peoples and cultures in their village life are marked as unchanging. Calls to the ‘simple life’ therefore simplify the village experience into something knowable and accessible to the Western development worker.
Enjoyment of the Simple/Primitive Life

After explaining how the village life was relaxing and beautiful, Rowena goes on to say the following:

You know it was hard work, village life but (pause) it's a novelty for me as well. It’s not that for someone who lives in the village but for me it’s a novelty to walk down to the river to get water and you know... Rowena

Rowena’s statement illustrates what I and other development workers felt when visiting a village. There is an enjoyment and the “novelty” of getting back to nature, having to get water from the river. She talks of the work being “hard”, but implied in the quote is a sort of wholesomeness about this work. Rowena also claims that this experience would be different if she was someone from the village. This indicates that Rowena has self-awareness about the role and position in these village situations, which means she is aware of viewing the tasks she undertakes at the village and the lifestyle, through Western eyes. This was echoed in my journal from my time in village life.

I went and collected the firewood today. I really enjoyed that. I’m so glad I finally made it out to a rural village. This was the kind of experience I really longed for. I know it’s the wrong way to think but this to me is the ‘real’ PNG. When I brought back the firewood the whole village was cheering and laughing. I felt kind of embarrassed about that. I know why they are cheering, it’s because it’s really funny for a white man to be doing this sort of work. Since I came here [people have] been basically serving me hand and foot giving me so much stuff. It’s really nice and they are so generous to me, but kind of wish they didn’t give me so much stuff. It was part of the reason why I collected the firewood in the first place, so they wouldn’t feel that they had to keep doing everything for me. Jack Aisbett

My quote shows that what I really desired out of my experiences in PNG was this village stay. It was something novel and different to me, and it filled some of my conceptions about what PNG should be like. There was a feeling of adventure about the whole thing. Having an
adventurer was mentioned by other development workers also. So there is an adventure aspect to the village life, from which the development worker gets enjoyment. I also liked how my time in the village enabled me to provide my basic needs for myself¹¹⁵. It is interesting to note that later on in my journal I suggest there is some appeal to living in the “wild” just outside the village, something that I was “invited” to do by several villagers. For me, the village allowed me to indulge in a primitivism where I could ‘get back to nature’. Yet also in my quote is ambivalence around being given so much help and support by the villagers. This will be discussed in the next section.

Ambivalence Towards the Position as ‘Honoured Guest’

In my journal extract above I admit, although somewhat shamefully, that I liked being waited on “hand and foot” yet at the same time felt bad about how I was positioned in the village. I felt that I didn’t deserve to be given such a grand welcoming and treatment which I couldn’t repay. I also felt that it embodied some of the worst aspects of the colonial legacy where the ‘white’ man was put on a pedestal above his ‘black servants’. This feeling led me to express in my journal that I felt like “the biggest colonial bastard”¹¹⁶. The quote also shows that I tried to do acts such as collecting firewood, to break down this pedestal so that I could have, what I felt would be, a more genuine interaction with people. To me, therefore, the position that a ‘white’ development worker occupies in a village can sometimes block the connectivity that development workers are trying to achieve. Similar ambivalences to this positionality were expressed by Jill.

We would go and visit friends’ villages which was just fantastic, yeah, we were really lucky, just so looked after and I feel like we did it a lot, but we probably didn’t do it that much. But when we did it’s that whole, you know, you’re going into no running water, no electricity, um you’re kind of…doing it, not tough, but you’re kind of getting back to nature, like the way that we were for so long and see how people live so simply and so effectively. And they don’t really feel like they are missing out on much.

¹¹⁵ The whole time outside my shack I had an entourage of young men who helped me do a lot of the tasks so it was more like being without the aid of Western technology than ‘by myself’ per se.

¹¹⁶ This was said in relation to summing up my experience in the village. I also state that this was the place that I found the most deeply fulfilling, fascinating and enjoyable.
I really like that. I think some of the highlights for me was going to the villages, certainly I had a really, some beautiful experiences and people were just so generous in what they showed us and what they…. You know you would go and people would put on a big spread for you and you’d go ‘oh gosh!’ how much money have they wasted. So you’d bring supplies and probably perpetuate the cargo cult of people bringing stuff, you just want to contribute how you can. Jill

In Jill’s quote there is a list of factors that she liked about the village life. There is a familiar primitivism in Jill’s notion that going back to the village is “getting back to nature”. She thereby reproduces the Orientalist trope by which the village life is represented as timeless and unchanging. She enjoys the fact that in her view, the villagers “don’t really feel like they are missing out on much”. It is important to note that the village allows her to connect in positive ways to PNG people, which she also likes, stating she had “some beautiful experiences and people were just so generous”. Yet also evident is that she feels a discomfort, similar to mine, at the extent of the generosity expressed. She mentions a feeling of guilt, believing she could be perpetuating the ‘cargo cult’ status. This guilt (which I also felt) comes from a cycle where; because she has had so much given to her by the PNG villagers she feels the pressing need to “contribute how [she] can” (i.e. by giving ‘cargo’). In doing so she feels guilty about perpetrating a “cargo cult” mentality. Her quote shows that there are ways of behaving in a village stay that have roots in colonialism.

7.6 Discussion

Altruistic Identities and the Development Process

In this chapter I have shown how a Western development worker’s identity is tied-up with acts of altruism and compassion. The actions of Western development workers are often grounded in a sense of hope that, as a development professional, one might bring into being a better future (McKinnon, 2008). When such identities are articulated, the Western development worker can feel as if they are an ethical advocate for poor communities, building and strengthening social justice through their actions. Therefore, to articulate these identities brings happiness to the development worker.

Several of the quotes in Section 7.2 suggest that it is not the goal of development workers to implement policy, as such. Instead, they saw their goal as helping and supporting the PNG people. Moments when the development worker and their organisation succeeded in building
connections and promoting happiness in PNG people were considered the signs of success. Having such goals as the measure of success, and not ‘successful’ implementation of policies, shows the potential for the development worker to subvert some of the hegemonic and Orientalising processes embedded in development policy (see Chapter 6). This is because the development worker has positioned themselves as one who struggles to bring this hopeful, more just, future into being (McKinnon, 2008).

Yet the development worker is positioned within a system that is heavily influenced by the recommendation of policy experts and policy protocol (Mosse, 2004). So as they succeed in articulating their identities as ‘selfless’ and altruistic, development workers also ‘succeed’ in implementing policy that has Orientalist roots. In addition, when development workers succeed in successfully making a change on the ground, they feel happy and confident, thereby making their emotions and identity align with the feelings of positivity and confidence found in policy documents (see Chapter 6). It follows that development workers may be seen as embroiled in hegemonic struggles. Achieving their desired identity must be viewed reflexively, to assess which aspects of Orientalisms were resisted, and which were incorporated, in their successes.

Even though ‘altruistic’ identities have the ability to resist\textsuperscript{117} possible social injustices, like Orientalisms, which are embedded in policy documents, there are a number of problematic elements to such identities. Heron (2007) describes how the altruistic desires of development workers can often be caught up in colonial and post-colonial ideas and assumptions about what it means to be a ‘good’ Westerner. Some of these assumptions function as Orientalisms. For example, the choice to go overseas is often predicated on the presumption that, as a Western development worker, one can somehow help to redeem a desperate situation; a situation that the local population seems incapable of redeeming. Many of the above quotes in 7.2, where development workers position themselves as altruistic, suggest such behaviours occurring in PNG, as all development workers at least implied that their work was making a

\textsuperscript{117} Altruistic identities can resist hegemony by encouraging people to change policy and implement it in ways that connected better with PNG people and more likely to be liked by PNG people (see 7.2 and 7.6 above)
difference. Such practices make altruism contingent on positioning the Third World ‘Other’ as available to be changed, saved or improved. It is also contingent on the belief that as ‘Westerners’ (or people from the First World), they have an entitlement and an obligation to intervene and steer the affairs of the ‘East’ (Heron, 2007 pg 44). Such thinking is consistent with Orientalisms as it produces the Orientalist dichotomy of, and justifies the need for, a form of Western intervention and control of the ‘Other’ (Said, 2003). As such, it is important to be reflexive of just how and why a Western development worker wishes to articulate an altruistic identity.

Equally, it is important to note that often development workers cannot articulate their desired identity. Section 7.2 indicated that when development workers failed to achieve their desired goals, there was a strong feeling of discomfort and failure. This feeling is highly connected to the sense of disorientation Ahmed (2006) describes in “Queer Phenomenology”, in which one loses the desired trajectory. In this case, the desired trajectory is the articulation of an altruistic identity. Heron (2007) showed that Western development workers often head overseas because they assume that they can help in Third World crises. To end up in a state of disorientation where one cannot articulate a helping identity can therefore bring into question such thinking: development workers can begin to question their helping motive, and the ability of the development practice that they are involved in, to help. There is evidence of this in several quotes in Section 7.2, particularly Maryanne’s quote in which she wondered “are we causing damage?” This can be taken as a sign that disorientation can lead to more reflexive moments as development workers begin to question the Orientalist idea that Western development intervention necessarily leads to improved circumstances, or at the very least does not cause harm. In doing so, it can be seen as a starting point by which the development worker can begin to question their own positionality and that of their development agency and industry in the scheme of First World/Third World or ‘East’/‘West’ politics. Such reflexivity should therefore be encouraged, as representing a moment of resistance and struggle with Orientalist, as well as other forms of, hegemony.

---

To determine whether the work of the development workers was actually making a difference to some PNG people is beyond the scope of this PhD.
Yet these moments of disorientation can be very distressing for development workers, who often feel a great deal of discomfort and sense of failure at these moments. If the opportunity for reflexivity that these moments produce is not acknowledged or taken up, then a development worker’s emotional response to disorientation can lead to the ‘othering’ of PNG peoples and places. This is because a failure to achieve one’s desired goal can often slip from disorientation into anger or frustration. If the development worker does not reflect on this anger, it tends to ‘stick’ more to the ‘shortcomings’ of PNG peoples and places than the development worker’s own desired trajectories. The past imperialistic histories of many Western development workers would be one reason for this ‘othering’ (Ahmed, 2004a).

Heron (2007) and others (Said 1993a, Ahmed, 2004a, Ahmed, 2006) have theorised that many Westerners make an implicit assumption that they, as Westerners, can actually ‘help’ or redeem a situation, while at the same time assuming that the Oriental or ‘other’ cannot help themself or worse still, may ‘regress’ without Western development aid. Such implicit assumptions were evident in some of the quotes above (see 7.2). It seems evident that if one is not reflexive of such past cultural learning then, in moments when one is blocked from reaching a desired trajectory, it is the ‘Other’ or the ‘Orient’ that is blamed. This implicitly reproduced the Orientalist dichotomy between a ‘superior West’ (which helps and fixes the ‘East’) and an ‘inferior East’ (that is destructive and gets in the way of the ‘West’s’ compassion).

**Positioning People with Altruistic Identities**

Section 7.2 showed that there were times when development workers saw their PNG counterparts as holding an altruistic identity, like the identity that they themselves subscribe to. To appreciate that indigenous development workers were trying to improve the situation of people in their country made development workers feel positive emotions towards their indigenous counterparts. One reason for this was that the workplace facilitated a connection between Western development workers and PNG development workers. As connection to PNG people seems to be a strong desire of development workers, feelings of positivity accompanied this connection. Along with positive feelings for the Western development worker, one can also note that the portrayals of indigenous development workers seem to be more positive. It is evident from Jill’s quote in Section 7.2 that the portrayals Western development workers made after forming a connection to PNG development workers tended to be more hopeful and positive than the typical Orientalist portrayal of PNG people. An example of this hopeful portrayal can be seen below.
I gave a talk once at a 7th Day Adventist retreat... After the talk, a man countered that promoting condoms lead to promiscuity. My counterpart asked the man: "Before we had HIV, did we have infidelity? Did we have children born out of marriage?" The man admitted yes. "Then how can you say that condoms cause promiscuity?" she asked. The man was quite aggressive, but she brought him down with gentle humour. That was a common situation. Susan

In the above quote, Susan describes how her PNG "counterpart" was able to bring about a hopeful outcome by dispelling a myth around condoms and calming-down aggression with "gentle humour". The portrayal of her PNG counterpart can be seen as one that produces a sense of hope, because her counterpart is able to communicate their message successfully to an audience that, at least partly at the outset, wasn't going to be receptive to the use of condoms. It is evident in the above quote, as well as Jill’s quote in 7.2, that these positive connections have the ability to resist some of the negative portrayals and ‘othering’ of PNG people and place that can occur when development workers are blocked from achieving an altruistic identity.

In some respects, these forms of portrayals show the indigenous development worker articulating the same sorts of altruistic ideals, of hope and being an empowering force, that the Western development worker wishes to articulate within themself. As such, I believe these portrayals are grounded in the same sense of identity as an altruistic development worker that McKinnon (2006, 2008) describes, and I mention in 7.6 above. When the indigenous development worker performs such acts as the one mentioned by Susan above, they can come to represent, for the Western development worker, an 'empowered' Papua New Guinean. Perhaps some of the sense of hope associated with these moments is that the PNG development worker represents the change that the Western development worker wants to see in the world. These moments do have the potential to resist Orientalisms, as portrayals of the PNG ‘Other’ tend not to follow the typical Orientalist perspective. For example, in the above portrayals a PNG woman is empowered and helpful instead of powerless and/or a hindrance to development.

There is, however, a need be mindful of such portrayals, as there are a number of problematic aspects that may arise. Firstly, in these portrayals the PNG development worker has been positioned in a way that is very similar to the ideal self that the development worker wishes to achieve. Although this is probably linked to some of the positive portrayals of PNG people, it
also opens up the possibility for the Western development worker to over-identify with the PNG development worker, positioning both as having the same goals and desires for development, and the same notions of identity.

This is known as identification. Identification refers to someone substituting how they themselves feel and react for the actual feelings and reactions of the other person. This can cause problems in the representations of the ‘Other’, as it ignores the importance of culture, class and race difference (Bondi, 2001). In other words, identification is a process by which the ‘Other’ is identified as self. As I discussed in Chapter 2, the self and the ‘Other’ are two sides of the same coin. The ‘other’ represents those aspects of the self that the self does not wish to identify with. Therefore identification is likely to result in circumstances where the Western development worker begins to speak for the PNG worker. It would also probably produce images of PNG that follow the line of the indigenous hero of post-development literature. The image of indigenous hero has been critiqued by postcolonial academics as being a type of “romantic Orientalism”. This is evident in the following quote:

“Probably one of the country’s greatest assets are these people who are able to sit comfortably between the Western world and the culture that they come from and continue to belong to. Those people that understand, um, what the requirements of success are, in Western terms, and can see what the realities are. They are able to bridge, they translate two worlds as a matter of daily practice. Those people are PNG’s most valuable resource. Without people like that on a project team a project is unlikely to succeed.

This is what I’ve found, so the more that development agencies can identify these individuals—and unfortunately there are so few of them, that most of these aid agencies know who they are that most of these individuals are over committed. We had a water engineer on our project, and we found out that he was also working for three other agencies, rather extensively, at the same time. Our finance manager was one of these guys who could do the translation thing, and if ever I go back I’ll employ him, or do whatever I can [to] employ... He was very capable and intelligent, in both senses of it; academic intelligences and personal, cultural and intuitive intelligences. So I think those people are the people who will enable the development community to do something less unsuccessful (laugh) about HIV AIDS. Peter

In the above quote Peter identifies with a certain group of PNG people and he connects with them because they “understand”, accepting Western culture and ways of doing things, yet are
still Papua New Guinean. Also inherent in this quote is their willingness to behave in the ways required for success in the Western sense. As a Westerner, Peter finds these people are the easiest to identify with and they are brought into the self. As part of the self they are constructed in highly positive ways such as “most valuable”, “capable” and “intelligent”. These individuals are seen as all the more valuable because they have the ability to expand the border of the self. As Peter says, they are a “bridge” to the indigenous culture. Because of these attributes they are lauded in terms that are consistent with Romantic Orientalisms. These people become the saviours, at the expense of others. In terms of Said’s (2001) theory, these people could be seen as the ones that transform the strange, faraway and threatening ‘other’ into something familiar.

Peter’s quote also shows some sense of reflexivity on this issue, as he suggests there might be too much emphasis put on too few people in order to explain why this type of Papua New Guineans is overstretched. In addition, he does not paint an overly romantic and rosy picture, claiming only that things would just be more unsuccessful without their contributions. Interestingly, this quote also suggests how identifying with this sort of individual changes how resources are directed. Peter proposes that he would hire one particular individual of this type, and that in general, development agencies seek out people of this type.

Romantic Orientalisms may have particular appeal to the development workers because they tend to produce an imagined ‘domesticated’, or ‘civilised’ ‘other’. This is a process that makes the ‘Orient’ familiar to the ‘West’ by apparently taming it to be like ‘us’ (Makdisi, 2003, Ahmed, 2006). The origins of this form of Orientalism are highly linked to the development work of the colonial era (e.g. the ‘civilising’ missions) which is also the origin of much of the identity politics around altruism that drives Western development workers to act (Makdisi, 2003, Heron, 2007, McKinnon, 2006).

This sort of thinking can be even more problematic when the PNG development worker does not live up to the ideal of ethical, altruistic professional that is a strong part of Western

---

119 Peter was not the only development worker to think that way, as a number of other development workers made similar comments. I also found working with one PNG person I identified in this way to be extremely productive and his involvement made the experience more enjoyable for me.
development workers’ identity. In Section 7.2 I noted that a particular form of altruism, known as empathy altruism, was important to Western development workers. It is possible that because of attachments to empathy altruism, when development workers did not get (according to Western development workers) empathetic responses, the divide between Western Self and PNG ‘Other’ became greater because they were originally associated with the self. When the PNG development worker fails to articulate themself as altruist in the eyes of the Western development worker, their foreignness is increased. If reflexive actions are not undertaken, it has the ability to create images of PNG people that are uncaring/un-empathic to the Western development workers’ apparently ‘caring’ or ‘empathic’ nature. Such portrayals have the potential to reproduce Orientalist dichotomies because the Western development worker who now no longer knows the PNG person as ‘self’ may then attempt to know them as radical ‘other’.

Yet it is important to also note examples in 7.2. of when indigenous development workers ‘fail’ to live up to the altruistic identity, and the Western development workers experience a moment of great discomfort and disorientation, leaving them confused and questioning the development process. This moment, I believe, can be viewed as the uncomfortable and disquieting moment before one collapses the ‘Other’ into someone ‘just like us’ or damns them into an irreconcilable ‘Them’ (Askins, 2008). Thus these moments offer an ideal time for the development worker to be reflexive of the current situation and the way they construct the PNG ‘Other’.

**On the Need for Comfort Zones and the Negative Feelings they Produce**

This chapter’s descriptions of the desire of Western development workers for comfort zones, while in PNG, can add to the theories of Katie Walsh’s (2006 a, 2006 b, 2007) work and its themes of domesticity and foreignness. In investigating British expatriates’ sense of belonging in Dubai, Walsh observes how the racialisation of everyday space is critical in the experience of expatriate belonging in Dubai. Walsh notes how British expats can be positioned, and made to feel foreign, by the gazes of Emerati nationals and Muslim expats.

As in Walsh’s study, my interview participants found themselves posited as ‘foreign’ by the gazes of PNG nationals. In addition, I found that it can help development workers to resist Orientalist thinking if they are reflexive about feeling foreign.
And I guess being an expat you really are just looking from the outside in and kind of realise that there is a whole different world there you know you are just not part of. So you just can’t even begin to understand (pause) some of those drivers [of HIV]. Richard’s quote shows the foreignness that development workers feel in PNG. Richard, who had spent over four years within PNG, still felt very foreign there. The quote indicates that he is positioned as foreigner or outsider in PNG, and is looking in. There was a sadness and acceptance in his tone that, to me, indicated he had accepted that certain desired connections could not be achieved. It is interesting to note that in this sad acceptance he indicates a reflexive stance that resists Orientalist thinking. Being in the outsider or foreigner position, Richard is positioned on the other side of the Orientalist dichotomy to that which is ‘appropriate’ for a Westerner, as it is the ‘role’ of the Oriental to be foreign. From the position of foreignness, he feels that it is impossible to understand and ‘know’ PNG cultures and therefore know the drivers of HIV and how to control them. Quotes such as these therefore, put into question the Orientalist fantasy that the ‘West’ can know and govern the ‘Other’.

Walsh’s (2006 a, 2006 b, 2007) study goes on to say that British expats often felt vulnerable when viewed as foreign. Although the effect of this varies with personality, gender and economic status, feeling foreign and vulnerable could occur every time some expats left their house in Dubai. Walsh goes on to say that experiencing foreignness in such negative ways in everyday spaces can unsettle and limit one’s sense of belonging abroad, and would make one nostalgic and seek a belonging in a national and Western identity.

The above results suggest that feeling foreign in negative ways was making development workers seek out resorts, clubs, in part, to bring about a sense of belonging to a Western identity. This had the potential to produce Orientalisms. Firstly, Said (1993 a, 2003) claims that Orientalisms plays an integral part in helping Westerners imagine themselves as ‘Western’ so strengthening one’s identity as Western will inevitably strengthen one’s reliance on Orientalisms. In addition, the places and objects in which one would seek to ‘indulge’ in this nostalgia for the West, are likely to function around the Orientalist principles of producing ‘East’/’West’ relations that always give the upper hand to the Westerner (e.g. like the resorts mentioned in 7.3 or indulging in the generosity of PNG villagers, mentioned in 7.4).

Such behaviour is also evidenced in how my interviewees and I felt when in urban areas outside our homes or a resort complex. In these situations many of my interviewees, as well as I, in my journal, mentioned moments of feeling vulnerable. For example, my journal makes
numerous mentions of having to “psych myself up” to leave either the resort or house because of a feeling of vulnerability from being gazed on as foreign.

As per every day there is a general fear and reluctance to start the day that I have to fight against. I am also once again feeling sick and uncomfortable. Jack Aisbett 12/05/2006

The above quote indicates that while in PNG I experience my foreignness as a vulnerability felt at leaving my house. I do not engage reflexively with this emotion; instead I fight it and try to overcome this feeling. This was something I tried to overcome every day. In hindsight, a more reflexive stance could have helped in this situation because, in trying to fight or deny these emotions (which I failed to achieve), I missed out on utilising one of those fundamental moments of disorientation (Ahmed, 2006) that are useful for self-reflexivity. The disorienting emotions associated with disorientation are evident in the fact that I felt “sick and uncomfortable” at the prospect of leaving my house. What disorientated me (and many other development workers) about leaving the house had much to do with our past histories with Orientalisms. Due to Orientalist thinking, Western development workers may imagine that they have a right, or indeed an obligation, to access ‘foreign’ countries like PNG and its people (Ahmed, 2006, Heron, 2007). Under this Orientalist way of thinking, it is the country that remains foreign and strange, the self known and in its place. These imaginings do not hold true for many development workers outside the space of the home and the resort where they find themselves positioned as foreign or stranger. Many of the interviewed development workers, as well as I myself, felt disorientated. Upon having this Orientalist imagining resisted, we felt ourselves as strange and out of place. If one is reflexive about these moments they can provide a perfect opportunity to move beyond Orientalisms. If one is not reflexive in these moments of disorientation, they can lead to feelings of fear and vulnerability. This too can be linked to Orientalisms. Under the Orientalist belief, the Westerner never feels foreign and they believe they hold a position of superiority or an upper hand (Said, 2003). Without the imagining of being the superior party (or the one with the upper hand) one’s sense of self becomes threatened, bringing feelings of fear and vulnerability (see subheading ‘The Role of Fear’ below). In the quote from my journal above, it is evident that this fear has implicitly led me to label PNG people and places that lie outside my home, as a threat, because I feel a fear to engage with ‘them’ out there.
This notion of the PNG ‘Other’ as threatening, has the potential for reasserting Orientalist discourses around the notion of the ‘Other’ as threatening, and thus requiring some form of intervention. Perhaps the nostalgic search for a sense of belonging to a Western identity is one form of intervention available to the Western development worker. This is evident in the fact that resorts and ‘plush’ clubs have an appeal because they shelter the Western development worker from feeling vulnerable and they also allow the Western development worker to indulge, perhaps nostalgically, in a familiar Western culture. The quote in Section 7.4 in which Tina observes that the setting provides a “nice bubble in the middle of all this mayhem” supports my contention. Tina conveys a sense of being sheltered from all the foreignness that is Papua New Guinean cultures. And by inference, the culture within the resort was not foreign but a familiar Western culture. Thus within these places the ‘East’/’West’ power relations are once again configured in such a way that the Westerner has the upper hand.

Home could also facilitate these sorts of power relations because it gave some sense of control (see Section 7.3). Villages too facilitated Western ‘indulgence’ as they enabled Westerners to experience a familiar primitivism. This primitivism often put the development worker in a position where they were ‘set above’ Papua New Guinean people to such a degree that it provided a sense of safety. So what the village, the resort and the ‘plush’ clubs have in common is that they place the Westerner in a ‘superior’ position to the PNG ‘Other’. By going to these locations, or by lingering in the home, the Western development worker is reasserting the Orientalist power relations, so that they can feel as if they know their place in the world and the place of the ‘Other’.

Walsh also noted that ‘home’ for expats in Dubai was a place that put up a border between the expat and the foreign outside the door. And within the border of the home you can reconstitute the self and behave contrary to public performances. I believe ‘home’ also played a similar role for development workers in PNG (see Section 7.3), but so too did resorts and clubs. In my journal I mentioned a number of times being able to drop my public performance, or “zone out” as I called it, and just recuperate at the nearby Holiday Inn. I occasionally mentioned this to other development workers and they tended to agree with me, as in the exchange with Tamara, quoted in 7.4. Therefore, using Walsh’s themes of foreignness and domesticity, it is evident that development workers seek comfort from a resort or club because these places enable practices of belonging, integral to some of the multiple notions of belonging and self that development workers hold. Other notions of belonging that the development worker held, like that of adventurer, were satisfied by trips to a village, while
notions of selflessness were articulated through work. Yet at the same time some of these notions of belonging have the ability to reaffirm Orientalisms.

**On the Ambiguity Felt in Comfort Zones**

Although participants felt a need for comfort zones, at the same time (as discussed in Sections 7.3, 7.4 and 7.5) my participants often viewed these places with much ambiguity, and sometimes negativity. While development workers enjoyed the comfort of the familiar in resorts, they felt that resorts were segregated from the indigenous community and this was something they were not quite happy about. At home, development workers found a ‘need’ for segregation that home provided which was often diametrically opposed to the development workers’ desire to connect. While the village allowed for connection, this was often achieved through the re-enactment of colonial performances that limited the type of connections available. It is therefore the Orientalist power relations that Western development workers enact by visiting these places that cause them to feel ambiguous or negatively towards these places. This ambiguity or negativity can therefore be seen as a struggle with Orientalisms.

Both Walsh (2006 a, 2006 b, 2007) and Moltz (2005) suggest that this negativity towards resorts is because engagement with ‘foreign’ places and people, through travel, is often central to both traveller and expat identity. To feel a sense of belonging to such identities, the familiar needs to be overcome through travelling and experiencing what is beyond the borders of the familiar. Therefore, by ‘indulging’ in places like resorts, people can feel robbed of the transforming experience “proposed by encounters with others” (Molz, 2005). This meant that my participants and I often felt guilt, frustration and contempt simultaneously with the emotions of comfort and relaxation, while in resorts and ‘plush’ clubs. The home, for me, could also get like this if I spent too long avoiding leaving the house. In other words, acts of disengagement from the foreign might generate a sense of (non) belonging to one’s identity as traveller or expat. Closely tied to traveller and expat identities is the desire to connect and exchange information and life experiences with those who are ‘foreign’ to us. This too is not being fulfilled in the comfort places, as they significantly limit the opportunities for exchanges with those who are ‘foreign’.

Such constructions of self as traveller were evident in the stories of travel, or desire for travel, expressed by my interviewees and in my diary. The emotional effects when one does not live
up to this sense of identity can be seen in one self-indulgent moment of frustration in which I wrote:

I’m tired of sitting in one city and not travelling around [and experiencing new places]...

This journal extract shows the amount of frustration that can build up when one is not living up to a desired identity. Because I felt that I wasn’t travelling as much as I wanted to, I began to express an intense frustration towards the place in which I was situated. As the resorts were largely the places I frequented in Port Moresby, this shows some contempt towards resort culture, and the home which I found hard to leave in the morning. This, coupled with my quote in 7.4. in which I describe resorts as something reminiscent of a colonial past, also indicates contempt and frustration at the Orientalist power relations of such places.

It is important to note that one needs to be reflexive of the ways in which one resists Orientalisms through the desire to fulfil an identity as traveller. The traveller identity is internally linked to the hegemonic practice of colonialism and Orientalisms, in particular. Travel writing has been helping Westerners to ‘know’ the ‘Other’ and legitimise Westerners’ access to, and intervention in, the affairs of the ‘Other’ (Said, 1993 a, Said, 2003, Heron, 2007). Travel writing creates, legitimatises and fans the desire to know the self through obtaining the ‘Other’. In particular, travel writings and brochures, and the commodification of products from the ‘East’, have helped to define as well as fan a desire for, the ‘exotic’ and have sold ‘access’ to, or ways of obtaining, the exotic ‘East’. They have helped to produce such cultural tropes as the search for the ‘authentic other,’ and a need to merge with ‘native’ cultures and not be seen as a visitor (Grewal, 1996, Heron, 2007). As such, travel has propagated unequal power relations by which the ‘East’, or in this case PNG, becomes a series of commodities for the ‘West’s’ enjoyment or self-enrichment.

Travel writing has also been implicated in producing a disdain for the ‘natives’, particularly the hybridised ‘native’ who, in the mind of the Westerner, has lost his or her ‘authenticity’ (Grewal, 1996, Barbour, 2005). Such thinking has played an important role in silencing and

120 Although not evident in this quote, wrapped up in it is was a frustration at the anxiety and tension I felt while living and working in Port Moresby.
discounting the ‘oriental’ who ‘refuses’ to stay fixed. As such, my comment quoted above could be seen to reflect a moment of disdain and disrespect for the urban PNG people that surrounded me, as much as it reflects a disdain for the club and resort culture. It is also a likely factor behind the desire that my interviewees and I shared for indulging in primitivisms at village stays. It was during these stays (or in the anticipation of a village stay) that development workers and I could imagine interacting with, to use the Orientalist term, ‘more authentic’ natives.

As discussed in 7.2, development workers’ sense of self is often tied to expressions of altruism. This means that development workers have certain practices of belonging that are tied to acts of selflessness, as noted by Vaux (2001). Vaux states that because development workers can never be entirely selfless, they often struggle with the need to choose when and how to be selfless or selfish. As I have indicated in this chapter, comfort zones in PNG are places that are often segregated from the community and are often used to reconstitute the self. This means that they can be construed as in conflict with the development workers’ sense of altruism. This makes comfort zones places in which development workers negotiate perceptions of acting selfishly.

This conflict manifested itself in me as guilt about enjoying something that I felt reproduced colonial power relations. In others it manifested itself as an ‘othering’ of other expats who visited them. This was evident in the quote in 7.4 in which Susan mentioned resorts and clubs as having “too many old fat Aussie blokes” and in John’s contempt for a drinking culture at these places where he found himself drinking too much. Thus I believe a desire to feel a sense of belonging to the identity of (altruistic) development worker can produce feelings of frustration, contempt and guilt when development workers visit resorts while in PNG. Ideas around what it means to be a professional, ethical and altruistic development worker can help development workers to resist Orientalisms. Yet one needs to be mindful of how such acts of altruism may be implicated in the reproduction of Orientalist power relations. Examples of how altruism can lead to Orientalisms are given in 7.2.

In addition, Heron (2007) implies that altruism might be used by Western development workers to imagine PNG people in such a way that they can presume a sense of innocence due to their altruistic concern, while undertaking actions that will improve their ‘self-worth’, career prospects or ‘self-understanding’. Indeed, when asked to reflect on their reasons for choosing
a development career, it was common for interviewees to show a desire to fulfil altruistic goals as well as a multitude of ‘self-interested’ goals, as indicated in the following quote:

Jack: Why did you choose careers that led you to work on HIV and AIDS development issues in PNG?

Well it wasn’t that I specifically wanted to work on issues of HIV. As part of a general development program HIV naturally became a part of the health issues that we were dealing with. So there was obviously funding behind it but it is a real issue also. [But I started a career in development work because]… I come from kind of a law background and I knew fairly early on that I didn’t want to deal with documents, I wanted to deal with people, then… I went to a developing country quite late, I would guess at age 19, and it really opened my eyes to the rest of the world so I kind of combined those two things. I wanted to work with people and within different cultures which I found to be really interesting. So combining the two and helping people that’s obviously bound up in that. But I now think that I’ve developed (pause) developed as a worker it’s now I think as an exchange. Miranda

In this quote it is evident that Miranda has a real interest in working with people, and in a development context. These interests of hers she describes as being bound up with the altruistic desire to help people. She is however quite pragmatic about ‘how’ she helps people. Miranda’s statement indicates that it wasn’t the suffering that was caused by HIV and AIDS per se that motivated her to help people; it was more a notion of wanting to help people in general. Because HIV and AIDS development work was (comparatively) well-stocked with resources she utilised it as an avenue to achieve her desire to help people. Her ‘altruistic’ act to help people is about enabling her to have “eyes open[ed] to the rest of the world”, and to move her career in a more people-focused direction. Indeed, as she developed in her career she began to see the whole process as an exchange. This exchange still shows a desire to help people but it also shows self-interested aspects of the ‘altruistic’ acts that enable her to “develop”.

What is interesting about the above quote is that although helping others is important, the majority of the quote is about Miranda’s own personal benefits. This shows the ability for development workers’ own experiences and quality of life to take precedence over their concerns for others. Miranda, like many development workers, does not see the unequal nature of this exchange in which she has the ability to fly to PNG and “exchange” knowledge
and understandings, while the PNG people, for the most part, are unable to do the same (Heron 2007). Yet this unequal exchange is justified by the belief that, as a development worker, she is helping people. Although Miranda has acknowledged some of the limits to her knowledge and relinquished some of her identity as the sole knowing agent, this quote still has some resonance with Orientalisms. Orientalisms is still evident because, to some extent this quote shows an unequal power relation is being formed, and justified, through the Western development worker imagining themselves as altruistic, and the PNG people as being in need of help or an exchange of their services.

What I have shown in this section is that there is a split in the psyche of the Western development worker in PNG, due to several forms of competing identities. Some of these present the development worker as a singular, self-interested, free agent; others are altruistic, egalitarian and ethical (Heron, 2007, McKinnon, 2008). Although sometimes, as in the quote above, these competing agendas can coexist, often in PNG they can be in conflict and disturb and disorientate the development worker’s sense of belonging or identity. Both aspects of the split hold the potential to resist Orientalisms. Yet so flexible are the Orientalist tropes that, without reflexivity, both aspects of this split propagate a different form of Orientalisms. So it is the uncomfortable and disorientating middle ground between these two splits where the potential to resist Orientalisms is the strongest.

The Role of Fear

In 7.3 and 7.4 I discussed fear as an emotion often felt by PNG development workers on a day-to-day basis. Ahmed’s work (2004 a) on the cultural politics of fear provides a good explanation as to why fear might drive development workers to frequent resorts, hotels and clubs, and to complete rituals at home. Ahmed postulates that fear strengthens the border of the self, excluding the object of fear, and opening up past histories that reconstruct the ‘white’ body as apart from the ‘black’ body. Orientalist knowledge of PNG is undoubtedly one of the past histories that are reopened in order to segregate the ‘white’ and ‘black’ bodies. An example of this can be seen in the following quote:

Jack: Was it ever scary living in PNG?

That’s an interesting question because I can’t say that there were particular times that I was really scared but because of the way that AVI just impressed on us, so heavily telling us we must not take risks. When I had my interview for my position in PNG, or a
briefing or something, they asked me what my concerns were, and I said not being able to walk around free. I was a bit of an exercise addict, I'm not any longer (laughing) because PNG beat me out of it. I used to have to walk, either go to the gym or go for a long walk every day! And they said, "Oh no, you won't be able to walk around the streets alone even during the day!" And we had this long conversation and I said "You got to be kidding!" During the Day! And I was told no, well, PNG women don't walk alone, they walk in groups so you will have to find a group to walk with. And this went on and on. And they said "No seriously! You must NOT do this, it is just not done, it is dangerous and Blah blah blah blah."

So I followed their advice for about the first two weeks and I was always looking over my shoulder, seeing every fierce young highlander, you know with Bui and a fierce scowl, thinking they were about to jump me. And when I first tentatively started going out I would just take $10 kina with me and start going to the supermarket. And walk up and down the aisles for half an hour (laughing) for some exercise, and some entertainment. Tamara

There are several points I wish to make about this quote. Firstly, it suggests that development workers are preconditioned to a fear of PNG people by development agencies, before actually going to the destination. A number of other development workers claimed in interviews with me to have felt scared by the briefings that they received from development agencies before going to PNG. This includes Maryanne, who stated that she had a “UN briefing and .... I almost shat myself”. These briefings presented the PNG ‘Other’ as a threat and ‘something’ to keep your distance from in the streets, the place where I mentioned (in 7.6 above) the development worker does not hold a ‘superior’ power relation to PNG people. Thus it perpetuates Orientalisms by imagining PNG people as fearsome and the need to keep apart from them when the place does not give the Westerner the upper hand. In addition, development workers are often encouraged to read-up on the policy and academic context of HIV and AIDS in PNG before heading there. As discussed in Chapter 5, development research on HIV and AIDS in PNG tended to be heavily focused on building a consensus around the Orientalist trope that PNG is like Africa. Africa itself, in the imperialist mindset, has been constructed as something fearful and ‘dark’ (Said, 1993 a). Therefore it could be argued that the academic and policy documents on HIV and AIDS in PNG are also contributing to this predisposition to fear in development workers.
It would be wrong, however, to assume that development agencies were responsible for all the preconditioning to fear that a development worker had before going to PNG. From my own personal experience, in which I did not receive an official country briefing, I too felt preconditioned to fear. For Tamara, being preconditioned to fear meant that upon arrival every “young highlander” was seen as a threat to her\(^{121}\). The effects were that she put up barriers that segregated her ‘white’ body from the PNG unknown ‘black’ bodies, restricting her movements in order to keep this divide\(^{122}\). Orientalist knowledge is reliant on such divides. Therefore by keeping this divide, development workers contribute to the continuation of Orientalisms.

This quote shows that as time went on, these fears began to wane a little. After two weeks these were still only tentative steps, restricted to her walking to the supermarket where she felt some form of upper hand due to her ‘class’ or income status. It is important to note that as Tamara began to have more experiences with PNG people that formed a positive past history, her movements began to increase. This however took a significant amount of time and was a struggle that meant the restraints on her movements were in a constant flux.

Another point to mention was her ability to, on reflection, laugh at herself and her Orientalist fears. It would seem, therefore, that self-reflexive humour can sometimes be employed by those struggling with, or resisting, Orientalisms. In doing so, this quote suggests that if one is self-reflexive of their fears then they have the potential to produce resistances to Orientalisms.

Defining the self as segregated from the ‘black’ body is likely to make understanding the problems of HIV and AIDS in PNG harder. In particular, it would limit the production of new forms of knowing that might be able to resist or at least soften the Orientalist knowledge that affects PNG HIV and AIDS development campaigns. This can be seen in the following quote;

\(^{121}\) Similar but perhaps not as ‘strong’ feelings were felt by me upon my original trip to PNG.

\(^{122}\) There is also likely to be a gender dimension behind why she formed this barrier. This may be inferred through the fact that Tamara was told that “PNG women” (as opposed to PNG people) don’t walk alone. This implies a sense that, because you are a woman, you should fear PNG streets more than men and restrict your interaction with PNG streets accordingly.
I think the best way to describe [the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG] would be “fairly unknown”. There were a lot of... There was a lot of information about how to go about the situation, what it was becoming, no one really knew what the situation was, no one really knew how it was... How it was developing or what it was doing, where it was going, what was it doing and how people were dealing with it. So I think “unknown”... Like it was very, very unknown, and there was a lot of fear and a lot of umm... that it could... fear of the Africa explosion, or that it could go like that. And on the other hand, at the same time you had a lot of information coming back saying that it would never get that bad, never, and all that kind of thing. I sort of guess in that way it was unknown. I think as far as... from actually chatting with people over there it was also... um... it was a very, very difficult situation in the fact that there was so much of the...the culture, so much of the way of life... It would ...would... not promoting the spread of the virus but it would be very, very difficult to change a lot of things to reduce the spread of the virus and things like that, so I think it was, generally speaking, a lot of unknown and a lot of difficulty. Maria

Maria’s quote makes evident the difficulty in understanding the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG. From her description the reader may deduce that there were many drivers and elements of the disease that she and other development workers did not know about. She felt that there was not enough of a nuanced understanding of PNG cultures for development agencies to fully understand these drivers and the implications for HIV. In addition, it is evident in this quote that a fear of an African style ‘explosion’ is creeping in as a way to explain the situations in PNG, in light of a lack of information.

In Chapter 5 I discussed how this idea that PNG is like Africa is an Orientalism derived from consensus between numerous academics and HIV and AIDS policy makers in order to make PNG more knowable to them. Thus it seems that when development workers cannot connect or understand PNG people, place or HIV, the familiar Orientalisms/primitivisms are employed to fill the gaps in understanding. Maria also notes that, at the same time, there was information “coming back” that resists this idea of an African style ‘explosion’. The use of the words “coming back” is interesting as it suggests that there are times when the barriers
between the Western Self and the PNG ‘Other’ are reduced, and new knowledge that resists Orientalisms can be produced\(^\text{123}\).

The tone in which Maria expressed this quote showed a considerable amount of distress. The reason for this distress is because not understanding the situation means that the development worker is not connected with people and not living up to their ‘altruistic’ ideal (see Section 7.2). This once again shows how altruism may help development workers to struggle to resist Orientalisms. Her distress can also be linked to a moment in which a development worker feels blocked or disorientated and discomforted, which once again shows the potential for these moments to be an opportunity for reflexivity.

Thus I believe that the participants of my study were often caught in a bind where they wanted to transcend the familiar, which sees the self as a segregated white body, so that they could connect with PNG and articulate their altruistic (i.e. selfless) identities, but to do so threatened the ego’s understanding of the self as a Western/white body. So fear moves the development worker to seek out places that reproduce Orientalisms in order to reaffirm their sense of self as a segregated white body. Yet it is also evident that they feel a sense of discomfort and disorientation within these places, for not living up to their altruistic desire.

### 7.7 Conclusion

In this chapter I have shown some of the contradictory and often overlapping emotions\(^\text{124}\) present in development workers while working in PNG. I have particularly focused on how

\(^{123}\) Although I wish to stress that process of connecting with PNG Other must be undertaken reflexively so as not to gather new information to reconfirm Orientalist theories.

\(^{124}\) It should be noted that this chapter does not list all the variety of emotions that a development worker would feel while in PNG. Nor does it list all emotions that have relationships to Orientalisms. There are a number of less obvious emotions, such as gratitude, curiosity, love, sexual desire, intimacy, shame, grief, loathing, revulsion, etc that make up the gambit of emotions experienced by development workers all of which are likely to, in part at least, affected by Orientalisms. Some of these emotions surfaced in my interviews but often only briefly. It would seem that interviews may not be the best way of uncovering or exploring these emotions. My journal did reveal more of these emotions than my interviews, yet I, possibly like my interviewees, did not want to admit to some of them or articulate
these emotions related to the places of significance in a development worker’s experience of PNG. These places are the work place, the home, the resorts (and ‘plush’ clubs) and the rural village.

These places of significance embodied certain identities that development workers were either trying to articulate or move away from, depending on the circumstances in which they found themselves. Three of the most significant identities that development workers ascribed to were that of the altruistic development worker, the traveller and, at times, the Westerner. Embodying these identities has a contrapuntal relationship to the emotions associated with either achieving, or failing to achieve, these identities. Achieving a desired identity or moving away from an undesired identity was often associated with positive emotions such as comfort, hope and happiness. On the flip side, when a development worker failed to achieve a desired identity or felt they were living up to an undesired identity, then negative emotions such as frustration, discomfort and despair were felt. Development workers, like most it would seem, pursued actions that they thought would articulate their desired identities and positive emotions, and avoided those less desirable identities and negative emotions.

This, however, was a task that was highly complex and never completely articulated because development workers (including me) desired multiple and often contradictory identities. The events, peoples and places that could enable one identity often blocked or contradicted another identity. As such, development workers felt multiple and conflicting emotions associated with their work environments, their homes and their leisure activities. In addition there were often forces beyond the control of the development worker that could enable or block desired identities. How a development worker negotiated these multiple and contradictory identities, as well as the forces that either enabled or blocked these identities, had profound effects on the development worker’s feelings towards certain PNG peoples and places. This in turn affects the representations of PNG peoples and places that development them publically. As such there is likely a number of silences in my transcripts that indicate emotions not shared. These silences could indicate that these emotions are not part of a ‘development discourse’ and as such, certain Orientalisms in development may go unquestioned.
workers reproduce. Some of these representations had the ability to resist Orientalisms, while others could reproduce them.

Equally important to the reproduction and resistance of Orientalisms are what it means to a Western development worker to ascribe to an identity like that of traveller, development worker or Westerner. I argue that the cultural meanings that have shaped the identities to which a development worker adheres have a long and complex relationship with Orientalisms. Therefore, through articulating or moving away from certain identities, development workers are constantly embroiled in a struggle with Orientalisms. Orientalist tropes may be resisted by development workers through the assertion of one identity over another. Yet the very ways of resisting could also re-enact Orientalisms under a different trope. For example, in the work place, desires to articulate altruistic identities and connect to PNG people meant that development workers would try and change the way projects were implemented, so that they were more liked by PNG people, but at the same time this could lead to acceptance of, and adherence to, hegemonic ideas like Orientalisms. In addition, failing to connect with people and achieve this altruistic identity could lead to forms of ‘othering’ of PNG people and place that could closely resemble the Orientalist dualism between ‘East’ and ‘West’.

These sorts of double binds were equally common in places that provided comfort to the development worker, such as the home, resorts and the village. Part of the appeal of these places was the ability to reproduce Orientalist power relations and exchanges between PNG people and Western development workers. These places also relieved fears that Orientalist knowledge of PNG has helped to produce, by providing barriers between development workers and the PNG people who they imagine might ‘harm’ them. Yet as they rebelled against these feelings due to the highly flexible positionality of Orientalist tropes, development workers ran the risk of Orientalising PNG people in other ways. For example, by resisting and disparaging the clubs due to my desire to travel and see the ‘real PNG’, I not only rejected these clubs for keeping me segregated from PNG people, I also discounted interacting with the ‘urban’ PNG people who I interacted with and passed by, on the way to resorts and clubs. In doing so, I reproduced the Orientalist imagining of the authentic timeless ‘other’.

This chapter has shown that both the acceptances of Orientalisms and the resistances to it are never a full acceptance or a complete rejection. Therefore in this chapter I suggest a radical or hyper-reflexive form of self-reflexivity (Kapoor, 2004). I have indicated that several emotional responses to work place are good indicators that remind people to be reflexive in the ‘now’.
For example, when development workers feel the hope and happiness at achieving their altruistic identity as a development worker, they should be reflexive on what was actually achieved by fulfilling this desire.

To promote hyper self-reflexivity, one must accept that all emotions and articulated identities are dangerous. Seeing emotional reactions and identity articulation as dangerous means that something can be done to address the danger of Orientalising the other (Kapoor, 2005). If we act as if it is our emotional reactions to the ‘Other’, and not the ‘Other’ themselves, that is dangerous then our gaze will first shift to ourselves before engaging the other. Thus gazing upon ourselves and our own role in representing the other should be used as a tool for enabling an honesty and openness about our feelings and desires that we should take to our dealings with the ‘Other’.

One emotion that calls for a great deal of reflexivity is also one of the most negatively perceived emotions. When development workers are blocked from achieving desired identities, a profound sense of discomfort and disorientation can be felt. These discomforting feelings can often get development workers questioning their own values as well as the ideals of the development process. As such, these moments represent a crisis in a way of knowing ourselves and others. Seeing these moments as a call to reflexivity, and giving reflexive answers to the questioning these moments produce, will provide stronger and more complete resistances to the processes of Orientalisms.
Chapter 8: The Emotional Interaction between Policy and Development Workers

8.1 Introduction

In this chapter I deal with the considerable overlap between development policy and the actions and emotions of the development workers in PNG implementing these policies. In particular this chapter will look at how development policy is likely to influence how development workers act and emotionally react in the field, as well as how they may influence (future) development policy.

Chapter 7 suggested that development workers are not looking to implement policy per se; instead, their focus is often about maintaining relationships and connections to the stakeholders in the development projects. As such this thesis has resonances with the works of Mosse (2004) and McKinnon (2008). For development workers trying to articulate an altruistic identity, their desire is often more about giving PNG people something that they like and connect with, than it is about being in line with any international policy (such as those of AusAid). Yet development workers will translate their actions and achievements through the idiom of policy to ensure the continued support of the project. This is required because the success of a program is often measured through donor-supported theory or policy on how to enact development work. This of course will have an effect on when and how the workers ‘speak back to policy’. Yet the experiences that development workers do manage to articulate back into policy, can affect how policy is viewed. Such interactions with policy are likely to have an emotional effect.

This chapter will explore some of the ways in which development policy and practice interact to produce emotional reactions that can either resist or promote Orientalisms. This chapter takes Mosse’s (2004) work “Is Good Policy Unimplementable? Reflections on the Ethnography of Aid Policy and Practice” as a basis for exploring this interaction (see Chapter 2). Note that in this present chapter I define policy as a whole raft of documents and procedures that govern the development process. It includes the overarching policy direction that was discussed in Chapter 6 but it also includes project design, or procedural documents, which development organisations try to apply. The policies that development organisations undertake are often designed to comply with the overall strategies of organisations like AusAid, in order to garner their support, approval and/or involvement.
8.2 Policy and its Effects on Development Workers’ Emotions

In the research interviews described in Chapters 4 and 7, I noted obvious emotional effects on development workers as they talked about policy, evidenced by the change in the way, and tone, in which they spoke. When discussing policy (e.g. development models, strategies and project designs) development workers tended to be vague about what actions applying policy entailed. This vagueness was brought about by the assumption that certain sets of words often embedded in policy (such as “peer support” or “undertaking prevention work”) explained what happened on the ground. Along with the use of these phrases, development workers tried to use an emotionally neutral tone when discussing policy. This can be seen in the following quote:

Jack: Describe the role of your organisation in the prevention of the spread of HIV and AIDS.

Tamara: …The electoral support program focused, when I was with them, purely on prevention, amongst their employees, which at the time of the election was an extra 3000 staff who were taken on as casual election officers. And it was those that we were targeting because they had their allowance and many of them would be based away from home. So they had their allowance and they had plenty of opportunity for premarital, or whatever, sex.

In the above quote we can notice two things occurring. Firstly, the actions Tamara described could have been described in rather emotional ways. Instead, the tone that she used to describe the development process was very neutral. Yet it became evident to me as interviews progressed that development workers were likely to feel highly emotional (in particular, frustrated) about aspects of policy. In taking a neutral tone, the development worker could repress the emotional aspects of the work they were undertaking. This suggests that to even speak of the workings of policy, the workers felt they must be emotionless. Such repression had the additional effect of mimicking the authoritative ‘knowing’ that was evident in policy documents (see Chapter 6). Thus, as in policy documents, in the above quote PNG electoral

125 This is different from describing the failures of policy which development workers were more emotional about.
workers are ‘known’ as sexually promiscuous when away from home (i.e. when given the chance).

Secondly, in this quote it is evident the actions undertaken by the development organisation are described using the single word “prevention”. The word prevention has specific meaning in HIV and AIDS policy and is often seen as sufficient to describe a range of actions that might be undertaken. According to Mosse (2004), the ‘vagueness’ of policy terms often meant that a whole range of actions could be undertaken by development workers, that may not necessarily be in line with the ‘spirit’ of the policy, but as long as development workers can translate these actions back into a policy context, they will be deemed as acceptable. The following quote from Rowena suggests that this process is occurring in PNG.

Jack: Were you or your organisation affected in any way by, say, the policies or performance criteria that you had to adhere to?

Yes, so the national AIDS council had policies that we had to adhere to. And we also worked with the provincial government so staff within the office had to adhere to policies there. And as well we may be working with different church-based organisations, faith-based organisations that we would have to lean to around their interests… So I guess when you are talking about performance criteria we made our own within the office. But I had my own objectives that I had to meet as well, separately from my organisation. So there were two sets that we were working with… actually, there were three sets because we had (pause) well there is probably as many as you can imagine, because you’ve also got the Millennium Development Goals, you’ve also got the National Strategic HIV and AIDS Plan, so we were working within that as well, and trying to adapt that to a strategic provincial plan as well as working on annual activity plans, so that was an influence.

Jack: Ok. So did they ever hinder you? Having all those plans, or were they a benefit to you?

I don’t know about “hindering” being the word because a lot of the times these objectives (discomfort growing in tone) or goals or aims are so (pause picking her words carefully) “malleable” according to different circumstances and you can go off and do something that is totally different than what is actually written but then report it as being an indicator of that performance for that particular objective. So it depends on who’s writing the report. Rowena
In the above extract Rowena is trying to adhere to a large number of policy criteria. She feels they are influencing her work, but it is evident from the second part of the extract that it is not particularly influencing her actions on the ground because she can “go off and do something totally different than what is actually written”, so long as it can be written up as being an indicator of a particular performance. It was evident from a change in the tone of voice that Rowena felt uncomfortable about describing this process. This I attribute to the fact that development workers often feel like they should be representing themselves as implementing policy, even when the realities on the ground are something very different (Mosse, 2004).

The above extract suggests that policy was influencing how Rowena evaluated and reported her actions. This has the potential to do two things, in terms of Orientalisms. Firstly, as a number of policy documents have Orientalisms embedded in them (see Chapters 5 and 6), the development worker evaluates their work in terms of Orientalisms, which has the potential to hide many of the actions (or nuances to the actions) that development workers may undertake and which promoted a resistance to Orientalisms. In addition, Western development workers might undertake actions, or fail to undertake actions, due to Orientalist beliefs which have the potential to ‘hurt’ PNG people, yet because they can be evaluated in a positive way through policy protocols, these potential problems do not come to light.

We can also tell from Rowena’s quote that a large number of organisations are coming together through this policy framework. Though each organisation seems to add complexity to the framework, an image of cohesion has been produced between a number of groups including the National AIDS Council, the Provincial AIDS Council, faith-based organisations and the UN (through the Millennium Development Goals). This is particularly related to what Mosse (2004) proposed as one of the primary uses of policy, namely, that “policy [‘ies] (development models, strategies and project designs) primarily function[s] to mobilise and maintain political support, that is, to legitimise rather than to orientate practice” (Mosse, 2004 pg 648).

126 If one considers the quote from Paula in 7.2 (in which she expresses frustration at the lack of policy from the National AIDS Council) in the light of the above, it is plausible to suggest that some of her frustration is the result of feeling that she should be implementing policy, but is not.
Mosse (2004 pg 648) claims that policy (particularly project design) is “the art, firstly of making a convincing argument and developing a causal model (relating inputs, outputs and impacts) oriented upwards to justify the allocation of resources by validating higher policy goals; and secondly of bringing together diverse, even incompatible, interests — of national governments, implementing agencies, collaborating NGOs, research institutions, or donor advisers of different hues.” These two aspects of policy are evident in the quote from Rowena. Both aspects can affect the emotions of development workers on the ground.

Firstly, making a convincing argument, and having to frequently justify this argument in terms of the policy goals of those higher up, could produce a sense of discomfort in development workers. This is because development workers find the reporting process by which they translate their on-the-ground actions into a development policy goal to be too rigid. This causes distress and frustration in development workers, who feel that many of the new insights that they have learnt do not fit into the reporting process, or actions they think are needed cannot be undertaken because they cannot be easily translated into a policy goal of donor organisations like AusAID. This frustration can be seen in the following quote from Maria:

You send in a plan of what you’re supposed to be doing and then you’ve got to tick off a box and say: Yes, we did organise three workshops, these people attended, we’ve got the records, etc, etc. I guess with the focus of that being on doing the project... like the.....as opposed to the actual results of what you’re doing. Um, probably had an impact on it, yeah. Yes, also if you are looking at it that way with the performance criteria, it’s a lot less flexible. Obviously if you saw something (else) working really well, you can’t just say “let’s do this other thing that works well.” It’s a little bit harder, and so it’s a little bit more rigid. But relatively speaking, I don’t think that AusAID is that difficult to work with, or that the funding is difficult to manage, I think the climate there is relatively flexible. Maria

In this quote, the “tick off a box” nature of criteria is seen to limit capacity to respond to different, possibly more successful, approaches. It is such tick-a-box processes that enable projects to gain the continued support of donor organisations (in this case AusAID) by producing evidence that they are implementing policy. Yet this is causing unease or discomfort in Maria because she sees a contradiction in the fact that the development workers have to put energy into ensuring that the project looks like it is implementing policy as “opposed to the actual results”. It is evident from this quote that having to maintain the image of applying
policy is obscuring and hindering Maria’s ability to take actions that (she believes) would be more effective. Also causing Maria unease is that she (and her organisation) is restricted from actions that are seen to be working in the field, because these actions cannot be translated easily into achieving their policy objective.

Once again, it is evident that discomfort can be a call for reflexivity (see Chapter 7) as these actions of representation have a specific effect on Orientalisms. Producing representations that make it look as if policy is implemented on the ground helps strengthen the Orientalised authoritative knowledge within these texts (see Chapter 6). It provides ‘evidence’ that what policy documents ‘know’ about PNG is ‘truth,’ and propagates the belief that PNG people are malleable to AusAID's or the ‘West’s’ intervention. Interestingly, Maria sees that AusAID is still flexible compared with other agencies, indicating that this process, of producing representations of policy implementation, is well entrenched in the development process.

In the following quote Tamara echoes Maria’s concerns, yet goes on to explicitly explain how producing ‘evidence’ or representations of policy implementation are important for the continued financial viability of development projects. Her statement also has particular implications for organisational reflexivity. This is evident in the quote below:

My feeling is that for the program -- for the report --- reporting to AusAID, and reporting on output, basically didn’t give any idea of what was happening on the ground and how effective that was. You know, number trained of peer educators, the number of peer educators qualified and out there working out there in the field. It didn’t require for us all, you know, how many people had been...how many of those peer educators out there were still active, how many people had actually been contacted. And there was no follow-up of what the results of that activity had been, because there was no capacity to do that. And there was no funding available within the program proposal to enable that to happen. Because that proper evaluation has a reasonable cost. And that's, you know-- these programs were running on the smell of an oily rag. So that's one observation about how the way reporting requirements of funding agencies don't encourage agencies to look at the quality of what they are doing. Of course, if you take initiative to criticise your own program it is less likely that you will get funding for your own program. Tamara

In this quote Tamara explains that the tick-a-box approach used by AusAID is centred on certain deliverables, such as number of trained peer educators. She indicates that these tick box deliverables did not ask for any indication of effectiveness, such as how effective peer
educators are in the field, or whether they are still active in the field. Also in this quote, Tamara makes a link between adverse performance reporting and loss of funding. The nature of funding meant that development workers feared loss of funding if their programs were seen to be not working well, that is, not producing the appropriate evidence of policy implementation.

This is similar to Mosse’s (2004) ethnography of a development project in India in which he proposed that projects will be deemed as failures not because of what they do, but because the representations that they produce do not fit the policy environment. Therefore, development agencies like the one Tamara works for, feel the need to produce evidence that their work fits into the wider policy environment, at the expense of evaluation that could produce new knowledge that might help to resist Orientalisms. In addition, fear of not being validated in the wider policy context hinders development workers (and agencies) from being reflexive, because bringing up critical information about projects could mean less funding in the future. Therefore development policy can produce anxiety when targets are not met; these anxieties can lead to development workers validating and reproducing Orientalisms found in the wider policy context, in order to relieve this anxiety.

There was some evidence to suggest that the need for development workers and agencies to fit into the wider policy context, or else be considered to have ‘failed’, was hindering organisations from delivering what the PNG people felt they needed. This can be seen in the following quote from Sophie:

I think it was very single-focus. And lots of money is being spent on HIV but not locating it in a broader program to address other issues. The other thing is that we would go into communities with a HIV message, because that’s what the HIV funding was for, and they would say “That is not our biggest issue. Our biggest issue is the water or the school with no teachers or…. “. And just coming with a HIV message because it’s got funding doesn’t do anything if people’s other needs are not also being addressed (very passionate, fast talking, slightly panicked). Sophie

This quote shows a level of frustration and worry generated when development agencies/industry seem to have inappropriate priorities for funding, with a mismatch between funded activities and the needs of PNG people. Sophie indicates that the too-direct focus on HIV, which does not blend HIV-related activities with the more immediate needs of the community, makes her feel frustrated and worried. This frustration and worry could be linked
to the fact that the need to adhere to the broader policy context is hindering Sophie’s ability to articulate an altruistic identity and to connect with PNG people, which were often important to a Western development worker’s sense of self (see Chapter 7). At the same time this quote provides some insight into the material effects of Orientalism. This is because Western (in this case AusAID) ‘knowledge’ about the PNG people and their ‘needs’ is taking precedence over what PNG people claim they need.

I would now like to turn my attention to terms used in HIV and AIDS policy and the way such terms are expressed by development workers. These include terms like “prevention” and “peer support” that have appeared in a number of the quotes above. Such terms seem somewhat ambiguous and as such could mean different things to different people (Mosse 2004). It was common for development workers to present a picture that they, and their organisation, were working in unity with other groups for a common policy goal, at least in part, by using these terms (see Tamara’s quote at the start of 8.2 or in Section 7.2). As such, my findings have resonances with Mosse’s (2004) proposition that policy plays an important role in bringing together diverse and even incompatible interests of a multitude of different people and organisations. David’s quote below highlights the possibility for ambiguous policy terms to mean different things to different interest groups that are implementing policy.

I work for the BLANK and I guess the skills and expertise that have been developed here in BLANK, (pause) have, ah, been called upon, I guess, in Papua New Guinea. Both People Living With AIDS and also AusAID have called upon BLANK’s (pause) experience, they have invited BLANK to tender for pieces of work. And those pieces of work have been to support the organisation of people living with HIV and AIDS in Papua New Guinea. I have also been involved in a project called BLANK. And that’s a project run by a number of pharmaceutical companies and they have engaged BLANK and also the BLANK to engage in or strengthen the health systems in PNG to respond to HIV and AIDS. So I have had two different levels of involvement through two different projects. David

In the above quote David explains how his organisation has come together with several other organisations in order to achieve, what sound to be, altruistic goals such as supporting the PLWHA organisation in PNG and trying to “strengthen the health systems in PNG”. David’s quote also indicates that these groups are tied together by policy, as AusAID invited his organisation to tender. The tendering process produces policy (e.g. in the form of project
designs) that, if accepted by AusAID, will bring David’s organisation, AusAID and PLWHA groups together.

Therefore, through policy, David is able to present a picture that several groups are coming together to work towards what he (and many other development workers) values in aid projects, that is, to articulate an ethical, supportive and altruistic identity. In Chapter 7 I discussed how events that make the development worker feel they are articulating an altruistic identity tended to produce a sense of hope and happiness in them. This hope and happiness would probably affect development workers’ confidence in projects. Therefore it is likely the image that policy presents, of all members and organisations working towards a common (altruistic) interest shared by the development worker, can help produce a sense of hope and happiness in them.

There are, however, likely to be alternative interests hidden by policy that would not inspire the development worker, and these issues must be negotiated and sometimes heeded in order for there to be continued involvement of all parties (Mosse, 2004). For example, it is likely that the pharmaceutical companies’ involvement, although possibly partly altruistic, is also driven by the profit motive to introduce and sell ARV drugs in PNG. Or perhaps, as in Mosse’s study, the companies see a PR and marketing opportunity. Profit-driven motives may affect the type and number of ARVs that are available to PNG in ways that would adversely affect the interest of a development worker trying to articulate an altruistic identity. In Chapter 7 I showed how development workers can end up feeling hurt, frustrated and betrayed when indigenous development workers or organisations do not hold the same interest in articulating an altruistic identity as they do. I also noted how these feelings can lead development workers to ‘other’ PNG institutions and development workers, recreating the binary opposites of Orientalism. Therefore policy’s ability to hide the personal and organisational interest of those involved under a veneer of altruism may provide the building blocks to some of the feelings of frustration and betrayal that can lead to Orientalism in the field.

8.3 How Development Agencies Might be Influenced by the Emotions Felt by Development Workers

This section discusses the possibility that development workers on the ground can influence HIV and AIDS development strategies in large organisations like AusAID and the UN. It is unlikely that one individual development worker on the ground can shape the actions of these
organisations. Certainly, this was the experience of many workers in the field. An example of this can be seen in the following statement from Sophie:

Jack: Do you think development workers on the ground can influence the strategies undertaken by the larger organisations like AusAID and the United Nations?

I don’t know, I’m not sure, I think AusAID’s strategy was really set back here in Canberra, an idea that was a bit driven by Canberra and not located back in the context very much. And I felt that whole NACs funding and I went to a whole thing, ..[on the] social marketing thing [of] condoms.. and the whole thing was being driven by AusAID and it just didn’t have grounding in the culture. I didn’t think it was very well done. So in terms of whether development workers can have influence on AusAID, I’m not so sure. (Laughs nervously) Sophie

We can see from the above quote that, although she claims to be not sure, Sophie indicates that development workers on the ground are quite powerless in dictating the strategy. As such, she feels that the strategy is not grounded in the culture of PNG and therefore is not executed well. Her nervous laugh indicates discomfort at this situation. Such discomfort may be due to the fact that, although the workers and their NGOs may be doing ‘good’, they are positioned in an overall strategy which they see as problematic, because it is set in a Western culture and its ‘imagining’ of PNG (see Chapters 2, 5 and 6). This discomfort could come from potentially criticising her ultimate boss and possibly exposing herself by speaking so frankly. Another cause for this discomfort could be that she has diverged from representing the official policy discourse. Part of her might feel that it is her role to state/represent the official policy discourse, so by diverging from it she feels uncomfortable (see Section 8.2 above). Whatever the cause, such discomfort was often expressed by development workers when asked this question; many of them held similar views about the overarching national HIV and AIDS strategy. This discomfort shows once again a moment in which reflexivity could be of benefit. With reflexive thought, a development worker might recognise more clearly their role in reproducing the Orientalisms of policy.

Quotes such as the one above indicate that development workers feel that those with experience on the ground and with some cultural context are quite powerless to change the approaches taken by large development agencies. Interestingly, however, when development workers were asked about their ability to influence the policy of their own, or of larger organisations, they tended to see themselves as having influence at the organisational level.
They thought this influence at the organisational level could have flow-on affects that that could change the way overarching development organisations would act. This can be seen by the change in attitude in Sophie’s answer to the next question.

Jack: Do you think someone at your level can have much influence on development strategy undertaken by groups like AusAID?

Well, I get to contribute within [my NGO] and I think that as INGO\textsuperscript{127} or even as faith-based organisations, and as the larger ones got together with the smaller ones through the church partnership program, yeah, I think through dialogue with AusAID we can have an influence more at the organisational level. Sophie

In the above quote it is evident that Sophie feels she can contribute within her NGO. First off, Sophie participates in discussions within her organisation. Here she feels like she can really influence and shape the solutions to the problems that face her organisation, in relation to HIV development. She and her organisation then present their examples of solutions to HIV and AIDS issues, through further dialogue and discussion to other organisations. Other organisations can begin to take up their examples, with large organisations getting together with smaller organisations\textsuperscript{128}. At the organisational level she felt it was possible to sway or influence AusAID strategy.

As I have shown in Chapter 7, perceptions and understandings of PNG people and place that are integral to the process of development, and the recreation of Orientalisms, are influenced by emotions. Hoggett and Miller (2000) argue that the individual collective emotions within community organisations have a large influence on the operations of community organisations. If organisations can influence overall policy direction, as Sophie suggests, then “those involved in community organisations need to have the capacity for maintaining a reflexive awareness of the emotional process at work within groups and campaigns” (Hoggett and Miller, 2000 pg 360).

\textsuperscript{127} International NGO

\textsuperscript{128} One might argue there are some resonances in this theory to Kuhn’s (1970) of exemplar paradigms in this process of influence.
In Tamara’s experience, a slightly different form of consensus reached by on-the-ground development agencies was capable of influencing development strategy.

I think that there is a lot of synchronicity happening. You know that different individuals in different organisations are perhaps having similar experiences. Like expats for example in non-government organisations with HIV AIDS programs, they are coming up against similar world views, similar organisational capacity challenges, similar sort of ideological challenges presented by world views of church-based organisations. And people are chipping away on those issues in their own particular ways. And they may have different kinds of effects -- it might be having influence on PNG colleagues in those organisations; it may be information about particular results that are heavily influenced by particular religious outlooks -- what sort of effects that has on a program, and reporting on that may have, contributing to a larger report that is read by someone in something like AusAID or someone in UNAIDS. And those kinds of bits of information that are collected around the country where expats have to be working within the country in particular small organisations, at the grassroots level, you know, on the ground. And that starts filling in particular jigsaw pieces and producing a larger picture. And I think that eventually gets back to larger organisations like AusAID and UN-AIDS who are, you know, trying to be on the ball, by doing evaluations from time to time, and having people do research on the area. And so they are listening to what’s working and what’s not and what the big issues that are impacting strategy are. And as a result of that, policies to HIV AIDS prevention and everything else are changing.

My own .... as I've done research for the church partnership program that has fed back into the development of AusAID’s policy, [as] to what extent they are funding HIV within the church partnership program. And it wouldn't be just what I said; it would be feedback from other areas that AusAID is funding. But I guess the input I made, in a very small way, in a small way to the chapter on the churches’ responses to HIV and AIDS in PNG in a recent UNAIDS Pacific report -- so in little ways like that, it all contributes to a bigger picture. Tamara

Tamara’s quote supports the idea that on-the-ground development workers can have subtle influences on overall HIV and AIDS strategies. Where I feel Tamara’s quote differs from Sophie’s quote is that, in her description, the process doesn’t seem as organisationally based, but exists more as a result of expats in different organisations finding synchronicity with other expats from different NGOs. This puts into question the role of dinner parties and other such
get-togethers mentioned in Chapter 7. Perhaps it is at these dinner parties that synchronicities between experiences are discussed and development workers both create, and share, exemplar solutions to the problems faced on the ground. When development workers come together like this they are, in many respects, forming their own group that can be influenced by individual and collective emotions. As these dinner parties were often an occasion to vent frustration about PNG peoples and places there is thus a propensity for these gatherings to ultimately lead to the reproduction of Orientalisms in future policy. Thus, some reflexivity of what is actually occurring at these dinner parties could be beneficial and positively affect the nature of policies that are being produced in the future.

Silenced in these quotes is what happens to those moments that are not “synchronous” with other development workers. Contentious knowledge is arguably removed from the story of how to conduct HIV and AIDS development work in PNG.

It is also interesting to note that Tamara has conducted research that has fed back into AusAID’s decision-making. Tamara was not the only development worker I interviewed who had produced papers and reports that fed into the academic or policy findings on which AusAID based its strategy. This suggests a link between the research on which larger NGOs like AusAID base their strategy, and on-the-ground experience of (some) development workers.

Another way that on-the-ground development workers influence the larger policy and strategy is through their future employment, which possibly they received from a stint working on-the-ground. This was the case for a number of my interviewees. Although at the time of their placement in PNG they may have felt that they had limited input, at the time I interviewed them they had moved up to positions of greater responsibility. A number of them now held the position of regional directors or co-ordinators of some of the larger aid organisations working in PNG and abroad. This included organisations like World Vision and the United Nations. In moving to these positions, the former on-the-ground workers take with them

129 At least four other development workers interviewed mentioned participating in HIV and AIDS development research over their time in PNG.
experiences and understandings learnt in PNG, and from these positions have a greater influence on the overall policy and strategy in PNG.

So to summarise, there was some evidence to suggest upward-moving influence from the ground level. This influence comes through the ability of development workers to influence their own organisations which, in turn, have an influence on the overall HIV and AIDS strategy. In addition, the overall synchronicity in experiences of on-the-ground Western development workers could also have the ability to influence strategy. Finally, development workers can influence strategy by moving up the ranks into positions of power. Yet development agencies and workers need to be reflexive of this process. Otherwise, they can self-limit the amount of positive influence that they can have on resisting Orientalisms, by not considering how emotional reactions can change the nature of the policy environment, which in turn affects emotions and the nature of interactions with PNG.

8.4 Conclusion

In this chapter I have discussed the interaction between policy and the emotions of development workers, and the relation of these to Orientalisms. I first discussed the role that policy has on the emotions of development workers. Then I discussed how development workers can influence policy in ways that go beyond their immediate organisation.

In the first half of this chapter I argued that, although policy is not directly implemented on the ground level in any simple way, there is a concerted effort by development workers and development agencies to produce the myth that policy has been implemented. The production of this ‘myth’ can affect the emotions of development workers in a number of ways that can reinforce Orientalisms. Firstly, to talk of policy makes development workers take on an emotionally neutral tone that denies many of their experiences and feelings on the ground. In addition, it makes development workers feel discomforted and frustrated as the production of this myth means that important learning from the field is not evaluated, reflected upon, or incorporated into the future overriding strategies of organisations like AusAID. I argue that this discomfort calls on development workers to be reflexive, because, by continuing to produce data to represent the implementation of policy, on-the-ground development workers may continue to justify the Orientalisms embedded in the overarching policy of AusAID and other organisations.
I also noted that policy influences who and what organisations came together to work on HIV and AIDS development projects. This, I theorised, produced an image of several groups coming together to achieve an altruistic goal, but in doing so could hide the self-interested motives of other parties. If these ulterior motives were to impede a development worker’s desire to achieve an altruistic identity, the development worker could feel frustrated and betrayed. In addition, if these ulterior motives came from PNG development workers in the organisations, there was the potential for the Western development worker to Orientalise PNG peoples and places as discussed in Chapter 7.

In the next half of the chapter I considered the potential for development workers to influence the overarching policy directions of groups like AusAID. In this section I discussed how each individual development worker felt (and, highly likely, was) limited in their ability to influence policy. They could, however, influence the strategies of their own organisations, or could ‘create’ synchronicities of experiences with other development workers that were able to have some influence on groups like AusAID. Thus I called for greater reflexivity on the roles that (both individual and collective) emotions play in the consensus-raising that occurs within these groups. Finally, I theorised that development workers who continue in the same field often climb the ranks of the development industry, thus gaining greater influence on policy direction in the future. Thus the continued and greater reflexivity of those development workers on the ground is important for shaping the future overarching development policy and culture.
Chapter 9: Conclusion

9.1 Introduction

Throughout this thesis I have argued that Orientalisms plays an important role in how contemporary development work functions. I have also argued that the persistence of Orientalisms has been enabled by the emotionally charged nature of development work, a factor which is often overlooked. Yet I also argued that this emotionally charged nature is messy, filled with complex, contradictory and overlapping feelings towards people and places. As such, emotions seem just as important in resisting Orientalisms as they are in creating them.

This ability to struggle with, and resist, Orientalisms was something I particularly noted in my interview participants. I feel their much-appreciated help in constructing this research comes, at least in part, from a genuine want to reflect on their emotions and be reflexive about their effects on development outcomes. Any criticism of their actions expressed in this thesis are also a criticism of my own actions, as I too experienced many of emotionally charged situations that my interview participants experienced in their time as development workers in PNG.

This thesis has shown that the Third World ‘Others’/places that Western development workers or organisations claim to assist are not logical, known and stable realities, but are flexible and imaginative constructs built from emotional reactions to people, places and culture. These emotions, it seems, are in part linked to one’s past histories and the imaginings of one’s identity as a Westerner, and development worker. As Said (2003) observed, it would be virtually impossible to think of a culture or person whose history has been untouched by colonialism and imperialism (Said, 2003). This means that the colonial past of Western development workers and agencies plays a role in how they feel towards these Third World ‘Others’/places. How they feel towards Third World ‘Others’ flows on to affect how development workers and organisations constructs ‘Third World’ people and places.

In this chapter I conclude this thesis by bringing out the important implications for development work of the interaction between emotions and hegemonic discourses of Orientalisms. I also show how the study of emotions has an important, yet so far under-appreciated place within the field of geography (although this has been changing rapidly in recent years), and in development studies in particular. I will first describe the contributions
that this thesis has made in relation to the three points of argument outlined in Chapter 1 and in 9.2 below. I will also describe how this has contributed to the fields of Postcolonial Studies and Emotional Geographies. This section will also give insights into the application of new methods of applying critical discourse analysis. I will then discuss the limitations of my research and some possibilities for future research. Finally I conclude this thesis by advocating that greater consideration be given to the role of emotions in processes of development, and that Emotional Geographies should play a more central role in the fields of geography and development studies.

9.2 Thesis Contributions

Introduction

In this thesis I have relied heavily on the ground-breaking works of others to produce my argument. Some aspects of this argument come from the works of Said (2003), Mosse (2004), Ahmed (2004 a, 2006), Wright (2012), to name a few (see Chapter 2). Yet the empirics of this research have also made a number of important contributions to the works of these authors and the fields of Postcolonial Studies and Emotional Geographies in general. It is these contributions that will be the focus of this section.

The empirical focus of this research has centred on four particular aspects of development practice in PNG. Each chapter argued that both emotions and Orientalisms are persistent and often- denied aspects of development work. In addition, each chapter showed how emotions were interlinked with the reproduction of Orientalisms, and also with the struggle to move beyond, or resist it\(^{130}\). In this section I will summarise how each of these chapters argued this supposition, as well as describe the broader implications of these results. I do so by describing the contributions of each chapter in relation to the three points or arguments set out in Chapter 1, namely:

\(^{130}\) This struggle to move beyond Orientalisms was more marked in some aspects of HIV and AIDS development in PNG than others\(^{131}\). This process had the strong potential to be Orientalising as often these get-togethers were about venting frustrations and reorientating along a Western mindset (see 7.3). Yet with reflexivity this process could destabilise Orientalisms.
1. All aspects of development are emotional.
2. The emotionality of development work can cause the reproduction of Orientalisms in development research, policy, and practice.
3. Emotions are not wholly negative forces in development, as they are also important in creating resistances to Orientalisms.

All Aspects of Development Work are Emotional

In my results, I highlighted several aspects of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG. These largely pertained to the areas of development research, policy, and implementation by development workers. In each of these chapters I provided evidence of emotionality. This is particularly significant for the findings in the empirical chapters which dealt with policy and academic research (Chapters 6 and 5 respectively). These two areas are typically considered to be the realm of rational thought and absence of emotionality (Smith, Davidson, Cameron et al, 2009, Askew, 2009). This work has therefore strengthened the claim by Emotional Geographers such as Ahmed (2004 a) and Davidson, Bondi and Smith (2007) that all texts are emotional. However, the attempts to remove emotions from policy documents were significant, and the traces left behind can be subtle (see Chapter 6).

The empirical chapters which dealt with policy and academic research both used Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to locate emotionality within the text and critically assess the effect this emotionality would have on both the reader and writer of these texts. The success of this approach shows that CDA can, and should, be applied to texts as a way of uncovering emotionality. As such, this thesis has contributed to new and innovative ways of using CDA.

Using an aspect of CDA known as pragmatics, I was able to discern, in Chapter 5, that the metaphor that ‘PNG is like Africa’ was employed in part because of the fear and concern that it could generate in readers. This fear and worry could then push the reader of documents which used the metaphor, to act and think in certain ways that would benefit the researcher. For example, documents may generate the fear that PNG will end up just like Africa if people don’t put more funding into HIV and AIDS research or development projects, and so influence readers who control funding decisions. Therefore this thesis has contributed to a greater understanding of HIV and AIDS development research in PNG by suggesting that development research should not be considered emotionally neutral, but rather an argument to make the receiver of the research feel a certain way towards PNG people and places.
Stronger yet was the prompting found in policy documents. These documents could prompt (very subtly, in the case of secular policy documents) a range of emotions from the reader, including positivity, sympathy, fear and frustration. For the most part, these documents could prompt such emotions in order to produce a sense of confidence, support and ‘faith’ in the aims and desired actions of the HIV and AIDS policy makers. That is, to achieve confidence and support for the policies, these documents had the potential to incline the reader to adopt certain feelings about HIV and AIDS, PNG people and place. If elicited, these feelings would often position the reader and/or the policy documents to be ‘above’ PNG people or place. For example, the reader was often prompted to feel frustration at the PNG Government for getting in the way of, or not doing enough to support, good policy. Therefore the policy seemed better, for the ‘fact’ that any alternate modus operandi used by the PNG Government seemed worse.

This thesis has therefore contributed to a greater understanding of the role of emotions in policy documents, which are often considered to be the most emotionally neutral of texts. But even in policy areas, texts have emotionality, and, where there is emotionality there is the ability to emotionally manipulate the reader. Although these attempts are very subtle and apparently weak, paradoxically, these texts have the potential to influence their readers’ emotions more strongly because many readers assume that there will be no emotionality.

It is important to note that not all policy documents were the same. Those policies closer to the ground tended to have more nuanced constructions of PNG people and place. They also tended to be more overt with their emotions. This was particularly the case with the religious policy documents. These were at times highly and overtly emotional, directly asking the reader to feel certain ways, or to reflect on how they felt about issues to do with HIV and AIDS in PNG. The religious documents also did not try to prompt a feeling of confidence and ‘faith’ in the policy documents themselves; instead they often called for confidence and ‘faith’ in God or the teachings of Jesus Christ. However, embracing emotions through the filter of religion can have problematic effects, because religion can often be divisive and implicated in all sorts of complicated colonial and Orientalising processes that are beyond the scope of this thesis to discuss. Also, for many secular development workers operating with these policies, the overtly religious nature might make them ‘switch off’ and/or reject the messages they contained, for better or worse.
Thus this thesis shows that policy documents do not necessarily aim to remove emotions, as the secular policy documents did, but can instead ask for emotional investments or reactions from the readers, as the Anglican HIV and AIDS policy document did. This has added impact on development, particularly in places like PNG, because religious institutions can often muster significant financial, cultural and social resources that can shape the nature of policy and action undertaken by secular development agencies such as AusAID, which work in partnership with, or in support of, the religious institutions (Luker, 2003, Bowtell, 2005). Thus highly emotional texts like the Anglican HIV and AIDS policy documents can influence the finances and actions of secular development agencies and workers.

This thesis also shows that CDA could be used to gain an understanding of the emotional states of the policy writers, and the emotional benefits to them, that come from these texts. For example, I noted in Chapter 6 that the policy documents could be revealing insecurities on the part of people/organisations who wrote them. This was evidenced by the sheer number of attempts and techniques used to make the reader feel positive about the stated directions and aims for HIV and AIDS development in PNG. One reason the authors of these policy documents might have constructed them to be overtly positive, and in many respects faultless, was so that they could portray the PNG HIV and AIDS situation in a way that seemed completely understood (by themselves and their organisations) and thereby, under control. Such portrayal helps the authors and other members of their organisations to avoid the unpleasant and disorientating feelings that come with acknowledging and embracing some of the many ‘unknowns’ and contradictory information about PNG HIV and AIDS. Therefore some of the constructions, of PNG people and place, in policy documents are partly due to the writers, and the organisations that they represent, wishing to avoid difficult emotions.

There was even more evidence of emotional states in the texts of academic researchers. In this thesis I show that the ‘like Africa’ metaphor was extremely useful in providing opportunities for emotional as well as practical benefits to the academic researchers. For example, the metaphor allowed a great many gaps and unknowns in the PNG HIV and AIDS situation to be filled in by what was ‘known’ about Africa. This has the potential to give researchers confidence and allow their ‘evidence’ about PNG to hold together in a socially acceptable narrative. This also avoids discomforting feelings about unknown situations and a possible lack of answers to superiors or donor clients.
This thesis therefore contributes the idea that many of the actions and constructs of people and places are about people dealing with their emotions, in particular, trying to lessen the time one might need to ‘sit’ with unpleasant feelings. If this is the case then this thesis has made an important contribution to the theory of exemplar paradigms and the reason why certain examples of how to deal with HIV and AIDS are taught more widely than others. For example I show that the use of the ‘like Africa’ metaphor is at least partly due to researchers and policy experts trying to avoid unpleasant feelings stemming from not knowing many of the key elements of the HIV and AIDS situation in PNG, or how to respond appropriately. It also helped them to avoid unpleasant feelings about not pleasing their potential funders. Therefore when researchers and policy experts used this metaphor in conference papers, in keynote research to aid agencies or through the covert means (like claiming that African HIV and AIDS experts are automatically PNG HIV and AIDS experts), they were teaching people how to deal with emotions and how to persuade others emotionally. In other words, this thesis indicates that exemplar paradigms are not just about teaching and transferring knowledge and skills, but about teaching (or at least encouraging) people to feel certain ways in certain situations, towards certain people and places.

Struggling with unpleasant feelings associated with disorientation, and feeling ‘lost’, were also very common among the Western development workers on-the-ground. Not surprisingly, experiences on-the-ground seemed to be the most emotionally charged aspect of development. Development workers constantly felt battered by a complex, overlapping and often contradictory range of emotions around their experiences in PNG. These feelings would not let up anywhere in PNG, even in their place of residence or when trying to relax at a resort. Hope and happiness, frustration and fear were just some of the strong emotions felt by development workers. This thesis problematises the idea that development workers can and should stay ‘rational’ and ‘unemotional’ in the highly charged emotional situations that are part and parcel of development work.

These emotions where often linked to the types of identities that development workers were trying to make for themselves or, at other times, reject in themselves. For example, I noted that development workers were often trying to transcend themselves, to articulate an altruistic and ethical identity which promoted connection to PNG people. When development workers felt they achieved or articulated these altruistic identities, they would often feel a sense of hope and happiness. As development work was constructed as the way of achieving such altruistic identities, the location in which development workers operated was at times
constructed as a place of hope and happiness. This observation adds to Emotional Geographies by suggesting that development workers might seek out certain places in order to articulate certain identities and to produce certain emotions within themselves. It should be noted, however, that at times development workers failed to articulate this altruistic identity, and at such moments feelings of frustration, sadness and betrayal could be felt at the work place. Thus, although certain places may be sought after to articulate certain emotions, the emotions felt within these places can be complex, diverse and contradictory.

This thesis notes that suppressing and rejecting certain identities was just as much a part of the development workers’ emotional reaction to place as trying to articulate certain desired identities. The rejection of certain identities was just as messy, with its complex mix of emotions and desires, for and against certain places. For example, I noted that development workers at times tended to ‘other’ the ‘plush’ clubs and resorts in PNG, as these places were often segregated from the wider PNG community with which the development worker had a desire to connect. These places also had the markings of home that went against the development worker’s desired identity of traveller. So disparaging remarks were often made, and feelings of dislike were often expressed about these resorts and clubs and for the people who frequented them. Yet at the same time, particularly when the development worker felt the fear of their (Western) self being threatened, they had a deep desire to seek out these places and ‘relax’. Thus development workers often felt many mixed emotions towards these places. My thesis therefore suggests that development workers may feel a fair amount of disorientation due to the fact that they hold contradictory and competing understandings of self.

This thesis has also contributed by describing the emotionality of the interaction between policy and practice, an area that has been greatly under-researched. I noted that there were some similarities between the emotions of development workers and the emotions embedded in policy. It seems that both desired to produce a sense of hope and happiness about the effects that HIV and AIDS development projects had on the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG. Policy, at some times, could go a considerable way towards strengthening development workers’ sense of hope and happiness. This is because policy could bring a lot of different people, expertise and organisations together and produce the appearance that all share the same (altruistic) goals. Although the reality was far more nuanced, complex and riddled with self-interest, a considerable amount of hope and happiness could (at least at the start) be generated by this image.
Also, I noted that complying with, and talking about, policy at times produced certain emotional reactions in development workers. For example, when talking about policy, development workers felt the need to act emotionally neutral about their work and the implementation of policy. Yet this thesis goes further and suggests that development workers controlled their emotions in this way so as to try to do an aspect of their job, which was to represent the situation on-the-ground as the outcome of policy implementation. At these moments, it seems important to some of them to produce a façade which shows that actions were undertaken rationally and in an emotionally neutral fashion. This façade often caused development workers a great deal of discomfort. This was largely because the realities on-the-ground about what, and how, tasks and relationships needed to be maintained, varied considerably from the structured, task-focused nature of policy. Yet development workers felt that they should be representing what happens on-the-ground, in terms of policy goals. In other words, considerable tension and stress was caused because what the development worker saw as success was connecting to PNG people and giving them something they actually wanted (and thus articulating the identity of altruistic development worker), whereas what their organisations required for success was the appearance that policy goals and directions were being implemented.

This thesis also contends that much of this discomfort and stress could be attributed to the fact that development workers found it problematic that many aspects of what actually happened on-the-ground were hidden or unexplored in the attempt to represent policy as having been implemented. They also felt this way because there were times where they saw other methods of dealing with HIV and AIDS achieving what they, on-the-ground, considered a success, yet were unable to initiate similar schemes because these could not be represented in their current policy context. In doing so this thesis opens up the potential for debate around the importance of the aim (held by many development organisations and development workers) to implement policy directions ‘on the ground’.

Yet this thesis also shows that the emotionality of development workers could influence the outcome of future policy. This had implications for how exemplar paradigms in policy might be formed. It was revealed that development workers would often seek-out, and discuss their understandings of PNG and HIV and AIDS with, other development workers. Through this process, consensus among the development workers could be reached, that held the potential for them to come up with solutions to problems that had been causing them frustrations. These discussions could also potentially be a platform for development workers to ‘teach’ their
solutions to frustrating problems to other development workers. These exemplars might impact on how one feels towards particular aspects of PNG people and place. I saw the potential for the continuation of Orientalisms through this process. Although, in most cases, each individual development worker had limited influence and power to impact overall policy and strategy around HIV and AIDS, they often could influence their organisation, or section of organisation, and as a whole could subtly influence the emotionality of PNG HIV and AIDS policy at all levels. Also, in time, development workers could move up the ranks of development organisations, and from their positions of greater power could more directly influence texts.

In making these arguments, this thesis has shown that all aspects of development are emotional, and that this emotional nature of development can affect how people and place are constructed. In doing so, this thesis has contributed to an understanding of the development process and the role that emotions play in development projects. This thesis has shown that emotions cannot be ignored if we wish to full understand the impact of development projects.

**Emotions can Cause Orientalisms to be Reproduced in Contemporary Development Campaigns**

A second central motivation of this thesis was to uncover whether the emotionality of development work had the potential to produce racialised and imperialistic constructions of people and places. More specifically, I focused on the ability for the emotionality of development work to reproduce Orientalisms. In doing so, this thesis has shown that Orientalisms are still prevalent in all aspects of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG, and that emotion can be instrumental in the production and reproduction of Orientalisms. This thesis, therefore, has added to the argument for greater and continued vigilance in exposing and rooting out racism and cultural imperialism in the development industry.

---

131 This process had the strong potential to be Orientalising as often these get-togethers were about venting frustrations and reorientating along a Western mindset (see 7.3). Yet with reflexivity this process could destabilise Orientalisms.
Orientalisms were first noted in the texts of HIV and AIDS development researchers. This thesis argues that a number of the assumptions and metaphors used in policy documents tended to portray PNG people and place as the racial ‘other’. Principal among them was the metaphor that PNG was ‘like Africa’, or, more to the point, would become Africa if left to its own devices. Africa was assumed, in development circles, to be a ‘failure’ or a disaster in terms of the spread HIV and AIDS, which was assumed to be caused by a unified, homogenous and over-sexualised population that could not control their urges without outside intervention. On occasion, Africa was even referred to as the ‘West’s’ primitive sexual self, and in doing so conjured-up colonial and imperialistic ideas about racial science. The African situation was therefore deeply Orientalised, as it imaged the African people as belonging to a single culture that was primitive and child-like, unable to manage its own sexuality and therefore requiring governance/control by an exterior (Western) force. By making the claim that PNG was like Africa, much of the Orientalised understanding about the African HIV and AIDS situation was assumed to apply to PNG.

This thesis shows that the ‘like Africa’ metaphor gains the power to produce Orientalisms by researchers teaching other researchers how to apply this metaphor as a solution to some of the problems they had, in comprehending or producing research into PNG HIV and AIDS. The chapter on development research (Chapter 5) showed that conference papers, keynote research, and the attribution of people as ‘experts’ are taken for granted as mundane aspects of development studies. Yet it was through these aspects of development studies that academics taught others to both accept and use Orientalisms in the form of the ‘like Africa’ metaphor. By teaching people to apply the African circumstance to PNG, Africa has become the exemplar paradigm for how HIV and AIDS research and development should be conducted in PNG. This means that only certain forms of knowledge are appropriated, and information and feedback from PNG that is different to the (imagined) African circumstance is more likely to be ignored. It also means that the Orientalised knowledge that formed knowledge of African HIV and AIDS is now being applied to another part of the globe, PNG.

The (imagined unitary) African HIV and AIDS circumstance is thereby becoming even more universalised as the Third World HIV and AIDS circumstance. Therefore Chapter 5 has added to the work of Stillwagon (2003) by investigating the mechanism by which the Orientalised HIV and AIDS situation in Africa is able to move beyond Africa. More importantly, Chapter 5 strengthens my theoretical argument that exemplar paradigms are complementary to the theories of Orientalisms. It has achieved this through demonstrating how Orientalisms forms
of hegemonic thought can gain and maintain their hegemony through processes that teach other researchers how to do research. But, as stated in Chapter 5 and at the start of 9.2, this metaphor was employed for emotional as well as physical benefits to the development researchers. To make the Papua New Guinean ‘knowable’ meant that discomforts were overcome and confidence in one’s work was engendered. As such, this thesis has improved the understanding of Orientalisms in development research, by indicating that Orientalisms may be employed in order to avoid the discomforting emotions of not ‘knowing’ the ‘Other’, or the appropriate directions to take in order to tackle HIV and AIDS in PNG. In other words, this thesis has added an emotional aspect to understanding exemplar paradigms.

These findings have implications for the practice of development as they indicate that the knowledge claims on which development agencies base their decisions are Orientalised. Works that are Orientalised give benefits (some of which are emotional) to the academic researchers and the policy experts, but misconstrue the actualities of the situation on-the-ground. More money pumped into HIV and AIDS for fear of a ‘like Africa’ disaster can often mean less money for other vital areas, like mainstream epidemiological approaches, or other major health issues PNG is facing, such as TB (Stillwaggon, 2003). Moreover, this thesis indicates the need to investigate the emotionality of these research documents to uncover the Orientalisms within them.

In addition, I noted that when development policy used grammatical and linguistic structures to produce a ‘knowing authorities’ tone about HIV and AIDS in PNG, there was the potential to perpetrate Orientalisms. This thesis thus goes further to show that Orientalisms were often propagated through emotional means. When secular aid organisations try to act emotionally neutral, emotions are still present. These emotions may nonetheless influence how a development worker, or other reader of these documents, feels towards certain people, places and things. Particularly strong was the inference in these documents that one should feel positive about development agencies/policy. This emotional charge seemed largely directed at convincing the reader to feel confident in the policies and the action of the policies. These claims towards positivity repeatedly construct the development agency and the mainstream development approach as the only viable option for positive development. This has the potential to empower Orientalisms by moving readers to feel that Western mainstream development documents are the only ones that truly understand the variables of PNG people, place and HIV and AIDS. This means that Orientalisms are being reproduced through the idea that Western policy documents ‘know’ PNG HIV and AIDS and ‘know’ how to manage/govern it
and PNG people. Thus this adds to an understanding of Orientalisms by suggesting that it can be through the attempt to remove emotion, that Orientalisms can be propagated.

Yet at other times it was the emotions that writers of these text themselves were feeling that could lead to Orientalisms. For example, in Chapter 6 I noted that there was a considerable amount of confusion, miscommunication and frustration in the description of previous events in the AusAID yearly plan. By not acknowledging or, more so, not being reflexive of the frustration in the situation, the writers of the yearly plan constructed their PNG counterparts as child-like and incompetent. This document also suggested that it was essentially their ‘Western’ hand that guided and finished-off the project, after their PNG partners left it unfinished. Therefore, by not being reflexive of their feelings of frustration, the writers of this Western policy document reproduced Orientalisms.

The findings of Orientalisms within PNG HIV and AIDS policy documents, and the way they are triggered through emotions, have important implications for development. They suggest that development organisations and their policy writers must continue to be more self-reflexive of the ways in which they might cause harm to their clients through Orientalisms, and must be especially reflexive of their own emotions and of the emotive arguments they wish to make through policy.

This thesis further adds to this understanding of the role between emotions and Orientalisms by investigating emotions of development workers in the field. It revealed that when development workers were not reflexive or mindful of their emotions they were likely to produce Orientalisms. Without reflexiveness to their emotions and desires, a development worker could, in multiple ways, reproduce Orientalisms. For example, in Chapter 7 I noted development workers desired an altruistic identity, to feel like they were helping. Feeling this way or articulating this identity was often related to feeling that they connected to PNG people. At moments when they connected to their PNG work colleagues in this way, development workers would often view their PNG work colleagues in a positive light. They would see their PNG fellow workers as their equal and conveyed a great deal of respect for them. Yet without reflexivity, this way of seeing and feeling towards PNG work colleagues could slip into a form of Romantic Orientalisms in which these colleagues were a form of ‘indigenous hero’ who will be the ‘saviours’ of the rest of the PNG population who can’t help themselves. Yet at other times, particularly when a development worker ‘betrayed’ the ‘indigenous hero’ image constructed for them, Western development workers felt a great deal
of frustration and anger towards their PNG work colleagues. At these times development workers felt like they could not connect with PNG people, and they were more likely to construct their PNG work colleagues along traditional Orientalist lines that is, as selfish, childlike, and unable to govern their own actions properly.

This thesis has thus shown that it doesn’t matter whether a Western development worker feels pride and connection to PNG people, or anger and disconnection, if they are not reflexive of their emotions at either end of the emotional spectrum, then the worker can reproduce Orientalisms.

Chapter 7 also showed that the emotive desires and aversions of Westerners to certain places in PNG were often intertwined with Orientalisms. This thesis has contributed to understandings of Orientalisms by showing that Westerner’s desire and enjoyment for certain places might, in part, come about because these places provide comfort and security associated with reproducing the Orientalist dichotomy that places the Westerner in the position of ‘superiority’ and power. For example, I noted a strong desire for development workers (me included) to seek out places of leisure like ‘plush’ clubs and resorts, while in PNG. One of the reasons for this was the fear felt by Western development workers while in PNG. This fear was, at least in part, due to the egos of development workers being threatened when Orientalist imaginings of the world were challenged. For example, Orientalisms have taught Westerners to feel as if Western bodies are always the ‘familiar’ and hold the ‘superior’ position, whereas ‘Eastern’ bodies are the ‘foreign’ and are in the ‘inferior’ position. However, in many places in PNG development workers began to feel their Western bodies were foreign in that landscape and did not feel as though they were in control or in the superior position. This could make them feel fear. The ‘plush’ clubs and resorts provided an escape from this fear because they reproduced Orientalist imaginings of the world. In the clubs and resorts the PNG body was less prevalent than the Western body (and therefore ‘foreign’) and the Westerner could feel like they were in a superior position through all the ‘pampering’ that they received at these places.

As such, this thesis has contributed to the understanding of how a development worker’s emotions might be interlinked with certain places, by showing that feelings towards certain places are linked to the development worker’s past history of colonialism and the ways it has taught them to imagine the ‘Other’. This adds weight to Ahmed’s (2004 a) argument that a
person’s past histories, real or imagined, with others leave an impression on them. The impression previously left by others will shape one feel towards others in the present.

It is important to note that people’s emotions towards other people and places were never as clear cut as I have described in the above paragraphs. The emotional reactions that were vital in the reproduction of Orientalisms were constantly tempered by varying degrees of self awareness and resistance. These processes meant that people’s emotional reactions towards places were often very messy, with overlapping and contradictory emotions. This meant that the reproduction of Orientalisms was never a complete process, and was something that all development workers struggled with. This will be discussed more in the next subsection below.

I also revealed that the current interactions between policy and implementation can lead to Orientalisms (see Chapter 8). It was noted in Chapter 8 that Orientalisms could be either hidden from view, or worse still, reproduced and strengthened by some of the actions that resulted from the interaction between policy and practice. This is largely due to the process by which development workers felt they had to translate their actions back into policy format. Policy, as noted above and in Chapter 6, was often affected by Orientalisms, particularly in the way it portrayed itself as a knowing Western subject which had superior knowledge about HIV and AIDS in PNG. Development workers felt they were in a situation where they had to spend a lot of time maintaining the image that the policy was correct and that they were successfully implementing it on-the-ground. If they didn’t, future funding would be at risk. This had the ability to affect both their actions and their emotions.

One of the ways this strengthened Orientalisms was by limiting the reflexivity that development workers would put into their job. Development workers wanted to consider and investigate the flow-on effects of their development work. But if their investigations revealed that their actions had limited, no, or adverse, effects on the PNG population, then they feared their actions would be constructed as a failure to implement (the all-knowing) policy, and therefore they would not receive future funding. So instead, development workers (and organisations) limited much of their ability to be reflexive, and instead focused on reporting the number of programs (that appeared to be in line with policy goals) that they implemented. In doing so, they reproduced an Orientalist assumption that, because the Western policy ‘knew’ what was needed, then its implementation must be successful. This process often caused feelings of stress and doubt in development workers as they saw the problematic nature of such actions. What also caused stress and doubt was the fact that development
workers would sometimes see, or learn about, certain actions that seemed more successful which were occurring on-the-ground in PNG, yet could not change their actions to mimic these successful approaches because they could not be represented as fitting the policy framework. Therefore this thesis shows that there can be considerable stress and discomfort caused if the structures through which development workers operate force them to reproduce Orientalisms. This form of stress and discomfort therefore is likely a sign of how development workers struggle with Orientalisms.

This thesis also illustrates another way that the interaction between policy and implementation could cause Orientalisms. It notes that many development workers’ actions were not impeded by policy, and that some felt like they could take any action that they wanted provided that they could think of a way of describing what they did in terms of policy goals. This thesis argues that slanting and reporting actions that fit with policy goals had the potential to strengthen Orientalisms by ensuring that some of the actions that development workers took to resist Orientalisms are not recorded, and therefore do not improve future policy. In addition, potential actions and beliefs held by development workers, that could reproduce Orientalisms and other forms of racism and imperialism, may go unnoticed because they are not reported under the policy framework.

These findings therefore suggest that current interactions between policy and practice need to be reconsidered in light of their ability to strengthen and appropriate unwanted acts of cultural imperialism and racism.

It is important to note that there are aspects of this interaction that may help promote resistances to Orientalisms. I noted resistance to Orientalisms in all aspects of the development process, although some areas, such as the actions of development workers on-the-ground, tended to show more signs of resistance than other areas. The next section will explain the main contribution this thesis has made to the understandings of resistance to Orientalisms in the development process.

**Emotions can be Vital in Producing Resistances to Orientalisms**

The final contribution this thesis makes to the fields of Postcolonial Studies, Emotional Geographies and development studies/practice is to show some of the ways in which emotions could be vital in resisting Orientalisms. This was particularly the case if the emotion tended to help promote a sense of self-reflexivity in the person feeling the emotion. More than that, this
thesis argues that instances when we catch ourselves feeling certain emotions should be noted as moments for self-reflexivity. This might require a different attitude towards emotions. For this thesis proposes that when a person experiences the unpleasant feelings and discomfort that come with feeling lost, disorientated and unsure, it is important to act reflexively. These feelings can often be the markers for where someone is struggling with Orientalisms.

Such feelings were evident in one of the texts in the mainstream development research that I studied, in which the writer first claimed that PNG was not an African look-alike, but then went on to claim that certain aspects of culture and kinship were like those in Africa. This swapping from one stance to the other suggests uncertainty of the writer, which can be read as a struggle with Orientalisms. This struggle itself is a sign of resistance, and therefore emotions such as these could be seen as a chance to act reflexively. For the most part, when research became uncertain about an Orientalist assumption such as the ‘like Africa’ scenario, it would just go silent on the issue. I noted this in Chapter 5, where many of the more recent conference papers about HIV and AIDS in PNG did not construct the Orientalism that PNG was ‘like Africa’, whereas older conference papers tended to mention that PNG was like Africa. One of the more recent talks by Oxfam (2007) went further, and challenged the assumption by proclaiming that PNG was not like Africa.

This thesis suggests that researchers should acknowledge when they feel uncertain about the assumptions that they are making. From there, they can be reflexive about the role they play in propagating these assumptions. Through this suggestion, this thesis has the potential to contribute to how development research could be conducted in order to reduce Orientalisms.

Policy, too, tended to show some signs of resistance to Orientalisms. These signs of resistance were particularly evident in the policy documents written by development workers in PNG. These policies produced closer to the actualities of PNG live than the overarching AusAID documents that I analysed and were therefore less certain and more nuanced in their approach to the situation. These documents also tended to express more emotion, and in doing so did not produce as strong an image of being a knowing, rational/emotionless document. By not creating the impression that all the ‘ins’ and ‘outs’ of HIV and AIDS in PNG were known, these documents were more open to expressing the feelings of uncertainty about the situation, and in doing so were less likely to construct PNG people and place in ways that were static and Orientalist. This was particularly the case with the Anglican HIV and AIDS policy document, which was highly emotional and, in a number of places, called for a reflexive
process to understand the role being played in HIV and AIDS in PNG and how actions might be prejudicial to certain sectors of the PNG population. Yet being a religious document, it filtered this form of reflexivity through the ‘knowledge’ of the Bible. This could be problematic, as it has the potential to limit the effects of this reflexive process, by ignoring potentially contentious areas of the scriptures, the history of the Church as a colonising force, and turning away people like Western development workers who do not (actively) follow Christianity.

In making these claims, this thesis contributes to the debate about how to produce culturally appropriate development policy. These findings suggest that a greater acceptance, presence and reflexivity of the policy writer’s emotions should be evident in policy documents. If this is done, then potential cases of Orientalisms can be exposed and a greater resistance to Orientalisms can be fostered. In addition, the overarching policy frameworks under which development work is conducted should be more grounded in the actualities of the places they claim to represent. This would promote more of an emotional engagement, and possibly a greater sense of uncertainty around the development process. Greater emotional engagement has the potential to foster resistances to the production of documents that claim to ‘know’ the Third World ‘Other’.

Signs of resistance were particularly evident in the interviews with development workers on-the-ground (see Chapter 7). It was noted that the times when development workers felt a strong emotional reaction tended to correspond with times in which they could consider their actions and thoughts in a self-reflexive manner. This was particularly the case when development workers felt the disorientating feelings of disorientation or being lost, which were often the times when their desired trajectories and interactions with PNG people and place were blocked. As a result, development workers would often fail to articulate or live up to a desired identity. Yet these desired identities were often, in part, a product of Orientalisms, requiring the access to and, on some level, the exploitation of PNG people and place. For example, to articulate an altruistic identity can be predicated on the assumption that the Western development worker can fix the situation that the PNG people cannot fix; and it is their right as Western altruist to be granted access to PNG people and places. This is Orientalist, because articulating this identity requires/imagines that the Western development worker has unprecedented access to PNG people and place and that PNG people are weak/needy and amenable to change. Therefore a development worker’s failure to articulate a certain identity because their desired trajectory is blocked is in part a resistance to Orientalisms.
This thesis also notes that when development workers begin to feel disorientated and lost, they begin to question what they are trying to achieve. Thus feeling disorientated lends itself to more instances of self-reflexivity than a number of other emotions. This thesis has therefore shown that moments of disorientation are calls for one to think and act reflexively, and thereby allow for the possibility of new knowledge and understanding that can resist Orientalisms. It is important to note that I, and many of the development workers interviewed, missed some of these moments for reflexivity because we had an aversion to the unpleasant feelings associated with being disorientated. In other words, instead of being reflexive we looked for ways to stop the unpleasant feelings. The actions we took to escape these feelings, in many cases, reproduced Orientalisms. This thesis therefore supports Ahmed’s (2006) claim that we need to be more open and accepting of the moments of disorientation and the unpleasant feelings that are associated with it.

Chapter 7 also noted that, for development workers, positive emotions like hope and happiness were often associated with achieving a desired identity, such as the altruistic development worker. Equally so, the happiness and pleasure felt at the resort were signs of articulating an identity. Articulating an identity, as was shown in Chapter 7, could sometimes be beneficial for resisting Orientalisms, yet at other times could be instrumental in reproducing an Orientalism, or (as is most likely the case) it could be a mixture of the two. It is only by being reflexive of these moments that we can begin to understand this process. This thesis therefore has contributed to the debate about how to resist Orientalisms by suggesting that development workers should begin to act reflexively in the moments of pleasant emotions experienced on achieving a desired identity132.

Finally, in Chapter 8, this thesis suggests ways that the interactions between policy and implementation can help, or be improved, to promote resistances to Orientalisms in development work. In general there was not much that was noted that promoted the resistance to Orientalisms in the interaction between policy and development as it stands now. Due to the vagueness of policy, development workers could take actions that could lessen or resist the Orientalisms embedded in policy, provided that they could write up their actions in

132 These moments are often harder to act reflexively in, as they don’t tend to engender the self-questioning that was noted in moments of disorientation.
ways that suggested the implementation of policy. This however could limit the reach of such resistances, because workers were unable to report them in ways that would fit with possible representations of policy implementation. In addition, many development workers were restricted from being reflexive about their interactions in PNG due to the interactions between policy and implementation. Development workers felt that if they investigated the effects of their work on the PNG population, they ran the risk of losing funding, because any negative feedback could be considered a failure to implement policy, and not a failure of policy itself\(^{133}\). In addition, some development workers felt constrained because they could see positive developments in the field, with the potential to resist Orientalisms and work with PNG people in new ways, yet could not undertake these actions because they would not fit the policy framework.

Therefore this thesis suggests that policy framework needs to be changed in order to encourage openness about what is happening on the ground level, and not necessarily see failure to implement policy as a failed development project, but as a time for greater reflexivity on the situation. It also argues that development workers on-the-ground could benefit from having greater leeway in what they can do to promote development, and in how they represent themselves and their actions.

It was also noted in Chapter 8 that development workers on-the-ground could later move up the ranks of development organisations and so be in positions that could have greater effects over policy framework. Chapter 7 noted that development workers on-the-ground seem to be at the coalface of the emotional interactions between ‘self’ and ‘other’ that lead to the resistances or reproductions of Orientalisms. Therefore this thesis promotes the idea that future policy frameworks, as well as implementations, could encourage greater resistance to Orientalisms if development workers on-the-ground are taught to see their emotional reactions, such as feeling disorientated and hopeful, as moments for self reflexivity.

\(^{133}\) Development workers often showed the signs of disorientation at those moments, because they felt like they were not articulating their desired identity as ethical, altruistic development worker due to the constraints of the policy framework. This is therefore another indication of how disorientation can be a call for reflexivity.
9.3 Limitations and Future Research

Although this research lists a number of important factors as to why racism and cultural imperialism exist in current Western development practices, there are still a number of limitations which I believe could be the impetus for research in the future. In this research I have noted how emotional interactions affect the relationship by which the ‘Self’ and the ‘Other’ interact. My study, however, has only looked at how the nature of that relationship is affected from the perspective of the self or Western counterpart. This research provides little insight into how the ‘Other’ or non-Westerner might be affected by these moments of interactions. Therefore a useful future study would look at the emotional interactions between the Western development workers and the PNG people, with both the views of the Western development workers and their Papua New Guinean counterparts and clients fully articulated. Such research would undoubtedly find valuable insights into the constructions of ‘self’/‘other’, ‘East’/‘West’ relations. Because the diversity of cultures and social systems in PNG can lead to great differences in how HIV and AIDS development work is received (Lepani, 2008, Wardlow, 2006), there would be value in studies in which the emotional reactions of development workers are situated at a highly local level, and also in studies which assess the flow on effects of an individual’s attempt to implement a particular policy (or policy direction).

In this thesis I have explored how development workers have postcolonial desires to form identities that transcend the ‘Self’/‘Other’ or ‘East’/‘West’ boundaries. I particularly focused on how these desires can be encouraged to form new knowledge that can change interactions between Westerners and the ‘Other’. I also noted that these desires still required something from the ‘East’ to fulfil them. An argument could be put that those in the ‘West’ should not look to the ‘East’ in order to fulfil their desires and form their identity. Such processes of desire fulfilment were at the very heart of Orientalisms (Said, 2003). Research into the ways those in the ‘Self’ could feel stable in identity without requiring/or taking something from the ‘Other’ could provide a valuable insight.

I am, however, not entirely sure what such a research proposal would look like. In every interaction between subjects and objects there is always desire (Said, 2003). Even Descartes, the ‘great’ enlightenment thinker did not see how desire, unlike almost every other emotion, could be completely eradicated from human life (see Chapter 2). As such, the postcolonial desires to transcend a Western ‘Self’ and connect empathically and ethically with the Third World ‘Other’ could be seen as a step forward. This step should be taken reflexively, so as not
to repeat problems of the past like Romantic Orientalisms, or produce new ways of silencing the Third World ‘Other’. As such, more research into ways to help development projects foster a sense of empathic connection would have benefits for both Western development workers and their clients.

I also noted in Chapter 7 that what often turned moments of connection, or the articulation of an altruistic identity, from an act of resistance to an act of Orientalisms was the process of identification. This was where the development worker, instead of empathising with the PNG people through a sense of connection, identifies the PNG people as being like them. This situation often led to the reproduction of Romantic Orientalisms. This research did not investigate deeply what caused a development worker to stop empathising and start identifying with PNG people. Therefore there is potential for future research to investigate both the desires for connection and empathy with the ‘Other’ and its potential to shift empathy into identification.

In this thesis I focused on just some of the emotions experienced by development workers. Other emotions that are more subtle or that interviewees are less likely to admit to are also likely to play an integral role in how development workers construct themselves and others. The experience of using a free writing journal in this research revealed to me many emotional reactions that I may not otherwise have noticed or would not have admitted to. I would therefore advocate future research that would involve multiple participants keeping free writing journals over their time working in developing countries, in order to explore these more subtle/‘shameful’ emotions.

In addition, in 7.3 I noted that development workers were more open to talking about their emotions, particularly their frustrations/thwarted desires, in debriefs with other workers. It is therefore likely that focus groups with development workers may reveal more emotive responses than interviews would, as they provide a setting more like that of a debrief. So future research involving focus groups is likely to produce a more nuanced understanding of the desires and emotions of development workers and how they affect development worker/client interactions.
9.4 Conclusion

I am uncertain as to how to end this thesis. It describes how development work is emotional and by its very nature messy, never static, riddled with multiplicities and contradictory knowledge and opinions about people, places, times or things. In short, development is an uncertain process and prospect. Yet it is hidden behind façades of certainty that can obscure the actualities of development, and the people involved. So how then could one who studies and observes development have complete certainty as to what their readers should ‘take home’ from their work? Nor am I certain that what I wish for my readers to ‘take home’ will be the actual message that they do take. My and my readers’ emotional reactions to the texts and interview quotes that I have used will likely vary. Such is the uncertainty that is brought about because we are all emotional beings. Yet despite this uncertainty, and in part because of our emotions, things are always moving; requiring one to take action. And so it is with uncertain steps that I must forge, not a conclusion, but a new beginning. So it seems only fitting that I go back to what was said at the beginning of my thesis.

At the start of this thesis I described a situation in which a development worker stayed on in the field despite the fact that she was earning significantly less income than she had previously, and was living in stressful conditions in which she was robbed. She continued to work for what she hoped will be a better future for PNG people. Her story shows that development workers, at least in the ‘West’ forego opportunities because they are, at least in part, moved by the inequality in the world today. Her story is just one of a multitude of stories of the ‘sacrifices’ development workers make as a result of emotion. And although the sacrifices of development workers are always a form of impure or selfish altruism, development workers’ emotions have still moved them to tackle issues that many have chosen to avoid or move away from.

Whether they knew it or not, when development workers were moved to act they chose, for a time at least, to be in exile from their ‘home’. They were in a place of disorientation and uncertainty, between ‘two worlds’. It is a place that Said (1993 a, 1993 b) claims offers one the potential to see racial and imperial hegemonies such as Orientalisms. In other words, Western development workers away from home are well-positioned to create new beginnings that can move beyond Orientalisms. Yet the position of exile is also a distressing one, so it is understandable that development workers might long for a ‘home’ they have left behind, so as to have ‘certainty’ once more. This is particularly so because they are placed within a
development system that often produces policy and ‘knowledge’ that often does not support
them to achieve what can be achieved in this ‘exile’. Worse, the development system still
expects the development workers to be certain about things that cannot be known, like the
positionality of the development workers’ ‘home’ culture and that of the culture in which they
find themselves. In asking for such certainties, the development framework denies
development workers the ability to express the emotionality that is essential for achieving the
potential of the development experience.

Although there are some signs of resistances in mainstream development policy and
knowledge claims, more needs to be done in order to help development workers stay in ‘exile’.
What I see as the best way forward is for mainstream development policy and academia to
embrace ‘exile’ with the workers. That is, to first admit to, and then be (hyper) reflexive of, the
emotionality, the ever-changing nature and the constant uncertainty, and thus to be reflexive
of the disorientating experience that is development work. In addition, it would be beneficial
to train development workers to be reflexive of their emotions and of their emotions’ ability to
lead to hegemonic constructions of the Third World. As I see great potential for new
knowledge coming from the experiences that disorientate, development workers should be
taught ways of staying with (as opposed to avoiding) these experiences. This includes teaching
development workers how to stay ‘in exile’ when they get home. So in short (although
knowing such vision is fanciful), I envision a new form of development that is set adrift on
uncertain seas, yet able to act reflexively to each moment that arises, and in each moment
choose the option that leaves behind racism and imperialism.
Appendix 1

Questions for Development Workers

Project Title: Emotional Orientalism: A Postcolonial Study of Emotions in HIV and AIDS Development Projects in PNG.

Document Version 3; dated [14/05/09]

General Questions about structure

When did you go to PNG?

What sort of impressions did you get of PNG? What did you think of the lifestyle? The people?

Where did you work in PNG?

What do you see as the role of your organisation in the prevention of the spread of HIV and AIDS in PNG?

How would you describe your role in the programs?

What factors do you think influenced how your organisation portrayed its self and the strategies it took for dealing with HIV and AIDS?

   Does the way your organisation fund its HIV and AIDS work influence what you can do, or how you portray yourself and the issues of HIV and AIDS?

   Do you work with any other NGO/GO on your PNG, AIDS projects/programs?

   Were policies and programs influenced by these exterior organisations? For example did AUSaid performance criteria influence how programs where enacted?

Do you think the experiences that development workers have on the ground level can influence the policies and strategies of development agencies, including large national and international organisations like the AusAID and the UN? (how)
Do you think someone in your position can influence HIV and AIDS strategies. (how)?

Questions on issues to do with the effects of HIV and AIDS development work

*How would you describe the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG? What do you see as the reasons behind its spread? What do you think can be done in this situation?*

Do you think the issues of HIV and AIDS in PNG requires more of a relief approach or more of a Development approach?

*What are the main avenues by which knowledge about HIV and AIDS reaches the PNG community (and PLWHA)?*

What do you think are the current strengths of HIV and AIDS development work in PNG?

Where do you feel there are gaps?

What sorts of problems or issues are faced on a **day-to-day** basis while running a (insert what ever sort of task they do. E.G AIDS prevention/awareness campaign)

Did you find the polices and programs that you work(ed) on fit(ted) with the situations and issues at the ground level?

Are there any people or groups that resist or reject the knowledge given about AIDS (and PLWHA)? And why do you think this is so?

A number of development workers that I have talked to say that even though they have taught people about HIV and AIDS those very same people still continue to engage in risky behaviors.

Do you think that is the case? Why do you think this is so?

Did the information you learnt about AIDS change how you live your life?

*How do you think HIV and AIDS, and Papua New Guineans are portrayed by the campaigns?*

*Do you think the perceptions of HIV and AIDS produced by development agencies affect how people in PNG view themselves, or their society and family?*

*What’s your opinion on the changes that the Aids Industry as made to the lives of people in PNG and their societies.*
Do you think that HIV and AIDS development agencies are trying to redefine what is considered ethical behaviour in PNG? (How) What are these alternatives? Do you share this vision?

Are HIV and AIDS organisations producing new structures and support networks in communities?

Are there any negative consequences of the actions of HIV and AIDS development organisations in PNG?

Questions about people emotional understanding of place

I’m really interested in the emotions and feeling that you got being and expat and working on these kinds of issues so I’d like to finish up asking you some questions about that.

How did you feel living in PNG? What was it like?

Did you feel different in the place or in society than you do in Australia? How? (Did you feel that this feeling of difference changed over time?)

Is it a comfortable experience for you living and working in PNG?

What about day-to-day things, did you ever feel like a fish out of water? Did you get a sense of disconnection from the place ever? (how often did you feel that)?

Was it ever scary or anything? Did you ever feel segregated in you day-to-day living while in PNG? (How often did you feel that)? How often would you feel like that in Australia.

Do you think that the emotions you felt in PNG affected your work in any way?

Do you think any feelings of discomfort and segregation affected your work in any way? Were there any other emotions you particularly felt that influence how you worked? Did you have any strategies for dealing with discomfort or ways of thinking about your place there that helped you grapple with it? Positive emotions

Where there any key emotional triggers that you feel shaped how you experienced living and working in PNG? If so can you tell me about them and what were your emotional responses to them?
Do you think that your emotional responses to your environment influenced how you went about your work practices?

What were some of the places and things you tended to do to relax and unwind while over in PNG? How often would you tend to go to these places / do these things? Why do you think you chose these places to relax and unwind? Would you describe some of the feelings you tend to felt in these places?

What do you think of Hotels in PNG? Did you ever utilise them? What did you go there for?

How much do you think the polices, frameworks and programs of HIV and AIDS development work empathised with how Papua New Guineans feel about the of HIV and AIDS situation?

How much do you think the polices, frameworks and programs that you worked on empathised with your clients perspectives of HIV and AIDS situation?

How hard was it for you to empathise with your clients’ perspectives of HIV and AIDS?

Where there times when you couldn’t empathise with your clients’ perspectives of HIV and AIDS? How often did that happen? How did you feel in these situations?

When people resited the advice on HIV and AIDS that your organisation (you) gave them how did that make you feel?

How hard was it for you to empathise with your national work colleagues’ perspectives on issues of HIV and AIDS?

Where there times when you couldn’t empathise with their perspectives of HIV and AIDS? How often did that happen? How did you feel in these situations? Were you able to say anything about it?

How much do you think that this disconnection was a result of the situation of working in PNG and how much do you feel that it was the sort of problem that you would find in any work environment?

Why did you choose a job that would make you work on HIV and AIDS issues in PNG?
How has your understanding of the HIV and AIDS situation in PNG changes since going to PNG? What do you think were the key factors in changing your understanding of the HIV and AIDS situation in PNG?

Would you discuss and share your understanding of the situation of HIV and AIDS in PNG with anyone while you were over there? Who and in what situations would you generally share your understandings? Did you find that these discussions had a particular emotional charge to them?

Many of the programs used by development agencies were not developed for the PNG circumstances but other situations like those found in Africa and then transplanted here. Do you think that there could be any aspects of these programs that might be culturally insensitive or racist to Papua New Guinean people?

How did you feel going through this interview process? Where there any questions that made you feel uncomfortable? Which ones were they?
References


HAMMAR, L. (2008)


IBRAHIM, LORRAINE, SHY, & FARR (1999)


KOCZBERSKI & CURRY (2005)


Research, Northern Thailand. Asia Pacific Viewpoint, 49, 281-293.


TULIP, R. (2005) 'Historical Perspectives on Australian Aid to Papua New Guinea'. Paper presented at PNG Canberra Students’ Association Conference: ‘30 years of independence’ Canberra Australian National University, AusAID.


