What does Tourism Mean to Residents? An Investigation of Madura Island, Indonesia

Dian Yulie Reindrawati
BSocSc, MM

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
The University of Newcastle
August 2013
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University’s Digital Repository**, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

**Unless an Embargo has been approved for a determined period.

Dian Yulie Reindrawati: _____________________________
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks to Allah Almighty for all His endless blessings.

The completion of this thesis was only possible because I had the support and assistance of many individuals.

First and foremost, I would like to express my sincerest appreciation to my supervisors: Associate Professor Dr. Kevin Lyons and Dr. Tamara Young for the valuable feedback and constructive criticism on my work. The support you have both given me has been exceptional. I wish to extend my sincere appreciation to Dr. Patricia Johnson for insightful comments, and to Prof. Dr. Kevin Markwell for bringing me to Newcastle for my PhD journey. Thankfulness is also expressed to Prof. Dr. Alison Dean, Dr. Patricia Stanton, Associate Professor Dr. Suzanne Ryan and Michael Romeo for their constant support. I also wish to thank Dr. Deborah Meyer and Sharlene Leroy-Dyer to whom I am deeply grateful for their friendship and encouragement. Also, special thanks to Kim Edmunds for all her thoroughness, invaluable comments and never-ending encouragement.

My deepest appreciation is also extended to Papa and Mama for their endless support and prayers. I love you with all my heart. To Pakdhe and Budhe Bambang, thank you for always being there for me and my family. I love you both. I also owe special thanks to the family of Donowati and Ngagel for their wonderful support. Thanks also go to David Ionsdale, for his sincere assistance. To my fellow postgraduate students in the Business and Law Faculty, especially in SRS 238, for all the beautiful friendships which made my journey more enjoyable.

I convey my gratitude to Dikti (Indonesian Higher Degree) and the University of Newcastle for the scholarships provided to fund the pursuit of this research degree. I am also in debt to my home university, Airlangga University in Surabaya, Indonesia, for their generosity in approving and supporting my candidature. Last but not least, I am eternally grateful to the participants of this study, whose names I cannot mention. Without their contribution, this thesis would never have come into existence. Thank you!

I dedicate this thesis to my three wonderful heroes: (Daddy) Satrio, Tio and Pasha

‘This PhD is also yours; I could never have made it without your love and support.’
TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY .............................................................. ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................................................ iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................................ iv
LIST OF APPENDICES .......................................................................... vii
LIST OF FIGURES ................................................................................ vii
LIST OF TABLES ................................................................................... viii
LIST OF PLATES .................................................................................... viii
GLOSSARY AND ABBREVIATIONS ......................................................... ix
ABSTRACT ............................................................................................... xi
PRELUDE ................................................................................................ xii

CHAPTER 1
RESIDENT PERCEPTIONS OF TOURISM:
AN EMERGING ISSUE ON MADURA ISLAND ........................................ 1
1.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 1
1.2 The Madura Island Context ............................................................... 1
1.3 Tourism in Developing Countries ....................................................... 9
1.4 Institutional Arrangements in Indonesia ............................................ 12
  1.4.1 Implications for Tourism Planning ............................................. 15
1.5 Research Aim, Significance and Approach ....................................... 19
1.6 Structure of the Thesis ..................................................................... 21

CHAPTER 2
TOURISM PLANNING: THE SUSTAINABILITY IMPERATIVE .................... 23
2.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 23
2.2 Tourism Planning Processes ............................................................. 24
2.3 Tourism Planning in Developing Countries ....................................... 30
2.4 Community Participation in Tourism ................................................. 33
  2.4.1 Forms of Participation in the Tourism Planning Process ............. 38
  2.4.2 Limitations of Community Participation in Tourism Planning in Developing Countries ................................................. 40
2.5 Power in Tourism Planning ............................................................... 45
2.6 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 49

CHAPTER 3
RESIDENT PERCEPTIONS OF TOURISM: THE EVOLUTION OF KEY
CONCEPTS AND THEORIES .................................................................. 51
3.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 51
3.2 The Evolution of Thought in Tourism Research: Implications for Resident Perceptions .................................................. 52
  3.2.1 The Advocacy Platform........................................................... 52
  3.2.2 The Cautionary Platform ........................................................ 53
  3.2.3 The Adaptancy Platform .......................................................... 55
  3.2.4 The Knowledge-based Platform .............................................. 57
CHAPTER 4
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 86
4.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 86
4.2 Paradigmatic Framework and Research Design ................................. 86
  4.2.1 Qualitative Descriptive Method ................................................. 89
  4.2.2 Exploratory Research Method ................................................. 90
  4.2.3 The Use of Qualitative Methodology in Tourism ...................... 94
4.3 Data Collection Process ................................................................. 95
  4.3.1 Research Sites ....................................................................... 96
  4.3.2 Study Participants .................................................................. 97
  4.3.3 Data Collection Methods ....................................................... 101
4.4 Validity and Reliability ................................................................ 103
4.5 Data Analysis ................................................................................ 103
4.6 Researcher Bias .......................................................................... 106
4.7 Conclusion ................................................................................... 108

CHAPTER 5
TOURISM PLANNING IMPLEMENTATION ON MADURA ISLAND:
A DESCRIPTION .................................................................................. 110
5.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 110
5.2. Tourism Planning Implementation Priorities ................................. 111
  5.2.1 Attracting Visitors .................................................................. 111
  5.2.2 Managing Tourist Attractions ............................................... 116
  5.2.3 Promoting Benefits of Tourism to Residents .......................... 118
5.3 Tourism Planning Implementation Challenges ................................. 121
  5.3.1 Overlapping of Authorities..................................................... 121
  5.3.2 Funding Issues ..................................................................... 125
  5.3.3 Top-down Planning ............................................................... 126
  5.3.4 Resident Resistance to Tourism ............................................. 130
5.4 Responses to Challenges ................................................................ 136
  5.4.1 Reducing Political and Bureaucratic Issues ............................ 136
  5.4.2 Minimising Resident Resistance to Tourism ........................... 139
5.5 Conclusion ................................................................................... 148
CHAPTER 6
THE MEANINGS RESIDENTS ASSIGNED TO TOURISM................................. 152
6.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 152
6.2 The Meanings of Tourism in Bangkalan Region ................................. 153
   6.2.1 Business Opportunities: Gain and Loss ....................................... 154
   6.2.2 Threat to Cultural and Religious Values ........................................ 161
   6.2.3 Low Involvement of Local Residents in Tourism Planning ............... 164
6.3 The Meanings of Tourism in the Sampang Region .............................. 168
   6.3.1 Business Opportunities ............................................................. 168
   6.3.2 Threat to Cultural and Religious Values ........................................ 173
   6.3.3 Low Involvement of Local Residents in Tourism Planning ............... 177
6.4 The Meanings of Tourism in the Pamekasan Region ............................ 180
   6.4.1 Business Opportunities ............................................................. 180
   6.4.2 Threat to Cultural and Religious Values ........................................ 182
6.5 The Meanings of Tourism in the Sumenep Region .............................. 188
6.6 Discussion of the Meanings Residents Assigned to Tourism ............... 194
6.7 Conclusion ..................................................................................... 198

CHAPTER 7
THE INFLUENCES THAT SHAPE THE MEANINGS OF TOURISM................. 201
7.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 201
7.2 The Influence of Guru (Kyai) .......................................................... 201
7.3 The Influence of Mother ................................................................. 203
7.4 The Influence of Government .......................................................... 204
7.5 The Influence of the Tourism Industry ............................................. 206
7.6 Comparing ‘Influences’ and the Philosophy of Buppa ‘Babhu ’Guru Rato in
   Madura Island..................................................................................... 208
7.7 Synthesising the Influences that Shape the Meanings of Tourism ........... 212
7.8 Conclusion ..................................................................................... 215

CHAPTER 8
CONCLUSION: FROM DIVERSE MEANINGS TO SHARED PASSIVE
PARTICIPATION IN TOURISM PLANNING............................................. 217
8.1 Summary ...................................................................................... 217
8.2 Passive Participation in Tourism Planning ......................................... 218
8.3 Theoretical and Practical Contributions ............................................ 230
8.4 Limitations of this Study ................................................................. 236
8.5 Future Research ............................................................................ 237

REFERENCES .................................................................................... 239
APPENDICES ..................................................................................... 266
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A. Profile of Participants ................................................................. 266
Appendix B. In-depth Interviews Checklist (For Residents) ................................. 269
Appendix C. In-depth Interviews Checklist (For Local Tourism Officers) ............... 270

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 Map of Indonesia .............................................................................. 2
Figure 1.2 Map of East Java and Madura Island ................................................... 2
Figure 1.3 Map of Madura Island ....................................................................... 3
Figure 1.4 The ‘Ladder of Respect’ in Madurese Philosophy ................................. 5
Figure 1.5 The Organisational Structure of the Indonesian Government .................. 14
Figure 1.6 The Structure of Master Tourism Plan of Indonesia ............................. 15
Figure 2.1 A Normative Model of Participatory Tourism Planning ....................... 35
Figure 7.1 The Influences that Shape the Meanings of Tourism ............................ 209
Figure 8.1 The Implication of the Meanings of Tourism: Minimal Participation of Residents in Tourism Planning ................................................................. 219
Figure 8.2 Community Participation in Tourism Planning: the Ideal and the Reality Context .. 231
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 Sites and Experiences identified as Tourist Attractions in the Regional Plans ..........16
Table 1.2 The Authority of the Central Government and the Local Governments in relation to Tourism ..................................................................................................................................................18
Table 4.1 Theoretical Construction of the Research .........................................................................................87
Table 4.2 The Research Sites ..............................................................................................................................97
Table 4.3 The Number of Participants Interviewed .............................................................................................101
Table 4.4 The Key Themes of the Interviews ........................................................................................................102
Table 4.5 Summary of Research Design ...........................................................................................................109
Table 5.1 Summary of Tourism Planning Implementation on Madura Island .......................149
Table 6.1 Meanings Assigned to Tourism by Residents in the Four Regions of Madura Island195

LIST OF PLATE

Plate 1.1 Suramadu Bridge .................................................................................................................................6
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Glossary/Abbreviations</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adhirasa</td>
<td>The name of Madurese leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APBD</td>
<td>Regional budget (Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Batik</td>
<td>A cloth that is traditionally made using a manual wax and dye technique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAPPEDA</td>
<td>Regional development planning board/Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPD</td>
<td>The Village Discussion Board (Badan Permusyawaratan Desa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPWS</td>
<td>The board of the Suramadu Bridge development (Badan Pengembangan Wilayah Suramadu)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bupati</td>
<td>Head of Kabupaten (Region/Regency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buppa’ Babbu’ Guru Rato</td>
<td>The traditional philosophy that respects father, mother, guru and government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camat</td>
<td>Head of Kecamatan (Sub District)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desa</td>
<td>Village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dinas</td>
<td>A specific technical local agency/board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disporabudpar</td>
<td>Youth, Sport and Culture Board (Dinas Pemuda, Olahraga, Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disbudparpor</td>
<td>Culture, Tourism, Youth and Sport Board (Dinas Budaya Pariwisata dan Olahraga)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disperindag</td>
<td>The Industry and Trading Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dusun</td>
<td>Rural hamlet (A village consists of several Dusun)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPN</td>
<td>National Tourism Destination (Destinasi Pariwisata Nasional)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPRD</td>
<td>Local Representative Board at the provincial or regional level (Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerbang Salam</td>
<td>The Development Movement of Islamic Society/Gerakan Pembangunan Masyarakat Islam (a Motto of Pamekasan Region)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hadrah</td>
<td>A traditional music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honorer Teacher</td>
<td>Temporary teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDR</td>
<td>Indonesian Rupiah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamu</td>
<td>Traditional medicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kabupaten</td>
<td>Region/Regency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kas Desa</td>
<td>The village treasurer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kacong-Jebbing</td>
<td>Tourism ambassador promoting the regions of Madura</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kampung</td>
<td>The same meaning as Dusun (Rural Hamlet)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kecamatan</td>
<td>Sub District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelurahan</td>
<td>The lowest tier in Indonesia’s administrative structure (The same level as Desa/Village)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kepala Desa</td>
<td>Head of Village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keris</td>
<td>Traditional weapon (a dagger)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirab</td>
<td>Traditional walks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KK</td>
<td>Head of household/family (Kepala Keluarga)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koran</td>
<td>The sacred book of Islam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kota/Kotamadya</td>
<td>Municipality (The same level as Kabupaten/Region/Regency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPPN</td>
<td>The National Tourism Development Areas (Kawasan Pengembangan Pariwisata Nasional)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyai</td>
<td>Guru/Religious leader/Teacher/Respected person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>Province (Propinsi) and Region (Kabupaten/Kotamadya)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lok-alok</td>
<td>A kind of traditional music performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lurah</td>
<td>Head of Kelurahan (Village)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Macan Cave : Tiger Cave
Madurese Residents : Madura Island Residents
Musholla : Small Mosque
MTF : Majapahit Travel Fair. An East Java tourism promotional fair designed to bring buyers/investors and sellers together
Nyai : Wife of kyai or a name for Women Muslim Gurus
Pecaton : Land in lieu of salary
Perpres : Presidential Decree (Peraturan Presiden)
PK 5 : Sellers in Temporary Stalls (Pedagang Kaki Lima)
PKK : Empowerment Family Welfare (Pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga)
Pembinaan : Training
Pengajian : An activity of reading the Koran
Pesantren : Islamic boarding school
Petik Laut : A traditional ceremony to thank God for good fortune and ask for safety, mostly carried out by fishermen
Pokdarwis : Tourism Awareness Groups (Kelompok Sadar Wisata)
Produk Unggulan : Quality or leading products
RIPPARNAS : National Tourism Plan (Rencana Induk Pengembangan Pariwisata Nasional)
RIPP : Provincial Tourism Plan (Rencana Induk Pengembangan Pariwisata Tingkat Propinsi)
RIPPDA : Regional Tourism Plan (Rencana Induk Pengembangan Pariwisata Daerah)
Rokat Tase’ : A traditional ceremony carried out by fishermen to ask God for abundant supplies of fish
Rokat Sabeh : A traditional ceremony conducted after harvest
Rukun-Tetangga/RT : Neighbourhood solidarity unit
Rukun-Warga/RW : Community solidarity unit
Santri : Student of pesantren
Satpol PP : Security officer (Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja)
Silatuhrrahi : Muslim fraternity
Sub DTW : A sub area of DTW (Tourist Destination Area/Daerah Tujuan Wisata)
Taman Rekreasi Kota/TRK : The name of a park in Bangkalan
Vihara : A place for Buddhists to pray
Walikotamadya : Head of Kotamadya (Municipality)
Warung : Small store
Wudhu : The activity of cleaning parts of the body before praying
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to critically explore the meanings of tourism held by residents in the context of tourism planning in Madura Island, Indonesia. The thesis reviews and critiques the literature on tourism planning and resident perception studies, particularly as they have been applied in developing countries. This review recognises that much of this literature overlooks the complex processes that shape the meanings that residents assign to tourism and that ultimately reinforce power inequities among residents. This thesis employs symbolic interactionism as an empirical framework in order to focus specifically on how these complex meanings interact with the social, political and cultural landscapes to reinforce patterns of engagement and disengagement among residents in the tourism planning processes in developing countries. To achieve this aim, a qualitative research design was employed in the study of Madura Island. In-depth interviews were conducted with residents and local tourism officers. Review of tourism planning and policy materials at national, regional and local levels were also undertaken to contextualise the data drawn from the interviews. Thematic analysis of the data revealed that the meanings residents assigned to tourism could be broadly categorised as ‘business opportunities gained and lost’, ‘a source of disempowerment’, ‘a threat to culture’ and ‘an opportunity to share religious and cultural values’. However, a more critical analysis explores the extent to which these meanings of tourism were underpinned by the hegemony of a central political and cultural philosophy: Buppa’ Babbu’ Guru Rato (father, mother, guru and government) which has been claimed to influence life on Madura Island. The findings of this study challenges the relevance of the structure and order of this philosophy and concludes by considering the implications of this for participatory planning on Madura Island and developing countries more broadly.
On the 10th of June 2009, the Surabaya-Madura Bridge, also known as the Suramadu Bridge, was officially opened. The 5.4 kilometre bridge constructed over the Madura Strait of Indonesia connects Bangkalan on the island of Madura, which is situated off the northeastern coast of Java, to the Javanese Mainland. Madura Island comprises an area of approximately 5,422 square kilometres, with a population of 3,570 million. The majority of the Madurese population are devout Sunni Muslims. Madura Island is administratively part of the East Java Province, and is divided into four regencies, or regions, Bangkalan, Sampang, Pamekasan, and Sumenep.

Prior to the opening of the Suramadu Bridge, the geographic location of Madura Island meant that the island was isolated from the Indonesian mainland, with a ferry being the main method of transportation to or from the island. The opening of the bridge – the longest in South East Asia and proudly regarded by the Indonesian Government as an Indonesian mega infrastructure project – has enabled and vastly improved the flow of transportation to and from Madura Island.

As a result, tourism, particularly domestic tourism by Indonesian locals, has started to emerge and grow on the island. Indeed, one important government aim was to link East Java to Madura Island for the purpose of boosting the regional economy, including the development of tourism on the island. Since the opening of the bridge, the government has encouraged and implemented many tourism plans and visitors from all over Indonesia now come to the island.

Madurese people have long been characterised by Indonesians from elsewhere as being rough, rude, extroverted, temperamental, impolite, and crude, and this has resulted in the perception of them as frightening or ‘to be avoided’ (Jonge 1995). Coupled with the knowledge that poverty and chronic unemployment are significant issues for residents of Madura Island, I was originally compelled to discover the reasons why people from elsewhere would visit the island. However, what emerged in the early stages of my research was that while the government is busy implementing tourism plans, they seem to have forgotten a very important aspect of tourism development, that is, what tourism means to the Madurese residents living on the island. How do people who live in a location that has never operated as a tourism destination feel about tourism, about tourists, and about their involvement (or lack of involvement) in tourism planning and development processes? These questions emerged with the recent opening of the Suramadu Bridge, stimulating my interest in the multifaceted nature of tourism development and the articulation of meanings attached to tourism by residents of Madura Island.