The application of syndromic surveillance to public health practice

Beverley Joyce Paterson
(BArts, GradDipHealthProm, MKnowledgeMgt, MAppEpi)

Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
(Community Medicine and Clinical Epidemiology)

Submitted May, 2013

School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY
The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University’s Digital Repository**, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.
**Unless an Embargo has been approved for a determined period.

STATEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP
I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis contains a published paper/s/scholarly work of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of the thesis a written statement, endorsed by my supervisor, attesting to my contribution to the joint publication/s/scholarly work.

THESIS BY PUBLICATION
I hereby certify that this thesis is in the form of a series of published papers of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of the thesis a written statement from each co-author, endorsed by the Faculty Assistant Dean (Research Training), attesting to my contribution to the joint publications.

Beverley J Paterson Date
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

What an enjoyable and interesting journey this thesis has been. None of it would have been possible without my primary supervisor, Professor David Durrheim, who offered wisdom and calm advice – what an extraordinarily committed and knowledgeable person to have as a mentor. To Professor Cate D’Este who kept me on track over coffees at Estobar, many thanks for your insightful input.

To the Health Protection team at Hunter New England Health – what a professional and informed group of people you are to work with. A special thanks to Keith Eastwood and Tony Merritt for your great comments and advice.

To all those who were involved with my various research projects – many thanks for your contributions – it has been an amazing experience to work with you.

This research would not have been possible without the financial support of the Hunter Medical Research Institute, University of Newcastle, who allowed me the opportunity to undertake this PhD during my employment as a Research Fellow.

To Chris and Frances, big hugs – I think I’m finally there!
ABSTRACT

This Thesis by Publication is a series of eleven scientific papers and letters published in peer reviewed, professional journals which explore how syndromic surveillance has been applied to public health practice. At the time of submission, ten papers have been published in peer reviewed journals and one has been accepted for publication.

Chapter One, ‘Overview’, introduces the topic of syndromic surveillance. The separate papers are placed within the context of what is known about syndromic surveillance and public health.

Chapter Two, ‘Literature Review’, is a peer reviewed article ‘The remarkable adaptability of syndromic surveillance to meet public health needs’ that examines the literature to determine how syndromic surveillance has been used as a tool in public health practice and how it has been adapted by practitioners over time to meet changing public health information needs. This scientific publication was published in the Journal of Epidemiology and Global Health.

Chapter Three, ‘Gathering the evidence: syndromic data utilisation’, includes four published papers and scientific letters that demonstrate how syndromic data sources can inform public health responses or provide additional information to help characterise a particular disease. The peer reviewed article ‘Historical data and modern methods reveal insights in measles epidemiology: a retrospective closed cohort study’ was published in the journal BMJ Open. The scientific letter ‘Influenza: H1N1 goes to school’ was published in the journal Science. The scientific letter ‘Use of workplace absenteeism surveillance data for outbreak detection’ was published in the journal Emerging Infectious Diseases. The peer reviewed article ‘Changes in the severity of 2009 pandemic A/H1N1 influenza in England: a Bayesian evidence synthesis’ was published in the British Medical Journal.

Chapter Four, ‘Implementing and evaluating the evidence: syndromic surveillance in practice’, is a series of three published papers and scientific letters that establish the value and effectiveness of developing a syndromic surveillance system for a specific purpose. The peer reviewed article ‘Pacific-wide simplified syndromic surveillance for early warning of outbreaks’ was published in the journal Global Public Health. The peer reviewed article ‘Sustaining surveillance: evaluating syndromic surveillance in the Pacific’ was published in Global Public Health. The scientific letter ‘Pandemic response in low-resource settings..."
requires effective syndromic surveillance’ was published in the journal Influenza and other respiratory viruses.

Chapter Five, ‘Presenting the evidence: changing public health policy’, includes two published papers and one published scientific letter which illustrate how syndromic surveillance can be used to inform public health policy. The peer reviewed article ‘A review of the epidemiology and surveillance of viral zoonotic encephalitis and the impact on human health in Australia’ has been published in the journal New South Wales Public Health Bulletin. The peer reviewed article ‘Review of Australia’s polio surveillance’ has been accepted for publication in the journal Communicable Disease Intelligence. The scientific letter, ‘Guillain-Barré Syndrome’ has been published in the New England Journal of Medicine.

The final chapter, ‘Discussion and Conclusions’, summarises the overall findings from the thesis, discusses public health outcomes resulting from the thesis, identifies gaps in the literature and limitations of the research, and discusses further areas for research.

As demonstrated throughout the thesis, syndromic surveillance is a broad term covering multiple divergent approaches to surveillance. This flexibility appears to be its strength, making it useful to address a range of public health needs.
LIST OF CITATIONS FOR PAPERS INCLUDED IN THIS THESIS


10. **Paterson BJ**, Durrheim DN. Review of Australia’s polio surveillance. *Communicable Disease Intelligence* (accepted for publication)

STATEMENT OF CONTRIBUTION


   I was the primary author on this scientific publication. I developed the concept, completed the literature review, undertook the analysis using NVivo, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication. I completed these activities in collaboration with DN. Durrheim.


   I was the primary author on this scientific publication. I developed the concept, designed the study, undertook the data collection in Canberra, Sydney and Adelaide, undertook the analysis and modelled the data, undertook the literature review, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication. These activities were undertaken in collaboration with Kirk MD, Cameron AS, D’Este C and Durrheim DN.


   I was the primary author on this scientific publication. In collaboration with Durrheim DN and Tuyl F, I developed the concept, undertook the data collection, completed the secondary analysis and modelled the data, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication.


   I was the primary author on this scientific publication. I developed the concept, undertook the data analysis, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication. These activities were undertaken in collaboration with Caddis R and Durrheim D.

I was the third author on this scientific publication. In collaboration with Presanis AM, Pebody RG, Tom BD, Birrell PJ, Charlett A, Lipsitch M and De Angelis D, I was involved in the data collection, interpretation of the data, contributed to model development and the preparation and revision of the manuscript.


I was the second author on this scientific publication. In collaboration with Kool JL, Pavlin BI, Durrheim D, Musto J and Kolbe A, I was involved in development of the concept, data collection and analysis, and prepared and revised the manuscript.


I was the primary author on this scientific publication. I designed the evaluation, prepared the interview guides, undertook the data collection (both in-country and through other methods) transcribed the interviews, undertook the data analysis, wrote and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication. These activities were undertaken in collaboration with Kool JL, Durrheim DN and Pavlin B.


I was the primary author on this scientific publication. I developed the concept, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication. I undertook these in collaboration with Durrheim DN and Hardie K.

I was the primary author on this scientific publication. In collaboration with Mackenzie JS, Durrheim DN and Smith D, I developed the concept, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication.

10. Paterson BJ, Durrheim DN. Review of Australia’s polio surveillance. *Communicable Disease Intelligence* (accepted for publication)

I was the primary author on this scientific publication. I developed the concept, designed the study, prepared the interview guides, undertook the interviews (both face-to-face and telephone), completed the data analysis, presented the data to the *National Certification Committee for the eradication of polio* for validation, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication. I undertook this in collaboration with Durrheim DN.


I was the primary author on this scientific publication. In collaboration with Durrheim DN, I developed the concept, prepared and revised the manuscript, and submitted the manuscript for publication.
STATEMENTS OF CONTRIBUTION OF OTHERS

Following are the statements of all the co-researchers and co-authors in the publications included in this thesis.

**Co-authors:**

- Birrell, Paul
- Caddis, Richard
- Cameron, A. Scott
- Charlett, Andre
- De Angelis, Daniela
- D'Este, Cate
- Durrheim, David
- Hardie, Kate
- Kirk, Martyn
- Kolbe, Anthony
- Kool, Jacob
- Lipsitch, Marc
- Mackenzie, John
- Musto, Jennie
- Pavlin, Boris
- Pebody, Richard
- Presanis, Anne
- Smith, David
- Tom, Brian
- Tuyl, Frank
Statement of Contribution

I, Paul Birrell, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially — in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript — to the publication:


Paul Birrell (Co-Author) Date: 8/2/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Richard Caddis, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publications:


Richard Caddis (Co-Author)  Date: 6 March 2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate)  Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training)  Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Scott Cameron, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Scott Cameron (Co-Author) Date: 6/3/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Andre Charlett, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially—in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript—to the publication:


Andre Charlett (Co-Author)  Date: 4/2/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate)  Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training)  Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Daniela De Angelis, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Daniela De Angelis (Co-Author)          Date: 5/3/2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate)          Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training)      Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Cate D’este, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Cate D’Este (Co-Author)  Date:  5th March 2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate)  Date:  

Assistant Dean (Research Training)  Date:  

Page 16
Statement of Contribution

I, David Durrheim, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publications:


Paterson BJ, Durrheim DN. Polio surveillance review. Communicable Disease Intelligence (accepted for publication)

David Durrheim (Co-Author)  Date: 2 May 2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate)  Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training)  Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Kate Hardie, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


[Signature]
Kate Hardie (Co-Author)  Date: 04/13/18

[Signature]
Beverley Paterson (Candidate)  Date:

[Signature]
Assistant Dean (Research Training)  Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Martyn Kirk, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially—in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript—to the publication:


\[Signature\]

Martyn Kirk (Co-Author) Date: 5/3/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Anthony Kolbe, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially— in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript— to the publication:


Anthony Kolbe (Co-Author) Date: 4/2/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Jacob Kool, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publications:


and


Jacob Kool (Co-Author)  Date: 1/2/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate)  Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training)  Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Mark Lipsitch, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Mark Lipsitch (Co-Author) Date: 2/4/2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, John Mackenzie, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept, preparation, writing and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


[Signature]

John Mackenzie (Co-Author) Date: 5/02/2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Jennie Musto, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Jennie Musto (Co-Author) Date: 4/11/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Boris Pavlin, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publications:


and


Boris Pavlin (Co-Author) Date: 4-2-2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Richard Pebody, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Richard Pebody (Co-Author) Date: 08/03/2013

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Anne Presanis, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially - in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript - to the publication:


Anne Presanis (Co-Author) Date: 4th February 2013
Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:
Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, David Smith, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept, preparation, writing and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


David Smith (Co-Author) Date: 5/2/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date: 

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Brian Tom, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of data collection, contribution to model development and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Brian Tom (Co-Author) [Signature] Date: 06/02/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
Statement of Contribution

I, Frank Tuyi, attest that Research Higher Degree candidate Beverley Paterson contributed substantially – in terms of study concept and design, data collection and analysis, preparation and revision of the manuscript – to the publication:


Frank Tuyi (Co-Author) Date: 1/2/13

Beverley Paterson (Candidate) Date:

Assistant Dean (Research Training) Date:
# Table of Contents

Statement of originality ................................................................. 2
Statement of authorship .................................................................. 2
Thesis by publication ..................................................................... 2
Acknowledgements ....................................................................... 3
Abstract ....................................................................................... 4
List of citations for papers included in this thesis ......................... 6
Statement of contribution ............................................................ 7
Statements of contribution of others ............................................. 10
Table of contents ......................................................................... 31
Glossary of terms and abbreviations ............................................ 33

Chapter One: Overview .............................................................. 36
  Defining syndromic surveillance .................................................. 37
  Syndromic data .......................................................................... 38
  Syndromic surveillance and infectious disease threats ............... 39
  Evaluating syndromic surveillance systems ............................... 40
  Syndromic surveillance and public health ................................... 41

Chapter Two: Literature Review .................................................. 42

Chapter Three: Gathering the evidence: syndromic surveillance data utilisation ......................................................... 42

Chapter Four: Implementing and evaluating the evidence: syndromic surveillance in practice ............................................. 43

Chapter Five: Presenting the evidence: changing public health policy ................................................................. 44

Chapter Six: Discussion and conclusions ..................................... 45

References .................................................................................. 45

Chapter Two: Literature review .................................................. 56
  Paper One: The remarkable adaptability of syndromic surveillance to meet public health needs ............................................. 60

Chapter Three: Gathering the evidence: syndromic surveillance data utilisation ................................................................. 68
  Paper Two: Historical data and modern methods reveal insights in measles epidemiology: a retrospective closed cohort study .................................................. 73

Chapter Three: Gathering the evidence: syndromic surveillance data utilisation ................................................................. 83
  Paper Three: Influenza: H1N1 goes to school ............................... 83

Chapter Three: Gathering the evidence: syndromic surveillance data utilisation ................................................................. 85
  Paper Four: Use of workplace absenteeism surveillance data for outbreak detection .................................................. 85

Chapter Four: Implementing and evaluating the evidence: syndromic surveillance in practice .................................................. 88

Chapter Four: Implementing and evaluating the evidence: syndromic surveillance in practice .................................................. 103
  Paper Six: Pacific-wide simplified syndromic surveillance for early warning of outbreaks .............................................. 107
GLOSSARY OF TERMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ABLV  Australian Bat Lyssavirus
AHPC  Australian Health Protection Committee
AFP   Acute Flaccid Paralysis
APSU  Australian Paediatric Surveillance Unit
AQIS  Australian Quarantine and Inspection Service
Bayesian A method of statistical inference that begins with the state of knowledge, i.e., the facts, prior to an exposure or an intervention, and augments this with study data to yield the state of knowledge posterior to the study [1]
Case Fatality Rate The number of deaths due to a specific disease as compared with the total number of cases of the disease [2]
CDNA  Communicable Disease Network of Australia
DAFF  Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry
DoHA  Department of Health and Ageing
ERLNA Enterovirus Reference Laboratory Network of Australia
GBS   Guillain–Barré Syndrome
HeV   Hendra virus
IHR   International Health Regulations
ILI   Influenza-like-illness
IPV   Inactivated Poliomyelitis Vaccine
JEV   Japanese encephalitis virus
LDC   Least developed countries
MVEV  Murray Valley encephalitis virus
NCC   National Certification Committee
NERL  National Enterovirus Reference Laboratory
NPRL  National Polio Reference Laboratory
NOCS  Queensland Notifiable Conditions System
Outbreak An epidemic limited to localized increase in the incidence of disease [1]
PAEDS Paediatric Active Enhanced Disease Surveillance
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pandemic</td>
<td>An epidemic occurring worldwide, or over a very wide area, crossing international boundaries, and usually affecting a large number of people [1]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEP</td>
<td>Polio Expert Panel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PICTs</td>
<td>Pacific Island Countries and Territories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public health</td>
<td>Health of the whole population or community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPV</td>
<td>Oral Poliomyelitis Vaccine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R$</td>
<td>Effective reproduction number – average number of secondary infectious persons resulting from one infectious person in a given population in which some individuals may already be immune because of infection or vaccination [3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R_0$</td>
<td>Basic reproduction number – the average number of secondary infectious persons resulting from one infectious person following their introduction into a totally susceptible population [3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SARS</td>
<td>Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>The proportion of cases of a disease detected by the surveillance system or the ability of the system to detect outbreaks, including the ability to monitor changes in the number of cases over time [2]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitivity analysis</td>
<td>A method to determine the robustness of an assessment by examining the extent to which results are affected by changes in methods, values of variable, or assumptions [1]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serial interval</td>
<td>Time interval between successive infections in a chain of transmission [3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPC</td>
<td>Secretariat of the Pacific Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSBA</td>
<td>Security Sensitive Biological Agents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveillance</td>
<td>The ongoing, systematic collection, collation, analysis of data and the timely dissemination of those who need to know so that action can be taken [1]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syndrome</td>
<td>A symptom complex in which the symptoms and/or signs coexist more frequently than would be expected by chance [1]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Syndromic surveillance  Surveillance system using a case definition based on symptoms or indicators, not requiring laboratory confirmation, which provides data for public health purposes

TGA  Therapeutic Goods Administration

Timeliness  Reflects the speed between the steps in a public health surveillance system [4]

Triangulation  The use of a variety of data in a study to validate the findings [5]

VAPP  Vaccine-Associated Paralytic Poliomyelitis

VIDRL  Victorian Infectious Diseases Reference Laboratory

WNV  West Nile virus

WHA  World Health Assembly

WHO  World Health Organization

References


