An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin
BSc (Hons) Engineering, Master of Engineering

The University of Newcastle, Australia

March, 2013
Statement of Originality

The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University’s Digital Repository, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Signed……… …………………Date: 25/03/2013
Acknowledgements

I am indebted to my parents, my first teachers, who contributed to shaping my personality as that of an inquisitive learner. My parents have always encouraged me to traverse the path of higher education, and to contribute to the body of knowledge in the field of my interest. I sincerely appreciate their deliberate concern to represent themselves as role models guiding my personal, academic, and professional lives.

This study would not have been possible without the support of the school teachers from Bangladesh who voluntarily participated in this study. I also thank the officials from the Directorate of Primary Education, Bangladesh for allowing me to conduct this research study, and the local education authorities for helping me select the school sites and make initial contacts with the head teachers.

I am also indebted to my academic supervisors at the University of Newcastle - Professor Terry Lovat and Dr. Kerry Dally. They have provided me continuous support and invaluable feedback from the very early stages of proposal development and preparation of the ethics application, through to the development of research instruments, data analysis and data reporting. Dr. Dally has dedicated her precious time to check the draft chapters, to pinpoint the areas requiring further improvement, and to provide insightful suggestions and recommendations. Not only have I learned the crafts of PhD research from my supervisors, I have seen myself grow as an educational researcher under the careful supervision of Professor Lovat and Dr. Dally.

I sincerely thank the academics at the School of Education, University of Newcastle, who taught me the pros and cons of educational research, and who contributed as my informal mentors at various stages of my PhD candidature. Intimate relationships with the academic and administrative staff as well as the fellow research higher degree students at the School of Education have helped me feel at home during my stay in Newcastle.

Finally, I express my heartfelt gratitude to my husband, Mohammad Mamunur Rashid, for sharing all my mental pressure and anxieties in relation to conducting the PhD study. He has always taken care of ensuring a congenial environment for my study. I am also thankful to my family members and friends in Bangladesh for being such an excellent source of continuous encouragement, and my friends in Newcastle for making my social life very memorable.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

1.1.1 Motivation for the Study
1.1.2 Imperatives of Teaching Values in Schools
1.1.3 Values and Values Education
1.1.4 Theories Underpinning Values Education

1.2 Rationale for the Study

1.3 The Context of Education in Bangladesh

1.4 Aim of the Study

1.5 Nature and Significance of the Study

1.6 Organisation of the Thesis

1.7 Summary

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Comparison of Values Education with Related Approaches

2.2.1 Character Education and Moral Education

2.2.1.1 Definition

2.2.1.2 Interplay between Character Education and Moral Education

2.2.1.3 Character Education Programs

2.2.1.4 Moral education across the countries

2.2.2 Citizenship Education

2.2.2.1 Definition

2.2.2.2 Aim of citizenship education and moral education

2.2.2.3 Relationship between character, moral and citizenship education

2.2.2.4 Implementation of citizenship education

2.2.3 Social Emotional Learning (SEL) and Social-Emotional and Character Development (SECD)

2.2.3.1 Close link between Values Education and SECD

2.2.4 Relationship of Values Education to Other Approaches

2.2.4.1 Values clarification model

2.2.4.2 Values analysis model

2.2.4.3 Kohlberg’s moral development model

2.2.4.4 Values Reasoning

2.2.5 Conclusion

2.3 Effectiveness of Values Education Programs

2.4 Philosophies, Principles and Practices of Values Education Programs
2.4.1 Introduction 25
2.4.2 Introduction to the Three Programs 25
2.4.3 Holistic View towards Child, Education, Student Achievement and Student Wellbeing 25
2.4.4 ‘Troika’ and its Relation to Student Wellbeing and Student Achievement 28
2.4.5 Determination of Values and Skills and their Explicit Articulation in School Policies 30
2.4.6 Whole School Approach 31
2.4.7 Explicit Articulation of Values through Meaningful and Challenging Curriculum 33
2.4.8 Implicit Modelling of Values by Teachers and Creation of a Safe, Supportive Learning Environment 35
2.4.9 Values-focused Pedagogy 38
2.4.10 Implicit Teaching of Values 42
2.4.11 Embedding Values Education into Teacher Education Programs 43

2.5 Summary 45

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY 46

3.1 Introduction 46

3.2 Qualitative Nature of the Study 46

3.3 Development of the Conceptual Framework for the Study Design 47

3.4 Methodology: Document Analysis and Case Study 50
  3.4.1 Document Analysis 53
    3.4.1.1 Samples 53
  3.4.2 Case Studies of Schools 54
    3.4.2.1 Research Sites 55
    3.4.2.2 Selection and Recruitment of Participants 56
    3.4.2.3 Procedures for Data Collection 58
    3.4.2.4 Semi-structured Interviews with the Head Teachers 58
    3.4.2.5 Interview with the Subject Teachers 59
    3.4.2.5 Focus Groups Discussions with the Teachers 60
    3.4.2.6 Observations of Classrooms and School-wide Activities 60

3.5 Data Analysis 65
  3.5.1 Introduction 65
  3.5.2 Analysis Procedures 66
  3.5.3 Identifying Themes in Data 67
  3.5.4 Analysis of the Documents 67
  3.5.5 Analysis of Case-study Data using NVivo 69
    3.5.5.1 Coding and Query 69
    3.5.5.2 Coding and Analysing the Observation Transcripts 71

3.6 Validity and Reliability 72

3.7 Summary 73

CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS FROM DOCUMENT ANALYSIS 74

4.1 Introduction 74
4.2 Priorities, Targets, Issues and Challenges in Primary Education in Bangladesh
4.2.1 Background
4.2.2 Significant Events and Initiatives
4.2.3 Issues and Challenges
4.2.4 Recent Achievements and Targets in Primary Education
4.2.5 Summary and Discussion

4.3 Values in Curriculum Documents
4.3.1 Educational Aims and Objectives
4.3.2 Competency-based Curriculum
4.3.3 Primary Curriculum and Textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies
4.3.3.1 Aims of the Curriculum
4.3.3.2 Textbooks of Social Studies and Islamic Studies
4.3.4 Summary and Discussion

4.4 Values in Teacher Training Resources
4.4.1 Instructional Resources Available to Teachers
4.4.2 Teacher Training Provisions
4.4.2.1 Curriculum of Key Teacher Training Programs
4.4.2.2 Short Training Courses for Teaching Quality Improvement
4.4.3 Summary

4.5 Conclusion

CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY OF CASE STUDIES
5.1 Introduction to Case Studies

5.2 The School Contexts
5.2.1 Case A
5.2.2 Case B
5.2.3 Case C
5.2.4 Case D
5.2.5 Case E
5.2.6 Case F
5.2.7 Summary

5.3 Involvement of the Community

5.4 Daily School Routine
5.4.1 Observations of the Teachers’ Practices in relation to the Daily Routines

5.5 Awareness of Values Education among the Higher Authority
5.5.1 Teachers’ Critical Views towards Some of the Initiatives

5.6 Teachers’ Perceptions of Values and Values Education
5.6.1 Values Viewed as Essential for the Children
5.6.2 Different Way that the School can Support Values Education
5.6.3 Teachers’ Views of their Role and Relevant Experiences

5.7 Values Content in the Curriculum
5.7.1 Social Studies
5.7.2 Islamic Studies  143
5.7.3 Knowledge, Skills and Values  143
5.7.4 Content Relevant to the Students’ Lives  144
5.7.5 Teachers’ Criticisms of the Curriculum and the Evaluation System  145
5.7.6 Summary  146

5.8 Pedagogy for Teaching Values  147

5.9 Implicit Modelling of Values by the Teachers  157

5.10 Summary  160

CHAPTER 6: EXPLICIT/IMPLICIT SCHOOL PROVISIONS FOR VALUES DEVELOPMENT  161

6.1 Introduction  161

6.2 Explicit/Implicit Values Learning Provisions in the School  161
6.2.1 The Daily Assembly  161
6.2.2 Behaviour Management Approaches  165
6.2.3 Co- and Extra-curricular Activities  169
6.2.4 Summary  177

6.3 Findings from School Visits and Classroom Observations  178
6.3.1 Introduction  178
6.3.2 Samples  179
6.3.3 Qualitative Rating of the Classrooms  180
6.3.4 Instructional Practices  183
  6.3.4.1 Instructional Resources and Materials used  183
  6.3.4.2 Type and Frequency of Activities  183
  6.3.4.3 Sequence of the activities  186
  6.3.4.4 Inadequate Instruction, Lack of Teacher Sensitivity and High Detachment  186
  6.3.4.5 Shallow exploration of Values terms/concepts  188
  6.3.4.6 Teachers’ inexperience in conducting cooperative strategies  189
  6.3.4.7 Students’ Interest in Narratives  189
  6.3.5 Social Support and Meaningful Classroom Interaction  191

6.4 Overall School Environment  192

6.5 Challenges for the Teachers  197

6.6 Summary  201

CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION  203

7.1 Introduction  203

7.2 Addressing the Key Themes  203

7.3 Summary  219
7.4 Limitations of the Study 220
7.5 Directions for Future Research 220
7.6 Conclusion 221

REFERENCES 227
**LIST OF APPENDICES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Student Enrolments in Different Types of Primary Schools (1996-2009)</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Bangladesh Primary Education Statistics 2010</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Objectives of Primary Education</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>English Version of the Information Statement for the Director General-Directorate of Primary Education, Bangladesh</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>English Version of the Information Statement for the Head Teacher</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>English Version of the Information Statement for the Subject Teacher</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>English Version of the Information Statement for the Focus Group Participants</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>English Version of the Consent Form for the Head Teacher</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>English Version of the Consent Form for the Subject Teacher</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>English Version of the Consent Form for the Focus Group Participants</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Information Statement for the Head Teacher</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Information Statement for the Subject Teacher</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Information Statement for the Focus Group Participants</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Consent Form for the Head Teacher</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Consent Form for the Subject Teacher</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Consent Form for the Focus Group Participants</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>English Version of the Interview Questionnaire for the Head Teacher</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Interview Questionnaire for the Head Teacher</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>English Version of the Interview Questionnaire for the Subject Teacher</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Interview Questionnaire for the Subject Teacher</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>English Version of the Focus Group Discussion Protocol</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>Bengali Version of the Focus Group Discussion Protocol</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>Details of the Classroom Observation System for Third Grade (COS-3) Instrument</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Document Sources for Analysis</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Educational Structure in Bangladesh</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>List of Terminal Competencies</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Essential Learning Continuum (Social Studies)</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Objectives of the Islamic Studies</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 4.6  Grade Three Social Studies Curriculum [Translated from Bengali] 307
Appendix 4.7  Total Number of Pages and Illustrations in the Textbooks 308
Appendix 4.8  Sample Exercise Sections from Textbooks 309
Appendix 4.9  Chapter Titles for the Social Studies Textbooks (Grade Three-Five) 312
Appendix 4.10  Section Titles for the ‘Akhlāq’ Chapter in Islamic Studies Textbooks (Grade Three-Five) 313
Appendix 4.11  Teaching Learning Activities and Evaluation Strategy [Islamic Studies Curriculum] 314
Appendix 4.12  Examples of Listing Tasks Included in Textbook Chapters 316
Appendix 4.13  Sample Lesson Plans for Social Studies 317
Appendix 5.1  Demographic Information of Teachers in Various Cases 319
Appendix 5.2  Information on Occupation and Economic Status of Guardians in Case C 320
Appendix 5.3  Observation of the National Children’s Day in Case D 321
Appendix 6.1  Classroom Examples of Over-reliance on Textbook 323
Appendix 6.2  Classroom Examples of Teachers’ Inexperience in Cooperative Techniques 324
Appendix 6.3  Classroom Examples of Exceptional Pedagogical Practices 327
LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 Key Themes and Underlying Concepts Extracted from the Literature 47
Table 3.2 Methods and Associated Points of Inquiry Planned for the Case Study Schools 51
Table 3.3 Research Questions and their Relation to the Methods 52
Table 3.4 Different Types of Documents and the Relevant Themes 68
Table 3.5 Different Classifications and their Attributes 70
Table 4.1 Key Concepts in Social Studies Textbooks 90
Table 4.2 One subject-wise Terminal Competency and its Description 91
Table 4.3 Activity Types and their Frequencies (in percentage) in Grade Three Social Studies Curriculum 98
Table 4.4 Activity Types and their Frequencies (in percentage) in Grade Four Social Studies Curriculum 99
Table 4.5 Activity Types and their Frequencies (in percentage) in Grade Five Social Studies Curriculum 100
Table 4.6 Frequencies of Listing Activities in Social Studies Textbooks 101
Table 4.7 Minimum Qualification and Salary Grades for the Positions of Teachers and Field-level Education Officers 108
Table 4.8 Recommended Methods and Techniques for Teaching Social Studies 113
Table 5.1 Description of Source Referencing Code 118
Table 5.2 Some Contextual Information of the Schools 120
Table 5.3 Teachers and Students in Various Cases 121
Table 5.4 Duration for Various School Activities as included in the Daily School Routine of the Schools 130
Table 6.1 Frequencies of Classrooms Observed for Different Subjects 179
Table 6.2 Descriptive Statistics for the COS-3 Rating of the Lesson Samples (n=43) 180
Abstract

Values education is a pedagogical approach that centres on the whole-person development of children. It stresses creating a school environment supported by respectful relationships, where students feel safe to express their thoughts, emotions and values and learn about others, where children are given choice and power over what and how they learn and where they can participate in active and cooperative learning experiences. Over the past ten years, educational and psychological research has confirmed that children not only thrive socially and emotionally in such environments, but this is where they also learn best. Values Education has been implemented in both developed and developing countries including the USA, Australia, England, Scotland, and the Philippines. Research emanating from values initiatives in these countries has identified a number of common core features that characterise effective values pedagogy.

Bangladesh is a small but densely populated country in South-East Asia. In recent years, substantial advancement towards access and equity in primary education has been made in Bangladesh. The government is now focusing on quality improvement issues, ranging from the teacher and teaching qualities to the curriculum and textbook reform. Given that values education provides a wider platform for young learners to grow as moral human beings and as responsible members of the wider community, the present study seeks to examine the extent to which primary education in Bangladesh supports the key implementation aspects of values education, namely: i) awareness of values among the key educational authorities and school leaders; ii) the cognitive, affective, and behavioural domain of values learning; iii) explicit/implicit provisions for the articulation of values; and, iv) support from the learning environment. The data collection and analysis included: i) document analysis of the educational policies and relevant documents, and the curriculum, textbooks, and teachers’ manuals developed for primary-level Social Studies and Religious Studies; and, ii) case studies of six government primary schools (two for each of the metropolitan, urban and rural schools) comprised of semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with the teachers, and observations of classrooms and school-wide activities.

The findings suggested that the government is increasingly urging schools to establish a student-centred, participatory learning environment, and to engage students in meaningful learning experiences, goals which evidence suggests could well be facilitated by values education implementation. However, most of the teachers included in this study had a limited understanding of values education and restricted opportunities to implement the kind of student-centred, cooperative learning activities that assist children to reflect on and enact values. In addition, the curriculum and the textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies showed little to no awareness of values education perspectives and rarely included activities to promote critical thinking skills, emotional and social skills, or problem solving and decision making abilities. As well, most of the observed lessons were over-reliant on textbook content with the lesson delivery being teacher-directed and prescriptive, and activities focused on the rote-learning of the textbook content. This study suggests the need for the Bangladeshi education authorities to revisit and reform the aims and objectives set for primary education, and to revise the primary curriculum, textbooks and evaluation methods, to ensure that all of the educational initiatives undertaken are aimed at creating a safe, supportive and child-friendly learning environment.
environment. The thesis suggests that much of this reform could be achieved by greater attention being given to values education research and practice.
CHAPTER 1:
INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

1.1.1 Motivation for the Study

I remember growing up in Bangladesh as one of eight million primary students believing that school is a place where all learning is directed to being tested in exams, where good students are those who remain silent during lessons, memorize content word for word, and do only what their teachers instruct them to do. But, I kept asking: “Is schooling only about being tested? Should we put all our efforts into what children should know and ignore how they are feeling or acting? Can we afford to ignore their personal, emotional and social development? What about building the core human values, essential life skills, self-confidence, self-knowledge, and social competence in children? How can we expect that the children would grow as good citizens when we are not considering this to be a part of their schooling experiences?”

I found answers to these questions in values education research. Values education is a pedagogical approach that centres on the whole-person development of children. It stresses creating a school environment supported by respectful relationships, where students feel free and safe to express their thoughts, emotions and values and learn about others, where children are given the choice and power over what and how they learn and where they can participate in active and cooperative learning experiences. Over the past ten years, educational and psychological research has confirmed that children not only thrive socially and emotionally in such environments, but this is where they also learn best.

1.1.2 Imperatives of Teaching Values in Schools

With changing family structures and parenting roles, the often negative impact of media on children, and a noticeable decline in the moral state of societies, schools are facing an increasing need to foster the character development of young learners, that is, to improve their attitudinal and behavioural characteristics (Brannon, 2008; Lickona, 1996; D. Rowe, 2006). It is now established that schools and teachers have considerable potential to develop the values and virtues of all children in the form of explicit instruction (Damon, 2008, 2000), and teachers’ modelling of values (Haynes, 2009; Leenders & Veugelers, 2009; Lumpkin, 2008). In response
to the elevated concern around the role of public education in addressing the individual’s needs, schools in various countries are implementing programs aimed at developing students’ self-confidence and self-esteem by familiarising them with core human values (Brown, 2007; de Souza, 2008; DEST, 2005a; Leming, 1993; LVEP, 2009; D. Rowe, 2006).

Addressing the development of values dispositions of children within a school context entails considering the affective as well as the cognitive domain of learning (Damon, 2000). Researchers (de Souza, 2008; Kenan, 2009, p. 279) also urge that education systems need to encompass the subjective and spiritual world of individual students, without focusing only on ‘positivist knowledge and science’, so that educational efforts can prepare children to face the emerging frontiers of social phenomena and related problems prevailing in the contemporary world. On the grounds that only teaching students knowledge and skills represents a limited view of education, Sternberg (2009) urges giving ultimate focus to teaching ‘ethical behaviour’ or ‘wisdom’, that is, to be able ‘to use their [students’] knowledge and intelligence in ethical ways’ (p. 190). Ethical behaviour is evident when ‘one seeks a common good, realizing that this common good may be better for some than for others’ and ‘requires one to inform one’’s thinking by ethical values’ (p. 197).

Durkheim (1961) considered the school and classroom as a replica of society and therefore identified the potential of introducing children to the moral order of their society through teaching classroom and school rules. He viewed the education system as an instrument for generating and reinforcing the moral identity and order of a society, where the learners socialise morally. Similarly, Halstead (1996) stresses that education on character and values serves individuals as well as a society. The schools in which values are omnipresent as a ‘hidden curriculum’ link these two entities, the children and the wider community. Societies generally expect schools to instil certain values in children and these values, in turn, influence the society (Halstead, 1996; Haynes, 2009). Haynes (2009), a strong proponent of the inclusion of character education and civic learning in formal schooling, boldly articulates – “Schools should be the laboratories for acts of conscience” (p. 11) based on the premise that public education has the potential to reach the majority of citizens in a nation and, therefore, can act as an active ground for fostering the character development of young learners.

Although the development of ‘emotional literacy’ and the explicit teaching of values has entered into the curriculum design and implementation sphere relatively recently—following the educational movement of moral, character and values development during the last five decades—education systems across the world are turning to explicit values education at a rapid rate (Pring, 2010b, p. v). Values Education has been implemented in various parts of the
world including the USA, Australia, England, Scotland, the Philippines and other countries (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a).

1.1.3 Values and Values Education

Values have been considered as socially shared ideas or principles that guide us to discern right from wrong or desirable from undesirable behaviour (Halstead & Pike, 2006; Zajda, 2009). Halstead (1996) defines values as ‘principles, fundamental convictions, ideals, standards of life-stances which act as general guides to behaviour...and which are closely tied to personal integrity and personal identity’ (p. 5).

An examination of the values discourse suggests that there are a number of different kinds of values, such as, moral, educational, aesthetic, social, political, and religious values. Aristotle, however, attached most significance to moral values contending that this overarching value determines all our value judgments (Aspin, 2002). There has been considerable debate over the last few decades around what values are and whether ‘values’, ‘morals’ and ‘ethics’ can be regarded as separable and uniquely defined (Aspin, 2002; Fraenkel, 1980; Irwin, 1988). Given that defining the term ‘values’ and isolating it from other related concepts is not a straightforward task, this study defines the term ‘values’, in the context of educational literature, as encompassing general ideals we hold that determine our behaviour.

That education is a value-laden activity has been stressed by Tarlinton and O’Shea in the following manner,

> Values are core to a school; they come with the architecture and the furniture and decorations of the building itself. They are personified in the attributes of the teachers and in the standards of behaviour expected of the students; they are made explicit in the rubrics and rituals, particularly in those that accompany tragedy or celebrate success. (Tarlinton & O’Shea, 2002, p. 90)

Values Education, known as character education in some countries, refers to the teaching of values that the adults in a democratic society conceive of as indicators of morality (Zajda, 2009). The National Framework for Values Education in Australian Schools describes values education as:

> Any explicit and/or implicit school-based activity which promotes student understanding and knowledge of values, and which develops the skills and dispositions of students so they can enact particular values as individuals and as members of the wider community. (DEST, 2005a, p. 8)

Values are evident in every aspect of schooling (Clement, 2007). A school is thus expected to educate children about what these values mean and how to demonstrate shared values in the
personal and social lives of the students. Values education enables the learners to explore the nature of the challenges and choices they face in their practical lives, and to make informed decisions about how to meet those challenges and make the ‘right’ behavioural choices (Marsh, 2008).

From the literature presented in this section and the sections that follow, values education is conceptualised as helping children learn principles in relation to making decisions about, and taking responsibility for, their actions, and maintaining integrity between their thoughts and actions. These principles extend beyond simply prescribing what they can and cannot do, and rather focus on developing decision making and problem solving skills so that children can discern right from wrong. Values education comprises the adults’ (teachers’ and parents’) explicitly teaching and modelling the values that they want their students or children to learn. At the same time, it is a transformative journey for the teachers as they learn to discover their own caring and responsible selves that treat individual students with respect and fairness, build intimate relationships with their students, and strive for creating positive learning experiences that foster students’ emotional and social development (DEEWR, 2008).

Research conducted in the Australian and international contexts have shown that character education and values education programs have the potential to improve teachers’ commitment and confidence, student’s engagement in classroom and the nature of the overall learning environment (Arweck & Nesbitt, 2004; Arweck, Nesbitt, & Jackson, 2005; Bergmark, 2008; Chang & Munoz, 2006; DEST, 2006). Values education is essential in educational enterprise because its embedding into schools can result in students’ ‘effective learning’, ‘wellbeing’ and ‘progress’ (Terry Lovat & Clement, 2008; Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010b). Drawing from the Australian Values Education experiences Lovat (2010) presents evidence that a common language for values education, a whole-school approach to it and ‘the nexus between quality teaching and values education’ positively affect the school climate, teaching and learning outcomes, relationships, as well as wellbeing of both teachers and students, with an increase in students’ self-regulation behaviours and self-esteem (p. 10).

1.1.4 Theories Underpinning Values Education

Two theoretical bases that match and enlighten the philosophy of values education are those of John Dewey (Dewey, 1964) and Jurgen Habermas (Habermas, 1971, 1973, 1984, 1987, 1990). Dewey advocated for extending the scope of education beyond ‘subject knowledge and methods’ to the ‘reflectivity, inquiry and a capacity for moral judiciousness’ (Terry Lovat, 2007, p. 6). Habermas portrayed the ways of knowing as a three-level system; first, ‘empirical-
analytic’ knowing which refers to knowing the ‘facts and figures’; second, ‘communicative knowledge’ or interpretive knowing that refers to our understanding of others’ views on the facts we already know; and third, ‘critical knowing’ or ‘self-reflectivity’, which leads to knowing one’s own self, given all of the pertinent facts and evidence (Gray & Lovat, 2006; Terry Lovat, 2007, 2008).

The ultimate goal of values education is to develop ‘self-reflectivity’ in children that first prepares them to be questioned about their beliefs and to take the challenge of threatening their long-held beliefs, and then reveals to them their real identity through deeper interpretive knowing (Terry Lovat, 2008). Values education is fully transformative in nature in the sense that it steers the original ‘life-world’ (a term used by Habermas) of students through explicit modelling of trust, care and respect in order that students reach a state of self-reflection and critical knowing where they develop and utilise their ‘communicative capacity’, that is, the capacity to judge their own position in the complex dynamic of the surroundings, to commit ‘communicative action’ or ‘praxis’, namely, an action meant to make a difference in the world (Terry Lovat, 2003, 2007).

1.2 Rationale for the Study

Several approaches to teaching values have been adopted as part of formal schooling, such as moral education, character education, civics education, citizenship education, ‘social-emotional learning’, and values education. It is proposed in this thesis that values education, in its underlying philosophy, principles and practices, incorporates all the key elements of other approaches and widens the scope of many of these approaches. It provides a safe and supportive school environment for children and adults, strengthens the cognitive, emotional and social development of the students, and develops a wide range of skills that are necessary for the sustainability of learners in their personal and social lives. In addition to providing knowledge and skills related to values, it develops the problem-solving and decision-making skills that children may utilise to resolve conflicts inside and outside the school.

Given that values education provides a wider platform for young learners to grow as good human beings and as responsible members of the wider community, this study seeks to examine to what extent values education is occurring in the primary education system of Bangladesh, a small but densely populated country in South-East Asia. In recent years, substantial advancement towards access and equity in primary education has been made in Bangladesh. The government is now focusing on quality improvement issues, ranging from the teacher and
teaching qualities to the curriculum and textbook reform. Against this backdrop of primary education in Bangladesh, it is timely to investigate the phenomenon of the values development of Bangladeshi children, the present policies and practices in Bangladeshi primary schools and any perceived gaps in relation to the widely accepted educational approaches for values development.

1.3 The Context of Education in Bangladesh

The primary education system comprises a total of ten different types of primary schools with the government primary schools serving almost 58% of the students. Information on the various types of schools and their student enrolment statistics (1996-2009) are provided in Appendix 1.1. The country has one of the largest primary education systems in the world (UNICEF Bangladesh, 2009). According to the latest government statistics\(^1\), the total primary school enrolment is 16.90 million (50.5% are girls). The primary school workforce is comprised of 380,957 teachers (45.56% are female) working in more than 82,674 schools where the average pupil/teacher ratio is 47.1:1 (2010 statistics given in Appendix 1.2). Although the net enrolment rate at the latter part of 2011 stood as high as 99.47% the dropout rate of 21% is still a significant number ("Drop out," 2011).

The aim of primary education in Bangladesh is to ‘assist with the physical, mental, social, spiritual, moral, human and aesthetic development of all children in Bangladesh, and inspire them to develop a vision for prosperous life.’ (DPE, 2005b) This aim is broken into twenty-two objectives (Appendix 1.3), the majority of which embody the fostering of personal, social, citizenship and democratic values. Setting ‘the cultivation of human values’ as a principal objective, the latest education policy (MOE, 2010) focuses on nurturing the natural curiosity of learners as well as ensuring they are competent for future employment by having a strong base in modern science and technology. This policy also upholds the development of learners’ leadership qualities and ‘intellectual and practical qualities’, in order for them to be able to guide and participate in ‘pro-people development programs’, and to grow as creative, productive, and rational human beings enriched with core personal and human values like ‘honesty, patriotism, accountability and social responsibility’. The education minister declared in his foreword that this policy is based on the ethos of alleviating all inequalities in education and that through education, and the knowledge and skills that schools provide, a strong workforce will be created which will ‘contribute to eradicate poverty, illiteracy, corruption,

\(^1\) 2010 statistics retrieved from the website of Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics (BANBEIS).
communalism and backwardness and build up a developed and prosperous Bangladesh.’ (MOE, 2010)

It is evident that the four major concepts on which the Constitution of Bangladesh was formed—namely religious faith and adherence, socialism, nationalism and democracy—govern the aims and objectives of Bangladeshi education. Whereas religious faith and values are expected to develop and strengthen the character traits of learners, the ethos of nationalism, democracy and socialism are intended to create in the students a sense of fellow-feeling, patriotism, and democratic living in local, national and universal contexts.

A World Bank (2008) report identified some key factors limiting the quality of primary education in Bangladesh. These include ‘the low quality of the teaching force, weak management and accountability mechanisms, poor quality of the curriculum and textbook production, shortage of staff at all levels, inadequate physical infrastructure and inappropriate financing of primary education expenditures’ (p. 2). More specifically, classroom-level quality gaps such as ‘ineffective teaching methods, a poor environment for learning and lack of suitable resources’, as well as the absence of an inclusive learning environment turned a large proportion of children to ‘silent’ or ‘virtual’ dropouts—children ‘who are physically in class but not psychologically and intellectually engaged in learning’ (Nasreen & Tate, 2007, p. 40). The World Bank study (2008) pinpointed a range of school, teacher, community and child factors that were correlated to the low student achievement in Bangladeshi primary education. While the school factors included ‘the student-teacher ratio, teachers’ time on task, their teaching load, textbooks and other instructional materials, the length of the school year, single or multiple shift classrooms, school facilities such as library, toilets, sports and other physical infrastructures’ (p. 37), teacher absenteeism as well as poor financial status and educational achievement of the family members appeared to have contributed to low student achievement. Finally, the lack of financial support from the community and also the ability and learning disposition of a child were identified as contributing factors. In the context of primary education in Bangladesh, child work, and poor parental education and household income were found to be highly linked to the lower school attendance and grade attainment (Khanam & Ross, 2011).

Along another line, Islam (2010) argued that, as it is difficult to measure quality against broader indicators such as the relevance of the curriculum to the real-life of the learners or the achievement of learning outcomes, education quality measurement in Bangladesh has thus far considered only the ‘proxy indicators’ including ‘the student-teacher ratio, the repetition rate, the survival rate, the dropout rate, the completion rate, internal efficiency rate, the number of contact hours involving teachers and students, and the Gender-Parity Index’ (Islam, 2010, pp. 9, 27). The central education authority has not so far conducted any nation-wide standardised tests
to measure cognitive, affective or psychomotor learning outcomes of the students (Islam, 2010). This study also identified the rapid quantitative expansion of the sector and the resulting gap in the workforce, as well as the increasing detachment of the community elites from the financial and administrative affairs of the school as adversely affecting the quality of primary education in Bangladesh.

A number of measures have been taken by the government to address the quality gaps in the primary education sector. As a landmark initiative in the education system of Bangladesh, the apex curriculum body—the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), with the help of the Institute of Educational Development of BRAC University, Bangladesh, arranged a series of five workshops on curriculum development and implementation, within the period of January 2009 to March 2010 (IED-BRACU, n.d.). Members of the top government organisations in primary education, national and international Non-Government Organizations (NGOs), donors, as well as primary school teachers and teacher trainers attended the workshops. The aim of the workshops was to build awareness among the key educational stakeholders on the curriculum revision and to reach a consensus on the developmental framework for a new, upgraded curriculum and relevant teaching materials (textbooks, teaching guides etc.). Participants in the workshops have identified elements in the present curriculum and teaching-learning methods that should be subject to change and improvement. The workshop series has envisioned the children as personal and social learning agents who possess deep natural interests, curiosity, values, and judgments, and need an interesting, joyful, and love-enforced learning environment to bloom in their full capacity, both in the cognitive and emotional aspects of learning (IED-BRACU, n.d.).

The major government initiatives in relation to improving the quality of primary education have been undertaken under the project, Primary Education Development Project-II (PEDP II, scheduled for 2004-2011), funded by UNICEF and ten other international donor agencies (Ministry of Primary and Mass Education Bangladesh, n.d.). PEDP II aims to improve the quality of teaching and learning and the level of student achievement in primary schools all over the country (UNICEF Bangladesh, 2009). The major quality challenges in primary education, identified by this project, include the lack of training and motivation of teachers, and the emphasis on rote-learning with little attention being paid towards the practical and analytical skills of pupils. To overcome these quality challenges, PEDP II has taken some effective strategies: training teachers on interactive teaching approaches, providing subject-based training, and delivering professional development training to the head teachers and local education officials. PEDP II is also revising the Diploma of Education Program for new teachers to incorporate new child-friendly teaching techniques and a 6-month practice teaching period. Another important strategy taken by PEDP II concerns the empowerment of teachers,
parents and the local community, through the School Level Improvement Plans (SLIPs), in order to strengthen the sense of motivation and joint ownership of the school (UNICEF Bangladesh, 2009).

Recently, the government has undertaken a third phase of PEDP (PEDP-III, 2011-2016), the biggest ever project in the education sector ("PEDP-3," 2011), the aims of which include improving the quality of teaching-learning in primary schools by taking measures such as providing educational materials to all children and conducting necessary training for the teachers and officials in primary education. This program will not only enhance ongoing projects of the government, such as School Feeding and Stipend, but also included in its agenda are emergency education, child health, social motivation, non-formal education for drop-outs, unified education, curriculum development and decentralised school management ("PEDP-III progress," 2011).

1.4 Aim of the Study

It is clear that a fundamental change in the quality of primary education in Bangladesh is under way. In this respect, as the development of children as whole-human beings is regarded as an essential charter of public schooling, this research aims to examine primary school education in Bangladesh for its endeavour towards the development of student values. After identifying in the literature the internationally recognised philosophies and best practices for values development of children, this study aims to explore the primary education system of Bangladesh in the light of these philosophies and practices. To be specific, this study aims to explore the extent to which primary education in Bangladesh supports the key implementation aspects of values education. This central theme is divided into the following sub-questions developed around the best practices of values education:

1. **Awareness of values among the key educational authority and the school leaders:** What values and skills are deemed important for Bangladeshi students by the policy makers and school authorities and how is the delivery of these values and skills incorporated within the educational policies and practices?

2. **Cognitive, affective, and behavioural domain of values learning:** What opportunities do the primary curriculum and textbooks provide for students to learn about values, understand and explore values, and develop and practise applying values?
3. **Explicit/implicit provisions for the articulation of values:** To what extent do the involvement of the community, school-level daily operations, curricular provisions, co- and extra-curricular activities, and the decision making strategies support the explicit and implicit values learning of the students?

4. **Support from the environment:** To what extent do the overall school environment, teachers’ modelling of values, as well as the interaction between and among the school community members uphold the significance of supporting student’s values and holistic development through the schooling provisions?

### 1.5 Nature and Significance of the Study

This research investigates the primary education of Bangladesh through a values education lens to examine the provisions available for fostering whole person development. It employs an analysis of the educational philosophy, aims and objectives, and curriculum and teacher training programs that represent the primary education system in Bangladesh. The study also applies a multiple case-study approach (Yin, 1994) in order to examine the values education practices prevalent in Bangladeshi primary schools. Field-level qualitative data—comprising interviews and focus groups with teachers and observations of classrooms and school operations—were collected from six government primary schools that included two metropolitan, two urban and two rural schools.

This is the first study on Bangladeshi primary education that has attempted to look beyond the academic performance of students and critically examine the values development provisions in schools. This research is very timely because the Education Ministry is now encouraging initiatives aimed at the improvement of overall school provisions, and revising the teacher education program to introduce child-friendly teaching practices. The findings from this study will provide important insights into current teaching practices in Bangladeshi primary schools and the extent to which the aims and policies governing Bangladeshi primary education are being realised.
1.6 Organisation of the Thesis

The thesis is organised into a number of chapters representing the relevant literature, key findings, and the discussion topics emerging from the study. A summary of the content of each chapter is given below:

The Literature Review chapter (Chapter 2) presents insights gained from a review of the literature on values, values education and other related concepts. The two key questions that guided the selection and review of the literature are: i) In what way do the related concepts, such as moral education, character education, citizenship education, etc. differ from or show resemblance with the concepts of ‘values education’?; and, ii) What are the underlying philosophies, principles and practices (e.g. curriculum and pedagogy) of values education as implemented in various school-based programs around the world? The findings derived from the literature review are presented under some major sections including: Comparison of values education with related approaches; Effectiveness of values education programs; Philosophies, principles and practices of values education programs; A holistic view towards child, education, student achievement and student wellbeing; and, the ‘Troika’ and its relationship to student wellbeing and student achievement. In addition, the key principles and best practices that are delineated from the literature include: Determination of values and skills and their explicit articulation in school policies; Whole school approach; Explicit articulation of values through meaningful and challenging curriculum; Implicit modelling of values by teachers and the creation of a safe, supportive learning environment; Values-focused pedagogy; Implicit teaching of values; and, Embedding values education into teacher education programs.

The Methodology chapter (Chapter 3) will first summarise the key themes identified from the literature, and then will provide a conceptual framework for the study. This chapter will describe and justify the qualitativeresearch design chosen for the study, following a detailed description of the methodology, samples and sampling strategy, field work and data collection methods, data collection protocols, and the strategies used for the analysis of data collected using various methods. This chapter also describes the ethical considerations, validity and reliability of the research study.

The Document Analysis chapter (Chapter 4) reports the findings from the document analysis and discusses the ways in which reinforcing the values development of children is incorporated into the educational philosophy, priorities and agenda of the state; and in the primary curriculum, textbooks and teacher professional development programs. The aim of the document analysis was to reveal a broad picture of values development opportunities that the primary schools are expected to create for children. This chapter is organised into three major sections. The first section provides contextual information regarding primary school education
in Bangladesh and highlights the significant policies adopted in the history of primary education, major initiatives taken so far, and future goals set for this sector. This section also describes the place of values development among the priorities of the government, and the existence of any school interventions and/or programs that directly or indirectly relate to the mental and physical nourishment of children. The second section reports findings from the analysis of the primary curriculum and textbooks of two subjects, Environment Studies - Society (referred to as Social Studies) and Religious Studies (Islam). The third section reports the outcomes of the analysis of the resources that support teachers’ professional development and classroom teaching.

Chapter 5 and Chapter 6 report the findings from the case-studies conducted in six government primary schools in Bangladesh. The findings have been derived from the analyses of a number of data sources including the documents collected from the schools, interviews and focus group discussions with teachers, classroom observations, informal discussions with teachers, and observations of the overall school environment and special events or activities taking place during the field visits. Chapter 5 includes the contextual and operational information about the schools; and the teachers’ perceptions of values, values education and their role as teachers. Data are presented under themes including: Involvement of the Community; Observations of the Teachers’ Practices in relation to the Daily Routines; Awareness of Values Education among the Higher Authority; Teachers’ Critical Views towards some of the Government Initiatives; Teachers’ Perception of Values and Values Education including those of the values viewed as essential for the children, different ways that the school can support values education, the teachers’ role and relevant experiences as values educators, values content in the curriculum of Social Studies and Islamic Studies and the extent to which the curriculum supports students’ holistic development and relates to the students’ lives. Moreover, the findings are presented under the headings of the Teachers’ critical views towards the curriculum and the evaluation system; Pedagogy for teaching values; and, Implicit modeling of values by the teachers.

The purpose of Chapter 6 is to report findings in relation to the explicit/implicit school provisions that provide support for values and moral development of the children (for example, the daily assembly, behaviour management approaches, and co- and extra-curricular activities), and the findings from observations of the classrooms and the overall environment of the schools.

The Discussion and Conclusion (Chapter 7) has four main sections. The first section addresses the key research questions by summarising the findings collected from the four different sources—the document analysis, interviews, focus groups and observations—and
making connections to these different groups of findings. This section discusses the findings and additional themes emerging from the study in light of the relevant literature. The second and third sections report the major limitations of the study, and suggestions for future research, respectively. The fourth section draws conclusions and identifies implications.

### 1.7 Summary

This chapter discussed the research motivation and background for this PhD study. Briefly introducing the concepts underlying values education, this chapter explained the research problem, the research questions, as well as the rationale for investigating the research problem. An introduction to the context of primary education in Bangladesh was also provided. Finally, the chapter offered a roadmap to the whole thesis with a summary of the content included in the various chapters.
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

The objective of this chapter is to present the insights gained from a review of the literature on values, values education and other related concepts. Key questions that guided the selection and review of the literature are as follows:

- What do ‘values’ and ‘values education’ refer to? What are the theories underpinning values?
- What are the imperatives of teaching values within a school context, i.e. can and should values be ‘taught’ or are they ‘caught’ (‘Nature’ versus ‘Nurture’)?
- In which ways do the related concepts, such as moral education, character education, citizenship education, etc., differ from or show resemblance to the concepts of ‘values education’?
- What are the underlying philosophies, principles and practices (e.g. curriculum and pedagogy) implemented in various school-based programs around the world?

The literature relevant to the first two questions has been included in Chapter 1. The following sections present the summary of the literature reviewed under various headings and sub-headings that address the remaining key objectives of this literature review. Sections 2.2-2.5 introduce the key terms and concepts related to values education and other relevant educational approaches, as well as the positive impacts of values education. The next section presents literature on the principles of implementing values education in schools and therefore sets the background for the focus of this study.

As noted above, one objective of the literature review is to discover the underlying philosophies, principles and practices (e.g. curriculum and pedagogy) implemented in various school-based programs around the world. The intention is to develop a conceptual and analytical framework setting a background for the focus of this study, the aim of which is to investigate the primary education of Bangladesh from a values education perspective. With this purpose in mind, a comprehensive search for seminal and contemporary literature has been conducted using relevant databases. In terms of the literature reviewed, the regional or cultural categorisation of the studies was not taken into account, rather the focus was to identify the best
practices and implications of various values education programs. The assumption was held that the key principles and an operational framework for effective values education programs would provide sufficient implications for investigating Bangladeshi primary education employing a values perspective.

2.2 Comparison of Values Education with Related Approaches

Values education is closely related to other terms in the literature including spiritual, moral, social, and cultural development (Meakin, 1988), character education (Davidson, Khmelkov, & Lickona, 2010; Lickona, 1991, 1993, 1996; Lickona & Davidson, 2005; Lickona, Schaps, & Lewis, 2007; Schwartz, Beatty, & Dachnowicz, 2006), education in virtues (Carr, 2005), civic and citizenship education, and the development of attitudes and personal qualities (Halstead & Taylor, 2000). However, values education was pointed to by Carr (1999) as a ‘catch-all for moral, social and personal, civic and spiritual education’ (p. 147). Carr’s assertion will be explored in this section by presenting a detailed discussion on values education and other approaches including character education, moral education, citizenship education, and social-emotional learning (SEL).

2.2.1 Character Education and Moral Education

In this section, the definitions of character education, moral education, and their relationships, as well as examples of character education and moral education programs will be presented.

2.2.1.1 Definition. Character education teaches ‘social and emotional skills’ so that children will learn to act responsibly, value fairness and justice, strive for the common good, and respect other’s rights (Richardson, Tolson, Huang, & Lee, 2009, p. 71). Winton (2008) defines character education as ‘the explicit attempt by educators to teach values to students’ (p. 307). Values and skills are taught explicitly in character education. It is a practical approach with a focus on behavioural outcomes (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006).

Moral education, on the other hand, is a cognitive moral development approach, based on the theories of Jean Piaget (1965) and Lawrence Kohlberg (Kohlberg, 1971, 1976), which develops moral reasoning ability (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006). Moral reasoning is a ‘systematic process’ by which we evaluate our own virtues and come up with ‘consistent and impartial’
moral principles (Lumpkin, 2008, p. 48). At the heart of moral reasoning is the capacity to consider ‘the effects of one's actions on others’ (Haydon, 2003, p. 29).

2.2.1.2 Interplay between Character Education and Moral Education. Some researchers consider traditional character education an authoritative approach, since it prescribes a model of good behaviour and acceptable character traits whereby children are expected to passively and unquestioningly conform to predetermined values and the chosen indicators of ‘good’ character. The problem with this kind of didactic approach is that it does not nurture the moral reasoning ability of children; neither does it encourage them to think critically, to make moral judgements, nor to challenge the status quo (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006; Halstead & Pike, 2006; Winton, 2008). On the other hand, the development of moral reasoning ability requires explicit and deliberate effort. In order to strengthen their capacity for moral reasoning, students need opportunities to discuss morality and to make moral decisions, by means of direct curricular incentives—within a free, safe and supportive environment that ensures freedom of expression and builds engaged citizens (Mayhew & King, 2008).

Recent advancements in character education, therefore, have been made towards the blending of the key concepts behind moral education and character education, thus bridging the gap between moral reasoning and behavioural outcomes. Moral reasoning is viewed as a three tier process: knowing, valuing and acting (Lumpkin, 2008). This view is evident in one of the guiding principles of a character education program in the USA, the Character Education Partnership (CEP), where moral living is conceived of as thinking morally, feeling morally and behaving morally (Lickona et al., 2007). Moreover, character education is now conceived of as a combination of knowledge, skills, and dispositions, where the knowledge base is built upon moral concepts and manners (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006).

2.2.1.3 Character Education Programs. In the US, as well as Canada, government level initiatives around character education are expanding on the grounds that it is good for ‘students, schools, and society’ (Winton, 2008, p. 307). American public education has always been connected with the moral development of children and in the recent past character education programs, such as, ‘Character Counts’ and the ‘Six Pillars of Character’ have been adopted (Brimi, 2009). In 1994, the US Congress endorsed a character education program named the ‘Partnerships in Character Education Project’ and the Department of Education later joined in character education initiatives to financially support and collaborate with the state-level and district-level educational institutions (The US Ministry of Education, n.d.).

The Character Education Partnership (CEP), a program designed and run by leading character education advocates in the US, covers thirty six states of the US which have either mandated or encouraged character education through legislation (CEP, n.d.). This program,
which is based on eleven principles of effective character education (Lickona et al., 2007), will be described later in the Three Programs section of this proposal. Another character education program in the US, the Child Development Project (CDP), has reported findings showing improvements in students’ social achievement (Chang & Munoz, 2006). In the US, however, there is ongoing debate among educators about an appropriate form of character education (Zhao, 2005). There is not a nationally mandated curriculum standard for character education nor any guidelines for assessment (Brimi, 2009).

In Canada, the Ministry of Education in both Ontario and Alberta have adopted character education initiatives at all school levels (Bajovic, Rizzo, & Engemann, 2009). A character education program in Hong Kong has been shown to develop the social competence of children (Cheung & Lee, 2010). Moreover, following American character education models, a Taiwanese school has also implemented a program called Character Based School Culture (CBSC) during 2005-2007 (Lee, 2009).

2.2.1.4 Moral education across the countries. In England Moral Education was mainly in the form of Religious Education before 1970, but in the 1970s and 1980s the two main approaches used for moral education, as in the US, were ‘Values Clarification’ and ‘Moral Reasoning’ (Halstead & Pike, 2006, p. 20). In China, ‘value/moral education’ is the concept that was used traditionally as the vehicle for the moral development of children (Zhao, 2005, p. 11). In Japan, moral education has been compulsory since 1872, with a recent urge to improve moral education strategies in the face of increased youth crime (Sakamoto, 2008).

2.2.2 Citizenship Education

In this section, the definition and aims of citizenship education, in parallel with the aims of moral education, will be presented. Moreover, relationships between character, moral and citizenship education, and examples of various countries where citizenship education has been adopted, will be described.

2.2.2.1 Definition. Citizenship refers to the membership of a state or nation as well as the associated rights and responsibilities of the citizens. Citizenship education prepares learners to reflect on their understanding of citizenship, on their desired state of the society, and on their part in ‘local, national and global issues’ (Halstead & Pike, 2006, pp. 10-14). The aim is to develop active citizens in a pluralistic society who possess decision-making and conflict-resolution skills (Winton, 2007). Whereas citizenship education develops ‘social and moral responsibility, community involvement and political literacy’, civic education, which is a
traditional approach to citizenship education, merely passes on the constitutional knowledge (D. Rowe, 2006, p. 524).

2.2.2.2 Aim of citizenship education and moral education. Halstead and Pike (2006) describe the aims of citizenship education and moral education in a parallel conceptual manner: the aims of these educational approaches fit into three consecutive levels of a hierarchy in a similar fashion. According to Halstead and Pike, at the first level, citizenship education generates ‘informed’ citizens, equipped with the knowledge of constituting elements of citizenship in local, national and global contexts; moral education aims to build ‘informed’ moral agents having knowledge of moral practices, and beliefs pertinent to a tradition. The second level aims to transform these informed citizens into ‘committed, active’ citizens who actively take part in community affairs; in the case of moral education the aim is to upgrade the informed moral agents into ‘committed, active’ moral agents who demonstrate their moral understanding by committing moral actions. Here, it is necessary to develop certain skills and values, in addition to the knowledge about citizenship (in citizenship education) and morality (in moral education). The final aim is to build ‘autonomous, critically reflective’ citizens who challenge the authorities, and to create moral beings who think critically and reflect on moral judgements (Halstead & Pike, 2006).

2.2.2.3 Relationship between character, moral and citizenship education. Without moral education, (i.e., without developing moral values and moral reasoning), citizenship education cannot achieve its goal. Citizenship education entails fostering civic and communal values to live co-operatively in a society, but, to be good citizens children also need to develop personal values, dispositions, skills, and commitment to moral action, which may be achieved by moral education as it deals with personal values, moral understanding, action and reflection (Halstead & Pike, 2006).

Character education covers one aspect of citizenship education, because it accomplishes the formation of the values and dispositions that are necessary for well-functioning citizens, and the dispositions (e.g. social justice, honesty, responsibility etc.) that are targeted by both approaches are almost the same (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006). Character education, however, fails to support citizenship education when it concentrates only on equipping children with certain values and behavioural traits and does not address the ‘conceptual or situational knowledge’ (Winton, 2007, p. 1) that are necessary to impel actions in local or global contexts. On the other hand, character education is complemented by moral education and citizenship education. Developing certain behavioural traits in students, through strategies like discussion and negotiation, becomes more effective when the schools also blend this effort with moral education and citizenship education. These latter approaches facilitate the internalisation of
values, so that the students question their own behaviour and do not merely comply with school rules (D. Rowe, 2006).

2.2.2.4 Implementation of citizenship education. Since 1997, moral education in England has been considered as just one aspect of citizenship education (Halstead & Pike, 2006). In 2002 citizenship education was included in the secondary curriculum of England and Wales (Arweck & Nesbitt, 2004; Cairns, 2003; Gundara, 2008) and character education was embedded in it (Revell & Arthur, 2007). Active citizenship education has been in operation in the Netherlands from 2005 (Leenders, Veugelers, & De Kat, 2008) and is ‘embedded in all school subjects and the school culture’ (Leenders & Veugelers, 2009, p. 22). In Germany and France, it is taught as a stand-alone subject and takes differing forms in Australia, Canada and England (Leenders & Veugelers, 2009). In Canada it is more in the form of civic education, in England as education for citizenship and in Australia, as part of the social studies curriculum that promotes critical thinking skills to develop social understanding (Davies & Issitt, 2005).

The International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) conducted the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS) 2009 (after projects conducted in 1971 and 1999) on civic and citizenship education (Brese, Jung, Mirazchiyski, Schulz, & Zuehlke, 2011; Fraillon, Schulz, & Ainley, 2012; Kerr, Sturman, Schulz, & Burge, 2010; Schulz, Ainley, Fraillon, Kerr, & Losito, 2010a, 2010b). ICCS 2009 reported on civic knowledge, attitudes, and engagement among lower-secondary school students in 38 countries. Teacher and school questionnaires gathered information about the contexts in which students learn about civics and citizenship, including teaching and classroom management practices, and school governance and climate. Findings suggest that there were different approaches to civic and citizenship education in the participating countries, with 20 countries including it as a specific subject in the curriculum. Civic and citizenship education covered knowledge and understanding of political institutions and concepts, such as human rights, as well as social and community cohesion, diversity, the environment, communications, and global society. It was also revealed that the majority of students endorsed democratic values, gender equality, and equal rights for ethnic or racial groups and immigrants, though this varied across countries.

2.2.3 Social Emotional Learning (SEL) and Social-Emotional and Character Development (SECD)

Social and Emotional Learning (SEL), is defined by Bar-On (1997, as cited in M. J. Elias, Parker, & Kash, 2007) as an ability to discover and communicate our own feelings and
emotions, understand the feelings of others and show respect for those feelings, control our own emotions in a positive way, and adjust our own attitude and behaviour to solve personal and social problems in a thoughtful way. The Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (CASEL) has advanced the five basic constructs of SEL, originally developed by Goleman (1998, as cited in M. J. Elias et al., 2007). The constructs are: self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, responsible decision making, and relationship management. CASEL has attached a set of emotional (intrapersonal) skills for the first two constructs, and social (interpersonal) skills for the others. SEL is viewed by CASEL as the process of developing social and emotional skills in the context of safe, caring, well-managed, and engaging learning environments (CASEL, 2005).

According to Elias et al. (2007), while Character Moral Education (CME) opts for ‘knowing the good’ and ‘right thinking’, it is SEL that develops the necessary attitudes and skills to solve problems in daily life. Based on the premise that human functioning is best developed under a balanced nourishment of mind, affect, and action (Lickona & Davidson, 2005), Elias et al. (2007) have combined Character Moral Education (CME) and SEL into a single concept, Social-Emotional and Character Development (SECD), which develops children’s personal, civic and problem solving skills and enables them to utilise these skills in everyday situations.

In addition to the above approaches, Religious Education, that is, using religious teachings or teaching world religions as a mode of imparting socially or culturally accepted values has long been in place and gained renewed interest and momentum in today’s globalised and multicultural world scenario (de Souza, 2005; J. L. Elias, 2008; Franzmann, 2003; Hindman, 2002; Lester & Roberts, 2009; Liddy, 2002; Terry Lovat, 2003, 2005a, 2006, 2010; Meakin, 1988; Mercer, 2002; Newton & Newton, 2006; Ng, 2002; Rosenblith, 2008; White, 2005). According to Gates (2006, p. 571), Religious Education is ‘a necessary complement’ to character education, citizenship education and/or moral education.

2.2.3.1 Close link between Values Education and SECD. Analysing the key concepts of the approach, Social-Emotional and Character Development (SECD), Dally (2010) has argued that SECD has a significant overlap with the guiding principles and effective strategies of values education in Australia. Values education in Australia not only encapsulates the development of the whole-child, including interpersonal and intrapersonal skills, it also entails the provision of a safe and supportive school environment where teachers scaffold the students’ values development and also model and enact the values in their own behaviours and classroom practices, offering a contextual support for what SECD aims to foster in children (Dally, 2010). In this study, the term ‘values education’ will encompass the concepts of both SECD and values education.
2.2.4 Relationship of Values Education to Other Approaches

This section first presents some accepted models and approaches for teaching values and then moves to the discussion of values education embedding the concepts of all other related educational approaches.

2.2.4.1 Values clarification model. Values clarification model (Raths, Harmin, & Simon, 1978) entails that individuals freely select from a range of alternatives where the consequences of each alternative need to be considered employing thoughtfulness. One then expresses willingness to affirm the chosen alternative publicly, followed by conducting repeated actions based on the choice and embedding it into personal life practices (Irwin, 1988).

2.2.4.2 Values analysis model. Values analysis differs from the values clarification model as this is commonly used with social issues that involve many people and viewpoints in contrast to values clarification guiding reflection on personal moral dilemmas (Hof & Dwyer, 1982). Thus, values analysis constitutes a way of helping students to examine other people’s values as well as examining their own. Values analysis requires the use of logical thinking skills to analyse different viewpoints about an issue. In its original form, values analysis involved a debate format following John Dewey’s step-wise reflective thinking strategy for problem solution, namely: 1) Is there a need for change in the status quo? Does a problem exist? What are the causes of the problem? Will solutions other than the affirmative proposal solve the problem? 2) Is the affirmative proposal practical? 3) Is the affirmative proposal desirable? Decision is the final step – will the affirmative proposal be accepted or denied? (Irwin, 1988).

2.2.4.3 Kohlberg’s moral development model. Kohlberg (1976) believed that moral development is a natural process that teachers can foster in children. As opposed to explicit teaching or values clarification techniques, he postulated six stages of moral development through which children and adults progressed (Kohlberg, 1976). Kohlberg claimed that his theory was both psychological and philosophical, and his findings generated a philosophy of moral education designed to stimulate moral development, rather than teach fixed moral rules (Kohlberg, 1987). Kohlberg’s (1976) study yielded six developmental stages allocated to three moral levels (pre-conventional, conventional and post-conventional). Building on his cognitive development theory, Kohlberg devised a moral education program called Just Community program that utilised age-appropriate (or stage-appropriate) discussions of moral dilemmas, democratic rule making, and the creation of a community context where students and teachers could act on their moral decisions (Hersh, Paolitto, & Reimer, 1979).
2.2.4.4 Values Reasoning. The ‘Value Reasoning’ approach to values education enables students to reason logically about values issues, that is to ‘think more clearly about their own and others’ value judgments, to examine value systems objectively, and to deal constructively with value conflict’ (Arcus, 1980, p. 163). Values reasoning and similar approaches may lead students to relate classroom experiences to hidden values and controversies and to judge them from an individual perspective (Hopwood, 2008).

The concepts underlying moral education and values education have been used interchangeably by some researchers (Kenan, 2009; Leming, 1993; Xiaoman, 2006; Zhao, 2005). However, values education is a more practical approach compared to moral education since it translates abstract moral principles into a form suitable for applying in daily life and, in addition to this, it provides ‘a critical understanding, analysis and evaluation’ of these moral principles (Zajda, 2009, p. xvii). While values education focuses on making accessible the particular values necessary for students’ practical wellbeing, moral education connotes a more ‘cognitive process’ (Veugelers, 2000, p. 38).

Halstead and Pike (2006) argue that ‘values are as central to Citizenship as to Moral Education’ and that ‘values permeate every aspect of the planning and the teaching of Citizenship Education’ (p. 23). Because values education can contribute to forming the personal, relational, and communal identities of citizens, it has the potential to be the vessel for citizenship education in the new century (Cheng, Lee, & Lo, 2006). For example, in Australia, values education serves individual learners for developing holistically as persons, as well as serving the community by promoting a sense of citizenship (Brown, 2007). In this way, both the private and public values (Halstead & Pike, 2006) of the learners are nurtured. Moreover, schools can explicitly teach the values underpinning moral and citizenship education using values education techniques, such as discussion with children, to develop their capacity for self-reflection (Halstead & Pike, 2006).

2.2.5 Conclusion

From the literature discussed in the preceding sections, it can be concluded that values education encompasses the knowledge and understanding of values (moral reasoning) which forms the basis of moral education; the necessary skills and dispositions which are enforced by character education and citizenship education; and the enactment of private values and public values, in a similar fashion as stressed by moral education and citizenship education, respectively. To summarise, all forms of education-character, moral, citizenship, and the like-
serve a common purpose, that is, forming good (moral) citizens for democratic societies (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006; Bergmark, 2008). Through values education, schools can cover all aspects of moral development, character development, and the teaching of civic and citizenship skills (Cheng et al., 2006; Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2007). Values education not only defines and clarifies values, it also requires teacher modelling and the provision of a safe environment for the learners to practise those values. Above all, values education is a whole-school approach which takes responsibility for the development of the whole-child.

2.3 Effectiveness of Values Education Programs

Social emotional learning and values education can significantly improve the academic outcome of students. Fostering self-awareness and self-management skills in a caring and supportive school environment promotes a strong sense of student responsibility and therefore an increased commitment to academic performance (Dally, 2010; M. J. Elias et al., 2007). Values Education has the potential to improve teachers’ commitment and confidence, student’s engagement in classroom and the nature of the overall learning environment. Blending Values Education good practices into a school’s philosophy can influence the school environment, students’ attitudes, and teacher-student as well as student-student relationships (DEST, 2006). Values education is essential in the educational enterprise because its embedding into schools can result in students’ ‘effective learning’, ‘wellbeing’ and ‘progress’ (Terry Lovat & Clement, 2008).

Research evidence suggests that student wellbeing, the essential outcome of schooling, can be achieved by values-driven best practice pedagogy (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010b). For instance, two types of values education pedagogies, namely ‘service learning’ and the ‘Socratic circle’ (details provided in Sections 2.6.4 and 2.6.9.5, respectively), have been shown to be effective in igniting the reflective and evaluative thinking skills of the learners, thus enabling them to behave as empathic social beings who are aware of their commitments to society and who respect social and cultural diversity (Terry Lovat, Toomey, Dally, & Clement, 2009a).

A study (Terry Lovat, Toomey, Dally, & Clement, 2009b) was conducted to gather empirical evidence regarding the effects of the Australian Government's Values Education Program on a number of school- and student-related factors, including students’ academic diligence, classroom ambience, school climate and relationships between and among students, staff and parents. The findings suggested that the values education endeavour in Australia
resulted in an increase in students’ academic diligence, a calmer school and classroom climate and improved relationships (Terry Lovat, Clement, Dally, & Toomey, 2011; Terry Lovat et al., 2009b). Drawing from the Australian Values Education experiences Lovat (2010) clearly shows that a common language for values education, a whole-school approach to it and ‘the nexus between quality teaching and values education’ (p. 10) positively affect the school climate, teaching and learning outcomes, relationships, as well as the wellbeing of both teachers and students, with an increase in students’ self-regulation behaviours and self-esteem. When the Living Values Education Program (LVEP) was implemented in some schools in the UK, the students of those schools self-reported an improvement in their behaviour and their awareness of the values of adults (Arweck & Nesbitt, 2004; Arweck et al., 2005). Using pedagogies like silent sitting, reflections in the classroom etc., the LVEP, significantly developed the communicative and the reflective capacity of the students, as a result of which, they could make judgements about their own values and behaviour (Hawkes, 2007). The students in these schools also learned how to achieve the power of self-management as their awareness of and respect for the emotions of peers contributed to their own coping strategies.

Research shows that good character education not only promotes the moral development of students, but also enhances their academic learning (Bergmark, 2008). For example, a study (Kunduroğlu & Babadoopan, 2010) conducted to assess the effectiveness of a values education program reported a significance difference between the experimental and the control group in ‘the cognitive behaviour’ of the participants - measured in terms of being ‘open-minded, unbiased, and scientific’ (p. 1287). In addition, the Child Development Project (CDP), a character education program in the USA, was also found to have enhanced students’ social as well as cognitive outcomes, and at the same time improved teacher self-assessment (Chang & Munoz, 2006). Another example can be given of a social skills program, ‘Connecting with Other: Lessons for Teaching Social and Emotional Competence’, that was perceived by the teachers to have improved the social skills of a group of students with disabilities (Richardson et al., 2009). Moreover, discussing the empirical evidence derived from two character education studies, Schwartz, et al. (2006) articulated that, “Effective character education not only improves school climate and student behaviour but also can lead to academic improvement.” (p. 25)

2.4 Philosophies, Principles and Practices of Values Education Programs
2.4.1 Introduction

As specified in Section 2.1, the purpose of this section is to tease out the underlying philosophies, principles and practices (e.g. curriculum and pedagogy) of various school-based programs aimed at fostering the values, moral and character development of children. Particular reference will be made to the guiding principles and key components of three programs including: one character education program in the US, the Character Education Partnership (CEP); one international values education program, the Living Values Educational Program (LVEP); and the Australian Federal Government’s Values Education initiatives, which will be referred to as Values Education in Australian Schools (VEAS) from this point onward. Findings from the literature are presented in the following sub-sections.

2.4.2 Introduction to the Three Programs

Since its inception in 1993, the CEP has been pioneering the character education movement in the USA (CEP, 2008), and is guided by the Eleven Principles of Effective Character Education (Lickona et al., 2007). LVEP is a specially developed values education program, which was founded in 1996 with help from UNICEF and the Brahma Kumaris. It is now spread over about 80 countries (LVEP, n.d.). Finally, in Australia, the Federal Government’s emphasis on values education was officially established in 2003 with the publication of the report, the Values Education Study (Lovat & Toomey, 2007). Later in 2005, the National Framework for Values Education in Australian Schools (DEST, 2005a) came into effect. A ‘ground up’ approach to identifying good practices of values education—as adopted by the schools—was used to develop the framework (Toomey, 2010). The framework serves as the basis for all values endeavours in Australian schools, providing the vision and the guiding principles of an effective values education program.

2.4.3 Holistic View towards Child, Education, Student Achievement and Student Wellbeing

A significant body of research in the past two decades has rejected the idea that the role of schools is solely to equip children with cognitive skills (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2007, 2010b). When children are considered as whole human beings, their ‘academic’ scaffolding and nourishment cannot be considered separately from their ‘social and emotional’ development (Comer, 1987, as cited in Cairns, 2003, p. 17). It is an imperative for the school charter to include the ‘skills of communication, empathy, reflection and self-management’ (Terry Lovat,
because education is expected to affect the ‘attitudes, values and beliefs’ of the learners (Cairns, 2003, p. 13).

The concepts underlying ‘Holistic Education’ entails that education should involve both the heart and mind of learners, relate the learning to ‘human experience’ and develop the ability to ‘think reflectively, imagine, dream, create, intuit, and emote’ (A. P. Johnson, 2010, p. xix). Four essential criteria of Holistic Education, as suggested by Ron Miller (1991, as cited in Johnson, 2010) are (a) developing the learner as a whole person, (b) creating a conducive learning environment supported by an equal relationship between and within students and adults, instead of a relationship based on power and authority; (c) linking the curriculum to the life experiences of learners; and (d) building the judgment and reasoning ability to critically examine and define values in cultural, social, and political contexts.

As an example, a practical approach to holistic education was adopted by Vasily Sukhomlinsky (1918–1970), one of the most influential Soviet educators. Sukhomlinsky established a school where students experienced diverse learning experiences designed to integrate the values of compassion and service with the aesthetic awareness regarding nature. Sukhomlinsky crafted a whole-school educational program that brought under one umbrella the various facets of physical, moral, aesthetic, intellectual and vocational education (Cockerill, 1999, 2011). Developing an aesthetic and moral mindset and a strong volition for physical labour and community services made this program unique.

Ongoing practices of measuring students’ progress and learning outcomes against only their performances in standardised tests have received criticism from researchers around the world. For example, the U.S. policy of No Child Left Behind (NCLB) has been criticised for its reductionist view of a child and education and the enormous pressure created upon students, teachers and parents due to the standardised tests. With the primary focus set on raising achievement in standardised tests, the ‘whole person’ development of a child is often ignored (Kohn, 2005; Noddings, 2005; Rothstein & Jacobsen, 2009). Kohn (2005) argues that in the present situation ‘some capabilities are privileged over others, and a broader approach to education is sacrificed’, thus losing the ‘sight of children’ (p. 20). Similarly, Noddings (2005) questions the viability of the NCLB policy and its ‘overdependence on standardized tests’ in measuring student achievement, given that the policy bypasses ‘the basic questions related to the proper aims of education, service of public schools in a democratic society and education of the whole child’ (p. 8). Apart from failing to accommodate the holistic view of children and their education, the standardised tests narrow the teaching-learning practices to simply preparing for tests, thereby blocking the creativity of students and teachers (Kohn, 2005). Another study (Brimi, 2009) points to a tension between the teachers' accountability to comply with the
national agenda of standardised tests and their moral responsibility to deliver the social and moral norms of the society. Brimi asserts that the reason why values and moral development receives relatively little attention in the educational agenda in the U.S. is that no valid measures have yet been developed to standardise students' learning of values and morality.

Similarly, articulating that ‘today's classrooms focus on topics that culminate in mandated tests, and there are no tests on justice’ (Brooks & Thompson, 2005, p. 48), Brooks and Thompson took a strong position against the textbook-based and test-based curriculum. According to these authors, such a limited view towards curriculum and classroom practices pays no heed to the wealth of ‘cultural capital’—a term coined by Pierre Bourdieu—that every student brings to the classroom, and students are left with very limited opportunities to share and express their ‘cultural capital’ (Brooks & Thompson, 2005).

The opposite side of the spectrum, that is, a holistic view towards learning and associated wellbeing is further emphasised by recent research. Student wellbeing is now viewed holistically from a three-dimensional perspective that comprises personal and emotional wellbeing (e.g. being productive to communities, self-esteem, self-knowledge), social wellbeing (‘communicative competence’) and intellectual wellbeing (‘think deeply, creatively and critically’) (Clement, 2010b; Toomey, Lovat, Clement, & Dally, 2010, p. xi). Clement (2010b) draws from relevant literature to show that student wellbeing at school largely depends on a number of school- and teacher-related factors including ‘school and classroom climate, teacher support and caring, student connectedness to school and values education’ (p. 37).

Pring (2010a) argued that educational thinking and curriculum design decisions that centre around high-stake tests, and are devoid of ‘social engagement’ of learners, are inherently flawed (p. xxiii). It should be the case that the qualities we expect of a ‘full’ human being should guide our educational decision making. Hence, pedagogical choices need to aim for the ultimate goal of developing a learners’ personal integrity and responsibility in wider social and global contexts (Pring, 2010a).

It is well established that students’ academic diligence and performance is maximised in an environment in which they feel connected and wherein their emotional wellbeing is supported (Osterman, 2010, as cited in Terence Lovat, 2011). The ‘Smart and Good Schools Model of Character Education’ (Davidson et al., 2010), for example, acknowledges the inherent moral aspects of the teaching and learning process, and, integrates the dual goals of achieving academic performance and moral development. Therefore, an effective values education is one that takes into account ‘the cognition/affect/sociality nexus’, that is the ongoing interplay between these three aspects of the teaching and learning environment and their combined influence on the emotional engagement with the learning that takes place (Clement, 2010a, p.
Because learning is constantly impacted upon by the immediate sociocultural environment, curriculum and pedagogy should aim to create a social ambience in the classroom where both emotion and cognition are attended to and promoted.

Clement (2010b) argued that ‘the motivation toward and the content of intellectual engagement’ largely depends on the learners’ ‘affective states’ (p. 39), and that the development of higher thinking skills is also strongly associated with the socio-cultural context of the learner. Hence, an effective values education pedagogy involves a whole-school, integrated approach to values teaching with particular attention to creating a caring and safe learning environment so that student wellbeing is insured in its entirety (Clement, 2010b).

Developing the whole person also received attention in the three programs. An effective character-development approach, according to the guiding principles of CEP, promotes the knowledge of, awareness of (feelings and love for values), and the enactment of values in personal and social lives (Lickona et al., 2007). Similarly, LVEP considers the potential of education in nourishing three aspects of human character: ‘thinking, feeling, valuing’. Growing as a whole person requires the emotional, intellectual, spiritual, and physical development and LVEP incorporates these four dimensions of learning (LVEP, 2009, p. 3). Likewise, VEAS recognises one of the good practices of values education as being the development of student agency, a concept which is based on the premise that, “Schooling educates for the whole child and must necessarily engage a student’s heart, mind and actions” (DEEWR, 2008, p. 40).

2.4.4 ‘Troika’ and its Relation to Student Wellbeing and Student Achievement

The recent research of Lovat and Associates introduces the ‘troika’ notion of values education which brings the pedagogical power of ‘quality teaching’ (intellect), ‘values education’ (emotion/affect/aesthetics) and ‘service learning’ (sociality) onto a single platform, thus catering for the aforementioned ‘cognition/affect/sociality nexus’ (Terence Lovat, 2010; Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a). ‘Troika’ is established on the three research foundations into the fields of neuroscience, social and emotional learning, and positive psychology. As explained by Curtis (2010), ‘the holistic conception of the troika’ comprises three important notions of effective learning and teaching: the link between ‘implicit and explicit teaching of values’, ‘specific dimensions of quality teaching’, and the practical implementation of values education through service learning (p. 108).
Lovat and Toomey refer to the notion of learning being a ‘mediated process’—introduced by Vygotsky (1978)—to argue that learning does not take place in a vacuum and, therefore, we cannot expect our children to be emotionally and socially intelligent without being given ample opportunities to experience ‘service learning’ (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a). The way ‘service learning’ supports holistic learning has been elaborated by Clement (2010a):

Service learning exposes students to situations beyond what they have previously experienced, thus broadening their outlook on ecological, social and educational issues. It provides an environment where students have to apply knowledge in concrete situations and thus are thrust into decision-making that draws upon their emotional and cognitive capacities. … Service learning is multi-sensory and encourages the cross-referencing of knowledge and its application in new and creative ways. … Moreover, service learning provides opportunities for mentoring and the modelling of values and, most of all, it offers students a supportive opportunity to consciously translate their values into concrete action and to reflect upon the outcomes of that action. (p. 30)

Toomey (2010) describes a service learning experience known as Student Action Teams (SATs), the members of which are actively engaged in discussing and solving problems that are usually drawn from the local community or the real life experiences of the students. This pedagogy increases student participation and engagement and has proven to be instrumental in instilling core values of care, compassion, cooperation and respect. Toomey suggests that this pedagogy poses deep intellectual and emotional challenges to the learners and at the same time accentuates their self-regulating behaviour, thereby creating a safe and supportive learning environment for all.

The inherent strength of a combination of ‘explicit value education’ and service learning lies in the fact that this approach ensures quality teaching with a focus on ‘whole person learning’ (Matthews, 2010) . As a result, both the students and the teachers are exposed to a range of values, skills and traits including ‘personal self-reflection, sense of responsibility, the importance of encouragement in the learning process, calmness, sense of wellbeing, self-discipline, self-concept, striving to achieve full academic potential and fostering healthier interpersonal relationships’ (Matthews, 2010, p. 196) .

The idea of values education being a ‘student wellbeing pedagogy’ is premised upon the Carnegie Task Force (1996) findings as well as the work of Fred Newmann (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a). According to the Carnegie report, ‘effective learning’ should be conceptualised as a combination of intellective development and the development of ‘communicative competence, empathic character, self-reflection and self-knowing’ (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a, p. 2). To achieve this form of effective learning, ‘effective teaching’ needs to embody the creation of a trustful and caring relationship between teachers and their students with student wellbeing placed at the heart of schooling. The renewed focus on values education
as a ‘student wellbeing pedagogy’ extends beyond the ‘moral’ dimension and incorporates ‘social, emotional, physical, spiritual and intellectual aspects of human development’ (p.2). It can also help to dispel a teacher’s assumptions around the possible negative impact of a students’ ability, family background or gender on their achievement and shift educators’ focus towards a teacher’s ability to positively influence student achievement (Terence Lovat, 2010).

As previously discussed, the student wellbeing pedagogy considers learning and academic success from a whole-person perspective rather than only focusing on the cognitive dimension of learning (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a). Drawing from the vast literature on learning theories, Lovat and Toomey have argued that cognitive or intellectual development should not be treated in isolation of ‘the physical, emotional and social ambience’ of learning. Recent research findings from the fields of neurosciences, philosophy and pedagogy emphasise that education should be viewed from a ‘holistic’ perspective because cognition, affect and social competency, as a combined force, propagate actions of human beings (Terence Lovat, 2011). Therefore, school and classroom experiences should be designed in a way that provides the learner with scaffolds for building knowledge, understanding and experiences related to values learning, and to achieve this, pedagogy should focus more on ‘service learning’ (Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a).

Pring (2010a) criticised the traditional approaches to moral and values education, such as Kohlberg’s (1976) moral dilemmas, Rath’s (Raths et al., 1978) ‘values clarification’, Poteet’s (1974) ‘behaviour modification’ or Mischel and Mischel’s (1976) ‘cognitive social-learning approach to morality’, for their narrow focus on student wellbeing (p. xx). He rationalised the preference for the ‘new values education’ on the premise that this holistic pedagogical approach values every individual for their disabilities or weaknesses, not just abilities, and helps them flourish to their full potential. Pring extends this discussion by arguing that the creation of a social and democratic school environment enriched by trustful relationships, where opportunities are available for learners to live by the virtues they learn, is the key to ensuring students’ intellectual, emotional and social wellbeing (Pring, 2010a).

### 2.4.5 Determination of Values and Skills and their Explicit Articulation in School Policies

Both LVEP and VEAS emphasise that values should be placed at the centre of schooling and mentioned explicitly in a values education policy and/or the school vision statement (DEST, 2005a; LVEP, 2009). It is prescribed in all three programs that the whole school community — staff, students, parents and local community members — should jointly develop the school’s
core values. These ‘universal values’ should not be limited to any race or culture, and need to be defined unambiguously in the school values statement (DEST, 2005a; Lickona et al., 2007; LVEP, 2009).

It is relevant to mention that D. Rowe (2006) criticised school behaviour policies in England as they lacked a meaningful incorporation of collaborative practices like ‘discussion and negotiation’ within daily school practices. The author stresses that in order for a behaviour policy to nurture the value of personal responsibility among students, an explicit link between the policy and ‘moral development and citizenship education’ should be established. This can be achieved through posing cognitive challenges in relation to the behavioural expectations from the students and positioning the learning within the citizenship context of the school life (D. Rowe, 2006).

CEP follows the principle that core human values such as honesty, trustworthiness, care, compassion, fairness and justice help children grow as good human beings and moral citizens, while performance values such as critical thinking, diligence, perseverance and commitment to work enable children to enact the core values and achieve the best in their academic and professional life (CEP, 2008; Lickona, 1996; Lickona et al., 2007). LVEP nurtures self-reflection by bringing learners in contact with twelve universal values selected for the program (Hawkes, 2007; Shea & Murphy, 2007). VEAS strives to develop students’ personal and social skills, judgements and planning ability, civics and citizenship understanding and skills, understanding of their relation to the school and wider community, and a sense of confidence, achievement and self-esteem (DEST, 2005b).

Each core value, in the CEP, is represented to children as a set of behavioural traits (Lickona et al., 2007). Similarly in LVEP, when students enter the school, they are provided with an expected model of behaviour, which is deemed important in values education (Hawkes, 2007). LVEP not only requires the core values to be in accord with the school context and the needs of its members, the school also needs to set principles for the adults guiding their behaviour, teaching-learning activities, and their relationship with other adults and students (Hawkes, 2007).

2.4.6 Whole School Approach

Robinson and Campbell (2010) conducted school-based research on effective pedagogy for gifted and talented students in England. The authors investigated how effectively the teachers in two case-study schools supported students’ independent learning and an inclusive classroom environment and what influences the school values exerted on classroom pedagogy (p. 77). The case-study schools shared similar goals of values achievement and implemented explicit
rewarding and appreciation as well as implicit modelling by adults through their daily school functioning. The teachers were well aware of the backgrounds and learning abilities of the children and bore a respectful and caring attitude to all. The school policy and culture supported ‘independent learning’ and ‘inclusiveness’ through a whole-school practice of respectful relationships between teachers and students and creating a climate where both teachers and students felt valued. The success of the schools values education program was attributed to the school’s philosophy of holistic development of children as well valuing children and their views to the same extent as those of adults, thus providing the children with a positive schooling experience (Robinson & Campbell, 2010).

According to CEP’s guiding principles, a school’s commitment to promoting core values should be visible and deliberately included in all aspects of schooling; not just in academic curriculum, but also in the hidden curriculum and extra-curricular programs (CEP, 2008; Lickona et al., 2007). The elements of the hidden curriculum include school management and discipline policies, the relationships between members of the school community, the provision of a safe and caring classroom environment, and the interactions of students with peers or teachers in all portions of the school campus. Moreover, the core values that the students are expected to learn and practise can be communicated regularly in extra-curricular activities such as sports, daily assemblies, clubs, and the like (CEP, 2008; Lickona et al., 2007).

LVEP’s core principles and the blueprint for values education stress the need for engaging the whole school community in the values journey (Hawkes, 2001; LVEP, 2009; Shea & Murphy, 2007). Teachers should have regular and intimate connections with the parents to share all values activities, progress, and outcomes. LVEP also provides training for parents and invites them in dialogues and forums to share their values experiences (Hawkes, 2007). It is important to note that parental involvement in school’s policy making and activities is essential when the effective implementation of a character education program is concerned (Berkowitz & Bier, 2005). The empirical evidence of the positive effects of community involvement on students’ values learning were reported by Hands (2008) in a qualitative study of a secondary school in southern Ontario with a number of school-community partnership programs. It was shown that through community partnership activities, not only ‘the students enhanced their skill sets and were exposed to diverse community values’, but also their ‘civic responsibility’ was promoted and ‘social capital’ strengthened (Hands, 2008, p. 50).

The whole-school approach is also elaborated in the Values for Australian Schooling Professional Learning Resources. This approach includes the whole school community, expecting them to participate and cooperate actively in the values formation of children (DEST, 2005b). Starting from the school vision and/or mission statement that controls all planning and
activity in the school, and the policies and programs that work as a skeleton of the school operation, this approach suggests that all teaching-learning experiences in and outside the classroom and all aspects of schooling are designed to teach and model the values and to have the students practise those values whenever possible. Moreover, this approach of values education includes the bigger world outside the school community (DEST, 2005b).

The proposal that delivering only knowledge on social and emotional skills cannot be effective, without a proper amalgamation of daily practices in a school context, has been supported by research findings (e.g. G. Johnson, Poliner, & Bonaiuto, 2005; Titus, 1994). Along with explicitly teaching skills, there should be modelling, appreciation and practise of these skills. The adopted and reinforced school practices, as described in the study (G. Johnson et al., 2005), included 'gatherings', 'cooperative groups', and changing 'School Routines and Schedules' with the latter eventually changing the learning environment. Gathering took place in the forms of Morning Meetings, Circles, mentor groups, etc. providing 'a structured opportunity for students to get to know one another, to feel explicitly welcomed, to shape the classroom culture, and to learn such social skills as cooperation, communication, and self-restraint' and resulted in 'more cohesive, cooperative, and productive classrooms' (p. 60). Cooperative groups were used to teach, practise and assess social skills such as 'listening, encouraging, leading, sharing, strategizing, and reflecting on the group process and individual contributions.' (p. 61). These groups increased tolerance and conflict-resolution ability. Changes in school routines were introduced to give increased opportunities for practice of social and emotional skills. Strategies included bringing recess time before lunch time so 'students can expend some energy, eat in less of a rush, and use lunchtime to calm down before going back to class' (p. 62); ensuring consistency between disciplinary learning from both the 'recess teacher' and the 'classroom teacher'; and increasing class times for core subjects so students had more opportunities to socialise and practise social and emotional skills (G. Johnson et al., 2005).

2.4.7 Explicit Articulation of Values through Meaningful and Challenging Curriculum

In schools, the best way of implementing values education is to integrate it into classroom pedagogy and into the school curriculum (Cummings et al., 1991, as cited in Zajda, 2009). In curriculum and pedagogy values can take three forms: as content, when students learn about different values; as process, when students engage in activities and experience values; and as application, when students apply their values-based knowledge and skills in solving problems (DEEWR, 2009, p. 7). Nielsen (2005) urges for a careful integration of social and moral values
into curriculum and pedagogy by providing the students with ample opportunities to ‘actively and critically construct’ values, adopting ‘imaginative teaching’ to engage learners’ emotions, and teaching values through ‘activity and doing’ as well as modelling (p. 39).

For a character education program to be effective, CEP requires that the teachers pay attention to the inherent skills, ability, and interests of individual students, and develop and implement diversified teaching strategies that best address student need. Moreover, the school curriculum should increase student interest and involvement, ensure active participation of all students, and support academic competence by developing; ‘thinking habits’ (curiosity, critical thinking etc.), ‘work-related habits’ (hard-work, determination etc.) and ‘social habits (e.g. cooperation, responsibility, honesty etc.) (CEP, 2008, p. 10; Lickona et al., 2007).

In a values-based learning environment, values are integrated into all key learning areas rather than values education being treated as an extra curriculum module (DEST, 2005a; LVEP, 2009). CEP urges that values-content be included explicitly in academic subjects, so the teachers can build ‘character connections’ between the academic content and the character traits they want to develop in students, and students—through co-operative learning and problem-solving activities—can discuss various ethical issues embedded into the subjects. Moreover, any unethical behaviour of students is addressed by referring to values and associated expectations about behaviour (Lickona et al., 2007).

LVEP stresses that schools have the responsibility of ‘values formation and inculcation’ that should not be limited to passive ways of teaching values; rather, schools should present a tangible model for being moral in the form of a values education curriculum which will bridge the gap between ‘saying’ (school ethos) and ‘doing’ (values in practice). According to Hawkes (Hawkes, 2007, pp. 126-127), values should be placed explicitly at the centre of all teaching-learning activities. LVEP schools select for each month one core value, introduce that value in the school assembly, and make that value the monthly theme for all values-lessons, visual demonstrations in and outside the classrooms, and an information focus for parents (Hawkes, 2001).

The strong focus, placed by VEAS, on values being explicit is evident in the Australian Government’s Values Education Good Practice Schools Project (VEGPSP) Stage 2 report, as it says, ‘values-based schools live and breathe a values consciousness. They become schools where values are thought about, talked about, taught about, reflected upon and enacted across the whole school in all school activities’ (DEEWR, 2008, p. 37). In the experience of these schools, explicit teaching means referring to values explicitly in the classroom, in co-curricular activities, in key documents, and in all school programs and ceremonies. Explicit classroom teaching may occur when: teachers devote classroom time for a part of the curriculum that deals
specifically with values, beliefs, worldviews, spiritual systems and philosophy; hang values
posters in classrooms to make frequent references to these; discuss role models; and reflect on
values achievements (DEST, 2005b).

Finally, it should be noted that neurosciences literature strongly supports the need for
engaging multiple senses of learners through carefully selected teaching materials and
techniques as this helps them personalise the learning (Clement, 2010a). When multiple senses
are activated during learning, stronger connection with the material to be learned is created
resulting in improved memorisation and recall ability. Likewise, showing the explicit
connections between new and previously learned material, and the relevance of the content to
the learners’ lives, created a long-lasting effect of the learning, thus leading to improved
creativity (Clement, 2010a).

2.4.8 Implicit Modelling of Values by Teachers and Creation of a Safe,
Supportive Learning Environment

The long held belief, as supported by researchers like Talcott Parsons, Christopher Jencks
and Plowden, that undermined the potential of schooling in steering student achievement, has
proven to be flawed by the array of research throughout the past two decades (Clement, 2007;
Terry Lovat, 2007; K. Rowe, 2004). For example, the work of Fred Newmann (1996) and Linda
Darling-Hammond (1997, 2000, & Youngs, 2002), as cited in (Clement, 2007) and (Lovat,
2007), centre the power of pedagogy and the technical as well as relational competence of the
teachers at the heart of affecting student achievement.

The potential factor behind quality teaching is how effectively students can learn, which
entails a teacher considering a student’s ability and understandings, thus making a values link
between the efforts made for learning on the part of the student (Terry Lovat & Clement, 2008).
The teacher’s attitudes and practices help in improving student achievement by establishing an
environment of mutual respect, care and relational trust. In such an environment students feel
cared for and know what it is that they ought to learn (Terry Lovat, 2007). Mutual respect and
empathic relationships also contribute to the welfare of the stakeholders and the ambience in a
school (Terry Lovat & Clement, 2008). It is evident that the moral and long-term personal
development of students can be achieved through a blend of Values Education and Quality
Teaching since a values-based curriculum acts as a companion to a quality teacher in his or her
endeavour towards educating children ethically and socially (Terry Lovat, 2005b; Terry Lovat
& Clement, 2008).
The modelling of values by the teachers and the nature of student-teacher interactions play a crucial role in values education, because ‘a degree of learning occurs unconsciously and by imitation’ (Clement, 2010a, p. 27). The social context of the learning environment, that is, the instances of values exposed through the interactions with teachers as well as the beliefs and values dispositions of the teachers themselves determine the breadth and depth of students’ values learning (Clement, 2010a). To relate the impact of a teacher’s personal character on a student’s mind, Carr (2007) commented that ‘we remember teachers as much for the kinds of people they were than for anything they may have taught us’ (p. 369). He identified the ‘qualities of personal character’ of the teachers to be an utterly significant professional value. Similarly, Sullivan (2007) commented that, ‘Students may or may not study lessons, but they certainly study the teacher.’ (p. 106). Therefore, the teachers expecting their pupils to behave ethically should first model themselves as ‘persons of character’ (Lumpkin, 2008, p. 45) and reflect on their own values and morals (Mergler, 2008).

This view can be further supported by a large body of research findings. Based on the argument of Nel Noddings (1992, as cited in Lumpkin, 2008) that moral education is truly achieved when teachers care for their students, Lumpkin (2008) put special emphasis on teachers’ teaching and modelling values. According to this author, teachers’ modelling of honesty, respect, responsibility, trust and fairness can motivate the students to shape their character morally. To elaborate, teachers can model honesty by sticking to the rules and guidelines, keeping personal and professional promises, and being fair in financial matters. Similarly, students begin to trust their teachers and seek mental support from them after gaining the confidence that the teacher will act consistently following the promises made. Moreover, a fair teacher treats each student equally and cares for the individuals’ rights in relation to learning. Finally, teachers should show respect to all students irrespective of their ability and intellect, should be responsible in their professional endeavours, as well as teach students how to think and behave responsibly (Lumpkin, 2008). In a similar manner, arguing that ‘teachers can have a moral impact on their students’ (Hansen, 1993, p. 397), Hansen considered ‘shared morality’ (Hansen, 1992) and ‘moral assumptions’ (Hansen, 1989, p. 259) held by the students and teachers in a classroom setting as having a significant role in making the teaching and learning meaningful.

Curtis (2010) cited a number of studies (such as, Hattie, 2003; Hayes, Mills, Christie, & Lingard, 2006; and Rowe, 2004), to illustrate the view that teachers spend a reasonably long time with their students inside classrooms and, therefore, their classroom practices need to be under continuous scrutiny in order to ensure high quality teaching. Similarly, Hackett & Lavery (2010) concluded from a substantial literature review that quality teaching or the qualities expected of a teacher is measured not only against the commitment to the vocation or teaching
competencies; good teachers should also possess ‘relational qualities’ and be able to build positive learning environments and relationships by teaching and modelling core values. In an empirical study (NICHD Early Child Care Research Network, 2005), positive classroom environment and emotional and academic support provided by the teacher appeared to have significantly influenced student performance and was therefore identified as an inevitable part of quality teaching.

Carr (2010) argued that there are hardly any distinctions between publicly expected private and professional qualities of a teacher, because what is conceived of as good qualities of a person also represent those of a teacher; e.g. friendliness, caring and empathetic attitude, approachable personality etc. According to Carr, a teacher devoid of a caring attitude towards students and their learning fails to turn the learning experiences to an active and dynamic meaning-making process. Carr (2010) also extends the notion of authority of a teacher beyond the traditional view of ‘social control’ and articulates that ‘the better part of pedagogical authority is clearly grounded in the deep human respect that really good teachers have for their pupils and in the climate of pupil respect and trust that they are in turn successful in generating on this basis’ (p. 70). In his opinion, a good teacher should be able to ‘establish positive personal relationships with pupils’ (p. 73).

Lumpkin (2008) puts the virtue 'integrity' (page 46) at the centre of good character. She also explains how teachers can motivate their students to morally shape character, by the means of modelling honesty, respect, responsibility, trust and fairness. For example, teachers become models of honesty when they follow the rules and guidelines, keep personal and professional promises or show fairness in financial matters. It is the responsibility of the teachers to interrupt an activity that represents a dishonest act of a student, following an explicit discussion on what it means to be honest or dishonest. Similarly, given that trust originates from confidence, students begin to trust a teacher when they become confident that the words and actions of that teacher are congruent. Students also become open to that teacher and relies upon him or her mentally and emotionally (Lumpkin, 2008).

Finally, the three programs in question are all based on the premise that relationships in school should be scaffolded by a sense of respect and care, providing a safe and supportive school environment for students so they develop social, as well as self-management skills, and feel safe and secure in exploring their own values, in acting out these values, and in developing the capacity to take responsibility for local, national and global issues (DEST, 2005a; Lickona et al., 2007; Shea & Murphy, 2007).
2.4.9 Values-focused Pedagogy

There prevails a philosophical debate in the literature concerning the risk of indoctrination created through explicit or direct teaching of values versus the ‘disconnection’ between personal values and socially expected values that indirect or implicit teaching may cause (Irwin, 1988). Helwig, Ryerson and Prencipe (2008) inform that three competing approaches to teaching values, namely the cognitive-developmental/constructivist approaches (e.g. Kohlberg’s moral development model), character education and values clarification (Raths et al., 1978), have dominated the values education literature. Schuitema, ten Dam, and Veugelers (2008) closely looked at the ‘how’ of moral education, that is the instructional scaffolding, prevailing in secondary schools during the period, 1995-2003. Problem-based cooperative teaching strategies, service learning and other techniques including drama, role play etc. were the predominant teaching strategies extracted from the literature. The authors contend that there is an underlying gap between the theory and practice of moral education and points to a research gap in relation to integrating moral education into subject areas (Schuitema et al., 2008).

The role of teachers in teaching values was regarded by Veugelers (2000) as being both ‘participants and coaches’ (p. 44); they are guided by their own values dispositions while making curriculum and pedagogical decisions. It requires them to become explicit about the values they want to teach and also to reflect on their interactions with students (Veugelers, 2000). According to Halstead and Pike (2006), children learn moral and citizenship values in schools from four sources: direct instruction, participation in action, critical reflection and observation. Here, the first three sources are discussed, with observation being discussed in the section 2.6.10.

**Direct instruction.** Values can be taught through ‘systematic and explicit’ instructional strategies such as discussion, problem solving, co-operative learning, and the portraying of virtues through real life stories or fictions (Halstead & Pike, 2006, p. 141). Values should not be imposed on learners, rather they should be discussed (Zajda, 2009). Without taking a ‘prescriptive’ stance, values educators can present to learners the complex mechanisms of the world, so that the learners develop the capacity for making judgements about how they want to live, based on their own understanding of values (Wringe, 2003, p. 48). Therefore, classroom discussion and interaction are necessary for students to analyse moral or political issues and to utilise and question their own moral understanding. Teachers need to ensure that students are expressing themselves honestly and openly and not just conforming to what teachers might perceive as ‘correct’ responses (Halstead & Pike, 2006).

**Participation in guided action.** Arthur and Wright (2001, as cited in Halstead & Pike, 2006) describe three different ways that students can develop their understanding of values
through ‘experiential learning’. These include: (a) ‘simulations’, such as ‘mock elections’ and ‘mock trials’; (b) ‘involvement in school activities’, such as developing school and classroom rules, debating school policies in the School Council, and engaging in Peer Mediation; and (c) ‘extra-curricular involvement’ in Community Service Projects (Halstead & Pike, 2006, p. 146). Through extra-curricular activities it is possible to develop essential citizenship skills, such as co-operation, respect, conflict-resolution, leadership, and a sense of responsibility to the wider community. Service learning, that is, learning from school or community services, is an effective source for developing citizenship skills (Gage, 2004). Moreover, service learning was designated as a teaching scaffold that provides teachers with opportunities for ‘mentoring and the modelling of values’ and students with acting and reflecting on their values (Clement, 2010a, p. 30).

Critical reflection. Johnson (2010) defines thinking skill as ‘a cognitive process broken down into a set of explicit steps which are then used to guide thinking’ (p. 140). Critical thinking includes the methods of and attitudes towards ‘problem solving, decision making, inquiry, or higher-order thinking’ (Bataineh & Alazzi, 2009, p. 55). Inferring, comparing and contrasting, analysing, support-a-statement activities, decision making (originality, cost and benefits, reach solution), ordering, and evaluation/critique are critical thinking skills (Johnson, 2010).

To be effective, citizenship and moral education requires that participation in school or community activities be followed by ‘critical reflection and discussion’ (Halstead & Pike, 2006, p. 148). A moral education endeavour also needs to consider the simultaneous development of critical thinking ability and emotional intelligence among the children (Wonderly, 2009). Veugelers (2000) considered critical thinking a combination of cognitive skills and dispositions, and a process-oriented approach which is directed towards the development of the skill of ‘logical thinking’ (p. 38).

Critical thinking skills that are necessary to be able to reflect on one’s own action include:

… the ability to interpret, analyse and evaluate ideas and arguments, to recognize false assumptions and conclusions, to assess the validity of generalizations, to distinguish between relevant and irrelevant information, to see through bias and propaganda, to use evidence impartially, to assess the strengths and weaknesses of an argument, and to draw justifiable conclusions. (Halstead & Pike, 2006, p. 150)

Classroom provisions like Circle Time and Philosophy for Children, at primary level, and debates, discussions, and activities for rational decision-making and reflection, at secondary level, are aimed at having students think critically and reflect on their beliefs, values and experiences. For example, when participating in Circle Time activities, all students get an equal opportunity to give voice to their feelings and ideas, and thus learn to: respect others’ opinions;
develop qualities like co-operation, empathy and care; and together form a shared culture in the classroom (Halstead & Pike, 2006).

The following discussion of pedagogies, used by the three programs, reveals that these pedagogies match the activities Halstead and Pike (2006) suggest for teaching moral and citizenship values.

Suggestions from CEP include: applying classroom strategies such as values lessons, discussions, observations and problem-solving activities in order to engender values knowledge; forging relational skills and ability for self-reflection in order to build values awareness; and using pedagogies like co-operative learning and role-plays for students to live the values in classroom activities and interactions (Lickona et al., 2007). After the staff members clearly express their expectations about the roles and responsibilities of students in the form of expected skills and behaviour, it is necessary that they arrange activities such as co-operative learning, tutoring to other students, service projects to school and community and, service learning, because regular participation in these activities will provide opportunities for repeated moral action and reflection and eventually the students will be habituated to act morally (CEP, 2008; Lickona et al., 2007).

Values Education is interpreted by LVEP as a blend of (a) receiving information on values, (b) reflecting internally to foster a love and respect for values, and (c) developing the necessary skills and attitudes to act out the learned values (Shea & Murphy, 2007). LVEP provides values stimuli such as real-life stories, pictures, and role-plays to discover values and reflect on them through debate and discussion (Shea & Murphy, 2007). It also nurtures the soundness of students’ inner-world in a distinctive manner by placing the students in silence amidst a calm and quiet environment to develop their capacity for self-reflection and self-awareness (Hawkes, 2007). Since the program’s emphasis is on developing the skill of self-reflection, the teachers adopt teaching strategies such as ‘silent-sitting, active listening…ethical dilemmas’, all commonly referred to as ‘philosophy for children’ (Hawkes, 2001, 2007). These activities provide the learners with an opportunity to discover their own and others’ emotions, to reflect on these and communicate about them with others.

In a similar fashion, VEAS necessitates the use of values-centred pedagogies that place students at the centre of all activities, teach values explicitly, respect all students, and create a positive environment for student voices to be heard. These pedagogies also provide room for communicating feelings and thoughts about values, and acting out these values by practical and meaningful actions. Most importantly, the pedagogies foster the ability of students to relate what they learn to their real life experiences (DEEWR, 2008). Some of the powerful values-focused pedagogies that mediate student learning are Philosophy in the Classroom, Socratic
Philosophy in the Classroom. The central idea behind this pedagogy, similar to what Fisher (2003) denotes as ‘philosophical enquiry’, is questioning about a topic and attempting to answer the questions by discovering various ideas and opinions around that topic. The teacher introduces the problematic issue as a story or in a visual form, and encourages students to discuss their personal views on the issue with their peers, and pose reasoned arguments to clarify their own position. In this way students become aware of the existence of differing stances on an issue, learn to listen to others carefully and respectfully, and practice expressing their own feelings and thoughts in a constructive way, while accepting changes to these as an influence of others' views. This pedagogy promotes tolerance, respect, inclusion, and the skills of critical thinking and reflection (DEEWR, 2008). Curtis (2010) refers to this approach of building thinking skills as enabling children to ‘think for themselves’.

Socratic Circles. Socratic Circles are suitable for middle and upper secondary year students. This pedagogy requires forming two circles, one inside another, where the students in the inner circle discuss a controversial, values-oriented topic, while those in the outer circle examine the individuals' attitudes and behaviour during discussion, and evaluate the depth of argument, and the strengths and weaknesses of the way individual students represent their thoughts on values. Finally, the inner-circle students are provided with feedback from these observations. This activity helps students identify stereotypes and possible sources of values conflicts, as well as developing self-confidence in articulating one’s own thoughts and developing respect for the opinions of others (DEEWR, 2008).

Student Action Teams (SAT’S) and Values Action Teams (VAT’s). Forming SAT’s and VAT’s is a very effective way to empower students as they take full responsibility for identifying an issue in the school or community and planning, carrying out and managing tasks addressing that issue on the principle that they have the right and ability to make informed decisions when their own and community interests are involved. The speciality of this pedagogy is that it provides opportunities for not only researching a problem and finding possible solutions but SAT members are also required to implement the best solution. Since all decisions and actions are to be based on values, SAT members learn to transfer their knowledge and understanding of values into actions. This pedagogy develops resilience, self-confidence and leadership skills among the students. VAT is an extended form of SAT that includes parent participation in addition to that of students and staff, and functions as a steering work-group for values education within a school community (DEEWR, 2008).
Toomey (2010) presents a case-study of implementing Student Action Teams (SATs) in a ‘values school’ included in the Australian Government’s National Values Education Programme. The pedagogy explicitly taught values and supported the notion of ‘student wellbeing pedagogy’ through a common language of values, positive student-teacher relationships, teachers’ modelling of values, and translation of values to service learning experiences (p. 19). The ten selected students for the SAT were introduced to the core values and their meanings, shared this learning with their peers, and then were involved in determining the set of core values for the school upon consultation with the school community. The twelve values identified by the SAT then permeated all explicit values education endeavours taken in that school. In the process of conducting the research, the SAT members ‘buddied up’ with senior citizens in a nearby retirement village and engaged in ‘reciprocal learning’ through helping the senior citizens learn some computer skills and getting to know themselves the life histories of their counterparts (p. 29). This pedagogy catered for an improved school ambience, increased student participation and agency, and enhanced critical thinking and self-regulating skills evident among the students (Toomey, 2010).

*Values for Australian Schooling Professional Learning Resources – Primary* (DEST, 2005b) suggests some other co-curricular and extra-curricular programs which also involve the practical application of values in meaningful contexts such as school assemblies, sports activities, community councils to work with local government, student leadership programmes involving school decision-making, buddy programmes, peer mediation and student fundraising activities, etc. The cluster schools involved in the Values Education Good Practice Schools Project – Stage 1 implemented a variety of activities including newsletter articles, web pages, discussion groups and small forums, surveys, PowerPoint® presentations, school billboard messages, raps, emails, informal conversations, songs, special whole school learning experiences, posters, etc.

### 2.4.10 Implicit Teaching of Values

As the LVEP Blueprint for values education suggests, in addition to explicit teaching of values the core values should be displayed in posters and in other visual forms, inside classrooms as well as other places in the school (Hawkes, 2001). LVEP urges that the teachers, prior to teaching values, identify their own values, attitudes and behaviours, as well as their social and cultural beliefs and practices, as these factors are crucial in the teachers’ ability to represent themselves to the students as models. Moreover, the teachers need to be conscious of the impact their beliefs, values and attitudes may have on the students and hold in themselves and live the values they want to teach (Hawkes, 2001; Shea & Murphy, 2007). Since values are very much ‘caught’, the teachers, need to be aware of their responsibility in modelling the core
values, showing appropriate respect and care to students, and encouraging good deeds (Hawkes, 2007, p. 124).

VEAS vision and principles echo the same idea. In order that coordination is established between what students experience in school life and what they learn in values lessons, the core values should be modelled by both the adults and the students in their behaviour and in interpersonal relationships (DEEWR, 2008).

What Halstead and Pike (2006) denoted as learning by observation is very similar to the idea of implicit learning of values. Students learn values when they observe their teachers, the school rules and school environment, and the democratic activities taking place in the school. Day-to-day interactions between teachers and students contribute to forming a shared set of values, and teachers have the potential to indirectly influence their students’ value dispositions. Daily school assemblies, where various religious practices and moral issues are mentioned, student achievement acknowledged, and a sense of school community strengthened, are a good source for students to learn about values. Students also learn from the regular classroom rituals. Therefore, the physical environment of the school and the classroom should be such that the students find it friendly, welcoming, encouraging, and supportive of their participation. Students also learn from observing the school ethos. This includes the vision and mission of the school, the way the members in a school community communicate and socially interact, and the policies and programs a school undertakes in order to maintain discipline and the well-functioning of the school. Ethos also includes ‘attitudes and expectations of teachers, teacher morale, student morale, ways of conflict resolution, … degree of student involvement in the school’ as well as the ‘management styles, the extent to which students are listened to and respected, behaviour in the playground and on the way to and from school, power-structures, [and] decision-making processes’ (p. 144). In this way, the schools acting as a small replica of the whole nation provide the students with opportunities to harness their citizenship skills. Schools should also provide a balance between what students learn in their classrooms about democratic living and decision-making, and what they observe in the operations of the school. Citizenship lessons would be more meaningful if students can engage in—and not just observe—the democratic activities inside school (Halstead & Pike, 2006).

2.4.11 Embedding Values Education into Teacher Education Programs

For pre-service and in-service teachers to be able to impart values effectively through curricular and co-curricular provisions, and thus ensuring quality teaching and learning, it is an imperative that they receive ample education and training on the teaching of values (Macqueen, 2009; Zdenek & Schochor, 2007). Zdenek and Schochor (2007) particularly point to the
importance of developing ‘moral awareness’ and ‘moral literacy’ among the prospective teachers, and of designing the teacher education programs with a bottom-up approach. It is also important that teacher educators show congruent teaching by modelling the kind of teaching they expect their student teachers to adopt in classrooms (Swennen, Lunenberg, & Korthagen, 2008).

Recognition of the link between cognition, emotion, and sociality, for achieving the whole person development through holistic education, has been noted as ‘the new foundations for teacher education’ by Lovat, Dally, Clement and Toomey (2011). This section presents a collection of studies that made a case for applying, and/or applied, the principles of ‘troika’, that is values education, quality teaching and service learning, to specific teacher education programs.

Matthews (2010), for example, reported a case-study of applying the ‘troika’ metaphor of values pedagogy in a secondary pre-service teacher education course. The design of the teacher education course highlighted the pedagogical knowledge and skills for building ‘positive classroom interactions and relationships’ because a positive classroom environment is key to achieving ‘successful whole person – centred learning’ (p. 197). The overarching goal was to build ‘a transformative capacity’ (p. 199) in the pre-service teachers that steers them towards building a trust-based, caring and respectful learning environment rather than a traditional, control-focused one, to better support student learning and achievement (Matthews, 2010).

Hackett and Lavery (2010) argued that a prerequisite to embarking on a journey of enhancing students’ whole-person learning through caring and trustful relationships is to develop a teaching disposition enriched with care, sympathy, empathy and integrity. According to these authors, to achieve this, pre-service teachers need to be given opportunities to discover and critically examine their inner self and their predisposition to the vocation of teaching, as well as orient themselves to a caring and empathetic personality. Deep, personal experiences of connecting with community and taking caring and leadership roles during pre-service education contribute towards such self-discovery and self-actualisation resulting in attributes expected of a quality teacher (Hackett & Lavery, 2010).

An example of a service learning component in pre-service teacher education is the Queensland University of Technology service learning program which required fourth-year Bachelor of Education students to complete a non-paid service learning component in addition to the practicum or internship (Carrington, Mercer, & Kimber, 2010). The students gathered ‘transformational learning experiences’ as well as learning to ‘question, deconstruct and then reconstruct knowledge’ in relation to their future vocation (p. 75). Another study (Mergler, 2008) took the Queensland pre-service teacher education as a case to argue that for teachers to
be successful as values and moral educators, the teacher education they receive should be designed to provide transformative learning experiences for these to-be teachers. This study argues that in order for teachers to be able to teach values explicitly, the teacher education programs should incorporate explicit values statements and provide student teachers with opportunities to critically examine and contribute to the values that underpin the pre-service program, and judge the beliefs and behavioural practices of their own and others to understand the underlying relationship of values to beliefs and practices. Through such an explicit incorporation of moral education in pre-service teacher education programs, future teachers would gain the necessary knowledge, skills and professional confidence to transform their learning into classroom practices (Mergler, 2008).

2.5 Summary

The literature review presented in this chapter delineated some key terms, concepts and principles in relation to school-based values education endeavours. Some of the extracted themes will be used to formulate the methodological and analytical frameworks for this study. These include i) the formulation of explicit values policies reflecting the values preferences of the key persons involved; ii) a whole-person perception of children’s development, education and achievement; iii) the explicit articulation and implicit teaching and modelling of values; iv) the adoption of values-focused pedagogies aimed at developing students’ critical thinking skills, problem solving and decision making ability; v) the creation of safe, supportive learning environments; and vi) the incorporation of all the preceding themes into teacher education programs. The research design centred on the exploration of these key themes in educational policies and practices in Bangladeshi primary schools and the associated findings will be presented in the following chapters.
CHAPTER 3:
METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

In Chapter Two, a literature review on the best practices and guiding principles of three character and values education programs were conducted. The review also covered the dominant and/or the recent literature in the field of values and moral development of children. The review clearly indicated the importance of: establishing a vision and mission statement highlighting the desired set of values; aiming for the holistic development of children and reflecting this aim in the curriculum and pedagogy; utilising the explicit and implicit learning opportunities available for children in school; and, creating a safe and supportive learning environment, through a whole-school approach, where students’ and teachers’ values endeavours and dispositions are recognised and promoted.

Based on the good practices delineated from the literature, a conceptual framework for the study design was developed. In this chapter, the framework will be presented. Following this, the research questions will be generated showing the connection between these questions and the themes building the conceptual framework. The chapter will also include a detailed description of the methodology and the various methods involved, as well as the corresponding samples and the sampling strategies. Ethical considerations made during the data collection, various data collection protocols, and the techniques used for the analysis of data will also be described. Finally, the last section will discuss the validity and reliability issues considered in the study design.

3.2 Qualitative Nature of the Study

The study is qualitative in nature as it seeks to explore and understand the provisions that Bangladeshi primary schools make for the children to develop their values. The aim is not to describe any trend, nor to explain, predict, nor compare anything (Creswell, 2008; Lichtman, 2006). Also, the major data collection will take place in primary schools, that is, in ‘natural settings’ (Lichtman, 2006, p. 12) and the sources for the school data will consist of personal views, interactions, behaviours, activities, and events. The study design resembles that of interpretive educational research because in this study, “Education is considered to be a process
[of developing student values] and school is a lived experience [for students and teachers]”, and that of an inductive study because ‘the meaning of the process [values education] or experience’ gained from the inquiry form the intended research knowledge (Merriam, 1998, p. 4).

## 3.3 Development of the Conceptual Framework for the Study Design

The backbone of the conceptual framework builds upon the literature discussed in the sections, 2.6.3 to 2.6.10, in the Literature Review chapter. A number of key themes were extracted from the literature in relation to the main research focus of this study, which is the exploration of the values education principles and practices prevailing in the Bangladeshi primary education system. A summary of the key themes and the underlying concepts, derived from the literature, are listed in Table 3.1.

### Table 3.1
**Key Themes and Underlying Concepts Extracted from the Literature**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Themes</th>
<th>Underlying Concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Whole person development</td>
<td>Think-feel-act model of values development engaging the hearts, minds and actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Values in school policy</td>
<td>Values are:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• At the centre of schooling;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mentioned explicitly in the values education policy and/or school vision statement;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Determined by the whole school community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Desired set of values and skills</td>
<td>• A combination of moral values and performance values;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Higher-order cognitive skills; interpersonal and intrapersonal communication skills;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Judgements and planning ability;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Civics and citizenship understanding and skills;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• An understanding of the relation of the self to the school and the wider community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Sense of confidence, achievement and self-esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Explicit modes of values education</td>
<td>• Values formation and inculcation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Values explicit in the classroom, in co-curricular activities, in key documents, and in all school programs and ceremonies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Values at the centre of all teaching-learning activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• References to values made during lessons, whenever opportunities arise, such as student discussions on values; values posters hung in classrooms; role models discussed; reflections made on values achievements etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Through the behavioural guidelines:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Values are represented to students as a combination of traits;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• A model for acting morally provided.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### E. Desired features in the curriculum

- Attention to children’s skills, abilities, interests and needs
- Interesting and meaningful curriculum ensures student agency
- Students free to express opinions freely
- Relevant to the real life experiences of the learners
- Meaningful for personal and social lives
- Caring and trustful relationships in the classroom

### F. Values pedagogies

**Key features of values-centred pedagogies:**

- Students at heart of teaching and learning
- Explicit teaching of values
- Respectful and caring learning environment
- Opportunities to explore (*discussions, observations and problem-solving activities*), communicate (*relational skill, self-reflection*), enact (*co-operative learning and role-plays*), and reflect (*debate and discussion*) on values
- Relevant to the real life experiences

**Values and citizenship education through:**

- Direct instruction: discussion, problem solving, cooperative learning etc.;
- Participation in action: school decision making and social work etc.;
- Critical reflection; and
- Observation of school rules, behaviours and interactions.

### G. Implicit modes of values education

**Teachers and other adults:**

- Aware of their responsibility in modelling the core values in behaviours and relationships;
- Show appropriate respect and care to students;
- Encourage good deeds.

**Other sources:**

- Core values displayed in posters and in other visual forms, inside and outside classrooms;
- Assembly, classroom rituals, supportive physical environment;
- Attitudes and expectations of teachers;
- Teacher morale and student morale;
- Management styles including practices for conflict resolution and decision making, power-structures, etc.;
- Student involvement in school activities;
- Student behaviour in the playground and on the way to and from school;
- Extra-curricular activities, such as sports, daily assemblies, clubs etc.

### H. Safe and supportive school environment

- Quality teaching and caring relationship
- All-inclusive classroom environment
- A sense of student responsibility developed
- Opportunities to explore values, develop skills, and practise values
- Whole-child development
- Professional training provided for teachers

### I. Whole-school approach

A combination of all of the above themes, plus the involvement of parents and other community members in values endeavours
Four key research questions were formed incorporating the themes and concepts listed in Table 3.1, in order to investigate the primary education sector in Bangladesh against these themes and concepts.

1. Themes B (Values in school policy) and C (Desired set of values and skills) were combined to form the question:

   *Awareness among the key educational authority and the school leaders:* What values and skills are deemed important for Bangladeshi students by the policy makers and school authorities and how is the delivery of these values and skills incorporated within the educational policies and practices?

2. Themes A (Whole person development), E (Desired features in the curriculum) and F (Values pedagogies) were combined to form the question:

   *Cognitive, affective, and behavioural domain of values learning:* What opportunities do the primary curriculum and textbooks, as well as pedagogies implemented in classrooms, provide for students to learn about values, understand and explore values, and develop and practise applying values?

3. Themes D (Explicit modes of values education) and G (Implicit modes of values education) were combined to form the question:

   *Explicit/implicit provisions for the articulation of values:* To what extent do the involvement of the community, school-level daily operations, curricular provisions, co- and extra-curricular activities, and the decision making strategies support the explicit and implicit values learning of the students?

4. Finally, Themes H (Safe and supportive school environment) and I (Whole-school approach) were combined to form the question:

   *Support from the environment:* To what extent do the overall school environment, teachers’ modelling of values, as well as the interaction between and among the school community members uphold the significance of supporting student’s values and holistic development through the schooling provisions?

The next questions were what data should be collected and from which sources. It was clear from the key research questions that the focus of the investigation included:

- the reinforcement of values development in the key educational policies and programs;
the perceptions of school leaders and other teachers in relation to the perceived necessity of values education and the desired set of values; and,

the incentives provided for the values development of children through the curriculum framework, teacher education, implemented pedagogies, overall school culture and the co- and extra-curricular activities in schools.

3.4 Methodology: Document Analysis and Case Study

After identifying the main focus points of this research, a plan was developed for the study design and data collection. The task of data collection and analysis included two consecutive steps:

1. Analysis of the educational policies and relevant documents, and the curriculum, textbooks, and teachers’ manuals developed for the primary schools; and
2. Natural data collection through interviews and observations in primary schools in Bangladesh, i.e. the case studies of schools.

The analysis of the primary curriculum and corresponding teacher training materials, and the observations of classrooms, were limited to the two relevant mandated subjects of Social Studies and Religious Studies. The reason for restricting the study to these two subjects was that these subjects accommodate the majority of the content related to values and morality—a finding that was discovered by an initial examination of the educational aims, objectives, and learning outcomes set for primary education in Bangladesh. These are the courses that specifically include ‘values’ as a core feature of the mandated curriculum and outcomes.

Based on the key themes and associated concepts shown in Table 3.1, as well as the research questions, a broad plan for field data collection from schools was drawn. This is shown in Table 3.2:

It was envisaged that while the document analysis of the curricular provisions for values in the subjects Social Studies and Religious Studies would develop a broad picture of what the children are expected to learn and how the teachers are expected to deliver the content in classrooms, the on-site observations of the classrooms would reveal the actual activities and teaching strategies taking place in the classrooms. Along with the classroom delivery of the values content, some other factors, such as co-curricular and extra-curricular activities, interaction between school members, involvement of the whole school community, were planned to be observed, to gain an overall picture of the school-wide incentives and scaffolds.
providing for values development. Moreover, semi-structured interviews of the head teachers, focus group discussions with other teachers, and interviews with the subject teachers were conducted. The following sections describe the two main steps involved in the data collection, namely document analyses and case studies.

The data collected from the different sources and the insights gained from the analyses of these data were intended to address the various research questions. The anticipated
connections between the research questions and the methods that were the main sources of data to answer the questions are shown in Table 3.3:

Table 3.3
Research Questions and their Relation to the Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. *Awareness among the key educational authority and the school leaders:* What values and skills are deemed important for Bangladeshi students by the policy makers and school authorities and how is the delivery of these values and skills incorporated within the educational policies and practices? | • Document analysis of key educational documents, reports and policies  
• Interviews with head teachers |
| 2. *Cognitive, affective, and behavioural domain of values learning:* What opportunities do the primary curriculum and textbooks, as well as pedagogies implemented in classrooms, provide for students to learn about values, understand and explore values, and develop and practise applying values? | • Document analysis of policies  
• Interviews with head teachers  
• Interviews with subject teachers of Social Studies and Religious Studies  
• Observations of classrooms |
| 3. *Explicit/implicit provisions for the articulation of values:* To what extent do the involvement of the community, school-level daily operations, curricular provisions, co- and extra-curricular activities, and the decision making strategies support the explicit and implicit values learning of the students? | • Interviews with head teachers  
• Interviews with subject teachers of Social Studies and Religious Studies  
• Focus groups with teachers  
• Observation of school-wide activities |
| 4. *Support from the environment:* To what extent do the overall school environment, teachers’ modelling of values, as well as the interaction between and among the school community members uphold the significance of supporting student’s values and holistic development through the schooling provisions? | • Interviews with head teachers  
• Interviews with subject teachers of Social Studies and Religious Studies  
• Focus groups with teachers  
• Observation of school-wide activities, school culture and the interactions |

The two main methods, document analysis and combined qualitative case studies, are described next.
3.4.1 Document Analysis

The purpose of the document analysis of the educational aims and objectives, priorities and targets; curriculum materials, and teacher education resources—in the primary education sector in Bangladesh—was to examine:

1. the values that are intended to be developed among children, the way these values are defined, and the descriptions and features used for representing these values;
2. the personal and social skills that are emphasised;
3. the way the content, learning exercises, and the classroom activities, provided in these materials: link to the needs and real-life experiences of the children; enhance their natural interest, curiosity, and attention; provide opportunities for exploring values of their own and others; develop higher-order cognitive skills; and, provide opportunities for children to enact the values.

3.4.1.1 Samples

The four main types of document used for analysis in this study included the:

1. Publications generated by the government, international donor agencies, or independent research authorities;
2. National policies on education;
3. Document sources related to the professional development of teachers; and,

Of the four types, original documents were collected for only the teachers’ professional development resources. All other documents were downloaded from the websites of the government educational institutions, international donor agencies, or independent research authorities. The government websites included those of the Ministry of Education (www.moe.gov.bd), Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (www.mopme.gov.bd), National Curriculum and Textbook Board (www.nctb.gov.bd), and Directorate of Primary Education (www.dpe.gov.bd). All of the documents were openly available to the public to download and use.

As described earlier, the curricular materials of Bangladesh included in this study were the curricula, textbooks, and the teachers’ manuals for Social Studies and Religious Studies, developed centrally by the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), Bangladesh. The curriculum for each subject is an integrated document developed for the five primary-level grades. While there are no Social Studies and Religious Studies textbooks for the first and second grades, the curriculum content for these grades is typically embedded in other key
learning areas. For third, fourth, and fifth grades, there are separate textbooks for each subject. Moreover, there are four textbooks for Religious Studies that represent the four major religions of Bangladesh: Islam, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Christianity. As Islam and Muslims represent almost 87% of the total population, this study will only consider the curricular materials for this religion.

The latest national textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies are available both in Bengali and English. The Bengali versions were developed between 2003 and 2005 to be used from the next academic years. However, the English versions of the same textbooks were developed in 2007 to be used from the same academic year. In this study, electronic copies of the English version textbooks have been used for analysis; the findings are discussed in Chapter 4. However, the textbooks used in the classrooms observed were the Bengali versions (NCTB, 2003a, 2003b, 2003c, 2004b, 2004c, 2005a, 2005b), and therefore in the analysis of the classroom observations, the Bengali versions have been used; the findings from this analysis will be reported in Chapter 5. All of the textbooks are available on the website of the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), Bangladesh, (www.nctb.gov.bd) from where the researcher downloaded the electronic versions.

The professional development resources for the teachers, including the subject manuals and the manuals for teacher training programs were collected from the Directorate of Primary Education office located in Dhaka, Bangladesh; Upazila Resource Centre, Sylhet Sadar; and the Primary Teachers’ Training Institute, Sylhet. While most of the online documents, such as the education policies, reports, curriculum documents and textbooks were downloaded prior to the period of field data collection in Bangladesh, the original or photocopied versions of the teachers’ professional development resources were collected during the period, February-March, 2011. Other than the above documents, the research also collected newspaper reports from the online versions of the leading Bengali and English daily newspapers in Bangladesh, to keep abreast of the recent educational initiatives taken in the primary education sector.

### 3.4.2 Case Studies of Schools

Data collection for the second part consisted of multiple case studies of the government primary schools in Bangladesh. Lichtman (2006) defines a case to be ‘a characteristic, trait, or behavior’ of an individual or multiple individuals, including even a ‘particular entity’ or ‘one type of situation’ (p. 74). In case studies, a researcher collects data through ‘watching’, ‘asking’ and ‘reviewing’, which are done systemically by observations, interviews, and document reviews (Wolcott, 1992, p. 19). These multiple sources of data interactively provide a holistic
picture of the phenomenon and make it possible to ‘validate and cross-check’ the interpretations made from the data (Patton, 1990, p. 244).

Tisdell (1993) conducted a comparative case study of two graduate classes in which she used participant observation as the main source of data collection. The observations were preceded by the study of the syllabus as the intention was to understand how certain concepts in the syllabus were reinforced in the classrooms. Finally, interviews with teachers and students were conducted to confirm and extend the observation findings. In this PhD research, the government primary schools in Bangladesh were regarded as cases, and a similar sequence of data collection, as that employed in the study of Tisdell (1993), was followed.

3.4.2.1 Research Sites

Although there are seven types of primary schools in Bangladesh that follow the national curriculum and centrally developed textbooks (Nath & Chowdhury, 2009), only government schools were selected for this study. This is because the government schools accommodate most of the primary students in Bangladesh (about 60%), as evident from the latest statistical data available from the website of the Bangladesh Bureau of Education Information and Statistics (BANBEIS, n.d.).

The question that came next was how many and which of the government schools would be included in this study. Following Lichtman’s (2006) suggestion that a case selected should not be ‘representative of all cases of a particular type’ because qualitative research is not aimed at generalisation, the focus was therefore placed on getting ‘detailed and rich descriptions’ (p. 75) of the selected cases. The schools were not selected randomly. Instead, typical sampling was used in order to describe what is ‘typical’ (in terms of student number and teacher number) of the three types of schools (Creswell, 2008, p. 215). Demographic data for this purpose were collected from the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS) and the Directorate of Primary Education (DPE).

As the research focus was on the overall implementation of values education in Bangladesh, schools were selected to cover a range of prevailing socio-economic scenarios. Two typical government primary schools from each of the three areas—metropolitan, urban, and rural—were selected. Considering the duration of the period each case study might take, which was presumed to be no less than two weeks, and also the time and budget constraints of the proposed PhD research, two schools of each type were selected, with six schools in total.

Metropolitan schools were selected from the two biggest cities, Dhaka (capital) and Chittagong; urban schools from the administrative headquarters of two divisions, Sylhet and
Rajshahi; and rural schools from the two districts, Sylhet and Pabna. Sampling in this way reflected the diverse social conditions and geographical locations across the country.

Ethics approval was sought firstly from the Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC) at the University of Newcastle before approaching the educational authorities in Bangladesh. After obtaining the university ethics clearance, the researcher contacted the educational authority in Bangladesh through the Directorate of Primary Education, in person. The approval was sought from and issued by this governing body of primary education in Bangladesh.

Before approaching the Directorate of Primary Education (DPE), Bangladesh, the researcher selected the administrative districts from which the schools would be selected. After obtaining the ethics approval from the DPE, the researcher selected the six case-study schools, with the help of the local education authorities. The key criterion in selecting the cases was the representativeness of the schools in the region, in terms of the student and teacher numbers, socio-economic backgrounds of the student population, academic and other performances of the school, etc. The DPE was the ‘gatekeeper’ in this research, and sent an official letter to the head teacher of each selected school stating the research interest of this project in collecting data from that school. The researcher then made initial phone contact with the head teachers of the schools, and sent the information package, containing the Information Statements and Consent Forms, to the individual sites. The complete schedule for the field work in individual sites was also decided on through communication with the head teachers.

3.4.2.2 Selection and Recruitment of Participants

Case studies of schools in this research involved the teachers as participants in interviews and focus group discussions. The head teacher and the teachers who teach Social Studies and Islamic Studies were interviewed. Focus group discussions included those teachers (except the head teacher) who play key roles in school decision-making and management. Moreover, the classrooms of the subjects, Social Studies, Religious Studies, co-curricular lessons and some aspects of the school activities were observed. As stated above, the Directorate of Primary Education (DPE) served as the ‘gatekeeper’ in this research, and so sent an official letter to the head teacher of each selected school stating the research interest of this project in collecting data from that school.

At the field-level, the head teacher was the ‘gatekeeper’ who introduced the researcher to the other teachers and to the school. The head teacher selected the participants for the interviews and the focus group discussions. Information packages and consent forms were supplied to the head teacher to be delivered to the relevant teachers. After the teachers returned their signed consent forms or gave their verbal consent (to the head teacher or the researcher), subsequent contacts were made with them by the researcher herself. In the cases when an initial
verbal consent was provided, signed consent forms were collected from the corresponding teachers, prior to observations, interviews or the focus group discussion. The initial plan was to involve about five to eight teachers in interviews and focus group discussion, from each school. However, the final number of teachers recruited was determined by the total number of teachers in a school, and the availability of the teachers in terms of the individual school scenario.

Information Statements were sent to the participating schools describing the research project in detail including the data collection methods, expectations from the participants, processes and protocols for data collection, benefits and risks associated with involvement in the project etc. It was clearly stated in the documents that participation in the project was voluntary and the participants could opt out at any time. The consent forms for head teachers, and subject teachers of Social Studies and Religious Studies, as well the potential focus group participants, were also included in the information package. The Information Statements, Consent Forms and the interview and focus group protocols were translated into Bengali, the state language of Bangladesh, for distribution among the teachers. The English versions of the Information Statements and Consent Forms are included in Appendices 3.1 to 3.7, and the Bengali versions are provided in Appendices 3.8 to 3.13.

The study also included observation of classroom lessons and selected school activities in which the children were involved. Parental consent for observation of children, however, was not sought for a number of reasons. First, the focus of the observation was not on individual children but, rather: on the teacher and the classroom as a whole; on the teachers’ practices in delivering content on values; and, on the mode of interaction between teacher and students. Second, considering the context of Bangladesh and the ‘insider’ perspective of the student researcher in this connection, it was anticipated that seeking parental concern was of minimal value in this regard. Owing to their generally low level of formal education, parents might not have been able to read and comprehend the content of the consent form. Because the purpose of the study was to improve the quality of education in Bangladesh, it was very likely that parents would agree to consent and they would see it rather as an opportunity to have their children observed as part of the study.

Although parental consent was not sought, the classroom teachers were informed through the Information Statement that they would need to inform the children and parents of the project; the reasons why the researcher would be in the classroom and at the school; and what the researcher would be doing, which was, observing the children learning, playing, interacting etc. at school. The teachers provided opportunities for the children and their parents to ask questions and express any concerns they might have regarding the observation of the classrooms and the broader school environment. The teachers also ensured that before they gave consent for
the researcher’s presence in the school and classrooms, the children and their parents would verbally confirm their agreement with each other.

3.4.2.3 Procedures for Data Collection

Interviews, focus group discussions and observations of classrooms and school activities were conducted by the researcher at the school sites, during the usual school hours. Dates and times of the interviews and focus group discussions were determined according to the availability of the teachers who consented to participate in the project. The researcher collected the daily school routine at the outset of data collection at each school. Upon receiving the consent from the teachers, who agreed for their classrooms to be observed, the researcher developed an observation timeframe for the lessons of interest. All of the interviews and discussions, as well as the lessons observed were conducted in Bengali. There was no need for an interpreter since the researcher herself is from Bangladesh. The interviews, focus group discussions and the observations of classrooms and daily assembly sessions were audio recorded.

Field notes were taken for observation of all of the classroom lessons and school-wide activities, such as the annual sports and the National Children’s Day taken place at two of the schools. In addition, photographs of the school buildings, classrooms, playgrounds, corridors, school fields etc. were taken during the usual school days. Photographs were also taken during the daily assemblies and other special events. Complying with the University of Newcastle Ethics requirement, it was ensured that none of the students’ or teachers’ faces were identifiable from the photographs, which might be selected for any presentations or publications.

3.4.2.4 Semi-structured Interviews with the Head Teachers

Interviews allow qualitative researchers to extract ‘voices of individuals’ from which they make meaning of the phenomenon under investigation (Litchman, 2006, p. 33). In this research, semi-structured interviews with the head teachers of the six schools were carried out to explore the teachers’ perceptions of the values development of children, and the provisions made in the schools for the children to learn and practice values. The purpose of the interviews was to obtain information on, and gain a broad understanding of:

- the awareness of values among the top management body of the school;
- the school charter, and policies and programs that address values;
- the formal time-tabled lessons as well as the informal lessons where values are taught to the students; and,
- the places, situations, and activities in the schools that raise or deal with values-related issues.
The head teachers were also requested to provide documents relevant to this research, such as official orders, formal documents, pamphlets, notices, school policies, etc. that are produced, supplied, and/or implemented by the school authority.

The interview questions were organised under the following main themes:

1. Perceptions of the values development of children;
2. Inclusion of values in school policies and programs;
3. Discipline and behaviour management strategies;
4. Inclusion of values in the curriculum;
5. Values and skills development of students through co-curricular or extra-curricular activities; and,
6. Involvement of the school community

The interview question protocol is provided in Appendix 3.14 (English) and in Appendix 3.15 (Bengali).

Of the six head teachers, three were male and three were female. The average age and length of the teaching career of the head teachers were 41.5 and 17 years, respectively. The interviews with the head teachers, ranging from 15 minutes to 68 minutes 20 seconds, lasted for an average of 39 minutes 45 seconds.

The information gathered from the interview was expected to not only give a consolidated view of how values are addressed within the school premises, but also to help narrow the focus of the observation by singling out the people, places, and activities that focus on the values development of the students. Above all, the interviews carried the potential to help build an initial rapport (Litchman, 2006; Merriam, 1998; Silverman, 2010) with the head teachers, which is essential at the outset for collecting field data in the schools.

3.4.2.5 Interview with the Subject Teachers

The aim of the interviews with subject teachers was to explore: (a) the philosophies that guided the teachers in planning and designing lessons; (b) the way teachers made use of the curriculum document, teachers’ guides, textbooks and other support materials, if any, in planning, designing and delivering lessons; (c) the teachers’ opinions in relation to the efficacy of these instructional resources in building and nurturing values in children; (d) the pedagogies used by the teachers for teaching values; and, (d) the extent to which these pedagogies, in the teachers’ view, support the development of critical thinking, decision-making, and problem-solving skills in the children.

A total of twelve teachers were interviewed as subject teachers including only one male teacher. The average age and length of the teaching career for the subject teachers interviewed
were 35.4 and 13.2 years, respectively. The interviews with the subject teachers, ranging from 15 minutes to 69 minutes, lasted for an average of 27 minutes.

The interview question protocol is provided in Appendix 3.16 (English) and in Appendix 3.17 (Bengali).

3.4.2.5 Focus Groups Discussions with the Teachers

Focus group discussions involve a small number of informants, usually members of a homogenous group, where a moderator leads the discussion with a view to finding general background information about a topic from the words of the participants, i.e., the way the group members ‘think and feel’ about the topic in question (B. Johnson & Chirstensen, 2004, p. 185). The main advantage of focus group interviews is that the ideas and opinions of participants stimulate others in the group, thus generate thoughts and personal views which might not be obtained in individual interviews (Lichtman, 2006).

In this study, focus group discussions were expected to help gain a general understanding of what the teachers, other than the head teachers, thought and felt about: the social, emotional and character, as well as, the values development of the children; the teachers’ own approaches to and experiences in dealing with this issue; and the challenges the teachers faced in their endeavours regarding the students’ values development. The focus group discussions lasted for an average of 39 minutes. On average, the number of participants in the focus group held in one case-study school was five. The focus group interview question protocol is provided in Appendix 3.18 (English) and in Appendix 3.19 (Bengali).

3.4.2.6 Observations of Classrooms and School-wide Activities

This study aims to explore: the school and classroom rituals that explicitly or implicitly refer to values; the teaching-learning activities that are designed to deliver values and develop personal and social skills of students; the behaviours, interactions and relationships that enact the values; and, the co-curricular and extra-curricular activities that take place in the schools. In order to achieve this, this research did not depend only on the views and experiences of the informants. Rather, non-participant observations were used to collect ‘open-ended, first-hand information’ (Creswell, 2008, p. 221). Researchers conduct observations to describe and analyse the dynamics of human behaviour, the interaction within and among different groups of people, and they use their own knowledge and experiences to interpret ‘naturally occurring data’ (Silverman, 2010, p. 130) instead of relying only on what people say (Merriam, 1998; Silverman, 2010). Whereas interviews represent the ‘emotionalist’ model, which is the understanding of human experiences or views around a phenomenon, observations adhere to the ‘naturalist’ model of research, which is the understanding of human behaviour in relation to that phenomenon (Gubrium & Holstein, 1997, as cited in Silverman, 2010).
The purpose of the observation was to explore various school elements that explicitly or implicitly referred to values. Observations included: the teaching-learning activities designed to deliver values and develop the personal and social skills of students; the co-curricular and extra-curricular activities taking place in the schools; and the behaviours, interactions and relationships among the school community members. The activities and interactions in the classrooms during formal lessons of Social Studies and Religious Studies, and in any formal or informal situations in the school where the students get opportunities to learn about values and enact values, were observed keeping in mind the following themes:

- Students getting to know values explicitly, expressing their own feelings, ideas, and opinions, sharing these with others, analysing their own values and those of others, acting independently in their learning as well as for decision-making and problem-solving activities, and being involved in activities that utilise their meta-cognitive skills such as thinking and reflecting; and,

- Teachers mentioning values explicitly, applying student-centred pedagogies, identifying and encouraging the values of students, showing respect and care for every child, and modelling values in their own behaviours and decision-making.

The research problem acts as a guide in deciding what needs to be observed (Merriam, 1998). The first few observations, which are targeted at getting to know the setting better rather than at collecting field data, should be of short duration, but frequent (Merriam, 1998). Once an impression of the setting is developed from early field visits, the researcher might narrow the scope of observation, using a ‘funnel approach’, to decide what to observe, when to observe and how to observe (Creswell, 2008, p. 236). In this research, the interview with the head teacher was expected to initially guide the observation process. The places, activities, and events that were planned to be observed included: the daily school assemblies; the classroom lessons of Social Studies and Religious Studies (Islam) for third, fourth, and fifth grades, and the first and second grade lessons that were suggested by the head teacher and other key staff; formal or informal parent-teacher meetings; student-teacher and teacher-teacher interaction in any planned or unplanned situations; activities of the school discipline-management team, if any; any co-curricular and extra-curricular activities or special events, such as sports, club activities etc.

The key aspects that were considered for observation in formal settings such as classrooms or meetings, as well as in informal situations as in the playfield, the corridors, the teachers’ common room etc. included:
• The physical environment: the overall impression that the place offers, the arrangements of furniture, a map or picture of the room as well as decoration and other visual features, allocation of space between different groups of people (Creswell, 2008; Lichtman, 2006; Merriam, 1998);

• The participants: their identity, number, characteristics, and the role individuals take in a situation (Merriam, 1998);

• The activities and interactions: the process and sequence, individual’s mode of interaction, any norm or rules underpinning the activities and interaction, and the start time and duration (Creswell, 2008; Merriam, 1998);

• The conversation: content of the conversation, identity of the speakers and listeners, words that people utter recorded either in direct quotes or in paraphrased and summarised form, and the silence and its length (Merriam, 1998). Some other traits of conversation to be observed were, ‘who initiates a conversation, reactions of participants to a particular issue, or nonverbal signals shown by participants’ (Lichtman, 2006, p. 142).

Merriam (1998) suggests some other elements to consider when engaged in observation. These include: any informal or unplanned activities; any occurrence that has not happened but ought to have happened (Patton, 1990); and the researcher’s own behaviour—how his or her role affects the participants and the situation, what the researcher says and does, and what interpretation and analysis the researcher develops during observation, all these constitute the ‘observer comments’ in the field-note (p. 98).

Observation data were recorded in the field-notes which were both ‘descriptive’ and ‘reflective’ (Creswell, 2008, p. 224). Observations, unlike interviews, identify ‘what people do’ and a detailed account of what is observed (i.e., descriptive field-note) represents the ‘ordinary and unexceptional’ activities in people’s lives (Silverman, 2010, p. 231). When recorded in detail, observational data offer clues to (a) the process that an event follows, (b) the members’ understanding of activities and events, (c) the factors that the members recognise as causing an activity or event, and (d) the real ‘concerns, conditions and constraints’ (Emerson et al., 1995, as cited in Silverman, 2010, p. 230) that the people experience in daily lives. The concept of reflective field-notes (Creswell, 2008), similar to what Merriam (1998) refers to as observer comments, is centred on the notion that observers not only track the people, activities, and interactions in a setting but, at the same time, they develop interpretations and analyses, using intuitions and deeper thinking ability which, having been jotted down during observations, facilitate the later analysis of field-notes. As well as taking field-notes, the researcher also audio-recorded the classroom observations and the daily assembly sessions.
The conceptual and analytical frameworks for the classroom observations were built upon the review of four categories of sources: a) the body of literature on values-focused pedagogies and quality teaching (Chapter 3); b) the teacher training resources at the primary level in Bangladesh (Chapter 4); c) the NSW Quality Teaching Model (New South Wales Department of Education & Training, 2003a, 2003b, 2003c, 2003d, 2003e); and d) the COS-3 Global Qualitative Ratings for the classrooms (NICHD, 2005). The findings derived from the review suggested that moral and values development as well as a holistic upbringing is best supported through curricular provisions when the teachers make deliberate efforts to make the environment participatory, fun-filled and engaging for the children. Values development is promoted when teachers implement child-centred, meaningful and cooperative teaching-learning strategies, such as discussion, problem solving, critical reflection, philosophical inquiry, group or project work etc. The analysis of the classroom observations was guided by these concepts related to ‘value-focused pedagogy’ and ‘quality learning environment’.

The classroom observations were analysed with a view to addressing the following key objectives:

- Instructional practices: Type, frequency and structure of activities; sequence of the activities in lessons;
- The way values are defined, explored and explained;
- The extent to which classroom activities include thinking tasks, practical work, problem solving and decision making tasks;
- The extent to which higher expectations are set by the teacher, and the tasks assigned are challenging and individualised;
- The degree and nature of interpersonal interactions taking place;
- The degree of student agency, participation and engagement in learning activities;

Moreover, a qualitative classroom rating system was applied to the observed lesson samples. This rating system is a part of the Classroom Observation System for Third Grade (COS-3) (NICHD, 2005), which qualitatively examines the activities and experiences to which children are exposed in the classroom. There are eight codes in this rating system with a 1-7 scale [1-2: low; 3-5: moderate; 6-7: high] developed for each code. A short description of the codes is given below:

- Richness of Instructional Methods: The variety and depth of strategies the teacher employs;
- Over-Control: The extent to which the classroom is rigidly structured or regimented;
- Chaos: The extent to which the children in the class are ineffectively controlled or chaotic;
• Teacher Detachment: Reflects a lack of emotional involvement and a lack of awareness of the children’s needs for appropriate interactions with activities, materials, or peers;
• Positive Classroom Climate: The overall emotional and social tone of the classroom;
• Negative Climate: A classroom climate that is hostile, angry, punitive, and controlling;
• Productive Use of Instructional Time: How well the classroom manages time and activities to insure productivity, engagement and efficient use of instructional time;
• Teacher Sensitivity: Child-centred behaviour demonstrated by the teacher.

A detailed description of all the codes and the defined criteria for low, moderate or high ratings is included in Table A3.20.1 in Appendix 3.20.

The outside-classroom activities and events were observed to examine the extent to which:

• Pupils understood what was expected of them;
• Staff members showed awareness of the individual pupils’ values and need for values development;
• Staff members responded appropriately to the pupils’ communication with peers or teachers;
• Pupils were engaged in practical experiences to discover their own values and those of others;
• Staff members gave positive and specific feedback to pupils in order to reinforce appropriate behaviours as well as help the pupils understand how to improve their behaviours and make progress;
• Staff members responded to inappropriate behaviours in accordance with the School Behaviour Policy;
• Pupils were provided opportunities to take responsibility in the context of school, family, local community, and the society;
• Pupils showed a positive approach to the cooperative work they were actively involved in; and,
• Evidence of respect between the pupils and the teachers was observed.

3.4.2.6.1 Samples

A total of forty-six classrooms were observed across the six case study schools. In addition to the classroom lessons, a total of five daily assembly sessions were observed. Also, the observations included two events that took place in two of the schools, which were the annual sports and prize distribution ceremony and the observation of the National Children’s Day.
3.5 Data Analysis

3.5.1 Introduction

Textual data comprised the principal form of data in this study. The documents selected for analysis represented the key components of the central curriculum, that were expected to portray the nation’s educational aims and objectives (Allen & Ingulsrud, 1998) and what the educators desire and envision (Davies & Issitt, 2005) in terms of the holistic development of the children and their values and morality. Interview, focus-group and observation data were collected to identify the extent and nature of the significance attached by the school authority to the values development of children; and the ways this perceived significance is reflected in the school-related planning, decision-making, policies and programs; interactions within the school members; and the delivery of the values lessons. The qualitative analysis of the textual data provided insights into the key issues in relation to the schools’ values endeavours.

The research data included the audio recordings of, and/or the field-notes taken during or immediately after, the interviews, focus group discussions and observations, as well as the artefacts collected from the schools and the photographs taken. The field-notes recorded the description of the observations of the activities, events, and the physical environment of classrooms and schools; an immediate summary of an interview or discussion; or the reactions, hunches and reflections of the researcher. The field-notes were found to be very useful by the researcher while collecting the field data, as well as conducting the data analysis tasks. These notes provided a good deal of additional information, along with what could be recorded in audio or visual formats. The field-notes proved to be especially important in the case of the observations, as they filled in the information gap prevalent in the audio transcripts of the observations. Another experience gained during the data collection seemed beneficial to the researcher. It was found that an early transcription and quick summarisation of the initial interviews or observations provided useful feedback for the later data collection tasks.

Transcriptions of the audio recordings, field-notes and photographs were stored in a laptop issued by the university to the researcher. Not only was the laptop password-protected, all the electronic data were erased from the original sources after being transferred. All the transcripts, field-notes, and other documents were carefully observed to have replaced the names of the teachers with codes. The teachers in each school were coded as SXTY, where ‘S’ refers to ‘School’ and ‘X’ represents a number (1-6) for the school, and ‘T’ refers to ‘Teacher’ and ‘Y’ represents a number for a teacher in the respective school. Both of the numbers were assigned by the researcher.
3.5.2 Analysis Procedures

The principal technique used for analysing the textual data was content analysis, which Merriam (1998) defines as ‘a systematic procedure for describing the content of communications’ (p. 123). Content analysis is performed to examine the conceptual structure a text offers to the readers and the nature of ‘the worlds they [particular readers] can imagine, make into their own, and consider real’ (Krippendaurff, 2004, p. 63). Content analyses can be used to draw inferences about phenomena in an institution by studying the patterns of communication in that institution—analysis of texts reveal emerging patterns in communications, confirms an existing pattern or discovers competing patterns (Krippendaurff, 2004). As Krippendorff suggests, content analyses of ‘what is said and written within an organization’ can reveal the reality of that organisation (p. 77). The assumption of ‘reality’ of the primary schools in this study concerned the significance that they attached to the development of emotional competence and associated attitudes and skills, as well as the measures by which these were assessed.

While quantitative content analysis measures ‘the frequency and variety of messages’, qualitative content analysis is used to assess the ‘nature of the data’ and the ‘communication of meaning’, by searching for themes and persistent patterns in the data (Merriam, 1998, pp. 123, 160). In this research, qualitative content analysis was used as the main method, although there was some use of quantitative analysis as well, mainly to perform descriptive analyses of textbooks, interviews, focus groups and classroom observations.

Moreover, for analysing the case-study data, the ‘constant comparative method’ (Lichtman, 2006, p. 73; Merriam, 1998) was used. Starting with an incident recorded in a field-note, comparison was made to another incident of the same session or a different session; the process then moved to building ‘categories’ which are ‘concepts indicated by the data’ (Merriam, 1998, p. 179). As suggested by Merriam (1998), the categories, which are exhaustive, mutually exclusive, sensitizing, and conceptually congruent, were developed purposefully to relate to the research questions and answer these questions.

Analysis of qualitative data is not necessarily a non-iterative step that can be accomplished in one go (Creswell, 2008, p. 245). Researchers may be tempted to collect more data during the process of analysis. Subsequent efforts in data collection and analysis lead to the thematic development of a research problem. Text data can be analysed either manually or using software. Steps involved in both processes are, categorising the raw data into some codes, synthesising the codes into broader notions and eventually developing some themes that facilitate reporting of the interpretations (Creswell, 2008). As the analysis continues, a description of the theme emerges that includes the ‘people, places, or events’ (p. 259) in a
research setting. The themes then may be propagated, in a layered fashion, through the intermediate levels to a few broader themes. The interpretation from data may be accomplished through summarising key outcomes, adding a personal thought to the findings and relating them to the previous literature (Creswell, 2008). As is the case in the literature review, an investigation of the textual data for recognisable patterns is accomplished through ‘the task of understanding and of theorising, or developing explanations of phenomena’ (Kellehear, 1993, p. 32).

3.5.3 Identifying Themes in Data

In qualitative research, coding is a process that segments data in order to extract meanings from it. It is, however, not an alternative to ‘analysis’ nor is it analogous to ‘developing conceptual schemes’ (Coffey & Atkinson, 1996, p. 27). Coding simplifies or reduces, as well as, complicates data (p. 30). It incorporates both ‘Decontextualization’ and ‘Recontextualization’ of data by first segmenting it into categories and then placing each segment into a new context to form new concepts or questions (p. 31). Coffey and Atkinson (1996) have suggested some ways that can be followed to initiate and pursue coding. First, we can extract some essential characteristics of the data and use those as codes. Second, coding can be commenced with a predefined list of codes, developed from the theory, concepts, hypotheses to be tested, or from the previous literature. Third, codes can also emerge from the research questions. The three ways described have also been suggested by Tesch (1990, p. 141) to be used as the criteria for data organisation.

3.5.4 Analysis of the Documents

For the document analysis conducted in this study, the different sources—including the government and international reports on primary education in Bangladesh, curriculum documents, teacher training materials etc.—were coded manually. The coding schemes were developed according to the different sets of analysis objectives for these sources. Following the advice of Denzin and Lincoln (2000), each document was read three times: focussing initially on the overall content and a holistic understanding of the principles and key points; then re-read and analysed for major themes; and read the third time for a further understanding of minor themes. From the initial analysis of the major themes in each document, key words were identified and minor themes discovered within these categories. These minor themes were then analysed with a view to understanding the similarities or differences of the content, under these themes across the documents falling under the same group, namely, curricula, teachers’
manuals, etc. The content of the different groups of documents analysed were categorised under separate major themes. The groups and the corresponding themes are provided in Table 3.4:

The themes were generated in relation to specific questions highlighting the overarching goal of the research. For instance, some of the questions asked for the analysis of the textbooks were:

1. What values are presented in the textbooks and how are they presented?
2. To what extent are the curriculum objectives and terminal competencies endorsed in the curriculum of a subject reflected in the textbooks of that subject?
3. To what extent is the content of the textbooks appropriate for the age and ability of the learners?
4. To what extent do the content and activities presented in the textbooks provide scaffolds for the social and emotional learning of the children?

Table 3.4
Different Types of Documents and the Relevant Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reports on the primary education sector, education policies, newspaper articles, etc.</th>
<th>Primary-level curriculum documents</th>
<th>Textbooks of Social Studies and Religious Studies for grades three to five</th>
<th>Teacher training resources (short-term training manuals, teachers’ guides for Social Studies, information booklets etc.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• History</td>
<td>• Educational Aims and Objectives</td>
<td>• Description</td>
<td>• Teacher training provisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Priorities</td>
<td>• Aims of the curricula of Social Studies and Religious Studies</td>
<td>• Format and language</td>
<td>• Instructional resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Issues and challenges</td>
<td>• Frequencies and description of the activities and exercises suggested in the curriculum</td>
<td>• Topics</td>
<td>• General guidelines in teachers’ guides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recent achievements and targets</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Competencies and relevant description</td>
<td>• Curriculum of key teacher training programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Representation of values</td>
<td>• Content of the short training courses for teaching quality improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Opportunities for moral action and service learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Frequencies and description of the activities and exercises included in the textbooks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the other hand, the primary objective of analysing the teachers’ guides was to examine the extent to which these guides provide guidelines and materials for the teachers to implement child-friendly teaching strategies in the classrooms.

As described earlier, the English version of textbooks were used for analysis. Both qualitative and quantitative content analyses were conducted. The textbooks were thoroughly examined to identify the key topics, language, organisation of the content, frequencies of the pictures included, representation of various values, as well as the types and numbers of teaching-learning
activities included in the textbooks. A number of tables were created to record the frequencies and descriptions of the occurrences of relevant information, retrieved against the different key search criteria.

### 3.5.5 Analysis of Case-study Data using NVivo

In this study, the storage, management, and analysis of the field-notes, transcripts and other case-study data were facilitated by the use of the qualitative software package, NVivo (a product of the Qualitative Software International) (QSR, n.d.). NVivo was used to code the data sources following a predefined coding scheme, and to develop themes and categories from the data. NVivo supports ‘fine grained analysis’ (Gibbs, 2002, p. xxiii) of chunks of a message along with the whole message. It also supports ‘speed coding’ (Gerbic & Stacey, 2005) which is called ‘Code In Vivo’ in the software. In NVivo, ‘nodes’ represent categories (Richards, 2005, p. 89) that emerge from the data.

All transcripts, field-notes, data collection protocols, and project- and school-related information were imported and stored in corresponding folders, separately for each of the six cases. ‘Node Classifications’ were created to store descriptive data for the cases and teachers, and ‘Source Classifications’ for the sample interviews, classroom observations and focus groups. A list of attributes for the various classifications used in this project is given in Table 3.5.

The descriptive information stored as attributes of the classifications were used to form NVivo ‘queries’ in order to retrieve data against a specific search criterion. Moreover, one case node was created for each teacher who participated in the interview, focus group, or classroom observation(s). The content from all of the transcripts relevant to a teacher was coded under the case node created for that teacher. By doing this, it was possible to record all comments made or actions performed by a particular teacher in one node.

#### 3.5.5.1 Coding and Query

Coding is an iterative process. The coding of data was found to be a cyclical process. The underlying concepts of a research determine the coding decisions taken. These decisions, in turn, determine how a researcher will retrieve information from different nodes to answer the research questions. There were two main levels of coding involved in this study. First, a number of pre-defined categories were formed from the conceptual framework of the study. At the first level of coding, the data sources were coded in the ‘nodes’ created in relation to the main themes and concepts used in this study. At the second-level of coding, the content coded under the pre-defined themes were read thoroughly, as a result of which, a number of sub-categories emerged from the first-level nodes, at one or more levels of hierarchy of the nodes.
Table 3.5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Different Classifications and their Attributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Code (Assigned by the researcher)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type (Urban/Rural/Metropolitan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Shifts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Classrooms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of Birth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Started Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Joined This School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewed (yes/no)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Group (yes/no)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observed (yes/no)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interview</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date and Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audio Length</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcription Duration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Classroom Observation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date and Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audio Length</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcription Duration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Group</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date and Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audio Length</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcription Duration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each node was defined carefully to avoid the confusion in terms of the coding decisions. All of the nodes and their content were checked several times so that a node does not contain chunks of data that do not have any logical relations, or that the sections of data that carry similar meaning are coded under the same node. A number of analytical and reflective memos were taken during the course of the analysis in order to track the coding decisions made at different points. ‘See Also Links’ and ‘Annotations’ were also created to record the researcher’s hunches, reflections, and perceived relationships between different sets of data. Moreover, ‘In Vivo’ coding, that is creating categories from the direct text included in the sources, and...
searching other sources against these categories was used heavily in the analysis process. The In-Vivo coding was found very useful because a number of significant concepts derived directly from the documents themselves. Coffey and Atkinson (1996) have shown how unusual or interesting points made by an interviewee can lead to building new codes.

It is usual in the coding procedure that texts from multiple sources are coded under a single node. Alternatively, a single piece of text can be coded at different nodes. In NVivo, ‘Queries’ were used to retrieve pieces of information that were collected from multiple informants through a single method or multiple data collection methods. For example, in order to retrieve what the subject teachers said about the lack of curricular focus on student ability, a query was created. The query searched for the content which was coded at both of the nodes ‘Student Ability’ and ‘Limitation of Curriculum’, and was originally from the transcripts of the interviews with subject teachers. By using the attributes of the classifications (Table 3.5), it was also possible to create queries that searched for the information supplied by a specific group of participants from a desired set of cases.

To give another example, one question raised in relation to the study was ‘How is the holistic development of students addressed in the student evaluation mechanism?’ In order to design a query to answer this question, it was first necessary to determine the scope of the search. The intent was to collect evidence from: i) the teachers’ views of the curriculum documents; ii) the information supplied by the teachers about their practices of student evaluation; and iii) the teachers’ practices observed in the classrooms. Therefore, the query was designed to retrieve the content that was coded at both the ‘Student Evaluation’ and ‘Holistic Development’ nodes, and that originally came from the transcripts of teacher interviews as well as classroom observations. From the above examples, it is evident that the triangulation of data collected from the various methods could be achieved easily using NVivo.

In order to assist the analysis, some other features of NVivo were used. For instance: ‘auto-coding’ the transcripts of focus groups, using formatting of the documents to automatically copy the comments made by the teachers to their respective case nodes; creating ‘relationships’ to see the association between the content coded at different nodes; creating visual ‘models’ to get a graphical snapshot of the coding relations between nodes, sub-nodes and the source documents; exporting the list of nodes and other project items; creating summary reports on the nodes, etc.

3.5.5.2 Coding and Analysing the Observation Transcripts

Using NVivo for data analysis was particularly beneficial for the coding and analysis of the observation transcripts. The transcripts were examined against a large number of qualitative and quantitative search criteria. The major categories under which the observation data were coded included:
• Physical Environment of the Classroom
• Teaching learning materials
• Classroom Activities
• COS-3 Ratings
• Students’ Classroom Questions
• Students' Classroom Responses
• Students’ Classroom Attitudes
• Students’ Engagement in Learning
• Teachers’ Behaviours and Interaction with Students
• Teachers’ Reponses to Students’ Questions
• Teachers’ Reponses to Students’ Questions
• Student-Student Interaction

Because NVivo gives a quantitative measure of the content coded under the nodes, it was possible to keep a record of the types and frequencies of various classroom activities, interactions, and attitudes and behaviours of the students and teachers, in addition to the description of the evidence.

3.6 Validity and Reliability

Lincoln and Guba defined validity as the worth and credibility of what a researcher has done (1985, as cited in Eisenhart & Howe, 1992). A research method itself is not judged against validity, rather the data and the explanations emanating from that method are subject to validity (Maxwell, 1992). In this study, a detailed record of the subsequent steps of the fieldwork and data analysis were kept, which contributed to ascertaining the ‘credibility’ of the research (Wolcott, 1990). Validity was also ensured by keeping records of every decision and evaluation made in the course of the research, thus linking the data and evidence to the interpretations in a meaningful and acceptable way (Freeman, de Marrais, Preissle, Roulston, & StPierre, 2007).

Merriam (1998) defines reliability in qualitative research as the extent to which the research findings are consistent. In order to make this study reliable, the triangulation technique (Mathison, 1988) has been applied in the research design by using several data collection methods including the document analyses, interviews, focus group discussions and observations. The data and evidence collected using these various methods lead to answering the research questions. The individual steps in data collection and analysis were monitored and evaluated continuously so that consistency in decision-making was maintained throughout the course of the research (Merriam, 1998).
The qualitative software, NVivo, assisted in ensuring the reliability and validity of the research. The nodes and queries were carefully defined and the coding decisions recorded. The definitions and the decisions can later be used to verify the analysis process against reliability and validity, or to replicate the analysis. The analytical, methodological and reflective Memos, as well as the See Also Links and Annotations, were used rigorously to record the thoughts and ideas that emerged at various phases of data collection, preparation, and analysis. Moreover, the retrieval of information from the different sources as well as the quantitative analyses of the classroom observations could be easily and reliably achieved using NVivo.

3.7 Summary

This chapter presented a detailed discussion of the development of the conceptual framework, the research questions and the methodology used for data collection and analysis. The key components of the methodology, namely the document analysis and the case-study, were described, detailing the purposes of the methods, samples and sampling strategies used, and the analysis techniques implemented for the various sources of data. It was also shown how NVivo was used to analyse the case-study data. Finally, the last section on validity and reliability discussed the way the researcher employed NVivo functions and techniques to ensure the validity and reliability of this research.
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS FROM DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

4.1 Introduction

The purpose of this research was to investigate the curricular incentives aimed at the values development of children in the primary education system of Bangladesh and the extent to which the primary school learning environment nurtures children's personal, human, social and moral values. The qualitative approach employed in this study to examine these issues utilized a document analysis and a case-study of six government primary schools. The aim of the document analysis was to reveal a broad picture of values development opportunities that the primary schools are expected to create for children. This chapter reports the findings from the document analysis and discusses the way in which reinforcing the values development of children is incorporated in the educational philosophy, priorities and agenda of the state; and in the primary curriculum, textbooks and teacher professional development programs.

The document analysis component of this research not only sets a background for understanding the system-level and school-level reality in primary education, but also guides the qualitative case-study design and implementation reported in the next chapter. Triangulation of the findings from the document analysis and the six case-study schools gives an insight into the extent of the interplay and coordination between policy and practice in the arena of children’s values development in Bangladesh.

This chapter is organised into three major sections. The first section provides contextual information regarding primary school education in Bangladesh and highlights the significant policies adopted in the history of primary education, major initiatives taken so far, and future goals set for this sector. This section also describes the place of values development among the priorities of the government, and the existence of any school interventions and/or programs that directly or indirectly relate to the mental and physical nourishment of children. The second section reports findings from the analysis of the primary curriculum and textbooks of two subjects, Environment Studies - Society (referred to as Social Studies) and Religious Studies (Islam). These documents were analysed in order to understand i) what values the children are expected to learn in school, and ii) the provisions currently available for values development in these textbooks. Moreover, the professional development provisions available to the teachers were investigated, and the teacher guides and manuals for Social Studies and Islamic Studies
analysed, in order to investigate the professional support that the teachers receive in making learning meaningful for their students. The findings are reported in the third section.

4.2 Priorities, Targets, Issues and Challenges in Primary Education in Bangladesh

This section presents the findings from the document sources (Appendix 4.1) comprising the official educational statistics in Bangladesh; reports generated by the government, and by the international donor agencies such as the World Bank, UNICEF and UNESCO, working as donor partners for educational development; education policies; and government orders and circulars retrieved from the websites of the Education Ministry and Primary and Mass Education Ministry and from newspapers.

4.2.1 Background

The history of legislating the provision of primary education by the state was described by Nasreen and Tate (2007) in the following manner:

Prior to the independence of Bangladesh (1971) two Acts laid the legal foundation for formal primary education in the country. The Primary Education Act of 1919 established the responsibility of the provincial government in primary education and noted that the goal for the future was universal primary education. In 1930, the Bengal (Rural) Primary Education Act also sought to establish universal primary education and gave the first details of how primary education could be managed locally. (p. 22)

The Government of Bangladesh recognises education as a means of reducing poverty. One of the strategic blocks in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Framework embedded in the National Strategy for Accelerated Poverty Reduction (NSAPR II) (GOB, 2009c) is human resources development, the focus of which is developing a knowledge-based society through quality training and education starting from the pre-primary level. The Primary Education Compulsory Act passed in 1990 made primary education free and compulsory for all children up to Grade Five. A summary of the entire educational structure in Bangladesh is shown in Appendix 4.2.

Given that the compulsory primary education comprises five years of schooling from grade one to grade five, ‘the government recognizes the value of and demand for pre-schools’ and, therefore, is promoting the NGO-funded and community-funded preschools which will be
set up within the catchment area of government primary schools or even in the premises of these schools (GOB, 2009c, p. 50). Pre-primary education in Bangladesh commenced in 1997 with the purposes of ‘promoting the quality of primary schooling especially for children whose parents are illiterate’ and preparing ‘underprivileged children for mainstream primary school entry’ (GOB, 2009c, p. 50). The Operational Framework for Pre-Primary Education, 2008 (MOPME, 2008)—developed by the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education—provides the following information regarding the status and providers of pre-primary education:

Available data shows that only 14.6% of the children aged 3 - <6 years are attending pre-primary education. Currently there are ‘Baby Classes’ in 26,300 primary schools under the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MoPME). In addition the Ministry of Women and Children Affairs, the Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs and the Ministry of Religious Affairs are operating pre-primary classes under development projects. Besides, many private kindergarten schools and more than 150 NGOs are operating pre-primary education throughout the country. (p. 8)

Now, there are some broad-term educational goals that the country is entitled to fulfil. Bangladesh, as a signatory to the Educational For All (EFA) goals and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), is committed towards:

- Expanding and improving comprehensive Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE), especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.
- Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
- Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes.
- Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills (Nasreen & Tate, 2007).

In order to fulfil the EFA goals and MDGs, the government of Bangladesh, with the financial and organisational support of international donor agencies, has undertaken various projects and programs. A number of NGOs also extended their support to the government in this

---

2 The EFA goals were developed in 2000, at the Dakar World Education Forum. They constitute a considerable strengthening and revision of the earlier EFA goals developed in Jomtien in 1990.
3 MDGs were developed in 2000. The second MDG urges to ensure for all children the completion of five-year primary education cycle, and the third MDG sets the target of achieving gender parity at primary level by 2005, which has been fulfilled.
regard. Most of the activities conducted so far in the primary education sector have been implemented through these projects and programs.

4.2.2 Significant Events and Initiatives

1970s. Universal access to primary education emerged as a central focus of the government after Bangladesh (the former ‘East Pakistan’) became independent in 1971 (Hossain, Subrahmanian, & Kabeer, 2002). The 1972 Constitution stipulates that the state be responsible for imparting education to all citizens:

The State shall adopt effective measures for the purpose of establishing a uniform, mass-oriented and universal system of education and extending free and compulsory education to all children to such stage as may be determined by law, relating education to the needs of the society and producing properly trained and motivated citizens to serve those needs. (GOB, 1972, Article 17)

The nationalisation of primary schools began in 1973 when the state assumed central control over primary schools overseeing their finance and administration (H. Z. Rahman & Ali, 2005). However, "its focus has narrowed to the issues of infrastructure, teacher salaries, training and educational materials". Furthermore, the effect of the state having the sole responsibility of primary education alienated the community from the schools and led to the omission of quality issues from the state agenda (H. Z. Rahman & Ali, 2005, Section III).

1980s. During the 1980s, as Unterhalter, Ross and Alam (2003) pointed out, primary education in Bangladesh underwent various reforms and advancements as a result of nationwide small-scale experiments. During the decade, national initiatives were implemented for literacy by both the government and the leading NGOs with the latter introducing non-formal education, and emerging as a dominant stakeholder in the provision of education in Bangladesh.

Bangladesh developed its first National Plan of Action (NPA) on Education for All in 1990, following the Jomtien EFA conference, and intensified its efforts to provide basic education for all Bangladeshi children. Primary education was made compulsory, as previously noted, by an act of Parliament in 1990, and a separate division with ministerial status was set up

4 As described in the Non-formal Education Policy 2006, the purpose of this education is to “to meet the learning needs of educationally disadvantaged persons of different ages and backgrounds, flexible in terms of organization, time and place and may cover basic and continuing educational programs to impart basic literacy, including life skills, work skills, general culture, and facilitates lifelong learning and enhancement of earning capabilities for poverty reduction.” (MOPME, 2006, p. 4) NFE in Bangladesh is operationalized through the activities of NGOs funded by international donor organisations, although it is centrally controlled by the government.
in 1992 with full responsibility to deal with matters concerning primary and mass education (MoPME) (Nasreen & Tate, 2007).

1990s. A description of major initiatives taken since the 1990s is available in a government report (GOB, 2009a). Major steps were taken, under the General Education Project (1990-1996), towards increasing access and quality; for example, ‘construction and reconstruction of classrooms’, introduction of Satellite Schools5 Pilot Program and community schools6, training of teachers, upgrading facilities at the Primary Training Institutes (PTIs), and curriculum and textbook development. The School Attractiveness Program, covering about 400,000 children under the General Education project, aimed at ‘motivating students to go to school regularly by making schools more student-friendly. An important feature of this program was to provide educational materials, school uniforms, sports equipment and occasionally nutritious food for poor students, particularly girls. Moreover, in 1993 the Food for Education Program7 was introduced in order to compensate poor parents for the costs of sending their children to school. In July 2002 this program was replaced by the Cash for Education Grant which provides stipends to the families of poor children. This program is still in place and expanding day by day (GOB, 2009a, pp. 90-91).

In 1986 the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB) started to revise the primary curriculum with the help of the Asian Development Bank (ADB), and in 1994 introduced a competency-based curriculum. This revision as well as improved access to education remained at the centre of policy discourse until the first half of the 1990s (Unterhalter et al., 2003). As a whole, in the 1990s, impressive progress was achieved in expanding basic and elementary education, at least as judged by the pace of quantitative expansion with a dramatic increase in the number of students enrolled, teachers recruited and infrastructure built and with NGOs expanding the non-formal education sector (Nasreen & Tate, 2007; Unterhalter et al., 2003).

2000s. The first National Education Policy was published in 2000. By the start of the decade the donor-funded Primary Education Development Programme (PEDP I, 1998-2003) was brought into implementation in order to move beyond access to quality issues (Unterhalter et al., 2003). The National Education Policy 2000 (MOE, 2000) included many policies aimed towards progress on the Education For All initiative. Major recommendations from this policy for primary education included ensuring the total enrolment of primary entry age children (6+

---

5 These schools were built to bring school nearer to the door steps of the children who cannot travel to the main school.
6 Less expensive community schools were established in the areas with no school. School buildings were constructed on the land donated by the local people and necessary facilities were provided by the government.
7 It provided food rations to 20% of poor primary school age children in specifically targeted rural areas. This helped increase enrolment and school attendance and prevented child labour.
years), introduction of pre-primary education, participation of communities and civil society in the development of schools, reducing pupil : teacher ratios to 40 : 1, and reforming and improving teacher recruitment and promotion; all with minimum standards of quality education (Nasreen & Tate, 2007). It was recognised that, "access achievements are not necessarily translating into commensurate quality achievements", and therefore the issue of improving the schooling quality was gradually finding its place in the national education agenda (H. Z. Rahman & Ali, 2005). PEDP-I had its ‘particular focus on improving the quality and efficiency of the school system, while continuing to improve equitable access to quality primary schools in the underserved areas\(^8\) (GOB, 2009a, p. 91). The *Intensive District Approach to Education for All (IDEAL)* project (1996-2004), created by the UNICEF under PEDP-I, was implemented to strengthen (a) local level planning, management and monitoring; (b) school quality; (c) social mobilization and communication; and (d) monitoring of learning achievement. An innovative teaching method, called Multiple Ways of Teaching and Learning (MWTL), was developed based on the Multiple Intelligence theory of Gardner (1983) under the IDEAL project to improve the existing teaching practices in primary schools, and to make them more child-centred, participatory and joyful (GOB, 2009a; A. Rahman, 2004).

Prime advancements in the Bangladeshi primary education sector have been made under the second phase of PEDP (*PEDP-II*, 2003-2011). The key objectives of the PEDP-II program were to:

- Increase primary school access, participation, and completion in accordance with the government’s EFA and other policy commitments; and

- Improve the quality of student learning and performance outcomes (i.e. achievement).

One of the key educational reforms undertaken through this program was the definition and implementation of *Primary School Quality Level (PSQL)* indicators and benchmarks that uphold access to educational services and the quality of education provided. PSQL indicators include: increasing student enrolment, especially the enrolment of children with special needs; increasing contact hours to 900 hours for all children; and reducing the pupil-teacher ratio to 46:1. Some other indicators were: constructing classrooms with sufficient size, light and ventilation; access for children with physical disabilities; ensuring water and toilet facilities to all staff and students; making teaching resources available to all teachers; and, the provision of special training programs for all teachers and managing committee members.

The government has made some progress in increasing access and improving quality by addressing these indicators, including: the recruitment of new teachers; development and

---

\(^8\) Ecologically difficult locations including north-eastern wetlands (Haor), islands, Chittagong Hill Tracts and coastal areas.
implementation of advanced training programs for teachers, officials, and school community representatives; and construction, re-construction and renovation of school facilities. Moreover, under the School Level Improvement Plan (SLIP) initiative of PEDP-II, schools and the community have been given authority in school-level planning and management, as well as improvement of the school and classroom environment to reduce the number of drop outs. Schools receive a small conditional fund that, under the auspice of the SLIP committee, can be spent on buying teaching-learning materials, sports and entertainment equipment for children; building and repairing toilets and other physical facilities; organising events etc.

Despite these recent achievements in primary education, the sector is still facing major issues and challenges in respect of providing quality education. These issues and challenges are discussed in the following sub-section.

4.2.3 Issues and Challenges

While the government has been making continuous effort to ensure access and quality education to all children, including disadvantaged and vulnerable children, there are still a significant number of major problems, which hamper children’s learning achievement that need to be addressed (Ardt et al., 2005; GOB, 2009a; Haq, 2006; Nasreen & Tate, 2007; UNICEF Bangladesh, 2009; World Bank, 2008). These include:

- poor quality of curriculum, textbooks, classroom teaching and learning, and of evaluation system;
- unpleasant and unattractive school and classroom environments which are often not child-friendly and lack necessary physical facilities;
- insufficient contact hours at school (on average less than 50% of international standard\(^9\));
- large class sizes, poor school attendance, high student drop-out rates, and a low completion rate;
- absence of physical facilities in schools and lack of teacher training, particularly in regard to addressing the inclusion of children with special needs; and
- a highly structured and centralised education system.

The following sub-section reports the successes earned in the recent past and the targets set for the near future, that reflect government’s strong commitment towards facing the above challenges.

\(^9\) Standard annual contact hour is 900-1000 hours (UNICEF Bangladesh, 2009).
4.2.4 Recent Achievements and Targets in Primary Education

At the strategic level and implementation level, a number of remarkable improvements have made been in the three-year tenure of the present government, namely:

- The Formulation and enactment of the Education Policy 2010 (MOE, 2010), given that neither the first education policy (MOE, 2000) nor any of the previous policy reports/recommendations had been implemented in Bangladesh;
- Achievement of near 100% (99.47%) net enrolment rate and reduction of drop-out rate to 21%;
- Introduction of completion exams, as a public exam, at the end of grade five and grade eight, providing a formal certification to the completers.
- Introduction of pre-primary education in 2010 and supply of free pre-primary textbooks to about 38% primary schools.
- Distribution of free textbooks to all children on the first day of school year, which was previously delayed until the 3rd/4th month.
- Continuation and expansion of school feeding and stipend program to increase student attendance in school.

In order to ensure a conducive learning atmosphere in classrooms, this government has banned the use of cellular phones by teachers and students at all educational institutions during class and during examinations (“Banning mobile in classroom,” 2011). Another vital decision that has been taken is the banning of all forms of physical and mental punishment in public and private educational institutions (“Children abuse banned,” 2011). Moreover, the printing, publishing, importation, distribution and sale of guidebooks and notebooks, developed for primary and secondary level, has been banned by a law, in order to restrict the practice, among learners, parents, and teachers, of relying on these books more than the government-provided national textbooks (“Guidebook ban,” 2009). The need for such a law arose because there was a tendency among students to avoid reading the national textbooks, and instead to rote learn the answers directly from these guidebooks which did not follow any standards and were not developed under government control. The guidebooks thus contributed to limiting the acquisition of knowledge from the textbooks and stifling the creativity of the students.

Moreover, in order to retain poor students at school, and thus reduce their drop-out rate, the government, with assistance from donor agencies, has started to provide ‘mid-day meals’ in poverty-prone areas of the country (Roy, 2011). A Student Council was launched in 2010 on an experimental basis, in order to promote leadership qualities, democratic norms and values, and
tolerance of others’ opinions commencing from the early years of school (“Student council,” 2011).

The primary education sector has set specific goals for the near future which include:

- Achieving 100 per cent literacy by 2014 (GOB, 2009c);
- Extending primary schooling to grade eight from grade five from 2014;
- Introducing pre-primary education to 100% primary schools by 201310 (“Pre-primary education,” 2011);
- Reducing pupil-teacher ratio to 30:1 by 2018;
- Introducing new textbooks and teacher materials to schools, based on a new curriculum, from 2013;
- Introducing ‘creative questions’ in the primary completion exam from 2012, in order to replace the present structured-type question and traditional evaluation system that tends to promote rote-learning; and,
- Replacing from 2013 the present vocational training for teachers, named Certificate-in-Education, with a more advanced Diploma in Education program and including a pre-primary module in the curriculum (MOPME, 2011). The DPeD program is now being piloted in seven out of fifty-seven Primary Teachers’ Training Institutes across the country.

Recently the government has undertaken a third phase of PEDP (PEDP-III, 2011-2016), the biggest ever project in the education sector11 (“PEDP-3,” 2011), the aims of which are to:

- Achieve 100% net enrolment and 100% completion of primary education;
- Ensure attainment of class-wise and subject-wise learning outcomes and competencies;
- Improve the quality of teaching-learning in primary schools and provide educational materials to all children; and,
- Conduct necessary training for the teachers and officials in primary education.

This program will not only enhance ongoing projects of the government, such as School Feeding and Stipend, but also included in its agenda will be emergency education, child health,
social motivation, non-formal education\textsuperscript{12} to drop-outs, unified education, curriculum development and decentralised school management. ("PEDP-III progress," 2011).

\subsection*{4.2.5 Summary and Discussion}

Being committed to fulfil the Education For All targets and Millennium Development Goals (Nasreen & Tate, 2007), Bangladesh has so far given utmost importance to ensuring access and equity in primary education. Quality issues, such as the revision and improvement of curriculum and textbooks, and the provision of authentic and meaningful learning experiences for children have been given scant attention until the recent past. Therefore, although success has been achieved in increasing the enrolment rate, Bangladeshi primary education is still suffering from high drop out and absenteeism rates. The large size of the population and the overall low level of income, coupled with the lack of political will of previous governments has contributed to making the situation more challenging. Not only have the policy recommendations of previously formed policy committees/commissions been ignored, the outcome from educational research on primary education in Bangladesh has largely been neglected (Hossain et al., 2002; Unterhalter et al., 2003). Moreover, until now there has not been any permanent, politically-unbiased education commission that will formulate education policies and take key educational decisions\textsuperscript{13}. The lack of coordination between educational research and policy-making in Bangladesh, over a three-decade period after independence, has been summarised by Unterhalter et al. (2003) in the following manner:

\begin{quote}
...Except for an early period after the War of Independence, there has been little open dialogue between researchers and policy makers in Bangladesh. Policy has been much more closely shaped by the changing forms and values of educational administration in central government and in large NGOs than by 'scientific' forms of research and knowledge production or by the debates these might provoke. Research and education policy development have been the preserve of elite groups closely connected to central government. Very little research has been undertaken independent of government or commissions from large NGOs. (p. 85)
\end{quote}

After the present government came into power in 2009, the situation began to improve. Public and expert opinion was sought and is reflected in recent education policies. In order to improve the quality of primary education, the government has taken thoughtful decisions, such as introducing pre-primary education; planning a revision of primary curriculum and teacher education curriculum; expanding teacher training on advanced teaching-learning techniques and evaluation methods; and introducing ‘creative questions’ in primary completion exam so that

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{12} Target groups include “children and youth with physical and mental disabilities; ethnic minorities; people living in ecologically difficult locations such as haors [the north-eastern wetlands], chars [islands], and coastal areas; and marginalised groups, such as, street children, working children, and people otherwise disadvantaged or living in especially difficult circumstances.” (MOPME, 2006, p. 5)
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{13} Creating such commission is one of the recommendations of the latest education policy.
\end{quote}
the students’ learning achievements can be better evaluated following the guidelines of a competency-based curriculum.\textsuperscript{14}

The preceding scrutiny of government policies and initiatives indicates that although the Bangladeshi government is making good progress towards ensuring quality primary school education in terms of access and curriculum the matter of moral and values development of children has still not received adequate attention. There do not appear to be any dedicated policies or frameworks either at the planning or implementation phases, nor any integrated school-based programs or activities focusing on moral, character, or values education. The new education policy, however, has proposed to introduce a new subject for moral education, which will draw from the religious, cultural, social, and regional values of the nation, in order to impart appropriate moral knowledge and behavioural skills.

Some recent educational targets and implemented measures, however, make it evident that developing personal, social, democratic and other values in children and building the kind of safe and supportive school environment that optimises learning and values acquisition are gradually coming to the attention of the government. For example, programs to retain children in school, such as school feeding, stipend, midday meals etc. have been implemented. Each school is also receiving a small budget (under SLIP) to make schools more attractive and enjoyable for children. Football tournaments for primary school children are being held every year at the national level. In addition, the government is planning to expand and strengthen the ‘cub-scout’ program — a school club that creates opportunities for co-curricular activities (MOPME, 2011). Launching a ‘student council’ in all schools is also a significant step towards reinforcing democratic attitudes and citizenship values in children. Moreover, the ban on physical and mental punishment of children reflects the government’s will to make the school environment healthier and more child-friendly. The latest policy directions (MOE, 2010) also echo that commitment as the future goals of primary education include promoting ‘responsive behaviour’ in teachers characterised by a ‘caring and sympathetic attitude’; ‘warm interactions between teachers and students’; and ‘attractive and joyful’ learning environments.

The following sections report findings from the analysis of curriculum documents and textbooks as well as resources for primary teachers’ professional development and discuss how the development of values and morality in children has been addressed in these materials.

\textsuperscript{14} The present competency-based curriculum (revised) has been in place since 2002.
4.3 Values in Curriculum Documents

This section reports findings from the analysis of the primary curriculum and textbooks. These documents were analysed in order to understand i) what values the children are expected to learn in school, and ii) the provisions currently available for values development in the primary curriculum and the textbooks of two subjects, Environment Studies - Society (referred to as Social Studies) and Religious Studies (Islam).

4.3.1 Educational Aims and Objectives

As specified in the documents supplied by the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), Bangladesh, the state philosophy of ‘absolute trust and faith in the Almighty God, nationalism, democracy and socialism’ is viewed by the Ministry of Education as a guiding force in designing school curriculum and textbooks. With the goal of inculcating in children the ‘spiritual, moral, social and human values’, the education system has been given the responsibility of training and assisting pupils in acquiring appropriate attitudes and knowledge about: i) their own rights; and ii) their responsibility and duty towards the society and nation, as well as the discharging of those duties and responsibilities. The curriculum is aimed towards developing competencies in pupils that will prepare them as trained and well-intentioned citizens equipped with human values, patriotism, and love for their country and fellow citizens. The government also prescribes that the ‘Spirit of the War of Liberation’ is highlighted in education policy and curriculum, in order that children: become aware of the birth history and freedom struggle of the nation; come to know in detail their own tradition and culture; and acquire citizenship values such as tolerance, respect and patriotism through participation in the democratic process (NCTB, n.d.-a, n.d.-b).

It is expected that primary education will help develop:

- Religious faith and spiritual values in the learners, and these will in turn shape their character and moral dispositions, and nurture in them social and human values.
- Essential citizenship values and skills required to maintain harmony in a democratic society, such as ‘a sense of love, respect, equality, fellow-feeling and cooperation to all’, as well as, ‘an eagerness for human rights, mutual understanding, cooperation’, further including the learning of global citizenship based on the concepts of ‘universal brotherhood, internationalism, and world peace and culture.’
- Students’ awareness of their own and others’ rights, duties and responsibilities through active participation in various activities undertaken in the family, society and the
school, and their tolerance of other’s opinion. Moreover, students will develop personal qualities such as discipline, respect and good manners.

- An interest in manual labour, a sense of respect for manual labourers, and an awareness of enhancing quality of life through economic activities based on productive labour.
- ‘A sense of patriotism and nationalism’, geared by adequate knowledge of and respect towards national history, heritage, and culture. With ‘the spirit of the war of liberation’ instilled in their mindset, learners will develop a disposition of sacrifice and dedication and contribute to the national welfare. They will also acquire an attitude of using community and national resources with caution and care.

The way these educational philosophies have been reflected in a national education policy (National Education Policy 2000), the first time since independence, however, was criticised in a major study on Bangladeshi educational policy (Unterhalter et al., 2003). Unterhalter et al. contended that although this education policy emphasised the establishment of nationalism and building a national identity, but no practical guidelines were provided for implementing education for the personal development of individuals, and thus enabling them to participate in the poverty reduction of the nation.

### 4.3.2 Competency-based Curriculum

The primary curriculum in Bangladesh (NCTB, n.d.-c), which was introduced in 1992 and later revised in 2002, is competency-based. Competencies are referred to as a combination of knowledge, skills, and attitudes that primary-age children should achieve by the completion of their primary school cycle, and around which all teaching-learning and evaluation strategies are designed. Attaining these competencies will prepare children with essential life skills that, in turn, will help them cope with real life challenges and issues. The fifty Terminal Competencies (TCs) (Appendix 4.3) are spread across six core subjects taught at primary level, where they are referred to as ‘subject-based competencies’. For each subject, the subject-based competencies are further broken into ‘class-wise attainable competencies’ for Grade One through to Grade Five. At the bottom of the hierarchy lie the ‘learning outcomes’ which are set for each subject in each grade. A learning outcome is defined as the knowledge, skills and attitude that the learning should develop. Topics and content in textbooks are selected based on these learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are also referred to as ‘behavioural objectives’ since the expected change becomes observable in the learners’ behaviour. An example of how the ninth Terminal Competency has been spanned across grades three to five for the subject Social Studies is provided in Appendix 4.4.
An initial analysis of the terminal competencies and curricular objectives of the core subjects revealed that the development of children’s personal, social, human, religious, and citizenship values — which is the focus of this research — is covered mainly in two subjects, namely Religious Studies and Social Studies. Among the four Religious Studies for the principal religions of Bangladesh, Islamic Religious Study has been chosen for this research as the majority (87%) of the population adhere to this religion. The curriculum and textbook analysis in this study therefore, focuses only on the two subjects, Social Studies and Islamic Studies. The following section describes how values development has been emphasised in the primary curriculum and textbooks.

4.3.3 Primary Curriculum and Textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies

All Bangladeshi primary schools are provided with a subject-wise curriculum, a teacher edition of the accompanying textbooks and a limited range of charts, posters, and other learning and teaching tools. However, in almost all of the primary schools the textbooks are the only instructional tool used by the teachers. Teachers make use of the textbooks in preparing for lessons, delivering the subject-matter, designing and planning classroom activities and so on. Similarly, the only learning resource that the primary students have access to is the textbooks that are developed and distributed nationally by the government. Because of the poor socio-economic condition of the majority of the Bangladeshi population, only a limited proportion of families can afford to buy their children learning and/or entertainment materials, for instance drawing books, story books, toys or other equipment that may function as sources of knowledge and associated skills in addition to the textbooks.

Student evaluation, that is the development of test items for term and completion exams and daily evaluation during lessons, is solely based on the content included in the textbooks. Whether students have mastered the textbook content skillfully, predominantly by rote-learning, determines the exam score and the academic recognition the students receive at the end of the year. Thus, the curriculum and particularly the textbooks act as the bridge between learners and the subject matter in Bangladeshi primary schools.

One of the broader research aims of this study is gaining insights into the way the curriculum documents and textbook content support values education. The objectives are to examine the:

1) values that are incorporated, how these values are defined, and the descriptions used for representing these values;
2) personal and social skills that are emphasised; and

3) extent to which the content, learning exercises, and the classroom activities:
   a) link to the needs and real-life experiences of the children;
   b) enhance children's natural interest, curiosity, and attention;
   c) develop higher-order cognitive skills; and
   d) provide opportunities for children to explore values of their own and others, and to enact the values.

The following analysis of the curriculum and textbook attempts to cast light on these issues.

4.3.3.1 Aims of the Curriculum

The aims and objectives of Social Studies (SS) are stated as developing social skills and qualities in learners, which will enable students to become responsible and innovative citizens equipped with the knowledge, skills and attitudes they will need to cope with changing social phenomena (DPE, 2005b). The Social Studies curriculum aims to develop awareness among children of the environment around them, and make them active members of that environment.

The educational philosophy emphasised in the curriculum of Islamic Studies (IS) emphasises that children who develop a belief or faith in Islam and follow the teachings of the Qur’an (the Holy Book) and the Hadith (sayings of Prophet Muhammad) will be able to build their character and contribute to the creation of a peaceful society. This curriculum makes children familiar with the Islamic teachings on the virtues and values of human life. The Islamic Studies syllabus, as is the case for other religious studies included in the curriculum, is intended for teaching not only the rituals pertaining to the particular religious belief, but also attempts to deliver the religious virtues and support the character formation of the students. Objectives of teaching this subject, as mentioned in the curriculum, are listed in Appendix 4.5.

It is important to note that the curricula for all subjects are presented in a tabular form, the entries being grade-wise attainable competencies, corresponding learning outcomes, topics to be covered for each learning outcome, and suggestions for ‘class work’ (teaching-learning activities). An excerpt from the Grade Three Social Studies Curriculum is provided in Appendix 4.6, which illustrates the way one of the grade-wise attainable competencies has been divided into learning outcomes as well as the textbook topics and classroom activities suggested. It is more a concise syllabus than a detailed curriculum. As can be imagined, the suggestions for teachers provided in a table column include very little description of the teaching-learning activities or evaluation techniques. The curriculum is quite short and provides only limited guidelines for teaching the subjects.
4.3.3.2 Textbooks of Social Studies and Islamic Studies

As indicated earlier, the terminal competencies concerning the nurturing of values are intended to be achieved through studying Social Studies and Religious Studies. The concepts and topics that are covered in the textbooks of Social Studies and Islamic Studies, from Grade Three to Grade Five, are summarised in this section. A critical analysis of the textbook content is also reported. Because the textbooks are the principal, and, in most cases, the only instructional resource that is used in Bangladeshi primary schools, this analysis will reveal the extent to which the content and activities provided in the textbooks address children’s moral and character development.

General Description

The latest national textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies are available both in Bengali and English. The Bengali versions were developed between 2003 and 2005 to be used from the next academic years. However, the English versions of the same textbooks were developed in 2007 to be used from the same academic year. In this study, electronic copies of the English version textbooks have been used for analysis and the analysis findings are discussed in this section. However, the textbooks used in the classrooms observed were the Bengali versions (NCTB, 2003a, 2003b, 2003c, 2004b, 2004c, 2005a, 2005b), and therefore in the analysis of the classroom observations, these versions have been used; the findings from this analysis will be reported in the next chapter. All of the textbooks are available on the website of the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), Bangladesh, www.nctb.gov.bd from where the researcher downloaded the electronic versions. Total numbers of pages and illustrations (pictures or sketches) in the textbooks are shown in Appendix 4.7.

As informed in the preface of all the textbooks, the books were written based on the attainable competencies determined for the respective grades. In general, each of the Social Studies and Islamic Studies concepts are covered in a single chapter in corresponding textbooks. Typically, a concept is introduced in the Grade Three textbook and then gradually elaborated to provide a deeper understanding of more complex topics and ideas in the textbooks of upper grades. A common feature of all the textbook chapters is that after the main content is presented an exercise section at the end of the chapter is provided which includes sample questions for objective, short-answer and narrative-answer type questions. Examples of the exercise sections have been copied verbatim and are shown in Appendix 4.8.

Topics Covered

Social Studies: An analysis of the seventeen subject-wise terminal competencies set for Social Studies resulted in a list of key concepts that are covered in the Social Studies textbooks. The concepts and their description are listed in Table 4.1.
Table 4.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Concepts in Social Studies Textbooks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key Concepts</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity, tolerance, inclusion, and democratic living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rights, duties and responsibilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal, moral and social qualities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment, its pollution and protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spirit of Liberation War, patriotism, and nationalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social and national resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population problem in Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to other cultures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universalism, international relations and world peace</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To give the readers an understanding of the textbook content across various grades, the titles of the chapters included in the Social Studies textbooks for grades three to five (NCTB, 2007a, 2007b, 2007c) have been listed in Appendix 4.9.

As indicated by the topics listed in Table 4.1, the Social Studies curriculum includes a broad range of concepts and topics and the textbooks appear to provide a greater emphasis on a shallow approach to a range of topics at the expense of depth. As an example, in the Social
Studies Grade Three book, a chapter includes content on the various roles we take in society, as well as providing information on different religions and religious customs. It is not clear how just by knowing about customs and festivals of four religions, students will be able to develop respect for religious diversity. The same chapter includes some discussion on people of differing gender, age, occupation and nationality. There are some promises that the students need to make to maintain religious harmony in society. Students also learn that they need to respect all people, irrespective of economic conditions, be caring and compassionate to domestic workers, respect and help all, irrespective of nationality and religion. In conclusion it is said that world peace can be established in this way. This single chapter contains information on many diverse and complex concepts with almost no opportunities provided for students to discuss or explore these topics in greater detail. Yet another example can be given from the same book where seemingly limited content has been included in relation to a subject-wise terminal competency on human rights (Table 4.2). The paragraphs from the book are shown after Table 4.2.

### Table 4.2

**One subject-wise Terminal Competency and its Description**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject-wise competency</th>
<th>Class-wise attainable competencies</th>
<th>Learning outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10. To gain knowledge of fundamental human rights and to practise these rights in social and civic life.</td>
<td>10.1 Students will know what human rights are and will be able to describe some important fundamental human rights.</td>
<td>Students will be able to:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. say what human right is;</td>
<td>2. say the dates of the international human rights day and the children rights day;</td>
<td>3. express the thought that all humans have equal rights irrespective of gender, religion, caste and mother language;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. express that torturing and humiliating human beings violate human rights;</td>
<td>5. tell the names of some national human right organisations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Human rights

We are all human beings. We live in different countries of the world. The right to live well as human beings is called human rights. The United Nations has made a declaration on human rights.

All countries obey this declaration. This declaration has stated rights for the thoughts, actions, religions, security of every human being. All people regardless of male, female, religion and caste will enjoy these rights equally.
According to this declaration people cannot be oppressed and suppressed. We shall obey the UN declaration of human rights so that all can live in a good environment. Many organizations work for human rights. The Amnesty International is a remarkable one. It works for the rights of the people of all countries. ‘Legal Aid Centre’ ‘Adhikar’ are other human rights organizations of our country. All the countries of the world observe Human Rights Day on 10th of December. (NCTB, 2007c, p. 68)

Islamic Studies: One of the goals of the primary Islamic Studies curriculum is to build ‘Akhlāq’ or character. Pupils are expected to learn about and follow the religious teachings that entail character formation. Grade Three students learn the significance of obeying parents, behaving well with classmates and guests, exchanging greetings, being compassionate to living creatures, telling the truth and serving humankind. They are also expected to act accordingly. As can be seen, basic human values and personal qualities, such as truthfulness, good manners, compassion, and obeying parents are the focus of this grade.

As students move to Grade Four, they are taken a little further from their immediate environment and basic knowledge of humanity and personal qualities. They learn what ‘character’ is and activities are aimed at motivating students to develop these ideal characteristics. Grade Four students learn about the importance of obeying and respecting teachers, elders, and being affectionate to juniors. Their responsibilities to neighbours, as well as personal qualities like patience, truthfulness, keeping promises etc. are introduced at this stage. They are also taught about the negative influences of greed, wastefulness, and spite. In light of Islamic teachings, the children are encouraged to practise good habits and avoid bad habits.

At the final stage of the Islamic Studies curriculum, a deepened comprehension of ‘good character’ and of building character in the light of Islamic education is expected from the learners. Noble virtues and qualities such as honesty, forgiveness, mercy, and care for parents and living creatures are elaborated in Grade Five. Newer concepts like patriotism and serving the nation are also introduced. Students learn about the merits of helping, performing and encouraging good deeds and preventing wrong doings.

It can be seen from this brief summary of the content that while the Social Studies materials are aimed at developing civic and citizenship values, the Islamic Studies curriculum mostly emphasises private or moral values conveying the message that, because every action of Muslims will be judged in the Hereafter, one should follow the teachings of Quran and Hadith to satisfy Allah and to create a peaceful world.

Titles of the sections included in the ‘Akhlāq’ [Character] chapters in the Islamic Studies textbooks for grades three to five (NCTB, 2007d, 2007e, 2007f) have been listed in Appendix
4.10. It should be noted that the analysis of the Islamic Studies textbooks was limited to these Akhlaq chapters.

The discussion that follows will identify some limitations in the way the textbook content of these subjects is composed and presented. Given the important role that textbooks play in Bangladeshi primary education by being almost the only teaching/learning resource that teachers and students use, an examination of the way in which learning activities are constructed and delivered is integral to understanding the extent to which the content, learning exercises, and the classroom activities: a) link to the needs and real-life experiences of the children; b) enhance children's natural interest, curiosity, and attention; c) develop higher-order cognitive skills; and, d) provide opportunities for children to explore values of their own and others, and to enact the values.

General Format and Language. The primary focus of the textbooks appears to be providing a model of what students can do or should do, but rarely are guidelines provided as to how the learners can implement values in practical ways or in their everyday lives. In some cases, the tone of the content seems authoritative and students are left with very little scope for realising the necessity of making moral judgements, or learning the process of moral reasoning. The content, instead, prescribes an ideal form of how children should think, behave or act in their personal or social lives.

For example, at the end of a Social Studies Grade Three (SS-3) book chapter, a list of promises that ‘we’ [the students] will make to prevent environmental pollution is provided (p. 5). There is almost no room for learners to think about or ask questions like "Why would I do that?" or "What if I do not do that?" In the same book, children learn about school rules in the following way:

Everyday, we will come to school in time. We will bring books, notebooks, pencils, eraser, etc., to school in a proper way. We will join the assembly of the school. We will obey the advice of our teachers. We will behave well with our classmates and others. During tiffin hour break time we will take tiffin and play games. When the bell rings, we will come back to our classroom in time. We will take part in the annual cultural functions, sports competition and other functions of the school. We will keep the classroom and the school premises neat and clean. When the school breaks up, we will get out of the classroom in a queue. Afterwards, we will go to our own houses. (NCTB, 2007c, pp. 29-30)

Instead of asking children to formulate ideas from their daily experience regarding what they do or should do, a prescribed list is provided in the above example. Similarly, in other cases too, children are encouraged to repeat ‘promises’ instead of examining how they can reflect the values in their own lives.
In representing the content, the Social Studies textbooks do not include any stories, either fictional or real-life. The only exception to this, found in the third grade book, is a story about electing the class-captain. The Islamic Studies books, however, do contain a number of stories from the lives of Prophets and saints of Islam.

**Representation of Values.** Values are in general mentioned in the textbooks as part of the discussion on broader issues instead of being treated as important in their own right. The content on values provides very few opportunities for students to reflect on their own behaviour or to judge their own actions against a particular value. A great many instances were found in the textbooks where a range of qualities and values were merely listed without any scope for exploring the concepts and ideas underlying these qualities and values. For example, one of the Social Studies Grade Four chapters titled ‘Social Qualities’ contains the text in the introductory paragraph that:

Man [Sic] is a social being. From time immemorial man [Sic] lives together. Each man lives in some society or other. The basis of society is unity, cooperation and living together. Each society has certain rules and regulations. We will observe them. Fair play, sense of duty, sense of discipline, politeness, sense of time, mentality to live together peacefully etc. are moral and social qualities and we will acquire them. (NCTB, 2007b, p. 16)

There is no further discussion, however, following this paragraph that directly makes references to the qualities mentioned. In the latter sections of this chapter, the content is presented under the headings: ‘Family’, ‘Neighbours’, and ‘School’. The way these qualities are described in the context of family is as follows:

We will respect our elders and love our younger. [The] young or old will live peacefully together. We will help them and co-operate [with] them in their various work. We will have our baths, meals, prepare our lessons, and play games and sports in time. We will remember the motto “we will read in due time and play in due time”. We will never misbehave or show misconduct with any member[s] of the family. (NCTB, 2007b, p. 17)

In the context of neighbourhood, the students are instructed to respect the neighbours, maintain a peaceful relationship with them, help them when needed, and not make any problems for them. The content under the heading ‘School’ describes the way school can help students learn about various social qualities:

We study at school and learn many useful things about society. Along with that we come to learn about our duties and responsibilities towards our society and country. We also learn about hospitality and help towards people who are poor and in trouble.
In our spare time we take part in various games and sports and cultural activities. From school we go on picnics and educational excursions to places of historical interests. (NCTB, 2007b, p. 19)

Immediately after this comes the following content concluding the chapter:

Through participation in these activities we come to learn new things. As a result cooperation, sympathy, discipline, duty, politeness etc. [–] [t]hese social qualities are developed in us. We need these social qualities to carry out our responsibilities in society.

In a similar manner, the Grade Five Social Studies book includes a chapter titled ‘Social Virtues and Values’ where the terms ‘virtues’ and ‘values’ are not defined or differentiated. Students learn that ‘unity, togetherness, co-operation … truthfulness, justice, dutifulness, discipline, civility, courtesy, tolerance, sympathy’ (NCTB, 2007a, p. 24) are ‘our social values’, but these ‘values’ are neither defined nor elaborated or represented with examples of how they can affect our personal or social lives. This chapter then concludes with the following paragraph where various complex constructs are presented without adequate explanation:

Unity, togetherness and co-operation establish good relations among members of the society. Civilization, culture, and tradition of a nation develop on the basis of social values. Social values create a sense of help and co-operation for man. As a result, relations among people of the society become deep. Unity is established among the people. Love grows for the motherland. Social values teach us to behave well with people, bring discipline in life and help to be a perfect man. (NCTB, 2007a, p. 25)

The above discussion on the presentation of values also applies to the Islamic Studies textbooks. A common feature of the way the preferred attitudes and character traits are presented in the Islamic Studies textbooks is that the significance of these attitudes, values or dispositions are described in light of the expectations of the Creator from the human beings, stipulated by the verses in the Qur’an or the teachings of Prophet Muhammad. For example, the concept and significance of ‘good character’ is introduced to the Grade Five students in the Islamic Studies book by saying:

Once a person asked the great Prophet (Sm)- "The most Gracious Allah has blessed human beings with innumerable gifts. Which is the most valuable one among these? The great Prophet (Sm) said: "Good character is the most precious gift".

Everybody loves the person, who speaks the truth, does good deeds, maintains cleanliness, keeps word[s], he gets every one's affection. And if this person is of old age then everybody respects him. Everybody says that his character is good. Everyone has conscience, has intelligence. Everybody can understand which is good and which is bad. (NCTB, 2007f, p. 91)
Later in this book, discussion on the virtue ‘Service and Help to The Creation’ includes:

Our great Prophet (Sm) said, on the day of Last judgment Allah will say, I was hungry, you did not give me food. I was without clothes; you did not give me clothes. I was sick, you did not nurse me. Men will say, oh Almighty! You are free from all these necessities. Allah will say: There were needy and sick ones around you, if you would have nursed and helped them that would have been the service to me. I would have been glad.

We have come to know that, Allah becomes happy if we help human beings. He becomes much more happy if we serve and help the needy ones and the destitutes [Sic]. But in spite of having scopes, those do not help the poor, do not serve the afflicted ones, Allah becomes displeased and unsatisfied with them. (NCTB, 2007f, p. 93)

Similarly, the content on the topic, ‘Obedience to Parents’ has been presented in the Grade Three Islamic Studies book in the following manner:

The Almighty Allah Says- “You should behave nicely with your parents.” Our beloved Prophet (Sm) said- ”You can please Allah by making your parents happy.”

Parents are our most dear ones. They look after us with love and care. For this, we have to be nice to them. We should respect them and greet them with ‘Salam’. We should obey them. We should not do such things that our parents tell us not to do. We should speak politely with them. In their need we should look after them and make them happy. If we do all the above things Allah will be happy with us too. Allah is pleased if we listen to our parents. As a result all our tasks become easier. We can attain heaven. Heaven is a place of great bliss and happiness.

The Prophet (Sm) has said, "A child's heaven is under the feet of his/her mother". (NCTB, 2007f, p. 29)

This is then followed by a story from the biography of a saint who created an extraordinary example of obedience to his mother.

Opportunities for Moral Action and Service Learning. The textbooks include content on how children can act responsibly with regard to their family, school, local community, and the nation. For example, in the Social Studies Grade Four textbook students are encouraged to take part in school activities, such as building a school library, growing gardens and making fences to protect those gardens. The students learn that building libraries in their home, neighbourhood, and local community, as well as devising a waste disposal plan based on the community consensus or assisting in community law and order initiatives, are the sorts of activities they should take part in. Grade Five students learn from the Social Studies textbook that their social commitment should include organising a ‘Plant Fare’ or ‘Social Forestation Event’ in
their local community in cooperation with the Department of Agriculture and other non-government organisations and provide the community members with information and materials regarding the production of fruits and vegetables. Other such suggested activities include garbage collection, waste disposal, and pest control, as well as repairing houses, bridges and other buildings after any natural calamity. The students are instructed to join the scout [for boys] or girls’ guide [for girls], or the co-curricular club in school\(^\text{15}\) to be involved in these development activities.

It is questionable whether the tasks suggested above are appropriate for children aged between six and eight years. It seems that the majority of the activities depicted in the textbooks are beyond what could be achieved by children of these ages and within the school context. The reality in Bangladeshi schools is that there is almost no scope for children to participate in experiences outside of the school environment. In fact children rarely even step outside the classroom during most of the school day. Thus, the likelihood of their involvement in the kind of social activities mentioned in the textbooks is far from the students’ reality. The message that the students get from the textbooks, therefore, is mostly disconnected from their actual learning environment and life experiences.

**Activities, Exercises in the Curriculum.** The introduction to the curricula for Social Studies and Islamic Studies include general suggestions for teachers to use a wide range of creative and interesting teaching-learning strategies, such as excursions, visual aids, narratives, stories, and personal encounters with events, in delivering the subject content. Through engaging in these interactive and participatory learning experiences, children will develop knowledge, self-motivation and a sense of responsibility towards the social and natural environments.

However, the chapter-wise planned activities—as provided in the tabular form of the curriculum (Appendix 4.6)—are mostly confined to tasks which involve the children in writing in their notebooks. In almost all of the cases where a writing activity is suggested for inclusion in the lesson, the activity actually is listing some points that were found in the analysis provided directly in the textbook content. Examples of such listing activities\(^\text{16}\) suggested in the Grade five Social Studies Curriculum are given below:

- List all the rules that prevail in the school and family.
- List the ways a student can serve others.

---

\(^{15}\) The ‘Cub’ team and the ‘Yellow Birds’ team

\(^{16}\) From this point onwards, writing answers to fact-finding questions or filling in tables given in the book will also be considered to be included in this ‘listing’ activity type.
• List the ways the countries in the world can help each other.

An analysis of the ‘classwork’ suggested in the Social Studies curriculum for grades three through five revealed the relative frequencies and description of various types of activities suggested. Among the 49 activities suggested for the teachers in the grade three curriculum, listing tasks comprised 44.9% of the total activities. Similarly, 57.7% of the total 52 activities in the grade four curriculum, and 58.7% of the total 63 activities in the grade five curriculum were listing tasks. Activities other than the listing tasks included beyond-classroom and school-wide activities, advanced teaching-learning techniques to be implemented in the classroom, as well as observation, drawing, writing, and locating places or regions of interest in a map. The activities that seemed to involve students in challenging and interesting tasks as well as in interaction with other members in the school, family and neighbourhood are referred to as ‘Advanced activities’ in this analysis. A complete description of the various types of classroom activities included in the curriculum of grades three, four and five are given in Table 4.3, Table 4.4 and Table 4.5, respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity Types</th>
<th>Percentage of Total Number of Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listing</td>
<td>44.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced activities</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation of people and other elements in the surrounding environment</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pointing in map</td>
<td>10.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing task to classify or explain information</td>
<td>4.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher observation of students’ behaviour</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Grade Three advanced activities included:
• greeting classmates on their birthdays and giving them presents;
• exchanging greetings with neighbours and extending help to them;
• sharing the news of events and celebrations in one’s own religion with the class, inviting classmates to these events and attending these events when invited by other classmates;
• performing songs and recitations of poems, rhymes;
school cleaning;
participating in the observation of the national days and other special days and making relevant posters; and,
voting in elections for the class captain.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity Type</th>
<th>Percentage of Total Number of Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listing</td>
<td>57.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced activities</td>
<td>21.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pointing in map</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going on excursion</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Grade Four advanced activities included:

- participating in the observation of the world environment day and the world women’s day; preparing in groups slogans relevant to the themes of these days, presenting them to the class and posting them on the school board;
- participating in school activities;
- group discussion in classroom;
- school cleaning;
- selecting the class captain;
- taking care of the local roads and the plants;
- listening to the stories told by any freedom-fighter about his or her involvement in the liberation war, and sharing those with the class;
- surveying the population size in the family and neighbourhood;
- calculating the population growth rate from given census data; and,
- developing a chart highlighting the basic needs of humans.
Table 4.5
Activity Types and their Frequencies (in percentage) in Grade Five Social Studies Curriculum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity Type</th>
<th>Percentage of Total Number of Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listing</td>
<td>58.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced activities</td>
<td>30.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing and/or pointing in map</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Grade Five advanced activities included:

- participating in a drawing competition and essay-writing competition in the school;
- school cleaning;
- gardening at school and home;
- developing a school library;
- collecting pictures of renowned persons of the nation and hanging these in the classroom;
- performing songs and recitations;
- observing independence day and victory day, and collecting souvenirs developed for these days;
- listening to the stories told by any freedom-fighter about his or her involvement in the liberation war, and sharing those with the class;
- inspecting roads and bridges in the locality and participating in repair activities along with adults;
- group discussion in classroom and writing discussion points;
- comparing the populations of different countries and presenting these in a chart; and,
- finding in the newspapers some national problems caused by the population growth.

The teaching-learning activities and evaluation techniques suggested in the Islamic Studies Curriculum (NCTB, n.d.-c) are given in Appendix 4.11. It can be seen in this curriculum that the activities and techniques suggested provide only basic and general
guidelines for the teachers, and do not elaborate on particular activities which could be conducted in the classroom.

**Activities, Exercises in the Textbooks.** The main type of student activity given in the textbooks is filling in the blank spaces in given lists or tables which in almost all cases are situated immediately below a paragraph containing factual information. Students are asked to list information that they have found in the passage above the table. The focus is on providing the ‘correct’ answer and there is almost no scope for children to think beyond the given content and construct their own understanding. The total numbers of such activities found in the textbooks are given in Table 4.6. Some examples of the tasks of listing or making entries into tables, as included in the textbooks, are provided in Appendix 4.12. It should be noted that the content in the ‘Character’ chapters in the Islamic Studies textbooks does not include any activities, not even listing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Textbook</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies Grade Three</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies Grade Four</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies Grade Five</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The analysis of all the textbooks revealed that only a few listing [or putting entries in tables] activities were an exception to the usual type of listing tasks. These six instances seemed exceptional to the researcher because either the content that needed to be included in those lists or tables was not provided in the chapter or the tasks were more or less individualised in nature. The students, therefore, had to draw on their own ideas to prepare the answers. Instructions for these listing tasks as included in the textbooks are given below.

**Grade Three Social Studies book (NCTB, 2007c)**

- *We shall write about more professionals [other than those described] in the table below.* (p. 77)
- *We shall think for a while about who are senior to us and who are junior to us in our houses and schools. Now we will write the names in the table below.* (p. 80)

**Grade Five Social Studies book (NCTB, 2007a)**

- *We will now write in our notebooks the rules and practices of clubs and associations as in the following table.* (p. 24)
• Write some qualities of a leader whom you know in a similar table [as given] below in your notebook. (p.49)

Other than the ‘recall’ tasks such as listing, the only higher order thinking activity found in the textbooks was a Mind Map exercise and an observation task, both in the Social Studies Grade Five textbook. The Mind Map activity, however, does not require the children to brainstorm or add anything new to the content that is given in a passage directly above the activity.

The observation task is worded as:

Let us now observe the environment of our surrounding places and prepare a list [of three items] of its condition. (p. 28)

At the end of each textbook chapter, the exercise section includes questions of the following types: filling in the blanks, identifying true/false statements, matching, multiple choice questions, and answering short and narrative questions (see Appendix 4.8). There are almost no reflective or thought-generating questions in the exercises. Answers to the questions are given in the chapter. It seems that the aim is only to test the student’s ability of fact-finding from the chapter passages. In general, the answers to the questions in the True/False and Multiple Choice exercises are almost self-evident and require little thinking or evaluation. This kind of task requires the lower-level thinking processes of retrieving and restating concrete ‘facts’ and does not engage higher-level thinking processes, such as critical reflection, evaluation or analysis.

For example, the matching exercise (item 3) in Example 1 in Appendix 4.8 requires the student to match two parts of the sentences which are already included the chapter content. To answer this item, one needs to have only an understanding of correct sentence structure and he or she will not even need to comprehend or think deeply about the meaning of the sentences. Another example would be filling in the blank item in the exercise section of the chapter titled ‘Our Work in the Family and the School’ in the Grade Four Social Studies book (NCTB, 2007b, p. 5). The sentences for this item are given below with the answers predicted in the parentheses:

a. We --- at school. (study)
b. We do not --- anything on the school buildings or on the walls. (write)
c. We will develop a ---. (library)
d. We will read books in the library and will put --- in their proper place (them).
e. Girls aged between six and ten form a --- in the school. (‘Yellow Birds’ team)
The sentences in this exercise are either copied word-by-word from the chapter or are slightly changed. Some of the questions, such as (a) and (b) are low-level in the sense that in answering these questions students will just need common sense and they do not even need to recall any information learnt from the textbook chapter. It can also be inferred that the answers to these questions are confined to what is included in the chapter content and students are not allowed to use their creativity in answering this question, for instance, using ‘play’ instead of ‘study’ in item (a) above. Moreover, the ‘Objectives’ questions in the textbooks, (see Example 2 in Appendix 4.8), are almost in all cases fact-finding questions with their answers being very obvious and straightforward.

Some of the short and narrative answer type questions include the affective domain or higher order thinking. But, as the content is provided in the book, students seem to rote learn and therefore all questions from the affective domain or higher levels of cognitive engagement actually turn into restating declarative knowledge. Of the entire exercises included in the Social Studies and Islamic Studies textbooks, only one practical activity was found in the Grade Four Islamic Studies textbook:

*The students will clean the classroom once a week. (NCTB, 2007e, p. 92)*

### 4.3.4 Summary and Discussion

This section has examined the extent to which the aims and objectives of the primary level curricula and textbooks of Social Studies and Islamic Studies cover the personal, social and moral development of pupils. It was portrayed that the state philosophy of religious adherence, socialism, nationalism, and democracy have been translated to a set of spiritual, human, social and citizenship values, which form the basis of aims, objectives, and learning outcomes of primary education in Bangladesh. The values-related outcomes are expected to be achieved from mastering the subject-matter of Social Studies and Religious Studies, and the key topics and chapter content in the textbooks of these subjects were designed to achieve this goal.

Given that the textbooks are used as the sole learning and instructional resource in Bangladeshi primary schools, the limitations of the textbooks that have been identified in this section could be impeding the extent to which pupils can understand and acquire values. To summarise the shortcomings, the textbooks tend to cover a broad range of topics and provide examples which are disconnected from student’s lives rather than supporting students to acquire a deep understanding of the intended curriculum focus. The textbooks rarely provide learning activities that allow students to investigate the nature of values, the significance of a particular value in life, and the way the presence or absence of values can affect themselves or the feelings.
of others. In addition, the text, activities, and exercises leave almost no scope for children to explore and share their own values and those of others, and commit moral actions guided by the values. Thus, the understanding that may be gained from the main curriculum component, the textbook, is limited to theoretical definitions and may not be sufficient to encourage or motivate children to practise these values independently in their own lives. Moreover, the textbooks rarely provide activities which could promote higher-order cognitive skills and emotional skills, such as conflict resolution, decision making, problem solving, goal setting, and controlling one’s own emotions, which are essential to bolster in children, if the education enterprise of values development is to be achieved. Moreover, although the curricula of both subjects recommend taking into account the natural curiosity and investigative mind of young learners, as well as their age-specific capacity and need for learning, the textbook content does not reflect this recommendation. The textbooks lack diversity in teaching-learning strategies and provide mainly ‘lower-level’ skills such as retrieving and restating facts.

However, the possibility that teachers may engage students in more active and meaningful learning by supplementing their lessons with sources and activities other than those provided in the textbooks, is not being ignored. As discussed earlier in this chapter, student evaluation is currently under careful scrutiny and the introduction in 2012 of ‘creative questioning’ in primary completion exams means that evaluation will no longer entirely depend on mastery of textbook content and solving the exercises provided in the textbooks. Moreover, the government’s attempts to provide teacher training in advanced teaching and evaluation techniques should lead to an improvement in the quality of teaching and learning in Bangladeshi primary schools.

The following section examines the professional training of Bangladeshi primary teachers and the practical knowledge and skills provided by this training and other resources that have the potential to improve teaching skills and classroom practices.

4.4 Values in Teacher Training Resources

This section describes the instructional resources provided for primary teachers in Bangladesh and the provisions that are available for teachers’ professional training and development. This examination of the curricula and other features of these resources and training programs is conducted in order to reveal how the teachers’ knowledge and skills prepare them to deliver values-related lessons.
4.4.1 Instructional Resources Available to Teachers

As discussed in the previous section, the main resources used for teaching in Grade Three through to Grade Five are textbooks and the teacher editions of these textbooks. Sample lesson plans, question booklets, and information booklets are also provided for teachers. The teacher’s manual replaces the above materials for Grade One and Two, since there are no textbooks for these grades.

The teacher manuals and teacher editions of the Social Studies and Religious Studies textbooks come as a set with the curriculum documents and textbooks which were last revised in 2002. With the technical and financial support of UNICEF and other donor agencies, revised manuals, teacher editions and additional resources have recently been developed for other subjects including Bengali, English, Maths and Science, as part of the ongoing endeavour in improving teaching quality. However, for Social Studies and Religious Studies, such resources are not yet available.

The question booklets (for Grades Three to Five) provide suggestions on how to evaluate student understanding of the subject content, what questions to ask from each textbook chapter during lessons, and what sort of test items to develop for evaluation. Social Studies teachers also receive a collection of sample lesson plans, for Grade Three to Five, that highlight the multiple intelligences children may employ and the corresponding Multiple Ways Teaching Learning (MWTL) method. Teachers are provided with instructions on how to develop lesson plans including definitive steps on fostering motivation and creating a safe learning environment, lesson presentation, teaching-learning activities, and evaluation tasks. This book also suggests lesson-based activities that take into account various forms of human intelligences. There are also information booklets provided named ‘Gender Toolkit’ and ‘Inclusive Education’.

With a view to understanding the ways in which the instructional resources are guiding teachers’ endeavours in teaching Social Studies and Religious Studies (Grades Three to Five), the teacher editions of the textbooks for these subjects were analysed. These editions are a broader version of the textbooks in the sense that they contain the exact text from the textbook chapters with the addition of the competencies and learning outcomes to be achieved from the chapter, and outlining the division of each chapter into multiple lessons. The teacher editions also suggest the kinds of teaching-learning activities and materials, evaluation techniques, and remedial actions that need to be undertaken in each lesson.

General guidelines to teachers come as a list in the teacher editions. These guidelines advise teachers to:

- read the lesson content several times before taking a lesson;
• make efforts to develop a pleasant and sharing classroom environment;
• make teaching learner-centred and ensure active participation of learners;
• use simple, standard language to explain subject matter, and encourage comments;
• assess prior knowledge of students relevant to the lesson topic;
• collect, prepare, and use teaching-learning materials;
• create opportunities for group activities and cooperative learning; and
• encourage learning from the real environment, rather than only from the textbooks.

The above directions appear to be guiding teachers to create a learner-centred environment. The content of the teacher editions, however, provides shallow guidelines for, and traditional modes of, classroom teaching and evaluation. Widely suggested techniques comprise a question-answering method and having the children make a chart/list or fill in blank tables on either the blackboard or notebook. The questions that have been suggested to introduce a topic or to evaluate a student’s level of understanding are mainly fact-finding questions and do not lead students to deep thinking or discussion. While the guidelines emphasise a learner-centred approach the resources do not include sufficient directions or suggestions for creating a learner-centred classroom environment and using learner-centred teaching approaches. Given that most Bangladeshi teachers have had only ten to twelve years of schooling and possibly no prior teaching education or experience (discussed in next section), it would be very challenging for teachers to adopt learner-centred teaching-learning strategies just by following these resources. Most importantly, as relevant to this research, these resources do not recognise or illustrate the standard teaching-learning strategies that are effective in delivering the content of Social Studies, particularly the topics pertaining to moral and values development.

4.4.2 Teacher Training Provisions

A recent study on primary teachers in Bangladesh (Quddus, 2008) depicts an in-depth picture of the core vocational training programs and their weaknesses. The findings and discussion included in this section mainly draws from the above source, if not otherwise stated.

Three institutions work at the core of primary teacher training in Bangladesh, namely Primary Training Institutes (PTIs), National Academy for Primary Education (NAPE) 17 and Upazila Resource Centres (URCs) 18. Across the country, fifty-seven PTIs, which are secondary

17 The apex institution in the primary teacher training structure.
18 'Upazila' refers to a sub-district. URCs were introduced in late 1990s in order to i) improve teaching skills of teachers in order to improve classroom teaching and learning; ii) strengthen the sub-cluster training system by
school level institutions, offer the Certificate in Education (C-in-Ed) training — the main vocational training of primary teachers. NAPE is responsible for the in-service training of teacher trainers and field-level administrators and for providing academic support to the PTIs and all the URCs in the country. The URCs facilitate in-service training and provide regular and technical support to strengthen sub-cluster training.\(^{19}\)

Although C-in-Ed is a pre-service training course for untrained primary teachers, operationally only in-service teachers who enter the job without any training enrol in this certificate course. This module-based one year course has a 3-month component of supervised practice teaching. In addition to C-in-Ed training, a one-year Higher C-in-Ed course, initiated on an experimental basis in 1995 in some PTIs, is offered to in-service teachers who decide to be head teachers. Since 1990, PTIs also have been hosting short courses for teachers, for example, competency-based curriculum dissemination programs or project-based refresher courses. The principal in-service training for teachers, called sub-cluster training, is conducted by an Upazila Education Officer (UEO) or Assistant UEO (AUEO)\(^{20}\) as a bi-monthly full-day training session. Since early 2000, 5-day ‘subject-based’ training for each of the core subjects at primary level have also been provided by the URCs, in order to improve the teachers’ skills of classroom management and teaching these subjects. The training on Social Studies started since 2006. Moreover, there are short training courses for teachers on school management, pre-primary education, and also for the School Management Committee (SMC) members.

The Teacher Training Colleges (TTCs) and a few universities, such as Dhaka University and Bangladesh Open University, offer a ten-month to one-year pre/in-service B. Ed course which is usually taken by those government primary school teachers who want to be an Education Officer or an Assistant Education Officer. This course, however, is designed for secondary school teachers and is not suitable for primary teachers. The two above-mentioned universities also offer a one-year Diploma in Education (Dip-in-Ed) course mainly designed for graduate primary teachers and a one-year Master of Education (M.Ed.) course for teacher instructors and sub-district level education officers. Moreover, a few universities offer 4-year Bachelor of Education (Honours) degrees in which a total of 938 students were enrolled in different years in 2010, according to the BANBEIS statistics.

---

\(^{19}\) Bi-monthly, full-day in-service training session for teachers conducted by the immediate supervisor, the AUEOs. Each sub-cluster consists of 5-10 primary schools.

\(^{20}\) AUEOs are at the bottom of educational administration hierarchy, and therefore the immediate supervisors of teachers.

\(^{21}\) Trainings are available for Bengali, English, Math, Social Studies, and Science.
4.4.2.1 Curriculum of Key Teacher Training Programs

In this discussion of teacher efficacy and adequacy of the existing teacher training and supervision scenario, it is important to look at the minimum qualification required to be a primary school teacher or a field-level teacher educator. The curriculum of the C-in-Ed course is limited in its capacity to adequately equip trainee teachers with the necessary teaching and classroom management skills given that the minimum entry requirement for this course is low. Table 4.7 lists the recruitment criteria as specified in the most recent advertisements issued by the Directorate of Primary Education. The entries in Table 4.7 show that any female person with a 10-year qualification and without any experience or training can enter the teaching profession, and the training requirement is relaxed for males if they have a three/four year Bachelor degree.

Table 4.7
Minimum Qualification and Salary Grades for the Positions of Teachers and Field-level Education Officers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Minimum Qualification</th>
<th>Salary Grade as of the National Pay Scale 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-primary teacher (advertised on 15/11/2012) and</td>
<td><strong>Male:</strong> HSC or equivalent with C-in-Ed training, and at least one 2nd class (GPA 2.0*) in SSC or HSC.</td>
<td>With training: Grade 15 Without training: Grade 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant teacher (advertised on 4/8/2011)</td>
<td>OR,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelor or equivalent degree.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Female:</strong> SSC or equivalent with 2nd class (GPA 2.0*).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At least one 2nd class up to Master’s degree.</td>
<td>With training: Grade 13 Without training: Grade 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>OR,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelor degree with 3-year teaching experience in primary or high school, with at least one 2nd class up to Bachelor degree.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head teacher (advertised on 11/1/2012)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelor degree with 2nd class and a Master’s degree</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Upazila Education Officer (advertised in July, 2012)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*GPA 2.0 is equivalent to 40-49.99% mark

The C-in-Ed curriculum has been revised only three times in the last forty years, in 1978, 1992 and 2001. Although NAPE was established in 1978 with a vision to developing it as the apex institution in teacher training — laid with the responsibility of developing and revising the teacher training curriculum — so far NAPE has been unable to contribute to the curriculum development and revision process, owing to the lack of inter-institutional linkage and competent faculty members. Instead, this task is being accomplished by a small group of ‘experts’ who take into consideration recommendations from various committee reports in the revision and
development process. Given that the stakeholders (e.g. superintendents and instructors at the PTI, and NAPE staff) in the C-in-Ed training in Bangladesh have a limited conception of ‘curriculum’ as being merely a ‘syllabus’ or ‘module textbooks’ (Braathe & Otterstad, 2003, as cited in Quddus, 2008), the process of curriculum development for primary teacher training has been confined to a few top-level personnel in the MoPME and technical experts who are committed to upholding the political agenda of whichever government is in power.

Drawing from a number of national and international studies on Bangladeshi teacher education, Quddus (2008) has identified some major shortcomings of the revised curricula of the C-in-Ed program and questions the overall quality of the country’s teacher training programs. The most serious problem is that there is very little scope provided for practical teaching works/exercises and the curriculum is mainly theory-based and descriptive. This finding resembles what has been found from the analysis of the C-in-Ed curriculum (NAPE, 2008). Trainees have very few opportunities to develop their subject-specific knowledge and practical skills essential for teaching and student evaluation. For example, a significant portion of the C-in-Ed course is comprised of theoretical discussion on primary education principles and strategies and the organisational structure of the Bangladeshi primary education system. Although one of the four course modules covers teaching-learning strategies for core primary subjects, only 16% of this module delivers hands-on knowledge and skills for teaching those subjects.

As the PTIs suffer from the shortage of teacher trainers, there is not sufficient scope for C-in-Ed trainees to be familiarised with classroom situations, problems that may arise while teaching and solutions to these problems, life-oriented skills etc. Moreover, the curricula developed so far have not included adequate training components on the changing social and educational phenomena — as well as the associated school and classroom management skills, for example, dealing with large class sizes or with children with disabilities. The curriculum of the HC-in-Ed also suffers from the above shortcomings. It is to be noted that the C-in-Ed and other in-service training programs do not embody a set of competencies or outcomes that the teachers are expected to acquire and which are evaluated upon completion of the training. Moreover, as Quddus (2008) discovered from his field study, the evaluation process (marking and examination) of C-in-Ed trainees does not follow any benchmark or standard and appears to be faulty and corrupt.

Another serious issue that brings the quality of teacher training under scrutiny is the staffing situation in PTIs and NAPE. Not only are the academic training, qualifications and expertise of trainers inadequate for delivering quality teacher training, the understaffing in key positions of PTIs and NAPE is seriously affecting primary teachers’ training. It is evident from Table 4.7 that to be a field-level school administrator and teacher educator, one does not need to have any teaching experience or qualification in teacher training. The Bachelor or Master’s
degrees do not have to be earned in Education or related areas according to the advertisements. Anyone with a ten-month to one-year BEd training, but without a primary subject specialisation or even without any teaching experience, can apply to be teacher trainers for primary teachers. In addition, the ten-month to one-year B. Ed. training that is one of the requirements for a trainer position is mainly designed for secondary school teachers and does not provide training in primary education. There is also very limited scope for the incorporation of educational research in the key training institutions. In addition, to these positions it is difficult to attract high profile and competent graduates given that the teacher trainers in PTIs receive a poor salary which leads to their relatively low professional status.

Apart from the C-in-Ed training, teachers receive sub-cluster training from AUEOs who are also responsible for visiting each school under their jurisdiction at least once a month. However, the AUEOs receive only 3-12 days of training which is not adequate for training teachers and supervising them. The AUEOs are loaded with so many administrative responsibilities that the time they spend on designing and conducting in-service teacher training is minimal. Moreover, although the sub-cluster training was designed mainly for providing the teachers with an opportunity for sharing experiences related to pedagogy, classroom management etc., Quddus (2008) found from teacher interviews and observation of training sessions that AUEOs lack the attitude needed for building a co-operative and participatory environment. These findings suggest that the intended purpose of sub-cluster training is not being fulfilled.

In summary, the traditional theory-based curriculum, the relatively short duration of vocational training courses\textsuperscript{22}, and the inadequate qualifications and training of teacher trainers are working in combination against the delivery of quality teacher training in Bangladesh. The above discussion suggests that in order to build a trained workforce in primary teaching, it is an immediate necessity to develop a long-term and needs-based teacher training plan.

4.4.2.2 Short Training Courses for Teaching Quality Improvement

Taking into consideration the shortcomings discussed so far of existing teacher training curricula, the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education, under the PEDP-II program, started to develop in the late 1990s supplementary, short training courses for in-service teachers, in order to improve their attitude to their profession and the students as well as to the teaching approaches to make these more learner-friendly. The training materials and other resources in basic, in-service trainings have been designed around the Multiple Ways of Teaching and Learning (MWTL) method (DPE, 2005a, 2005b; A. Rahman, 2004). The multiple-intelligence based method was first introduced in Bangladesh by the UNICEF-funded IDEAL project in the

\textsuperscript{22} Eight-month to one-year C-in-Ed course, and two-hour to one-day, bi-monthly in-service trainings.
late 1990s to replace the long practiced rote-learning teaching strategies prevalent in primary schools with learner-centred methods, and to make classrooms more child-friendly, attractive and joyful. Seven-day training sessions on the Multiple Ways Teaching Learning (MWTL) and Evaluation is now running as a pilot program. Teachers are also being brought under subject-based training programs for English, Bengali, Math, Science and Social Studies. Training for social studies commenced in 2006 but is a relatively new addition compared to training for other subjects. For Religious Studies, however, no training program nor any specific teaching-learning and evaluation strategies have yet been developed.

Teacher training materials that will be analysed in the next section include the Information Booklet (DPE, 2005b) for Social Studies teachers, training manual for 5-Day subject-based training on Social Studies (DPE, 2005a), the training manual for the seven-day Multiple Ways Teaching Learning and Evaluation Training (NCTB, 2004a), and the Social Studies Grade Five teacher manual (NCTB, 2003c).

The training places equal importance on strengthening teacher knowledge and skills, and changing teachers’ attitudes. Specific modules are provided on the structure of the primary curriculum and the significance of learning outcomes, learner-based teaching-learning activities, using teaching materials appropriate to the lesson content and to the learning outcome(s), developing lesson plans, and evaluating students’ learning based on MWTL.

The discussion that follows summarises the major themes in the content of the supplementary in-service training courses. The reason for examining the training content is twofold. First, to understand what teaching approaches and pedagogies the primary teachers in Bangladesh are being exposed to and what areas of teachers’ professional practice may require more attention. Second, is to determine what to expect from teachers during the classroom observation sessions in the field-study phase of this research.

The common themes that the training courses cover are summarised below.

**Components of the Bangladeshi primary curriculum**: In order that teachers are well aware of the objectives and outcomes of the primary curriculum, practical information is provided on a range of topics including: the aims and objectives of primary education; competency-based curriculum; terminal competencies, subject-based competencies and learning outcomes; curriculum of the subject the training on which the training is provided; and the hierarchical relationship between the above components describing how the aims of education are reflected in the textbooks. Teachers are also introduced to the instructional resources developed by the department for assisting their teaching, and the significance of using those resources.
Multiple intelligences and Multiple Ways of Teaching and Learning (MWTL):

Recognising multiple intelligences in children and associated learning techniques, and using MWTL methods and techniques are at the core of teacher quality improvement programs in Bangladesh. In this respect, trainee teachers are introduced to concepts and theories on multiple intelligences, such as those of Jean Piaget, Benjamin Bloom, Howard Gardner and Lev Vygotsky. Trainees come to know that while designing teaching-learning activities and evaluation techniques, they should take into consideration the multiple ways that children can learn.

Because Social Studies is a multi-dimensional subject covering topics from varying fields, teaching-learning for Social Studies is relatively more complex than other subjects at the primary level. The subject-based training on Social Studies claims to fill the gaps in teachers’ knowledge and skills of using appropriate teaching-learning methods and techniques in the lessons of this subject. It is also stressed that Social Studies teachers have so far relied mainly on the ‘lecture method’ of presentation which has very little potential to lead students to achieving their subject-related competencies. The training manual (DPE, 2005a) describes some essential criteria for teaching Social Studies, which include:

- Fostering creative thinking in learners;
- Making lessons enjoyable and stimulating;
- Providing hands-on learning experience instead of mere rote-learning;
- Providing opportunities for students to connect their learning to real-life experiences;
- Fostering the students’ desire for deeper understanding;
- Creating interest in students to learn about the various components and properties of society; and
- Nurturing the social skills of learners.

The methods and techniques that the Social Studies teachers are introduced to and instructed to use in teaching this subject are summarised in Table 4.8.

Teachers learn both the strengths and weaknesses of the above methods and techniques, ways of making these strategies effective, and the preferred methods to use with different topics. The steps that the trainees are instructed to follow in selecting appropriate methods and techniques include:

- Thoroughly reading the textbook content for a lesson;
• Identifying methods and techniques suitable for firstly the subject and then the intended lesson content;
• Specifying in the lesson plan the selected methods and techniques and conducting the lesson according to the plan; and, finally,
• Confirming that the selected methods and techniques are child-centred, fun-based, and participatory for children.

Table 4.8
Recommended Methods and Techniques for Teaching Social Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Techniques</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>Question-answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question-answer</td>
<td>Storytelling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Storytelling</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigation</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstration</td>
<td>Question-answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excursion</td>
<td>Group work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acting</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debate</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment</td>
<td>Brain storming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem solving</td>
<td>Market place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigation</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Question-answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Group work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Pair work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Group work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Pair work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual task</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>Brain storming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brain storming</td>
<td>Market place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>Writing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>Market place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acting</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mind mapping</td>
<td>Drawing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Student evaluation:** It is stressed that the multiple intelligences of learners should be considered in evaluation. The intelligences include Visual-Spatial, Bodily-kinaesthetic, Musical, Interpersonal, Intrapersonal, Linguistic and Logical –Mathematical. Concepts of formal and informal assessment, summative, formative and continuous assessment, and desirable properties of oral and written tests are described in depth. Teachers are encouraged to use a variety of evaluation techniques, such as observation, discussion, anecdotal notes, checklists, portfolios etc. to make ‘the learning meaningful’. The training emphasises the inclusion of test items so that achievement in all three learning domains, namely cognitive, affective, and psychomotor (Bloom, Engelhart, Furst, Hill, & Krathwohl, 1956), can be tested. Teachers are instructed to select assessment techniques and tools which will adequately assess the knowledge, skills, and attitudes of learners achieved from a lesson, and to assess Social Studies-related outcomes that may occur as an outcome of the learners’ real life experiences and not merely from their mastery of the textbook content.

Although the pilot training program on MWTL and Evaluation describes in general terms how to carry out different types of evaluations, the subject-based training on Social Studies does not provide sufficient information on how to assess the social values, attitude, and skills of
a child. Social Studies teachers are advised to use evaluation methods, such as oral and written tests, observation, practical work, identification, classification, role-play, and drawing.

**Classroom management:** Special attention to classroom management skills and techniques is a common feature of the short training programs. Considering the socio-economic situation in Bangladesh, several problem areas have been identified that should be taken into account during classroom management to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes by all children. The identified problems include large class sizes and inadequate physical facilities in the classrooms as well as the mix of children with different levels of intelligence, attentiveness, learning capability, physical and mental ability as well as varying attendance patterns.

Emphasis has been given to the following areas of classroom management:

- making intelligent use of time;
- maintaining classroom discipline;
- ensuring the class organisation is suitable for the intended teaching-learning activities;
- planning seating arrangements for learners based on the anticipated interaction between teacher and learners;
- creating a learning-friendly classroom environment; and,
- ensuring a sufficient supply of light and air in the classroom.

Some of these factors are discussed below:

**Preparation for the lesson and development of a lesson plan:** In order to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes within the limited lesson duration, adequate time management is crucial and the teachers are instructed to plan in advance the steps of their lesson presentation, the nature of the learners’ task-based exercises, and the method for evaluating the students’ learning. Teachers learn that lesson plans must be developed prior to any lesson, taking into consideration the learners’ age, ability and interests, and subject content. They also receive instruction on how to prepare an effective lesson plan by clearly identifying the desired outcome of the lesson, the measures planned for creating an affective environment, the steps of presentation and activities stipulated within a time frame, the evaluation techniques, and the materials planned for the lesson. Translated versions of two sample lesson plans suggested in the Social Studies Teacher Training Manual (DPE, 2005a) are shown in Appendix 4.13.

**Safe and supportive learning environment:** Creating a child-friendly classroom environment in order to gain better learning outcomes and make the learning efficient and long-
lasting has been given special attention in the training programs. Teachers learn about the significance of the physical and mental demands on children and ways of meeting these demands before starting any teaching-learning activity. In order to refresh the children’s minds, teachers are instructed to involve them for the first few minutes in an activity relevant to the lesson, for example, a rhyme, song, poem, role-play, joke, riddle, magic, game, review of a previous lesson, light physical exercise etc. It is also stressed that teachers should give special, personal attention to slow learners and less-mature learners, and create opportunities for children to apply their learning skills.

Co-operative learning: The training programs also place special emphasis on group-based activities in order to ensure that classrooms become interactive and promote a shared learning environment. Having learned that group activities help develop children’s interpersonal relationship skills and positive attitudes to shared learning, Social Studies teachers are instructed to act as a facilitator to create opportunities for students’ sharing through individual or group discussion and to make their lessons task-based. The message is also conveyed to teachers that along with having necessary subject-knowledge, teachers should act as a friend, helper, advisor, and guide to students and become sympathetic to them.

Teachers also receive practical information on how to manage group-based activities by representing a balanced combination of children in each group, defining the roles of each group member, developing an appropriate seating arrangement for groups, providing necessary instructions on what the groups are expected to do and how performances of individuals and groups will be judged, and by continuously monitoring and assisting in the activity.

Teaching materials: The training programs include a separate session on the use of teaching materials in the classroom—the importance of using these materials, and the ways of selecting, collecting, developing, and storing them. Social Studies teachers are advised to use vision-based, hearing-based, and audio-visual materials. Vision-based materials can be real objects, models of objects, charts, images, maps, and posters. Suggestions for hearing-based and audio-visual materials include electronic/electrical equipment, such as radios, cassette players, TVs, CD/DVDs, DVD players, computers etc.

Teachers learn that when making decisions about the size, shape and number of materials they should consider the class size and the students’ age and ability. Moreover, the materials should be made visible to all children and learner opportunities for individual and group discussions should be created following a demonstration. Teachers are instructed to collect materials from their immediate environment, from students, teachers, guardians and school managing committee members, exhibitions, shops, and from PTI, UNICEF or other government/non-government organisations.
4.4.3 Summary

In response to concerns that the existing vocational training programs and resources are not producing quality teacher outputs, the Education Department of Bangladesh has launched additional short training courses for primary teachers. The aim is to change teacher attitudes to their vocation and learners and to develop among teachers the necessary skills and expertise so that they will strive to create a learner-centred classroom environment, adopt participatory and interactive teaching approaches, and apply advanced evaluation techniques to assess learning outcomes.

4.5 Conclusion

This chapter has elaborated on the aims, targets and priorities of primary education in Bangladesh. Although there is no specific values education or related programs adopted in the primary sector, recent efforts made by the government and future plans in this sector strengthens the possibility of gradually moving to quality primary education, with a target of creating safe, interesting, and joyful learning environments and meaningful learning experiences for Bangladeshi primary school children.

The existing primary curriculum and textbooks for the Social Studies and Islamic Studies subjects were analysed with a view to understanding how the curricular incentives are providing the learners with opportunities to explore and share their values and to build personal, moral and social skills. It was revealed that although the aims, objectives, and curriculum of primary education make adequate reference to the significance of values development, the design and content of the textbook, the dominant instructional and learning tool, and the associated learning opportunities convey very little potential in materialising the curricular objectives. Developing children’s thinking and critical reflection ability, which is essential for building the moral disposition of learners, is barely addressed by the curriculum and textbooks.

Existing teacher development incentives were also examined in order to understand the level of teaching skills and professional mastery that teachers may bring to the classroom. The findings suggest that the main vocational training, the C-in-Ed program, is failing to produce quality teachers and in order to address this gap additional training programs have been introduced in recent times. The purposes and contexts of these programs are suitable and timely for the primary education. However, the extent to which these one-off, short training programs will improve the quality of teaching and the classroom environment mostly depends on the
teachers’ willingness and motivation to implement the advanced, learner-centred teaching approaches they have been exposed to in the training program. The success of these recent endeavours will also rely upon the strengthened academic supervision of teachers and ongoing monitoring of their classroom teaching practices.
CHAPTER 5:
SUMMARY OF CASE STUDIES

5.1 Introduction to Case Studies

This chapter and the following chapter report the findings from the case-studies conducted in six government primary schools in Bangladesh. The findings have been derived from the analyses of a number of data sources including the documents collected from the schools, interviews and focus group discussions with teachers, classroom observations, informal discussions with teachers, and observation of overall school environment and special events or activities taken place during the field visits. This chapter mainly includes the contextual and operational information about the schools; and the teachers’ perceptions of values, values education and their role as teachers. The purpose of the next chapter is to report findings in relation to the explicit/implicit school provisions that provide support for values and moral development of the children, and the findings from observations of classrooms and the overall environment of the schools.

The format used to make references to different data sources can be expressed as ‘XXXS#@YZZT%’; the description of the different parts in this code is given in Table 5.1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XXX</td>
<td>Source type. INT-Interview; FG-Focus Group; CO-Classroom Observation;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>Refers to ‘School’; included in all codes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>School code; A-F.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>@*</td>
<td>Grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y*</td>
<td>Class in a grade; ‘A’, ‘B’, ‘C’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZZ*</td>
<td>Subject code; SS-Social Studies, IS-Islamic Studies; HS-Hindu Studies, M-Music;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>Refers to ‘Teacher’; included in all codes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number assigned to teachers in each case.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Applies only to classroom observations.
As an example, the code INTSDT3 refers to the interview with the teacher ‘T3’ in the case-study school ‘D’. Similarly in the case of observation, the code COSF3BIST6 refers to the classroom observation of an Islamic Studies lesson in Grade Three-Class B, where the lesson was conducted by the teacher ‘T6’ in school ‘F’.

There are some terms and practices included in the case-study reports that are specific to the context of the primary schools in Bangladesh. Information on these terms and practices are provided below to assist the reader in understanding the context when these terms appear in the case-study reports.

**Model School:** In 1957, the then Pakistani government named some primary schools across the state ‘Model Primary Schools’ based on the overall school performance. That recognition as a ‘Model’ continues to be a part of the school name, although a ‘Model’ school is not necessarily living up to that standard to date.

**School Grade.** A grading of schools (A to D) assigned by the sub-district in which the school is located. The grading is made on the basis of ten performance criteria: “1) enrolment relative to the [total] school-age children in the school catchment area\(^23\), 2) student attendance, 3) dropout rate, 4) success rate in the scholarship examination\(^24\), 5) attendance and dutifulness of teachers, 6) effectiveness of the School Management Committee, 7) number of Parent-Teacher Association meetings, 8) attractiveness and cleanliness of school premises, 9) co-curricular activities, and 10) record keeping.” (Islam, 2010, p. 10).

**Guardian:** This term is used in Bangladesh to indicate the student’s parents, mainly the father, or other responsible elder member of the family if the parents are not alive. It mainly refers to the principal provider for the family.

**Daily Assembly:** A mandated part of school operations which is conducted in all primary schools nationwide for about 15 to 20 minutes each day.

**Completion Exam:** Centrally administered public exam which the students in grade five complete. Prior to 2009, this exam was organised locally at the school level. The students’ results at this exam are categorised into four performance grades of decreasing competence based on the total marks scored; these grades are ‘talent pool’, ‘first division’, ‘general grade’, and ‘pass’. Overall success in this exam is used as a key performance indicator for the schools.

---
\(^{23}\) A ‘catchment’ area is decided for each school by the authority. A school is entitled to cater for the children in its catchment area.

\(^{24}\) Currently restructured as the mandated primary completion exam.
**Baby Class:** Refers to the pre-primary grade. Currently there are 'Baby Classes' in 26,300 primary schools under the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MoPME). In addition the Ministry of Women and Children Affairs, the Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs and the Ministry of Religious Affairs are operating pre-primary classes under development projects. In addition, many private kindergarten schools and more than 150 NGOs are operating pre-primary education throughout the country.

**Subject Teachers:** The term ‘subject teacher’ used in this subject does not refer to a teacher who is specialist in teaching the subject. Rather, this term is used to refer to the teachers who were selected by the respective head teachers as teaching the subjects Social Studies or Religious Studies in the given academic year.

### 5.2 The School Contexts

The year of establishment, location and grade of each of the case-study schools are presented in Table 5.2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Established</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1955</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Sylhet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>1939</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sylhet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Dhaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>1934</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Pabna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>1964</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Chittagong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>1970</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Rajshahi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Students and Teachers**

The total numbers of students and teachers as well as the student/teacher ratio in the case-study schools are provided in Table 5.3.
### Table 5.3
**Teachers and Students in Various Cases**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total teachers (female)</td>
<td>6 (6)</td>
<td>8 (6)</td>
<td>19 (17)</td>
<td>6 (4)</td>
<td>11 (9)</td>
<td>7 (6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total students</td>
<td>701</td>
<td>570</td>
<td>1007</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>1410</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student/teacher ratio</td>
<td>116.8</td>
<td>71.2</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>52.7</td>
<td>128.2</td>
<td>34.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Frequencies of the age distribution, the highest qualification, and the length of teaching career of the teachers in various cases are shown in Appendix 5.1 in Table A5.1.1, Table A5.1.2 and Table A5.1.3, respectively.

### 5.2.1 Case A

The school is located at the heart of the city of Sylhet, the head quarter of the Sylhet division, and in an affluent suburb, however, the student population does not represent the socio-economic condition of the permanent residents of the locality. Almost 95% of the students come from families who represent the lowest income group in the society, and who are temporary dwellers living within the school catchment area. As the head teacher informed, the upper-, middle- or even the lower-middle class parents nowadays send their children to the private schools which are less populated than the government primary schools.

One teacher informed that the school usually waives exam fees for those students who go through emotional turmoil for not being able to pay the fees. She also cited the example of one incident when she was so moved by the distressed condition of a group of children—sent to this school from an orphanage—that she took them to the teachers’ common room and bought them food.

The school stands by the side of a busy road. It was observed a number of times that the students could not hear what the teachers instructed during lessons, because of the noise made by the heavy vehicles. There is one four-storeyed school building, surrounded by a brick wall. Inside the school premises, there is a yard in which the daily assembly takes place. The gate at the entrance seemed to be too narrow for the number of children trying to pass through the gate at a time, especially when the students from the two shifts attempted to either enter or leave the school during the between-shifts period. The students were seen struggling and pushing each
other to make their way through the congestion created by the crowd. This was a common scene observed during the break periods.

The school building accommodated seven classrooms, five of which were being used during the field visit. Five different classes run simultaneously in those rooms. The supply of drinking water was not available in this school.

5.2.2 Case B

The school catchment area includes a total of four villages. The habitants of the catchment area are predominantly farmers and day labourers. The rate of literacy in this area was assumed to be approximately 25%, by the head teacher. The teachers informed as well as the researcher observed that many children came from utterly impoverished family backgrounds, with most of them deprived of basic needs such as health, nutrition and clothing. Moreover, the school catchment area, as informed by the teachers, is prone to monsoon flooding. Almost every year for about two to three months a vast majority of the area remains submerged under flood water, when students from those areas cannot attend school. The students in this school receive financial incentives under the government-funded aid program for poverty-prone areas. According to the head teacher, student attendance increased significantly after the aid program was implemented.

The transport facility from the nearby town to this school was also not convenient. It took about forty minutes by auto-rickshaw directly from the centre of the nearby town to the school. This form of transport, however, is relatively expensive. The teachers who commute from the town therefore use cheaper means of local transport, such as rickshaws and local buses, which they need to change three or four times when travelling both to and from school, taking about one and a half hours. Some of the female teachers shared the story of the physical suffering they faced during pregnancy, owing to the poor road condition.

The school facility comprised a one-storey building and another two-storey building accommodating a total of seven classrooms and a room for teachers. The ground floor of the two-storey building was used as a flood shelter for the local community. One tube-well placed in front of the teachers’ room supplied drinking water to the students. As the teachers commented, the water collected from this tube-well is not of good quality and therefore the teachers use a water filter in the common room. There is a large field inside the school boundary on which the children were playing during the recess period. The local marketplace is very close to the school. There is also a local madrasa (Islamic School) adjacent to this school.
According to the head teacher, this school is often used as a venue for various programs, such as national vaccination initiatives, social awareness drama shows etc. The head teacher expressed his dissatisfaction by saying, “We hardly get all classrooms free.” It was experienced one day during the field study that the classroom for the Baby class was being used for vaccination of the local children. The mothers of this village with children aged between six months to two years came to take that service. The head teachers’ comment in this regard was: “Today attendance of mothers is very high. However, we get very few of them when invited to attend the mother assembly”.

5.2.3 Case C

The Case C school was recognised by the government as one of the model25 schools a few years after its establishment. It is located within a residential block developed for government employees, in one of the most affluent suburbs of the capital city. The school survey data showed that the school catchment area, which is 1.5 square kilometres, is inhabited by a total of 23,517 people in 4110 families.

The Citizen Charter of the school (enacted by the government for all schools) was painted on the front wall. Also written on a blackboard on the wall were some charts on the occupation and economic status of the guardians26 as well as the statistics of the means of communication between guardians and teachers. Information collected from these charts is given in Appendix 5.2.

In the four-storey school building, the head teacher’s room and teachers’ common room as well as the classroom for ‘Baby’ class are on the ground floor. The rest of the floors accommodate other classrooms with the sub-district education training centre using two rooms on the uppermost floor. The classrooms are shared by the local secondary school for the second half of the day. The classes in various grades are named after colours, and after Bangladeshi fruits, flowers, birds and rivers. On the entrance of each classroom were painted the portrait and biography of the great personalities of the nation, such as leaders, poets, and philanthropists.

The classroom for ‘Baby’ grade drew the attention of the researcher because it seemed an exception to the classrooms commonly found in government primary schools. There were eight tables in this class around which the chairs were organised so that the children could participate in group activities. In such classroom arrangements, it is possible to provide opportunities for interaction among the pupils.

25 Based on the overall school performance, the then Pakistani government named some primary schools across the state ‘Model Primary Schools’. That recognition as a ‘Model’ has been a part of the school name, although a ‘Model’ school is not necessarily living up to that standard to date.

26 ‘Guardian’ is used in Bangladesh to indicate parents, mainly father, and/or other responsible elder member of the family.
It was found that street hawkers were near the school gate selling various foods which did not appear to be hygienic. The students were seen buying those food items with a great deal of eagerness and zeal. A notice for the parents, however, was found on the school corridor warning them to restrict their children from buying any street food.

5.2.4 Case D

The inhabitants of the village where the school is located are predominantly farmers and day labourers. The school building includes one two-storey building, constructed in 1987, that contains three classrooms on the upper floor, and also an old one-storey aluminium-roof building with two classrooms. There is a semi-government high school adjacent to this school, sharing a common boundary wall.

On the ground floor of the new building, there were the teachers’ room and also two more spare rooms which were not being used as classrooms. The teachers’ room was shared by the head teacher and his colleagues. Used textbooks and attendance registrars were found piled up on a desk. A school monitoring board containing the school statistics was on the wall, but it did not include current information. Some educational materials, such as an abacus, a globe etc. were kept on a table in the teachers’ room. Covered with dust, those materials did not seem to be regularly used in lessons. A box containing other educational materials and toys was also stored in a locked cabinet.

The teachers repeatedly focused on the fact that due to the large number of students in each classroom, it was very difficult for them to create a classroom environment congenial to learning. The teachers had to take classes without any break, and they were left with very little energy and enthusiasm to be able to attend to the needs and abilities of individual students. The teachers also expressed their concerns about the classrooms as these rooms were ‘not airy, spacious or at all attractive.’ It was also highlighted by the teachers that there were no sources of fun available in typical Bangladeshi classroom and schools that might attract the students to the school and learning.

5.2.5 Case E

The school is located in the second largest city, known as the ‘industrial capital’ of the country. Although located at almost the heart of the city, the school catchment area, according to the teachers, is mainly inhabited by slum-dwellers and those people who represent the lowest income group of the society. The rate of literacy and overall status of living of the majority of
these people were described by the teachers as very low. One assistant teacher commented that the slums are ‘the haven’ for drug dealers and other miscreants, and therefore, the task of imparting values has become more challenging for the teachers of this school. In her words: “The family environment in general and the local community are not at all conducive to moral learning for the students.”

Another challenge for this school, according to the head teacher, is the increasing popularity of the school suburb area among low-income people and the resultant fast-growing population size. Adhering to the government’s commitment for 100% enrolment, this school is bound to enrol all students living in this suburb as there are no other government primary schools in this suburb. However, the school facilities, such as the number of teachers and classrooms and other physical facilities have not been increased to accommodate the increasing student number. The head teacher described the situation in this way: “There are so many students that we do not even know the faces of all of them.”

The school building comprised one four-storey building accommodating a total of 12 classrooms. There are separate rooms for the office of the head teacher and the common room for teachers. On the walls of the head teacher’s room, were hung the annual work plan for the school, a monitoring board including a summary of the school information, and an annual lesson plan for all the grades and subjects. Moreover, student-made crafts were kept on the floor and a number of teacher manuals piled up on a desk. Inside a locked book cabinet there were supplementary reading materials as well as other teaching materials such as cards, charts etc. A number of morals and educational and religious quotes were painted on the outer and inner walls of the classrooms. Some of these were “Respect your elders. Do not hurt anyone’s feelings.”, “Cooperation, not hostility; tolerance, not clash; coordination and peace, not conflict – Swami Vivekananda”, “A teacher is none but a friend and guide - John Dewey”, and “Unity is strength”.

There was no playfield inside the school premises. On the third floor of the school building some rooms were yet to be constructed and therefore some space left empty. One teacher informed that the students sometimes play in this space, although they are not always permitted to use this space considering the safety problems, especially when not accompanied by any teachers. The only option available for the students was, therefore, using the corridors for play. During the recess period the students of this school either went home for lunch or played in the corridors on various floors. There was a paved yard (laid with brick) which was used as the venue for the daily school assembly, but this yard was shared with the adjacent high school. As one teacher stated, “The students are not permitted to play in this yard as this might

27 FGSET2
interrupt the operation of the high school.” When the school organises the sports competition, “The students of each class are brought to this yard separately in order to reduce the number of students at a given time”. It was observed that the students were playing tag on the staircases of the different floors which, the researcher thought, might have caused potential safety hazards. Another concern regarding the safety of the children arose in the mind of this researcher. Only a small part of the gate at the school entrance, which usually was kept locked, was left opened during the break between the two shifts, when the children in the first shift leave school and the remaining students enter. It was observed more than once that about twenty students were trying to use the gate at the same time, whereas there was enough space only for about two or three students to pass through. There was a lot of pushing happening among the students which could have caused them physical injuries.

5.2.6 Case F

The school is located in Rajshahi city, the head quarter of Rajshahi division. Rajshahi, known as the ‘City of Silk’, is the third largest city of Bangladesh with an area of 96.69 square kilometers and about 475,000 inhabitants. The city is on the northern bank of the river Padma, and this school itself stands by the river bank. The school is located in a ‘historically posh area’, as commented by the head teacher. One three-storied building occupies the total school land which is about 347 square feet. There is no open space or playground inside the school boundary. Considering the location of the school and the number of teachers and students, the Education Office proposed this school as a representative of the government primary schools in Rajshahi city.

The three-storeyed school building is surrounded by a brick wall. The building stands right behind the main entrance. There is no yard or playground inside the school premises. An open public space in front of the school gate is sometimes used for the daily assembly. This space is owned by the City Corporation and used for various public and private purposes. During the field visit to this school, the Bengali New Year festival was taking place here and lasted for one week. The teachers informed that the rooms of this school had been used for preparing foods for the festival stalls. Due to the high volume of the music and announcements continuously played at the festival site, the school environment was being seriously affected. The students completing the term exam were barely able to concentrate. The teachers were also disturbed by the sound. The male teacher once complained to the festival committee regarding the noise, but no measures were taken.

\[\text{FGSET2}\]
The school building accommodated five classrooms and seven other rooms. Some educational quotes and sayings, such as “Come to learn, spread out to serve”, “Education is the backbone to the nation” etc., were painted on the classroom walls, corridors and staircases. It was found in the grade one classroom that a number of pictures were painted on the walls including those of some great persons about whom content is included in the primary level textbooks. A map of Bangladesh was also painted on a wall. There was no supply of drinking water available in this school.

The head teacher’s office and the teachers’ common room were on the ground floor and the classrooms on the first and second floors. On the walls of the teachers’ common room were hanging the school monitoring board, a display board with notices and other information on it, and some charts and posters. Supplementary Reading Materials (SRM), supplied by the government for the children to read, and a number of student-made crafts were kept in a bookcase.

5.2.7 Summary

The student populations of the schools represented the lowest socio-economic groups of the society, irrespective of their location in metropolitan, urban or rural areas. Overall, there were very limited or almost no opportunities for the students to participate in recreational and fun activities outside the classrooms. There was a playfield in only two of the schools. In addition, the location seemed to be inconvenient, and the total area of the school as well as the size of the classrooms and the light and air flow in them seemed to be inadequate in almost all of the cases.

5.3 Involvement of the Community

The head teachers were asked to provide specific information on the participation of the local community in school-related matters. The focus of the enquiry was to identify the extent to which the guardians and the local community members support and strengthen the school’s endeavour in providing values education. It was informed by the head teachers that the central educational authority provides directions and guidelines for community involvement to take place in the primary schools community. Every school is required to form the School Managing Committee (SMC), Parents Teachers Association (PTA), and hold regularly the Mothers’ Assembly, Yard Meeting etc.
It was informed by the head teachers that the monthly meetings of the School Managing Committee (SMC) and occasional meetings with the guardians take place in their schools. The topics usually covered in such meetings included the various problems faced by the school and ways to improve the quality of education. The teachers seek advice and help from the guardians as well as the community members about increasing student attendance in the school or improving the academic performance of the students. If any student is absent from the school for a long period, the teachers meet with the guardian of that student in order to understand the reasons behind the absence, and try to address this issue. In addition, the guardians receive instructions and suggestions on taking proper care of their children’s health, hygiene, study and behavioural traits. They are also requested by the teachers to share their problems and difficulties in relation to raising their children and assisting with the children’s study. The head teacher of School E informed that the teachers in this school requested the parents to regularly send their children to school as well as to take care of the children in their neighbourhood along with their own children. He also shared with the researcher the schedule of the term final exam; the schedule was printed to be sent to all the guardians. An invitation to visit the school on the day of the results declaration was included in the schedule. It was also found that the school-wide syllabus, developed by the local education office, included a message for the guardians that requested them to abandon physical punishment of their children, and instead treat the children with love.

The head teachers informed that the ‘Mothers’ Assembly’ is usually held at the end of each school term. According to the Case D head teacher, as the government put special emphasis on holding the ‘Mothers’ Assembly’ in schools, the mothers are invited to the school to share their good practices, or problems faced, in raising their children. The teachers pass on necessary information and suggestions regarding the children’s overall safety, health and nutrition. In general the focus is on ‘how to create a child-friendly environment at home’. The mothers of the students, who secure the first three positions in the final exam, share their stories of how their children were supervised at home that led them to achieving that academic success. The head teacher believed that “listening to these success stories, the mothers of the other children become inspired.” The head teacher informed that the ‘Mothers’ Assembly’ had taken place several times in recent years, however, after the local youth made negative comments about this form of gathering taking place at the school, the teachers did not hold the assembly again.

The mothers of the Grade Five students in School A are called at the beginning of the year and the teachers share with them the importance of the completion exam in the assessment of their children, and the structure and question patterns of this exam as determined by the central authority. The guardians in this school are also invited when any declaration about the
‘stipend distribution’ needs to be made. Moreover, the teachers of all the schools informed that the parents are invited to the school when the results of the final exam are declared as well as when the annual sports and prize distribution takes place. The head teachers, especially those in Cases B and C, informed that according to the annual plan the schools are required to arrange three or four guardian assemblies or ‘Yard meetings’ (motivational meetings with guardians) a year. However, this cannot be achieved at all due to the lack of cooperation from the guardians.

The Case F head teacher stated her view about the role of community in terms of assistance in providing quality education to the students by saying, “community participation can bring about significant changes in terms of values education”. However, the perceived reality in Bangladeshi primary schools was evident when she said, “In the context of Bangladesh, our communities do not become able to help the schools much.” She informed that the contribution of the community in her school mainly included financial assistance for the school fund received from the local government members. This fund is utilised in organising programs in the school or purchasing school furniture.

It was informed by the Case A head teacher that the wealthy members of this school’s community often donated funds for school furniture or for necessary repairs, and sometimes financed teacher aides which are appointed on a casual basis. At this school, the SMC members also assisted in conducting the Children Survey and in achieving the 100% enrolment of children living within the school catchment area. However, in Case B, the majority of the people from the local community lived in extreme poverty, so monetary donations to the school funds were rare. Despite their financial barriers, some of the local people donated a water filter and some chairs for the teachers’ common room. One family provided a bamboo mat for the ‘Baby’ classroom. The Case B teachers also informed that the local people sometimes offered volunteer services in the school activities. It was observed during the annual sports day that the members from the local community assisted in conducting the school decoration and the overall management of the program. The managing committee chairman attended meetings with teachers prior to the event and shared his views and suggestions regarding the planning and management of the event. It was also observed that the local members once came to school to mediate a problem among the teachers of the school and the local rickshaw-pullers.

The Case D head teacher expressed his disappointment regarding the perceptions of the local people about the school and the teachers. He informed that, “The influential members of the community want to exert political influence on the decisions the school takes about selecting students for stipend or about using the SLIP (School Level Improvement Plan) allotment.” According to the head teacher, the community members wanted to persuade the teachers to share the SLIP allotment with them rather than using it for the school. At times, the community
members had requested that the stipend be paid to favoured students, even though these students had not passed the year-end exam and therefore were not eligible to receive the stipend. The head teacher also cited an example when the local people exercised their power to gain for themselves financial benefits from the Food for Education program. Under this government program the families of the students were supposed to receive wheat for free. This initiative eventually came to an end due to mismanagement. According to the head teacher, “the representatives of the community are only after receiving potential financial benefits from the school, rather than contributing to the school”. The head teacher argued that it would have been better if the teachers alone had the authority to make decisions regarding the financial matters of the school.

In summary, although the government has mandated the reinforcement of active community participation in school-related and child-related matters in order to promote a whole-school approach to quality improvement, in reality, parent participation appears to be limited to visits to the school on the day of the results declaration or the stipend distribution. Moreover, in some cases the financial limitations among the community members, and their low level of education and restricted sense of responsibility or attachment to the school appeared to limit their capacity to make meaningful contributions to the school.

5.4 Daily School Routine

The daily school routine was collected from each case. Information on the start and end times of the school day as well as the time for mid-day recess and the daily assembly are included in Table 5.4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>1st shift</th>
<th>2nd shift</th>
<th>Assembly</th>
<th>Recess</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>9.30 am-12 pm</td>
<td>12 pm-4.15 pm (2.30 on Thu)</td>
<td>12 pm-12.15 pm</td>
<td>1.30 pm-2 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>9.30 am-12 pm</td>
<td>12 pm-4.15 pm (2.30 on Thu)</td>
<td>12 pm-12.15 pm</td>
<td>1.40 pm-2.10 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>7am –9.30am</td>
<td>9.30 am-1 pm</td>
<td>7.15 am-7.30 am, 9.30 am-9.45 am</td>
<td>2 pm-2.30 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>9.30 am-12 pm</td>
<td>12 pm-4.15 pm (2.30 on Thu)</td>
<td>12.10 pm-12.30 pm</td>
<td>2 pm-2.30 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>9.30 am-12 pm</td>
<td>12 pm-4.15 pm (2.30 on Thu)</td>
<td>12.01 pm-12.15 pm</td>
<td>2.21 pm-3.10 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>9.30 am-4.15 pm (until 2.20 on Thu)</td>
<td>9.30 am-9.45 am</td>
<td>1.15 pm-1.45 pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4.1 Observations of the Teachers’ Practices in relation to the Daily Routines

A common practice observed among the regular teachers in School A was that they usually combined the students from two ‘sections’ (classes) of a grade, and taught them as a single class. This practice in effect let one of the teachers skip a class. Often, the teachers assigned a writing activity to the students, and then left them in the classroom while the teachers spent time in the common room. It was also observed that the teachers were not maintaining the time scheduled for the lessons of the compulsory subjects. The head teacher appeared to be the most irregular in taking classes. It was found more than once that she did not take any of the assigned lessons for the whole day, although she was at the school. The teachers displayed another common practice of coming to the school after, and leaving earlier, than the scheduled time. Some of them were even seen leaving school in the middle of the day and not returning.

Similarly, it was observed in Case D that the teachers did not always maintain the scheduled time allocated for the subjects included in this study. The start and end time of the lessons as well as the lesson duration were not in accord with what the routine specified. The researcher, therefore, had to make instant decisions about which class to observe because often the teachers only invited the researcher to conduct the observation of their lessons just before they proceeded to the class. It was observed that the school operations, which were scheduled to commence at 9.30 am, did not begin at this time on any of the days during the field visit. A delay of forty to forty-five minutes was commonplace. At this school, another common tendency observed among the teachers was leaving the school earlier, about fifteen to twenty minutes before 4.15 pm, and skipping the last period. Most days, the head teacher was at the school in between the period, 11 am-1.30 pm, and was absent for the rest of the school day. Often, it was experienced that the students in a number of the classes were left unattended for a reasonable duration despite the fact that almost all of the teachers were present at the school. The teachers were in the common room, either taking a rest or feeding their toddlers, or having a chat with their colleagues. The students were then seen wandering in the nearby field, or passing time in the adjacent food shop. It was also observed several times that the students left school after waiting in the classroom for the teacher to come.

As in the case of other schools, the daily class routine in School B was sought by the researcher on the very first day, in order to make a schedule for the classroom observation sessions. It was, however, found that the teachers happened to spot several anomalies in the routine soon after the head teacher supplied the routine to the researcher. The teachers were confused because according to the routine the class duration for Grade five did not seem usual. Moreover, they identified that the recess period for Grade five was different to that for the other grades. It seemed to the researcher that the teachers had not followed this routine before the
observations started. In another case, the head teacher had scheduled a time for the researcher to observe the Social Studies lessons in grades one and two. However, on arriving at the designated lesson, the teacher in charge expressed disagreement by saying, “How can I teach this subject in these grades given that there are no books?” The question rose in the researcher’s mind as to whether this subject in those grades had actually been taught in previous weeks, given the fact that almost two months of the school year had passed.

It was experienced in Case B that the school operation usually did not begin at 9.30 am, although the school routine stipulated this. For example, on one day the researcher entered the school at 9.20 am. Very few students had arrived before then. Two male teachers were supervising the school cleaning which was conducted by some students who were sweeping the corridor and classrooms, collecting waste from the field and so on. By 9.50 am student attendance, especially in grade five, was very low. The teachers were having a chat standing in the corridor. Some girl students were cleaning the teachers’ toilet. They were filling buckets with water from the tube-well and carrying those to the toilet. The class teacher of Grade five was supervising them. In general, a common scenario observed was that the majority of the students usually arrived at school after 10 am and this seemed to be accepted by the teachers. Moreover, the school operation ended at 4 pm instead of 4.15 pm most of the days during the data collection. The head teacher explained that because the managing committee of the school could not afford to employ an orderly for cleaning tasks — ‘unlike urban schools’ — the students had to perform these tasks and this delayed the commencement of daily school operations. In his words, “We cannot start school at 9.30 am. It becomes 9.45 am by when the school cleaning is done. Children get their hands dirty and they need time to clean themselves before attending class.”

The Case C head teacher admitted that “although the school time is from 7 am, we cannot start that early.” She added, “Our teachers arrive by 7 am and the children by 7.15 am. After doing assembly the students are sent to classrooms at 7.30 am.” The daily assembly takes place twice in this school. This seemed to be a solution to the problem of limited space in front of the school building. Since it was not possible to accommodate all students at the same time the school arranged the assembly twice, separately, for the two shifts. In other urban and metropolitan schools, however, where the same problem was faced, only one assembly was conducted and the students from the first shift did not participate in the daily assembly.

On the very first day when the daily class routine was sought from the Case C head teacher, an unusual response was obtained. Unlike the teachers in other schools, this head teacher was reluctant to provide the routine and said, “I have to check. I will let you [the researcher] know tomorrow.” However, she informed the researcher that Social Studies and
Islamic Studies were taught in grades three to five every day for thirty minutes. The next day the head teacher at first hesitated to show the routine and then said, “The authority does not permit us to show the routine [to any outsider]”. The head teacher was concerned and uneasy about the timing of the first shift which was evident when she said, “as we start the first shift after the scheduled time, the timing of classes is not maintained that well”. She later decided to provide the routine and requested the researcher to consider only those periods ‘written by pen, and not pencil.’ The researcher discovered that the timings written by pencil—and thereby flexible to change—were those for the supplementary and co-curricular lessons, such as ‘art and craft’, ‘checking homework’, ‘music’, ‘hand writing’, ‘essay’, ‘assessing class work’ and also Social Studies of grades one and two. Only the main curricular subjects, such as Bengali, Math, English, etc. were written in pen. From these actions, the researcher formed the impression that the teachers did not always strictly follow the school routine, and that they skipped lessons when possible.

5.5 Awareness of Values Education among the Higher Authority

With a view to understanding the significance the government has attached to the moral and character development of children, the head teachers were asked to provide information on any documents available, either developed by the school authority or supplied by the central body in the form of office orders or notices, that emphasise the values development of children. The aim was to reveal a picture of the views on issue of morality and values development held by the educational decision makers in Bangladesh. According to the head teachers, the government is increasingly attaching significance to the development of various values and skills through co-curricular and extra-curricular activities. The observation of national days in schools has been strengthened more than ever before. In addition, the schools are now strictly instructed to have their students participate in the national football tournament, the sports competition and other co-curricular events. Moreover, the teachers received instructions from the government to conduct ‘home visits’ ‘to not only confirm regular attendance, but also to make the parents aware about the cleanliness of their children and other forms of care that they should give their children.’

A number of relevant documents were provided by the Case A head teacher. These documents were either prepared by the school, or supplied from the higher authority including the district-level and divisional education departments and the Directorate of Primary
Education, Bangladesh. These documents were also applicable to the other schools and included:

- Minutes of the ‘coordination meetings’ held monthly in the local education office in which the higher officials mainly circulated the orders and agenda, generated by the central authority for the schools.
- Minutes of the ‘follow-up meetings’ between the teachers taking place at the school in which the head teacher shared the agenda of the coordination meetings with other teachers.
- Official orders from the local, divisional, and central authorities.

The directions provided for the teachers in these minutes and orders, which are related to the provision of a child-friendly school environment and a quality education have been summarised into the following main categories:

- Observing the annual sports and prize giving ceremonies, and the special national days;
- Giving greater emphasis to education in the pre-primary grades and conducting lessons for two and half hours on a daily basis;
- Distributing the supplementary reading materials among the students during regular lessons and supervising if those were being read;
- Keeping regular communication with the members of the local community and integrating them into the various activities of the school;
- Avoiding the practice of punishing students mentally or physically, and building a safe learning environment;
- Ensuring the achievement of the learning outcomes by adopting effective classroom management techniques and lesson delivery methods including the preparation of lesson plans and the use of materials in classrooms;
- Including the co-curricular subjects, such as Music, Physical Education, Art and Crafts, in daily class routines and treating these subjects with equal importance as the mandatory ones;
- Organising the activities of the ‘cub team’\(^{29}\) regularly; and
- Organising the daily assembly every day.

These directions for the teachers portray the commitment of the Education Ministry to establishing a joyful learning environment in the schools, and the development of human and social values and skills in the students.

Admiring the efforts taken by the government, the Case D head teacher described the agenda of the meetings that had been held with the higher authority:

There come many orders and directions through regular sub-cluster and monthly meeting. The focus is placed on the prevention of drop-out, improving the quality of education, and increasing student retention. To work towards meeting these goals, we are instructed to create a better classroom environment so that children do not leave school after they come.

\(^{29}\)Government-mandated student club to implement extra-curricular activities.
The Case E head teacher admired some recent initiatives of the government, such as the launch of the national football tournament and the ban on all sorts of punishment. He reported that the government is increasingly focusing on the quality of the teaching and learning environment in schools which is highlighted in the in-service training and the official orders. In his words:

Now, several training programs are being implemented and incentives provided, which the primary teachers did not experience before. These advanced trainings [on teaching methods] have introduced to the teachers new techniques to replace the traditional methods. The students are also increasingly becoming interested in these new approaches.

The teachers made positive comments about the increased focus of the government on the observation of the national days in school. In this way, they thought, the children are being made more aware of the national history and heritage and the value of ‘patriotism’ is being enhanced more effectively.

Similarly, it was stipulated by the teachers in the Case F school that the directions and guidelines that the authority have provided to them in recent times highlight the priorities of the achievement of 100% enrolment and the prevention of drop-out. In achieving these, the greatest significance has been attached to the creation of an enjoyable school environment. The head teacher showed an official letter that the Directorate General (DG) of Primary Education had sent to the head teachers across the country, as a New Year resolution for 2011. The focus in the letter was placed upon the existing challenges in the primary education sector, which are the enrolment rate, drop-out rate, and the evaluation system. The DG also accentuated the need for creating a supportive school environment. Moreover, special emphasis was laid on the necessity of a school-community partnership in order to face the current challenges, as well as, of the leadership role that a head teacher can play in strengthening this partnership. The head teachers were instructed to regularly make ‘home-visits’ (to the pupils’ home), and organise events like ‘Mother Assembly’, ‘Yard Meeting’, ‘Parents Meeting’, etc. In the letter there was also an indication of the ‘competency-based question system’ to be implemented in the primary completion exam from 2012.

The teachers also referred to the SLIP project, initiated in October, 2010 and under which the government allocates a certain fund for each school to purchase equipment and materials for the children’s entertainment. However, the head teachers of the two rural schools reported that although their schools bought a swing using this fund, it could not be placed outdoors because of concerns that it might be stolen.
The Case E teachers described two recent government pilot studies in which their school had been included. One of these projects was directed towards quality improvement in classroom teaching-learning activities, thus ensuring ‘a fun-filled and attractive classroom environment’. As part of the pilot-study in this project, the teachers were required to observe five of their colleagues’ classrooms within a month, and fill in a classroom observation sheet for each lesson observed. The observation sheet included checklists and notes made on various aspects of a lesson, such as whether the creation of an affective environment was attempted at the beginning, whether any teaching materials were used, whether the questions asked during the lesson required the students to use higher-level thinking skills and whether the questions were directed towards the whole class or individual students, as well as the extent to which the teacher linked the lesson to the real life of the learners.

The other initiative was the ‘English in Action Program’, funded and administered by the UK, the aim of which is to train the English teachers in primary schools to develop communicative English language skills among their students. During the period of the field visit, two teachers from School E visited another city to attend a training session under this program. The program initially incorporated a total of 231 primary schools across the country. The teachers highly praised the incentives and training provided to the trainees and the equipment facilities supplied to the schools. The equipment and materials included a number of high-quality teaching manuals, a sound system, and an iPod, as well as numerous picture cards and word cards.

The Case E head teacher reported that according to a recent order from the government, the schools under the ‘model’ sub-districts in the education system hierarchy were required to ensure that each of the students submitted some form of creative work every month. The class teachers were in charge of showcasing these works in the classroom. The head teacher, however, regretted that there was not sufficient space in the classrooms or other rooms where they could store the students’ works.

5.5.1 Teachers’ Critical Views towards Some of the Initiatives

It was criticised by the Case C head teacher that the government sometimes implemented new orders without giving any prior indication to the schools and this created undue pressure. For example, during the year, the day before a historic day—significantly attached to the history of the liberation war—this school was given an order to play the CD of the speech—that was made by the national leader on this day in 1971. The order was to play the CD using an amplifier from 7 am, that is, the start of the school day. Because the school did not
possess a CD player, the teachers had to go to endless trouble to acquire one. There was no alternative to following the order.

Moreover, the Case D head teacher argued that the ‘stipend program’ of the government was not as effective in increasing the enrolment and retention rates as was expected. This view was based on his observation that not all families sent their children to school even after receiving the funds. In his view, another project, funded by the European Union (EU), aimed at providing snacks for the school children seemed to be more effective in attracting and retaining children in school. The reason why he held this view was that the children who cannot afford to bring a good lunch feel inferior to those who can, and therefore prefer to be absent from school. In his opinion, providing the same lunch for every student can mitigate this problem.

5.6 Teachers’ Perceptions of Values and Values Education

5.6.1 Values Viewed as Essential for the Children

The teachers across the cases expressed their views regarding the role a school can play in nurturing and enhancing expected values and skills in students. As perceived by the Case F teachers, “learning is expected to bring positive changes in one’s behaviour”3031 and positive changes in the dispositions and views of the learners were referred to by these teachers as the most expected outcome of learning. One teacher elaborated this view in the following manner:

I come to know something, rote learn it, stand first in exam by writing that on exam paper-- this is a limited view of learning. I should rather be able to capture the internal value of what I learn and reflect it in my behaviour. Here is the saying, ‘a self-learned person is certainly a better-educated person’. 32

The teachers identified a range of values that they thought could be learnt from school. The commonly mentioned values and qualities included punctuality, truthfulness, honesty, order and discipline, adherence to school rules, manners and civility, endurance, sympathy, good conduct, dutifulness, cooperation, tolerance, patriotism, punctuality, and self-management as well as a sense of responsibility towards themselves, their school, family, society and the nation. The Case C head teacher, for example, articulated that:

30 FGSFT6
31 INTSFT1
32 FGSFT2
Qualities are nurtured in children every day since the beginning of their school life. For example, they need to maintain school time, attend assembly. They also learn that they need to be clean and tidy, bring books and notebooks to school regularly and wear [school] uniform. They learn how to use toilets, how to behave with classmates, teachers, and family members, etc.33

Moreover, the head teacher in Case D thought that it was very important for the primary school children of Bangladesh to learn about the ‘dignity of labour’ in order to develop a respectful attitude to all people in society irrespective of the level of work they do for a living—an attitude which the head teacher thought is ‘almost absent in our society’.

A set of moral and social ‘qualities’ were articulated by the teachers when they were asked to express how they conceived ‘values’. Values formation, for instance, was perceived by the head teacher as developing ‘mental, human and social’ qualities. In her opinion, moral qualities enable the pupils to ‘possess a good character’ and ‘conceptualise right and wrong and differentiate between them’. Emphasising mostly the two universal values, honesty and truthfulness, the head teacher provided a model of character traits that she expected to be developed in primary school students:

…they [pupils] will be truthful, will take the right course of action, and will not be disillusioned. They will remain honest in their study and their words. Their deeds and words will be congruent.

The head teacher defined ‘social qualities’ as a combination of traits expected in a social human being,

…one would learn how to adjust in society, cooperate with others, acquire leadership qualities, and interact with others in society…Also [included] is social formalities…There are certain positive behaviours that we need to show to society as human beings…What conduct one is allowed to make to different people, how to treat older people and teachers…also an outsider… On the whole, they will learn how to be sociable.

5.6.2 Different Way that the School can Support Values Education

During the interviews and the focus group discussions, the teachers expressed the common belief that “children first learn from their family, and then from their school”. One teacher in Case C made a specific comment about how she viewed the respective roles of the family and the school in the process of children’s learning. In her view,

What they [the children] learn from family becomes stronger by attending school. So, both family and school play a role. … In schools they study and learn together,
but also by mixing with others they learn to respect all and follow the leader … and
to compete with others.³⁴

The teachers also shared a common view that the role of the school in building a values-
base in children is utterly significant. They argued that although children are pre-equipped with
some values emanating from their family and cultural background, it is only in the school that
these values can be learnt ‘more strongly’. One teacher, for example, articulated that a school
being a social institution creates opportunities for children to learn and practice skills, such as
‘following school rules, being punctual, and being in cooperation with classmates’³⁵. Another
teacher highlighted the value ‘discipline’ which she thought can be learnt through everyday
activities in school: “Students learn that they need to be upright and be in a straight line while
the national anthem plays. By verbalising the oath every day, they learn about their
responsibilities to the society and the nation”.³⁶ According to most of the teachers in Case D, the
most important values that the children learn from school are those which build their religious
and moral self and develop in them a sense of responsibility.

The head teacher in Case F identified the awareness of teachers as being very essential
in this regard. One assistant teacher from the same school elaborated her view in this way: “If
we cannot bring them [children] up properly here [in school], then no matter how much they
learn in the future, their learning will have minimum effects”³⁷. In describing the influence
of school and teachers on a child’s values formation, most of the teachers in this school compared
a child to ‘clay’³⁸ that can be given ‘any shape the teachers like’. School was termed by a
teacher as the ‘workshop for nation building’, where ‘children come not only to study’, and
wherein lie the opportunities to equip the children with ‘socialisation, moral qualities, [and] various social qualities’³⁹.

The head teacher in the Case B school emphasized that, through playing sports, the
students develop personal values such as motivation for striving towards success, as well as
social qualities such as friendliness, compassion and cooperation. According to this teacher,
children develop the tendency of nursing or helping their classmates when they get sick or
injured. In this way the social and human values of showing care and sympathy are cultivated in
the children. The teachers in this school liked to introduce to the children the ideal

³⁴ FGSC1
³⁵ FGSA2
³⁶ INTSAT5
³⁷ INTSF4
³⁸ INTSF1, INTSF4, FGFT2
³⁹ FGFT6
characteristics of a human being which, the head teacher believed, ‘help develop and flourish the moral dispositions of the children’.

The teachers identified the opportunity of socialising with teachers and classmates as a crucial source of learning values in school. As one teacher commented, the children learn well ‘by observing the good behaviour of their peers’. The Case E head teacher argued that children learn values from school by means of ‘studying’, ‘observing’ and ‘doing’. Through every day schooling experiences they learn values like discipline, punctuality and responsibility. The ‘observing’ and ‘studying’ aspects of values learning were further elaborated by the teachers. Most of them shared the view that as the children come from various family backgrounds and social levels, they become exposed to certain social values, such as living in cooperation with people from other cultures, sects, ethnic groups and castes, which cannot be learnt in isolation. According to the head teachers across the schools, by studying the subjects, Social Studies and Religious Studies, one can learn the significance of behaving well with everyone in the school, family and the society. These subjects introduce what rights family members, neighbours and relatives possess, and what responsibilities each person should bear to the family and society.

5.6.3 Teachers’ Views of their Role and Relevant Experiences

The participants in the focus group in Case E identified the role of a teacher as inclusive of that of the parents and friends of a child. As one teacher in Case A commented, the teachers repeatedly ‘advise’ the students to obey their elders, show affection to the juniors, be truthful, and always perform and assist in good deeds etc. According to the teachers, when the children first leave their family and attend school, the environment seems to them very different to what they have known so far. Hence, the teachers need to take care that a child feels safe, and becomes able to cope with his or her ‘excitement and eagerness about the new experiences’ and does not become fearful of the new environment. An assistant teacher stated her view during the focus group in the following manner:

I, as a teacher, should be able to motivate the children by my good behaviour. If I scold them when they do something wrong, these children will not come to school from the next day out of fear. But, if I tolerate their behaviour and make them understand what was wrong with their behaviour, then they will be habituated to the [expected] rules and will come in [our] control...Gradually it will become easier for them to understand the school culture and they will learn that school is not a place to fear.40

---

40 FGSET8
Several teachers drew on their personal experiences to describe how some of the students changed their attitude to their teachers and classmates over the years, and learnt to behave in a democratic and disciplined manner. One assistant teacher in Case B commented that the teachers provide practical advice and suggestions beyond the lesson topics in order to portray the goals the students need to achieve in their personal life, as well as the students’ responsibilities in this regard. This teacher cited an example of a girl who ‘performed very poor academically when she first came to school’, but later her results in the Grade five exam surpassed all students in this school and the neighbouring schools. The teacher stressed that this form of change in performance by a child is achievable only when that child attends school.

It was emphasised by the participants in the focus groups in almost all of the schools that since most of the children in their schools come from a disadvantaged family background, the children usually lack sufficient education of values. In this reality, the school was viewed by the teachers as the only source for children from low socio-economic backgrounds to learn about personal values, interpersonal skills, health, hygiene etc. and to have access to the learning that contributes to their character formation. The teachers in Case C believed that the underdeveloped values in the deprived children would flourish and strengthen by mixing with children from more privileged backgrounds, who already had certain values developed in them. These teachers felt that there is a possibility that the deprived children take the learning of these values home to their family and make their family more educated and aware.

To summarise, the teachers unequivocally upheld the role of school, especially that of the primary school, in developing the basis of morality and values in a person. However, one teacher in Case D delineated the forms of learning that take place inside and outside the school and attached more significance to the learning gathered from the family. In his view, the teachers delivered the necessary knowledge on values by teaching the textbook content, but it is mainly in the context of the family and the social surroundings of a child that practical learning of morality and character is achieved.

5.7 Values Content in the Curriculum

The head teachers provided an overall picture of the curricular provisions that explicitly referred to values. For example, the Case E head teacher expressed the view that the aims and objectives as well as the terminal competencies and outcomes as indicated in the national textbooks set for the primary level included a range of values and qualities which ‘provide enough teachings on values and we [schools and teachers] do not need to go beyond textbooks"
[to teach these values].’ The provisions included the mandated lessons for Social Studies, Religious Studies, Music, Art and Crafts, Physical Education, and the lessons for co-curricular activities—mainly singing and recitation.

In grades one and two, there are no textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies, and the teachers seek help from the subject manuals supplied for teaching in these grades. Through ‘discussion and question-answering’ 41, the pupils of these grades are taught about the basic human values, such as truthfulness, honesty, helping others; the fundamental concepts of family, society as well as environment and its components; and the significance of maintaining personal hygiene and cleanliness of the surrounding environment. They are also introduced to the foundational concepts of religious faith, namely, the Creator and His creations, the angels, the messengers, the holy book, etc. As the learners proceed towards the upper grades, they learn from the textbooks about various human, social, religious, and universal values.

In grades three through five, the textbook content of Social Studies and Religious Studies as well as the moral stories and the biographies of the great personalities, included in some of the prose and poems in Bengali, deliver useful teachings on values. The Case A head teacher reported, for example, that:

From Islamic studies textbooks, one can learn about the significance of developing the expected character traits such as honesty, helping the deprived, patriotism etc. Social studies informs about the responsibilities towards the school, family, and society; about living in cooperation with all; about citizenship rights and obligations and so on.42

### 5.7.1 Social Studies

The subject teachers of Social Studies summarised the content included in the curriculum of this subject. They stated that this subject mainly focuses on the concepts of society and social values and all that a person needs to learn to live in cooperation with everyone in a society. The focus is on developing the essential social and citizenship values such as patriotism and tolerance; responsibilities towards members of the family, school, society and nation; and respect towards all people, irrespective of their socio-economic status and occupation. Through studying this subject the students also learn about the basic principles of democratic living and good citizenry, both in local and international contexts, as well as civic and citizenship concepts such as voting, human rights etc. In the teachers’ views, teaching this subject would instil in the children the necessary skills and values required for the sustenance of, and harmony within, the national and international communities. As one Case C teacher commented:

---

41 INTSFT3
42 INTSAT1
Social Studies is about how students can make their lives beautiful and simple, and keep themselves away from the unacceptable traits in life.31

The Case B Social Studies teacher argued that the students see the reflection of what they learn from this subject in their daily school practices, such as when they clean the school and classrooms, or when the teachers make explicit reference to social issues such as the equal rights of boys and girls in the students’ families.

5.7.2 Islamic Studies

The subject teachers of Islamic Studies stated that this subject stresses personal values such as honesty, truthfulness, obeying parents, respect towards parents and other elders, appropriate conduct with all in the family and neighbourhood, nursing patients, being nice to guests, showing compassion to living creatures etc. Students also learn to avoid negative behaviours such as stealing, lying, wasting personal and social resources etc. One Case F teacher highlighted that the Hadiths [the teachings of Prophet Muhammad] and the life stories of the prophets and saints included in the books seem to be effective in teaching about expected values such as compassion, humanity, kindness etc.

5.7.3 Knowledge, Skills and Values

In response to the question “what opportunities are available in this school to learn about and practise these values?” the teachers’ replies connoted in most cases what the students ‘learn’, ‘can learn’ or ‘can do’ in their personal life or school life. The Case A head teacher, for example, expressed her view in the following manner:

By telling stories it is possible to build awareness of the value, honesty. When the students think about various natural calamities that affect Bangladesh, sympathy may be developed in them. They can also show sympathy to the special need children, to elderly people, and can help their neighbours in any adversity. … Also by taking part in the developmental activities in the society, their human and social values can be expressed. … They also learn in Social Studies lessons about the basic human rights and the rights of the citizens. By learning about the lives and contributions of the great persons of the nation, the sense of patriotism grows in them.44

Another common pattern was identified in the teachers’ responses. The teachers preferred to narrate the content of the textbook chapters in relation to various personal and

31 INTST2
44 INTSAT1
social values. It seemed to the researcher that they took it for granted that what they taught from the textbooks would, in the course of time, be automatically transferred to the students and form their values dispositions and character traits. For instance, the Case A subject teacher of Islamic Studies responded in the following manner:

> When I teach, for example, the chapter on character formation, the students come to know about how to become a human being enriched with good character traits, what good and bad characteristics the human character may have, and how to adopt good things and implement these in the classroom, family, society and in nation. … When I tell, explain, advice, and instruct on these things [various values]…students will then learn…to contribute to the school, family, and in turn to the society and nation.

The subject teachers of Social Studies and Islamic Studies held the common view that the values content in the curriculum and the textbooks of the respective subjects sufficiently covered the knowledge that the students needed to acquire to grow as good human beings and well-intentioned citizens. Contending that “whatever the children need to learn in order to cope with the environment is included in the textbooks”, the Case B subject teacher of Social Studies stressed the importance of making the syllabus more inclusive of ‘vocational education’ which in her view was ‘not present in Social Studies that much’. This teacher thought that the syllabus should provide greater focus on life-oriented skills such as farming or raising poultry so that by gaining sufficient knowledge and practical skills “children and their families can make some income from these sources through self-employment” and thus ‘inspire others to be involved in these activities and assist therein’\textsuperscript{45}. In her view, this type of vocational knowledge and practical skills is essential to build the workforce and thus to combat the poverty prevailing in Bangladesh.

Another Islamic Studies teacher in Case F argued that because the topics covered in this subject encompass essential religious concepts and beliefs, as well as the basic personal and social values and virtues, the content would sufficiently ‘develop in children morality, discipline, devotion’ and the children will be ‘very unlikely to perform wrong deeds in the future’\textsuperscript{46}. Similarly, believing that there was sufficient content on values in the Social Studies textbooks, the Case C teacher identified the need of presenting certain concepts of history and civics to the students in a more simplified manner so that the students could better comprehend these relatively complex concepts.

### 5.7.4 Content Relevant to the Students’ Lives

In response to the question, to what extent do they think the curriculum and textbook
content relates to or reflects the real life of the students, all of the Case F subject teachers presented a similar view, that is, that the subjects of Religious Studies and Social Studies provide ample opportunity for students to learn about and show reflection of the real world that they regularly experience. One pertinent comment made about the Islamic Studies curriculum was: “This subject teaches all that a child needs to learn for his or her [religious] life…I do not think they need to learn anything beyond this after passing [the primary level].”

Similarly, the Case C Social Studies teacher stated that:

> There is enough content on values in the textbooks. If they [students] learn this much and capture this in mind, then automatically they will be able to reflect the values in real life...We [the teachers] expect that they [students] will follow these teachings... When we see some reflection on the behaviour and mentality of the children, we come to know that they have internalised the learning.

When requested by the researcher to specify the learning experiences that the students gain from outside the textbook content, the Case A teachers responded with particular activities and events that they thought positively influenced the morality and character formation of the students. These activities and events were mainly the co-curricular and extra-curricular activities described in a later section.

### 5.7.5 Teachers’ Criticisms of the Curriculum and the Evaluation System

While discussing the values content provided in the curriculum and the textbooks, the teachers at some of the schools referred to aspects of the primary curriculum and the evaluation system, which in their view, limited the potential of the schools and the teachers to develop the children as whole human beings with essential knowledge, skills and values acquired through their schooling.

The teachers thought that the existing curriculum, learning practices and written-exam-based evaluation procedures did not seem to take into account the needs, abilities, multiple intelligences and interests of students as individuals or as a class. They felt opportunities for nurturing students’ creativity or achieving practical learning were also very limited and that the curriculum and evaluation systems were designed in a way that only promotes the mastery of the textbook content by rote-learning. The Case F head teacher suggested that the curriculum and the evaluation system need to be tailored to the needs and abilities of both the more able and less able children, so that the less able students are not overwhelmed with advanced, complex information; rather, they only acquire the essential values and the practical life skills that their level of ability can manage. In addition, the teachers unequivocally expressed their

---

[^47]: INTSFT7
[^48]: INTSCT2
concern about the ‘extremely large’ syllabus at the primary level, especially for grades three and five. The Grade five children are required to ‘master everything in textbooks for appearing at the completion exam’\(^{49}\), an expectation that one teacher termed as ‘insane’ considering the size of the syllabus. Another teacher commented that the present evaluation system shifts the focus from ‘acquiring a sound knowledge base’ to ‘memorising everything for exam’\(^{50}\). In addition, the Case E teachers expressed the view that although the educational guidelines and policies prevailing in Bangladesh entail that there should be no written evaluation for the students in grades one and two, in reality these students are expected to appear at written exams in school. A significant limitation of the present summative, exam-based evaluation practice was articulated by the Case F head teacher:

> There is no provision available for children to improve their performance when they achieve poor result in an exam. There is also no opportunity [for them] to receive feedback and rectify their mistakes made in the annual exam when they get promoted to the next grade or repeat the same. This [the present practice] is a one-way process. What I suggest, instead, is the daily assessment and continuous feedback.\(^{51}\)

This teacher also commented that the education delivered in Bangladeshi schools does not match the way children’s development has been manifested in the competency-based curriculum. In her opinion, while it is intended that “the primary school graduates will be able to flourish in society as healthy citizens, follow general ethics and will abide by the established rules of the society”\(^{52}\), in the present reality the education is far from achieving these goals. She further added that although the competencies stipulated in the curriculum represent a combination of ‘knowledge, skills, and perceptions’, the primary education in Bangladesh is ‘still at the level of knowledge’.

### 5.7.6 Summary

To summarise the teachers’ views, the large syllabus and the exam based evaluation system, as a combined force, appear to be limiting the prospect of broader development of the children. It emerged as a common concern that at present there is very little scope for applying pedagogies that may develop the children’s thinking skills and creativity; allow them to share their personal experiences, thoughts and feelings; and make the learning permanent and meaningful.

---

\(^{49}\) INTSF1  
\(^{50}\) INTSF3  
\(^{51}\) INTSF1
5.8 Pedagogy for Teaching Values

As reported by the subject teachers, at the beginning of the school year the teachers make annual plans for all of the mandatory subjects that outline the sections of the textbook that will be taught in each of the three school terms. The teachers then decide which textbook chapters they will complete teaching each month. The curriculum includes the learning outcomes to be achieved from studying a subject. During lesson delivery, the teachers aim to address those subject-wise learning outcomes indicated in the curriculum that are included in the relevant chapter content.

**Instructional Resources.** The subject teachers reported that they use the textbook as their main instructional tool and that they predominantly teach the topics included in the textbooks. When discussing the topics they rely on their content knowledge of the textbook chapters as well as adding relevant examples and explanations. Some of the teachers reported that they refer to the teachers’ guides to learn what outcomes are expected to be achieved by the students in a given lesson and what questions to ask the students so that the outcomes can be evaluated. The head teacher and another male teacher in Case D stressed that like most of the schools in Bangladesh, none of the teachers in this school had access to recent training manuals. These teachers expressed the view that these manuals included information that would have made the task of teaching easier; the head teacher thought that if teachers could consult the manuals “we [the teachers] will not have to read and think about the whole topic before teaching, but this is what we are doing now”. The assistant teacher mentioned that the ‘extra questions’ included in the teacher manuals provided examples of questions that could be asked during lessons.

The Case A subject teacher of Social Studies—who had started her teaching career very recently and had received subject-based training on Social Studies—described the way the teachers’ guides and the teacher editions of the textbooks assisted her in teaching this subject. In her words:

The teacher guides elaborately instruct on how to present a topic, what questions to ask, and how to evaluate the learning of students. … These resources instruct a teacher to first develop a lesson plan that would include the creation of a safe and friendly environment at the beginning of a lesson. Next come the techniques of classroom management, such as ordering the seating arrangement of students based on their height, or ensuring that the classroom is neat and tidy. Then a teacher should ask the students about their thoughts on the lesson topic. After this, the teacher will present his or her thoughts to the class and compare these thoughts with those of the students.52
Another teacher referred to the form of lesson preparation suggested to the teachers during the training sessions. As she reported, a teacher is instructed to gain adequate knowledge and understanding of the lesson content and expected outcomes, prepare relevant materials, present the topic using varied techniques, and attempt to evaluate the learning of all students within the class time. She, however, admitted that in reality this is rarely implemented in regular classroom lessons. Her experience in this regard was described as follows:

In fact, we face many problems in a lesson. Sometimes children make noise during the lesson, they do not want to pay attention...in that case although I plan to cover three outcomes, even one of them cannot be covered. Some days it happens that the outcomes are easy [to be achieved]; they [children] also seem to have good conception about those. In this case, the outcomes can be achieved easily...  

Two of the Case F teachers described the good teaching practices that teachers are lately being recommended to use in their classrooms. One subject teacher for Islamic Studies, for example, discussed a ‘newer approach’ that entails a teacher first reading the textbook content and then discussing various aspects of it. Once the students are able to comprehend the topic from the teacher’s presentation, ‘they will [be asked to] open their textbook’. This teacher also reported that they have been instructed in training programs to ‘develop lesson notes’ for each lesson which would incorporate the questions to be asked of the students, and the ‘possible answers’ to those questions. The aim of doing so, in this teacher’s view, was to guide the questioning task so that “the class finally come up with the correct answer” (which is prescribed in the textbook). She also stated that the teachers are now being encouraged to use props, such as pictures or posters, in order to initiate and stimulate discussion in lessons.

The Case A subject teacher of Islamic Studies, who was the most senior and oldest among the teachers of this school, made mention of some other resources supplied by the government, including the teacher guides, teacher editions of the textbooks, information booklets, and question booklets. However, she did not clearly state what use she made of these resources in teaching this subject. Similarly, in response to the question regarding what teaching strategies she used in classrooms, the Case D subject teacher for Social Studies pointed out the recommendations made in the teacher guides and training programs, although it was not clear from her response whether she implemented these recommendations in her lessons. The directions for teachers that she mentioned are as follows:

Teachers have to move in the classroom rather than just sitting on a chair. First, we [the teachers] need to exchange greetings with students and do some activities to entertain them. Then we can initiate the topic of lesson. There should also be
included student evaluation, first verbal and then written evaluation...We are expected to do this way.\textsuperscript{55}

**Pedagogy.** Most of the teachers reported that the main teaching and assessment strategies they employed in their lessons included lecture, discussion and question-answering. As one teacher explained:

First I read the chapter myself and then explain to the students the content or what is expected from them. I do not go directly to the book. Rather, I first read and understand myself and then explain to them using my own words.\textsuperscript{56}

Similarly, one Case B teacher summarised the pedagogies commonly used by the teachers in her school in the following manner:

We mainly apply the ‘reading’ [of textbook] method... I instruct the students to underline the important sentences. I keep reading such sentences several times and also make them repeat after me. Later I ask questions from the portion I read...Through reading and discussion the students find answers to the short and narrative questions. We present the content to them in such a way that they become able to understand the topic...We also cite the examples of elements in immediate environment to explain any topic...When they can answer the questions we ask, it is understood that the outcomes have been achieved.\textsuperscript{57}

The way the teachers in general perceived the task of ‘discussion’ in the classrooms can be ascertained from the account made by a Social Studies teacher:

After going to class I converse with them about the topic I would teach. Say, if I want to teach about ‘democratic attitude’, I take some examples given in the book, such as selecting a class representative. Then I discuss with them, for example, in case your [the students’] family want to make a trip, you all may have varying opinions...But, a place may need to be selected considering the opinion of all. This form of considering everyone’s opinion is an example of democratic attitude ... I also have the students read the content of book repeatedly\textsuperscript{58}

The response made by a Case A teacher seemed an exception to the typical text-based question-answer format adopted in most schools. This teacher indicated that she tried to reflect in her lessons the instructions received from the teacher guides and the training sessions. Generally, before presenting any topic in a lesson she first shared her thoughts and personal experiences relevant to the given topic. In her view, by doing so, “the students feel relaxed and do not fear to share their thoughts with me.” She added, “I also make provisions for cheering up their mind. After teaching for a certain period, I take a break and let them converse with their
peers about the lesson topic or whatever they like.” This teacher also reported that in addition to the traditional discussion and question-answering methods, she occasionally involved the students in group work. She described her practice in this way:

I instruct the class to first read a textbook chapter. Then, I divide them in groups, and ask them to discuss whatever they understood about the topic and then list their thoughts on a piece of paper. Then I invite one student from each group and ask the student to present to class what the group discussed.59

With the focus of ‘digging out’ what prior knowledge children possess on a particular topic, the Case C Social Studies teacher first asked questions relevant to the topic, and added her own description and explanation, and then instructed students to look up what the book included on the topic. In order to assess what the students learned from the lesson, she sometimes assigned them a task of ‘creating questions and then finding their answers from the portion of the textbook taught’. In doing so her ‘aim is that the students at least know the topic well and can write something in exam’60. Similarly, the Islamic Studies teacher also reported that while teaching a topic she prefers to ‘first assess their [students’] basic knowledge of the topic. Following this, she ‘open[s] the book’ and also ‘tell[s] things relevant to the lesson topic’.61 Both subject teachers stressed the immense interest that the students derived from listening to real-life or fictional stories, told by either the teacher or other students. The Islamic Studies teacher, for instance, stated that: “Students like the stories included in Islamic Studies book a great deal. Actually when we tell them any relevant story or example, it affects their mind deeply.”62

Similarly, all of the Case E teachers reported that they preferred to first ask questions relevant to the topic to be taught. After collecting student responses, they described their own understanding and experiences in relation to the topic. Following this, the students were asked to check the textbook content to see whether the responses elicited from the class matched the points made in the textbook. The teachers finally conducted oral or written evaluation based on the topic, following the students’ reading of the textbook content individually.

Most of the teachers expressed a common view that in Islamic Studies and Social Studies there is very limited scope for using materials other than the textbooks. They thought that apart from a few charts or pictures there are not enough materials available to them to use in the lessons of these subjects. The Case A Social Studies teacher, however, provided some suggestions as to what materials can be used in the Social Studies lessons:

59INTSAT5
60INTSCT2
61INTSCT3
62INTSCT3
Since Social Studies is all about society, we can show materials that are usually seen around us. These might be real or semi-real. Or, we can take the students outside the classroom and school to show to them the elements of the society and environment. We can also use charts and maps while teaching about our country. Above all, the best material is the textbook. Textbooks include some pictures relevant to the topic. We can also ask students to bring some materials from home.

It was identified by a few teachers that replacing the present lecture-based teaching-learning methods is essential so that “the learning becomes permanent in them [students]”. They reported that there is virtually no opportunity for Bangladeshi students to participate in field work or service learning.

Assessment. As the teachers informed, the student activities implemented most frequently in the lessons comprised ‘reading from the textbook’ and ‘writing the answers’. Assessment was conducted mainly through question-answering techniques and writing tasks with the assessment items taken mainly from ‘the exercise section in the textbook’. The Case F teachers referred to the reasons why they preferred these methods and techniques. According to them, by repeating the question-answering tasks and writing exercises it can be assured that students will ‘memorise it [the textbook content] better’, ‘learn to spell the words correctly’ and will be able to ‘answer the questions listed in the exercise sections [of textbooks]’.

According to the teachers, they encourage the students ‘to write [answers] using their own words’ rather than only copying the content in the textbook. One teacher stated that,

When I find that someone has written something from outside the book, I ask that child to read his or her response aloud. Then the other students... get encouraged to write something relevant to the book content, but adding new points to that by themselves.

The Case C Islamic Studies teacher, however, shared her experience that during lessons the students usually preferred oral assessment to written tasks, although the result in the final examination, which is solely written, determines students’ performance in the subjects.

The view was expressed by one teacher in Case F that ‘a teacher is the best method’ and that what methods and activities a teacher selects depends entirely on ‘the situation in the classroom’, that is, on what needs to be done in order to ‘control’ the children by ‘keeping them busy in activities’. One teacher expressed a rather candid view about pedagogies generally

---

63 INTSAT5  
64 INTSCT3  
65 INTSFT7  
66 INTSBT1  
67 INTSDT7
applied in classrooms, which resembled the views of some other teachers, too:

It is true that we receive training [on advanced teaching practices]. However, to be honest, we do not apply what they train us. We feel comfortable to teach the way we have been teaching for long. Students also feel comfortable with how we teach. The topics covered in trainings are good, but difficult to be applied in schools.68

Two of the Case F teachers also highlighted that they lacked the professional knowledge and skills required to assess the students’ learning outcomes in affective and behavioural domains.

Opportunities for Expressing and Applying Values. The teachers were asked to express their views on the extent to which the students—through their daily schooling experiences—get opportunities to express their own feelings, emotions, and values; develop respect for those of others; and apply their values in authentic actions and interactions. The teachers replied with some examples from the student actions that they thought were the expressions of the students’ feelings and values. One of the most cited examples was the first aid care given by the classmates when a student falls ill or becomes wounded. As one teacher commented, “even before informing us [the teachers], they [the students] themselves take care of the wounded student. They also take that student home if something serious happens.”69 Another frequently mentioned example was the sharing of food and stationery items such as pens and notebooks with their classmates when the need arose. Almost all the teachers concurred in the view that the expression of values that the teachers passed on to the students became evident when the students pay ‘Salam’ whenever they meet their teachers within and outside the school, or they show respect to a teacher by standing together every time a teacher enters or leaves the classroom. Some of the teachers shared the expectation that “as these values are expressed in their [the students’] behaviour, the students would possibly apply in their later life what they are taught by the teachers”.

The teachers were adamant that whatever they instructed the students about values-related aspects like good manners, health, discipline or classroom rituals, was followed by the students. The subject teacher of Social Studies in Case A, for example, stated that:

Students learn from the textbook that they should not spit wherever they like. I taught this to them and found afterwards that they do no longer spit in classroom, or throw paper and other things on the floor. I get the impression that they are following what I taught them. I also told them I want to see the classroom clean after the lunch period. It is found that they are also following this command of mine.70

68GTSBT4
69FGSAT3
70FGSAT2
It was highlighted by the teachers, particularly those in Case A and F, that the opportunities for the students to share their feelings and emotions are created in the classrooms as the teachers initiate the lessons with exchanging greetings and then asking the children how they feel physically and mentally. For example, all of the Case A teachers reported that before starting lessons they try to assess the mental and physical states of the students by asking them questions like if they had their breakfast, what the situation in their family is etc. In addition, the Case A head teacher shared that when discussing any topic in a lesson, she asks the students some relevant questions and the students thus get the opportunity to talk about their real life and what they think of the topic in question.

Teacher responses were also sought on the ways the classroom activities in values lessons provided the students with opportunities to exercise their thinking ability. One Social Studies teacher set a specific example of how the textbook of this subject, in her view, provides an ‘opportunity to express thoughts and feelings’:

> There is a blank table in the middle of every chapter which the children are told to fill with their opinions…These tables provide a good opportunity to express children’s thoughts … Three or four points are given in textbook … and they are to add one or two points thinking themselves. In this way they get opportunity to express their thoughts.\(^1\)

The same teacher referred to some activities suggested in the Islamic Studies curriculum—such as ‘writing the teachings of Prophet Mohammad’ or ‘listing ten good deeds that the children do in their daily life’—as providing a scope for the children to be involved in ‘practical activities’ related to values. When asked whether other classroom opportunities were available beyond the listing of answers, such as pair or group discussion about what the children think or feel about a specific topic, this teacher replied nervously that: “Expressing thoughts, emotions and feelings is not yet included in the curriculum and practice [in Bangladeshi primary education]”\(^2\). In a similar vein, another teacher expressed her concern that until now classroom practices in general do not include any methods allowing students to converse with each other, to think, or to discuss or share their thoughts, feelings and opinions with classmates. She stressed the need for embedding child-centred activities into the textbook chapters so that these could be implemented in classrooms as a mandated curriculum component.

**Values Related to Real Life.** The Case C Social Studies teacher cited some examples of the way she relates the subject content to the real life of the learners. For instance, when two students complained to her about each other, she drew on the topic of behaving well with

\(^1\)INTSFT4  
\(^2\)INTSFT4
classmates to remind them of their responsibility towards friends. She also referred to the equal rights of men and women in society and explained how the absence of this creates problems in society.

On the other hand, the Case D Social Studies teacher claimed that there is not much scope in the Social Studies classrooms to relate the learning to the real life of the students, although she upheld the view that when studying Social Studies “students should be able to learn practically from the real environment”\textsuperscript{73}. She thought that this can easily be achieved in science or math lessons. This teacher informed that she relates to the real life components by only ‘demonstrating the relevant pictures’ in her lessons.

The Case E teachers reported in this regard that they drew examples from the lives of the students and of themselves. For instance, a Social Studies teacher cited an example from a lesson about ‘the rights of women’, she asked the students about the attitude and behaviour that their fathers show towards their mothers. Many children then shared the incidences of their father physically assaulting them or their mother. The teacher then explained how the students can initiate discussion with their father and make him understand that what he did was not right. Another teacher reported that while teaching the topic ‘respect towards manual labourers’, she once used a mind-mapping technique to get student responses on the occupation of their guardians and relatives. She then explained that no occupation is less respectable than the others and the students should behave equally with all in society irrespective of their occupation and social status. This teacher also reported that she once warned the students about their mistreatment of children with special needs in the same class. Later, she found that the students changed their attitude towards the children with special needs.

**Challenges Identified by the Teachers.** The Case A subject teacher of Social Studies identified a number of factors that she thought limited the possibility of engaging students in discussion and thinking exercises. First, most of the children fear speaking in the classroom since the environment and family background they come from do not generally promote self-confidence, therefore, the children showed almost no inclination towards expressing their feelings and thoughts. The teacher, however, stressed that the students may overcome this fear over time with the sincere care of the teachers. Second, as the teachers became exhausted, both physically and mentally, after teaching continuously, they lacked the energy or will required to involve the students in creative tasks. Third, within the limited class time, usually 30 or 35 minutes, the teachers find it extremely difficult to accomplish teaching the textbook content, engaging the class containing over 90 students in advanced activities like group discussion, and assessing the students’ achievement of the expected learning outcomes.
In addition, the large class size, coupled with the limited class time, was identified by a number of the teachers as restricting the teachers’ capacity to implement storytelling and other such sharing techniques as well as child-centred teaching methods in their lessons. These factors were also associated by some teachers to the classroom management problems that were created when they demonstrated any materials such as the globe or a map to the class. Similarly, in response to the question whether she used any other activities during lessons, one of the Case C teachers argued that although there are a few alternative assessment tasks suggested in the textbooks, she does not prefer these tasks as they cause the students to ‘leave their seats’ and they make a great deal of noise, and consequently the classroom management becomes difficult. One method that she sometimes applied in her class when any writing task was provided was to ask the students to check one another’s’ work in pairs. According to her, the students find this technique very interesting. This teacher also made a comment about the assessment and evaluation of students’ learning outcomes in terms of their affect and emotion: “We cannot actually assess or evaluate the extent to which they [the students] apply in their life what they learn from school.”

Likewise, the Case E teachers argued that it is difficult to implement cooperative techniques like pair or group work in large size classes since these methods tend to disrupt the lesson and time management becomes difficult. The Social Studies teacher shared her practices regarding the implementation of group work in lessons, and also the difficulties faced by the teachers in this regard:

When I implement a group activity, say when I tell the class to write something on a topic, I engage those students who submit their work first in checking the work of others. Finally, I myself check if they have done it properly. This sort of group work is perfect for a small class, but not suitable for regular classes in our country. We learn from trainings that the seating arrangement of students to conduct a group work should be ‘u-shape’ so that everyone can see others. But, we cannot even accommodate students in the classroom. We form groups of ten to twelve children whereas there should be a maximum of five students in a group.

It was clearly stated by this teacher that the students usually find group tasks very interesting and challenging and they request the teachers to implement such activities in every lesson. A final comment made by this teacher, however, depicted the actual situation in terms of implementing the cooperative teaching strategies in lessons. She stated that, “In reality, when the higher officials come to visit our lessons, we just act to show them that we use these techniques in our lessons”.

74INTSET5
Moreover, the Case D subject teacher for Islamic Studies expressed his concern that although it is crucial to let students share their own feelings and thoughts in the classroom through discussion with their peers, in reality this cannot be implemented in lessons. The reason he identified was that the teachers mainly concentrate on the completion of the syllabus within a given time frame, and therefore they cannot afford to reduce the limited class time with any method requiring ‘extra time’. Instead, the teachers prefer to assess student learning by posing oral and written questions which he believed allows the students to ‘express what they think or feel’. Moreover, another teacher contended that although the Social Studies textbooks include various topics that are applicable to children’s lives, at present there are no provisions available in schools to ‘take the students outside school’ so that they can experience the textbook content practically. This teacher also reported that although the textbooks referred to various clubs that were supposed to be established in schools, in reality the clubs were not in existence in this school.

One exceptional view regarding teachers’ actual classroom practices was expressed by one senior teacher during a focus group discussion. She candidly stated that:

To be honest, you will not get real scenario of teaching by observing classes. When you or someone else will observe, we will follow what we learn from trainings, such as preparing and using lesson plans and lesson notes, applying advanced teaching methods. However, these cannot be implemented in reality…Actually we do not need lesson plans as we are already experienced. How can one teacher prepare about nine lesson plans every day? We always feel the tension that any higher officials may come to visit our classrooms.76

In summary, the pedagogical practices that the teachers preferred mainly included lecture, discussion and oral or written evaluation, with the textbook being the only instructional tool in almost all of the cases. However, the description that the teachers used to explain their practice of ‘discussion’ actually depicted a teacher-centred question-answering session prior to introducing a topic. In addition, when asked to describe their pedagogical practices in the lessons of Social Studies and Religious Studies, the teachers referred to the ideal scenario of lesson preparation, presentation and evaluation that the recent training programs had introduced to them. However, the teachers from the metropolitan schools (Case C and Case E) and those who were relatively younger with a shorter teaching career seemed to have a better understanding of, and more inclination towards implementing, the recently introduced teaching strategies. The teachers in general, expressed a limited view of the potential of the lessons for Social Studies and Religious Studies in creating opportunities for the students to express their thoughts, emotions and values, and to develop their moral and values dispositions through

---

75INTSF4
76FGCT2
practical learning. In their views, the teacher’s exchanging greetings with the class at the
beginning of a lesson, and the students’ showing respect to the teacher as well as caring for their
classmates during the lesson provide adequate scaffolds for the students to develop and
strengthen their values. Finally, the teachers identified a range of challenges affecting their
implementation of cooperative learning strategies that included the system-wide narrow focus
on exam-based achievement, limited class time and large class sizes, and the unavailability of
teaching-learning materials that could make the lessons more meaningful and enjoyable.

5.9 Implicit Modelling of Values by the Teachers

The teachers were requested to express their views on the way their words, thoughts and
actions enhanced the values learning of the students. Almost all of the teachers interviewed or
involved in the focus group discussions upheld the view that the teachers have an ‘enormous
influence’ on their students, the students follow whatever their teachers instruct them to do, and
therefore, teachers can play a crucial role in strengthening the values of the students. The Case
D teachers commented that “when a teacher teaches something, it becomes permanent in their
[students’] mind”; the parents also reported the same to the teachers on several occasions.

It was strongly suggested by the teachers from all of the cases that the children tend to
obey their teachers more than their parents and other adults in their family, and they copy the
way teachers talk, behave, and even the way they dress. As an example, one Case F teacher
stressed the idea of the teachers’ being modest in appearance and speech. In her view, taking ‘an
unattractive appearance’, speaking in colloquial language or using belittling words would
impact on the students in a negative way. Moreover, in the views of some teachers, the
students learn not only from the way a teacher speaks, behaves or communicates with people;
they learn certain values, such as punctuality and discipline, by observing their teachers’
practices. One Case D teacher reported some instances of the students in his school showing
values and attitudes—such as attending school on time, keeping the classroom calm and quiet,
paying Salam to the teachers, and caring for elderly family members—which, he believed, had
been demonstrated by the students owing to their inclination toward obeying what the teachers
advised them to do.

The teachers stipulated that whatever advice and directions they provided to the
students in relation to the formation of their values and character traits had a profound impact on
the minds of the students. As one teacher commented, “The students believe that what they
learn from us is the real learning”78. A Case F teacher commented that “teachers are quite a role model to the students”. In support of her view this teacher said, “When we say something…they [the students] listen to us attentively. We tell them to greet with Salam each time they meet a teacher in or outside the school…Afterwards we find that they follow what we teach them”.79 Comparing the pupils of primary schools to ‘clay’, one teacher expressed her belief saying, “The children will grow with the values and beliefs that their teachers want them to learn and practice”80. As one teacher stated during the focus group discussion, “Students think seriously when we refer to any behaviour or habit as praiseworthy and acceptable…They also strive to be like those students who the teachers admire.”81 Another focus-group participant elaborated on the positive effect a teachers’ appreciation might exert on student motivation and achievement:

After I praise mature students for their performance in a lesson, a less mature student may wish “If I could be like them [mature ones]”. By observing the treatments that the mature students receive, a challenging and competitive mindset grows in them [less mature students] and they gradually improve their academic performance.82

Interacting with students in a friendly manner was identified by the Case F head teacher as the most crucial factor in creating a positive school environment. She referred to the fact that creating a motherly environment in school is one of the principal reasons behind recruiting 60% female teachers in Bangladesh. The head teacher cited a number of examples of how her amicable personality and behaviour eased the way for students to approach their teachers. For example, she educated her students, especially the younger ones, on maintaining personal hygiene in school and asked them not to fear or hesitate in seeking the teacher’s permission for going to the toilet. Another example was the provision of basic knowledge on puberty and associated health issues to some female students. She claimed that through her loving and caring attitude to students she had earned their trust, confidence and respect. In her view, a teachers’ friendly attitude and behaviour has enormous potential in minimising the effects of the factors that hinder the creation of a child-friendly school environment in Bangladesh. The factors she mentioned included the lack of provision in the schools to supply food to those who cannot afford it or to make classrooms attractive.

Similarly, highlighting the role that a teacher is expected to play in the context of Bangladeshi primary education, the Case B head teacher stipulated that it is the responsibility of the teachers to reward students after they accomplish any task or achieve success. The teachers
should not underestimate the views of the students, rather value them, and in this way the students’ values can flourish and be strengthened.

Three out of the six Case A teachers attached special importance to a teacher’s friendly behaviour to the students in developing mutual trust and confidence. One teacher put it this way:

The pupils usually fear the teachers. The teachers need to build such an affectionate relationship that the students gradually would gain confidence in teachers and believe that their problems will be listened to…Thus the students would begin to express them freely\textsuperscript{83}.

The Case C Social Studies teacher shared her practice of and view towards creating a safe and free classroom environment:

In my class, students do not fear me. I provide them the freedom to talk…By talking freely and sharing with me, their hesitation towards and fear of teachers lessens. They also become clear about any confusion in themselves…If I do not let them talk, they will not ask me any questions even if they do not understand a thing. I will also not be able to recognize whether they understood what I wanted to render…I do not like the idea that students will fear teachers. I prefer them to talk freely.\textsuperscript{84}

Another teacher from this school portrayed the friendly attitudes of herself and her colleagues by saying:

Students do not feel hesitated or fear [in my class] in sharing stories or examples from their lives. Teachers should be like friends. We [teachers in this school] usually want to mix with them [students] freely. If they fear they cannot learn. They will not ask questions and will remain quiet.\textsuperscript{85}

Finally, the teachers shared the expectation that since their students valued what they were taught about morality and values, the students would also be able to realise the implications of these teachings in their life. It was also articulated that the teachers could infer from their students’ attitudes and behaviour that the students were obeying the teachers’ commands and guidelines.

In summary, drawing from their experiences the teachers recognised their role as vitally important in shaping the minds and habits of the students. Displaying friendly attitudes and behaviours to the students and building a respectful relationship with them was also designated as a key to creating a positive school environment.

\textsuperscript{83}FGSAT4
\textsuperscript{84}INTSCT2
\textsuperscript{85}INTSCT2
5.10 Summary

This chapter described the contexts of the schools that included the school facilities, the student and teacher population as well as the local community, the daily school routines, and an overview of the stipulations related to the values and moral development of the children which the schools or the central authority enacted. The findings suggest that, in general, the schools suffered from poor infrastructural and recreational facilities and staffing conditions. In most cases, the community participation was limited to the parents’ visits to the school on a few annual occasions. The teacher interviews delineated some recent initiatives taken by the government that portrayed its commitment to creating a child-centred, quality learning environment. This also supports the findings from the document analysis included in the previous chapter. In terms of reinforcement of values development, the regular curricular provisions were confined to those through the subjects Social Studies, Religious Studies and mandated co-curricular subjects. However, from the experiences gathered by the researcher in relation to the teachers’ treatment of the daily routines and their daily practices in the schools, other than the metropolitan schools, it appeared that not only were the students taught for at least one period less than that stipulated in the routines, but the values lessons were the ones likely to be most neglected or skipped.

The teachers also shared their views about the contributions that they thought the present curriculum makes to the holistic development of the children. While the teachers’ views signalled their apparently narrow conceptualisation of curriculum and pedagogy as well as their role in the whole-person development of the children, the teachers also identified some challenges prevalent in the present education system that limit their potential to deliver values lessons effectively to all children. Moreover, despite all the limitations they reported, the teachers identified their role as utterly significant and influential to their students, which they positively linked to their strength as potential values educators.

This chapter primarily reported the teachers’ views about their role in the moral and values development of their students. The next chapter presents the findings from the observations of the classroom and the school-wide activities, as well the teacher interviews and focus groups, to present a detailed discussion on the explicit and implicit values learning provisions in the schools, overall school environment, and the challenges faced by the teachers.
CHAPTER 6:
EXPLICIT/IMPLIED SCHOOL PROVISIONS FOR VALUES DEVELOPMENT

6.1 Introduction
This chapter reports the field data relevant to: i) the explicit/implicit values development provisions available through the daily school activities, school management approaches, and co- and extra-curricular programs; ii) the conduct of the values lessons; ii) the nature of the overall school environment; and, iv) the school- and child-related factors that posed challenges to the teachers in their efforts to implement values initiatives. The data sources included the interviews with head teachers and subject teachers, focus group discussion with teachers, and the observations of classrooms and school-wide activities.

6.2 Explicit/Implicit Values Learning Provisions in the School
This section describes the activities that reflected either an explicit, implicit or combined approach to instilling values in children through the daily routines of the schools. As discussed in the literature review, values education is most effective when students are explicitly taught about values and when they also see and experience values throughout their daily interactions at school. The data was obtained from the teacher interviews, focus groups and the observations made of the schools and classrooms. The explicit provisions included the daily assembly, behaviour management techniques, co- and extra-curricular activities and values lessons.

6.2.1 The Daily Assembly
The question was posed to the head teachers and focus group participants as to what opportunities the children were provided with through daily school activities that explicitly referred to values. In response to this question, the teachers nominated the daily school assembly that lasts for about 15 to 20 minutes in every school as a mandated part of the schools’
activities. One or more assembly sessions were observed in all of the schools except School F. In this school, the assembly was conducted at a public space outside the school premises because there is no yard or playground in the school. Since that public space was being used for a local event during the field study, the assembly did not take place. The head teacher, however, provided a detailed account of the activities usually involved in the assembly.

The head teachers repeatedly emphasised that, through attending the daily assembly, the students learned to be ordered and disciplined, and that the various steps involved in the conduct of the assembly promoted the value of patriotism among the students. The values and skills that were identified by the teachers as being cultivated in the students through the daily assembly included:

- adherence to commands developed through following the directions of the student leader of assembly;
- religious awareness developed through listening to the recitation from the Holy Book and praying to God; and,
- democratic and citizenship values, such as patriotism, and a sense of responsibility towards the nation, which were developed through making the oath, saluting the national flag and singing the national anthem.

For example, the Case B head teacher commented that the children gained valuable lessons ‘about patriotism and discipline’ by attending the daily assembly when they performed activities like ‘showing respect to the national flag, going to class in an ordered manner’, etc.

The observation of an assembly session taking place in School A is described below. This description provides a representative picture of the steps involved in the conduct of the daily assemblies across the case-study schools:

**Day 1, 12.00 pm: Daily Assembly**

The students of grades three to five, gathered in the school yard. The area of this place is approximately 300 square feet. Dust from the ground has spread everywhere. One female teacher who is in charge of the Cub Team (student club for extra-curricular activities) is helping the students line up straight. The teacher is covering her face and head with cloth to protect her from the dust. All other teachers were standing on the veranda, inside the building.

Four or five students lined up near the teachers and faced the rest of the students. They then led the activities in the assembly.

One student (S1) commanded, ‘Be straight. Stand at ease.’ The crowd followed her command. She continued, ‘Prepare for the first PT (Physical Training)’. The whole school followed her and did the drill a few times. This was repeated for PT 2.

No microphone was available. The leader was shouting as best she could.
Next step was paying homage to the national flag. S1 said, ‘one’. All students saluted the flag. S1 then said, ‘two’ - all lowered their hands. The salutation was conducted one more time.

One trainee teacher expressed his dissatisfaction saying, “I saw some of you folded your hands. This is not the perfect way to stand while showing respect to the national flag. Be straight and do it again.” The whole process was repeated once more.

Next was saying prayer. S2 recited some verses from the Quran while the whole school listened quietly.

S3 then commanded, ‘Be ready for oath’. All students straightened their right hand to the front and made a fist. S3 continued to say - “I pledge that I will engage myself in the welfare of all citizens. I will be obedient to my country. I will always be active to maintain the dignity of my country. I will make continuous efforts to make my country prosperous.”

The school repeated every sentence after S3. The student who was leading the oath had trouble in memorising some words. Her peers helped her. The previous male teacher said to S3, ‘Be loud while leading oath. Next time I want your voice louder’.

The leading team sang the anthem. So did some other students from the crowd. Fifteen minutes passed. The students left the yard and headed towards the classrooms.

As another example, two assembly sessions were observed in Case B where a format and sequence of the steps involved, similar to that described above, was followed on both days. A group of four or five students as well as the teachers were standing on the veranda. A total of about 350 students from all grades were ordered in eight rows. At first, the male teachers insisted that all the lines became perfectly straight. They were using canes to discipline the students. The steps in the assembly included a recitation from the Quran, showing respect to the national flag by salutation, making the national oath, singing the national anthem and at the end performing a couple of physical drills. It seemed to the researcher that although these were mandated by the higher authority the daily assemblies were not conducted regularly in this school. Such speculation was based on the observation that the students and teachers became a little confused and at times could not decide the format and order of the steps involved. This did not appear usual for a school activity that was supposed to take place every day.

The researcher was told that, during the assembly, the teachers sometimes ‘stress maintaining cleanliness and hygiene regularly as well as make other special announcements, if any’86. It occasionally happened that, after conducting the regular steps in the assembly, the head teacher or the cub teacher in the school made a brief speech to the pupils reminding them of the necessity of adhering to certain school rules, such as attending school and wearing the school uniform regularly, and maintaining general hygiene and cleanliness. On the eve of the special national days, the pupils are usually briefed about the significance of those days and are

86INTSBT1
encouraged to observe the days in a due manner. It was observed one day that, during the assembly, the Case B head teacher made an announcement regarding the national children’s cultural competition and encouraged the students to take part in the competition.

It was seen in Case C that one student, along with one male teacher, was giving commands through a microphone. The student first recited from the Qur’an and the teacher translated the verses into Bengali. All the steps following this were guided by the teacher and, from then on, he was in control of the microphone to lead the oath, the anthem and salutation of the national flag. Moreover, the assembly did not include physical drills.

At the end of one of the two assembly sessions observed in Case D, the head teacher delivered a speech dispensing general advice on practising truthfulness, caring for elders, being attentive to study, etc. He did not seem to have any specific agenda for the talk. On the second day, the head teacher enquired of some students why they did not wear the school uniform. He, as well as other teachers, instructed the students to ‘stand still during the anthem’. The head teacher also gave advice to students, likewise the previous day, on the significance of truthfulness, performing good deeds in their personal and social life, and applying academic diligence. The next day was the birth anniversary of the ‘father of the nation’, Sheikh Mujibur Rahman. The head teacher asked the children if they knew anything about that day, but no responses were generated by the students. The head teacher then asked them to ‘come to school tomorrow at 9.30 am sharp’. He also gave an indication of what the program arranged for the next day would include: “You will present whatever you know about him. You will also come to learn a number of things about Sheikh Mujib.”

In general, the students did not seem to be engaged in what they were doing during the assembly—a common experience gained in most of the schools. For example, very few students took part in singing the national anthem. Moreover, rather than ensuring that the activity provided joy and a fun experience for the children, the teachers were more concerned as to whether the order and discipline and the physical and vocal gestures were accurately maintained throughout the assembly. For example, the teachers across the schools attached special importance to ‘making the right gesture with a respectful attitude’ when singing the national anthem.

In contrast to the other schools, Case E was an exception with evidence of true student leadership, engagement and enjoyment. First, student participation in the assembly and student engagement in conducting the various steps was comparatively higher and more spontaneous. The students were observed operating the sound system, playing drums etc. Unlike the students at the other schools, they seemed to be engaged in and enjoying what they were doing. There
was also a harmonium (a local musical instrument) in this school that the music teacher was playing. This made the singing of the national anthem rhythmic and attractive. Moreover, there were recitations from the Holy Books of Hinduism and Buddhism, in addition to those of Islam. This might have been a practice in this school because of the greater number of students adhering to religions other than Islam, but such diversity and inclusiveness was not observed in the other assemblies. Finally, the head teacher shared his philosophy regarding the responsibility of the students: “I articulate that this school is yours [the students’]. The increase in the reputation of this school will in turn increase the reputation of you and your community.”

6.2.2 Behaviour Management Approaches

The teachers were asked how, through the daily interactions with their students and within or beyond classroom lessons, they impart values. The particular focus of this enquiry was to understand the types and the extent of the behavioural or disciplinary problems experienced within the school as well as the way the teachers intervened to resolve such problems. The purpose was also to understand the extent to which the behaviour and discipline management approaches included explicit references to values. The teachers shared several examples of the behaviour and discipline management approaches that they prefer to apply. Apart from these examples, they also expressed their views regarding the significance of the friendly attitude and behaviour of the adults—both the teachers and the guardians—in rectifying the students’ behavioural problems.

According to the Case B head teacher, the children were expected to follow certain classroom and school rules, such as seeking permission before going to the toilet, since more than one student is not allowed to leave for the toilet at a time during a lesson. The teachers also took care that no student wandered in the school field during class time and that all students adhered to the lesson time, practices which the head teacher thought make ‘the children learn the importance of being punctual and following discipline’.

It was elicited from the Case A teacher responses that the teachers preferred to represent a model of how the children should behave in their personal and social lives, which is achieved mainly by providing guidance, orders and instructions, and by drawing examples from the lives of great persons who have contributed to human societies. The Case D teachers attempted to make the students acknowledge who had behaved inappropriately and engaged the students in identifying how conflicts could be resolved utilising positive values, such as tolerance and forgiveness. The Case D teachers sometimes employed the teachings of Qur’an and Hadith and the real life stories of great personalities to address student conflict or misbehaviour.
The common behavioural issues encountered in the schools included the use of inappropriate language to the teachers and peers, quarrels or fights between pairs of students, and stealing belongings from classmates. The latter was the most persistent behavioural problem that became evident from the stories shared by the teachers—a habit that the teachers thought is created mainly because of the poverty and needs prevailing in many of the families. Some of the teachers, however, emphasised that the former problem is not so severe and is very natural for primary-aged school children. The Case E teachers shared that when they recognised a student’s habit of stealing, they tried to explain to that child that stealing is an anti-social behaviour. Moreover, one of these teachers suggested that when the habit of lying is recognised in any child, the teachers need to apply ‘affection and good behaviour to make that child understand that it is not acceptable to lie’ and pass the message that ‘if you try to be truthful, you will be loved by all’. This teacher added, “We can transmit religious teachings regarding the demerits of lying”. The teachers shared the expectation that upon receiving advice from the teachers, the behaviour of that child would change positively.

In the case of such behavioural problems caused by the students, the teachers intervened by explaining how the unacceptable conduct may affect the person at the receiving end of such behaviours. As an example, the teachers in Case A believed that dealing with the issues in this way makes the students with problematic attitudes and/or behaviour realise what they should and should not do, and this makes the students cautious about showing similar attitudes or behaviour at a later time. Similarly, the Case D teachers ‘explain to the students that they should not treat their peers badly, and should behave well and be in cooperation with all’. The strategy the head teacher personally preferred in dealing with the ‘less obedient’ students was to ‘provide more affection’, to ‘take extra care in classroom’ and to ‘interact more with them compared to the others’. Affection and a caring attitude shown by a teacher, in his opinion, became more effective than any other measures in mitigating the students’ behavioural problems. One of the teachers in Case E shared her views regarding the behaviour management practices the teachers should adopt:

Children coming from troubled families sometimes quarrel, lie or use abusive language. Although these students learn good conduct and manners in school, they do no longer experience these when they return home. … They [these children] feel really delighted when the teachers show pleasant behaviour to them. I try to treat my students in exactly the same manner.⁸⁷

Another remark made by a Case E teacher regarding the attitude and behaviour of herself and her colleagues to the students was:

⁸⁷FGSET5
I tell my students that ‘you are like my own children’. This influences them the most. We can sense a feeling of profound joy in them. Even the youngest teacher in our school calls the students ‘kid’ from the outset of her working here. Students like this very much. She [that teacher] created a place in their [students’] heart. Often we hear, these are the children of poor people. Why to show so much affection to them? I strongly object this attitude. All are equal, either poor or rich. We have to draw our students closer.

Similarly, the Case F head teacher expressed her view that the best approach to dealing with such disciplinary problems is to build a friendly rapport with students and to create an environment scaffolded with mutual respect and trust. The teachers should clearly explain the consequences of students’ problematic actions, and at the same time, build a safe environment for students so they can express their thoughts and feelings without any fear or hesitation. The head teacher made the point that the teachers in her school approached the student causing a problem, as well as the problem itself, with a positive mindset and articulated the institutional and social expectations of the school.

According to the Case D head teacher, the disciplinary problems that some students caused during lessons could be minimised if the teacher moved around the classroom while teaching. In this way, he thought, the ‘trouble-maker’ students would not interrupt the classroom discipline mainly ‘due to the fear or respect to the teacher’. He also reported that teacher interventions are sometimes required during the assembly to ‘make the lines straight’. Moreover, when the teachers are informed about any incidents of smoking by a student outside the school campus (something ‘the students never do inside the school’), that student is ‘warned’ by the teachers and ‘provided information on the negative effects of smoking’.

The teachers cited several examples of how they attempted to explicitly refer to the undesirable attitudes shown by their students. One Case A teacher, for instance, shared a story of a student with physical disabilities who used to be mocked by her classmates. After noticing this, the teacher instructed the class not to laugh at the student and accept her disabilities with an open mind. The teacher also instructed the students to leave a convenient seat for that particular child so that she could easily enter and exit from her seating place. Another teacher stated in this regard that after a teacher with a physical disability joined the school, the teachers strictly instructed the students to not show any sign of disrespect to that new teacher. It had then been observed that “the pupils could feel themselves what we said and accepted her [the new teacher] very cordially.”

88FGSET2
89FGSAT2
The teachers in some of the schools reported that they sometimes sought assistance from their students to resolve conflicts. For example, when any complaint about missing personal belongings was reported to the teachers, they questioned the students of that class about the incident and asked one student to search the bags of all the other students. When the teacher in charge was able to identify which of the students had committed the wrongdoing, the teacher dealt with the situation with great cautiousness. As evident from the teacher responses, they did not accuse the student in front of others or administer verbal insults or corporal punishment. Rather, they explained why the deed was unacceptable. In other cases, too, the teachers reported that they encouraged the students to resolve disputes by negotiation. In some cases, however, the parents’ involvement became necessary, especially when anyone from outside the school complained about any student’s improper behaviour or the violation of socially agreed rules. The teachers then invited the parents to the school and discussed the remedial actions that needed to be taken.

**Family Involvement.** The Case C head teacher shared the view that as the children attending their school significantly varied in respect of the quality of family education, the teachers need to carefully apply various approaches in dealing with the problematic behaviours of children. She cited several examples when some well-off parents lodged complaints about their children having been mistreated by their peers. The parents from the upper-class of the society held the belief that the underprivileged children had behaved improperly to their child. The teachers then proved the parents' judgement wrong by technically collecting information from the classroom that helped them reveal the truth of the incident. The head teacher commented, “Children compromise easily but parents take everything seriously”. The head teacher also reported that the practice of using canes was not prevalent among the teachers in this school.

Drawing from his professional experiences, the Case E head teacher commented that the unjustified and inconsiderate ruling of parents is one of the principal factors causing the students’ behavioural problems. In his view, most of the parents of Bangladeshi primary students are unable to manage the problematic attitudes and behaviours of their children, as a result of which, eventually the behaviour of those children becomes chaotic. In his belief, physical punishment is not a solution for rectifying problematic behaviours and it exerts a negative influence on the mindset of the children. However, he believed that the parents did not share this view. The teachers, therefore, attempt to counsel the parents and guardians so that instead of providing corporal punishment, the parents are advised to discuss conflict issues with their child and help them realise the consequences of their problematic behaviour.
6.2.3 Co- and Extra-curricular Activities

The teachers outlined the co- and extra-curricular provisions available to the students through which “aesthetic qualities and some values grow in them”90. Informal talks with the head teacher and the observations made by the researcher in the schools provided some additional information that depicted the actual scenario in terms of implementing these provisions. The activities reported by the teachers included co-curricular subjects and lessons, ‘Cub Team’, annual sports and prize giving ceremony, observation of special days, classroom management, and other school-wide activities. These activities and relevant observations are described below.

**Co-curricular subjects and lessons.** In every school’s weekly routine, one 30 minute class period was scheduled for co-curricular activities during which the students sang, recited, acted or performed anything they liked. Moreover, the lessons for Music, Physical Education, and Art and Crafts were also mandated lesson periods and these were included in the written daily routines of the schools. However, the Case A teachers were rarely seen conducting these lessons. The teachers in this school admitted that these lessons were usually skipped. Similarly, no such lessons were seen being conducted in the Case B school during the field visit. The head teacher in this school admitted that lessons for art and craft as well as music were not conducted on a regular basis and that “art competitions are arranged during the national days”. In most schools the students usually only submitted some crafts before the year-end exam.

The teacher-in-charge of the subject, ‘Art and Craft’ in case F argued that this subject was not taught sufficiently well in her school for a number of reasons. These included the absence of any teacher training provisions for this subject, the inability of the school to supply the materials needed for Art and Crafts and, most importantly, the lack of suitably qualified teachers. This teacher reported that she visited the classrooms of all five grades during the one period allocated for this subject—a situation which, in her view, seriously limited the prospect of teaching this subject effectively. Some of the schools arranged annual in-school competitions for the events of art, music, costume show, handwriting etc.

A total of three co-curricular activities and music lessons were observed in Case A and E. When invited by the teacher, the students performed songs and recitations individually or in groups. The students seemed to be very spontaneous in doing this and they expressed their interest to perform with great zeal. The researcher was particularly amazed at the high quality of a singing performance by a group of four girl students in Case E. The teachers reported that these girls represented their school in the cultural programs held externally. The teacher also reported that the girls learned the songs merely by listening to CDs kept in the school. The head

---

90INTSBT1
teacher sighed when he said, “Such talents go unattended! Had we taken care of them, these children could have earned fame nationally. They, however, receive no care and attention after they graduate [from the primary school].”

‘Cub Team’. Officially, every primary school is required to form a ‘Cub Team’, the motto and activities of which resemble those of the ‘scout’ movement, with one teacher specially trained to conduct the activities of this team. In this study, only four of the six schools had established a cub team, with Cases D and F being the exceptions. The teachers in the four schools reported that by participating in the ‘cub team’, the students learned the mottos and the rules of ‘cubbing’, gained knowledge about their health and hygiene, and took part in the performance of songs, and sports. The cub members were required to follow some ‘rules and responsibilities that will be helpful in their personal and social lives’91. The camp for the cub teams is held nationally for three or four days, during which, the teachers asserted, the cub members learned practical lessons on self-management, discipline, time-management, team work and self-responsibility.

Discussion with the head teacher of Case A revealed that the ‘cub’ team in this school included students only from grade three, and there were only twenty-four places in this team. Considering that the student population in this school was 701, this activity seemed to cater for only a very small proportion of students. Similarly, in Case F, the cub team was comprised of several students from grade five only. In the Case E school, the team comprised twelve girls and twelve boys. The head teacher, however, frankly admitted that the school had not yet implemented the ‘cub’ program in its full form, but the teachers were working hard towards achieving that goal.

The Case F teachers acknowledged that the ‘cub team’ in their school existed only on paper and it had been a long time since any activities had been conducted. The teachers identified some factors that contributed to this inactive state of the team. In their view, the students were not attracted to joining the team because it incurred a weekly fee. In addition, the members of the club were required to know the cub rules, the organisational details and other things that the students found as an extra pressure. The ‘cub teacher’ commented in this regard: “The members do not join the activities regularly… They quit when we ask them to study as we do in the regular lessons. Actually they want to have some fun by joining the team.”92 Moreover, the head teacher reported that the teachers were generally not interested in taking the ‘burden of this added responsibility’ since a ‘cub teacher’ does not receive any extra incentives from the government for performing this role.

91FGSAT5
92INTSFT3
Annual sports and prize giving ceremony. Each year the schools organised a sports and prize giving ceremony. Some of the schools also participated in the victory day parade held in the local stadium. The Case F head teacher believed that these activities were crucial in bolstering the students’ self-confidence, diligence, and the desire to strive. The annual prize giving ceremony, in her view, was a means for acknowledging students’ ‘regular school attendance’ or ‘adherence to the school rules’ in addition to their achievements in study and sports. As well as these two ceremonies, every school competes in the annual football tournament for primary schools, held nationally, which was introduced in 2010 as an obligatory event for all primary schools.

The Case A head teacher, however, admitted that since there was no space in this school to conduct outdoor sports, it was not possible for them to ‘organise sports events’. The students, instead, took part in inter-school sports competitions when these were organised by other schools. She also added that the higher officials had instructed them a number of times to organise the competition by any means in this given year. Due to such pressure, the teachers decided to conduct some indoor sports. However, the researcher later discovered that the ‘indoor games and activities’ the head teacher referred to were limited to drawing and essay writing competitions, and a ‘pillow-passing’ game arranged for the girl students. Moreover, the students in Case A were not allowed to play in the school yard during the school day, as they might possibly ‘break the window glasses by throwing balls.’

The head teacher in Case A described an incident illustrating how the football tournament provided an opportunity for the student participants to come closer to the head teacher and what impact this closeness exerted on the students. In her words:

When I took the students to the final match (2010), I developed a true sense of sympathy to our team members. I came to feel them [the students]. They also approached me very closely. In schools they are scared of us, but in the field they approached me without any hesitation and fear, and behaved like a friend of mine. The students expressed themselves to me without any hesitation. I understand that this form of [unusual] relationship grew because of my involvement in taking them to the venue and providing an opportunity for them to play. Interestingly, following the tournament the seventeen members of the football team have been attentive to their study. I find them more engaged in study than before. I think this is the contribution of their participation in the sports.93

It was found in the Case C and Case E schools that there was no space in the school where the students could play. Also, the school routine in Case C did not include any recess

93INTSAT1
period in either of the shifts. The students in these schools were seen playing in corridors or in classrooms in between the lessons.

**Observation of special days.** In the recent past, the government placed an order for all schools to arrange extra-curricular activities on some special national days, such as Independence Day, Martyr Day, Victory Day, so that through observing these days the children become aware of the heritage and history of the nation. The teachers expressed the view that the children come to know the patriotism and contributions of the national martyrs and develop the disposition of standing beside the nation if any need arises.

The teachers were requested to provide more information on how these days are usually observed and what activities the children are involved in. One teacher from Case F shared an example of the celebration of the Martyr Day, which is the International Mother Language Day, when she arranged a class-based activity of developing a chart of the Bengali alphabet and the relevant pictures. This activity, according to the teacher, helped students ‘learn about that national day’\(^{94}\). A description of the observation of a national day in School D is included in Appendix 5.3.

The Case C head teacher reported that the school arranged an annual sports and prize distribution ceremony and the national children’s day a few days before the field visit commenced. The researcher was interested to observe the events arranged on the national Independence Day. This day, however, was not observed in this school although there was a government order to arrange special events on such national days. The reason for not doing so, as informed by the head teacher, was that the school was unable to advise the students to attend school before the event. Assuming that the usual school operations would be cancelled on that day, as on other holidays, the majority of the students were absent. The researcher was discouraged from conducting a field visit on that day. The head teacher, however, informed later that the teachers remained in school until the end of the school day and waited for the student participation to increase. It was not clear what sort of activities or events they would have conducted if the students had attended as expected.

Other than the national days, the annual ‘Milad Mahfil’ (an Islamic event) is organised in the schools as a joint-venture with the community during which the students perform the responsibilities of maintaining school discipline; making seating arrangements for students, teachers, and guests; attending to the guests etc. They also take part in an Islamic religious song competition held as part of this event.

\(^{94}\)INTSFT3
Classroom management. A class captain is elected by the students in each class. The principal responsibilities of the captain include ensuring classroom discipline and assisting the teachers in the collection and return of the students’ notebooks. One teacher informed that the students of the upper grades are sometimes sent to the classrooms of lower grades when there are not enough teachers present on a given school day. The senior students then help maintain the classroom order and discipline, and assist the pupils in that class in completing the tasks given by the teachers. The class leaders also take note of student attendance in respective classes and thus assist the teachers in identifying students who are absent from school.

The teachers reported that the students greatly enjoy the act of mentoring in lower grades. In their view, the responsibilities assigned to a class captain or a mentor not only promoted in them leadership and democratic skills, but the students at the receiving end of the service also had opportunities to freely share their learning difficulties. One teacher stated that “the students seem to be more comfortable to discuss their problems with other students than with the teachers. They enjoy the lesson and stay quieter in those lessons which are taken by the senior students”95. Another teacher shared a story of a Grade four girl who used to explain mathematical problems to the whole class after she learnt it from the teacher. It was observed by the teachers that the students of that class could then approach the problems in a better way. This teacher added that “out of fear or hesitation children do not want to ask questions to their teachers. But, they tend to share these questions with their classmates and like to learn from them.”96

It was observed one day in School E that two girl students of Grade five were conducting some activities with the children in the ‘Baby’ class. Both the mentoring and the mentored students seemed to be enjoying the class.

School-wide activities. A group of children from each class were typically selected for cleaning their classrooms. Besides this, student teams were formed to share the responsibility of school cleaning and watering the plants inside the school campus. Cleaning and gardening tasks were performed solely by the students. The teachers expressed the view that the students show great enthusiasm to be a part of the school gardening endeavour and looked after the plants regularly. All the teachers stressed that these activities provide an excellent opportunity of exercising cooperation, sympathy and team spirit, and also of building a strong work ethic and leadership qualities.

In the Case B school the students swept the school field and corridors and cleaned the toilets. The subject teacher of Social Studies in this school articulated that these activities
provided students with opportunities to see the reflection of the textbook content of Social Studies through their practical experiences. The Case F teachers, however, depicted the real scenario of the urban schools where the guardians complained about their children being involved in cleaning tasks. One teacher, for example, said, “We need to take extra caution before involving students in cleaning and related tasks ... We carefully choose the right time [the time when regular classes do not run] for having the children do something for school”\(^97\).

The Case E head teacher described two examples of how the students in this school managed the responsibility of school discipline. Student teams were formed to maintain discipline on the occasion of school-wide events such as the cultural programs. In addition, the students had been engaged to combat the problem of low student attendance after the lunch break, which occurs because many children leave school during the lunch break, but they do not return afterwards. The school, therefore, enacted a rule that the students would not, in the first place, go outside the school boundary during lunch, but if they have to, they will leave their bags in the classroom. The students in the disciplinary team watch over those students attempting to leave school in the middle of the day, and try to keep them from doing so. The head teacher reported an increasing success in this endeavour.

It was observed that in some schools a group of students was responsible for ringing the school bell after each lesson period, opening the classroom locks at the beginning and end of the school day, carrying attendance registrars to the classrooms, assisting the teachers in carrying student work or exam papers to the teachers’ common room etc.

**Other activities.** The Case B head teacher cited an example of involving the students in small-scale repairing tasks to the entrance road to the school, such as putting a layer of bricks or sand on the surface. The students in this school also volunteered in the national vaccination day initiative which takes place inside the school. In addition, the Case E school involved the students in assisting the teachers in collecting survey data from the locality. The teachers mentioned several times that without the help of the students it could not have been possible for them to administer the survey, which is a very labour-intensive and time-consuming task. The teachers also reported that they take help from their students when they need to collect information about students who have been absent from school. The extent of participation and assistance offered by the students in these cases was very highly praised by the teachers.

The teachers also provided some additional information in relation to the student interests and participation in the co- and extra-curricular activities, as well as, the challenges faced by the schools in arranging such activities.
Students' interest and participation. All of the teachers concurred in their views about the degree of the students’ interest and participation in the co-curricular and extra-curricular activities in school. According to the teachers, the students show extraordinary enthusiasm in playing games, singing, and recitation and observing the national days in school. Student participation on these days seems to be higher than on the usual school days. As one teacher commented, “The students do not find interest in monotonous, traditional academic learning. Instead, they show notable attraction to and interest in activities other than the study and voluntarily express interest to participate in such activities.”

One example of a girl student possessing marvellous singing skills was cited by the Case C head teacher. The official guests who attended the national children’s day event were so moved by the performance of this girl that they requested the teachers to nurture the talent in this student. One of the teachers then contacted a local music school and requested them to enrol that student for free. The teachers, however, revealed a very uncomfortable truth about the family of the girl when they went to seek permission from the parents. The girl came from an extremely impoverished family and the parents did not agree to send their daughter to that music school as this would cost them extra expense for transportation cost. The teachers then decided to arrange enrolment for that student in another school where no added expense was needed. The head teacher cited this example to state that due to the lack of nurturing and patronizing, numerous talents—like this girl—in primary schools go undiscovered and squandered. Another teacher during the focus group discussion in this school overwhelmingly admired the natural skills of drawing and singing among students who, without any training, had mastered these skills themselves. This teacher also reported that once a month the school conducts ‘story telling’ classes wherein the students’ skill of storytelling gets expressed, and where the students who are selected as ‘class captains’ learn to be responsible by helping their teachers manage the classroom discipline.

Similarly, the Case F head teacher highly praised the singing ability of some students who, without any opportunity to learn music at either school or home, performed so well that it seemed ‘unbelievable’ to her. It was identified by this teacher that although it is a government order to observe the national days, so that the children become able to learn about their nation and also engage in co-curricular activities, the necessary support that a school should have to conduct such activities is not currently available in her school. For example, the school did not have any audio-visual materials such as a CD player or a DVD player, which could have provided opportunities for promising students to listen to music. The teachers also argued that
since they do not get paid for these days, they feel little interest in observing these special days as a school event.

The Case B head teacher pointed to some issues that the local community creates in arranging programs. The community members were mostly ‘conservative’ in nature and they usually complained about students’ performance of music or drama at school. As an example, two years ago the local community had not given permission for staging an educational drama at the school, even though the higher educational authority had interfered in resolving the conflict. However, the adjacent madrasa, arranged a religious event in the field in front of the school two days before the field visit started. An amplifier was set in a tree inside the school. Because of the high noise, the teachers were bound to set school free about one hour ahead of the usual time. It was, however, added by the head teacher that the community is turning more tolerant day by day, which may be caused by the fact that the school makes continuous efforts to transmit the departmental expectations in relation to arranging such programs to the community.

The teachers in Cases D and F admitted that although the students showed great interest and enthusiasm about these programs, the schools cannot arrange such programs or sports due to the lack of school funds. One teacher expressed his concern by saying that, “students of our school get very limited opportunity for sports or other forms of recreation.” The teachers in this school charged some fee from each student in order to create the fund for the sports festival. But, the teachers reported that due to the low income of the guardians, “almost half of the children started to absent from the school since the day the fee was announced”. The teachers finally had no alternative to waiving the fee for those students who could not afford it, and then the student attendance started to increase.

One Case D teacher argued that it was necessary to extend the recess period in this school—which now is only thirty minutes including the lunch time—by reducing the time for class lessons, so that the children can have more time to play and relax.

As endorsed by the government, every school is entitled to buy sports and recreational equipment with the School Level Improvement Plan (SLIP) allotment. The Case B head teacher, for example, reported that the teachers ‘prepared some materials such as word and letter cards, pictures’ and bought a swing with this fund. Likewise, the Case D school bought ‘a swing, a hand mike and drums’. It was noted by the teachers in the schools where a swing or slide was bought that it was not possible to place those swings or slides on the field out of the fear that these might be stolen. Moreover, the government-supplied supplementary reading materials were kept in a book case in the teachers’ common room in almost all the schools. It was not at
all experienced by this researcher during the field visit to the schools that any book was issued to the children or taken by the teachers to be used in lessons. The head teacher in Case B commented that “the children either destroy the books or do not return them; many books therefore went missing”. The remark of the Case F head teacher summarised the situation in the schools: “There is very little opportunity for the children to have fun in school.”

In summary, although there were a number of mandated provisions for co- and extra-curricular activities in which the students showed great interest and performance, the teachers admitted that there is in reality a very limited application of these initiatives. The reasons behind this mainly included the limited school funds and necessary materials and the lack of teachers, especially for the co-curricular lessons. In most of the schools there were no playfields or ‘cub’ teams.

### 6.2.4 Summary

This section described the explicit and implicit provisions available for the children in the school to learn about and enact the socially accepted personal and social values. The provisions described in this section included the daily assembly, behaviour management techniques, and co- and extra-curricular activities. From the teacher interviews and focus groups it can be deduced that the teachers were aware of the potential of the daily school assembly and other activities in developing the necessary values, attitudes and skills among the children. However, the findings from the observations suggest that the schools were not able to fully utilise the explicit and implicit provisions to teach necessary values and skills. The assembly sessions seemed to have been conducted rather as ‘chores’. There were almost no explicit values connections made by the teachers during these sessions that could help the students make meaning of the steps involved, for example, making the oath or showing respect to the national flag. There were also very limited or no opportunities for the students to plan and guide the assembly sessions.

Moreover, the philosophies and practices of the teachers for student behaviour management were elicited from the focus group discussions and teacher interviews. The teachers seemed committed to the government’s emphasis on abolishing all kinds of punishment to children and creating a safe learning environment. According to the teachers, they taught the students about any unacceptable forms of behaviour mainly by explaining the negative effects of such behaviours on the other students. The teachers also reported that they did not take any disciplinary measures that would potentially insult or hurt the student accused. It should, however, be noted that the researcher mainly stayed in the head teacher’s room when not
involved in the classroom observations. During the field-study, there was almost no opportunity to observe the teachers’ practices with regard to managing student behaviour.

Furthermore, although the students were highly interested in sports and other co-curricular activities, there were limited opportunities for them to participate in these activities. Not only was the limited school fund a reason behind this, the teachers also seemed to feel less motivated or interested to regularly arrange co-curricular activities. Since they did not receive any incentives or recognition from the authority for conducting the co- and extra-curricular activities, the teachers appeared to consider these activities an ‘add-on’ to their day-to-day responsibilities of classroom teaching.

The next section describes the findings from the classroom observations of Social Studies, Religious Studies and co-curricular lessons.

6.3 Findings from School Visits and Classroom Observations

6.3.1 Introduction

The conceptual and analytical frameworks for the classroom observations were built upon the review of four categories of sources: a) the body of literature on values-focused pedagogies and quality teaching (Chapter 3); b) the teacher training resources at the primary level in Bangladesh (Chapter 4); c) the NSW Quality Teaching Model (New South Wales Department of Education & Training, 2003a, 2003b, 2003c, 2003d, 2003e); and d) the COS-3 Global Qualitative Ratings for the classrooms (NICHD, 2005). The findings derived from the review suggested that moral and values development as well as the holistic upbringing is best supported through curricular provisions when the teachers make deliberate efforts to make the environment participatory, fun-filled and engaging for the children. Values development is promoted when teachers implement child-centred, meaningful and cooperative teaching-learning strategies, such as discussion, problem solving, critical reflection, philosophical enquiry, group or project work etc. The analysis of the classroom observations was guided by these concepts related to ‘value-focussed pedagogy’ and ‘quality learning environment’.

The classroom observations were analysed with a view to addressing the following key objectives:
Instructional practices: Type, frequency and structure of activities; sequence of the activities in lessons;
- The way values are defined, explored and explained;
- The extent to which classroom activities include thinking tasks, practical work, problem solving and decision making tasks;
- The extent to which higher expectations are set by the teacher, and the tasks assigned are challenging and individualised;
- The degree and nature of interpersonal interactions taking place; and,
- The degree of student agency, participation and engagement in learning activities.

6.3.2 Samples

A total of forty-six classrooms were observed across the six case study schools. The samples were mainly of the subjects, Social Studies and Islamic Studies. However, lessons of some other subjects that are mandated in the primary curriculum were also observed. Among the sample lessons, only one lesson was for the ‘Baby Class’ (pre-primary). According to the available data\(^99\), the average student attendance in the observed samples was 41.91 (n=32, SD=13.86), where the attendance ranged from sixteen to seventy-nine.

The frequencies of observed lessons (N=45\(^100\)) for various subjects in the six different case schools are shown in Table 6.1.

Table 6.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>School</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindu Religious Studies</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Studies</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Math</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-curricular</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^99\) The number of students present could not be recorded for all samples.

\(^100\) ‘Baby’ lesson is excluded as the conduct of these lessons includes content from all key learning areas.
The three lessons of Maths and English were excluded from the following reporting of the analysis findings.

6.3.3 Qualitative Rating of the Classrooms

The observed lessons were assigned a rating for each of the eight **Classroom Observation System for Third Grade** (COS-3) codes (see Appendix 3.20). The descriptive statistics for these codes are shown in Table 6.2 followed by a discussion of the observed measures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Richness of Instructional Strategies</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaos</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Detachment</td>
<td>5.57</td>
<td>6.00</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over Control</td>
<td>6.49</td>
<td>7.00</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Climate</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative Climate</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productive Use of Time</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Sensitivity</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 6.2**

*Descriptive Statistics for the COS-3 Rating of the Lesson Samples (n=43)*

a. **Richness of Instructional Methods**: As judged against the criteria described in Table A3.20.1, this code received a low rating of 1.67. The lessons were characterised by the ‘teachers presenting the subject in a very basic format’ and ‘the methods used may employ only paper and pencil type of worksheets requiring a short correct answer with no problem solving, following along in the textbook or a pure lecture type of presentation.’ The low rating was also attributed to the observation of a number of defining properties:

- There is no expansion of the topic through the use of experimentation, analysis, or synthesis.
  - *The subject matter is presented in a scripted, very basic, fact only approach.*
There is no true discourse or instructional conversation between student and teacher. The teacher seems to want only a brief correct response. An activity requiring memory and recall of basic information or the repetition of previously learned material does not involve the use of higher level thinking strategies.

The observed lessons mostly involved ‘teacher talk’ and the teacher’s reading of the textbook. Classroom activities that challenged the students or showed a higher expectation of the teacher about the ability of the students were rarely seen, especially in the rural and urban schools.

b. **Over-Control**: This code was assigned a high rating (6.49) as the classroom properties matched almost all the descriptors of a highly controlled classroom. The students remained seated for the entire time in almost all the lessons. During a lesson, all of the students were involved in the same activities. They were also required to remain quiet. Not only were all the teaching-learning activities solely determined and directed by the teachers, there seemed to be almost no planning for ‘interesting activities, either indoors or outdoors’. Overall, the children were given almost no opportunity to exercise autonomy and responsibility with the students treated mainly as ‘passive recipients’.

c. **Chaos**: The classrooms observed received a very low mean score (1.28) on this code. While ‘Chaos’ refers to ‘the extent to which the children in the class are ineffectively controlled or chaotic’, the classrooms in Bangladeshi schools generally do not show the indicators of a ‘chaotic’ classroom because of the highly disciplined, self-controlled and quiet children. From a cultural perspective, teachers are highly respected by the students in Bangladesh, at least in terms of behavioural demonstrations of ‘respect’. Students in the observed lessons followed the instructions of the teacher in relation to maintaining classroom discipline and order as well as conducting classroom activities. The students usually did not make any noise or leave their seats during the class time, nor did they demonstrate any problematic behaviour that required teacher intervention.

d. **Teacher Detachment**: Overall, the teachers seemed to be detached (mean score of 5.57) from the students showing ‘a lack of emotional involvement and a lack of awareness of the children’s needs for appropriate interactions with activities, materials, or peers’. There were many cases observed when a child demanded emotional or instructional support from
the teacher, but the teacher either failed to comprehend or ignored the demands of that child. The detachment was very high in almost all rural and urban schools.

e. **Positive Classroom Climate**: This code refers to ‘the overall emotional and social tone of the classroom’. The mean score of 2.53 resulted from the overall ‘neutral or flat’ nature of the classrooms with ‘the absence of markers of positive climate’. Whereas in metropolitan schools the teachers were observed using positive verbal and physical clues following student performances, the students in urban and rural schools seemed to be feeling less safe and comfortable and more ‘withdrawn and fearful’ with occasional putdowns and sarcasm made by the teacher. Teachers in Cases A and B were seen using canes to discipline students or punishing them when the response to a question did not meet the teacher’s expectations. Moreover, the signs of a positive classroom climate such as ‘posted rules of behaviour’ or ‘enforcement of respect for others’ uniqueness and ideas’ were rarely seen in the classrooms.

f. **Negative Climate**: Negative classroom climate is characterised by a ‘hostile, angry, punitive, and controlling’ nature of the classroom wherein the teacher’s and students’ behaviour show signs including ‘negative regard’, ‘disapproval’, ‘body tension’, ‘negative voices’, ‘harshness’, ‘sarcasm’, ‘threatening behaviour’, ‘harsh punishment’ and ‘roughness’. The observed classrooms received a moderate mean score (3.70) because there were some evidence of these indicators. However, the score was not low because most of the classrooms were characterised by a lack of emotion, rather than an overt display of negative attitudes or behaviours by the teacher.

g. **Productive Use of Instructional Time**: According to the definition, this code refers to the extent to which ‘the classroom manages time and activities to insure productivity, engagement and efficient use of instructional time’. A low mean score (2.12) for this code articulates the lack of teacher planning in relation to utilising the learning time for each student effectively during classroom activities. The classroom consistently lacked ‘a teacher’s giving directions for the immediate task and telling the children what to do if they finish earlier than classmates’. As stipulated by the indicators of this code, ‘much instructional time may be lost’ in a classroom where the teachers ‘do not plan for different performance levels’. In the observed lessons, the loss of instructional time, if construed on an individual student’s level, was most observed when writing tasks were implemented. Not only a large, continuous portion of class time was used in these activities, the students
who completed their tasks earlier had to pass unproductive time as the teacher did not move to the next activity until a significant proportion of the remaining students completed the writing task.

h. **Teacher Sensitivity**: This code presents the extent to which the teacher demonstrates ‘child-centred behaviour’. A *sensitive teacher* attends to the children’s interests, abilities and degree of their attention and engagement while planning for and conducting classroom activities, as well as promotes, recognises and responds to the children’s affection and affective behaviours. The observed classrooms received a low score (1.77) on this code because the classroom activities and interactions did not seem to have acknowledged the developmental needs of the children with most classrooms being characterised by ‘long-winded speeches and lectures’.

### 6.3.4 Instructional Practices

**6.3.4.1 Instructional Resources and Materials used.** The textbook was used as the only instructional tool in the lessons observed. The teachers designed their lesson delivery and student activities based on the content of the relevant textbook chapter. Materials other than the textbook were used in only three lessons, which included two picture charts for animals, a model flower pot, and a box of matchsticks and a mosquito-repeller essence. The teacher in the latter case lit the essence to show an example of how chemicals, smoke and gases cause the air to pollute. The over-reliance on the textbook has been presented with some examples in Appendix 6.1.

**6.3.4.2 Type and Frequency of Activities.** In a study on classroom observation (Sidhu, Fook, & Kaur, 2010), the authors recorded for each observed lesson the percentage of time spent on three instructional practices. The practices they identified in the lessons were

i) **Whole class**: addressing the whole class through reading aloud from the textbooks, by either the students or the teacher, and through question-answering (Q/A);

ii) **Seatwork**: The notion used for ‘seatwork’ in this study refers to any tasks that the students were required to do individually without leaving their seat; and

iii) **Pair or group work**.

The observed classroom activities in this study are also described under the three types.
Whole class activities. The whole class activity comprised a significant proportion (69.69%) of the total class time across all of the 43 lessons. It was found from the observation transcripts that a common practice for the teachers was to spend a significant proportion of lesson time talking to the whole class, either reading from the textbook or performing the following tasks:

- revising the content of the previous lesson;
- articulating their own ideas on the themes that either directly, or indirectly linked to the topic of the lesson; and
- dispensing general advice and instructions.

Teachers talking to the whole class was characterised by a purely one-way, lecturing type of lesson delivery providing very minimal scope for the students’ involvement in any interaction with the teacher. While reading from the textbook, the teacher in some of the cases did not read the content word-by-word, rather rephrased or paraphrased the sentences. The students were instructed to ‘listen quietly’ to what the teacher was reading. The sentences that appeared to the teachers as forming potential questions in the exam were repeated a number of times, mainly orally, with additional practice of writing the answers observed in some of the lessons. The focus was to have the information memorised by the students as effectively as possible. In the case of individual oral questions, the teacher either randomly selected the students to answer, or chose from among those who raised their hand.

There were also some cases when, just after reading a sentence, the teacher explained the meaning of some words or underlying concepts. Moreover, while reading from the textbook, the teachers were sometimes asking rhetorical questions, the answers to which were either yes/no, or one or two words to complete a sentence. The questions were very basic with the answers readily identifiable. For example, “Is not stealing a wrong thing to do?”, “Will you lie to your parents?”, or “What attitude shall we show to our elders?” Another example can be given when for 36 out of the 37 oral or writing-task questions a Case B teacher asked in three of the lessons, the expected answers were either the keywords included in what she had just uttered, or some lists of information or definitions provided in the textbook. In addition, the whole class activity includes the cases when the teachers corrected student responses, commented on them, or articulated the student responses as well as the correct answers to the whole class. Moreover, the teachers invited their students to read aloud to the class in only five of the lessons, whereas reading by the teacher was observed in a total of 28 lessons.

Overall, the questions posed during the lessons had almost no potential to involve the students in deep thinking. The teachers also did not seem to be willing to initiate any discussion based on the responses they received from the students. In a grade five lesson the teacher asked the students how they would keep their school and classrooms clean. Several responses came
from the students, but instead of giving students an opportunity to elaborate on what they answered, the teacher herself started to add further explanation and to provide advice and instructions on what the students should do in this regard. In this connection, an excerpt from a transcript of the other Grade five lesson\textsuperscript{102} is shown below:

**Teacher**: Today we will see how we can keep the school neat and clean by using labour. What will happen if we keep our school neat? Shall we not feel good while studying? What do you think, if this room is dirty and untidy, will you be able to attend to study?

**Students**: No, Mam.

**Teacher**: If we do not sweep the school, if there is dust and mosquitos here, shall we not face difficulties in study?

**Students**: Yes.

**Teacher**: Instead, if the room is tidy, the school is organised well, shall we not feel joy?

**Students**: Yes.

**Teacher**: We will then enjoy study and be attentive to it. So, what do we need to do in this regard? We have to keep the school clean and pleasant.....

The teacher then went on explaining why and how the everyday chores at home require us to expend labour and why it is important for someone to be hard-working. The researcher thought that the teacher could have asked the students what they thought of the necessity of keeping school environment neat and clean, rather than presenting all the information herself. It also happened in this lesson that the teacher talked for a reasonably long period of the lesson when she discussed a wide range of topics and constructs which had very little connection to the lesson topic, and she did not really discuss any ideas or constructs in detail.

**Seatwork.** The seatwork comprised mainly writing in the notebook of answers to one or more questions formed on the textbook content read. In almost all of the cases, the questions sought only factual information that was included in the textbook content. The writing task was included in 19 lessons. The questions were either written on the blackboard or dictated by the teacher. No other forms of writing exercises, such as those involving any worksheets, were implemented in the observed lessons. The other task that the students performed individually was the ‘silent reading’ of the textbook, when they read individually certain content from the textbook. The aim of such a reading activity was to memorise the answers to the questions that the teacher would ask later in the lesson. ‘Silent reading’ took place in 18 of the 43 lessons.

To check what the students wrote in their notebook, the teachers either moved to individual students or the students brought their work to the teacher. The teachers mainly

\textsuperscript{102} COSF55ST2
checked whether there were any spelling mistakes or wrong sentence structures in the written responses. The teacher was never observed articulating what an individual student wrote to the rest of the class; nor in any of the lessons were the written responses shared among students themselves.

**Pair or group work.** This type of activity was observed in only four lessons. However, the question as to whether these activities can really be treated as ‘group’ or ‘pair’ work will be later addressed in this section with a detailed discussion on the function and structure of these activities.

**Other activities.** It was a common scenario across all the lessons that the students spent almost the entire time sitting in the same place. There was almost no opportunity for them to move in the classroom. It was observed in only eight lessons, other than the co-curricular lessons, that the students were involved in any ice-breaking, stimulating activities or any activities that required them to do some sort of physical movement. While the fun activities included singing one or two songs (four lessons) and solving riddles given by the teacher (one lesson), the physical activities included classroom cleaning (two lessons) and basic physical drills (one lesson). The duration of these activities, however, was very short compared to the total class time.

**6.3.4.3 Sequence of the activities.** In the observed lessons, reading by the teacher was usually followed by either asking the class oral questions or assigning a writing task which required the students to answer some questions given. In both of these cases, the questions were based on the textbook content that the teacher had read. Initiating the lesson with ‘teacher reading’ and then spending the rest of the lesson in student evaluation through oral or written questions was the most preferred mode of teaching across the observed lessons.

In two of the lessons, the teachers first asked questions in order to assess student knowledge of a topic taught previously. They then moved to either reading the new topic from the textbook or expressing their own understandings or thoughts relevant to the topic being taught. In four of the lessons, the teachers first assessed the prior knowledge and understanding of the students on the topic to be introduced, and after that referred to the textbook content.

**6.3.4.4 Inadequate Instruction, Lack of Teacher Sensitivity and High Detachment.** It was observed in some of the lessons that the teachers did not adequately describe an instruction or respond to problems faced by the students. One teacher\(^{103}\) from Case B was repeatedly confirming that all students had their textbook opened to the correct page. Given the

\(^{103}\) COSB3AIST2
age of the students, especially those in Grade Three, the question raised in the mind of the researcher was whether all the students were able to simultaneously follow in the textbook what the teacher was reading and pay attention to the theme of the content. The teacher did not check if the students could read the textbook content, nor did any students ask any questions about the content.

In another lesson, a portion of the students failed to understand what the teacher instructed them to do in the writing task. The explanation she gave seemed inadequate and was not audible to all. Although the students were seen by the researcher having trouble knowing what they were expected to do, they did not attempt to clear their confusion by asking the teacher any questions. In the case of the writing tasks given in two lessons, some of the students were struggling with memorising what they had just learnt during the lesson and then writing it. This is natural considering their age and literacy level. The teachers, however, were found using negative remarks and blaming the students for not studying enough, in relation to their inability to write the responses.

A mismatch between what the teachers instructed about how to complete an activity and what they actually wanted the students to do was observed in some lessons. One teacher from Case B, for example, posed a question about the duties and responsibilities of students at home, and instructed the class to write the answer ‘using your own words’. However, from the beginning of the lesson she repeatedly stressed the six points written in the textbook. When one student read aloud his responses the teacher praised him for including some sentences beyond what the textbook articulated. It was, however, found from cross-checking that student’s response and the relevant textbook content that he actually rephrased one sentence, and added a new point that was, “We will keep our reading table organized”. The teacher, however, did not share with the class which information she thought was from outside the book.

Overall, the Case B teachers did not appear to spend sufficient time in lesson preparation. Not only did they exclude activities that might have allowed active student participation and therefore increased teacher effort, in some cases they were confused about what the answer to some of the questions they asked should be; once they discovered their confusion they just skipped the questions rather than sharing those with the class. Moreover, in one lesson the teacher accepted an erroneous student response (name of the festival after observed after the month of Ramadan) as correct and asked the whole class to repeat the same response. Neither she nor the students were able to recognise that the response was wrong.

---

104 COSB3ASST3
105 COSB5SST2
106 For example, in COSB4ASST5, teacher asked from the book a True/False question, ‘There are differences in school curriculum for girls and boys’. No students replied. Teacher kept silent about this question and moved to the next question.
107 COSB3ASST3
6.3.4.5 **Shallow exploration of Values terms/concepts.** In most of the lessons the values content given in the textbook was explored only at a surface level without initiating meaningful discussion that could lead the students to exercise higher-order thinking. Although there were opportunities to listen to students’ ideas and thoughts in response to some questions, for example, “What are our responsibilities towards the family and society?” or “How should we behave with our parents?”, the teacher in a lesson only stressed that the students should memorise and reproduce the sentences included in the chapter content. In another lesson\(^{108}\), the teacher elaborated a sentence from the textbook by saying, “What makes you feel that stealing is a bad deed? We know this [‘stealing is bad’] as we all have conscience or intelligence.” She, however, did not explain what ‘conscience’ was or how the students can use their conscience to keep them away from doing unacceptable actions.

Making explicit connections of the lesson topic to school or classroom experiences of the learners was observed in two lessons conducted by a Case B teacher. While teaching the topic ‘Handicapped Children’, she referred to the attitude and behaviour the students should show to a student in this school having some physical disabilities. In another lesson she advised some students not to laugh when a student responded with a wrong answer. In her words, “If you laugh at someone [who answered incorrectly], he or she will never attempt to answer again. We ourselves are not always right. When someone says something wrong we will let them know the correct answer instead of laughing.”\(^{109}\)

It was found during the Case B observations that among the entire 76 questions asked, there was only one question where the response expected was not provided in the relevant textbook content. The question, “Do you know what modesty is?” was posed after the teacher articulated a sentence, “We shall talk to them [our parents] modestly.”\(^{110}\) The teacher, however, neither waited for the response nor explained the term ‘modesty’. Moreover, there were only two occasions in Case B when the teachers asked the class to summarise what was in the lecture, but the teachers themselves articulated the summary immediately after posing the question.

In most cases the teacher did not seem to be willing to create or utilise opportunities to explore students’ thoughts and feelings at length. For example, in one lesson of which the topic was ‘the responsibilities to the family’, the teacher himself took the lead to explain how the fathers earn money for the family whereas he could, instead, elicit student responses and extend the discussion based on the students’ comments. One Grade Four lesson\(^{111}\) about ‘Social

\[\text{\textsuperscript{108}}\text{COBS5IST5}\]
\[\text{\textsuperscript{109}}\text{COBS5IST5}\]
\[\text{\textsuperscript{110}}\text{COBS3AIST2}\]
\[\text{\textsuperscript{111}}\text{COSD45ST6}\]
Qualities’ and another Grade Five lesson about ‘Social Qualities and Values’ were observed at Case D in which the teacher introduced some relatively complex concepts and ideas from the book, such as ‘unity’, ‘cooperation’, ‘solidarity’, ‘dutifulness’, ‘morality’ and ‘punctuality’. However, neither the textbook nor the teacher herself defined or explained these social values and qualities with relevant examples and metaphors. Rather, the students were drilled several times to memorise the names of these values.

In only one lesson did the teacher attempt to discover the children’s attitudes and dispositions, stepping outside of posing only fact-finding and low-level cognitive questions. The teacher presented two scenarios to the class. After she explained how one should behave to others in society, she posed two open questions, “What will you do in case your neighbour’s home is on fire?” and “What will you do if your neighbour’s child is sick?” The teacher, however, did not provide adequate time or scaffolding so that the students could really engage in thinking to reflect on what they would have done in such cases. As the classroom remained quiet in response to the first question, the teacher pointed to one student and he replied, “I will help my neighbour with money.” The teacher did not seem satisfied with this reply, but rather than introducing cognitive exercises by posing further questions, the teacher moved to the next question. Again, after no students replied, the teacher articulated to the class what they could do in the cases presented. She went on saying as follows:

You can help with money. If you can’t help alone, you can take help from your elders. … You should take care if someone in your neighbourhood is sick. You should help as much as you can. There are many poor people around you. … You can share your food with them. You should also give your clothes to the needy if you have some extra.

6.3.4.6 Teachers’ inexperience in conducting cooperative strategies. The students seemed very interested in cooperative activities. But the teachers’ attempts to use collaborative learning activities were characterised by their limited understanding of how to conduct such lessons, unclear goals and expectations, and inadequate explanations and directions regarding the requirements of the tasks. Detailed examples are given in Appendix 6.2.

6.3.4.7 Students’ Interest in Narratives. The students in general showed great interest in the topic the teacher was discussing when the discussion referred to the moral and emotional experiences in one’s real life. For example, the teacher in one lesson shared her views on the services that people of different occupations provide to society, the significance of such services, as well as the attitude and behaviour one should show to manual labourers and
working class people. It was found that the students were listening to this discussion with notable attention. This happened in other cases, too, for example when the teacher was asking the class to share their food and clothes with the poor around them. In another lesson, too, the students were also seen to be deeply interested and engaged when the teacher was describing why one should show forgiveness to others, and how this virtue can maintain peace in a society. The students seemed to have been deeply moved when the teacher explained ‘forgiveness’ drawing on some social phenomena prevailing in Bangladesh. At one point the teacher made explicit reference to an incident in relation to the topic of ‘forgiveness’. In his words:

Today one student brought to me a ball that was thrown at him. Now, if instead of bringing that matter to me, he could have forgiven him [the other student]. Wouldn’t it be better then? Had he done so, his inner qualities would have been expressed. Sometimes you quarrel. But, you can say ‘sorry’ instead, as it is better to forget and forgive rather than quarrel.

After the teacher said this, one student questioned the view of the teacher by saying, “Is only saying ‘sorry’ enough in all cases? Does it really solve what someone has done to the other?” This type of placing a moral dilemma by a student was the only case found across all of the case-studies. The way the teacher responded to this moral dilemma was even more interesting. The teacher said:

A relationship cannot be built if you prefer to take revenge. Forgiving even without making any judgements helps build and improve any relationship. In this way love and compassion between you will increase. Today you say or do something [unpleasant] to someone, tomorrow he will do the same to you. The result will be only a decaying relationship.

The questioner, as well as the other students, seemed to have been satisfied with this response. Another instance can be given when the students showed relatively greater interest in the teachers’ lecture while the teachers were providing general suggestions or advice—in relation to the lesson content, but from beyond the textbook content—that highlighted real life, day-to-day experiences or feelings. This happened in a lesson\textsuperscript{115} when the teacher suggested the students convey to their mother what the teacher said about a mother’s role in keeping her children clean and tidy. In another lesson\textsuperscript{116}, the teacher was telling a story (from outside the book) about ‘united we stand, divided we fall’ and the students were seen listening with great interest.

\textsuperscript{115} COSE5HST8
\textsuperscript{116} COSD3TST3
6.3.5 Social Support and Meaningful Classroom Interaction

In general, the teachers in rural and urban schools did not seem to have considered the age, ability and interests of the learners while planning for the lesson or delivering the content. The classroom interactions in these schools were limited to that of the teacher with the whole class and these were mostly directed from the teacher to the class. The students were not seen asking questions, giving suggestions about the topic, or making any comments about what the teacher said or instructed them to do. The teachers did not seem to pay adequate attention to whether the individual students were able to follow the teacher’s lecture and connect to the lesson topic. It was observed in some lessons at these schools that the teacher did not make eye contact with any of the students for a significant portion of the class time. Moreover, some teachers in these schools were seen caning students when they failed to answer questions in the classroom. Canes were also observed being used during the assembly or on other occasions to maintain student discipline, although there was no perceived necessity of using such a mode of treatment. The teachers’ lack of interest in students’ learning and overall development and their detachment from the students during the lessons were perceived by the researcher as negatively influencing the students’ overall interest in the lesson and, hence, their classroom performance at these schools. It is also relevant to mention here that in response to a question about why there was poor student attendance in a particular lesson at Case B, the students replied that this was because of the fear of a class test, which this teacher had announced in the previous lesson. Moreover, it was found in several cases that when the students were unable to follow a direction of the teacher or they felt physically uncomfortable because of the extreme heat of the summer, they did not seem to gather enough courage to share their problems with the teacher.

Conversely, in metropolitan schools, the teachers’ attitude, behaviour and support to students appeared to foster a positive, democratic classroom environment. The behavioural practices and teaching methods adopted by the teachers enhanced student participation in classroom discussions, showing respect and care for the learning needs and abilities of the students. Although there was teacher control over students to a certain extent, it did not intimidate students or prevent them from expressing their opinions and thoughts. The students freely responded to teacher queries and were also heard making comments on what the teacher explained or on the responses of other students. The classroom environment even allowed students to correct or challenge teachers when they said or wrote something wrong. For example, in a Grade three Social Studies class the students asked the teacher to correct the total student number written on the blackboard. In another class, the teacher mis-spelled a word that the students recognized. In both cases, the teachers did not react negatively towards

\[\text{COSC3ASST5}\]
students’ identifying and correcting their mistakes. It was also observed in two lessons that the students even asked questions seeking clarification for a confusing instruction given for an activity\textsuperscript{118} or questions that arose in their mind in relation to the lesson topic\textsuperscript{119}. In almost all cases the teachers also showed appreciation when the students gave creative responses.

It was observed in some cases that the teachers deliberately made humorous remarks to make the students laugh and the students also seemed to enjoy those remarks. For example, in one class when the teacher introduced a topic, one student asked about the page number in the book. The teacher said in reply, “I myself am the page”\textsuperscript{120} and the class were amused to hear such a reply. In another class\textsuperscript{121} the teacher asked the students to pray for the Bangladeshi Cricket team so they could win a match in the world cup which was being played at that time. The students expressed great joy when the teacher introduced this topic and some of them started to sing the theme song of that sports event.

The students also seemed to be happy and engaged during class time. In some classes the teachers invited the students to perform songs at the beginning. This created a fun environment in class and worked as an effective icebreaker. The teachers encouraged students to ask questions and responded with respect to any student queries. When any student came up with a creative reply or could articulate any response in a clear and polite manner, the teachers appreciated that student with praising remarks and/or asked the class to clap. They also were not seen making any negative comment when a student response did not appear to be right or convincing to them.

6.4 Overall School Environment

The physical environment of most of the classrooms appeared to the researcher to be very unpleasant and not at all conducive to learning. In some lessons where the class sizes were 69 and 79, the students could barely move once they sat down. Furthermore, these classrooms were not adequately ventilated. The unbearable heat of the summer and the strong smell coming from a nearby drain was found to be distracting students from learning during some observations.

\textsuperscript{118}COSC3AIST5
\textsuperscript{119}COSC4AIST2
\textsuperscript{120}COSC4AIST2
\textsuperscript{121}COSC5AIST7
Overall, the Case A teachers’ attitudes to the students did not seem to be friendly or supportive. During the lessons some of the teachers were found using harsh and abusive language while commenting about student’s performance in class. The students also appeared to be disinterested in or less spontaneous about replying to the questions posed by the teachers. There were almost no student initiatives observed in this school during the field visit. There were numerous occasions when the teachers expressed their distress to the researcher about the students’ behavior and family education and how these factors made their job more difficult. The common view expressed by the teachers in this school was that most of the students were not attentive to their studies, and there was almost no academic support available to them from the family members. The teachers in this connection argued that the lack of motivation for study among the students was the main reason for their lower academic performance. It was repeatedly shared by the teachers that their ongoing efforts in teaching the students could not be reflected in the students’ academic achievement, because the students themselves and their family members were not serious about studying and learning.

Two major incidents occurred in School B which reflected the teachers’ reduced sensitivity to the overall interests and expectations of the children. On one occasion, the head teacher announced during the daily assembly that a ‘national children’s competition’ would be taking place at the sub-district level and invited the students to take part in this. It was articulated that the teachers would take the interested participants to the competition site. Some students managed to obtain the required fee and came to school the next day, prepared to participate in the competition. The teachers, however, were not willing to accompany those children and discouraged them from participating. Finally, the students gave up hope of attending the competition. Observing the annual sports and prize giving event in this school, this researcher also questioned the responsibility and respect of the teachers towards their students. The students showed great enthusiasm and interest in taking part in the sports events. The events were being organised over a period of three days and the final day program included the prize giving ceremony which was scheduled to start at 3 pm. The whole school was waiting for that part of the program as the students who ranked a position in various sports events and also in annual exams were supposed to be given an award. The focus of the program, however, was solely placed on entertaining the guests, who were higher officials and members of the local government. Not only were the children bound to remain seated and listen to the speeches delivered by the guests, the children had to wait for about three hours after the scheduled time before the prize distribution commenced. Moreover, the teachers refused to allow two of the students to perform a role play—the only student performance in the program—that the students had been preparing for a long time. The reason behind the refusal was that there was not enough time to accommodate that performance. Finally, the two students received permission to
perform and the other students were greatly amused seeing that performance. Although the event was meant to be directed towards students and their success, the way it was conducted neglected the students and their voice.

Both the teachers and the students in Cases C and E stood out for their exceptional characteristics compared to most of the other case study schools. The teachers in School C seemed to have better teacher education and teaching skills, and a friendlier attitude to the students. The students were also found to be more confident, alert and more willing to participate in classroom discussions and activities.

Similarly, the tone and language used by most of the teachers in School E were very mild and respectful of the students. The teachers’ verbal and facial expressions seemed to have created a supportive leaning environment in the classrooms observed. In most of the lessons the students did not seem to fear the teacher or hesitate to say anything in reply to the teachers’ queries. In some lessons students were seen correcting each other or providing scaffolds for responding when the teacher asked questions of someone sitting near them. The teachers at this school were also seen appreciating the satisfactory performances of students by using positive remarks or asking the class to applaud. Two of the teachers were using the pronoun ‘we’, instead of ‘you’ to refer to or address the students. Moreover, the teachers were usually concerned about whether the students’ oral responses could be heard by others in the class, and if not they either articulated the responses themselves or asked some other students who could say loudly enough.

The teachers in the observed lessons at Case Schools C and E maintained a common practice that they did not initiate the lesson with reading from the textbook. Neither did they spend an extended period in reading themselves. The teaching strategies implemented went beyond the techniques of question-answering and writing answers to the given questions. In these two schools the teachers almost always first asked open questions of the students to elicit what they knew about a certain topic, or revised the content from previous lessons. Following this, they described the topic of the lesson using relevant examples and explanations. Afterwards the students were asked to open the corresponding pages of the textbook and read from the relevant paragraphs. By doing this the focus was shifted from relying solely on the textbook for lesson delivery to engaging students by asking for their ideas and opinions. There were three instances at School E when an ‘icebreaker’ was used to initiate the lesson; the icebreakers included student performance of a song, basic physical drills, and two riddles.
posed to the class by the teacher. The children seemed to be very enthusiastic and active during these activities. A detailed account of the examples of such practices is included in Appendix 6.3.

The most child-friendly teacher observed by the researcher was in School E. This teacher in her lesson about ‘the rights of women in the society’ mostly talked to the students in an affectionate mood and did not use any comments that could have hurt the feelings of the students. She showed sensitivity to the difficulties faced by the students in following her instructions or performing tasks, and took measures to address those difficulties. For example, this teacher wrote a question on the blackboard, the answer to which was taught in the previous lesson. When she found that the students were unable to respond to this question, she commented, “This question has been a little hard for you [to remember], hasn’t it? Let us open the book and read the paragraph on this topic.” Following this, the teacher read from the book and explained the content. In another instance, the teacher rephrased a question when she realised that the students did not understand the meaning of that question. The researcher felt that the relatively higher student participation in classroom activities in this lesson and the willingness to respond to teacher queries could be attributed to the presence of a safe and supportive classroom environment and the teacher’s positive attitudes and behaviour to her students.

The Case E teachers’ attitudes towards, and the treatment of, their students also seemed to be very supportive and sympathetic. During the focus group discussion, the teachers referred to the impoverished family condition of the majority of the students and proclaimed their commitment towards providing a care-driven and love-based schooling experience for these children. Some teachers burst into tears while depicting the extreme poverty and unpleasant home environments prevailing in the families of their students. The stories that the teachers shared showed their honest and noble intention to assist these disadvantaged students in improving the status of their life. The teachers seemed sincere in their work and showed almost no tendency of evading their responsibilities. The students in general appeared to not be fearful of the teachers and showed a respectful attitude to the teachers and the other students. The students’ active and spontaneous participation in the classroom and school activities reflected the confidence they held about themselves. The students were involved in various tasks, such as assisting the teachers in carrying notebooks from the classroom to the teachers’ common room, ringing the school bell, and looking after the school resources etc.
In addition, the mutual understanding between the teachers at school E signalled the presence of a healthy, positive relationship that was supported by care and respect for each other. The teachers appeared to be sympathetic to any personal or professional issues faced by their colleagues. Particularly the leadership role of the head teacher, who was in his late thirties, seemed to act as a unifying force for steering the efforts made by the teachers towards the broader goal of providing a better learning environment for the pupils. The assistant teachers spoke very highly of the head teacher when they described the degree of his dedication to work as well as his personal virtues and dispositions. As an example, when two of his colleagues set off to a nearby city to attend a training session, the head teacher went to the bus station to see them off. All of the teachers praised highly this incident which was a proof of the generous and supportive mindset of the head teacher.

The remarks made about the head teacher by the most senior teacher were:

He is very hard working and also very transparent about the school management. He has good rapport with the local community... He is very efficient, never loses temper with the students and never punishes them physically; rather handles behavioural or disciplinary issues only with words. He is very passionate to the students.126

It was found that before taking any decisions about the students or the school in general, the head teacher discussed the issue with all the other teachers. In the case of distributing responsibilities among the teachers, he maintained a respectful voice and did not show an authoritarian attitude to others. His colleagues showed similar respect to him by valuing his requests. It appeared to the researcher that the head teacher also exerted some influence on the assistant teachers as they adopted certain qualities of the head teacher inside themselves, such as his mild behaviour, amicable personality and his sincerity to work. In addition, the senior teachers showed an attitude of motherly affection to the head teacher.

During the interview with this researcher, the Case E head teacher acknowledged the contribution of his colleagues by saying, “The teachers in this school are very dedicated. We work as a team.” It was observed that the head teacher possessed a caring attitude not only to his colleagues, but also to the students. For instance, when one guardian came to him to collect the testimonial for his son, the head teacher came to know that that person practices music and also provides free music training to the poor children. The head teacher then immediately requested him to launch a similar training program in this school. He also assured the guardian that the

126FGSET5
school would buy the necessary musical instruments for training. This incident showed an overall sensitivity of the head teacher to the development of the students in his school.

6.5 Challenges for the Teachers

One purpose of the case study component included in this research was to identify from the teachers’ viewpoint the issues and challenges the teachers face in performing the role of values educators. The teachers in general pointed out two common factors that in their view limited their motivation towards, and ability to contribute effectively to, forming the character and moral disposition of the pupils. First, the hierarchical education system suppressed the teachers’ voice and freedom, and the poor salary structure offered a lower professional and social status to the teachers. Second, the family background of the majority of the children acted as a major setback against the school’s potential in delivering values education. These two factors are elaborated in the following paragraphs.

School and system related factors. As the teachers contended, the present educational system in Bangladesh provides almost no scope for primary teachers to have any say in matters like developing educational goals, designing the syllabus and the curricular materials, and making decisions about the administration and operation of the schools. Not only do the higher officials ‘force’ and ‘pressurise’ the teachers in every aspect of the teachers’ professional life, but the creativity and performance of the teachers are also not recognised. Asserting that the department constantly directs teachers to adopt new and untested or unproven educational strategies without any prior discussion with the teachers, the Case F head teacher placed an example of an official who, on an official visit to Kerala, India, observed in a school that question papers were distributed to children fifteen minutes earlier than answer sheets. After he had returned, the higher official ordered all of the schools in this district to implement a similar procedure. The head teacher questioned this type of decision made by the higher officials by saying:

Why all on a sudden just a tiny part of the whole education system in Kerala was intended to be applied here, without providing us any prior instruction? Why didn’t he [the official] think about other more important factors of education that have been successful in Kerala? He just wanted to start a new approach and instructed us to do so.\(^{127}\)

\(^{127}\) INT5FT1
Since the teachers felt that their work was not valued and their voice unheard, the teachers stated that they did not feel any interest and enthusiasm in attending to the children’s values development. It was rather considered by a number of teachers ‘a wastage of labour and creativity’ and ‘an extra burden’, given that they were already overloaded with academic and non-academic work. Coupled with that, according to the teachers, the poor salary structure caused the teachers’ professional and social status to be degraded, and this negatively impacted on their personal values and ethics. To this end, the Case F head teacher contended that values education, in whatever form it is now present in Bangladeshi schools, is ‘seriously hampered’, because the teachers themselves are not able to exercise honest thoughts or deeds, or, ‘think in open mind’.

The teachers also criticised the attitude and behaviour of the higher officials as seriously offending the teachers’ self-respect and self-esteem. For example, the Case C and Case F teachers linked their professional dissatisfaction to the way the Education Department treated the primary school teachers. Not only were the teachers provided with a very low salary compared to other government employees of a similar rank, but the higher officials imposed on them non-academic responsibilities, set unrealistic deadlines and provided very little or no incentives. One male teacher contended that, “All teachers enter this profession with good intentions. However, they become engaged in private tutoring in order to survive [by making an extra income]. Consequently, they cannot remain honest with the time spent in school.” The head teacher expressed her grief about the lack of coordination in the Education Department in the following manner:

> It seems like our main job duty is to provide statistical information to the government. This is only what the primary education now expects us to be involved in. We repeatedly send the same sort of information every month. Why is there not an integrated system so that all information will be coordinated?

It was stipulated by the Case B teachers that unless the motivation and incentives for teachers increase, the situation of primary education in Bangladesh will not be improved. One teacher’s comment in this regard was: “We [Bangladeshi teachers] are under-paid. Our main concern during the last few lesson periods [of a school day] becomes earning extra money by going to an additional job.” He added that the teachers barely have time to follow the department’s order of doing ‘home visits’ to the students’ residents. Moreover, the teachers thought the fund of Tk 500 (equivalent to about $AUD6) that is allotted to each teacher for conducting the children’s survey is insufficient compared to the real cost. They expressed the
view that it is unreasonable on the part of the higher authority to expect quality work from teachers, whether academic or non-academic, when the payment to the teachers barely meets their day-to-day demands. One teacher commented on the harsh reality faced by the teachers in this way:

They [the authority] will get the return as much as they pay us … How can you expect teachers’ honesty or moral education in present reality? We teachers are not moral. Situation is compelling us to do so. All teachers have this sort of complaints. … They [the higher officials] treat us like third class citizens and rebuke us when they come to visit school. We are not allowed to protest or complain or say anything against the department’s orders.  

The teachers also criticised the trend in the Education Department of setting unrealistic goals without conducting adequate research or consulting with teachers. One teacher, for example, became sceptical about the government’s agenda of ensuring 100% enrolment by 2011. In his view, this might be one of the factors worth considering in order to improve the quality of education, but the highest priority ought to have been set on increasing the facilities in schools, including teacher numbers and other physical facilities. Afterwards, steps could have been taken to gradually attain 100% enrolment, first targeting for a 75%, and then increasing the target every year. He added:

Do the policies or plans [in primary education] have any implications? No, not at all. All are in vain. Do they reflect the real situation in Bangladesh? No. The government is concerned about numbers. But, are these numbers true? No. Why does it not instead consider enrolling less proportion of the children population and stress ensuring the quality of education for all of them?

The other problem that was identified by the teachers was the shortage of teachers and the high student/teacher ratio in government primary schools in Bangladesh. Due to these factors, it is very difficult for the teachers to attend to the needs and values of individual students and create classroom opportunities for them to think about and reflect on values in the regular lessons. The teachers described how the shortage of teachers affects their teaching, and therefore, the quality of education delivered in the classroom, as well as the teachers’ physical and mental well-being. For example, the teachers in Case C and F articulated that it was ‘nearly impossible’ for the teachers to prepare lesson notes for every lesson, an order placed by the authority to ensure quality teaching by the teachers. Moreover, all of the teachers in Case F complained about the school hours (seven to eight hours) being unreasonably long for children aged between six and ten.

\[130\] INTSBT7
\[131\] INTSBT7
**Student and family related factors.** It was stressed by nearly all of the teachers that ‘family is the first and foremost institution providing education’ and, therefore, the disadvantaged family background of the children may lessen the school’s potential in promoting the necessary values. According to the teachers the prospect of learning at school becomes limited for those children who come from ‘very low income families’, as is the case of most primary school children in Bangladesh. These children are generally ‘deprived physically, mentally, socially, financially - that is in all respects’\(^{132}\), because the extent of family support that they receive is insufficient to ensure their wellbeing. Most of the families struggle to meet the basic needs of their children, such as food, clothing, nutrition and health. The teachers argued that the lack of adequate food and nutrition impeded the ability of the students to benefit from what was taught in the classroom, thus resulting in their poor academic performance. The teachers also asserted that the parents could not provide any academic support or necessary moral teaching to their children. The teachers stressed that the lack of education among the guardians, coupled with their financial limitation, worked negatively against the teachers’ endeavour to provide education to the students. According to the Case B head teacher, for example, the guardians did not even maintain the basic cleanliness and hygiene of their children, let alone ‘looking after their study at home’ or ‘teaching them order or discipline’.

The teachers argued that the potential of the school in guiding the children’s moral education became restricted when the children experienced a lack of harmony between the environment in the family home and at school. There was a stark contrast between what the children learned in school about developing as moral human beings and exercising values, and what they experienced in their family from the attitudes and actions of their parents. Therefore, although the students learned about good values and expected qualities at school, when they mixed with their own family the effect of that learning was weakened. The following comment made by one teacher reflects the teachers’ views:

> How much the students reflect what they learn about values [in school] on their behaviour depends on the environment [they are raised in] and also the friends they are mixing with. … If they get everything favourable—good family, good friends, good environment, then the learning will be permanent.\(^{133}\)

Similarly, one Case A teacher depicted this situation in this way: “The environments at family and school are actually contradictory for these children. If they do not find any reflection of what we teach them at school about values and morality, then the learning would not be effective and lasting”.

\(^{132}\)FGSFT2
\(^{133}\)INTSCT3
The Case B teachers reported that the high student absenteeism rate was a major challenge for this school. Due to the low economic status of the families, some children dropped out of school and engaged in labour-intensive work. It happened that the enrolled students who did not attend school regularly were still required to appear at the school final or completion exams. However, these irregular students usually failed to pass the exams and thus contributed to lowering the image of the school to the higher authority. The teachers made remarks on how the high student absenteeism scenario and the lack of support from the family impacted on the achievement of student outcomes and the overall classroom teaching and learning in this school. One male teacher, for example, stated that:

Only about seven or eight out of the sixty [students] in grade five prepare lessons at home. When about 50% of the students are absent, how can I proceed with teaching [new content] in the next lesson without repeating the content that I already taught? This seriously hampers the overall progress [of the students’ learning].

In contrast to these often-stated views about the difficulties that schools faced in teaching values to children from disadvantaged family backgrounds, the Case F head teacher identified that schools and dedicated teachers could overcome the barriers of poverty and poorly educated communities to effectively teach values:

...when I get a readymade child, a child from a very good family, then I do not have much to do for him or her. But, for these children [without adequate family education] we have a lot to do if we really care. Say, this ethics or values or any form of qualities…it appears that not much of these has been flourished or developed in these children…if we teachers sincerely work, this can be achieved quite well.

6.6 Summary

This chapter reported the findings relevant to the explicit and implicit provisions available in schools for values education, the overall nature of the school environment, and the challenges facing the teachers in terms of delivering effective values and moral education. It was shown that there were no clear expectations and explicit policies or guidelines present in the schools, in relation to values development. Also, although the teachers identified that values such as tolerance, patriotism, punctuality etc. were taught or instilled through the mandated daily school assembly and the co- and extra-curricular activities, these activities were not usually implemented in the case study schools in a way that could contribute effectively to the
values development of children. The assemblies did not seem to be intentionally designed and implemented so that the children could discover, understand or enact the values that the teachers identified. In addition, the co- and extra-curricular activities, such as ‘Cub Team’, co-curricular lessons, sports and recreational activities etc. were happening in the schools in a limited manner, although the students were highly interested in these activities. It seemed that because their teaching time was reduced, the teachers considered these activities ‘an extra load’. Moreover, the teachers worked under a very difficult school environment characterised by high student/teacher ratios, impoverished family backgrounds of the students, and a strictly hierarchical education system. In this environment, the teachers had little authority to make school-related decisions. Therefore, the teachers felt their potential to contribute to the students’ values and moral education in the school was limited. According to the teachers, they were not able to plan or implement the kinds of school rules or activities that they thought would ensure the wellbeing of the students as well as themselves.
CHAPTER 7:  
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

7.1 Introduction

Findings from the document analysis and case studies have been reported in the previous three chapters. The purpose of this chapter is threefold: i) to address the key research questions by summarising the findings collected from the four different sources—the document analysis, interviews, focus groups and observations—and making connections to these different groups of findings; ii) to discuss the findings and additional themes emerging from the study in the light of the relevant literature, and finally iii) to summarise the research findings, report the limitations, make implications, and draw conclusions. The findings are discussed under four key themes that formed the research questions.

1. Awareness of values among the key educational authority and the school leaders: What values and skills are deemed important for Bangladeshi students by the policy makers and school authorities and how is the delivery of these values and skills incorporated within the educational policies and practices?

2. Cognitive, affective, and behavioural domain of values learning: What opportunities do the primary curriculum and textbooks provide for students to learn about values, understand and explore values, and develop and practise applying values?

3. Explicit/implicit provisions for the articulation of values: To what extent do the involvement of the community, school-level daily operations, curricular provisions, co- and extra-curricular activities, and the decision making strategies support the explicit and implicit values learning of the students?

4. Support from the environment: To what extent do the overall school environment, teachers’ modelling of values, as well as the interaction between and among the school community members uphold the significance of supporting student’s values and holistic development through the schooling provisions?

7.2 Addressing the Key Themes

The key four themes are discussed in this section with reference to the relevant literature and to the findings reported in Chapters 4, 5, and 6.
1. **Awareness of values among the key educational authority and the school leaders:**

What values and skills are deemed important for Bangladeshi students by the policy makers and school authorities and how is the delivery of these values and skills incorporated within the educational policies and practices?

For a values education endeavour to be successful, values should be placed at the centre of schooling, and mentioned explicitly in the values education policy and/or the school vision statement (DEST, 2005a; LVEP, 2009). These values will be determined by the whole school community since it is important to ensure that the values of a school community are reflected in the school’s endeavours. It is imperative that key persons instrumental in school decision making consider values learning an essential charter of the school, and translate their concerns around this agenda into school practices. Assuming that the philosophy and priorities of key persons involved in school management and operation guide school activities, interviews and a focus group discussion were carried out with them. The aim was to extract their position—that is, their attitude, understanding and concerns—in relation to values education in general and also in the context of Bangladesh. Through formal and informal discussions with teachers, it was also intended to collect information on the awareness of the apex authority in relation to the reflection of values development in key educational policies and their implementation. Findings and arguments presented to address the first research question derived from the interviews and focus groups with teachers and the analysis of key educational policies, government reports and other relevant publications.

In the context of Bangladesh, an educational focus on nurturing the children from a holistic viewpoint and creating a child-centred, quality learning environment is a relatively new phenomenon. This is also a significant leap beyond the ‘access and equity’ paradigm in terms of improving the quality of educational delivery. The government is increasingly urging the schools to conduct co- and extra-curricular activities and adopt child-friendly practices. The Education Policy 2010 and the teacher training programs introduced in the recent past put special emphasis on learner-centred teaching approaches, quality learning environments, inclusive education, and the recognition of multiple intelligences of the learners in teaching-learning and evaluation practices. There has not yet been developed any dedicated policy, program or curriculum for moral and values development. However, curricular content for developing physical, mental, social, aesthetic, moral and other values has been included across a number of mandated subject areas that include Social Studies, Religious Studies, Art and Craft, Physical Education, Music and other co-curricular lessons. These values also underpin the aims and objectives of primary school education.
Continuous efforts are being made by the government to provide quality primary education, such as increasing teacher numbers and physical facilities in schools, providing financial support to the families in the form of ‘stipend’, supplying mid-day meals so that children are retained in school, and so on. However, it is crucial to ensure that the initiatives are being monitored and evaluated effectively so that the schools do not neglect the objective of attracting children to school by making schools more enjoyable to them. A study on the weaknesses in the education sector governance in Bangladesh suggested that the ‘stipend’ programme has failed to target the poor because of the weaknesses and contradictions in the governance of the programme (Kerr et al., 2010).

The results of the present study suggest that most teachers seemed to have a limited understanding of values and values education. The focus of the teachers in this research was mainly on the children conforming to authority and social norms and orders. Learning manners and growing as social human beings were identified as the most crucial aspects of values development. Utmost importance was placed on the children showing respectful behaviour to the teachers and other elders, being affectionate to younger students, being dutiful to the family, maintaining classroom discipline etc. Performance values such as critical thinking, diligence, perseverance and commitment to work (CEP, 2008; Lickona, 1996; Lickona et al., 2007) were rarely mentioned by the participant teachers; nor were other aspects typically embedded in values education such as higher-order thinking abilities, and practical understanding and skills related to civics and citizenship. Also absent were the sense of responsibility, confidence, achievement and self-esteem, as well as the understanding of the students of their relationship to the school and wider communities, aspects commonly identified as student values outcomes in western education initiatives (DEST, 2005b).

In addition, the teachers’ views of the curriculum and pedagogy and their own potential in developing the essential values-related skills also seemed to be limited. With a very few exceptions, the teachers did not appear to be able to analyse the curriculum or their pedagogies from a critical standpoint. They did not seem to recognise that the present curriculum is prescriptive and does not foster opportunities to develop the students’ thinking habits and moral reasoning ability.

A study conducted to elicit views of the teachers in the Netherlands about the mandated citizenship education program showed that the teachers wanted their students to acquire the skills to analyse, communicate and reflect on values (Leenders et al., 2008). Another ethnographic study on Swedish primary schools attempted to understand the values education that occurs in daily interactions of teachers and students (Thornberg, 2008b). Thornberg’s findings indicated that the teachers attached primary significance to ‘teach students to be nice and kind to others, to behave well, and to understand and follow rules’ (p. 52). Teachers in this
study viewed their practices of values education as mostly ‘reactive and unplanned’ and ‘unconsciously performed’ (Thornberg, 2008a, p. 1791). Teachers’ perceptions about which values are important for the children were expressed in terms of ‘behaviour and rules/norms’ and ‘personality and character’ (p. 1792). Findings derived from the present study show resemblance to those of the Swedish study as teachers in Bangladeshi schools discussed values mainly in light of the behavioural traits expected of the children. Moreover, a lack of professional knowledge among the teachers in the Swedish study (Thornberg, 2008a, 2008b) was identified when the teachers failed to relate their practices of values education to any philosophical, educational or sociological theories or research. This, too, applies to the views expressed by the teachers in this regard, in the present study.

2. **Cognitive, affective, and behavioural domain of values learning:** What opportunities do the primary curriculum and textbooks provide for students to learn about values, understand and explore values, and develop and practise applying values?

It was revealed in the document analysis that the aims, objectives, and curriculum of primary education in Bangladesh make adequate reference to the significance of values development. The state philosophy of religious adherence, socialism, nationalism, and democracy have been translated to a set of spiritual, human, social and citizenship values, which form the basis of the aims, objectives, and learning outcomes of primary education in Bangladesh. The values-related outcomes are expected to be achieved from mastering the subject-matter of Social Studies and Religious Studies, and the key topics and chapter content in the textbooks of these subjects were designed to achieve this goal.

However, the design and content of the textbook, which is the dominant instructional and learning tool, conveys very little potential in materialising these curricular objectives. The textbooks tend to cover a broad range of topics and provide examples which are disconnected from student’s lives rather than supporting students to acquire a deep understanding of the intended curriculum focus. The textbooks also rarely provide learning activities that allow students to investigate the nature of values, the significance of a particular value in life, and the way the presence or absence of values can affect themselves or the feelings of others. Moreover, although the curricula of Social Studies and Religious Studies recommend taking into account the natural curiosity and investigative mind of young learners, as well as their age-specific capacity and need for learning, the textbook content does not reflect this recommendation.

Developing children’s thinking and critical reflection ability, which is essential for building the moral disposition of learners, is barely addressed by the curriculum and textbooks.
This argument also applies to the pedagogical practices prevailing in the classrooms. The present situation in Bangladesh can best be described by the dilemma of treating subject matter as an ‘end’, instead of as a ‘means’ to achieving that ‘end’, when the end is the development of certain intellectual, social and emotional qualities in learners (Fishman & McCarthy, 1998). Because of the overemphasis put on the mastery of the subject content, the objective of achieving other broader goals through teaching that subject content remains unreached.

It was portrayed in Chapter 4 that the curriculum and the textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies cover critical thinking skills, emotional and social skills, and problem solving and decision making abilities in a very limited manner. The teacher training resources made sporadic references to these themes, but in a very narrow way, and do not elaborate on the methods and techniques that the teachers need to learn to implement cooperative teaching-learning strategies in the classrooms. This argument was also supported by the teachers’ views of their pedagogical practices and by the findings derived from the classroom observations.

In 2013, a new set of textbooks have been developed based on the curriculum revised in 2011. The revised curriculum and the textbooks were intended to reflect the recommendations and suggestions from the Education Policy 2010 (MOE, 2010). The names of the subjects Environment Studies (Society) and Religious Studies have been changed to Bangladesh and Global Studies, and Religious and Moral Education, respectively. A brief look at the textbooks revealed that although minor changes have been made in the names of the textbooks, and the illustrations included in them, the content has remained almost the same. More classroom activities have been included within the chapter content, but the activities are mainly ‘listing on the notebook’ tasks. Therefore, the findings reported in Chapter Four, which derived from the analysis of the previous set of textbooks, seem to be applicable to the revised curriculum and textbooks as well. Findings from the teacher interviews suggested that a number of the teachers, especially those who had received short-term supplementary training courses, were aware of the limitations of traditional teaching-learning practices. Referring to these limitations, these teachers also shared the view that the learner-centred, cooperative teaching strategies and classroom management techniques that the recent training courses had introduced to them, could be instrumental in engaging the students in lessons and achieving the desired learning outcomes, if implemented properly. However, while talking about their teaching philosophies and practices, the majority of the teachers articulated that, in designing and implementing classroom activities they mainly focused on the students’ mastery of the textbook content. Their goal is that the students will be able to answer the questions correctly during the term-final and year-final tests. Therefore, the teachers prefer the techniques of ‘question-answering’ and ‘writing answers’ during lesson delivery to ensure that the students have grasped the lesson content well enough to restate the textbook answers in the exams.
Cooperative learning activities such as pair or group discussion about the lesson topic were identified by only a few of the teachers as significant in providing the students with opportunities for thinking, feeling and sharing their values and thoughts. Most of the teachers, however, argued that these types of learning exercises are not appropriate for classrooms in Bangladesh because of the large class size and limited class time, since the effective implementation of these activities demands a significant proportion of the lesson time. The teachers also highlighted that they do not feel confident or motivated in terms of implementing these learner-centred activities because classroom management tends to be difficult. In addition, they felt pressured to complete the syllabus and prepare the students for exams, a target to which the classroom discussion and sharing activities do not add any merit. Moreover, a number of the teachers questioned the expectation laid upon them regarding the regular preparation and implementation of lesson plans. According to them, preparing lesson plans demands from them extra time and effort which they can barely manage because of their excessive workloads. Particularly, the senior teachers expressed the view that their prior teaching experience prepares them sufficiently to achieve the successful management and conduct of a lesson. Therefore, preparing formal lesson plans for each lesson seemed unnecessary. However, some of the teachers reported that they prepare and follow lesson plans on the days when the higher officials come to visit their classrooms.

The classrooms of Social Studies, Religious Studies and co-curricular activities were observed with a view to unveiling the extent to which the lessons implemented learner-centred, cooperative teaching-learning activities. This investigation focus was based on the literature review finding that the pedagogies designed for developing the knowledge and skills that are related to moral and values dispositions are mainly characterised by their focus on involving students in deep thinking exercises and in activities that help the students act according to their beliefs, emotions, and values. The goal is to prepare the students so they can identify and evaluate the values and attitudinal orientations of self and others, and develop problem-solving and decision-making skills. Learning experiences created for students should be directed towards establishing a safe, supportive and democratic learning environment where students feel respected, valued, and cared for (Carr, 2010; DEST, 2005a; Lickona et al., 2007; Terry Lovat, 2007; Terry Lovat & Clement, 2008; Lumpkin, 2008; Shea & Murphy, 2007).

The findings from the classroom observations indicated that that the sample lessons, with a very few exceptions, were over-reliant on textbook content with the lesson delivery being teacher-directed and prescriptive, and activities driven towards rote-learning of the textbook content. In most cases the teachers read from the textbook to the whole class to introduce a topic and then drilled three or four oral questions repeatedly. This was in some cases followed by a writing activity which required the students to write answers to the questions in their notebooks.
The writing task was mainly designed to assess whether the students could reproduce the answer from the textbook that the teacher discussed earlier. As can be imagined, these types of classroom activities provided little or no opportunity for students to be involved in thinking or reflecting practices, nor in values-focused, cooperative learning experiences. There were a few lessons in which the teachers deliberately attempted to implement activities that they referred to as ‘group’ or ‘paired’ activities. However, the way these activities were conducted basically required individual students to write or read from the textbook content, and therefore did not seem to the researcher to be authentic ‘paired’ or ‘group’ activities. In summary, the teachers seemed to possess a limited understanding of what role education, in general, and the subjects of Social Studies and Religious Studies, in particular, can play in developing the students as whole human beings with a focus on fostering their moral and values dispositions. The teachers appeared to have limited knowledge and skills in relation to the pedagogical underpinnings that are essential to cater for the holistic development of the students.

It appears that there remains a gap in the pedagogies implemented in Bangladeshi schools in order to impart values and morality. Barua (2007) sheds light from a historical perspective to show that the education system in Bangladesh has been dominated by the British colonial system. This system promoted rote-learning based education with an overarching goal of producing office administration workers and tactically marginalised local, cultural and social values (Barua, 2007).

The large body of literature reported in Chapter 3 shows how values education can be regarded as a ‘student wellbeing pedagogy’ that supports the whole-person development of the students by providing them with a congenial learning environment in which to translate their thoughts and values to moral actions. For example, pedagogies based on the concepts of ‘service learning’—such as ‘Student Action Teams’—were shown to provide opportunities so that students could link their explicit and implicit learning to authentic situations where values actions were demanded, and also could reflect on their moral behaviour or the lack of it (Clement, 2010a; Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2010a; Matthews, 2010; 2010). Service learning fosters citizenship skills such as responsibility, mutual respect, tolerance, and also contributes to building a calmer school environment (CEP, 2008; Clement, 2010a; Gage, 2004; Halstead & Pike, 2006; Lickona et al., 2007). It was also suggested by the literature that classroom discussions, stories, role-plays, problem solving, observations, peer mentoring and other cooperative learning activities, that make explicit reference to values and related actions, comprise the best practice pedagogies for values education (DEEWR, 2008; DEST, 2005b; Halstead & Pike, 2006; Lickona et al., 2007; Zajda, 2009). Moreover, in discussing the effective pedagogies for values education, the literature puts special emphasis on building critical thinking and reflection skills among the learners. The pedagogies suggested for achieving this include Circle
Time, Socratic Circles, ethical dilemmas, debate, discussion, silent-sitting, active listening etc. (DEEWR, 2008; Fisher, 2003; Halstead & Pike, 2006; Hawkes, 2007; Shea & Murphy, 2007). These pedagogies help to enable students to think logically, and compare, contrast and analyse the values and thoughts of their own and others.

In terms of teacher education in Bangladesh, introducing cooperative teaching strategies and the assessment of student outcomes holistically is still in its infancy. In the future all of the teachers will attend five- to seven-day training sessions focussed on learner-centred teaching and assessment strategies. However, the depth and breadth of these training programs as well as the existing framework for the supervision and monitoring of the teaching practices in classrooms did not appear to be adequate in improving teaching practices. This finding was reported in detail in Chapter Four and further supported by the teacher interviews and classroom observation findings reported in Chapters 5 and 6. Almost all of the teachers whose classrooms were observed, and who were interviewed, had received those special, in-service training courses. However, the pedagogies implemented in their classrooms, with a few exceptions, lacked co-operative and thinking-based learning scaffolds. The situation in Bangladesh in this regard resembles that in India and other South Asian countries where teachers are traditionally seen as ‘venerable, flawless and unquestionable’ (George & Sankaranarayanan, p. 377), and lecturing stands as the dominant instructional strategy, with student-centred learning and the role of teachers as a facilitator only recently being introduced to the teacher education program (George & Sankaranarayanan, 2007).

To add to this discussion of teacher efficacy and the adequacy of the existing teacher training and supervision, it is also important to look at the minimum qualification required to be a primary school teacher or a field-level teacher educator. It was described in Chapter 3 that any female person with a 10-year qualification and without any experience or training can enter the teaching profession. The training requirement is relaxed for males if they have a three/four year Bachelor degree. Similarly, to be a field-level school administrator and teacher educator, one does not need to have any teaching experience or qualifications in education or teacher training. While the textbooks are prescriptive in nature, it is essential in these circumstances that the teachers with the aforementioned minimal qualifications are provided with adequate training and supervision, to ensure they have the necessary skills and knowledge to create meaningful learning experiences for their students.

3. Explicit/implicit provisions for the articulation of values: To what extent do the school-level daily operations, curricular provisions, co- and extra-curricular
activities, involvement of the community, and the decision making strategies support the explicit and implicit values learning of the students?

It has been discussed extensively in Chapter 3 that a whole-school approach to values education entails reinforcing values in school policies and programs, involving parents and the local community, and implementing school-wide extra-curricular and co-curricular activities so that learning experiences transcend the academic curriculum, thus taking into consideration the ‘hidden curriculum’ as well (CEP, 2008; DEST, 2005b; Hawkes, 2001; Lickona et al., 2007; LVEP, 2009; Shea & Murphy, 2007). School-wide explicit and implicit provisions such as sports, daily assembly, school gatherings, meetings, cooperative groups, as well as values posters, school rules, behavioural guidelines, parents’ meetings etc. have been identified as instrumental in increasing students’ sense of belonging and responsibility (CEP, 2008; DEST, 2006; Elisabeth & Eleanor, 2004; Hawkes, 2007).

In the present study, the teachers were asked to describe the opportunities the children are provided with, through daily school activities that explicitly refer to values. In response to this question, the teachers pointed to the mandated, 15-20 minute daily school assembly as being the most relevant everyday school activity that was focused on values acquisition. The head teachers repeatedly emphasised that through attending the daily assembly the students learned to be ordered and disciplined, and that the various steps involved in the conduct of the assembly promoted religious awareness and democratic and citizenship values among the students.

Overall, the findings suggested that the daily assembly and other school activities did not seem to deliver the expected values in a meaningful way. In general, the students did not seem to be engaged in what they were doing during the assembly—a common observation in most of the schools. The assemblies were operated in a prescriptive and authoritative manner with minimal scope for putting forward a student-directed agenda and activities. Rather than ensuring that the daily assembly provided joy and a fun experience for the children, the teachers were more concerned as to whether the order and discipline and the physical and vocal gestures were maintained adequately throughout the assembly.

The reader’s attention to some specific points about the daily school assembly needs to be drawn. Although it is a government-mandated part of the daily school operations, the way it was operated in the schools was found to deviate from the real objectives of the mandate. During the observations of the assembly sessions, the children taking part rarely showed an interest in or enthusiasm about any of the activities. The students at Case E seemed to enjoy the assembly to a certain extent. This, the researcher thought, was mainly because some of the students were assigned a number of responsibilities during the assembly in which they showed
great interest. In other schools the students and teachers seemed to act in a rather mechanistic manner during the assembly. The teachers put a lot of emphasis on ensuring that the students maintained appropriate discipline and gestures during the conduct of the routine tasks involved in the assembly. The assembly could become more meaningful, such as in Case E, if the students could have exercised some power in its design and implementation by contributing to the planning, preparation and conduct of the assembly, or if the objectives of steps involved in it were explicitly articulated by the teachers by making connections and references to the values and moral development orientation of the activities.

This 15-minute daily assembly could contribute significantly to the students’ values development if the potential of it is used by making it more interactive and participatory for the students and allowing for students’ decision making in regard to its conduct. The assembly could also be used as a time for the school to articulate school-level expectations and core values, and appreciate the achievement of students or teachers in relation to showing and respecting values. There is ample evidence in Australian and international values education literature that, if carefully planned and designed, school assemblies, as well as other school gatherings, can provide the students with an excellent platform for exercising their freedom, autonomy, and decision making problem solving skills, thus enhancing their self-confidence and self-esteem (DEEWR, 2008; DEST, 2006; G. Johnson et al., 2005). According to Halstead and Pike (2006), through daily school assemblies and classroom rituals, teachers can explicitly articulate religious values, discuss moral issues, and acknowledge the values achievement of students, thus bolstering a sense of school community.

There is a significant amount of literature that recognises the role of implicit learning of values in the overall moral and values development of the students. Implicit learning of values takes place through students observing their teachers’ personal traits and values dispositions, through the decision making and behaviour management policies prevalent in the school, the establishment of relationships between members of the school community, and through daily school and classroom rituals, that is, the overall school environment and the management of school operations (Halstead & Pike, 2006; Hawkes, 2001, 2007; Shea & Murphy, 2007).

In the present study, the teachers interviewed identified a range of co- and extra-curricular activities, other than the daily assembly, that they thought provided support for the holistic development of the students in their schools. According to these teachers, by participating in the co-curricular lessons, mandated school club (‘Cub Team’), classroom management, school cleaning, gardening, and the annual sports events, as well as by observing the special days, the students were exposed to the values necessary for them to learn and practise. It is without question that these opportunities carry significant potential in involving children in meaningful actions and reflective practices. However, the practices observed in the
schools appeared to be limiting this potential. The way these extra-curricular activities were conducted seemed to have little effect on the values development of children. For example, the ‘cub teams’ catered for a very small proportion of the student population. The operation of the ‘cub teams’ and co-curricular lessons were limited or almost absent in the schools due to a number of factors, including teacher shortage, limited school funds, the inability of the cub activities to attract children, the lack of motivation in teachers to conduct the activities etc. In addition to this, the observations of the sports’ day and one national day in respective schools seemed to the researcher to be sending an implicit message of disrespect to the students, because the students’ wellbeing and interests were seriously ignored during the observation of these days. Although the students were observed by the researcher, and reported by the teachers, to have strong interest and enthusiasm in the co- and extra-curricular activities, school and teacher support on such occasions seemed to be insufficient. Moreover, the community involvement appeared to be limited to issues related to the schools’ physical facilities and some administrative factors, with the parents’ visits to the schools restricted mainly to special school events and the result declaration day.

The teachers also shared several examples of the supportive behaviour and discipline management approaches that they preferred to apply, such as, assisting students to reflect on their behaviour and its impact on others, and encouraging students to resolve their own conflicts. Apart from these examples, they also expressed their views regarding the significance of the friendly attitude and behaviour of the adults—both the teachers and the guardians—in rectifying the students’ behavioural problems. During the interviews and focus groups, most of the teachers recognised the importance of creating positive teacher-student relationships in ensuring a safe and supportive learning environment. However, apart from those in a few exceptional schools, generally the teachers seemed to have limited inclination towards building friendly relationships with their students, both inside and outside the classrooms.

In summary, it was evident in the present study that there were no clear expectations and explicit policies or guidelines present in the schools, in relation to values development. Most importantly, the children and their values did not appear to be at the heart of teaching-learning and other school activities. Learning experiences, which were mainly limited to teacher-directed classroom learning, and student-teacher or student-student interactions taking place in and outside classrooms, did not appear to be providing the students with authentic learning opportunities to critically think about the values and responsibilities of themselves and of others. The classroom activities seemed neither challenging nor individualised and the teachers also did not hold high expectations for their students. As discussed under Research Question 2, content delivery in the values lessons mainly reiterated the ideas and examples prescribed in the textbooks. Moreover, the lessons were mostly characterised by an absence of
activities involving values conflicts and scenarios that would demand deep thinking and reflection on the part of the students.

4. **Support from the environment:** To what extent do the overall school environment, teachers’ modelling of values, as well as the interaction between and among the school community members uphold the significance of supporting student’s values and holistic development through the schooling provisions?

The school environment in most of the cases appeared to foster an implicit ‘wall’ between the children and the adults. The teachers were more aligned to the traditional role of a teacher which is authoritative and the sole provider of knowledge. It was seen to be an established norm that once a teacher entered the classroom, the whole class would go silent; the students would not leave their seats or talk to each other. They only acted according to what the teachers instructed them to do. An informal teacher-student relationship that may be developed outside of lecturing and assessing students’ learning was almost non-evident in the schools. In addition, in the rural and urban schools, most of the teachers showed a lack of willingness in modelling punctuality in terms of maintaining the school and lesson times. This was thought by the researcher to be creating a situation of ‘double-standards’, as there seemed to be a discrepancy between what the teachers explicitly taught about punctuality and what they implicitly modelled.

Moreover, as reported in Chapter 5, the more experienced and older the teachers were, the less inclined they seemed to be to meet the students’ needs. This group of teachers appeared reluctant to breach the ‘wall’ between them and their students and were also less likely to adopt advanced strategies in their teaching or to make efforts to contribute to the wellbeing of the students and their school. For instance, one of the head teachers with 30 years’ teaching experience described that it was only recently that she had learned about the impact of teachers’ friendly behaviour and openness on student wellbeing and happiness.

The large body of literature that upholds the importance of positive student-teacher relationships in realising the goals of values education and quality teaching has been discussed in the Literature Review chapter. Teachers’ deliberate efforts to understand the ability and interests of their students, and establish personal and emotional relationships with students, enable their students to feel connected, gain mutual trust and confidence, and thus achieve better academic and relational outcomes (Carr, 2007; Clement, 2010a; Curtis, 2010; Hackett & Lavery, 2010; Terry Lovat, 2005b, 2007; Terry Lovat & Clement, 2008). The three programs discussed in the Literature Review chapter are all based on the premise that relationships in
school should be scaffolded by a sense of respect and care, providing a safe and supportive school environment for students (DEST, 2005a; Lickona et al., 2007; Shea & Murphy, 2007).

A recent study (Ahmmed, Sharma, & Deppeler, 2012) conducted on 738 Bangladeshi primary school teachers identified some factors that were significantly related to the teachers’ positive attitude towards inclusive education. The factors included ‘perceived school support for inclusive teaching practices’, ‘previous success in teaching students with disabilities’ and ‘contact with a student with a disability’ (p. 132). The last two factors are relevant to the experiences of and views towards inclusive education that some of the participant teachers in this PhD study shared. The teachers who showed a more sympathetic attitude towards the children with disabilities had previous experiences of and success with accelerating the learning of these children in the classroom teaching context. These teachers highlighted their compassionate and inclusive attitude to these students as positively affecting the attitudes and behaviours of the other students.

The findings from the present study suggest that the large student/teacher ratio in Bangladeshi primary schools is limiting the potential of teachers to create quality relationships with their students. The interview and observation findings indicated that within the current educational environment, which is characterised by high work load and limited incentives available for the teachers, the teachers find it challenging to create the kind of teacher-student interactions that address students’ emotional and social needs. However, it should be recognised that the challenges created by the high student-teacher ratio, such as difficulties in classroom management or in implementing cooperative learning strategies, can largely be tackled if teachers understand the importance of meaningful student-teacher relationships and are adequately trained in ways to create and manage co-operative learning activities.

With some exceptions in two metropolitan schools, overall, the teachers seemed to have a limited view of schooling and their roles, and the transformational capacity of education to influence the students’ heart and mind. Staffroom discussions and the everyday practices of the teachers seemed to give scant attention to the learning needs and difficulties as well as the personal problems of individual students. Discourse was also absent about the self-evaluation of the teacher’s behaviour or practices or the professional development needs that could bring about changes in the learning experiences of the children. The teachers seemed to be more concerned with whether they prepared all the registers and forms requested by the authority on time. They also described how the present reality of Bangladesh seemed to dictate that the sole purpose of their role is to ‘provide data and information’.

The argument presented in the preceding paragraph can be related to the findings derived from a study (Thornton, 2006) that sought to identify the extent of teacher collaboration in secondary schools in Bangladesh. This study identified a number of barriers that worked
against creating a collaborative school culture in Bangladesh. These included ‘the difficulty of the curriculum, the perceived low ability of many students, the teachers’ own educational background and contextual factors which influence teachers’ motivation’ (Thornton, 2006, p. 181). The participants in Thornton’s study viewed the curriculum as ‘very difficult and central’, and, like the teachers in the present study, showed a preference for reinforcing the memorisation of the textbook content. In addition, the teachers criticised the higher authority for their practice of blaming teachers for low student outcomes. Moreover, analogous to the findings derived from the present study, classroom activities in secondary schools in Bangladesh were characterised by Thornton as ‘the teacher(s) delivering the syllabus which students ingest, leaving little room for genuine enquiry, questioning or criticism ... with their teaching being controlled by the highly centralised curriculum and associated text’ (p. 190). The author challenged the quality of existing teacher education based on the premise that the teachers viewed the low ability of the students as the principal reason for not being able to achieve the desired outcomes, and noted that the teachers failed to relate low student outcomes to any limitations in their teaching practices (Thornton, 2006).

Given that the primary education system is centralised and hierarchical, the policy and operational guidelines as well as the programs and the curriculum are produced by the central education authorities that mainly comprise The Ministry of Primary and Mass Education, the Directorate of Primary Education and the National Curriculum and Textbook Board. The role of the schools and the teachers within this hierarchy is limited to implementing the government programs and orders. It emerged from the teacher interviews that the teachers appreciated the authority for its focus on building and sustaining child-centred schools and learning environments. However, the teachers unequivocally criticised the lack of consideration of the authority in setting the teachers’ accountabilities and expectations from them. Recently, a study was conducted to identify the challenges faced by the school leaders in Bangladesh in implementing inclusive education (Schulz et al., 2010b). School leaders in this study identified ‘the centralized management system’ as hindering the authority of the school personnel in school-level decision making. According to the participants, the ‘centrally controlled process’ (p. 6) denies the involvement of teachers and school community members in policy development and decision making. Schools are required to approach and seek permission from the education authority in almost all aspects of school management and operation, ranging from small repairs to teacher recruitment or teacher training. Mullick et al. (2010b) commented in this regard that “school leaders’ and teachers’ opinions do not contribute to design, content or participation of any of the professional development activities.” (p. 6).

The teachers in the present study faced a dilemma as the authority, on one hand, urged them to be involved in non-academic work demanding a significant proportion of their teaching
time, while on the other hand, set strict guidelines for achieving a higher success rate in the exam-based evaluation system. The principal non-academic work that the teachers are involved in, is conducting different forms of national surveys and student population-related surveys, for which the department sets unachievable deadlines. According to the teachers, the surveys are planned and implemented by the authority when field-level quantitative data are needed on an emergency basis for report generation and policy making purposes. In almost all cases, there are no prior consultations with the teachers about the timeframe and human resources needed for the completion of the surveys. Also, the teachers receive very little funding for conducting these surveys. The other non-academic responsibilities include preparing lists of voters in the local community, administering vote casting during elections etc. Moreover, teachers from some schools reported that the office now requires teachers to submit all official documents through email despite the fact that there are no computer or Internet facilities available in the schools. As a result, every time the school needed to send any documents to the office the teachers had to take time off from their teaching to compose the documents and email them from computer shops.

The teachers commonly reported that throughout the year teachers in government primary schools are charged with conducting different types of educational surveys within their local community. It was also observed by the researcher that the teachers in some schools had to spend their teaching time collecting or collating survey data as well as other non-academic responsibilities mentioned before. This hampered the school operation since in almost all of the schools there were not sufficient teachers for one to replace another in case of emergencies. It should be noted that the ‘extra-teaching’ responsibilities of teachers in Bangladeshi primary schools as well as the ‘administrative load of maintaining a variety of registers’ were also identified by Rahman and Ali (2005, p. 9) as ‘eating into’ the teaching time. Moreover, the teachers in this study identified a shortage of teachers, the high student/teacher ratio, limited school funds, coupled with the long school hours and short mid-day break, as making the teaching job more complex and difficult in the current situation. It was also reported by the teachers that the situation becomes more difficult for them when the government shares inadequate or incomplete information prior to implementing any new system of teaching or evaluation.

The teachers in the present study identified an absence or lack of support from the authority when they want to have input about school-related matters and their workload. The situation is critical as the teachers are also expected to create inclusive and child-centred learning environments in classrooms and the school. The teachers have almost no opportunity to seek help from the authority regarding the challenges they face because of the constraints in
schools, such as the high pupil-teacher ratio, inadequate staffing, lack of support from the students’ families, and the varying levels of physical and mental abilities of the children etc.

The teachers also complained about the poor salary structure provided for primary school teachers. The teachers are currently paid at scales 13-16 on a twenty-scale national pay structure, where their salaries are 24%, 27%, 28%, or 30% of that paid to the scale-1 officials (GOB, 2009b). The teachers shared the continuing struggles they face to maintain their livelihood with this salary. They also articulated the view that the lower social and professional status of the teaching profession, along with the lack of freedom to exercise their voice in the present hierarchical education system, negatively affects their motivation to teaching and building quality learning environments. (Thornton, 2006) study conducted on secondary school teachers in Bangladesh echoes the findings presented above:

The economic position of teachers, which prompts them to take on additional employment (especially private tuition), coupled with their limited prospects for promotion has a de-motivating effect on many teachers. Seeking opportunities for raising their status, both economically and socially, detracts from their role as teachers in the classroom. (p. 192)

The need for developing specific interventions to ensure the occupational well-being of school staff should be dealt with importance (Saaranen et al., 2012). Literature suggests that factors like teacher-student relationships and pedagogies have an influence on the wellbeing of not only the students, but also the teachers. Spilt, Koomen and Thijs (2011), for instance, argue that the experiences of teachers with their students guide emotional interactions conducted by the teachers, which, in the long run, support teacher wellbeing. In another study, Dasoo (2010) reports that an improvement in their students’ learning achievement, which was the outcome of the values pedagogies, contributed to increasing the teachers’ self-esteem and wellbeing.

In terms of the leadership qualities identified among the teachers, the Case E school was an exemplar in this study. The head teacher in this school not only showed sincerity and dedication to his teaching and administrative roles, he appeared to possess a child-sensitive disposition and awareness for the holistic development of the pupils. The personal and professional values of this teacher contributed to developing a collegial environment among the school staff, who acknowledged the impact of the head teachers’ values disposition on their professional practices. In this school, the teachers demonstrated comparatively higher child-friendly attitudes and behaviours. This finding highlights the need for establishing a collegial environment in the school, scaffolded by the leadership qualities of the head teacher, when the effective implementation of a values education program is concerned. Other researchers have noted the critical importance of the values awareness of the head teacher, in ‘introducing, implementing and maintaining values education’ (Elisabeth & Eleanor, 2004, p. 255).
Finally, the overall physical environment of the school and classrooms did not seem to foster a healthy, safe and child-friendly learning environment. In most of the schools, there was no supply of drinking water available for the children. Apart from those in the rural schools, the students in general were not able to play in an open space during the recess hour because no playground space was available at their schools. Although in the rural schools swings were bought for the children, these were not placed in the playground, and therefore not accessible to the students. Moreover, it was a common scenario that the classrooms were very small compared to the large number of students. Also, the air and light flow in the classrooms were inadequate in almost of the cases. These factors seemed to severely affect the quality of the physical learning environment, contributing to decreased student motivation and attention towards classroom activities.

7.3 Summary

The preceding discussion leads the researcher to conclude that, in the Bangladeshi context, the curricular objectives and the teaching guidelines entail—to some extent—establishing a student-centred, participatory learning environment, and engaging the learners in meaningful learning experiences. An educational focus on nurturing the children from a holistic viewpoint and creating a child-centred, quality learning environment is a relatively new phenomenon in Bangladesh. While the government is increasingly urging the schools to conduct co- and extra-curricular activities and adopt child-friendly practices, most teachers included in this study seemed to have a limited understanding of values and values education. The values focus of the teachers in this research was mainly on the children conforming to authority and social norms and orders. Learning manners and growing as social human beings were identified as the most crucial aspects of values development. Utmost importance was placed on the children showing respectful behaviour to the teachers and other elders, being affectionate to younger students, being dutiful to the family, maintaining classroom discipline etc. Moreover, with a few exceptions, the teachers did not appear to recognise that the present curriculum is prescriptive and does not foster opportunities to develop the students’ thinking habits and moral reasoning ability.

It was also portrayed that the curriculum and the textbooks for Social Studies and Religious Studies cover critical thinking skills, emotional and social skills, and problem solving and decision making abilities in a very limited manner. In addition, most of the lessons observed, were over-reliant on textbook content with the lesson delivery being one-way and prescriptive, and activities driven towards rote-learning of the textbook content. Moreover, the existing teacher training programs appear to be inadequate in developing the confidence and
dispositions of teachers that are crucial to realising the goal of providing effective moral and values education.

Finally, the high student-teacher ratio and the lack of physical facilities in the schools make it difficult for the teachers to create an enjoyable learning environment. Moreover, the implicit departmental expectations regarding the test-based teaching and assessment practices pose a dilemma for the teachers; how can they find the time and the motivation to create an authentic learning environment for their students, when school-level, system-level and individual student ‘success’ is measured against the pass rate of students in year-final or ‘completion’ exams?

7.4 Limitations of the Study

There are a number of methodological limitations identified in the research design. To limit the scope of the study to a manageable project, which is a combination of document analysis and qualitative case-studies, this study included only six government primary schools. Although the schools represent metropolitan, urban and rural schools in Bangladesh, the reliability of the findings, and hence the acceptability of the arguments made, could be increased by including more schools. In addition, of the ten types of primary school systems existing in Bangladesh, only the government schools were selected on the grounds that almost 58% of the total student population are enrolled in the government schools. However, the study could have been more rigorous if data were collected from other types of schools as well. In this way, a comparative analysis of the findings derived from the different types of schools could also be conducted.

It is also important to note that this study did not include the students, parents, or the community members as participants. The reason for not including these stakeholders is that the research questions that guided this study did not demand the inclusion of these target populations. However, it is important to gather the perspectives of these groups to holistically examine the prospects of values education in the present context of Bangladeshi primary education. Moreover, a broader picture of teacher education could have been obtained if observations of the training sessions or interviews with the teacher educators were included in the study design.

7.5 Directions for Future Research

One of the principal insights gained from this study is the significance of building a values-based school leadership and school culture. One case-study school was found to be an exemplar
in this study, in terms of the leadership qualities of the head teacher and the collegial environment existing among the staff members. Future research, such as a pilot study, might explore the practices of school leadership, ongoing teacher supervision and teacher mentoring, prevailing in the primary schools in Bangladesh in the context of values and moral education. Also, a follow-up study can be conducted including the educational stakeholders and the other school types apart from the government primary schools. Moreover, there is also potential to carry out a comparative study between the primary education system in Bangladesh and other developing nations. Comparing the principles and practices with regards to values education in the secondary schools in Bangladesh can also guide the future research.

7.6 Conclusion

The purpose of this research was to investigate the system-wide underpinnings available for the values development of children in primary schools in Bangladesh; that is, the extent to which the curricular, co-curricular and extra-curricular incentives make learning meaningful, interesting and values-focused, and the extent to which the school environment nurtures children’s holistic development. The qualitative approach employed included a document analysis of the curriculum documents and teacher training materials, and a combined case-study of six government primary schools in Bangladesh.

The literature presented in Chapters 1 and 2 suggested that values education and values-focussed pedagogies have the potential to address the holistic development of children. Contemporary research on pedagogy and teacher education entails viewing student achievement and wellbeing from a broader perspective, one which includes the social, emotional and moral development of the students. It is evident from the literature that the key principles and best practices of values education provide scaffolds for this holistic view towards child development and education. The Australian and international values education literature provide an evidence-based framework for implementing effective values education programs. The building blocks of the framework include establishing a values awareness among school leaders and key educational decision makers; reinforcing values education in school policies and programs; taking a whole-school approach to values education by involving the students, teachers, parents and community members; and setting a common language for values communications. Also included are making explicit connections between values and classroom teaching and learning; adopting values-focussed pedagogies; utilising the full potential of the ‘hidden curriculum’, that is the implicit learning opportunities available for students; establishing a safe, supportive environment; and promoting a curriculum that values and moral education.
learning environment; and providing adequate support for the teachers’ wellbeing and professional development.

A document analysis of the curricula and textbooks of Social Studies and Religious Studies, and of the professional development resources available for the teachers who teach these subjects, was conducted. The document analysis preceded the field-data collection. The teachers who were interviewed and participated in the focus group discussions shared their views and practices in relation to the scaffolds for values development currently available in their primary schools. In addition to the teacher interviews and focus groups, classrooms of Social Studies, Religious Studies and co-curricular subjects were observed, in order to examine the pedagogical practices used to teach and impart values. Observations of the classrooms, and those of the school-wide operations, were also carried out to investigate the nature of the learning environment, in terms of the opportunities provided for student-student and teacher-student communications.

The teachers identified a mismatch between the educational aims and objectives set by the central authority in Education, and the reality under which the teachers operate teaching-learning and other school activities. It emerged from the interviews with the teachers, especially those who were in leadership roles, that in the present reality of available facilities at Bangladeshi primary schools, the government agenda of ensuring 100% of children are enrolled in and attending primary school seems to be compromising the quality of education. Although the recent policy imperatives put emphasis on improving the quality of the learning environment, the teachers’ perception is that the government focus is primarily on fulfilling quantitative targets, such as increasing attendance, reducing the dropout rate, ensuring 100% enrolment etc. Since the reality of teacher education, curriculum and school funding cannot be changed drastically, embarking on a journey of providing primary education to all children without making a consolidated and long-term plan has exacerbated the situation. According to the teachers, the government’s main target is to fulfil its political commitments by focusing on predetermined enrolment numbers, but the problem of how these goals will be ultimately achieved at the school level without lowering the quality of education is left for the teachers to solve. The actual aim of values education, which is to build a caring and supportive school environment for children by making a concerted effort of the whole school community, does not seem to be a focus of these initiatives.

It is without question that the quantitative enrolment and student achievement targets comprise important quality indicators for an education system. However, based on the evidence collected from the field-study, it appears that the quantitative targets are making the task of moral and values development of the children challenging for the teachers. The quantitative
targets are being given prominence over the qualitative indicators of quality education. The qualitative indicators include creating a safe and supportive learning environment; implementing student-centred and cooperative pedagogies; providing opportunities for the students to express their values, emotions and thoughts, and to implement their values in authentic learning experiences; and broadening the scope of assessment by including the assessment of social and emotional learning, etc. However, the findings from the teacher interviews and the observations indicate that, at present, the Bangladeshi primary schools are limited in their capacity to achieve these qualitative indicators, which also represent the key principles of an effective values education program. Not only are the classrooms over-crowded, but the teachers also have very heavy workloads—factors which negatively impact the teachers’ motivation and capacity to create a fun-filled learning environment, or to implement student-centred and cooperative pedagogies that promote the skills of critical thinking, problem solving and decision making. In addition to these factors, the majority of the teachers in this study seemed to be lacking the professional knowledge and skills, as well as the teaching dispositions that are essential for them to be able to view child development from a holistic perspective and to apply the relevant knowledge and skills in their classroom practices.

Moreover, in the present situation the teachers seem to have very little opportunity to contribute their own thoughts and plans in relation to school policies and educational initiatives. In addition to this, the teachers work in an environment where their wellbeing is challenged by the high teacher-student ratio, large classrooms, sub-standard salary packages, lack of professional incentives such as opportunities to move to higher positions in the educational administration, etc. The teachers in the present study, did not feel valued, respected or heard and they felt that their talents, efforts and dedication were neither recognized nor appreciated by the authority. The lack of opportunities to have input into school-related matters, coupled with their difficult working environment, has appeared to create a sense of de-motivation and apathy on the part of many of the teachers.

It was evident from the interview and focus group data that the teachers seemed critical of the top-down hierarchy and sceptical about the introduction of values education or any such programs in the future. From their experience with the current situation, the teachers held the view that in future this would potentially emerge as another ‘experiment’ by the top officials and the teachers would have to face a new form of pressure to adhere to the associated principles and guidelines set by the government. It is, therefore, crucial that the teachers and the school community be incorporated in the planning and decision making process, at least to some extent. It emerged as a recurring theme from this research that as long as the teachers’ thoughts, feelings, and suggestions are not included in the planning and implementation stages, a whole-
school approach to the values development of children will not be realised. This finding can be discussed linking it to the bottom-up approaches to values education, adopted by the Australian Federal Government Values Education initiatives (DEEWR, 2008; DEST, 2006; Terry Lovat & Toomey, 2007; Toomey, 2010), and by the other programs implemented around the world, such as LVEP and CEP (CEP, 2008; Lickona et al., 2007; LVEP, n.d.). These initiatives and programs are driven by the ‘bottom-up’ approach, which seeks to identify the good practices of values education implemented in the schools, and accommodate these practices while developing the framework for values education. Because the teachers’ opinions, views, and experiences are reflected in the operational framework, the teachers feel valued, and responsible for the program.

Furthermore, findings from the document analysis and case studies suggested that the present mandated evaluation system measures only the academic success of students’ in summative exams focussed on heavily prescribed content. This is a limited view of student achievement and contrasts with the government’s increasing efforts to achieve a quality learning environment. While, in reality, the government decisions are keeping the school and classroom activities limited to only achieving academic success, how can the co-existing goal of making learning enjoyable and meaningful for the students also be achieved? This is actually a question that the participant teachers raised numerous times. The system-wide culture of measuring the success of school education against exam scores does not seem to be congruent with the apparent goal of creating a fun-filled and enjoyable learning environment. When the wellbeing of the students and teachers have to be compromised to achieve ‘success’ in its narrowest form, how can the mandated conduct of co-curricular activities, such as observations of national days, create a quality learning environment?

It is recognised that the renewed focus on quality-related matters, such as strengthening co- and extra-curricular activities, providing free school meals, and banning all forms of punishment, are all targeted towards attracting children to school and thus increasing the attendance and retention rates. However, a question arises which is “How will the schools be able to provide quality education to the growing numbers of newly included and existing students?” The researcher also accepts the stark reality that it is not an easy task to manage such a vast education system as in Bangladesh, where there is inadequate funding in education and a serious gap in the trained workforce. Under the latest government program-PROG-III, a number of reforms in staffing conditions and teacher education are underway. The existing one-year Certificate-in-Education will be replaced with the 18-month Diploma-in-Education program which is being piloted at seven Primary Teacher Training Institutes. This new program will train teachers on the revised competency-based curriculum, to be introduced from 2014. However,
the expected outcomes of these initiatives will not be achieved unless the assessment and evaluation systems are also restructured to broaden the present summative evaluation system which is solely based on the achievement of mastery of the textbook content.

This study recommends that Bangladeshi primary education should place students at the heart of schooling and aim to create a school climate where academic performance is promoted within a supportive, values-based social context. It is only through this system-wide implementation that primary schooling in Bangladesh can be transformed, so that students will be heard, and not just seen.

A number of key insights can be gained from the research findings of this study. The insights are based upon the literature on good practices of values education.

*First*, there is a pressing need to revisit the aims and objectives set for the primary education in Bangladesh, so that the children’s holistic development and wellbeing are placed at the heart of the educational philosophies and decision making processes, and are not suppressed by ‘quality shortcuts’.

*Second*, there should be coordination among all of the educational initiatives undertaken so that a safe, supportive and child-friendly learning environment can be created.

*Third*, the students’ educational success should not be viewed merely in terms of their achievement in annual standardised tests. Rather, success should also be measured in terms of students’ social and emotional learning outcomes. It is also imperative that the curriculum, textbooks and teacher training programs are developed around holistic views of student achievement.

*Fourth*, the initiatives taken for the moral and values development of primary school students should be directed towards enabling the students to achieve intrapersonal and interpersonal skills, such as self-regulation, self-management, self-confidence, respect, responsibility, tolerance, etc., in addition to academic skills. In order to realise this goal, the curriculum and pedagogies should focus more on developing higher-order thinking skills, as well as creating significance for the personal, moral and social lives of the learners. In addition, the curricular, co-curricular and extra-curricular learning opportunities should cater for both explicit and implicit modes of learning, in relation to the development of intended values and skills.

*Fifth*, it is crucial that the teachers are introduced to the theories and research dominating the fields of educational psychology, philosophy, sociology etc. In particular, the teachers should be provided with theoretical and practical knowledge in the
philosophies underpinning values education, so that they become able to judge their
teaching dispositions and practices against a broad perspective of the children’s
development and education. It is also imperative for the teachers to be able to realise
that the overarching goal of values education is to empower the students and make them
confident, so that they learn how to strive for excellence, and face the moral challenges
as citizens of local, national and global communities.

Sixth, in the presence of the current challenges facing Bangladeshi primary teachers, it is
also crucial that the teachers are supported with a professional development scaffold
where they receive adequate training in the management of large classrooms,
implementation of student-centred and cooperative teaching strategies, conduct of co-
curricular and extra-curricular activities, as well as the assessment of social and
emotional learning outcomes. It has been reported in Chapter 3 that the recent
developments in the teacher education sector in Bangladesh include the introduction of
a number of short-term training programs. These programs are built upon the Multiple
Intelligences theory and the associated techniques for Multiple Ways of Teaching
Learning and Evaluation. However, the observed classroom practices of the teachers did
not reflect what the teachers should have learned from this training. The existing
framework for teacher education, and that for the academic monitoring and supervision
of the teachers, needs to consider this disparity between training and classroom practice.

Seventh, not only should the teachers be provided with free time, motivation and incentives
to encourage their participation in professional development training and workshops,
the teachers’ endeavour in implementing the best practices of values education should
also be recognised and promoted. It is imperative that the views and suggestions of the
teachers are sought while planning, designing or implementing a values education
program.

In conclusion, the researcher likes to reiterate a quote included in Chapter 1:

Values are core to a school; they come with the architecture and the furniture and
decorations of the building itself. They are personified in the attributes of the
teachers and in the standards of behaviour expected of the students; they are made
explicit in the rubrics and rituals, particularly in those that accompany tragedy or

This quote illustrates the omnipresence of values in every aspect of schooling, a message which
carries the essence of this thesis. The thesis is concluded with the hope that the significance of
the best practice pedagogies and a values-based school culture will be understood at all levels of
planning and implementation in the primary education sector in Bangladesh.
References


227


Gage, B. (2004). Teaching citizenship and Social responsibility. Childhood Education, 80(2), 84C, 84M.


Lovat, T., Toomey, R., Dally, K., & Clement, N. (2009b). Project to test and measure the impact of values education on student effects and school ambience. Report for the


MOPME. (2011). *Bortoman shorkarer bigoto tin bochorer shafollo shomporkito protibedon [A report on success achieved by the present government in last three years]*. Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME) Bangladesh.


Nasreen, M., & Tate, S. (2007). Social inclusion: Gender and equity in education swaps in South Asia- Bangladesh case study: The Regional Office for South Asia (ROSA) of UNICEF.


Thornberg, R. (2008b). Values education as the daily fostering of school rules (pp. 52-62).


## Appendix 1.1  Student Enrolments in Different Types of Primary Schools (1996-2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>GPS</th>
<th>EXP</th>
<th>RNGPS</th>
<th>COMM</th>
<th>* SATT</th>
<th>HSAPS</th>
<th>NGPS</th>
<th>KG</th>
<th>Ebtedyee Madrasha</th>
<th>HMAPS</th>
<th>NGO</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td></td>
<td>37710</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>19683</td>
<td>2759</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>2759</td>
<td>3963</td>
<td>1434</td>
<td>9499</td>
<td>2759</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>80818</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td></td>
<td>37710</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>19529</td>
<td>1962</td>
<td>1042</td>
<td>1292</td>
<td>3472</td>
<td>1545</td>
<td>8231</td>
<td>2850</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>77685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td></td>
<td>37710</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>19658</td>
<td>2989</td>
<td>2822</td>
<td>1582</td>
<td>3177</td>
<td>1691</td>
<td>7173</td>
<td>2948</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>79803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td></td>
<td>37709</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>19553</td>
<td>3107</td>
<td>2945</td>
<td>1230</td>
<td>2632</td>
<td>1940</td>
<td>6404</td>
<td>3253</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>78840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>37677</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>19253</td>
<td>3061</td>
<td>3884</td>
<td>1220</td>
<td>2126</td>
<td>2296</td>
<td>3710</td>
<td>3437</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>76809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td></td>
<td>37671</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>19428</td>
<td>3268</td>
<td>4095</td>
<td>1576</td>
<td>1971</td>
<td>2477</td>
<td>3843</td>
<td>3574</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>78126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td></td>
<td>37671</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>19428</td>
<td>3225</td>
<td>4823</td>
<td>1576</td>
<td>1792</td>
<td>2477</td>
<td>3443</td>
<td>3574</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>78363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td></td>
<td>37671</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>19428</td>
<td>3260</td>
<td>4823</td>
<td>1618</td>
<td>1670</td>
<td>3088</td>
<td>6581</td>
<td>8200</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>86737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td></td>
<td>37671</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>19814</td>
<td>3218</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1283</td>
<td>1699</td>
<td>3745</td>
<td>6723</td>
<td>8214</td>
<td>447</td>
<td>82868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td></td>
<td>37672</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>19682</td>
<td>3027</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1353</td>
<td>946</td>
<td>2281</td>
<td>6768*</td>
<td>8329</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>80401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td></td>
<td>37672</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>19999</td>
<td>3192</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1314</td>
<td>1140</td>
<td>2665</td>
<td>6726</td>
<td>8920</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>82020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td></td>
<td>37672</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>20107</td>
<td>3186</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1314</td>
<td>973</td>
<td>2253</td>
<td>6762</td>
<td>8920</td>
<td>229</td>
<td>81434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td></td>
<td>37672</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>20083</td>
<td>3263</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1571</td>
<td>966</td>
<td>2987</td>
<td>6744</td>
<td>9233</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>82981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
<td>37672</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>20061</td>
<td>2991</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>959</td>
<td>819</td>
<td>2744</td>
<td>6744</td>
<td>9233</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>81508</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GPS- Government Primary School, RNGPS- Registered Non-Government Primary School, NGPS- Non Government Primary School, EXP- PTI attached Experimental School, KG- Kinder Garden, HSAPS- High School Attached Primary Schools, HMAPS- High Madrasa Attached Primary School, COMM- Community School, * SATT - Satellite Schools which are closed from 2004.

Source: Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics (www.banbeis.gov.bd).
### Table A1.2.1

**Total Students and Teachers in Primary Schools, 2010**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Student</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Fem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td>37672</td>
<td>181455</td>
<td>105431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td>45002</td>
<td>199502</td>
<td>68128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82674</td>
<td>380957</td>
<td>173559</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 1.3  Objectives of Primary Education

1. To instil in the learner an absolute trust and faith in the Almighty Allah so that it works as a constant source of inspiration for all his/her thoughts and actions and helps develop spiritual, moral, social and human values.

2. To help the child develop moral qualities and qualities related to character through the cultivation of respective religious instructions.

3. To arouse in the mind of the learner a sense of love, respect, equality, fellow-feeling and cooperation to all, irrespective of nationality-religion-caste, male-female, and make him/her desirous of peaceful environment.

4. To arouse in the mind of child an eagerness for human rights, mutual understanding, cooperation, universal brotherhood, internationalism, and world peace and culture.

5. To make learner interested in manual labour, develop in him/her a sense of respect for manual labourers, and help develop an awareness of enhancing quality of life through economic activities based on productive labour.

6. To develop awareness in the learner about his/her own and others’ rights, duties and responsibilities through active participation in various activities undertaken in the family, society and the school.

7. To help learner practice tolerance to others opinion and cultivate democratic norms and rules.

8. To arouse in the learners a sense of patriotism and nationalism, a spirit of sacrifice and motivate them to take part in the nation-building activities, through inspiring them in the spirit of the war of liberation.

9. To help gain knowledge about and insight into national history, heritage and culture and arouse in them a sense of respect for these.

10. To help physical development of the learners through physical training and games and help develop the habit of healthful living.

11. To help acquire all the basic skills of Bangla language as a medium of instruction for effective use in all spheres of life.

12. To help the learner acquire the concepts & skills of mathematics, and the competences of rational thinking and problem solving.
13. To help the learners acquire basic skills of English as a foreign language and help in the use of this language.

14. To make the learners interested in lifelong education through arousing in them adequate curiosity towards learning skills and knowledge.

15. To help acquire knowledge of science and technology, develop habit of solving problem through scientific method, and develop scientific attitude with a view to improving the standard of livelihood.

16. To help gain ideas about sources of information and collection of information through various media including computer and the use, processing and preservation of such information.

17. To help the child know and understand about environment, and motivate him/her in its development and preservation by taking active part in the prevention of pollution of the environment and its conservation.

18. To help the child unfold his/her creativity, sense of beauty and aesthetics and intelligence, and help enjoy the pleasure of creativity and beauty through the study of Music, Arts and Crafts, etc.

19. To help develop the attitude of making appropriate use of community and national resources and to be careful in their conservation.

20. To help develop in the child the desired moral and social qualities like sense of justice, sense of duty, sense of discipline, good manners, mental disposition towards living together etc.

21. To gain ideas about the effect of population growth on the basic needs of people and environment, and to help develop awareness about this.

22. To help acquire necessary knowledge and skill as per the ability, aptitude and interest of the learner, so that he/she can grow up as a complete individual and a capable citizen and to develop him as eligible for the next stage of education.
Appendix 3.1  English Version of the Information Statement for the
Director General- Directorate of Primary Education, Bangladesh

Information Statement for the Director General-
Directorate of Primary Education, Bangladesh

Study Title: “An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values
Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools”
School of Education, Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia

To the Director General
Directorate of Primary Education, Bangladesh.

Dear Sir,

I am writing to you about my research project entitled, “An Investigation of Primary
Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of
Government Primary Schools”. This project is being undertaken as part of my doctoral
research program at the University of Newcastle, Australia. My supervisors are
Professor Terence Lovat and Dr Kerry Dally from the School of Education in the
Faculty of Education and Arts. The purpose of this study is to examine the extent to
which values education is occurring in the primary education system of Bangladesh.
Values are important because they provide students with principles which help them to
decide how to behave and what is the right thing to do. The importance of values
education for Bangladeshi students has been promoted by the Bangladeshi
government but how this is being implemented in schools has not yet been studied.

This research is a case-study of government primary schools in Bangladesh. Two
schools will be selected from each of the metropolitan, urban, and rural areas of
Bangladesh. The areas from which I want to select schools are: Dhaka Metropolitan,
Chittagong Metropolitan, Rajshahi Sadar, Sylhet Sadar and Bera upazila of Pabna
district.

Data will be collected from observations of Social Studies and Islamic Studies
classrooms and of daily school activities. There are also semi-structured interviews and
focus group discussions with teachers. The head teacher, and the subject teachers of
Social Studies and Islamic Studies will be requested to participate in two different sets
of interviews. The teachers, other than the head teacher, may also be requested to
participate in a focus group discussion. I plan to collect data from each school for a
period of two weeks (approximately). Please note that maximum efforts will be made by
the researcher to collect field data without causing any disturbance to the usual school
operation.
I will conduct the interview and focus group discussion during usual school hours in a secured room in the school, where there will be no interruption due to noise or the presence of a third person. There will be one interview session with one teacher lasting for about 40-60 minutes. Focus group discussion would take 1.5 to 2 hours. Interview and focus group discussion will be audio-recorded. The classroom observation sessions will be audio-recorded in order to provide support to the notes taken during observations. Audio data will not be used for any other purposes. Photographs of the school and classroom environments and those of activities and events may also be taken. This will be done without focusing on any particular person and without interrupting usual school activities. Still images will not be taken of individual children or teachers and there will be no such still images, chosen to be included in the thesis or any publication that might express the identity of any person or location.

All information collected will be confidential and will only be used for research purposes. Transcripts of audio recordings, field-notes, and all other documents will be carefully treated to replace real names with pseudonyms. No one besides this researcher and the academic advisory team will have access to the data. The doctoral thesis of this researcher and reports and publications derived from this study will not disclose the identity of the case-study schools or the participants. Upon completion of the project one summary report (written in both English and Bengali) will be sent to the Directorate of Primary Education and to each school in about one year from the completion of data collection. In addition, copies of any research publications derived from this project will also be sent.

Participation in this research is entirely voluntary. Only those people who give their informed consent will be included in the project. Whether or not the potential informants decide to participate, their decision will not disadvantage them. If they do decide to participate, the participants may withdraw from the project at any time without giving a reason and they have the option of withdrawing any data which identifies them or which they do not wish to have included.

Thank you for taking the time to consider this proposal. I am seeking your official permission to conduct the research in the selected government primary schools. If you would like further information please contact me or my supervisors, Professor Terence Lovat and Dr Kerry Dally. If you have concerns about the ethical conduct of the project, please contact the Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office on 612 4921 6333 or Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au

Attached herewith are the following documents:
1. Official permission to conduct this research from the University of Newcastle
2. Interview and focus group questions and observation schedules.

Yours faithfully,

Ms. Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin  
Faculty of Education and Arts  
University Drive,  
Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia  
Phone: 61 432 163165 (Australia)  
01711042842 (Bangladesh)  
Email: rukhsana.tajin@uon.edu.au

Professor Terence Lovat  
Faculty of Education and Arts  
University Drive,  
Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia  
Phone: 612 4921 6445  
Fax: 612 4921 7905  
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

Dr Kerry Dally  
Faculty of Education and Arts  
University Drive,  
Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia  
Phone: 612 4921 6281  
Fax: 612 4921 6939  
Email: kerry.dally@newcastle.edu.au
Appendix 3.2  English Version of the Information Statement for the Head Teacher

Information Statement for the Head Teacher

An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Document Version 01; dated 08/11/10

You are invited to participate in the research project identified above which will be conducted by Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin, a PhD student who is supervised by Professor Terence Lovat and Dr Kerry Dally from the School of Education at the University of Newcastle, Australia.

Why is the research being done?

This study seeks to examine the extent to which values education is occurring in the primary education system of Bangladesh. Values are important because they provide students with principles which help them to decide how to behave and what is the right thing to do. The importance of values education for Bangladeshi students has been promoted by the Bangladeshi government but how this is being implemented in schools has not yet been studied.

This research aims first to identify the internationally recognised standards of educational approaches for values development and their constituent factors. The
study will then explore and evaluate the primary education system of Bangladesh against the key educational components crucial in the teaching of values. Having identified the potential areas for improvement, recommendations will be made for those who are involved in teaching values in schools, designing curriculum and textbooks, and making key decisions in quality improvement of primary education.

**Who can participate in the research?**

This research is a case-study of government primary schools in Bangladesh. Two schools have been selected from each of the metropolitan, urban, and rural areas of Bangladesh. Data will be collected from observations of Social Studies and Islamic Studies classrooms and of daily school activities. There are also semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with teachers. The head teacher, and the subject teachers of Social Studies and Islamic Studies will be requested to participate in two different sets of interviews. The teachers, other than the head teacher, may also be requested to participate in a focus group discussion.

**What choice do you have?**

Participation in this research is entirely your choice. Only those people who give their informed consent will be included in the project. Whether or not you decide to participate, your decision will not disadvantage you. If you do decide to participate, you may withdraw from the project at any time without giving a reason and you have the option of withdrawing any data which identifies you or which you do not wish to have included.

**What would you be asked to do?**

If you agree to participate, you will be asked to participate in a semi-structured interview session. You will also be requested to provide documents of school policy and guidelines, school programs, curriculum materials with regards to the subjects Social Studies and Islamic Studies, and any other documents that have connection to the development of values in children.

**a) Interview**

You will be requested to provide information on your perceptions and views regarding values development in children; on the school charter, and policies and programs that address values; on the formal time-tabled lessons as well as informal lessons where values are taught to students; and on the places, situations, and activities in the schools that raise or deal with values-related issues. The interview will be conducted during usual school hours in a secured room in the school, where there will be no interruption due to noise or the presence of a third person. The student researcher will conduct the interview.

**b) Documents**

In addition to the interview data, you will be asked to provide documents relevant to this research, such as official orders, formal documents, pamphlets,
notices, school policies, etc. that are produced, consumed or supplied by the school authority.

c) Observation
The classrooms of Studies and Islamic Studies for Grade Three to Grade Five will be observed in each school. For each subject in each grade, one lesson will be observed. Observations will focus on how students: respond in values lessons; express their own feelings, ideas, and opinions, and share these with others; analyse their own values and those of others; act independently in their learning as well as for decision-making and problem-solving activities; and become involved in activities that utilise their meta-cognitive skills such as thinking and reflecting. Observations of teachers will cover: how they teach values explicitly; apply student-centred pedagogies; identify and encourage the values of students; show respect and care for every child; and model values in their own behaviours and decision-making.

In addition to the observation of these classrooms, observations will also include: the daily school assemblies; the classroom lessons of the first and second grade that are suggested by the head teacher and other key staff; formal or informal parent-teacher meetings; student-teacher and teacher-teacher interactions in any planned or unplanned situations; school playfield and corridors; activities of the school discipline-management team, if any; and any co-curricular and extra-curricular activities or special events, such as sports, club activities etc.

The classroom observation sessions will be audio-recorded in order to provide support to the notes taken during observations. Audio data will not be used for any other purposes. Photographs of the school and classroom environments and those of activities and events may also be taken. This will be done without focusing on any particular person and without interrupting usual school activities. Still images will not be taken of individual children or teachers, only of classroom decorations, posters, playground, school corridor, i.e. buildings, inanimate objects, and places. There will be no such still images, chosen to be included in the thesis or any publication that might express the identity of any person or location.

How much time will it take?
The student researcher will collect data from your school for a period of two weeks (approximately). There will be one interview session with you lasting for about 40-60 minutes. Documents will be collected at a time that is convenient for you.

What are the risks and benefits of participating?
It is anticipated that this research will not cause any risks to the participants.

The anticipated benefits of the research are that it will raise further questions and open up paths for future research about the effectiveness of curricular materials and teaching-learning practices in delivering core human values and citizenship values to
children. A copy of the research findings will be available to all participants which could contribute to the evaluation and enhancement of the effectiveness of teachers’ practices.

**How will your privacy be protected?**

All information collected will be confidential and will only be used for research purposes. The research data will include audio recordings of and notes taken during interviews and focus group discussion; field notes and audio data taken during observations; and artefacts collected from the schools. Audio data as well as still images will be transferred to the laptop of the student researcher, which is password-protected, and will be erased from the original sources. Transcripts of audio recordings, field-notes, and all other documents will be carefully treated to replace real names with pseudonyms. No one besides this researcher and the academic advisory team will have access to the data. The doctoral thesis of this researcher and reports and publications derived from this study will not disclose the identity of the case-study schools or the participants. All data records, consent forms, and participant information letters will be kept by the researcher in a secure place for 5 years after the project is completed, and then will be destroyed.

**How will the information collected be used?**

A tape recorder will be used to record interviews and focus-group discussions. The student researcher will transcribe the audio-recorded interviews and discussions and will provide a printed copy to the participants. A follow-up session, with the transcribed version of the recording, will be arranged with participants so that they can identify and clarify ambiguities in the transcript. Participants will have the right to edit or erase any information that may reveal their identity. Moreover, they will be able to review the recording and/or transcripts to edit or erase their contribution.

The information collected in this study will be analysed by Ms. Tajin and the findings will be presented in her PhD thesis. The information may also be used while writing research articles based on this study. Individual participants will not be identified or identifiable in any articles or reports arising from the project.

Upon completion of the project one summary report (written in both English and Bengali) will be sent to each school in about one year from the completion of data collection. Schools will also be sent copies of any research publications derived from this project.

**What do you need to do to participate?**

Please read this Information Statement and be sure you understand its contents before you consent to participate. If there is anything you do not understand, or you have questions, contact the researcher. If you would like to participate, please complete the
attached Consent Form and return it to the researcher. Once your consent is obtained, you will be contacted by the researcher to set a suitable time and place for the interview.

Further information

If you would like further information please contact the researcher, Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin or her supervisor, Dr Kerry Dally. The telephone numbers are given below:

Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin
Phone: +61 432 163165 (Mobile, Australia)
Email: rukhsana.tajin@uon.edu.au

Dr Kerry Dally
Phone: 612 4921 6281 (Office, Australia)
Email: Kerry.Dally@newcastle.edu.au

Thank you for considering this invitation.

Student Researcher:
Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin
Signature:

Supervisors:
Professor Terence Lovat
Signature:

Dr Kerry Dally
Signature:

Complaints about this research

This project has been approved by the University’s Human Research Ethics Committee, Approval No H-2010-1334.
Should you have concerns about your rights as a participant in this research, or you have a complaint about the manner in which the research is conducted, it may be given to the researcher, or, if an independent person is preferred, to the Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office, The Chancellery, The University of Newcastle, University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia, telephone (02) 49216333, email Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au.

If you prefer a local contact in Bangladesh, please contact the following person regarding any questions about this research:

Mr. Shayamal Kanti Ghosh
Director General, Directorate of Primary Education
Dhaka, Bangladesh.
Phone: 02-8057877
Fax: 02-8016499
Email: dgprimaryeducation@gmail.com
Information Statement for the Subject Teacher

An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Document Version 01; dated 08/11/10

You are invited to participate in the research project identified above which will be conducted by Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin, a PhD student who is supervised by Professor Terence Lovat and Dr Kerry Dally from the School of Education at the University of Newcastle, Australia.

Why is the research being done?
This study seeks to examine the extent to which values education is occurring in the primary education system of Bangladesh. Values are important because they provide students with principles which help them to decide how to behave and what is the right thing to do. The importance of values education for Bangladeshi students has been promoted by the Bangladeshi government but how this is being implemented in schools has not yet been studied.

This research aims first to identify the internationally recognised standards of educational approaches for values development and their constituent factors. The study will then explore and evaluate the primary education system of Bangladesh against the key educational components crucial in the teaching of values. Having identified the potential areas for improvement, recommendations will be made for those who are involved in teaching values in schools, designing curriculum and textbooks, and making key decisions in quality improvement of primary education.

Who can participate in the research?
This research is a case-study of government primary schools in Bangladesh. Two schools have been selected from each of the metropolitan, urban, and rural areas of
Bangladesh. Data will be collected from observations of Social Studies and Islamic Studies classrooms and of daily school activities. There are also semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with teachers. The head teacher, and the subject teachers of Social Studies and Islamic Studies will be requested to participate in two different sets of interviews. The teachers, other than the head teacher, may also be requested to participate in a focus group discussion.

**What choice do you have?**

Participation in this research is entirely your choice. Only those people who give their informed consent will be included in the project. Whether or not you decide to participate, your decision will not disadvantage you. If you do decide to participate, you may withdraw from the project at any time without giving a reason and you have the option of withdrawing any data which identifies you or which you do not wish to have included.

**What would you be asked to do?**

If you agree to participate, your classroom will be observed by this researcher. You will also be asked to provide documents relevant to your teaching this subject, and to participate in a semi-structured interview after the classroom observation.

**a) Documents**

If you teach Social Studies or Islamic Studies, you will be asked to provide documents such as lesson plans (daily/weekly/monthly/yearly), hand-outs, worksheets, student work etc.

**b) Observation**

The classrooms of Studies and Islamic Studies for Grade Three to Grade Five will be observed in each school. For each subject in each grade, one lesson will be observed. Observations will focus on how students: respond in values lessons; express their own feelings, ideas, and opinions, and share these with others; analyse their own values and those of others; act independently in their learning as well as for decision-making and problem-solving activities; and become involved in activities that utilise their meta-cognitive skills such as thinking and reflecting. Observations of teachers will cover: how they teach values explicitly; apply student-centred pedagogies; identify and encourage the values of students; show respect and care for every child; and model values in their own behaviours and decision-making.

The classroom observation sessions will be audio-recorded in order to provide support to the notes taken during observations. Audio data will not be used for any other purposes. Photographs of the classroom environments and those of activities and events may also be taken. This will be done without focusing on any particular person and without interrupting usual classroom activities. Still images will not be taken of individual children or teachers, only of classroom decorations, posters, playground, school corridor, i.e. buildings, inanimate objects, and places. There will be no such still images, chosen to be included in the thesis or any publication that might express the identity of any person or location.
Please note that parental consent for observation of classroom is not going to be sought. You will need to inform the children and parents of the project, the reasons why the researcher will be in the classroom and at the school and what the researcher will be doing, that is, observing how the children learn and play at school. Please provide enough opportunity for children and parents to ask questions and express any concerns they may have regarding the observation of classrooms and the broader school environment. Please ensure that before they consent for the researcher’s presence in the school and classrooms, the children and parents will verbally confirm their agreement.

**c) Interview**

If you teach Social Studies and/or Islamic Studies in Grades Three, Four, or Five, you will be asked to participate in a semi-structured interview after your classroom has been observed. The interview will be conducted during usual school hours in a secured room in the school, where there will be no interruption due to noise or the presence of a third person. The student researcher will conduct the interview.

**How much time will it take?**

For the interview, there will be one session lasting for about 40-60 minutes. Observation of classroom lessons (one for each subject in each grade) will be done for the whole period of that lesson. Documents will be collected at a time that is convenient for you.

**What are the risks and benefits of participating?**

It is anticipated that this research will not cause any risks to the participants.

The anticipated benefits of the research are that it will raise further questions and open up paths for future research about the effectiveness of curricular materials and teaching-learning practices in delivering core human values and citizenship values to children. A copy of the research findings will be available to all participants which could contribute to the evaluation and enhancement of the effectiveness of teachers' practices.

**How will your privacy be protected?**

All information collected will be confidential and will only be used for research purposes. The research data will include audio recordings of and notes taken during interviews and focus group discussion; field notes and audio data taken during observations; and artefacts collected from the schools. Audio data as well as still images will be transferred to the laptop of the student researcher, which is password-protected, and will be erased from the original sources. Transcripts of audio recordings, field-notes, and all other documents will be carefully treated to replace real names with pseudonyms. No one besides this researcher and the academic advisory team will
have access to the data. The doctoral thesis of this researcher and reports and publications derived from this study will not disclose the identity of the case-study schools or the participants. All data records, consent forms, and participant information letters will be kept by the researcher in a secure place for 5 years after the project is completed, and then will be destroyed.

**How will the information collected be used?**
A tape recorder will be used to record interviews and focus-group discussions. The student researcher will transcribe the audio-recorded interviews and discussions and will provide a printed copy to the participants. A follow-up session, with the transcribed version of the recording, will be arranged with participants so that they can identify and clarify ambiguities in the transcript. Participants will have the right to edit or erase any information that may reveal their identity. Moreover, they will be able to review the recording and/or transcripts to edit or erase their contribution.

The information collected in this study will be analysed by Ms. Tajin and the findings will be presented in her PhD thesis. The information may also be used while writing research articles based on this study. Individual participants will not be identified or identifiable in any articles or reports arising from the project.

Upon completion of the project one summary report (written in both English and Bengali) will be sent to each school in about one year from the completion of data collection. Schools will also be sent copies of any research publications derived from this project.

**What do you need to do to participate?**
Please read this Information Statement and be sure you understand its contents before you consent to participate. If there is anything you do not understand, or you have questions, contact the researcher. If you would like to participate, please complete the attached Consent Form and return it to the researcher. Once your consent is obtained, you will be contacted by the researcher to set a suitable time and place for the interview.

**Further information**
If you would like further information please contact the researcher, Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin or her supervisor, Dr Kerry Dally. The telephone numbers are given below:

**Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin**
Phone: +61 432 163165 (Mobile, Australia)
Email: rukhsana.tajin@uon.edu.au

**Dr Kerry Dally**
Phone: 612 4921 6281 (Office, Australia)
Thank you for considering this invitation.

**Student Researcher:**
Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin

**Supervisors:**
Professor Terence Lovat
Dr Kerry Dally

**Complaints about this research**
This project has been approved by the University’s Human Research Ethics Committee, Approval No H-2010-1334. Should you have concerns about your rights as a participant in this research, or you have a complaint about the manner in which the research is conducted, it may be given to the researcher, or, if an independent person is preferred, to the Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office, The Chancellery, The University of Newcastle, University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia, telephone (02) 49216333, email Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au.

If you prefer a local contact in Bangladesh, please contact the following person regarding any questions about this research:

Mr. Shayamal Kanti Ghosh
Director General, Directorate of Primary Education
Dhaka, Bangladesh.
Phone: 02-8057877
Fax: 02-8016499
Email: dgprimaryeducation@gmail.com
Appendix 3.4  English Version of the Information Statement for the Focus Group Participants

Information Statement for the Focus Group Participants

An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Document Version 01; dated 08/11/10

You are invited to participate in the research project identified above which will be conducted by Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin, a PhD student who is supervised by Professor Terence Lovat and Dr Kerry Dally from the School of Education at the University of Newcastle, Australia.

Why is the research being done?
This study seeks to examine the extent to which values education is occurring in the primary education system of Bangladesh. Values are important because they provide students with principles which help them to decide how to behave and what is the right thing to do. The importance of values education for Bangladeshi students has been promoted by the Bangladeshi government but how this is being implemented in schools has not yet been studied.

This research aims first to identify the internationally recognised standards of educational approaches for values development and their constituent factors. The study will then explore and evaluate the primary education system of Bangladesh against the key educational components crucial in the teaching of values. Having identified the potential areas for improvement, recommendations will be made for those who are involved in teaching values in schools, designing curriculum and textbooks, and making key decisions in quality improvement of primary education.

This research is a case-study of government primary schools in Bangladesh. Two schools have been selected from each of the metropolitan, urban, and rural areas of Bangladesh. Data will be collected from observations of Social Studies and Islamic Studies classrooms and of daily school activities. There are also semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with teachers. The head teacher, and the
subject teachers of Social Studies and Islamic Studies will be requested to participate in two different sets of interviews. The teachers, other than the head teacher, may also be requested to participate in a focus group discussion.

**Who can participate in the research?**

This research is a case-study of government primary schools in Bangladesh. Two schools have been selected from each of the metropolitan, urban, and rural areas of Bangladesh. Data will be collected from observations of Social Studies and Islamic Studies classrooms and of daily school activities. There are also semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with teachers. The head teacher, and the subject teachers of Social Studies and Islamic Studies will be requested to participate in two different sets of interviews. The teachers, other than the head teacher, may also be requested to participate in a focus group discussion.

**What choice do you have?**

Participation in this research is entirely your choice. Only those people who give their informed consent will be included in the project. Whether or not you decide to participate, your decision will not disadvantage you. If you do decide to participate, you may withdraw from the project at any time without giving a reason and you have the option of withdrawing any data which identifies you or which you do not wish to have included.

**What would you be asked to do?**

If you agree to participate, you will be asked to participate in a focus group discussion with your colleagues. The purpose of the focus group is to gather your views, opinion, experiences, and suggestions regarding the ways your school can contribute to the nurturing of values in children. In this discussion you will be asked to share what you think and feel about: the social, emotional and character, as well as, the values development of children, i.e. the nature of values deemed important for children and the role of schools in this respect; you own approaches to and experiences in dealing with this issue; and the challenges you face in your endeavour regarding student values development. Focus groups will be audio-recorded.

The time and place for the focus-group discussion will be decided upon consultation with head teacher and the participants. The student researcher will facilitate the discussion.

**How much time will it take?**

The intended focus group discussion (one) may take about 1.5 hour to 2 hours.

**What are the risks and benefits of participating?**

It is anticipated that this research will not cause any risks to the participants.

The anticipated benefits of the research are that it will raise further questions and open up paths for future research about the effectiveness of curricular materials and teaching-learning practices in delivering core human values and citizenship values to children. A copy of the research findings will be available to all participants which could contribute to the evaluation and enhancement of the effectiveness of teachers' practices.
**How will your privacy be protected?**
All information collected will be confidential and will only be used for research purposes. The research data will include audio recordings of and notes taken during interviews and focus group discussion; field notes and audio data taken during observations; and artefacts collected from the schools. Audio data as well as still images will be transferred to the laptop of the student researcher, which is password-protected, and will be erased from the original sources. Transcripts of audio recordings, field-notes, and all other documents will be carefully treated to replace real names with pseudonyms. No one besides this researcher and the academic advisory team will have access to the data. The doctoral thesis of this researcher and reports and publications derived from this study will not disclose the identity of the case-study schools or the participants. All data records, consent forms, and participant information letters will be kept by the researcher in a secure place for 5 years after the project is completed, and then will be destroyed.

**How will the information collected be used?**
A tape recorder will be used to record interviews and focus-group discussions. The student researcher will transcribe the audio-recorded interviews and discussions and will provide a printed copy to the participants. A follow-up session, with the transcribed version of the recording, will be arranged with participants so that they can identify and clarify ambiguities in the transcript. Participants will have the right to edit or erase any information that may reveal their identity. Moreover, they will be able to review the recording and/or transcripts to edit or erase their contribution.

The information collected in this study will be analysed by Ms. Tajin and the findings will be presented in her PhD thesis. The information may also be used while writing research articles based on this study. Individual participants will not be identified or identifiable in any articles or reports arising from the project.

Upon completion of the project one summary report (written in both English and Bengali) will be sent to each school in about one year from the completion of data collection. Schools will also be sent copies of any research publications derived from this project.

**What do you need to do to participate?**
Please read this Information Statement and be sure you understand its contents before you consent to participate. If there is anything you do not understand, or you have questions, contact the researcher. If you would like to participate, please complete the attached Consent Form and return it to the researcher. Once your consent is obtained, you will be contacted by the researcher to set a suitable time and place for the interview.

**Further information**
If you would like further information please contact the researcher, Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin or her supervisor, Dr Kerry Dally. The telephone numbers are given below:

**Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin**
Phone: +61 432 163165 (Mobile, Australia)
Thank you for considering this invitation.

**Student Researcher:**
Rukhsana Tarannum Tajin, PhD

**Supervisors:**
Professor Terence Lovat
Dr Kerry Dally

**Complaints about this research**
This project has been approved by the University’s Human Research Ethics Committee, Approval No H-2010-1334. Should you have concerns about your rights as a participant in this research, or you have a complaint about the manner in which the research is conducted, it may be given to the researcher, or, if an independent person is preferred, to the Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office, The Chancellery, The University of Newcastle, University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia, telephone (02) 49216333, email Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au.

If you prefer a local contact in Bangladesh, please contact the following person regarding any questions about this research:

Mr. Shayamal Kanti Ghosh
Director General, Directorate of Primary Education
Dhaka, Bangladesh.
Phone: 02-8057877
Fax: 02-8016499
Email: dgprimaryeducation@gmail.com
Appendix 3.5  English Version of the Consent Form for the Head Teacher

Consent Form – Head Teacher

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 612 4921 6445
Fax: 612 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

Consent Form for the Research Project:
An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Document Version 01; dated 08/11/10

I agree to participate in the above research project and give my consent freely.

I understand that the project will be conducted as described in the Information Statement, a copy of which I have retained.

I understand I can withdraw from the project at any time and do not have to give any reason for withdrawing.

I consent to (Place a √ or X to indicate your participation in the various research activities)

- participating in an interview and having it audio-recorded; [ ]
- providing documents related to school policy and program, curriculum, and extra-curricular activities; [ ]
- allowing the researcher to collect data from my school through observation, interviews, and focus-group discussion. [ ]
- allowing the researcher to collect audio-data during classroom observation, interviews and focus group. [ ]
- allowing the researcher to photograph buildings, visual displays, inanimate objects, and places like playground, school corridor etc. [ ]

I understand that my personal information will remain confidential to the researchers.

I have had the opportunity to have questions answered to my satisfaction.

Print Name: ____________________________________________
Signature: __________________________ Date: ________________________

Please add your Contact Details here to organise the meeting:
Phone:                                                                        E-mail:
Appendix 3.6  English Version of the Consent Form for the Subject Teacher

Consent Form – Subject Teacher

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 612 4921 6445
Fax: 612 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

Consent Form for the Research Project:
An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Document Version 01; dated 08/11/10

I agree to participate in the above research project and give my consent freely.

I understand that the project will be conducted as described in the Information Statement, a copy of which I have retained.

I understand I can withdraw from the project at any time and do not have to give any reason for withdrawing.

I consent to (Place a \( \checkmark \) or X to indicate your participation in the various research activities)
- participating in an interview and having it audio-recorded; 

- providing documents related to my teaching the subject of interest, such as lesson plans, student work, hand-outs etc.;

- allowing the researcher to collect data from my classroom through observation using hand-written notes and audio recordings.

- allowing the researcher to photograph classroom decoration, student work, visual displays in classroom, classroom activities etc.

I understand that still images will be taken during observation in such a way that would not reveal the identity of my students or myself.

I understand that my personal information will remain confidential to the researchers.

I have had the opportunity to have questions answered to my satisfaction.

Print Name: __________________________________________________________

Signature: ___________________________ Date: _____________________________

Please add your Contact Details here to organise the meeting:
Phone: _______________________________ E-mail: _________________________
Appendix 3.7  English Version of the Consent Form for the Focus Group Participants

Consent Form – Focus Group Participants

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 612 4921 6445
Fax: 612 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

Consent Form for the Research Project:
An Investigation of Primary Education in Bangladesh from a Values Education Perspective: Case Studies of Government Primary Schools

Document Version 01; dated 08/11/10

I agree to participate in the above research project and give my consent freely.

I understand that the project will be conducted as described in the Information Statement, a copy of which I have retained.

I understand I can withdraw from the project at any time and do not have to give any reason for withdrawing.

I consent to participating in a focus-group discussion with other teachers of this school and having it audio-recorded.

I understand that still images will be taken during observation in such a way that would not reveal the identity of my students or myself.

I understand that my personal information will remain confidential to the researchers.

I have had the opportunity to have questions answered to my satisfaction.

Print Name: ____________________________

Signature: ____________________________ Date: ____________________________

Please add your Contact Details here to organise the meeting:

Phone: ____________________________ E-mail: ____________________________
অধ্যাপক টেরেন্স লোভাট  
ফ্যাকাল্টি অব এডুকেশন এন্ড আর্টস  
ইউনিভার্সিটি অব নিউ সেল্টস, কালাহান ২৩০৮  
ফোন: ৬১২ ৪৯২১ ৬৪৪৫  
ফ্যাক্স: ৬১২ ৪৯২১ ৭৯০৫  
ইমেইল: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

Professor Terence Lovat  
Faculty of Education and Arts  
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308  
Australia  
Phone: 612 4921 6445  
Fax: 612 4921 7905  
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

প্রধান শিক্ষকের জন্য তথ্য বিবরণ

বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষায় ‘ভ্যালু জেন্ড এডুকেশন’ (মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা) এর অবস্থা  
পর্যালোচনা: সরকারি প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কেস স্টাডি  
বিবর্তী ক্রম: ০৬; তারিখ ০৬/১৬/১০

অস্ট্রেলিয়ার বিউক্যাস্ট্রেই বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ে শিক্ষা বিভাগে প্রিংচডি গবেষণার্ড শিক্ষার্থী বৃহদায়িনী তারালম্ব তাজীর উপরোধিত গবেষণা কর্ম জন্য চাপ প্রদানের জন্য আমাদেরকে আমাদের জানাতে গিয়ে রূপান্তরীতি মাধ্যমের উপর কেস বিভাগের উপর অপারেশন করছেন, তবে বাংলাদেশের বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর ওপর কর্ম সম্পর্কে সিদ্ধান্ত শুরু করে।

বাংলাদেশ সরকার প্রশিক্ষাবিদ্যা মূল্যবোধ ও নৈতিক শিক্ষা সরবরাহকর্তা উপর ওপর কর্ম সম্পর্কে তাদের কাজ করছে। এই কাজের চেয়ে বিদ্যালয়সমূহের কীভাবে এই শিক্ষা বিষয়ক ও পরিচালনা করছে সে বিষয়ে এখন পর্যন্ত কোন গবেষণা হয়নি।

মূল্যবোধ উল্লেখের জন্য আর্টিনিউভিতোপ্যাক্টর্কেদ সীমায় যেসব শিক্ষাপ্রশিক্ষা এবং স্ত্রীত্ব রয়েছে, এই গবেষণায় প্রথমে সাবধান কিছু স্ত্রীত্ব এবং কার্যক্রমের উপর আলোক করে তাদের নৈতিক ও কর্মপর্যায় সমর্থপন্থায় তথ্য আর্টিনিউ করা হয়। অন্তর্ভুক্ত নৈতিক ও মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষার দেওয়ার ক্ষেত্রে একটি শিক্ষাবিদ্যা প্রধান যেও বিষয়ের উপর নৈতিক থাকা প্রয়োজন তার নৈতিক বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার উদ্যোক্তার অনুমতি এবং মূল্যবোধ করা হয়।

গবেষণায় প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা শিক্ষার নৈতিক বিষয়ের নৈতিক ক্ষেত্রে নৈতিক নৈতিক ক্ষেত্রে শিক্ষক,  
শিক্ষকের প্রশিক্ষণ, পাঠদানসূচক প্রচারিত এবং বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার উদ্যোক্তাবিদ্যা নৈতিক সিদ্ধান্ত  

Appendix 3.8 Bengali Version of the Information Statement for the Head Teacher
প্রাণে নিয়োজিত ব্যক্তিবর্গের প্রতি ক্ষতির সূচিরিশ উপস্থাপন করা হবে।

গবেষণায় কারা অংশ নিতে পারেন?
এই গবেষণায় বাংলাদেশের সরকারের প্রাধান্যবিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কোন স্টার্ট পরিচালনা করা হবে। এলাকার দেরি বস্ত্রগরী, পরিবহন ও প্রাচীন গ্রন্থাগার থেকে দুটি করে স্টার্ট হয় এই প্রক্রিয়ায় বাংলাদেশ যতই হয়। গবেষণার জন্য প্রধান বিশেষ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্রের গঠন পরিচরণ করা হবে। এছাড়াও শিক্ষার্থীদের সাথে অধ্যায়কাত্মক সাহায্য করা এবং শিক্ষা-প্রক্রিয়া মেলায় এই গবেষণায় অবস্থিত। প্রধান শিক্ষক এবং পরিশেষ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) ও ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্রের বিষয়ে পাঠদানকারী শিক্ষক দুইটি সিদ্ধ সাহায্য করে অংশ নিবেন। প্রধান শিক্ষক বীভূতি জন্য শিক্ষক থেকে সান্নিধ্য নিয়ে গবেষণায় সহযোগিতা করার জন্য অনুমোদন পান।

আপলো কিছু বেঁচে নিতে পারেন?
এই গবেষণায় অংশ নেয়া সম্ভব আপনার পদ্ধদের উপর নির্ভরশীল। শুধুমাত্র তাদের ভূমিকার সম্পর্কে অবগত হয় সম্পর্কি প্রদানের জন্য। অংশগ্রহণ করার জন্য অবস্থান করা স্থানীয় অনুমোদন নেয়া। প্রাথমিকভাবে অংশগ্রহণ সম্পর্কে যখন বিভিন্ন সম্পর্কে প্রদান করার জন্য অবস্থান করা স্থানীয় অনুমোদন নেয়া। প্রাথমিকভাবে অংশগ্রহণ সম্পর্কে যখন বিভিন্ন সম্পর্কে প্রদান করার জন্য অবস্থান করা স্থানীয় অনুমোদন নেয়া। প্রাথমিকভাবে অংশগ্রহণ সম্পর্কে যখন বিভিন্ন সম্পর্কে প্রদান করার জন্য অবস্থান করা স্থানীয় অনুমোদন নেয়া।

আপনার ভূমিকা কি হবে?
অংশগ্রহণ সম্পর্কে যখন আপনার একটি অধ্যায়কাত্মক সাহায্য করার নেয়া হবে। এখানে বিদ্যালয়ের নীতিমালা, বিদ্যা নীতিমালা, কর্তব্য, পরিচালনা মিলনিত নির্দেশনা, পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্রের গঠন সম্পর্কে নিয়মিত, অথবা শিক্ষার্থীদের মূল্যবোধ গঠনের সাথে সংঘটিত একটি স্থানীয় গঠন লিখিত তথ্য বা বিবরণ দিয়ে গবেষণায় সহযোগিতা করার জন্য আপনাকে অনুমোদন জানানো হবে।

১) সাহায্য করে
বেসর বিষয়ের উপর আপনি বীভূত ও লেখন লিপ্ত বস্ত্র করবেন তা হলো: পিকনের মূল্যবোধ ও লেখনিকার গঠন ও বিকাশ, এক্ষেত্রে আপনার বিদ্যালয়ের ভূমিকা, এ সংস্থার নীতিমালা এবং কর্তব্য বা পরামর্শবাদ শিক্ষার্থীদের নীতিমালা ও মূল্যবোধ গঠনে সহায়ক হয় এমন আনুষ্ঠানিক ও অনুষ্ঠানিক শিক্ষক কর্তব্যে এবং আপনার বিদ্যালয়ের বেসর কর্তব্যও, স্থান বা পরিচিত চারিত্রিক ও লেখনিক মূল্যবোধ বিকাশের জন্য সম্পর্কে যে হিসেবে বিবেচিত হয় বা হতে পারে। বিদ্যালয়ের নির্দেশিত সময়সূচীর মধ্যে একটি নির্দেশ এবং কোনও সৃষ্টিকর্মের কথা এই জানা সাহায্য করবো এই সাহায্য করাটি নেয়া হবে। শিক্ষার্থী গবেষণক সাহায্য করে প্রহর করবেন।

২) সাহায্য করে
সাহায্য করে এবং আপনাকে এই গবেষণায় জন্য প্রযোজনার কিছু ডামু সরবরাহ করতে অনুমোদন জানানো হবে, বেসর- সরকারি আদেশ-নির্দেশনা, বিদ্যালয়ের নীতিমালা ও বিধিসংক্রান্ত নথি, পোস্টার, পাম্পার্ট, উক্তি প্রভৃতি 265
কর্তৃপক্ষ থেকে প্রাস্ব বা বিদালায় থেকে প্রদর্শিত ইত্যাদি- অর্থাৎ যেসব নথি আপনার বিদালায় থেকে প্রকাশ বা সরবরাহ করা হয় বা বিদালায় কর্তৃপক্ষ কার্য পরিচালনার জন্য যেসব নথির সাহায্য নিয়ে থাকেন।

৩) পর্যবেক্ষণ

প্রতিক বিদালায় তৃতীয় থেকে পক্ষ শ্রীপরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাধ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশিক্ষা পরিবেশের শ্রীপরিবেশ পর্যবেক্ষণ করা হবে। এক এক শ্রীপরিবেশ থেকে প্রতি পরিবেশের জন্য একটি পাঠ পর্যবেক্ষণ করা হবে।

পর্যবেক্ষণের প্রতিদিন বিষয় হবে কীভাবে শিক্ষার্থী: মূলধার্য্য বা চরিত গন্ধধার্য্য গথসমূহে অংশগ্রহণ করে বা সাড়া দেয়; তাদের নিজস্ব অনুভূতি, ভাবনা, মতামত প্রকাশ করে এবং অন্যদের সাথে তা ভাবগাঢ়ি করে; নিজের এবং অপারে বিদ্যাজর মূলধার্য্য বিশেষণ করে; নিজের জানা ও শেখার এবং শিক্ষাধৃত ও সমস্যা সমাধানের মাধ্যমে আবারিন্দ্রশীল হয় কাজ করতে পারে; এবং যেসব পৃথিবী কার্যক্রম তাদের মধ্যে উদরার জানাইল কাঠ পেল, চিন্তা ও প্রতিফলন, এসের বিকাশ ঘটায় সেথায কাজ অন্তর্নেয়।

শিক্ষকদের পর্যবেক্ষণের ক্ষেত্রে যেসব বিষয় প্রাথমিক পালনের কী উপায়ে তারা প্রবন্ধ উপর মূলধার্য্য ও চরিত গথসমূহের শিক্ষা দেন, শিক্ষার্থীকে নির্দিষ্ট শিক্ষাধৃত পন্থা ঘটান, শিক্ষার্থীদের মূলধার্য্য শনাক্ত করে তার বিকাশ সাহায্য করা, কলর শিক্ষার প্রতি শ্রদ্ধা এবং মনোযোগ প্রদর্শন করেন, এবং যীম আচরণ ও শিক্ষায় প্রচ্ছন্ন ক্ষেত্রে মূলধার্য্য ও নির্ভরভাত্ত নমুনা প্রদর্শন করেন।

উপরের শ্রীপরিবেশ সমূহের প্রথমার্থে জানান বা প্রযোজন করা হবে: প্রাথমিক বিদালায় সমাবেশ;
শিক্ষার্থী প্রথম ও দ্বিতীয় পর্যবেশের মধ্যে প্রথম পর্যবেক্ষণের জন্য প্রথমার্থ দেন- আমুনুশীলন বা অনুপালিত গতি ধর্মশিক্ষায় কিছু যোগ পরিয়ে দিয়েছে কোন পরিবেশের শিক্ষার্থী-শিক্ষার্থী বা শিক্ষক-শিক্ষার্থী তার-বিনিময় এবং পর্শর্ক সম্পর্ক; বিদালায় থেকে স্থান অন্যা; শোভাগ্রহণ সমাপক কার্যক্রম; এবং শহ-শিক্ষা বা অন্যিন্দ শিক্ষা কার্যক্রম অথবা বিশেষ কোন অনুষ্ঠান যেমন ক্রীড়া প্রতিযোগিতা, কার্য কার্যক্রম ইত্যাদি।

শ্রীপরিবেশ পর্যবেক্ষণের ক্ষেত্রে তাদের পরিপূর্ণার্থ জন্য প্রথমার্থে সত্য শরণ প্রদর্শিত নেটের সাথে শত ও পরিচ্ছন্দ ধারণ করা হবে। শত ও পরিচ্ছন্দ অন্য কোন উদ্দেশ্য ব্যক্ত করবেন। শ্রীপরিবেশ ও বিদালায় সমাবেশ পরিবেশের এবং বিশ্বাসের স্থলাঞ্চল ও কার্যক্রমের দিকে ভালো হবে। এছাড়া কোন পরিপূর্ণ ব্যক্তি প্রতি দোকান করা হবে। বিদালায় প্রযোজন ব্যভিচার কার্যক্রম বিম্ব ঘটানা হবে।

কন্ধুমুপ সময় প্রযোজন হতে পারে?
আমুনুশীলন মূল্য ধরে গবেষণার্থকী শিক্ষার্থী আপনার বিদালায় তথ্য সংগ্রহ করবেন। আপনার সাথে একটি সময় কার্য অধিবেশনের আয়োজন করা হবে যার সময়কাল ৪০-৬০ মিনিট। আপনার মূলধার্য্যকে জন্য সময় সাহায্য করা হবে।

আদর্শগণের নূতন এবং সুফল কী?
উক গবেষণায় আদর্শগণকারীর জন্য কোন নূতন সম্ভাবনা নেই বলে ধারণা করা যাচ্ছে।

গবেষণায় সুফল হিসেবে চিহ্নিত করা যায় এমন বিষয় হলো: শিষ্ট কার্যক্রমের সম্পর্কের ও নাগরিক মূলধার্যের শিক্ষা জোরদার করার জন্য শিক্ষাক্ষেত্র; পাঠ্যগুল্ম এবং সিদ্ধ-শেখারী কার্যক্রমের প্রচলিত আচ্ছা
দীর্ঘকাল নিয়ে নতুন প্রশ্ন উত্তর এবং বিষয়: গবেষণার দ্বারা উন্মুক্ত করা।

আপনার গোপনীয়তা ব্যবহারে সংরক্ষিত হবে

ds| সংশীলতা সত্ত্বেও গবেষণার হিসাবে পাব করা হবে এবং স্থূলতায় গবেষণার উদ্দেশ্যে ব্যবহৃত হবে। তথ্যের মধ্যে বা অপূর্ব ধারণা-সমন্বয়: কারণ এবং কোন ক্ষেত্র অলাভজনক অর্থনৈতিক নোট; পর্যবেক্ষণের সময় শৃঙ্খলা সিদ্ধান্ত, অডিও ও ভিডিও; এবং বিদ্যমান থেকে সংশীলতা ঢাবি, নথি, পুনর্বাণী ইত্যাদি উপকরণ।

অভিপ্রায়, ভিডিও এবং ধার গবেষণাকর্তার গায়কেরা দ্বারা সূচিত ল্যাপটপ কম্পিউটার স্থানান্তর করা হবে এবং উদ্যোক্ত থেকে মূথ কোন বা অন্য ডিভিশন সতর্কতার সাথে নিরীক্ষণ করা মুক্ত নাম হানান দ্বারা প্রতিস্থাপন করা হবে। গবেষণাকর্তা এবং বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ের পরামর্শাদি শিক্ষার্থীর জন্য করা এই তথ্যবান্ধা ব্যবহারের অধিকার নেই।

gবেষণাকর্তার প্রক্রিয়া হিসাবে (অভিজ্ঞতা) এবং এই গবেষনা থেকে প্রত্যক্ষ কোন রিপোর্ট বা প্রকাশনায় কোন ক্ষেত্র, টিউডি বিভাগ বা অন্তর্গতকরণকারী ব্যক্তির পরিচয় প্রকাশ করা হবে না। সকল, শেষপর্যন্ত, এবং অংশগ্রহণকারীর জন্য তথ্য বিশ্বাস এই গবেষণাকারী কর্তৃক একটি সূচিত হলে পাঠ বছর সংরক্ষণ করা হবে এবং এর গায়ে নষ্ট করা ফেলা হবে।

সংশীলতা তথ্য ব্যবহারে ব্যবহৃত হবে

sাধারণ কারণ এবং কোনকোনে গবেষণার তথ্যানুসারে তথ্য একটি টেস্ট রিকর্ডার ব্যবহৃত হবে। গবেষণাকারী শ্রেণীবদ্ধ সমস্ত মাধ্যম কারণ এবং কোনকোনে অলাভজনক প্রক্রিয়া তৈরি করার একটি পদ্ধতি অন্তর্গতকারী দিবন।

প্রতিদিন তথ্য কোন অনুসন্ধান করা কিনা তা চিহ্নিত করা এবং প্রতিদিন হস্তরে তথ্য অন্তর্গতকারীর সাথে একটি জলো-আপ সেশন আর্গাজন করা হবে। পরিচয় প্রকাশ করার জন্য এই কোন সিদ্ধান্ত মনস্তি তার পরিবর্তন বা কর্ত্তরের আধিকারিক অন্তর্গতকারীর নতুন।

এছাড়া, অন্তত রেকর্ডিং এবং/অথবা এর প্রতিদিন পূর্ববর্তী পরিচয় করা থেকে তাদের প্রলো কোন প্রথ-বিশেষ বিশেষ তথ্য পরিবর্তন বা কর্ত্তরের অধিকারী অংশগ্রহণকারীর নির্দেশ।

তাদেরা জাজীন গবেষণা তথ্য বিশ্বাস করে প্রাপ্ত ফলাফল তার প্রক্রিয়া হিসাবে অনুরূপ করবে।

এছাড়াও এই গবেষনায় উপর নির্ভরিত গবেষনাপত্ত এই তথ্য ব্যবহৃত হতে পারে। তবে কোন রচনা বা রিপোর্ট অংশগ্রহণকারীর পরিচয় প্রকাশিত হলে বা আবিষ্কারের সূচ্যায় রাখা হবে।

তথ্য আহরণের প্রায় এক বছর পরে গবেষণার একটি সর্বসম্মত (ইন্টার্ন্যাশনাল) প্রতি স্কুলে পাঠানো হবে।

এছাড়াও এই গবেষণা হতে উত্তীর্ণ প্রকাশনার অনুলিপি বিদ্যমানভূমি প্রেরণ করা হবে।

অংশগ্রহণ ইত্যাদি হলে আপনার কারণীয়

অংশগ্রহণ সম্পর্কে সম্মতি দেখার পূর্বে এই তথ্য বিবরণ বাদলাবাদ গুরুত্ব এবং নিষেধ কোন যে এর বিচারবিদ সম্পর্কে আপনার স্বাধ্যায হয় না। আপনি স্বাধ্যায়ভাবে অনুদান করেননি এমন কোন গবেষণা বা কোন প্রশ্ন থাকলে গবেষণাকারীর সাথে বোঝাপড়া করুন। অংশ নিতে ইত্যাদি হলে এর দিকে সম্মতিপ্রাপ্ত পূর্ব করে গবেষণাকারীর কাছে ফিরতি দিন। সম্মতি পাওয়ার পর সাংস্কৃতিক কার্যের সময় ও স্বাধিক্যের জন্য 267
Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office, The Chancellery, The University of Newcastle, University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia, telephone (02) 49216333, Email: Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au
জনাব শ্যামল কাশি ঘোষ
মহাপরিচালক, প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা অধিদপ্তর
ঢাকা, বাংলাদেশ।
ফোন: ০২-৮০৫৭৮৭৭
ফ্যাক্স: ০২-৮০১৬৪৯৯
ইমেইল ঠিকানা: dgprimaryeducation@gmail.com
Appendix 3.9 Bengali Version of the Information Statement for the Subject Teacher

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 612 4921 6445
Fax: 612 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

বিষয়বিস্তারিত শিক্ষকের জন্য তথ্য বিবরণ

বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার ‘ভ্যালুজ এডুকেশন’ (মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা) এর অবস্থা

পর্যালোচনা: সরকারি প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কেস স্টাডি

বিবরণী ক্রম: ০১; তারিখ ০৬/১৬/১০

অস্ট্রেলিয়ার নিউক্যাসল বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ের শিক্ষা বিভাগে পিএইচডি গবেষণাপত্র শিক্ষার্থী রুখোিল ভ্যালুজের উপর কেসের জন্য আনুষ্ঠানিকভাবে আমি এই শিক্ষা ব্যবস্থাপনা ও পরিচালনা করছি।

গবেষণার উদ্দেশ্য কী?

অত্র গবেষণাকর্মের উদ্দেশ্য হলো বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার ‘ভ্যালুজ এডুকেশন’ (মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা) এর প্রকৃতি ও গতিতের পর্যবেক্ষণ করা। নৈতিকতা এবং মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষাব্যবস্থার অর্থসূত্র হওয়া বাংলাদেশে, কারণ এসব বিষয় শ্রেষ্ঠ মাধ্যমে শিক্ষাবিদ্যার মধ্যে কিছু নৈতিক জন্ম নেয় যা তাদেরকে উপস্থিত ব্যবহার এবং কর্ম সম্পর্কে নির্দিষ্ট গ্রহণ সম্ভাব্য করে। বাংলাদেশ সরকার শিক্ষাব্যবস্থার মূল্যবোধ ও নৈতিক শিক্ষা সম্পর্কে উপর ওরূপের কারণে রুখোিল ভ্যালুজের উপর কেসের মাধ্যমে বিশেষ করে এই শিক্ষা ব্যবস্থাপনা ও পরিচালনা করছি সে বিষয়ে এরকম পর্যবেক্ষণ হয়নি।

মূল্যবোধ উপরের জন্য অর্থনৈতিকভাবে সীক্রেট যেহেতু শিক্ষাপ্রদান এবং স্ট্যাডি হলো, এই গবেষণার প্রথম সরকার কিছু স্ট্যাডি এবং কর্মসূচির উপর আলোকপাত করে তাদের নৈতিকতা ও কর্মসূচি সম্পর্কে তথ্য আহরণ করা হয়। তাই, নৈতিকতা ও মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা দেখায় যে একটি শিক্ষাব্যবস্থা প্রধান যেসব বিষয় পর্যালোচিত হিসাবে প্রয়োজন তার নৈতিকতা বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার উপরের কেসের অনুসরণ এবং মূল্যবোধ করা হয়। গবেষণায় প্রাগ্য ফলাফলের ভিত্তির উপরের সম্ভাব্য ক্ষেত্র নিরস্তর করে শিক্ষক,
শিক্ষাক্রম প্রশ্ননকারী, পাঠ্যপুস্তক রচয়িতা এবং বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার উন্নতিবিধানবিষয়ক সিদ্ধান্ত গ্রহণ নিয়োজিত ব্যক্তিগত প্রতি কৃতিধর সুদৃশিশ উপস্থাপন করা হবে।

গবেষণায় কারা অংশ নিতে পারবেন?
এই গবেষণায় বাংলাদেশের সরকারি প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কেন্দ্রিত পরিচালনা করা হবে। এজন্য দেশের মহানগরী, শহরী ও গ্রামীণ শিক্ষক থেকে দুইটি করে মোট দুইটি বিদ্যালয় বাচাই করা হবে। গবেষণার জন্য প্রধানত পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্র বিষয়ের পাঠাদি পর্যবেক্ষণ করা হবে। এছাড়াও শিক্ষকদের সাথে অর্থ-কাঠামোবিত্ত সাধনা করাও ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনা এই গবেষণায় অন্তর্ভুক্ত। প্রাথমিক শিক্ষক এবং পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) ও ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্র বিষয়ে

পাঠদানকারী শিক্ষকের দুইটি ভিন্ন সাঙ্গ্লায় কারা অংশ নিবেন। প্রাথমিক শিক্ষক ব্যক্তিগত অংশ শিক্ষকগণ ফোকাস-গ্রুপে অংশ নেনার জন্য আমৃত্যু হতে পারেন।

আপনি কি এক্ষে নিতে পারবেন?
এই গবেষণায় অংশ নেনা সম্পূর্ণ আপনার পর্যায়ের উপর নির্ভরশীল। শুধুমাত্র তারাই গবেষণার অন্তর্ভুক্ত হবেন যারা তাদের ভূমিকা সম্পর্কে অবগত হয়ে প্রতিষ্ঠিত প্রাচীন করেন। অংশগ্রহণ করা যাবে যদি আপনার কোন প্রশ্ন অন্তর্ভুক্তিতে যেতে পারেন। প্রাথমিকভাবে অংশগ্রহণ করার জন্য পরবর্তীতে ইংরেজি এবং হিন্দি যে কোন ভাষা দ্বারা অংশগ্রহণ করতে পারেন। এছাড়াও, গবেষণার এমন কেন্দ্র তথ্য যা দ্বারা আপনার পরিচয় প্রকাশ হবে পারে অথবা আপনি আনুষ্ঠানিক করার ইচ্ছা নেন তা প্রত্যাহার করে নিতে পারেন।

আপনার ভূমিকা কী হবে?
অংশগ্রহণ সম্পন্ন হলে এই গবেষণার আপনার শ্রেষ্ঠ পর্যবেক্ষণ করুন। উদ্দেশ্যে বিষয়ে পাঠদানের সাথে সংশ্লিষ্ট নথিপত্র সংগ্রহ করা হবে এবং পর্যবেক্ষণের পরে আপনার একটি অর্থ-কাঠামোবন্ধ সাধনা করার নেয়া হবে।

1) নথিপত্র
যদি আপনি পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং/অথবা ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্র বিষয়ে শিক্ষাদান করে তবে পাঠদানের সংরক্ষণ নথিপত্র যেমন পাঠপরিকল্পনা (দৈনিক/সাপ্তাহিক/মাসিক/বার্ষিক), পাঠ উপকরণ, শিক্ষার্থীর মধ্যে বিতরকৃত হ্যাড্ড-আউট বা অনুপ্রাণিত, শিক্ষার্থীর ভৈরব কাজ ইত্যাদি দিয়ে গবেষণায় সহযোগিতা করার জন্য আপনাকে আনুরোধ জানান।

2) পর্যবেক্ষণ
গবেষণার প্রতিকল্প বিষয়ে তৃতীয় থেকে প্রথম শ্রেণীর পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্র বিষয়ের শ্রেষ্ঠ পর্যবেক্ষণ করা হবে। এক এক শ্রেণী থেকে প্রতি বিষয়ের জন্য একটি গাঠনিক পর্যবেক্ষণ করা হবে। গবেষণায় প্রতিকল্প বিষয়ে কীভাবে শিক্ষাধ্যোয়- মূল্যবোধ বা চরিত গাঠনিক পর্যবেক্ষণ অংশগ্রহণ করা বা সাড়া দেয়; তাদের নিজস্ব অনুভূতি, ভাবনা, মতামত প্রকাশ করে এবং অন্যদের সাথে তা ভাগভাগি করে; নিজের এবং অন্যদের বিশ্বাস বা মূল্যবোধ
শ্রেণীকক্ষ পর্যায়ের পাঠকারীরা তাদের পরিসংখ্যান লেখা পাঠের মাধ্যমে পাঠানো হয়। এর মাধ্যমে সকল শিক্ষার্থীই প্রত্যেকটি পাঠ পাঠানো হয়।

কতকগুলি সময় প্রয়োজন হতে পারে?
আপনার সাথে একটি সাক্ষাৎ কর অধিভুক্ত হন হচ্ছে যার সময়োত্তর ৪০-৬০ মিনিট।

সাংগ্রহের বুঝি এবং মূলন কী?
উপ গবেষণায় সার্জনাল করার জন্য কোন বুঝির সায়কারা নেই বল থাকলে করা যাচ্ছে।

আপনার গোপনীয়তা মেনে নিন।
সতর্কভাবে সাধে নিরীক্ষা করে নব প্রকৃত নাম দ্বিমায় দ্বারা প্রতিষ্ঠান করা হবে। গবেষণাকারী এবং বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ের পরামর্শের শিক্ষকের ব্যাখ্যাত জন্য কারা এই উত্তরাধিকারী ব্যবহারের অধিকারে নেই।

গবেষণাকারীর সিইচড়ি থিসিস (অভিনন্দন) এবং এই গবেষণা থেকে প্রস্তুতক কোন রিপোর্ট বা প্রকাশনায় কোন কেন-স্টার্ড বিশ্লেষণ বা অন্য প্রশ্নকারী ব্যক্তির পরিচালক করা হবে। সকল ভক্তি, সমভিত্তি, এবং অন্যপ্রশ্নকারীর জন্য তাঁদের তথ্য বিবরণ এই গবেষণাকারী কর্তৃক একটি সূচিত হবে পাঁচ বছর সংরক্ষণ করা হবে এবং এর পর নষ্ট করে ফেলা হবে।

সংগঠিত তথ্য সংজ্ঞায় ব্যবহৃত হবে

সাধারণার কার এবং ফোকাশ-গ্রুপ আলোচনার শাখার জন্য একটি টেস্ট রক্ষণাধিকারী ব্যবহৃত হবে। গবেষণাকারী শিক্ষার্থী ধারণকৃত সাধারণার কার এবং ফোকাশ-গ্রুপ আলোচনার প্রতিলিপি তৈরি করে একটি কপি অংশগ্রহণকারীকে দিতে। প্রতিলিপিত তথ্যের কার অসচিন আঁকা কোন তা চিন্তিত করিয়ে দূর্করণের জন্য অংশগ্রহণকারীর সাথে একটি ফুন-আপ সেমিনার আয়োজন করা হবে। পরিচালনা প্রকাশ করতে পারে এমন কোন তথ্য থাকলে তা পরিবর্তন বা করণের অধিকার অংশগ্রহণকারীর রয়েছে। এছাড়াও অন্যতম রক্ষণাধিকারী এবং/অথবা এর প্রতিলিপি পূর্ববর্তী পরিশোধন করে সেখান থেকে ভাষার প্রদত্ত কোন তথ্য পরিবর্তন বা করণের অধিকারের অন্তর্ভুক্ত এরাতে অংশগ্রহণকারীর তথ্যান্তর।

জনাবা ভাষীন গবেষণাপ্রাপক তথ্য বিস্মৃতি করে প্রাপ্ত নদান নারী প্রতি ইচ্ছিত হবে করবেন। এছাড়াও এই প্রকাশনার উপর লিখিত গবেষণাপ্রাপক সেবা তথ্য ব্যবহৃত হতে পারে। তবে কোন রচনা বা রিপোর্ট এক অংশগ্রহণকারীর পরিচালনা প্রকাশিত হবে এবং আলোচনার সুমধুর রাখা হবে।

তথ্য আদর্শের প্রায় এক বছর পরে গবেষণার একটি সারঃসংক্ষেপ (ইংরেজি ও বাংলা) প্রতি ছাত্র পাঠানো হবে। এছাড়াও এই গবেষণা হতে উদ্ভূত প্রকাশনার অনুলিপি বিশ্লেষণমূলক প্রণয়ন করা হবে।

অংশগ্রহণ ইন্টুই হলে আপনার কর্মীর

অংশগ্রহণ সম্ভব হয়ে দেবার পূর্বে এই তথ্য বিবরণটি ভালভাবে পড়ুন এবং বিশ্বাস হোন যে এর বিষয়বস্তু সম্পর্কে আপনার স্বত্ন ধারণা রয়েছে। এরপর যখনকি অনুধাবন করেননি এমন কোন বিষয় বা কোন পথ থাকলে গবেষণাকারীর সাথে যোগাযোগ করুন। অংশ নিতে ইন্টুই হলে এতদসমস্ত সংযোগ প্রাপ্ত হতে পারে গবেষণাকারীর কাছে চিহ্নিত দিন। সমূহ প্রাপ্ত প্রামাণ্য সাধারণ করে দিতে হবে। আপনি নিতের মাধ্যমে এর সাথে সংযোগ প্রস্তুত প্রচার করুন এর গবেষণাকারী আপনার সাথে যোগাযোগ করেন।

আরো কিছু জানার থাকলে

উপরের তথ্য হলে আপনার আর কিছু জানার থাকলে অনুশীলন করে গবেষণাকারী রথসানা তারামূল ভাষীন আরো তথ্য যথাযথত ও কেরি ডায়িলির সাথে যোগাযোগ করুন। (টেলিফোন নম্বর ও ইমেইল নিয়ে দেখা হবে)

রথসানা তারামূল ভাষীন
(কোন: +৬১ ৪৩২ ১৬৩ ১৬৫ (মোবাইল, ইমেইল))

273
Исамеил: rukhsana.tajin@uon.edu.au

ডঃ কেরি ডালি
(ফোন: +৬১ 4921 6281 (অফিস, অস্ট্রেলিয়া))
ইমেইল: Kerry.Dally@newcastle.edu.au

আমাদের আমন্ত্রণ বিবেচনায় আনার জন্য আপনাকে অসংখ্য ধনন্দন করি।

বিষাক্ত শিক্ষার্থী:
রুখসানা তারামূল তাজীন, পিএইচডি শিক্ষার্থী, শিক্ষা বিভাগ

তথ্যাঙ্কন শিক্ষক:
Professor Terence Lovat, Pro Vice Chancellor, Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia

Signature: Dr Kerry Dally
Lecturer, School of Education, Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia

Signature:

বিষয়বস্তু
এই গবেষণাটি বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ের হিউম্যান রিসার্চ এথিক্স কমিটি তৈরির অনুমোদিত (অনুমোদন নং- H-2010-1334)। গবেষণার একজন অংশগ্রহণকারী হিসেবে আপনার অধিকার নিয়ে যদি কোন প্রশ্নে উদ্দেশ্য বা গবেষণার পরিচালনা পদ্ধতি নিয়ে আপনার যদি কোন অভিযোগ থাকে, তবে এ বিষয়টি গবেষণাকারীর নজরে আনতে পারেন। অথবা আপনি যদি গবেষণার সাথে সংযুক্ত নয় অথবা কোন ব্যতিক্রমি সাথে আলোচনা করতে ইচ্ছুক হন তাহলে এই ঠিকানায় যোগাযোগ করুন: Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office, The Chancellery, The University of Newcastle, University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia, telephone (02) 49216333, Email: Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au

এই গবেষণায় সম্পর্কিত জিজ্ঞাসার ব্যাপারে বাংলাদেশের স্নাতকীয় কোন ব্যতিক্রমি সাথে যোগাযোগে আগ্রহী হলে নিজের ঠিকানায় যোগাযোগ করতে অনুরোধ আমাদের যাচ্ছে উপরের তথ্যাঙ্কন শিক্ষকের নিজের ঠিকানায় যোগাযোগ করতে অনুরোধ আমাদের ব্যাপারে আগ্রহী হলে নিজের ঠিকানায় যোগাযোগ করতে অনুরোধ আমাদের যাচ্ছে: জনাব শ্যামচন্দ্র ঘোষ
মহাপরিচালক, প্রাধানিক শিক্ষা অধিদপ্তর
ঢাকা, বাংলাদেশ।
ফোন: ০২-৮০৫৭৮৭৭
ফ্যাক্স: ০২-৮০৫৬৪৯৯
ইমেইল ঠিকানা: dgprimaryeducation@gmail.com
ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনায় অংশগ্রহণকারীর জন্য তথ্য বিবরণ

বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষায় 'ভ্যালু জেডুকেশন' (মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা) এর অবস্থা

ফোকাস: সর্বাধিক প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কেস স্টাডি

বিবরণী কম: ০১; তারিখ: ০৮/১১/১০

অস্ট্রেলিয়ার নিউক্যাসেল বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ে শিক্ষা বিভাগে পিএইচডি গবেষণার পর শিক্ষার্থী রুখোনু তারান্নু তাজীস এর অশ্রুধার্থীর উপরের অধ্যয়ন করায় তারান্নু তাজীস বিদ্যালয়ের উপরের কেসের উপরের অধ্যায়ন করায় তারান্নু তাজীস বিদ্যালয়ের উপরের কেসের উপরের অধ্যায়ন করায় তারান্নু তাজীস বিদ্যালয়ের উপরের কেসের উপরের অধ্যায়ন করায় তারান্নু তাজীস বিদ্যালয়ের উপরের কেসের উপরের 

গবেষণার উদ্দেশ্য কী?

বাংলাদেশ সর্বাধিক প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপরের বিদ্যালয়গুলির 

মূল্যবোধ উপযোগীর জন্য অন্তর্জাতিকভাবে গৃহীত যেসব শিক্ষাপদ্ধতি এবং স্ট্যান্ডার্ড রয়েছে, এই গবেষণার প্রথমে সরবরাহ কিছু স্ট্যান্ডার্ড এবং কার্যকর উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের 

মূল্যবোধ উপযোগীর জন্য অন্তর্জাতিকভাবে গৃহীত যেসব শিক্ষাপদ্ধতি এবং স্ট্যান্ডার্ড রয়েছে, এই গবেষণার প্রথমে সরবরাহ কিছু স্ট্যান্ডার্ড এবং কার্যকর উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের উপরের 

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 612 4921 6445
Fax: 612 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au
এবং মূল্যাযন করা হবে। গবেষণায় প্রথম ফলাফলের ভিত্তিতে উল্লেখ সম্পর্কে ঘটনা শুরু নির্ধারণ করে শিক্ষক, প্রশিক্ষক প্রশাসকের কাছে রিপোর্ট দেওয়া ও বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার উন্নয়ন বিষয়ে বিষয় শিষ্য গ্রহণ নিয়োজিত ব্যক্তিগত প্রতি কর্মের সুসংগঠন করা হবে।

গবেষণায় আঘাত নিতে পারবেন?
এই গবেষণার বাংলাদেশের সমকালীন প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়গুলির উপর কেন্দ্রিত পরিচালনা করা হবে। এজন্য দেরি অথবা গ্রাহকের, শহর এবং রাজনীতি এলাকার দুইটি করে মোট দুটি বিদ্যালয় ব্যবহার করা হয়েছে। গবেষণায় জন্য প্রধান পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্র বিষয়ের পাঠদান পরিবেশ করা হবে। এছাড়াও শিক্ষার্থীদের সাথে অর্থাভাবের সংজ্ঞা করি এবং ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনা এই গবেষণায় অংশগ্রহণ। ধর্মীয় শিক্ষক এবং পরিবেশ পরিচিতি (সমাজ) এবং ইসলাম ধর্মশাস্ত্র বিষয়ে পাঠদানকারী শিক্ষকগণ দুইটি ভিত্তিতে সংজ্ঞা করে অঘাত নিতে পারবে। প্রধান শিক্ষক ব্যাপক জন্য শিক্ষকগণ ফোকাস-গ্রুপ অঘাত নিতে পারবে।

আপনি কী বেশি নিতে পারবেন?
এই গবেষণার অঘাত নিতে নেয়া সমস্ত আপনার প্রশনগুলির উপর নির্ভরশীল। শুধুমাত্র তারাই গবেষণায় অংশগ্রহণ করার মাধ্যমে সম্পর্কে অর্থবিত্ত হয়ে সম্প্রদায় প্রদান করবেন। অংশগ্রহণ করা যা না করার মাধ্যমে আপনাকে কোন অসুবিধা সম্প্রদায় করে। প্রাথমিকভাবে অংশগ্রহণ সমস্ত হলেও পরবর্তীতে ইচ্ছুক না হলে আপনি যেকোন সময় করে দেশ বা বিভাগের হয়ে তোলতে পারবেন। এছাড়াও গবেষণার প্রথম কোন ভাবা যা দ্বারা আপনার পরিচয় প্রকাশ হতে পারে অথবা যা আপনি অংশগ্রহণ করতে ইচ্ছুক নন তা প্রভাবিত করে নিতে পারবেন।

আপনার ভূমিকা কী হবে?
অংশগ্রহণ সমাজ হলে সরকারীদের সাথে একটি ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনায় আপনাকে অংশ নিতে হবে। এই আলোচনায় উপস্থাপন হলো পশ্চিমের মধ্যে উচ্চতর ও চারিক স্তরের এবং মূল্যবোধ গঠনের জন্য আপনার বিদ্যালয়ের ভূমিকা কী হতে পারে সে বিষয়ে আপনার পৃথিবীর, মানবতা, অভিজ্ঞতা এবং পরামর্শ সম্পর্কে ধারণা লাভ। যেমন বিষয়কের উপর আপনি চিঠি ও অনুদান প্রকাশ করবেন- শিক্ষার সমাজকে, আবেগার ও চারিক অবস্থায় গঠন এবং মূল্যবোধের উন্নয়নকে; এই বিষয়ে আপনি যে পদ্ধতি অবলম্বন করেন এবং আপনার প্রভাব অভিজ্ঞতা; এবং শিক্ষার্থীদের নির্দেশ ও চারিক মূল্যবোধ গঠনের ব্যাপারে আপনি যেমন প্রভাবশালীর সম্প্রদায়ের হয়ে থাকেন।

ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনার সমষ্টি ও সম্পর্ক প্রধান শিক্ষক এবং অংশগ্রহকারী শিক্ষকদের সাথে আলোচনা ভিত্তিতে নির্ধারিত হবে। গবেষণাকারী শিক্ষার্থী আলোচনার সমষ্টির ভূমিকা গ্রহণ করবেন।

কতুকু সময় প্রয়োজন হতে পারে?
উদ্দেশ্য ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনার (একটি অভিজ্ঞেয়) সময়গুলি দুই থেকে দুই ঘটা হতে পারে। 276
ংশ্যাঙ্গের কুকি এবং সুফল কী?
উক্ত গবেষণায় অংশগ্রহকারীর জন্য কোন কুকির সম্ভাবনা নতুন বলে ধারণা করা যাচ্ছে।

গবেষণার সুফল হিসেবে চিহ্নিত করা যায় এমন বিষয় হলো - শিক্ষার্থী মাঝে মৌলিক ও নাগরিক মূলনোদের প্রক্ষক জোরানোর জন্য যে শিক্ষাক্রম, পাঠ্যপুস্তক এবং শিক্ষা-শেখানো কার্যক্ষেত্র চলমান হচ্ছে।

আপনার গোপনীয় মেডিকেল সংরক্ষিত হবে
নিবন্ধিত সব তথ্য গোপনীয় হিসেবে সংরক্ষণ করা হবে এবং ধর্মীয় গবেষণার উদ্দেশ্যে ব্যবহার হবে। তথ্যের মধ্যে বা অন্তর্ভুক্ত থাকবে - সচরাচর করে এবং কোকাস গ্রুপ আলোচনায় অন্তর্ভুক্ত এবং সম্প্রসারণের সময় সচরাচর ফিন্ডলেট, অভিজ্ঞ ও ভিডিও; এবং প্রায়শ: যোগাযোগ বিশ্বকোষ সহ অন্তর্ভুক্ত হবে।

আপনার গোপনীয় মেডিকেল সংরক্ষিত হবে।
সচরাচর তথ্য গোপনীয় হিসেবে সংরক্ষণ করা হবে এবং সম্প্রসারণের মাধ্যমে একটি সম্প্রসারণ প্রক্রিয়া হচ্ছে।

সংশ্লিষ্ট তথ্য মেডিকেল সংরক্ষিত হবে
সচরাচর এবং কোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনায় সচরাচর তথ্য একটি বিশ্বকোষ প্রক্রিয়া হচ্ছে। গবেষণাকরী প্রতিযোগিতার প্রতিযোগিতার সাথে সচরাচর সম্প্রসারণ অন্তর্ভুক্ত করবে।

তথ্য আহরণের প্রথম বছর গবেষণার একটি সরাসরি সম্পর্ক (ইন্টারনেট ও বাংলার) প্রতি স্কুল পাঠানো হবে।
অংশগ্রহণে ইচ্ছুক হলে আপনার করণীয়

অংশগ্রহণে সম্ভাব্য দীর্ঘ পূর্ব এই তথ্য বিবরণটি ভালোভাবে পড়ুন এবং বিচিত্র হোল যে এর বিস্তারিত সম্ভাব্যকরণ আপনার স্বস্ত ধারণা রয়েছে। আপনি যথাযথভাবে অনুমোদন করেননি এমন কোন বিষয় যা কোন প্রশ্ন থাকলে গবেষণাকারীর সাথে যোগাযোগ করুন। অংশ নিতে ইচ্ছুক হলে এভাবে সংযুক্ত সম্ভাবনা পূর্ব করে গবেষণাকারীর কাছে চিহ্নিত হল। সম্ভাব্য পাওয়ার পর সাধারণ কারণের সময় ও স্থান নির্ধারণের জন্য গবেষণাকারী আপনার সাথে যোগাযোগ করবেন।

আমাদের কিছু জানার থাকলে

উপরের তথ্য ধরাও আপনার আর কিছু জানার থাকলে অনুপ্রাণিত করে গবেষণাকারী রূপসানা তারামূল তাজীন অথচ তার তত্ত্বামৃতকর্ম ডঃ কেরি ড্যালি-র সাথে যোগাযোগ করুন। টেলিফোন নম্বর ও ইমেইল নিয়ে দেয়া হলো:

রূপসানা তারামূল তাজীন
(ফোন: +৬১ ৪৩২ ৬৪৩ ৬৬৫ (মোবাইল, অস্ট্রেলিয়া))
ইমেইল: rukhsana.tajin@uon.edu.au

ডঃ কেরি ড্যালি
(ফোন: +৬১ ৪৯২১ ৬২৮১ (অফিস, অস্ট্রেলিয়া))
ইমেইল: Kerry.Dally@newcastle.edu.au

আমাদের আমলের বিবেচনা আনার জন্য আপনাকে অংশী ধরনগুলো।

গবেষণাকারী শিক্ষার্থী:
রূপসানা তারামূল তাজীন, পিএইচডি শিক্ষার্থী, শিক্ষা বিভাগ

তত্ত্বামৃতকর্মকারী শিক্ষক:
Professor Terence Lovat, Pro Vice Chancellor, Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia
Signature:

Dr Kerry Dally
Lecturer, School of Education, Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia
Signature:

গবেষণা বিষয়ক অভিযোগ
এই গবেষণাটি বিবিধ বিষয়ের ইউক্রেন রিসার্চ একাডেমি কমিটি কৃত্তিক অনুমোদিত (অনুমোদন নং- H-2010-1334)। গবেষণার একজন অংশগ্রহণকারী হিসেবে আপনার অধিকার নিয়ে যদি কোন প্রশ্নের উদ্দেশ্য হয় বা গবেষণার পরিচালনা পদ্ধতি নিয়ে আপনার যদি

কেন্দ্র অভিযোগ থাকলে, তবে এ বিষয়টি গবেষণাকারীর জন্যে আলাদা পাবেন। অথচ আপনি যদি গবেষণার সাথে সময় ব্যয় নেন এমন কোন বাড়ির সাথে আলোচনা করতে ইচ্ছুক হন তাহলে এই ঠিকানায় যোগাযোগ
কর্মন: Human Research Ethics Officer, Research Office, The Chancellery, The University of Newcastle, University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308, Australia, telephone (02) 49216333, Email: Human-Ethics@newcastle.edu.au

এই গবেষণা সম্পর্কিত জিজ্ঞাসার ব্যাপারে বাংলাদেশের স্থানীয় কোম বাজির সাথে যোগাযোগে আগ্রহী হলে নিজের ঠিকানায় যোগাযোগ করতে অনুরোধ জানানো যাচ্ছে:

জনার্ষ শ্যাম কবর যোব
মহাপরিচালক, প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা অষেষ্ঠক
ঢাকা, বাংলাদেশ।
ফোনঃ ০২-৮০৫৭৭৬
ফ্যাক্সঃ ০২-৮০১৬৪৯১
ইমেইল ঠিকানাঃ dgprimaryeducation@gmail.com
সম্মানিতপত্র – প্রধান শিক্ষক

গবেষণা প্রকল্পের জন্য সম্মানিতপত্র
বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার ‘ভ্যালুজ এডুকেশন’ (মূলাবোধ শিক্ষা) এর অবস্থা
অনুসন্ধান: সরকারি প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়ের উপর কেস স্টাডি
বিবর্তনী ক্রম: ০১; ভার্ষিক ০৮/১১/১০

আমি উপরের গবেষণা প্রকল্পে অংশগ্রহণের নিমিতে স্বাধীনভাবে সম্মানি প্রদান করি।
আমি অবগত আছি যে প্রত্যেক তথ্য বিবর্তনী অনুমোদন এই প্রকল্পটি পরিচালিত হবে।
আমি অবগত আছি যে কারণের জন্য বিবর্তনী অ্যাপ্লাই সময় আমি এই প্রকল্প থেকে অবাহিত নিতে পারি।
আমি নিম্নলিখিত বিষয়ে সম্মানি প্রদান করি (বিভিন্ন গবেষণা কার্যের বেঞ্চ / অথবা X চিহ্নিত করুন)
• সাক্ষাৎকারে অংশ নেন এবং তা পাঠ্যক্রম থেকে রেকর্ড করার অনুমতি দেন; ☐
• বিদ্যালয়ের নীতিমালা, কার্যক্রম, পাঠ্যক্রম এবং অতিরিক্ত শিক্ষাকার্যক্রম বিষয়ক নথি প্রদান; ☐
• অত বিদ্যালয় থেকে পর্যবেক্ষণ, সাক্ষাৎকার এবং ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনার মাধ্যমে তথ্য সংগ্রহ গবেষণাকারীকে অনুমতি প্রদান ☐

আমি অবগত আছি যে আমার ব্যক্তিগত তথ্যবোধ গবেষণাকারী কর্তৃক গোপনীয়তার সাথে রক্ষিত হবে।
আমার সকল প্রকল্পের সংক্রান্ত মীমাংসা জন্য পর্যাপ্ত সুবিধা প্রদান করা যেতে পারে।

নাম: ___________________________________________

বাক্সর: ___________________________ তারিখ: ___________________________

সাক্ষাৎকার আলোচনার সুবিধায় আপনার যোগাযোগের ঠিকানা অনুগ্রহ করে নিয়ে উপলক্ষ করুনঃ
ফোন নম্বর: ___________________________
ইমেইল: ___________________________________________
Appendix 3.12 Bengali Version of the Consent Form for the Subject Teacher

সম্মতিপত্র – বিষয় শিক্ষক

অধ্যাপক টেরেন্স লোভট
ফ্যাকাল্টি অব এডুকেশন এন্ড আর্টস
ইউনিভার্সিটিট অফ নিউ কেলস্টল, ক্যালাগান ২৩০৮
ফ্যাকাল্টি অফ নিউ কেলস্টল, অস্ট্রেলিয়া
ফোন: ৬১২ ৪৯২২ ৬৪৪৫
ফাক্স: ৬১২ ৪৯২২ ৪৯০৫
ইমেইল: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 61 2 4921 6445
Fax: 61 2 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

গবেষণা প্রকল্পের জন্য সম্মতিপত্র
বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষায় ‘ভ্য়যালুজ এডুকেশন’(মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা) এর অবস্থা
অনুসন্ধান: সরকারি প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কেন্দ্র স্টাডি
বিবরণী ক্রম: ০১; তারিখ ০৮/১১/১০

আমি উপরোক্ত গবেষণা প্রকল্প অন্তর্ভুক্ত নিমিত্তে ব্যাধিগতভাবে সম্মতি প্রদান করি।

আমি অবগত আছি যে প্রদত্ত তথ্য বিবরণী অনুযায়ী এই প্রকল্পটি পরিচালিত হবে।

আমি অবগত আছি যে কারণপর্যন্ত বাতিল একজন সময় আমি এই প্রকল্প থেকে অব্যাহতি নিতে পারি।

আমি নিম্নলিখিত বিষয়ে সম্মতি প্রদান করি (বিডিগ গবেষণা কার্যের ব্যাখ্যা এলাকা X চিহ্নিত করন)
• সাক্ষাৎকারে অংশ নেয়া এবং তা শব্দধরন যেন রেকর্ড করার অনুমতি দেয়; 
• বিষয়ের পাঠদানসমূহ কাগজপত্র, যেমন পাঠপরিকল্পনা, শিক্ষার্থীর কাজ, বিভাগগুলো
• কাগজ ইত্যাদি প্রদান;
• আমার প্রেক্ষাপট এবং পাঠদান পর্যবেক্ষণ করে লিখিত নোট এবং অ্যাডিম্যুলর মাধ্যমে
• তথ্য সংগ্রহ গবেষণাকর্মীকে অনুমতি প্রদান।

আমি অবগত আছি যে আমার ব্যাখ্যাত তথ্যের বিষয় গবেষণাকারী কর্তৃক গোপনীয়তার সাথে রক্ষিত হবে।
আমার সকল প্রদত্ত সত্যসত্যিক সীমাবদ্ধতা জন্য ধ্বংস সুবিধা প্রদান করা হয়েছে।

নাম: __________________________
স্বাক্ষর: __________________________
তারিখ: __________________________

সাক্ষাৎকার আয়োজনের সুবিধার্থে আপনার যোগাযোগের ঠিকানা অনুপ্রস্তু করে নিম্নে উল্লিখিত করন:
ফোন নম্বর: __________________________
Email: __________________________
সম্মতিপত্র – ফোকাস গ্রুপ

অধ্যাপক টেরেন্স লোভাট
ফ্যাকার্টি অব এডুকেশন এন্ড আর্টস
ইউনিভার্সিটি ড্রাইভ, কালাহান ২৩০৮
নিউ সাউথ ওরেলস, অস্ট্রেলিয়া
ফোন: ৬১২ ৪৯২১ ৬৪৪৫
ফ্যাক্স: ৬১২ ৪৯২১ ৭৯০৫
ইমেইল: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

গবেষণা প্রকল্পের জন্য সম্মতিপত্র
বাংলাদেশের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষায় ‘ড্যালুজ এডুকেশন (মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা)’এর অবস্থা
অনুসন্ধান: সরকারি প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়সমূহের উপর কেস স্টাডি
বিবরণী ক্রমঃ ০১; ভারিথ ০৮/১১/১০

আমি উপরন্তু গবেষণা প্রকল্পে অংশগ্রহণের বিমিতে স্বাধীনভাবে সম্মতি প্রদান করি।
আমি অবগত আছি যে প্রদত্ত তথ্য বিবরণী অনুসারী এই প্রকল্পটি পরিচালনা করবে।
আমি অবগত আছি যে কর্মসূচির বাণীতে লেখার সময় আমি এই প্রকল্প থেকে অব্যাহতি লিখে পারি।
আমি অন্য শিক্ষার সাথে ফোকাস-গ্রুপ আলোচনায় অংশ নেবার ব্যবস্থা সম্মতি প্রদান করি।
আমি অবগত আছি যে আমার ব্যক্তিগত তথ্যবিশিষ্ট গবেষণাকারী কর্তৃক গোপনীয়তার সাথে রক্ষিত হবে।
আমার সকল প্রমেয় সত্যীত্বক রীরামসার জন্য পর্যাপ্ত সুবিধা প্রদান করা হচ্ছে।

লাইন: ____________________________________________

বাণিজ্য: ___________________ তালিকা: ________________

সাক্ষাৎকার আয়োজনের সুবিধায় আপনার যোগাযোগের ঠিকানা অনুমোদন করে নিয়ে উল্লেখ করুন:

Professor Terence Lovat
Faculty of Education and Arts
University Drive, Callaghan NSW 2308
Australia
Phone: 612 4921 6445
Fax: 612 4921 7905
Email: Terry.Lovat@newcastle.edu.au

282
Appendix 3.14 English Version of the Interview Questionnaire for the Head Teacher

Semi-structured Interview with the Head Teacher

Thank you very much for your consent to the interview. During the interview, you will be asked to talk about your views on the values development of children, and the provisions made in this school for the children to learn and practice values. The interview should not last more than an hour. With your permission, I will tape-record the interview so that the authenticity of your views and opinions can be maintained. After the recording has been transcribed a summary of the interview will be given to you for checking and you may revise the information or ask to have any sections removed.

Before we start let me tell you one more thing. The value of the research and the credibility of its findings depend on your honest and authentic views. So, please be frank in your answers and express your views fully and completely.

Please feel free to ask me if you need a break.

Questions:

Perception on the Values Development of Children
1. What are the moral, social and human values that schools can help children learn?
2. How can a school contribute to the development of the above values?

Inclusion of values in school policies and programs
3. Does your school have a vision or mission statement or any documents, either developed locally or supplied by the higher administration, which relate to the values development of students? If yes, please explain briefly how these documents do so.
4. Is there any school policy and/or program that is designed to develop the character, moral and social qualities of the students? If yes, please explain briefly how it specifies the development of such qualities in children.
5. In what ways does your school aim to develop the awareness of and commitment to the duties and responsibilities towards the society and nation?
6. Please explain briefly any day-to-day school rules and/or activities that directly or indirectly address the development of values in students.

Discipline and Behaviour Management Strategies
7. What strategies does your school follow to maintain school and classroom discipline?
8. How does your school resolve problems related to student behaviour and lack of discipline?

Inclusion of Values in the Curriculum
9. How do the curricula for Grade One and Grade Two address the personal, moral, and social development of students?
10. Are there any timetabled classroom lessons for grades one and two in which values are taught? If yes, please indicate what the lessons are and the weekly schedule for these lessons.
11. How do the curricula for grades three, four, and five address the personal, moral, and social development of students?
12. Are there any timetabled classroom lessons for grades three, four, and five in which values are taught? If yes, please indicate what the lessons are and the weekly schedule for these lessons.

Values and Skills Development of Students through Co-curricular or Extra-curricular Activities
13. Apart from the academic subject content, are there other activities in your school which may help the students develop their moral and social values and qualities? Please explain briefly the way these activities develop desired values and qualities, and when and where these activities take place.
14. Please list and describe any school-based or social activities, arranged by your school, that require active student participation, and promote awareness of the students’ own rights and the rights of others, the duties and responsibilities towards family, school, and society.
15. Please explain briefly the in-school or extra-curricular activities, if any, that develop student decision-making and problem-solving skills.

Involvement of the school community
16. Please indicate any meetings or discussions or any other kinds of communication, that includes the parents and/or the community members.

17. In what ways do any of these meetings or discussions address the issues of values development of students?
প্রধান শিক্ষকের সাথে সাক্ষাৎকারের প্রশ্নাবলী

শিষ্টদের মূল্যবোধ গঠনের বিষয়ে আপনার দৃষ্টিভঙ্গি

১. শিখ্যা নৈতিক, সামাজিক এবং মানবিক কী কী মূল্যবোধ বিদ্যালয়ে নেতৃত্ব পাতে গেলে?

২. উপরোক্ত মূল্যবোধ গঠনে কীভাবে একটি বিদ্যালয়ে ভূমিকা রাখতে পারে?

বিদ্যালয়ের নীতিমালা এবং কার্যক্রমে মূল্যবোধ বিষয়টির অন্তর্ভুক্তি

৩. আপনার বিদ্যালয়ে কি শিক্ষাদানের মূলমন্ত্র ও সার্বিক লক্ষ্য বিষয়ক এমন কোন নীতিমালা আছে যা আপনার বিদ্যালয় কর্তৃক রচিত হয়েছে বা উর্ধ্বতন কর্তৃপক্ষ সরবরাহ করেছে, এবং যা শিক্ষাদের মূল্যবোধ গঠনের সাথে সম্পর্কিত?

৪. শিক্ষাদের চারিত্রিক, নৈতিক এবং সামাজিক উপাদান গঠন ও বিকাশের জন্য আপনার বিদ্যালয়ে কোন নীতিমালা, কার্যক্রম ও কর্মশীলতা রয়েছে কি? যদি থাকে, তবে কীভাবে এই নীতিমালার মূল্যবোধ গঠনের বিষয়ে তার দেখা অনুগ্রহ করে জন্য করা করুন।

৫. কী কী উপায়ে আপনার বিদ্যালয়ে শিখ্যা সমাজ ও জাতির প্রতি দায়িত্ব ও কর্তব্য সম্পর্কে সচেতনতা লাভ করে ও দায়বদ্ধতা শিখতে পারে?

৬. বিদ্যালয়ের দৈনিক পরিচালনা পদ্ধতি ও কার্যক্রম প্রতিক্রিয়া বা পরোক্ষভাবে কীভাবে শিখ্যদের মূল্যবোধ গঠনের বিষয়টিতে ওরুপাস্টরোপ করে, অনুগ্রহ করে বর্ষনা করুন।

নিমিত্তমৃদুল ও সদাচরণ নিষ্ঠিতকরণে গৃহীত পদ্ধাবনাকম্ব

৭. বিদ্যালয় এবং শ্রেণীকক্ষে নিমিত্তমৃদুল বিষ্ঠিতকরণে আপনার বিদ্যালয়ে কী পদ্ধ অবলম্বন করে?

৮. শিক্ষার্থীদের ব্যবহারজনিত সমস্যা এবং সংঘাতের অভাবজনিত সমস্যা আপনারা কীভাবে সমাধান করেন?

শিখা বিশ্বাস মূল্যবোধ বিষয়টির অন্তর্ভুক্তি

৯. প্রথম এবং দ্বিতীয় শ্রেণীর শিখার্থীদের ব্যক্তিক, নৈতিক এবং সামাজিক বিকাশের বিষয়টি কীভাবে অন্তর্ভুক্ত আছে?
১০। প্রথম এবং দ্বিতীয় শ্রেণীতে রুটিনের এমন কোন নির্দিষ্ট পাঠ কি আছে যেখানে মূল্যবেশের বিষয়গুলো শিক্ষা দেয়া হয়? থাকলে কোন পাঠ এবং সেটা সমায়ের কোন সময়ে দেয়া হয়?

১১। ৩য়, ৪র্থ ও ৫ম শ্রেণীর শিক্ষকের শিক্ষার ব্যক্তিকে, নৈতিক এবং সামাজিক বিকাশের বিষয়টি কীভাবে অন্তর্ভুক্ত আছে?

১২। ৩য়, ৪র্থ ও ৫ম শ্রেণীতে রুটিনের এমন কোন নির্দিষ্ট পাঠ কি আছে যেখানে মূল্যবেশের বিষয়গুলো শিক্ষা দেয়া হয়? থাকলে কোন পাঠ এবং সেটা সমায়ের কোন সময়ে দেয়া হয়?

সহ-শিক্ষা এবং অতিরিক্ত শিক্ষা কার্যক্রমের মাধ্যমে শিক্ষার্থীর মূল্যবেশ এবং দক্ষতা গঠন

১৩। শিক্ষার্থী অন্তর্ভুক্ত বিষয়ের বাইরে বিদ্যালয় এমন কোন কার্যক্রম কী আছে বা শিক্ষার্থীর নৈতিক এবং সামাজিক মূল্যবেশ ও ওপারেন্স বিকাশে ভূমিকা রাখে? থাকলে এসব কার্যক্রম কি উপায়ে শিক্ষার্থীর মধ্যে কার্যকর মূল্যবেশ ও ওপারেন্স গঠন করে এবং কখন ও কোথায় এসব কার্যক্রম সংঘটিত হয়, সংঘটন করতে করবে?

১৪। আলাদা বিদ্যালয় থেকে বিদ্যালয়ভিত্তিক বা সামাজিক এমন কোন কার্যক্রম আয়োজন করা হয় কি যাতে শিক্ষার্থীর সক্রিয় অংশগ্রহণ প্রয়োজন হয় এবং তারা নিজেদের এবং অন্যান্য অধিকার, পরিবার, বিদ্যালয় ও দেশের প্রতি দারিদ্র ও কর্মসূচী সম্পর্কে সচেতনতা লাভের সুযোগ পায়?

১৫। বিদ্যালয়ের অভ্যন্তরে বা অতিরিক্ত শিক্ষা কার্যক্রম হিসাবে এমন কোন উদ্যোগ নেয়া হয় কি যেখানে শিক্ষার্থীরা সম্মানীত এবং সমাধান সমাধানের দক্ষতা লাভের সুযোগ পায়?

স্থানীয় এলাকাবাসীর অংশগ্রহণ

১৬। শিক্ষার্থীদের অভিভাবক বা স্থানীয় এলাকাবাসীকে নিয়ে কোন সভা, আলোচনা বা অন্য যেকোন ধরনের বোঝাপড়া করা হয় থাকলে তার উল্লেখ করতে?

১৭। এসব সভা বা আলোচনায় শিক্ষার্থীদের মূল্যবেশ গঠনের বিষয়টি কি আছে? আসলে তাকে কীভাবে?
Appendix 3.16 English Version of the Interview Questionnaire for the Subject Teacher

Semi-structured Interview with the Subject Teacher

Thank you very much for your consent to the interview. During the interview, you will mainly talk about your views of the contribution this subject lends to the development of values in children, and your philosophy and practices related to the teaching of this subject. The interview should not last more than an hour. With your permission, I will tape-record the interview so that the authenticity of your views and opinions can be maintained. After the recording has been transcribed a summary of the interview will be given to you for checking and you may revise the information or ask to have any sections removed.

Before we start let me tell you one more thing. The value of the research and the credibility of its findings depend on your honest and authentic views. So, please be frank in your answers and express your views fully and completely.

Please feel free to ask me if you need a break.

Questions:

1. Which of the subjects Social Studies and Islamic Studies do you teach and in which grade do you teach this subject?
2. In teaching this subject, what student outcomes do you consider important?
3. How do you include these expected outcomes in your planning, design, and delivery of lessons?
4. What materials do you use as your guide for teaching this subject? (assumption is that teachers usually do not make use of the curriculum and teacher’s guide)
5. How effectively do you think the curriculum and the textbooks reinforce the values development of children?
6. What opportunities do these materials provide for students to think about and reflect on their own values and the values of others?
7. What teaching and learning practices do you follow to teach the content that is explicitly related to values?
8. To what extent do you think these practices provide opportunities for children to express their own feelings, emotions, and values, and develop respect for those of others?
9. What opportunities do you think these pedagogies provide to develop students skills in problem-solving and decision-making?
10. How do you think your actions as a teacher might implicitly affect the values learning of children?
11. How does the studying of this subject provide students with opportunities to practice their values?
12. In what ways does your teaching include the real-life experiences of students and provide opportunities for their real-life learning?
বিষয় শিক্ষকের সাথে সাক্ষাৎকারের প্রশ্নাবলী

১। পরিবেশ পরিচিতি সমাজ বা ধর্মশিক্ষার মধ্যে কোন বিষয়ে এবং কোন কোন প্রেক্ষাপটে আপনি পাঠদান করেন?

২। এই বিষয়ে পাঠদানের ক্ষেত্রে শিক্ষার্থীদের কী ধরনের শিখনফল অর্জনের উপর আপনি গুরুত্বপ্রদ করেন?

৩। পাঠ পরিকল্পনা তৈরি এবং পাঠদানের সময় প্রভাবিত এই শিখনফলগুলো কীভাবে আপনি বিবেচনায় আনেন বা অপ্রতুল করেন?

৪। এই বিষয়ে পাঠদানের ক্ষেত্রে আপনি কোন কোন পৃষ্ঠকা বা নির্দেশিকার সাহায্য নেন?

৫। এই বিষয়ের শিখন এবং পাঠ্যপুস্তক শিক্ষার্থীদের মূল্যবোধ গঠনে কতটুকু ভূমিকা রাখে সমস্ত বলে আপনি মনে করেন?

৬। এই বিষয়ের শিখন এবং নির্দেশিকা বা পাঠ্যপুস্তক, নিজেদের ও অন্যদের মূল্যবোধ নিয়ে চিন্তা এবং প্রতিফলনের ক্ষেত্রে সুযোগ শিক্ষার্থীদের দিকে বলে আপনি মনে করেন?

৭। মূল্যবোধ গঠনের উপর যেসব বিষয়বস্তু সরাসরি পাঠ্যবইয়ের অন্তর্ভুক্ত রয়েছে, সেগুলো শিক্ষাদাতার ক্ষেত্রে আপনি কী ধরনের শিখন-শেখারো পদ্ধতি অনুসরণ করেন?

৮। এখানের শিখন-শেখারো পদ্ধতির মাধ্যমে শিক্ষার্থীরা নির্দেশ অনুসারি, আরেক ও মূল্যবোধ প্রক্রিয়ার এবং অন্যদের অনুসারি, আরেক ও মূল্যবোধকে প্রভাব করতে শেখার কতটুকু সুযোগ পায় বলে আপনি মনে করেন?

৯। শিক্ষার্থীদের মধ্যে সমস্ত সমাধান এবং শিক্ষার প্রচেষ্টায় সাধারণ গঠনে আপনার অনুভূত শিক্ষাগত্বার কীভাবে সাহায্য করে বলে মনে করেন?

১০। একজন শিক্ষক হিসাবে আপনার আচরণ এবং কাজ কীভাবে শিখার মূল্যবোধ শিখনের বিষয়টিকে প্রভাবিত করতে পারে বলে মনে করেন?

১১। এই বিষয়ে পাঠ্য মাধ্যমে শিক্ষার্থীরা নিজের মূল্যবোধ প্রয়োগ করার কী ধরনের সুযোগ পায়?

১২। এই বিষয়ে শিক্ষাদাতার ক্ষেত্রে আপনি শিক্ষার্থীদের বায়ব জীবনের অভিজ্ঞতাকে কীভাবে সংযুক্ত করেন এবং তারা বায়ব জীবনের কী ধরনের শিক্ষালাভ করে বলে আপনি মনে করেন?
Appendix 3.18 English Version of the Focus Group Discussion Protocol

Focus Group Discussion Protocol

Thank you everyone for joining this focus group discussion. The purpose of the focus group is to gather your views, opinion, experiences, and suggestions regarding the ways your school can contribute to the nurturing of values in children. My name is Ruhksana Tajin and I will facilitate this discussion.

The discussion should not last more than two hours. With your permission, I will tape-record the interview so that the authenticity of your views and opinions can be maintained. After the recording has been transcribed a summary of the discussion will be given to you for checking and you may revise the information or ask to have any sections removed.

Opinions expressed will be treated confidentially. All responses will remain anonymous. There are no right or wrong opinions. I would like you to feel comfortable saying what you really think and how you really feel.

Before we start let me tell you one more thing. The value of the research and the credibility of its findings depend on your honest and authentic views. So, please be frank in your answers and express your views fully and completely.

Please feel free to ask me if you need a break.

First, I request you all to tell your name, the duration of your teaching career as a whole and in this school, the subjects you teach in different grades, and any other responsibility you are expected to take in this school.

Questions:

- What values do you think are important for children to learn and why are these important?
- What roles do you think school can play in developing these values?
- Are you aware of the knowledge and skills required for developing children as good human beings and as good citizens?
- What are the provisions that your school is making for children to learn about values, develop respect for values, and earn skills to apply the values in real life?
- Can you share any of your professional experiences that directly or indirectly relates to the values development of children?
- What are the issues that may accelerate or hinder school’s performance in developing and nurturing student values?
ফোকাস গ্রুপ আলোচনার সম্ভাব্য প্রশ্নাবলী

এই আলোচনার উদ্দেশ্য হলো শিক্ষার মাধ্যমে নৈতিক ও চারিত্রিক ওপাবলী এবং মূল্যবোধ গঠনের জন্য আপনার বিদ্যালয়ের ভূমিকা কী হবে পারে সে বিষয়ে আপনার দৃষ্টিভঙ্গি, মতামত, অভিজ্ঞতা এবং পরামর্শ সম্পর্কে ধারণা লাভ। যেসব বিষয়ের উপর আপনি চিন্তা ও অনুভূতি প্রকাশ করবেন- শিক্ষার সামাজিক, আমৃত্যু ও চারিত্রিক আচরণ এবং মূল্যবোধের উদ্দেশ্যে। এই বিষয়ে আপনি বে খণ্ড অবলম্বন করেন এবং আপনার প্রত্যক্ষ অভিজ্ঞতা; এবং শিক্ষার্থীদের নৈতিক ও চারিত্রিক মূল্যবোধ গঠনের ব্যাপারে আপনি যেসব প্রতিবন্ধকার সম্ভাবনা থাকেন। আপনি এই আলোচনার সমস্তকের দায়িত্ব পালন করবেন।

আলোচনার সময়ের মতামতের ব্যাপারে গোপনীয়তা বজায় রাখা হবে। এখানে কোন শুধু বা ভুল উত্তর নেই। আলোচনা তাদের এবং অন্যান্য জন্যে আপনার কী অনুভব করেন তা প্রকাশের ব্যাপারে অনুভূতি জানাভো।

প্রধান প্রশ্নাবলী:

• কী কী মূল্যবোধ বা ওপাবলী শিক্ষার শেখার প্রয়োজন বলে আপনি মনে করেন এবং কেন সেগুলো প্রয়োজনীয় করেন?
• এই মূল্যবোধ ও ওপাবলীগুলো শেখার ব্যাপারে বিদ্যালয় কী ভূমিকা রাখতে পারে?
• শিক্ষার্থীদের ভালো মানুষ এবং ভালো নাগরিক হয়ে গেছে ওঠার জন্য কী ধরণের জ্ঞান ও দক্ষতা অর্জন প্রয়োজন বলে আপনি মনে করেন?
• মূল্যবোধ শিক্ষা, অন্যান্য মূল্যবোধের প্রতি শক্তি প্রদর্শন এবং নিজের মূল্যবোধ বাস্তব জীবনের প্রয়োজন জন্য কী ধরণের ব্যবস্থা আপনার বিদ্যালয় করে দিচ্ছে বলে আপনি মনে করেন?
• শিক্ষার্থীদের মূল্যবোধ ও চরিত্র গঠনের সাথে প্রতিক্ষ্ণ বা পরামর্শ চায় তাদের এমন কোন প্রশ্নগুলি অভিজ্ঞতা কি আপনি মনে করেতে পারেন? অনুভূতি করে বলুন।
• শিক্ষার্থীদের মূল্যবোধ ও চরিত্র গঠন এবং বিবেচনা মূল্যবোধের উদ্ভাসের ক্ষেত্রে সহায়তা বা প্রতিবন্ধক হতে পারে এমন কী কী বিষয় হতে পারে?
### Appendix 3.20 Details of the Classroom Observation System for Third Grade (COS-3) Instrument

Table A3.20.1

*Details of the Classroom Observation System for Third Grade (COS-3) Instrument (codes rated at 1-7 scales)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Richness of Instructional Methods | **Variety and depth of strategies the teacher employs to present a particular lesson and to promote the children’s thinking and understanding at higher levels of complexity, integration or meaning.**  
Teachers use a variety of intellectually engaging strategies, including  
- posing problems or discrepancies,  
- asking thought-provoking questions,  
- adding complexity to tasks, and  
- engaging in reciprocal discussion in which they take children’s ideas seriously.  
Teachers also model, demonstrate, and explain, and provide the information, coaching, and direct instruction necessary for the child’s progress.  
There is the use of higher level thinking skills, problem solving approaches, and instructional conversation during the lesson.  
**6-7** The teacher’s emphasis will be on expanding the presentation of basic information to include opportunities for student involvement through inquiry, experimentation, problem solving and discussion. Lessons are designed and conducted so that students use a full range of skills, particularly higher order critical thinking such as analyzing, synthesizing evaluating, and originating. Methods of assessment cover a wide range of thinking skills (e.g., identify, classify, judge, and originate).  
**3-5** some discussion, or activities to promote problem solving.  
**1-2** teachers presenting the subject in a very basic format. The methods used may employ only paper and pencil type of worksheets requiring a short correct answer with no problem solving, following along in the textbook or a pure lecture type of presentation. There is no expansion of the topic through the use of experimentation, analysis, or synthesis. The subject matter is presented in a scripted, very basic, fact only approach. There is no true discourse or instructional conversation between student and teacher. The teacher seems to want
only a brief correct response. An activity requiring memory and recall of basic information or the repetition of previously learned material does not involve the use of higher level thinking strategies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Over-Control</th>
<th>The extent to which the classroom is rigidly structured or regimented and appears to be driven by the teacher’s agenda regardless of the students’ needs and interests.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Markers of <strong>Over-control</strong> include:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- children are not allowed to leave their seats for extended periods of time;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- all children are involved in the same activities throughout the observations, and there is no evidence of individualization;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- children are required to be quiet throughout the observation; or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- a high percentage of teacher talk with very little or no student talk or involvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- children seem to be inappropriately quiet;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- spontaneity and creativity are not encouraged.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children are not given choices for or within activities, instead they are heavily regimented with teacher directed activities and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- teacher imposed agendas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Little planning is evident for interesting activities, either indoors or outdoors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Classrooms <strong>low</strong> on over-control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- demonstrate respect for children’s autonomy and responsibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children have a role and voice in various activities and are usually active participants in activities not simply passive recipients.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chaos</th>
<th>Extent to which the children in the class are ineffectively controlled or chaotic.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Talking or movement that is not related to the instruction or where children are talking mainly for the fun of it would be considered in the chaos rating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In the <strong>chaotic</strong> classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children appear out of control during transitions, lessons, or during free time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children may not know where they are supposed to be or what they are supposed to be doing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The teacher allows situations to get out of hand before intervening.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Behaviours which may be dangerous are occurring.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- At times situations requiring discipline are dealt with in an arbitrary or half hearted way. At other times teacher does not intervene early or at all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children engage in inappropriate, and often disruptive or rude behavior.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Children do not pay attention to the teacher’s requests or commands, or do so only after the situation has reached crisis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
They may be annoying peers and misusing materials.
- The teacher may be trying to control the children using either positive or negative techniques; however, teacher control techniques are unsuccessful or the teacher appears unaware or unconcerned about what is going on in the classroom.
- The classroom is noisy and an outsider would wonder whether or not adult supervision was happening. Children may be running or wandering around, there may be extreme noise and child aggression. It is difficult to see how instruction could be occurring.

Classrooms **low on chaos**
- underlying sense of organization and playfulness, expectations are clear, adults follow through on communications with the children, there are few interruptions, children who are attentive.
- The sound within the classroom is respectful, productive, and can be light-hearted even when loud.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Detachment</th>
<th>Reflects a lack of emotional involvement and a lack of awareness of the children’s needs for appropriate interactions with activities, materials, or peers.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detachment is often noted by the absence of disciplinary encounters, insufficient discipline or lack of teacher assistance or feedback to children during situations that clearly warrant action.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detachment can be marked by:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A child</td>
<td>being out of sight of the teacher for extended periods or, if out of sight, the teacher not checking in periodically; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A teacher</td>
<td>rarely being involved with children in activities or conversation;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>failing to respond to a child’s approaches, vocalizations, smiles, or other social bids;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>lacking awareness of a child’s engagement in inappropriate behaviour;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>failing to respond to behaviour and situations that call for an adult or responding half-heartedly and inconsistently;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>permitting long stretches of unoccupied time or wandering without directing a child to an activity;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ignoring a child’s or children’s difficulties within the environment, especially when such difficulties are emotionally stressful for the child. (Example: escalating problems with peers, problems finding materials, or difficulty with assigned tasks or completing work)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>When the teacher does get around to interacting with a child, the behaviours are often perfunctory and signal a lack of interest and involvement in the child. The detached teacher says or conveys non-verbally, “don’t bother me”, “stay out of the way”, or “leave me alone”; may place an overemphasis on the physical environment or paperwork (e.g., decorating bulletin boards, recording grades) or other adults (talking to the classroom aide or other teachers in the hall) instead of attending to the children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detachment is <strong>low</strong> when</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>teachers are highly involved with children. An involved teacher permits children ample opportunity to try to solve a problem by</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
themselves, stepping in only when necessary to prevent too much frustration or disappointment.
- during individual seatwork, this teacher is seen monitoring her students’ progress either visually or by walking around through the desks.

A teacher who receives a low score on detachment acknowledges a child’s bid for attention in a timely fashion.

Exactly how high that rating should be will depend on the extent of children’s behaviors that merit efforts by the teacher to control and regulate them, but go uncontrolled and unregulated by teacher.

- A rating of (7) is given to a teacher consistently demonstrating several markers of detachment throughout the rating.
- A rating of (1) is given when no markers of detachment are seen.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Classroom Climate</th>
<th>The overall emotional and social tone of the classroom.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students demonstrate that they feel they are in a safe and respectful environment. Friendships among children and between children and adults <em>could</em> indicate that children feel safe in one another’s presence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adults speak to children in respectful and personable tones.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Children speak to one another respectfully, they try to make each other welcome as evidenced by their smiles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Respectful behaviours include listening attentively to others, discussing rules for social behavior and following them, waiting patiently in line, helping one another negotiate transitions in the classroom or from the classroom to some place else, and disagreeing with an idea (as opposed to attacking someone personally).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Signs of a positive and safe climate include: (a) positive emotional support of the children; (b) positive feedback to the children; (c) posted rules of behaviour whether or not they are used; (d) enforcement of respect for others’ uniqueness and ideas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Climate is <em>low</em> on positive if</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students seem withdrawn and fearful, and where people show disrespect for one another or are negative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Put downs, unflattering discussions about people’s appearances or their families, sarcasm (as opposed to friendly joking) would all be signs of disrespect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The environment is unsafe. Most children engage in and/or experience put-downs, taunts, even occasional threats or slurs about themselves or backgrounds. Teacher and other adults do little, if anything, to counteract these problems. By their uneven enforcement of rules of behaviour or occasional put downs of children, the adults may even add to the problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Classrooms that are neutral or flat should also secure low ratings because of the absence of markers of positive climate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative climate</td>
<td>Classrooms with a climate that is hostile, angry, punitive, and controlling.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **High if**      | - Expressions from the teachers of anger or hostility toward the children, negative regard, disapproval, criticism, and annoyance with the children.  
                      - Teacher irritability, lack of concern for children’s feelings and agendas, and the use of punitive controls.  
                      - Controls are based more on the needs of the teacher than on an understanding of children’s needs and feelings.  
                      - Children’s behaviors toward each other (e.g., aggression, criticism, harsh tones, teary, etc.)  
                      - Teachers may yell to control children’s behavior and even make threats regarding personal injury or withholding privileges.  
                      - Children may be shamed and humiliated by the teacher or by other children.  
                      - Teachers or children may express any of the following: 1) negative regard for each other, 2) disapproval, 3) body tension, 4) negative voices when speaking, 5) abruptness, 6) tense facial muscles and strained expressions, 7) harshness, 8) sarcasm, 9) threatening behavior, 10) harsh punishment, and 11) roughness. |

Classrooms **low** on Negative Climate will show few if any of the markers for this scale. They may either seem lacking in emotion or positive.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Productive use of time</th>
<th>How well the classroom manages time and activities to insure productivity, engagement and efficient use of instructional time.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|                       | An example of a classroom in which the routine is efficient during within-lesson transitions would involve a teacher’s giving directions for the immediate task and telling the children what to do if they finish earlier than classmates. The child does not have to sit doing nothing or become a disruption by talking with other classmates before the entire class moves on to the next subject.  
                      | The mechanics of time spent on passing out or collecting class work, taking attendance, collecting milk money, saying the “Pledge of Allegiance”, listening to the announcements, going to and from lunch and/or recess, collecting papers, distributing and replacing manipulatives, and going from whole class instructional settings to small groups are also indications of how much effort is put into maximizing instructional time.  
                      | Much instructional time may be lost by teachers who are not prepared to begin lessons directly, who do not plan for different performance levels, or who do not plan transitions within or between lessons efficiently.  
                      | **High if,**  
                      | - A classroom should resemble a well-oiled machine where the teacher and students go through the daily schedule in an efficient manner. Every-body seems to know what is expected from them and they go about doing it. |
- The pacing and level of the activities is such so that all children can be productively involved. For example, a child needing more challenging or extra work, or a child requiring
- Adapted work in order to be involved will have this provided.
- There is evidence of preplanning so that the mechanics of teaching do not get in the way of instruction.

A classroom would score **low** when
- It seems that a lot of time is spent without purpose. Students seem to mill around waiting for--or even ignoring--directions from the teacher on what to do next.
- The teacher allows interruptions to dictate how much time is available for instruction.
- A lot of instructional time is lost to transitions and other activities. For example, the teacher calls the name of each child and requires each to come up to her desk to receive a new math worksheet.
- Transitions may be chaotic.

**Teacher sensitivity**

**Child-centred behaviour demonstrated by the teacher**

The **sensitive teacher** is
- acknowledging a child’s affect
- teacher conversation that is responsive to the content of the child’s talk and or activity
- facilitating a child’s learning and play
- appropriate timing of activities to reflect the children’s interest
- changing the pace when the children appear underestimated, overexcited, or tired
- knowing the children’s interest in activities, materials, and peers;
- sharing positive affect or affection with students
- providing an appropriate range and variety of activities
- disciplining children in a manner that matches the violation and considers the children’s abilities to understand and benefit from explanations of the rationale of the discipline; and (j) demonstrating flexibility in handling compliance and autonomy issues.
- tuned in to his or her students and manifests awareness of each child’s needs, moods, interest, and capabilities, and allows this awareness to guide his/her behavior with each child.
- offers the right mix of support and independence so that his or her students can experience mastery, success, pride, and develop effective skills.
- actively taking an interest in a child’s activities, as evidenced by comments, embellishments, or redirection when a child loses interest, achieves success or does something new and interesting.
when conflicts arise, this teacher first allows children to resolve their own conflicts, and then intervenes when necessary. Behaviors that pose dangers to a child or children are responded to quickly and clearly and perhaps firmly (though not severely) in order to let the children know clearly that such actions are not permitted. Behaviors that represent rule violations or discourtesies are responded to with explanation or rationale for why the behavior is inappropriate. However, excessive explanations and rationales can reflect insensitivity rather than sensitivity. Sensitive discipline is discipline that varies in accordance with the nature of the misdeed and suggests that the teacher does not hold inappropriate expectations of the child or children in question.

Low sensitivity is shown when the teacher repeatedly
do not respond to the children, responds in a listless or perfunctory manner, or responds with developmentally inappropriate comments and behavior.
could also overstimate children with too many activities or instructions or intrude on ongoing activities and may continue to attempt to engage the children even when they are providing obvious clues that they are seeking to end the activity or interaction.
Long-winded speeches and lectures often reflect the teacher’s lack of awareness of a child’s developmental level.

Ratings on this scale should be based on both quality and quantity of the “primary” teacher’s behavior.
- A rating of (7) would be given to a teacher who consistently demonstrates several markers of sensitivity.
- A rating of (1) is given to a teacher demonstrating none of the markers.
Appendix 4.1 Document Sources for Analysis

Publications generated by the government, international donor agencies, or independent research authorities:

- Bortoman shorkarer bigoto tin bochorer shafoollo shomporkito protibedon [A report on success achieved by the present government in last three years]. Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME) Bangladesh.
- Quality primary education in Bangladesh: The IDEAL way, Intensive District Approach to Education for All (IDEAL): UNICEF, Bangladesh.
- Quest for quality primary education: Where are the entry points? Dhaka: Power and Participation Research Centre.
- Quality Education Needs Quality Teacher. A dossier based on information and views of the students and teachers of primary schools, education officers and guardians in selected locations of Bangladesh. Dhaka: Campaign for Popular Education.
- Report on primary education in Bangladesh: Challenges and successes: Bangladesh Bureau of Education Information and Statistics (BANBEIS) and Bangladesh Ministry of Women and Children Affairs (MWCA).
- Social inclusion: Gender and equity in education swaps in South Asia- Bangladesh case study: The Regional Office for South Asia (ROSA) of UNICEF.

National policies on education:

- Operational Framework for Pre-Primary Education. Dhaka: Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME) Bangladesh, Government of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh.

Document sources related to the professional development of teachers:

Curriculum documents and textbooks:
[Downloaded from the website of the National Curriculum and Textbook Board, Bangladesh]

Documents.
- Aim and objectives of primary education.
- Curriculum revision process.
- Primary curriculum: subject wise Essential Learning Continua.

Textbooks.
English versions of the Social Studies and Islamic Studies textbooks for grades three to five.
## Appendix 4.2  Educational Structure in Bangladesh

### The Present Educational Structure of Bangladesh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25+</td>
<td>XIX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24+</td>
<td>XIX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23+</td>
<td>XVIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22+</td>
<td>XVII</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics (www.banbeis.gov.bd).

*** Levels of Madrasa education system are shown inside the red box on the rightmost column.
Appendix 4.3  List of Terminal Competencies

1. To have absolute trust and faith in the Almighty Allah.

2. To know about the Creator and remember the Creator in all activities and express gratitude to Him.

3. To know about the biography of Hazrat Muhammad (SAS), the prophet of Allah/founders of respective religions and follow their teaching and ideals.

4. To know about own (respective) Holy Scriptures and acquire qualities of moral and personal character through following the instructions of own (respective) religion.

5. To love all the creation of the Creator.

6. To show respect and tolerance to all irrespective of their nationality, religion, caste and sex.

7. To know about the people of other countries and to create a sense of love and tenderness for them.

8. To gain idea about the basic needs of human beings, and to be aware of developing a decent life.

9. To be aware of one's own rights and also rights of others.

10. To allow others to express their opinions and to show respect to such opinion.

11. To extend cooperative and friendly behaviour with all.

12. To be interested in manual work and to be respectful to people living on manual work.

13. To be aware of one's own duties and responsibilities as a member of the family and to take part in household chores.

14. To be aware of one's own and others' rights, duties and responsibilities through active participation in social and school-based activities.

15. To be aware of democratic norms and to be careful about one's own responsibilities and duties as a good citizen.

16. To take part in nation building activities imbued with a spirit of self-sacrifice.

17. To gain adequate knowledge about the geographical position and features of Bangladesh.

18. To be imbued with a sense of patriotism and nationalism in the spirit of the war of liberation.

19. To know about national history, heritage, culture and literature and be respectful to these.

20. To be active in the development and preservation of environment.
21. To develop liberal attitude towards universal brotherhood and the culture of various countries and to develop an appreciation of the spirit of world peace.

22. To develop an attitude to be careful in making appropriate use of personal, family, community and national resources and their conservation.

23. To be informed about the gradually increasing population of the country and to gain awareness of its effect on the environment.

24. To gain knowledge about the mode of construction of Bangla language, arrangement of sentences (syntax) and rules and orders and to be able to apply them.

25. To be able to understand the central ideas of rhymes, poems, stories, speeches, narrations and conversations in Bangla, listening to them attentively.

26. To be able to speak to class fellows and others understandably in colloquial Bangla with correct and standard pronunciation.

27. To be able to read printed and handwritten texts in Bangla correctly and understand the sense of the texts read.

28. To be able to express in writing the observations, experiences and ideas in Bangla correctly and clearly, write simple letters and applications and fill in various forms.

29. To gain ideas about and be able to use numbers.

30. To be able to listen, speak, read and write numerical and ordinal words (including date).

31. To know the four fundamental rules (operations) of mathematics and to be able to use them.

32. To recognise the geometrical shapes and sizes of various things in the environment and to be able to use them.

33. To know the units of length, weight, area, volume, time and coins and to be able to use them.

34. To be able to apply mathematical skills in solving practical and information based simple problems.

35. To be able to use various information from the environment through collection, organisation and processing of them.

36. To know about calculator and computer and to be able to use calculator in computations.

37. To be able to apply mathematical knowledge in solving population related problems.

38. To be able to listen to and understand simple conversations, stories and rhymes in English and to enjoy them.

39. To be able to speak simple and correct sentences in English about one’s own observations, ideas and feelings.
40. To be able to read and understand printed and handwritten materials in English.

41. To be able to write brief accounts of experiences and known things in English correctly and in simple way.

42. To acquire knowledge about the application of science and technology in enhancing the quality of day to day life.

43. To develop habit of solving problems by adopting scientific methods.

44. To develop scientific attitude.

45. To know the environment through observation and enquiry and to be able to classify different things and events on the basis of the knowledge acquired.

46. To be aware of the variety in creations through the study of Arts and Crafts (such as drawing designs and sketches; work of clay, wood, cloth, and paper) and to develop one's own creativity and extend area of enjoying beauty.

47. To promote one's own creativity, sense of beauty, aesthetics and intelligence through the study of Music, Dance and Drama.

48. To be interested in games and physical training.

49. To know and follow health rules with a view to ensuring healthful living.

50. To acquire the mentality of living together, to be imbued with the attitude of honesty, sense of justice, duty, discipline and good manner, and to be inspired to practice them.
## Appendix 4.4 Essential Learning Continuum (Social Studies)

[Translated from Bengali]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Terminal Competency</th>
<th>Class-wise Attainable Competencies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grade Three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A pupil will:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. To arouse in the mind of the learner a sense of love, respect, equality, fellow-feeling and cooperation to all, irrespective of nationality-religion-caste, male-female, and make him/her desirous of peaceful environment.</td>
<td>9.1 show respect to and live in cooperation with all in their family, school, and neighbourhood, irrespective of male-female and religion-caste.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.2 respect the social, cultural, and religious activities and festivals of classmates and neighbours from other religions and lifestyles, and will take part in these festivals and activities when possible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.3 be sympathetic to the poor and deprived children and adults of the society, and will help them in their need.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.4 know about the lifestyles of the tribal groups, the Chakma, Marma, and the Saontal.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 4.5  Objectives of the Islamic Studies

1. To build absolute trust and belief in Allah, the Almighty, in the learner's mind, so that this belief inspires his/her thought and work and helps in developing spiritual, moral, social and human values.

2. To help the learner in acquiring moral and noble qualities of character through practice of Islamic dictum/teachings.

3. To raise in the child's mind a sense of love, respect, equality, fellow-feelings and cooperation for everybody irrespective of nation, religion, caste-creed, male-female as the children of the same parents of mankind and motivate the child for peaceful environment.

4. To raise an interest in the child's mind for human rights, mutual understanding, cooperation, universal brotherhood, Internationalism and world peace, justice at all fields and Islamic culture.

5. To create interest for physical labour in the mind of the learners, to rouse sense of respect towards working class people and help in creating awareness to improve the living standard through economic labour.

6. To make the learner aware of his own and others' rights, duties and responsibilities through active participation in family, social and school activities.

7. To help and build learner's habit of showing tolerance of others' opinions.

8. To rouse the sense of patriotism and nationalism in the mind of the learner, create the attitude of sacrifices and motivate in nation-building activities.

9. To help the learner to acquire knowledge about national history, tradition, Islamic creed and culture and rouse the sense of respect towards these things.

10. To make the learner interested in life-long education by creating proper eagerness for acquiring learning skills and knowledge.

11. To help in making the learner science-minded.

12. To help the learner to know and understand environment and motivate to improve and preserve it by active participation in stopping its pollution.

13. To rouse the sense and feelings for Iman through Qirat (correct recitation of the verses of the holy Quran), 'Hamd', 'Naat', 'Azaan' (call for prayer) and maintaining cleanliness and holiness in the minds of the learners.

14. To help in the development and manifestation of moral and social qualities like sense of justice, duty, discipline, good manners and mentality of living together in the learners.

15. To help the learner in acquiring necessary knowledge and skills to develop his / her as a complete person and good citizen in accordance with his/her ability, aptitude and interest and to make him/her fit for acquiring education in the next stage.
16. To motivate and inspire the learners in having firm faith/belief (Iman) in Allah, the Almighty, Prophet – Rasuls (messengers), 'Kitab' (the holy book), the Angels and 'Akhirat' (the life hereafter).

17. To motivate and inspire the learners to acquire knowledge for maintaining and following holiness and cleanliness.

18. 'Ibadat' (worshipping & obeying Allah): To help the learners in acquiring knowledge about 'Salat' (prayer), 'Saum' (fasting for restraints), 'Hajj' (holy pilgrimage to Mecca), 'Zakat' (giving part of the wealth to the poor for its purity), 'Tilawat' (recitation from the holy Quran) and supplication etc. and to rouse their eagerness for knowing the qualities of Allah, the merciful and the great lives of the Prophets and Rasuls (messengers).
## Appendix 4.6  Grade Three Social Studies Curriculum [Translated from Bengali]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attainable Competencies</th>
<th>Learning Outcome</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Planned Activities</th>
<th>Directions for Textbooks Writers, Illustrators and Editors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A pupil will:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Discussed will be included for the key themes covered in the Terminal Competency 9. Presentation of these themes will adequately highlight the ethical and behavioural aspects of character.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **9.1** show respect to and live in cooperation with all in their family, school, and neighbourhood, irrespective of male-female and religion-caste. | A pupil will:  
9.1.1 be able to tell the names of various religions;  
9.1.2 be able to state that a society consists of people with various occupations, financial abilities and classes;  
9.1.3 show respect to all irrespective of their gender, religion, caste, socio-economic status and occupation;  
9.1.4 maintain companionship with children of same age from home, school and neighbourhood. | Mutual respect, support and fellow feeling, and living in cooperation with other members in society | - Students will greet classmates on their birthdays and, if possible, will present to them small gifts.  
- At times children will perform in classroom songs, rhymes and recitation of poems that are based on the theme of amity.  
- They will exchange greetings with neighbours and will lend service to them. | |
| **9.2** respect the social, cultural, and religious activities and festivals of classmates and neighbours from other religions and lifestyles, and will take part in these festivals and activities when possible. | Two pupil will:  
9.2.1 show respect to all religions and religious festivals;  
9.2.2 greet classmates from religious groups and following lifestyles different to their own, on the eve of their social, cultural and religious occasions;  
9.2.3 participate in these activities and festivals when possible and will present gifts like hand-made cards, flowers, colour pencils etc.;  
9.2.4 develop the attitude of building amity with all irrespective of gender, caste, creed and religion, for the sake of social peace and stability. | Social and religious harmony | Children from various religious groups and lifestyles will inform their classmates briefly about their significant religious festivals and, if possible, will invite their classmates to programs arranged to celebrate these occasions, and will themselves attend when invited to such celebrations. | - Given that this theme is relatively abstract, adequate examples should be provided to discuss about the religions of Islam, Hinduism, Buddhism and Christianity.  
- Religious tolerance and communal cohesion should be given importance.  
- Illustrations of Eid [main festivals of Muslims], Puja [main festivals of Hindus], Bodh Purnima [birth anniversary of Buddha] and Christmas.  
- Mutual respect between men and women should be given importance. |
Appendix 4.7  Total Number of Pages and Illustrations in the Textbooks

Table A4.7.1 Total Pages in Textbooks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Textbook</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade Three Social Studies</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Four Social Studies</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Five Social Studies</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Three Islamic Studies</td>
<td>72 (13)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 4 Islamic Studies</td>
<td>104 (20)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Five Islamic Studies</td>
<td>172 (20)*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Figures inside parentheses refer to the number of pages in the Akhlaq [Character] chapter.

Table 4.7.2 Total Number of Illustrations in Textbooks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Textbook</th>
<th>Illustrations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade Three Social Studies</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Four Social Studies</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Five Social Studies</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Three Islamic Studies</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Four Islamic Studies</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Five Islamic Studies</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 4.8  Sample Exercise Sections from Textbooks

Example 1 is from the chapter ‘We All are Humans’ in the Grade Four Social Studies book (NCTB, 2007b, pp. 13-15), and Example 2 is from the chapter ‘Akhlaq’ in the Grade Five Islamic Studies book (NCTB, 2007d, pp. 107-110).

Example 1 (from Grade Four Social Studies textbook)

Exercise
1. Fill in the blanks with the appropriate word:

   a. We cannot get along without the help of ________.
   b. In society men and women have _____ responsibility.
   c. We will try to make needy children understand that we are all ________.
   d. Women and children have the same ————.
   e. Women should always be conscious to establish their own ————.

2. Write the word 'correct' and 'incorrect' against the following statements:

   a. Men and women live together in society through help and co-operation.
   b. If women can enjoy the same rights and privileges with men, their social status will improve.
   c. At school boys and girls follow different curricula.
   d. There is difference in the work of men and women.
   e. We will show respect and love to everybody's profession.

3. Match the words in the left column with the words in the right column

   | a. Men and women in society | are born |
   | b. In society many children with various physical and mental problems | work the same |
   | c. Men and women in society | all are human beings |
   | d. We men and women in society | to exceptional people |
   | e. We will show sympathy | have equal importance |

4. Tick (√) the correct answer:

   4.1. Who live in society by helping others?
   a. men and women     b. grandfather and grandmother
   c. boys and girls     d. male and female students.

   4.2. What will happen if men and women enjoy the same rights and privileges?
   a. women will be happy     b. women's social status will improve
   c. women will work more     d. women will become conscious

   4.3. Which day is recognized as International Women's
Day by UNO?

a. 10th March      b. 9th March
c. 8th March       d. 7th March

4.4. Who declared the observance of International Women's Day?

a. Clara Jetkin      b. Rokeya Sakhawat Hossain
c. Helen Keller      d. Shamsun Nahar Mahmud

4.5. Where was the Second International Women’s Conference held in 1910?

a. Dhaka            b. Delhi
b. Luxemburg       d. Copenhagen

de. 7th March

c. 8th March

d. 9th March

e. 10th March

5. Answer briefly

a. Who are men and women in society?
b. What is the purpose of observing International Women’s Day?
c. Write about the importance of International Women’s Day?
d. How will you help handicapped people?
e. How will you behave with orphans or helpless children?
f. Explain – ‘Men and women have equal importance in society’.
Example 2 (from Grade Five Islamic Studies textbook)

Exercise

Essay Type Questions

1. What are the good qualities of human character?
2. What are the bad sides of human character?
3. Whose lives are very miserable? What will you do to them?
4. Describe the holy saying of the Prophet (Sm) regarding service to men?
5. Describe with whom Allah is pleased and with whom He is not?
6. In what way can we serve and help people?
7. What will Allah say at the Last Judgement day regarding service to men?
8. Allah will be served by serving who? Describe.
9. Trees are our friends - explain.
10. Describe the incident of the woman about kindness to animals mentioned in Hadith.
11. What is mother? Write down what you know about this.
12. What do you understand by Ashraful Mukhukat? Why Mankind is called Ashraful Mukhukat?
13. What is patriotism? Why shall we love our country?
14. Write done the feeling of the Prophet (Sm) at the time of Hizrat.
15. Write down the incident of Abdul Kader Jilani (R) about Truthfulness.
16. Describe the incident of the mother and daughter regarding Truthfulness.
17. What is misuse? Give the description of misuses.
18. Describe the saying of Allah about the co-operation to good works and hindrances to bad works.
19. Describe the saying of the Prophet (Sm) regarding the cooperation to good works and non-co-operation to bad works.
20. Write down the prayer for parents with its meaning which Allah has taught us.
21. Narrate the incident of Bayezid Bustami (R) about taking care of the parents.

Objective Type Questions

Put tick marks (√) on the right answers

1. Which is the good quality of human character?
   a) To disobey parents  
   b) to serve men   
   c) to cause pain to animals  
   d) not to keep word

2. Which is the bad side of the character?
   a) To speak the truth  
   b) to respect the teacher  
   c) to tell lies   
   d) to nurse the patients

3. What is Allah pleased with?
   a) To inflict men  
   b) to tell lies  
   c) not to help distressed ones  
   d) to serve and help men

4. What will we give to our neighbours?
   a) Cause Pain  
   b) give vegetables  
   c) Throw garbage to their houses  
   d) help offer

5. ‘Show kindness to every thing that exists on the earth’, whose word is it?
   a) The words of the Angels  
   b) the words of men  
   c) the words of Rasul (Sm)  
   d) the words of the scientists.
### Appendix 4.9 Chapter Titles for the Social Studies Textbooks (Grade Three-Five)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade Three</th>
<th>Grade Four</th>
<th>Grade 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Our environment</td>
<td>1 Our work in the family and school</td>
<td>1 Development activities of the locality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 We are all humans beings</td>
<td>2 We are all humans beings</td>
<td>2 Social and national resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Our work in the family and school</td>
<td>3 Social qualities</td>
<td>3 Social virtues and values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Rules and discipline in the family and school</td>
<td>4 Our fundamental rights</td>
<td>4 Dignity of labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Our country</td>
<td>5 The geographical environment of Bangladesh</td>
<td>5 Human rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 The geographical environment of Bangladesh</td>
<td>6 The environmental pollution in Bangladesh</td>
<td>6 Tolerance of others’ opinion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Our wealth</td>
<td>7 The effect of population growth in Bangladesh</td>
<td>7 Rights and duties of a citizen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Our rights and duties</td>
<td>8 Our history and culture</td>
<td>8 Geographical environment of Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Dignity of labour</td>
<td>9 The background of our Liberation War</td>
<td>9 Preservation of environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Democratic attitude</td>
<td>10 The Great Hero of our freedom</td>
<td>10 Population of Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Different cultures of different peoples</td>
<td>11 Pioneers of the independence of Bangladesh</td>
<td>11 Historic places and relics in Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Population of Bangladesh: its growth and problems</td>
<td>12 The lifestyles of the tribal peoples</td>
<td>12 Our history and tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13 Dignity of labour</td>
<td>13 British rule in Bengal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14 Rights and duties of the citizens</td>
<td>14 Prominent personalities in social service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15 Democratic attitude</td>
<td>15 Nine months of our liberation war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16 Our social and state resources</td>
<td>16 Different groups of ethnic and indigenous people of Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17 Different cultures of Asia</td>
<td>17 Cultures of Europe and Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18 Universal brotherhood</td>
<td>18 World peace and the United Nations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix 4.10 Section Titles for the ‘Akhlqa’ Chapter in Islamic Studies Textbooks (Grade Three-Five)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade Three</th>
<th>Grade Four</th>
<th>Grade 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Obedience to Parents</td>
<td>• Akhlqa (Character)</td>
<td>• Akhlqa or Character</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To Speak the Truth</td>
<td>• To Honour the Parents</td>
<td>• Service and Help to the Creation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Salam [Islamic Greeting]</td>
<td>• To Honour the Teachers</td>
<td>• Forgiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To Behave Nicely with Guests</td>
<td>• To Honour the Elders and Love the Youngers</td>
<td>• Patriotism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To Behave Nicely with Classmates</td>
<td>• To Behave Well with the Neighbours</td>
<td>• Co-operation to Good Works and Protest to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To Serve People</td>
<td>• Nursing the Patient</td>
<td>Bad Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Show Mercy to the Living Beings</td>
<td>• Speaking the Truth</td>
<td>• Honesty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Keeping the Promise</td>
<td>• Serving the Parents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Not to Be Greedy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Not to Waste</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Not to Backbite</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 4.11 Teaching Learning Activities and Evaluation Strategy
[Islamic Studies Curriculum]

Teaching-learning activities

The teacher will:

(i) Say 'salam' (salute / greet) at the time of entering into the class and ask for knowing the well-being of all the learners and keep watch on the learners whether they have answered to the 'salam' or not.

(ii) Present the subject matter in simple language in accordance with the textbook and through the active participation of the students.

(iii) Keep watch on the learners, so that they follow him in the required matters.

(iv) Make the learners understand about showing respect to the parents, teachers and behaving well with the younger children.

(v) Motivate/ inspire the learners about showing kindness to the animals by the human beings.

(vi) Motivate the learners about patriotism.

(vii) Make the learners understand about hospitality to the guests and their entertainment.

(viii) Give clear idea to the learners about 'Iman' (faith) and 'Aqaid'.

(ix) Motivate the learners to recite the Quran Majid correctly.

(x) Motivate the learners in keeping their dresses and clothing clean.

(xi) Give practical training to the learners in performing 'salat' (prayer) correctly.

(xii) Inform the learners about the biographies of the Prophets-Rasuls.

Evaluation:

The teacher will:

- Evaluate the learners through oral questions-answers after presenting the lesson in the class. S/he will praise them for the correct answers but not discourage them for the wrong ones. S/he will rather, try to bring out the correct answers from the children by putting questions with hints from the wrong answers.

- Evaluate them by giving written tasks in the class.

- Evaluate them by giving homework.

- Evaluate them by class-tests at the end of each chapter. Objective and short answers-questions may be used for continuous assessment.
- Prepare the question-paper, keeping in view the class-wise attainable competencies, so that the ear-marked competencies can be measured.
- Evaluate them through monthly/terminal and yearly examinations. S/he will prepare questions from the entire contents/syllabus consistent with the competencies.
- Evaluate learners' interest in the subject, attitude and application of the acquired knowledge, side by side with the evaluation of information-knowledge.
- Identify the learning deficiency of the learners through evaluation and offer necessary remedial measures.
- Remain sympathetic to the children during the time of evaluating the answer-scripts. S/he will correct their mistakes and never express displeasure with them.
- Let the guardians know the results of the evaluation. S/he will give guidelines to the parents for taking special care of the children in possible cases.
Appendix 4.12 Examples of Listing Tasks Included in Textbook Chapters

Social Studies Grade Three Book

Example 1:

There are many workmen around us. We will write some name of the workmen in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Workers around us</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

p. 76

Example 2:

Write in table below what we will do after returning from school.

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

p. 28

Social Studies Grade 4 Book

Example 1:

Let us prepare a list of the benefits we will get if we are punctual:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

p. 23

Example 2:

We have known about our rights as citizens of Bangladesh. Let us now fill in a similar table below in our notebooks about these rights.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social rights</th>
<th>1.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political rights</th>
<th>1.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic rights</th>
<th>1.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

p. 54
Appendix 4.13 Sample Lesson Plans for Social Studies

Sample 1

Grade: One

Subject: Social Studies

Lesson Title: We all work

Today’s Topic: Chores at home

Learning Outcomes

11.1.1 Will observe who does what at home
11.1.2 Will be able to tell names of household chores
11.1.3 Will be able to tell which household chore is done by which family member

Activities of Teacher

a. Creating safe learning environment: by exchanging greetings
b. Bringing motivation: [by chanting a rhyme]
   ‘Dad shops, Mom cooks
   We cherish the food and this is enough
   Mom work in office and Dad is a businessman
   We cooperate with each other and there’s no problem’
c. Steps in presentation: Teacher will
   1. help the learners to think about who does what at their home, to discuss in group
      and then tell;
   2. discuss the following questions and help them answer: what household chores do
      we normally do? What does your father do? What does your mother do? What do
      you do? What problems do arise if we do not do household chores?
   3. divide the class into three groups: five girls in a ‘Mother’ group, five boys in a
      ‘Father’ group, and a mixed group of five for ‘Siblings’ group. The group
      members will then be asked to perform role-play. The rest of the class will observe
      them and later they will try to identify the theme of the role-plays;
   4. assist individual students to think on their own about the problems that may arise if
      they do not perform the chores as a family member.

Evaluation Technique: Oral and written evaluation during the lesson and at the end of it.

Material collection and preparation: Pictures relevant to lesson, mask/hat for role-play.
Grade: Four
Subject: Social Studies

Lesson Title: The Life-styles of Tribal People
Today’s Topic: Saontal [name of a tribe]

Learning Outcomes
9.4.1 Will be able to tell where the Saontal people live and find the location in the map.
9.4.2 Will be able to tell about the society, life and customs of the Saontal tribe.

Activities of Teacher
a. Creating safe learning environment
b. Bringing motivation
c. Steps in presentation: Teacher will
   1. show lesson-relevant pictures to the class, involve students in individual thinking followed by group discussion, and help the learners to describe the theme of the picture;
   2. ask the students to read the textbook so that they understand the lesson topic, and then through question-answering and discussion will help them to tell about the food, costume and key characteristics of the Saontal people;
   3. ask them to discuss in group, and fill in the table given in textbook with four properties of the religious life of the Saontal people;
   4. ask students to observe the map, then think individually and discuss in group, and then will assist them to identify the locations where the Saontal people live in Bangladesh.

Evaluation Technique: Oral and written evaluation and observation during the lesson and at the end of it.
Material collection and preparation: Pictures relevant to lesson, a map of Bangladesh.
### Appendix 5.1  Demographic Information of Teachers in Various Cases

#### Table A5.1.1

*Age Distribution of the Teachers in Various Schools (% within school)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group (in years)</th>
<th>School A</th>
<th>School B</th>
<th>School C</th>
<th>School D</th>
<th>School E</th>
<th>School F</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20.00 - 29.99</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>75.0%</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>42.9%</td>
<td>23.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.00 - 39.99</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>39.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.00 - 49.99</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>5.30%</td>
<td>3.30%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.00+</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>26.3%</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>28.6%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Table A5.1.2

*Percentage Frequency Distribution for the Teachers’ Highest Qualification in Various Cases (% within school)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>School A</th>
<th>School B</th>
<th>School C</th>
<th>School D</th>
<th>School E</th>
<th>School F</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Masters*</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>50.00%</td>
<td>21.10%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>28.60%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEd#</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>12.50%</td>
<td>5.30%</td>
<td>15.80%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>57.10%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor &amp; Hons</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor with Hons</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>26.40%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor with Hons</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>26.40%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEd^</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSC</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSC</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*One-year academic degree. #One-year professional qualification. ^Two to three years’ academic degree. *Ten month to one year professional qualification.

Only one teacher in Case C had a Diploma-in-Education qualification.

#### Table A5.1.3

*Percentage Frequency Distribution for the Length of Teaching Career of the Teachers’ in Various Cases (% within school)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Length of Teaching Career (in years)</th>
<th>School A</th>
<th>School B</th>
<th>School C</th>
<th>School D</th>
<th>School E</th>
<th>School F</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 1.00</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>5.30%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>42.90%</td>
<td>6.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.00 - 5.99</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>50.00%</td>
<td>21.10%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>25.00%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>30.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.00 - 10.99</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>12.50%</td>
<td>21.10%</td>
<td>15.80%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>28.60%</td>
<td>23.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.00 - 15.99</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>5.30%</td>
<td>15.80%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>1.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.00 - 20.99</td>
<td>50.00%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>10.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.00 - 25.99</td>
<td>33.30%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>28.60%</td>
<td>9.80%</td>
<td>9.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.00 - 30.99</td>
<td>16.70%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>6.80%</td>
<td>7.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.00 - 35.99</td>
<td>50.00%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>2.90%</td>
<td>2.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.00+</td>
<td>50.00%</td>
<td>10.50%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>2.90%</td>
<td>2.90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 5.2  Information on Occupation and Economic Status of Guardians in Case C

Table A5.2.1
Statistics of guardians’ occupation and economic status, and means of guardian-teacher communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guardians’ occupation</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual labour</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guardians’ economic status</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High middle class</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle class</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower middle class</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Below poverty line</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Means of communication</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Directly with school</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On street or local market</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over telephone</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 5.3  Observation of the National Children’s Day in Case D

The researcher decided to utilise the opportunity of observing a special event in the school on a national holiday. This was the celebration of the birth anniversary of Sheikh Mujib. The day was declared as the National Children’s Day. A sketch of this event is given below:

The day before this event, the head teacher, during the assembly, instructed all children to ‘come by 9.30 am sharp’. It was found that the children living near the school were preparing for the day with great zeal. Some of them even started for school at 9 am. All seemed to be very excited and enthusiastic about the observation of the day.

When the researcher entered the school at 9.40 am, some students were seen waiting in the yard with books in their hand. They said to the observer, ‘we will take private tuition’. The head teacher was found opening the door and windows of his room. No other teachers came to school until then. Some students approached the head teacher for the keys of the classrooms. The head teacher instructed them to gather in the yard for assembly. It appeared that the school is used by the teachers for providing private tuition after usual school hours and on holidays. A few minutes later, those students requested the head teacher again to open the classrooms. The children who arrived at school before that time were waiting in the school yard or the nearby field.

By 10.05 am, two female teachers arrived at school. The head teacher started to set the hand microphone. It was 10.10 am when one female teacher went to the yard to organise the students into lines. Some boys, showing a sign of intense enthusiasm in their face, came to teachers’ room to seek a piece of information about the day going to be observed. One of the boys, named Kayes, prepared a speech on Mujib, the ‘father of the nation’. The teachers did not respond to what the students asked. The head teacher instead instructed some boys to clean the toilet.

The students were impatiently waiting in the yard for the program to start. More than one hour since the promised start time had passed. The teachers and three community members, invited as guests for the discussion program, were having morning tea in the common room. The clock was ticking 10.40 am. A group of boys were seen carrying desks and chairs to the yard to make seating arrangements for the teachers and the guests, who started to take their seats. The daily assembly began at 10.45 am and continued for about seven minutes. The head teacher then delivered an inaugural speech that continued for three and half minutes. After this, the chief guest—the chairman of the school managing committee—delivered his speech. The head teacher then openly invited the students to say something about the great leader, Sheikh Mujibur Rahman. Kayes stood in front of the crowd and read from a script that he had prepared himself. Following his speech, another guest talked for a while. Finally, the head teacher talked
for eight minutes about the life and contributions of Mujib. He referred to the ideals of Mujib that the students could follow to become a leader like him. The entire discussion program lasted for about 35 minutes and the school day ended when the program was over. Only the students who took private tuition from the head teacher remained in the school.
Appendix 6.1  Classroom Examples of Over-reliance on Textbook

A strategy used by one Case B teacher in all her three lessons, two for Social Studies and one for Islamic Studies, was that while reading from the textbook she instructed the class at the beginning to put their fingers on the textbook just below the sentence she was reading, and in some cases she also instructed to underline the ‘important’ sentences. The teacher then revised the information in those sentences several times throughout the lesson so that the students could answer correctly the questions listed in the exercise section of the textbook, mainly ‘true/false’, ‘filling in blanks’ or ‘what is this’ type questions. This practice of this teacher reflected what she described during the interview about her teaching strategy. In another lesson\(^{136}\), taken by the most senior teacher at Case C, an over-reliance on the textbook was also observed. The students were asked to memorise the textbook content on the factors that cause air pollution and to ‘just write one point each’ on the blackboard. The teacher was repeatedly stressing that students should read the content, ‘memorise well’, and keep the response short in order to formulate a number of bullet points from the content. She did not encourage student’s creativity at all, neither added any information of her own. The only activity that the students were involved in that lesson was to copy the textbook content on the blackboard by the students whom she asked to do so.

\(^{136}\) COSC4CT4
Appendix 6.2 Classroom Examples of Teachers’ Inexperience in Cooperative Techniques

It was observed that the teachers showed some degree of inexperience in managing group or pair discussion. For example, although the teacher in a lesson instructed the class to discuss in a group of four, some of the students were actually reading the textbook individually for rote-learning the content. Also, the time the teacher allowed for group discussion (two minutes), prior to inviting groups to share their responses to the whole class, did not seem to the researcher to be adequate for the children to be involved in a meaningful group discussion.

Moreover, the teacher was struggling to take student responses and share them with the whole class as many students were offering their responses. Furthermore, as the last activity the teacher asked the students to ‘think’ about the ‘developmental activities in school’ and then list them on the notebook, but it was observed that the theme was not clear to most of the students and the teacher did not provide adequate information on what was to be written. In addition, she suggested the students think and add their own points beyond what was given in the textbook, but the students seemed to have been confused as to how much they can copy from the book when the teacher instructed, ‘you can also take help from the book’. Another example can be cited to portray the perceived limited implementation of pair or group work in the lessons. The head teacher, in a grade four Social Studies lesson, asked the students to ‘discuss in pairs what air pollution is.’ It was, however, observed that as pairs the students were actually checking if their partner could memorise the definition to ‘air pollution’ as written in the textbook. The teacher seemed to accept what the students were doing.

The Case E teachers seemed to have a limited understanding of how complexity can be added to classroom tasks and how a group work can be conducted during the lesson. In one lesson the teacher assigned a writing task to the students to answer the question, “How as a student can you help others?” When the teacher asked the class if they would prefer to do this activity individually or as a group, the students preferred to write as a group. They were then told to make groups of four. The students were encouraged to use their own imagination and thinking to answer the question and to compose sentences on their own instead of writing only those given in the textbook. Immediately after this, the teacher pointed to a paragraph in the textbook which she wanted her students to ‘read silently’ in order to be able to write the answer. She also articulated several times, “This question is very important for exam.” The question came into the mind of the researcher that what meaning it conveyed to first instruct “write whatever you think” and then ask the students to compose their answers based on the textbook content. Moreover, although she named the activity as ‘group work’, basically the teacher asked the students to ‘write individually in a group’, an instruction which was itself ambiguous in nature. It was found that the students were writing individually. In a later activity the teacher divided the class into four groups according to the seating arrangement of students and asked each group to produce one sentence in response to “What do we get from the manual labourers?” The students were showing great excitement and enthusiasm about that task. The teacher took responses from the four groups which were ‘love’, ‘service’, ‘affection’ and ‘labour’, respectively, and listed them on the blackboard. Finally, she declared that “Team 2 won” and put a tick mark near the response ‘service’. It was, however, not explained why she...
preferred this response to the others. In another case the teacher attempted to add complexity to a ‘fill in the blank’ exercise item taken from the book by changing the words in the sentence. However, after three consecutive attempts she actually wrote a similar sentence as that written in the textbook and therefore the answer became readily understandable to the students. When the teacher became unsuccessful to find what was wrong with her try, one student commented,

Madam, it would have been more difficult if you had written [the sentence] in your own words. It became easier [to us] as you copied the sentence as it is in the book. So, we all could guess what the answer would be.

This example bears another level of significance to the researcher because the students, at least the one who made the comment, did not feel fearful in pointing out the teacher’s mistake, nor did the teacher react negatively to such comments made by the students.

Similarly, a group writing task created a feeling of confusion among the students in another lesson as the teacher could not articulate to the class what she expected in the task and what the role of individual group members would be. She instructed the students to form groups of six members, to discuss and then to ‘write as a group in your notebook what you do in the evening.’ The lesson topic was ‘the discipline and rules in the family and school’. The students were asking questions to know more clearly whether each of the group members would write the same responses individually or only one person from each group would write. The teacher either ignored such questions or replied, ‘you discuss and write’, which actually did not answer the question. The increased classroom noise was partially due to the inadequate and unclear instruction about the activity. Although the teacher was stressing the term ‘discussion’, the way the classroom activity was being conducted did not appear to be a discussion at all. The teacher later went to some of the groups and explained to them in details, but lesson time was not properly used at the beginning. The groups finally read aloud what they wrote. The students showed great enthusiasm in that activity which seemed to challenge them as they were seen rushing to complete their writing when other groups were presenting. The group members were cheering with applause when their representative finished articulating the responses.

In the cases where techniques other than simple question-answering or writing tasks were used, it appeared that the teachers actually could not use the techniques in a meaningful and effective way. In most cases they provided inadequate instruction or clues, or failed to trace the source of the students’ mistakes. For example, in a Grade Two Social Studies lesson about ‘Animals’, the teacher introduced the four classes of animals (domestic, wild etc.) and the foods that the animals under each class live on. She first showed to the class a chart containing pictures of various animals, and then asked individual students to guess what the animal was that she covered with a piece of paper. In each case, the children were uttering multiple names of animals waiting for teachers’ signalling of the correct response. It appeared that the children were not actually being able to use the pictures of animals not covered by the teacher as a clue to identify the covered one. The teacher also did not provide this clue to the children which could help them find out the answer. In another lesson at Case D, the teacher drew a circle on
the blackboard and invited student responses to an open question. However, he finally listed only two responses from what the students replied and the rest were the points he himself made.

The questions asked during the lessons were mostly of low-level ‘knowledge’ type. The only exception that drew the researchers’ attention was in a grade four Islamic Studies lesson at Case C where the teacher first verbally presented the lesson topic, asked some rhetorical or keyword-seeking questions and then asked the class to summarise, tell and then write what she talked about. Apparently, it may seem that the teacher intended to build and judge the ‘comprehension’ ability of the students, but a closer examination of the students’ responses, the teacher’s comments and the corresponding textbook content revealed that the teacher actually focussed on whether the student responses included all the points mentioned in the textbook content. She reminded the students that not including certain major sentences from the textbook might lower their score in the exam if a test item is made on that specific topic. Although this teacher first instructed the students not to copy from the book and use their own words to answer, her evaluation of the student responses was based on the extent to which these encompassed the relevant textbook content. This also became evident at the end of the lesson when she said to the class: “This is your homework. Memorise it well. Tomorrow I will check.”

It was found in the Grade one lesson at Case F that the teacher spent a quite long time before starting any conversation with the class. She was hanging a calendar on the wall and preparing a flower pot to be shown to the class. However, it was found later that she made very minimal use of those materials; she just pointed to the pictures in the chart for a short period of time. Although it seemed a good idea to show a picture chart to Grade one children, but the time she spent in hanging this chart did not seem to be worth using compared to the lesson duration. The children did not seem to be at all interested to what teacher was saying or pointing to.

---

142 COSC4iST4
143 COSF1sST3
Appendix 6.3 Classroom Examples of Exceptional Pedagogical Practices

The teachers at Case E were seen posing open-ended questions to generate student responses. In a lesson about ‘Cleanliness’ the teacher\footnote{144 COSEHST8} posed an open question at the beginning, “What do we do after waking up in the morning?” She then took responses from two or three students, added her own comments or explanation, and listed the responses on the blackboard. The students appeared to be eager to reply and the teacher encouraged them to articulate their ideas without fear or hesitation. The teacher also repeated students’ responses so that the entire class could hear. Moreover, after introducing a topic from the textbook, in most cases the students were asked to summarise what was discussed instead of the teacher repeating the lesson content over and over again.

The activities implemented in two out of the seven observed lessons at School C included discussing in a group of four or in a pair, followed by listing the points and then sharing the outcome of the discussion with the whole class. The students did not seem to be uncomfortable with this relatively new technique being applied in their schools. They showed great interest and competence in sharing their thoughts and ideas. In another lesson\footnote{145 COSC4BSST1}, the teacher used some techniques which seemed exceptional to this researcher in comparison with the lessons in other schools. These included seeking student responses on the content of two pictures included in the textbook; involving one student in assessing other students’ verbal responses to a question; and, at the end of the lesson, asking the class to recollect what questions the teacher had asked during the lesson. In almost every class observed in this school, the teachers posed open questions to the students, either before or after introducing a topic and spent significant time and energy to listen to a number of students’ responses, articulating them to the whole class and/or listing them on the blackboard. The questions asked before introducing a topic assessed students’ prior knowledge and understanding of a theme. For instance, in a Social Studies classroom the teacher invited ideas from the students as to what responsibilities they can perform in school\footnote{146 COSC3ASSST5}. The students very eagerly responded with their own ideas. In another class\footnote{147 COSC5ASSST2} the teacher elicited students’ responses on the occupation of the manual labourers and their responsibilities and listed those responses on the blackboard. Later she asked the students to read the textbook and check if any new information could be added to what was written.