An Investigation of Phonological Processing and Reading Skills in Bhutanese Primary Students

Pema Wangmo

MSpecEd with Merit

BA with First Class Standing

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the School of Education and Arts at the University of Newcastle, Australia.

March, 2013
Declaration

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Pema Wangmo

(Signed): ................................................................................................... (Candidate)

Date: 6 March, 2013
Dedication

I dedicate this study to my son Jigme Singye Tobden (you are my heart), to my nephew Tandin Phub and the Children of Bhutan (you are my inspiration).

I would also like to dedicate this work in honour of my father, Sonam Wangchuk, whose passion for teaching children became mine and my mother, Pem Dechen, whose love for children is undeniably present in her daughter.

Lastly, I would also like to dedicate this study to my Canadian Nanny Hilda E Smekis, for her unquenchable thirst for knowledge and love for learning. She also prefigured while I was still doing my undergraduate in 2001 that one day, down the line I’ll have a PhD under my profile.
Acknowledgements

Taking up a PhD has taught me more about the essence of interdependence in life than anything else could have taught me so far. I have come to learn that many things have to come together and are dependent on each other in order to accomplish something in life.

First and foremost I feel deeply indebted to my supervisors, Associate Professor Ian Dempsey and Dr. Kerry Dally, both of whom I have known since my Master’s degree at the University of Newcastle from 2005-2006. Thank you to both of you from the bottom of my heart for never missing a fortnightly meeting and making me feel a lot better after each meeting for the past four years, and especially for bearing with me for asking you all the silly questions. I can very vividly remember our first meeting in 2009 when one of you asked me: “Pema, what are your questions?” And I said: “What? I thought you are going to give me the questions.” To which the response was: “Well, but this is your PhD, Pema.” That’s how I began my PhD journey and today, I can’t believe that I have finally done it!

Thank you very much to both of you for your tireless efforts in drafting my chapters thoroughly with your invaluable feedback and allowing each chapter to be drafted at least five times and hitting a record high of 30 times for the results chapter. Needless to say, for any error and lapse in this study I hold myself fully responsible.

Dr. Dally has provided me with the perfect role model of an intelligent, delightful, diligent, positive, understanding, generous and efficient female academic. Equally, A/Prof. Dempsey also has provided me with the perfect role model of an intelligent, consistent, decisive, steadfast, trustworthy and efficient male academic.

I owe my deepest gratitude to both of you for without your guidance, encouragement and support it would have been impossible for me to do justice to my Endeavour scholarship office and bring pride to my family and friends by completing this thesis.

A very big thank you goes to the Australian Government for generously awarding me an Endeavour postgraduate scholarship which benefited me in undertaking this PhD without having to worry about any financial assistance and concentrate fully on my research.

My special thanks to Dr. Neville Clement for kindly spending his precious time in teaching me how to use the NVivo software for analysing my qualitative data. Thanks to Dr. Tom Griffith and Professor Max Smith for providing me with the needed resources.

Finally, special thanks to my family and friends: my husband Jamba Tobden, without his love, help and encouragement; this study would not have been completed. Tobden is a full time Master’s student at the same University. By the same token I would like to thank my sister, Dechen Zangmo, who is also a Doctoral candidate at the University of Newcastle, and of course, to my sister Sonam Lhaden and niece Sonam Peldon and my good friend Selfy Manueke, for all your technical support.
Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study ................................................................. 16

1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 16
1.2 The Research Problem .................................................................................. 17
1.3 Background to the Research ....................................................................... 19
1.4 Rationale of the Study .................................................................................. 20
1.5 Focus of the Study ....................................................................................... 21
1.6 Conceptual Framework ............................................................................... 22

1.6.1 Reading comprehension. ........................................................................... 22
1.6.2 Word level reading. .................................................................................. 23
1.6.3 Phonological processing skills. ................................................................. 23

1.7 Aims of the Study ....................................................................................... 24
1.8 Research Questions ..................................................................................... 25
1.9 Significance of the Present Study ................................................................. 25
1.10 The Structure of the Thesis ....................................................................... 26
1.11 Summary ................................................................................................. 29

Chapter 2: Literature Review ........................................................................ 30

2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 30
2.2 Importance of Reading ............................................................................... 31
2.3 Views of Reading ....................................................................................... 32

2.4 Components of Reading. ........................................................................... 34

2.4.1 Reading comprehension. ......................................................................... 34
2.4.2 Word recognition. .................................................................................. 35
2.4.3 Word attack ........................................................................................... 37

2.5 Phonological Processing Skills ................................................................. 38

2.5.1 Phonological awareness ......................................................................... 39
2.5.2 Rapid automatized naming ..................................................................... 41
2.5.3 Verbal working memory (VWM) ................................................................. 43
2.6 English Language Learners (ELLs) ........................................................................................................ 44
2.6.1 Primary issues related to acquisition of language for ELLs. ......................................................... 44
2.6.1.2 Prior exposure to English language ................................................................. 45
2.6.2.1 Cross-linguistic transfer. ................................................................................. 46
2.6.2.3 Language proficiency. ..................................................................................... 47
2.6.2.4 Phonological awareness. ................................................................................. 48
2.6.2.5 Decoding ........................................................................................................... 49
2.6.2.6. Working memory ......................................................................................... 49
2.6.2.7 Oral vocabulary and oral proficiency............................................................ 50
2.6.2.8 Comprehension ............................................................................................ 50
2.6.2.9 Effective classroom instruction and intervention ........................................ 51
2.7 ELLs and Grade Retention ..................................................................................... 52
2.7.1 Academic outcomes ......................................................................................... 52
2.7.2 Social outcomes of retention .......................................................................... 53
2.8 Subjective Well-being of Students (SWB) ............................................................................. 54
2.8.1 Teacher support ................................................................................................ 57
2.8.2 Motivation ........................................................................................................ 58
2.8.3 Social relationships .......................................................................................... 58
2.8.4 Physical well-being and school environment ................................................ 59
2.9 Summary of Literature Review ........................................................................... 59
2.10 Focus of current study ....................................................................................... 61
Chapter 3: Research Design and Methods ............................................................. 63
3.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 63
3.2 Rationale for the Use of a Mixed Methods Approach ........................................ 64
3.3 Research Participants ......................................................................................... 65
3.4 Research Instruments and Administration of Tasks ................................. 66

3.2.2 Phonological awareness ........................................................................... 67

3.2.4.1 Letter naming ......................................................................................... 67

3.4.2.2 Onset-rime blending .............................................................................. 68

3.4.2.3 Phoneme blending .................................................................................. 68

3.4.2.4 Phoneme segmentation ......................................................................... 69

3.4.3 Rapid automatized naming (RAN). ........................................................... 69

3.4.4 Verbal Working Memory (VWM) ............................................................... 70

3.5 Reading Measures .......................................................................................... 71

3.5.1 Word Recognition ...................................................................................... 72

3.5.2 Word Attack/ Pseudo word reading .......................................................... 72

3.5.3 Passage comprehension .............................................................................. 73

3.6 Subjective well-being of students ................................................................. 74

3.7 Data Collection Procedures ......................................................................... 75

3.7.1 Research procedure ..................................................................................... 75

3.8 Data Analysis for Quantitative data ............................................................... 77

3.9 Data Analysis for Qualitative Data ................................................................. 78

3.10 Mixed Methods Integration ......................................................................... 78

Chapter 4: Quantitative Analysis ....................................................................... 79

4.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 79

4.2 School and Student Participants ................................................................. 80

4.3 Descriptive Statistics ..................................................................................... 82

4.4 Characteristics of the COSSS Scale in this Study ......................................... 85

4.5 Correlations among Phonological Processing Skills, Reading Measures and Student Well-being ................................................................. 87

4.5.1 Correlations among groups of measures .................................................. 88
4.5.2 Summary of correlations among groups of measures............................................................. 88
4.5.2 Correlations of phonological processing tasks with reading................................................. 91
4.5.3 Correlations between phonological processing and student well-being............................ 92
4.5.4 Correlations between reading measures and student well-being........................................... 92
4.5.5 Summary of correlations.......................................................................................................... 92
4.6 Interaction between Phonological Processing Skills and Reading....................................... 93
4.6.1 Multiple linear regression analysis.......................................................................................... 95
4.6.2 Contribution of each independent variable to the dependent variable............................ 97
   4.6.2.1 Word recognition. ........................................................................................................ 97
   4.6.2.2 Word attack. ............................................................................................................. 98
   4.6.2.3 Reading comprehension. ............................................................................................ 98
4.6.3 Summary of regression analyses............................................................................................ 100
4.7 Repeating Students Compared with Grade Four and Grade Five Students ..................... 100
4.7.1 Grade Four Repeaters compared with Grade Four............................................................ 102
4.7.2 Grade Four Repeaters compared with Grade Five............................................................. 102
4.7.3 Comparisons between Grade Four and Grade Five............................................................ 105
   4.8 Effect Sizes........................................................................................................................... 105
   4.8.1 Effect Sizes between Grade Four Repeaters and Grade Four........................................ 106
   4.8.2 Effect sizes between Grade Four Repeaters and Grade Five.......................................... 106
   4.8.3 Summary of Effect Sizes.................................................................................................. 106
4.9 Summary of Quantitative Analysis......................................................................................... 107
Chapter 5: Qualitative Analysis.................................................................................................... 108
5.1 Introduction............................................................................................................................ 108
5.3 Data Analysis......................................................................................................................... 109
5.4 Interview Themes.................................................................................................................. 109
5.4.1 Q. 1. Why do you like going to school? ............................................................................... 110
   5.4.1.1 Learning new things. .............................................................................................. 110
5.4.1.2 Friends........................................................................................................... 111
5.4.1.3 Future Jobs. .................................................................................................. 111
5.4.1.4 Physical education (PE.)................................................................................ 112
5.4.1.5 Doing well and other responses.................................................................... 112

5.5.1 Q.2. Why don’t you like going to school? ............................................................ 112
  5.5.1.1 Long walking distance. ............................................................................... 113
  5.5.1.2 Lack of interest. .......................................................................................... 114
  5.5.1.3 No friends. .................................................................................................. 114
  5.5.1.4 Bullying. ..................................................................................................... 114
  5.5.1.5 Teachers. .................................................................................................... 115
  5.5.1.6 Feeling unwell............................................................................................ 115

5.6.1 Q.3. What makes you happy at school? ............................................................. 115
  5.6.1.1 Friends....................................................................................................... 116
  5.6.1.3 Reading...................................................................................................... 117
  5.6.1.4 Teachers. ................................................................................................... 117
  5.6.1.5 Doing well................................................................................................. 118

5.7.1 Q. 4. What makes you unhappy at school? ......................................................... 118
  5.7.1.1 Teachers beating and scolding. ................................................................. 119
  5.7.1.2 Bullying. ................................................................................................... 120
  5.7.1.3 Quarrelling with friends and other reasons for being unhappy. ................. 120

5.8.1 Q.5. Why is school boring? ................................................................................ 121
  5.8.1.1 School climate. ......................................................................................... 121
  5.8.1.2 Student misconduct. ................................................................................. 122
  5.8.1.3 Don’t understand lessons. ......................................................................... 122
  5.8.1.4 Teachers. .................................................................................................. 123
5.8.1.5 Lesson repetition. ........................................................................................................ 123
5.9 Summary of Findings .......................................................................................................... 123
5.10 Common Positive Themes .............................................................................................. 124
5.10 Common Negative Themes ............................................................................................. 125
5.11 Analysis of Outcome for Specific Grades ....................................................................... 125

Chapter 6: Discussion and Conclusion Chapter .................................................................... 127
6.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 127
6.2 Discussion of Key Findings in Relation to the Research Questions ............................... 127
6.2.1 Research Question 1: What are the relationships among phonological processing skills, reading skills and student well-being in Grade Four and Grade Five Bhutanese children? .... 127
6.2.2 Research Question 2. What contribution do phonological processing skills make to reading in Grade Four and Grade Five Bhutanese children? ......................................................... 131
   6.2.2.1 Phonological processing skills on word recognition. ....................................... 131
   6.2.2.2 Phonological processing skills on word attack (pseudo word). ................. 132
   6.2.2.3 Phonological processing skills and word reading on reading comprehension. ......................................................................................................................... 133
   6.2.2.4 Summary of Findings Related to Research Question 2. .............................. 135
6.2.3 Research Question 3: Are there significant differences between Grade Four Repeaters, Grade Four and Grade Five students in phonological processing skills, reading skills and subjective well-being? ............................................................................................................. 136
   6.2.3.1 Grade Four Repeaters compared to Grade Four (current peers). ............ 136
   6.2.3.2. Grade Four Repeaters compared to Grade Five (previous peers). ............ 137
6.3 Qualitative Findings on Subjective Well-being of Students .......................................... 138
6.4 Summary of Combined Findings from the Quantitative and Qualitative Analyses 141
6.5 Implications of the Study .................................................................................................. 144
6.5.1 Targeting reading interventions for repeating students............................................. 144
6.5.2 Targeting reading interventions to facilitate comprehension. ............................................. 145

6.5.2.1 Background knowledge.................................................................................. 146

6.5.2.2 Language level of the text ............................................................................. 146

6.5.2.3 Modifications to reading comprehension instructions. ................................. 147

6.5.3 Directions for policies and practices on grade retention. ..................................................... 148

6.5.4 Subjective well-being of students.................................................................................. 149

6.6. Contribution of the Research to Existing Knowledge................................................ 150

6.7 Limitations and Suggestions for Future Research .......................................................... 151

6.8 Conclusions ..................................................................................................................... 152

References .......................................................................................................................... 155
List of Tables

Table 3.1 Indicator Variables 67
Table 4.1 School and Student Participants 81
Table 4.2 Descriptive Statistics for Phonological Processing Variables and Reading Tasks Variables for the total sample 83
Table 4.3 Factor Loadings for COSSS Items 86
Table 4.4 Correlations among Phonological Processing, Reading Variables and the COSSS for the full sample 90
Table 4.5 Multiple Regression Analysis Predicting Standardised Residual Scores on Word Recognition, Word Attack and passage Comprehension. 96
Table 4.6 Means and Standard Deviations for phonological Processing, reading and Well-being Measures for each Group. 101
Table 4.7 One-way ANOVA, Post-Hoc Scheffe Summary and Effect Sizes for Measures of Phonological Processing, Reading and Student well-being for the Total Sample. 103
List of Figures

*Figure 4.1* The hypothesized cross-sectional relationships between phonological processing skills, word reading and reading comprehension. 94

*Figure 4.2* The combined results for hypothesized cross-sectional relationships between phonological processing, word reading and reading comprehension. 99

*Figure 5.1* Embedded Design adopted from (Creswell, et al., 2003) ................................. 108

*Figure 5.2* Coding Process (Cresswell, 2002) (Matrix Example) ................................. 109

*Figure 5.3* Student responses as to why they like to go to school ...................................... 110

*Figure 5.4* Student responses to why they do not like to go to school .............................. 113

*Figure 5.5* Student responses to what makes them happy to go to school ......................... 116

*Figure 5.6* Student responses to why they were unhappy at school ............................... 119

*Figure 5.7* Student responses as to why they found school boring ............................... 121
List of Appendixes

Appendix A Human Research Ethics Approval 176
Appendix B Permission Letter 180
Appendix C Information Statement for Director 181
Appendix D Approval Letter 184
Appendix E Information Statements for Principal (English) 185
Appendix F Information Statement for Principal (Dzongkha) 187
Appendix G Consent Form for Schools 191
Appendix H Information Statement for Parents 192
Appendix I Consent Forms for Parents 194
Appendix J Letter Naming 195
Appendix K Onset-rime 198
Appendix L Phoneme blending 200
Appendix M Phoneme Segmentation 202
Appendix N Word Recognition 204
Appendix O Word Attack/Pseudo Word 207
Appendix P Passage Comprehension 209
Appendix Q Rapid Naming Colours 211