Patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies

Kerry Jane Peek

M Clin Sci, BSc (Hons) Physiotherapy, PG Cert Sports Physiotherapy

C3212809

Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
(Behavioural Science in relation to Medicine)

School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Newcastle

Submitted 19th May 2017

THESIS
Declarations

Statement of originality

I hereby certify that to the best of my knowledge and belief this thesis is my own work and contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due references and acknowledgements are made. It contains no material which has been previously submitted by me for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution.

Thesis by Publication

I hereby certify that this thesis is in the form of a series of *papers. I have included as part of the thesis a written statement from each co-author, endorsed in writing by the Faculty Assistant Dean (Research Training), attesting to my contribution to any jointly authored papers. (*Refer to clause 39.2 of the Rules Governing Research Higher Degrees for acceptable papers).

Copyright permissions

I certify that I have obtained, where necessary, permission from the copyright owners to use any third party copyright material reproduced in the thesis (e.g. questionnaires, artwork and unpublished letters), or to use any of my own published work (e.g. journal articles) in which the copyright is held by another party (e.g. publisher or co-author). Please refer to the Appendices for more information.

Date: 19th May 2017

Kerry Jane Peek
Supervisors:

Associate Professor Mariko Carey, D.Psych, NHMRC TRIP Fellow, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.

Laureate Professor Robert Sanson-Fisher, AO, PhD, M Clin Psych, Director, Health Behaviour Research Group, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.

Dr Lisa Mackenzie, PhD, National Breast Cancer Foundation Postdoctoral Research Fellow, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Newcastle.
Acknowledgements

Supervisors

Neither this thesis nor the published papers wrote themselves. Without the tireless efforts of my three amazing supervisors, Mariko Carey, Lisa Mackenzie and Robert Sanson-Fisher this body of work would still be just an idea. I sincerely thank them for their time, energy, passion for research and their constructive and thoughtful feedback.

Funding

Thank you to the University of Newcastle for funding my PhD scholarship; the Priority Research Centre for Health Behaviour (University of Newcastle) for funding assistance to conduct the research reported in Paper Five; and the Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship for funding assistance to conduct this PhD research.

Group

Thank you to all the researchers in the Health Behaviour Research Group and especially the PhD group for your assistance, advice and providing a walk up and down the stairs when needed (Natalie Dodd)!

Family

Last but by no means least, thank you to my wonderful husband Brendan, and my beautiful sons Harry and Charlie. Forever inspiring me to become the best person that I can.
## CONTENTS

Declarations ................................................................................................................................. ii

Supervisors ................................................................................................................................ iv

Acknowledgements ..................................................................................................................... v

CONTENTS .................................................................................................................................... vi

List of Papers ................................................................................................................................ x

Conference Presentations .......................................................................................................... xii

List of Tables ................................................................................................................................ xiii

List of Figures ............................................................................................................................. xv

List of Appendices .................................................................................................................... xvi

Abstract ...................................................................................................................................... xviii

Overview ..................................................................................................................................... xix

INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................................... 1

REFERENCES .............................................................................................................................. 22

PAPER 1 ......................................................................................................................................... 29

Abstract ...................................................................................................................................... 32

Introduction ................................................................................................................................ 33

Methods ...................................................................................................................................... 35

Results ......................................................................................................................................... 38

Discussion .................................................................................................................................... 43

Conclusion .................................................................................................................................... 47

References ..................................................................................................................................... 49

PAPER 2 ......................................................................................................................................... 52
Abstract .................................................................................................................. 55
Background ............................................................................................................. 56
Methods ................................................................................................................... 57
Results ...................................................................................................................... 60
Discussion ............................................................................................................... 68
Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 70
References .............................................................................................................. 73

PAPER 3 ............................................................................................................... 77
Abstract ................................................................................................................. 80
Introduction ............................................................................................................ 81
Method .................................................................................................................... 82
Results ..................................................................................................................... 86
Discussion ............................................................................................................... 89
Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 92
Clinical Messages .................................................................................................. 93
References .............................................................................................................. 94

PAPER 4 ............................................................................................................... 97
Abstract ................................................................................................................. 101
Introduction ............................................................................................................ 102
Review Aims ........................................................................................................... 103
Methods ................................................................................................................... 103
Information Sources and Search Strategy ............................................................... 104
Data Extraction ...................................................................................................... 105
Methodological Quality Assessment ...................................................................... 106
Abstract .......................................................................................... 170
Introduction ...................................................................................... 171
Behavioural Model ........................................................................ 173
Discussion ....................................................................................... 181
Conclusion ...................................................................................... 182
References ...................................................................................... 183

DISCUSSION .................................................................................. 187

Thesis Overview .............................................................................. 188
Summary of Main Findings ......................................................... 190
Strengths and limitations of Thesis ........................................... 197
Clinical Implications ................................................................. 203
Recommendations for Future Research .................................. 202
Conclusions .................................................................................. 206
References .................................................................................... 212
List of papers included as part of this thesis

Paper 1
https://doi.org/10.1002/msc.1181

Paper 2
https://doi.org/10.1080/09638288.2016.1212281

Paper 3
Peek, K., Carey, M., Mackenzie, L. & Sanson-Fisher, R. “Predictors of high levels of patient adherence to physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies” (submitted- Physiotherapy)

Paper 4
https://doi.org/10.12968/ijtr.2015.22.11.535

Paper 5
Paper 6

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physio.2015.10.003

Paper 7

https://doi.org/10.1080/10833196.2016.1226537
Conference Presentations


List of Tables

Table 1.1. Sociodemographic and injury characteristics of patient participants ...........39

Table 1.2: Time spent on self-management strategies; number of prescribed self-
management strategies; and time spent per self-management strategy (by injury
location and overall).................................................................42

Table 2.1: Comparison of socio-demographic characteristics of physiotherapist survey
sample to Australian physiotherapy workforce datasets .....................................................62

Table 2.2: Frequency and percentage of physiotherapists who agree or strongly agree
that treatment outcomes can be positively impacted by patient adherence to a range of
physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies.....................................................64

Table 2.3: Physiotherapists’ (n = 298) perceptions of the most important characteristic
determining patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management
strategies; listed by first rank frequency and percentage; and overall mean rank of
importance out of 5........................................................................................................65

Table 2.4: Physiotherapists’ perceptions (n=298) of the most important method for
aiding patient adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies;
listed by first rank frequency and percentage; and overall mean rank of importance out
of 8............................................................................................................................66

Table 3.1: Physiotherapist (n=14) socio-demographic characteristics compared with
Health Workforce Statistics.................................................................87

Table 3.2: Patient participant socio-demographic characteristics (n=113)......................88

Table 4.1: Results on the reported accuracy of the measures of patient adherence used in
the included non-intervention and intervention based studies.........................................110

Table 5.1: Physiotherapist participant characteristics compared with Australian national
workforce statistics.....................................................................................................131

Table 5.2: Therapy service characteristics and data source (n=61)..................................132

Table 5.3: Comparison of physiotherapist-perceived and patient self-reported level of
adherence to prescribed exercise program (n=61).........................................................133
Table 6.1: Results of methodological quality assessment using PEDro scale.............150

Table 6.2: Results of data extraction from the included studies......................................153

Table 7.1 Summary of the steps involved in the uCAN behavioural model .....................180
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Number of patients prescribed each type of self-management strategy......40

Figure 4.1: The number and type of studies published over the last 20 years over four
time periods (1995-2014) ........................................................................................................108

Figure 4.2: The types of adherence measure used in the non-intervention and
intervention based studies (n=53) ..........................................................................................109

Figure 6.1: Flow chart of the literature search .........................................................................149

Figure 7.1: Cycle of Adherence Nudging (uCAN) behavioural model to aid patient
adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies ..............................173
List of Appendices (Vol. II of Thesis)

Page numbers refer to Volume II - Appendices

Appendix 1: Paper One ................................................................. 5
Appendix 1.1: Published Paper .................................................. 6
Appendix 1.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement .................. 14
Appendix 1.3: Data Collection Sheet ........................................... 20
Appendix 2: Paper Two ............................................................... 23
Appendix 2.1: Published Paper .................................................. 24
Appendix 2.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement ................. 31
Appendix 2.3: Survey Instrument ............................................... 32
Appendix 3: Paper Three ......................................................... 39
Appendix 3.1: Coding Instructions for Completing the Data Collection Sheet ..... 40
Appendix 3.2: Univariate Analysis ............................................. 41
Appendix 4: Paper Four .............................................................. 43
Appendix 4.1: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement .................. 44
Appendix 4.2: Flow Chart of the Literature Search ..................... 45
Appendix 4.3: Included Studies .................................................. 46
Appendix 5: Paper Five ............................................................. 55
Appendix 6: Paper Six ............................................................... 56
Appendix 6.1: Published Paper .................................................. 57
Appendix 6.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement ................. 66
Appendix 6.3: Example of Search Strategy ................................... 74
Appendix 7: Paper Seven ........................................................... 75
Appendix 7.1: Published Paper .................................................. 76
Appendix 7.2: Copyright Clearance Licence Agreement .................. 83
Appendix 8: Statement of Contributions from Co-authors ............. 84
Appendix 8.1: Associate Professor Mariko Carey ......................... 85
Appendix 8.2: Laureate Robert Sanson-Fisher .............................. 87
Appendix 8.3: Dr Lisa Mackenzie ................................................ 89
Appendix 9: Additional Information .......................................... 91
Appendix 9.1: Conference Listings/Abstracts .............................. 92
Appendix 9.2: Poster Listings .................................................... 95
Appendix 10: Study Ethics Approvals ....................................... 96
Appendix 10.1: Human Research Ethics Committee Approvals .... 97
Appendix 10.2: Local Safety Assessments ............................................................... 110
Appendix 10.3: Examples of Participants Information Statements and Consent .......... 126
Abstract

Self-management strategies including exercise and advice are important components of physiotherapy treatment plans. However, a paucity of research currently exists regarding the prescription of self-management strategies in physiotherapy private practice in Australia. Further, it is widely accepted that the effectiveness of self-management strategies is dependent upon patient adherence. This is an important area to address because evidence suggests that levels of patient adherence to self-management strategies is currently sub-optimal. However, if physiotherapists do not perceive patient adherence to be an issue then methods to aid adherence may not be readily incorporated into routine practice. In addition, there is little consensus in the literature on the characteristics which might be associated with high levels of adherence to prescribed self-management strategies, the types of interventions that can be utilised in physiotherapy to aid patient adherence and how adherence can be accurately measured.

This thesis includes seven papers which aimed to address these gaps in the literature by exploring: physiotherapist prescription of self-management strategies in private practice; the perceptions of practising physiotherapists; the levels and characteristics associated with patient-reported adherence; the methods used to measure adherence; and interventions to aid adherence to physiotherapist prescribed self-management strategies. A behavioural model to aid patient adherence is also presented.

The results of this thesis support that self-management strategies are an integral component of private physiotherapy practice. However, the levels of patient adherence to all physiotherapist-prescribed self-management strategies in private practice are low. Patient adherence may be aided by the use of supplementary written information, asking the patient to repeat the self-management instructions and the use of activity monitors. Finally, there is a need to develop a multi-faceted measure of patient adherence to all self-management strategies which accurately captures all the elements of adherence.